

# 

**Citation:** Qin S-k, Yang Z-x, Guan Z-w, Zhang J-h, Ping X, Lu Y, et al. (2022) Exploring the association between epilepsy and depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE 17(12): e0278907. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0278907

Editor: Muhammad Junaid Farrukh, UCSI University, MALAYSIA

Received: October 4, 2022

Accepted: November 28, 2022

Published: December 15, 2022

**Copyright:** © 2022 Qin et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the <u>Creative</u> Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the article and its <u>Supporting Information</u> files.

**Funding:** 1. The S&T Program of Hebei (grant no. 20567625H) provided computer and related software for this work, and Lin Pei is the recipient of the funding awards. 2. Pei Lin National Famous and Old Chinese Medicine Expert Inheritance Studio provided databases search costs, and Lin Pei is the recipient of the funding awards. 3. Postgraduate Innovation Funding Project of Hebei

**RESEARCH ARTICLE** 

# Exploring the association between epilepsy and depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Shao-kun Qin<sup>1,2©</sup>, Zi-xian Yang<sup>2,3©</sup>, Zhen-wei Guan<sup>2,4</sup>, Jin-hu Zhang<sup>2,4</sup>, Xin Ping<sup>2,4</sup>, Ye Lu<sup>2,4</sup>\*, Lin Pei<sub>10</sub><sup>2,4</sup>\*

1 Hebei University of Chinese Medicine, Shijiazhuang, Hebei, China, 2 Hebei Key Laboratory of Turbidity, Shijiazhuang, Hebei, China, 3 School of Chinese Medicine, North China University of Science and Technology, Tangshan, Hebei, China, 4 Hebei Academy of Chinese Medicine Sciences, Shijiazhuang, Hebei, China

These authors contributed equally to this work.
\* 314749164@qq.com (YL); peilin13831190309@126.com (LP)

# Abstract

# Objective

This study offers meta-analytic data on the potential association between epilepsy and depression especially for the prevalence of depression in epilepsy or vice versa.

# Methods

The relevant studies were searched and identified from nine electronic databases. Studies that mentioned the prevalence and/or incidence of epilepsy and depression were included. Hand searches were also included. The search language was English and the search time was through May 2022. Where feasible, random-effects models were used to generate pooled estimates.

# Results

After screening electronic databases and other resources, 48 studies from 6,234 citations were included in this meta-analysis. The period prevalence of epilepsy ranged from 1% to 6% in patients with depression. In population-based settings, the pooled period prevalence of depression in patients with epilepsy was 27% (95% Cl, 23–31) and 34% in clinical settings (95% Cl, 30–39). Twenty studies reported that seizure frequency, low income, unemployment of the patients, perception of stigma, anxiety, being female, unmarried status, disease course, worse quality of life, higher disability scores, and focal-impaired awareness seizures were risk factors for depression.

# Conclusion

Our study found that epilepsy was associated with an increased risk of depression. Depression was associated with the severity of epilepsy.

University of Chinese Medicine (grant no. XCXZZBS2022011) provided training funding for the meta-analysis, and Shao-kun Qin is the recipient of the funding awards.

**Competing interests:** None of the authors has any conflicts of interest to disclose.

# Introduction

Epilepsy is a common neurological disorder in which abnormal electrical discharges in the brain can lead to recurrent seizures [1]. Epileptic seizures are generally rare with an annual incidence of approximately 0.3‰ for newly diagnosed epilepsy and 0.55‰ for unprovoked seizures [2]. In epilepsy, depression is the most common psychiatric comorbidity. Depression affects around one-third of these cases and impacts quality of life [3]. Depression is the most common psychiatric disorder, and it occurs in 14.1% of females and 14.8% of males worldwide [4]. Depression is more frequent in patients with epilepsy compared to the general population [5]. Epilepsy and depression both can influent individual's interpersonal communication, social activities and can increase the risk of sudden attacks [4,6]. Some studies indicate that epilepsy (PWE) varies between 10.7 to 44%, and it can reach 54% in refractory epilepsy [8]. However, the association between depression and epilepsy have not yet been comprehensively described.

The epidemiology and risk factors of depression in patients with epilepsy are unclear and vice versa. Understanding the epidemiology of depression and epilepsy is important in reducing disability and protecting patients' health and safe. Our study offers a comprehensive and systematic review of the prevalence, incidence, and reported risk factors for depression with epilepsy and epilepsy with depression. We further studied direct associations between depression and epilepsy.

### Methods

#### Protocol and registration

We registered this systematic review on the Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROS-PERO) on April, 2022 (#CRD42022327256). This systematic review and meta-analyses were reported with a predetermined protocol and the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement.

#### Information sources

Nine databases were searched from inception to May 15, 2022 (Fig 1). EndNote X9 was used to export and manage references. Search terms included awakening epilepsy, epilepsia, epileptic, epilepticus, seizure disorder, epilepsy, cryptogenic epilepsies, cryptogenic epilepsies, aura, depression, depressive symptoms, symptom depressive, emotional depression, etc. In addition, reference lists and bibliographies from cited documents were manually searched for additional articles. Hand searches were also included. The search language was English. A complete description of our search strategy is available as a S1 File.

#### Study selection

Two reviewers independently studied the titles, abstracts, and full text reviews to find potentially eligible reviews. The eligibility criteria included the following: (a) a clearly recognized diagnostic criteria for epilepsy and depression; (b) a sample size over 100; (c) reported prevalence or incidence of epilepsy in depression, vice versa, or both; the data had to be able to be extracted. The exclusion criteria included the following: (a) reporting only risk factors; (b) no focus on epilepsy and depression; or (c) duplicated studies. The most comprehensive version was selected from duplicate data. Disagreements between reviewers were solved by discussion. If agreement could not be reached, then a third senior study author resolved the issue.



#### Fig 1. PRISMA flow diagram.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.g001

#### Data extraction and study quality

Two authors extracted data independently in duplicate using a standard data abstraction form. Data were extracted by two authors, and the details were as follows: authors and study country, sample size, case size, mean age, age range, female, epileptic diagnostic criteria, depressive diagnostic criteria, data collection period, and prevalence. Research quality indicators related to sample representativeness, conditional evaluation, and statistical methods were extracted and provide the basis for conditional heterogeneity evaluation. Assessments of study quality were performed according to Subota et al [9]; see Fig 2.

#### Data synthesis and analysis

Depression in epilepsy, epilepsy in depression, or both were analyzed separately for each condition. The Cochrane Q statistic was calculated to assess the significance between study

Author, Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5	Q6	Q7	Q8	Totle Quality Scores
Adewuya 2005	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Alsaadi 2015	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Baker 2001	Yes	No							
Bautista 2013	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Bosak 2015	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Canuet 2009	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Chaka 2018	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Cianchetti 2018	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Cramer 2003	Yes	Yes	No	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Cramer 2004	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	
Cramer 2005	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	N/R	No	
Di 2012	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Espinosa 2016	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Ettinger 2004	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Fuller-Thomson 2008	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	
Gaitatzis 2004	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Han 2015	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Jo 2020	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Kui 2014	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Kwan 2008	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Kumar 2019	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Lee 2018	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Li 2019	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Lopez-Gomez 2005	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Mensah 2006	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	
Milovanović 2014	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Mori 2014	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Mohammadi 2019	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Nuyen 2006	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Ottman 2011	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	250	Yes	
Peterson 2014	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Pompili 2007	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	N/R	Yes	
Rashid 2021	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Ridsdale 2017	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Sah 2020	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Silagadze 2019	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Somayajula 2015	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
St 2011	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Stefanello 2011	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Tegegne 2015	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Tellez-Zenteno 2007	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Tsegabrhan 2014	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Viguera 2018	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Wang 2018	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/R	
Yildirim 2018	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Zeber 2007	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
Zhao 2012	Yes	Yes	N/R	N/R	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Zheng 2019	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	

**Fig 2. The quality scores of included studies.** Q1: Target Population described? Q2: Cases from entire population or probability sampling? Q3: Response rate >70%? Q4: Non-responders clearly described? Q5: Is the sample representative of the population? Q6: Were data collection methods standardized? Q7: Were validated criteria used to assess the presence/absence of disease? Q8: Are the estimates of prevalence and incidence given with confidence intervals?

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.g002

heterogeneity, and  $I^2$  was used to quantify the magnitude of between-study heterogeneity. When  $I^2 < 50\%$ , the pooled estimate and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) were calculated using a fixed-effect model. A random-effects model was used when  $I^2 > 50\%$ . Subgroup analysis was performed by sample resource and diagnostic criteria of depression. Our main outcomes were

Author, year (country, region)	Sample (n)	Case (n)	Age (year)	Female (n)	Diagnostic criteria epilepsy	Diagnostic criteria depression	Years of data collection	Prevalence
Mohammadi 2019 IRAN [10]	521	29	6-18	313	NR	NR	2016-2017	5.6%
Nuyen 2006 The Netherlands [11]	6641	50	NR	4452	diagnosis by general practitioner	NR	NR	0.75%

Table 1. Studies reporting on the prevalence and incidence of epilepsy in depression (n = 2).

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.t001

prevalence, confidence intervals, and percentage prevalence. All analyses were completed using Review Manager 5.4.

### Results

There were 12,712 studies preliminarily assessed for eligibility; 6,478 duplicate studies were excluded from Endnote X9. Here, 91 studies were screened at the full-text levels, and 48 studies were included. The reason for elimination was that they did not report depression or epilepsy (n = 24), were composed of a study sample of less than 100 (n = 10), reported duplicate data (n = 4), only reported risk factors of depression or epilepsy (n = 2), only contained an abstract (n = 8), or other reasons (n = 3). Manually checking the reference lists led to eight articles included in the systematic review for a total of 48 (Fig 1). The prevalence of epilepsy in depression was included in two articles (Table 1), the prevalence of depression in epilepsy was included in 43 articles (Table 2), and three articles recorded the comorbid relationship between epilepsy and depression (Table 3).

#### **Epilepsy in depression**

Two studies reported the prevalence of epilepsy in patients with depression—one from the Netherlands and one from Iran. Both studies used data from an administrative database. One study reported both the incidence rate of depression in epilepsy and the incidence rate of epilepsy in depression [11]; the other reported the rates of depression in children and adolescents in Iran [10]. There were relatively few studies, and the aggregated overall prevalence was not calculated.

#### Depression in epilepsy

Forty-three papers reported a prevalence estimate for depression with epilepsy. The 43 included studies from the United States (n = 8), China (n = 7), the United Kingdom (n = 4), Ethiopia (n = 3), Korea (n = 3), Canada (n = 2), India (n = 2), Japan (n = 2), Australia (n = 1), Brazil (n = 1), Colombia (n = 1), Georgia (n = 1), Italy (n = 1), Mexico (n = 1), Nigeria (n = 1), Poland (n = 1), Serbia (n = 1), Spain (n = 1), Turkey (n = 1), and the United Arab Emirates (n = 1). Among the 43 reports on the incidence rate of depression in epilepsy, 21 describe the demographic and clinical characteristics of epileptic patients in detail (Table 4).

Among the 43 reports on the incidence rate of depression in epilepsy, 15 were based on a population survey [14,19–22,25–27,35,38,39,45,47,50,52], and 28 were clinical studies [12,13,15–18,23,24,28–34,36,37,40–44,46,48,49,51,53,54]. In a population-based environment, the combined prevalence of epilepsy in depression patients was 27% (95% CI, 23–31), while the prevalence was 34% in the clinic (95% CI, 30–39) (Fig 3).

Depression is diagnosed with different scales: Beck Depression Inventory (BDI and BDI-II), Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (Fourth Edition (DSM-IV)), Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS), Neurological Disorders Depression Inventory for

	-				117.			
Author, year (country, region)	Sample (n)	Case (n)	Age (year)	Female (n)	Diagnostic criteria epilepsy	Diagnostic criteria depression	Years of data collection	Prevalence
Adewuya 2005 Nigeria [ <u>12</u> ]	102	29	12-18	37	NR	DSM-IV	NR	28.43%
Alsaadi 2015 United Arab Emirates [13]	186	50	18–65	105	NR	PHQ-9	2014.9–2015.1	26.88%
Baker 2001 UK [14]	669	163	NR	345	Physician diagnosis	HAD	NR	24.36%
Bautista 2013 USA [15]	200	71	≥18	156	NR	NIDDI-E	2012.6-2012.8	35.50%
Bosak 2015 Poland [16]	289	84	NR	49	NR	BDI	NR	29.06%
Canuet 2009 Japan [17]	114	51	18-80	49	Imaging	BDI-II	2006.6-2008.5	44.73%
Chaka 2018 Ethiopia [18]	422	185	≥18	173	NR	PHQ-9	2015.4-2015.5	43.83%
Cianchetti 2018 Italy [19]	326	30	8-18	171	NR	SAFA-D	NR	9.20%
Cramer 2003 USA [20]	683	240	NR	NR	NR	CES-D	2001.1	35.13%
Cramer 2004 USA [21]	649	206	≥18	NR	Seizure Severity Scale and QOLIE-89	CES-D	2001.1	31.74%
Cramer 2005 USA [22]	201	74	19–75	113	QOLIE10	HADS	NR	36.81%
Di 2012 Spanish [23]	121	25	≥18	80	Imaging	MINI	NR	20.66%
Espinosa 2016 Colombia [24]	220	86	18–79	106	ILAE 2014	NDDI-E	2014.9–2015.3	39.09%
Ettinger 2004 USA [25]	775	283	>18	365	Self-reported prior diagnosis of epilepsy	CES-D	2001.1-2002.4	36.51%
Fuller-Thomson 2009 Canada [26]	781	110	≥12	401	A health professional	CIDI-SF	2000-2001	14.08%
Gaitatzis 2004 UK [27]	5834	1063	>16	NR	ICD-9	NR	1995.1.1-1998.12.31	18.22%
Han 2015 Korea [28]	391	267	18-79	187	NR	BDI	NR	68.28%
Io 2020 Korea [29]	126	38	>18	62	ILAE 2014	РНО-9	2018.10-2018.12	30.15%
Kui 2014 China [30]	215	65	>18	84	ILAE	DSM-IV	NR	30.23%
Kwan 2009 China [31]	247	94	18-76	133	NB	HADS	2007 3-2007 6	38.05%
Lee 2018 Korea [32]	141	60	>18	68	ILAE 2014	HADS	NR	42 55%
Li 2019 China [33]	461	138	>18	248	II AF	CNDDLF	2017 1-2017 11	29.93%
Lopez-Gomez 2005 Mexico [34]	241	103	NR	116	ILAE	BDI	2002.3–2003.3	42.73%
Mensah 2006 UK [35]	499	139	18-78	252	NR	HADS	NR	27.85%
Milovanović 2014 Serbia [36]	203	67	18-65	118	II AF 2001	BDLII	NR	33.00%
Mori 2014 Japan [37]	463	85	>16	247	NR	IDS-SR	2009 10 2-2011 4 1	18 35%
Ottman 2011 USA [39]	3/88	1134	>10	2125	NP	ND	2009.10.2-2011.4.1	32 51%
Peterson 2014 Australia [39]	279	80	$\geq 10$ $\geq 18$	165	NR	HADS	NNR	28.67%
Pompili 2007 Italy [40]	103	43	19-78	72	NR	BDI	NR	41.74%
Rashid 2021 India [41]	449	180	18-75	219	ILAF	MINI	2018 1-2020 3	40.08%
Ridsdale 2017 UK [42]	403	113	16-85	219	OOLIF-31	НАДЯ	NR	28.03%
Silagadze 2019 Georgia [43]	130	31	18-56	68	NDDI-E ILAE	ICD-10	NR	23.84%

Table 2. Studies reporting on the prevalence and incidence of depression in epilepsy (n = 43).

(Continued)

Author, year (country, region)	Sample (n)	Case (n)	Age (year)	Female (n)	Diagnostic criteria epilepsy	Diagnostic criteria depression	Years of data collection	Prevalence
Somayajula 2015 India [44]	165	27	>16	62	ILAE	ICD-10	2011.5-20014.4	16.36%
Stefanello 2011 Brazil [ <u>45</u> ]	153	32	≥13	NR	ILAE	HAD	2006.5-2007.12	20.91%
Tegegne 2015 Ethiopia [ <u>46</u> ]	415	136	≥18	186	NR	HADS	2013.4-2013.5	32.77%
Tellez-Zenteno 2007 Canada [47]	253	44	≥15	NR	An interviewer asking directly	DSM-IV	2002.5-2002.12	17.39%
Tsegabrhan 2014 Ethiopia [ <u>48</u> ]	300	148	>18	117	NR	BDI-II	2012.8-2012.10	49.33%
Viguera 2018 USA [49]	1763	584	$\geq 18$	952	ICD-9-CM	PHQ-9	2007.10.1-20128.13	33.12%
Wang 2018 China [50]	458	241	$\geq 18$	100	NR	C-NDDI-E	NR	52.62%
Yildirim 2018 Turkey [51]	302	139	15-73	170	NR	BDI	NR	46.02%
Zeber 2007 USA [52]	13699	2961	$\geq 18$	503	ICD-9	ICD-9	1996.10.1-1999.9.30	21.61%
Zhao 2012 China [53]	140	36	15-71	70	ILAE 1989	HAMD	2007.8-2008.2	25.71%
Zheng 2019 China [54]	184	36	$\geq 18$	84	ILAE 2001	BDI	2014.6-2016.1	19.56%

Table 2. (Continued)

Abbreviation: ILAE = International League Against Epilepsy; QOLIE = the Quality of Life in Epilepsy Inventory; ICD = International Classification of Diseases; DSM-IV = Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders; BDI = Beck Depression Inventory; HADS = Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale; PHQ = the patient health questionnaire; CES-D = the Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression scale; CIDI-SF = Composite International Diagnostic Interview short-form; NDDI-E = Neurological Disorders Depression Inventory for Epilepsy; CNDDI-E = Chinese version of the Neurological Disorders Depression Inventory for Epilepsy; IDS-SR = the Inventory of Depressive Symptomatology Self Report.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.t002

Epilepsy (NDDI-E), Patient Health Questionnaire nine-item (PHQ-9), etc. The estimates of depression included here had significant subgroup differences (P<0.0001, I<sup>2</sup> = 94.5%). However, there is no significant subgroup difference when eliminating scales used only once or twice (Fig 4).

Twenty studies explored the risk factors of depression in patients with epilepsy (Table 4). Seizure frequency, low income, unemployment, perception of stigma, anxiety, being female, unmarried status, disease course, worse quality of life, higher disability scores, and focal-impaired awareness seizures were risk factors for depression. Eight studies identified seizure frequency as risk factors for depression in PWE [18,19,24,37,39,46,50,53]. Eight of the articles reported that lower income and unemployment are associated with depression in PWE [10,19,31,34,35,39,45,46]. Six studies found that the perception of stigma was associated with depression in PWE [13,16,19,37,46,53].

#### Table 3. Studies reporting on the prevalence and incidence of depression and epilepsy (n = 3).

Author, year (country, region)	Sample (n)	Case (n)	Age (year)	Female (n)	Diagnostic criteria epilepsy	Diagnostic criteria depression	Years of data collection	Prevalence
Kumar 2019 USA [55]	120	69	≥18	81	A self-reported diagnosis of epilepsy	DSM-5	NR	57.70%
Sah 2020 Nepal [56]	142	44	18–68	55	clinically confirmed epilepsy	HAMD	2018.4-2018.9	30.98%
St 2011 Canada [57]	7253	2044	0.03- 96	3481	ICD-9-CM ICD-10-CA	NR	1996.4.1-2004.3.31	28.18%

ICD-9-CM, the International Classification of Diseases, Version 9, Clinical Modification; ICD-10-CA, the International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems, Tenth Revision, Canada; DSM-5, Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition; HAMD, Hamilton Depression Scale.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.t003

Author, year	Sample (n)	Female (%)	Educ	ation (%)	Unemployment	Unmarried	
(country, region)			Less than high school	High school and above	(%)	(%)	
Bautista 2013 USA [15]	200	63.60	23.60	76.40	NR	40.30	
Bosak 2015 [16]	289	58.50	31.10	68.90	61.50	56.40	
Chaka 2018 [ <u>18</u> ]	422	40.90	80.80	19.20	9.70	50.20	
Cramer 2005 USA [22]	201	56.20	18.20	81.80	17.30	NR	
Espinosa 2016 Colombia [24]	220	48.10		NR	NR	85.50	
Fuller-Thomson 2009 Canada [26]	781	51.40	40.90	59.10	NR	48.90	
Han 2015 Korea [28]	391	47.80	19.10	80.90	37.10	54.10	
Jo 2020 Korea [29]	126	48.40		NR	25.40	NR	
Kui 2014 China [ <u>30</u> ]	215	39.00	65.10	34.90	34.80	39.10	
Lee 2018 Korea [32]	141	48.20	22.00	78.00	14.20	51.80	
Li 2019 China [ <u>33</u> ]	461	53.80	42.80	57.20	58.00	65.90	
Milovanovć 2014 Serbia [36]	203	58.10	23.10	76.90	25.10	58.10	
Peterson 2014 Australia [39]	279	59.10	47.30	52.70	51.60	41.60	
Ridsdale 2017 UK [42]	403	54.20	47.50	52.50	49.20	51.00	
Silagadze 2019 Georgia [43]	130	52.30	66.20	33.80	NR	NR	
Somayajula 2015 India [44]	165	37.60	59.40	40.60	6.70	62.40	
Tegegne 2015 [ <u>46</u> ]	415	44.80	82.40	17.60	NR	61.40	
Tsegabrhan 2014 Ethiopia [48]	300	39.00	55.70	44.30	21.70	53.30	
Wang 2018 China [50]	458	40.60	87.10	12.90	NR	25.80	
Yildirim 2018 Turkey [51]	302	56.00	58.00	42.00	26.00	55.00	
Zheng 2019 China [54]	184	45.65	61.40	38.60	26.60	47.20	

Table 4. Demographic and clinical characteristics of epileptic patients (n = 21).

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.t004

#### Comorbid epilepsy and depression

Three studies reported the comorbidity of epilepsy and depression [55-57]. Geographically, the three studies were from the United States, Nepal, and Canada. One study acquired data through registries, and two utilized a hospital clinic review. The aggregated overall prevalence was not estimated because of low sample size. One study examined risk factors and found that drug use remained an important predictor of depression among patients with epilepsy (*P* = 0.002); the odds of having depression in patients receiving polytherapy were 3.82-fold higher than in those receiving monotherapy (95% CI, 1.61–9.05, *P* = 0.002) [56].

## Discussion

The median incidence of epilepsy was 50.4 per 100,000 every year ([IQR] 33.6–75.6) [58]; it is estimated that 3.8% of the population suffer from depression. There were more studies on the incidence of depression with epilepsy than epilepsy with depression. This may because depression predicts a worse response to treatment during epilepsy [59] and because people with depression face greater suicide risk [60]; thus, many studies focus on depression with epilepsy. Three studies reported comorbidity, but they do not have specific samples or cases. Few studies reported on occurrence of epilepsy with depression and comorbidity, and a pooled overall prevalence evaluation could not be calculated.

This association may be causal or there may be common pathogenic mechanisms underlying depression and epilepsy. Depression is the most common psychiatric comorbidity in patients with epilepsy [61], and it may explain the worse response to epilepsy treatment [62].

Epilepsy is associated with increasing incidence of depression. Our meta-analysis found that the pooled overall period prevalence of depression in epilepsy based on population (27%,

				Risk Difference	Risk Difference
Study or Subgroup	Risk Difference	SE	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV. Random, 95% Cl
population setting					
Baker 2001	0.24364723	0.01659701	2.5%	0.24 [0.21, 0.28]	-
Cianchetti 2018	0.09202454	0.01600958	2.5%	0.09 [0.06, 0.12]	-
Cramer 2003	0.35139092	0.01826739	2.4%	0.35 [0.32, 0.39]	
Cramer 2004	0.3174114	0.01827126	2.4%	0.32 [0.28, 0.35]	-
Cramer 2005	0.3681592	0.03401916	2.2%	0.37 [0.30, 0.43]	
Ettinger 2004	0.36516129	0.01729511	2.4%	0.37 [0.33, 0.40]	
Fuller-Thomson 2009	0.14084507	0.01244747	2.5%	0.14 [0.12, 0.17]	-
Gaitatzis 2004	0.18220775	0.00505384	2.5%	0.18 [0.17, 0.19]	-
Mensah 2006	0.27855711	0.02006817	2.4%	0.28 [0.24, 0.32]	
Ottman 2011	0.32511468	0.00793131	2.5%	0.33 [0.31, 0.34]	-
Peterson 2014	0.28673835	0.0270748	2.3%	0.29 [0.23, 0.34]	
Stefanello 2011	0.20915033	0.0328799	2.3%	0.21 [0.14, 0.27]	
Tellez-Zenteno 2007	0.17391304	0.02382971	2.4%	0.17 [0.13, 0.22]	
Wang 2018	0.52620087	0.02333137	2.4%	0.53 [0.48, 0.57]	
Zeber 2007	0.21614716	0.0035168	2.5%	0.22 [0.21, 0.22]	
Subtotal (95% CI)			36.3%	0.27 [0.23, 0.31]	
Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0	0.01; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 693.89,	df = 14 (P < 0	0.00001);	l² = 98%	
Test for overall effect: 2	Z = 13.36 (P < 0.000	001)			
clinic setting					
Adewuya 2005	0.28431373	0.04466426	2.1%	0.28 [0.20, 0.37]	
Alsaadi 2015	0.2688172	0.03250761	2.3%	0.27 [0.21, 0.33]	
Bautista 2013	0.355	0.033836	2.2%	0.35 [0.29, 0.42]	
Bosak 2015	0.29065744	0.02670975	2.3%	0.29 [0.24, 0.34]	
Canuet 2009	0.44736842	0.04656913	2.0%	0.45 [0.36, 0.54]	
Chaka 2018	0.43838863	0.02415413	2.4%	0.44 [0.39, 0.49]	
Di 2012	0.20661157	0.03680676	2.2%	0.21 [0.13, 0.28]	
Espinosa 2016	0.39090909	0.03289786	2.3%	0.39 [0.33, 0.46]	
Han 2015	0.68286445	0.0235343	2.4%	0.68 [0.64, 0.73]	
Jo 2020	0.3015873	0.04088625	2.1%	0.30 [0.22, 0.38]	
Kui 2014	0.30232558	0.03132165	2.3%	0.30 [0.24, 0.36]	
Kwan 2009	0.3805668	0.03089329	2.3%	0.38 [0.32, 0.44]	
Lee 2018	0.42553191	0.04163796	2.1%	0.43 [0.34, 0.51]	
Li 2019	0.29934924	0.02132993	2.4%	0.30 [0.26, 0.34]	
Lopez-Gomez 2005	0.42738589	0.03186637	2.3%	0.43 [0.36, 0.49]	
Milovanovic 2014	0.33004926	0.03300371	2.3%	0.33 [0.27, 0.39]	_
Mori 2014	0.18358531	0.01799218	2.4%	0.18 [0.15, 0.22]	
Pompili 2007	0.41/4/5/3	0.0485908	2.0%	0.42 [0.32, 0.51]	
Rashid 2021 Bidadala 2017	0.40069067	0.02312828	2.4%	0.40 [0.36, 0.45]	
Riusuale 2017	0.20039702	0.02237591	2.4%	0.20 [0.24, 0.32]	
Silagadze 2019 Somovojulo 2015	0.23040134	0.03737519	2.2%	0.24 [0.17, 0.31]	
Somayajula 2015	0.10303030	0.0288002	2.3%	0.10 [0.11, 0.22]	
Tegegne 2015	0.32771004	0.0230409	2.4%	0.33 [0.26, 0.37]	
Viguoro 2018	0.495555555	0.02080495	2.5%	0.49 [0.44, 0.55]	-
Vildirim 2019	0.00120004	0.01120940	2.0%	0.33 [0.31, 0.33]	
7hao 2012	0.4002049	0.02000077	2.3%	0.40 [0.40, 0.32]	
Zhao 2012 Zheng 2010	0.207 14200	0.0202/525	2.2/0	0.20 [0.10, 0.33]	_ <b>_</b> _
Subtotal (95% CI)	0.19003217	0.02024020	63.7%	0.34 [0.30. 0.39]	•
Heterogeneity: $Tau^2 = 0$	0.01: Chi <sup>2</sup> = 492.11	df = 27 (P < 0	0.00001)	l <sup>2</sup> = 95%	-
Test for overall effect: 2	Z = 15.60 (P < 0.000	001)			
Total (95% CI)			100.0%	0 32 [0 29 0 35]	•
Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> - (	01: Chi2 - 150/ 04	5 df = 12 / P <	0.00004	· 12 = 07%	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Test for overall effect: 7	7 = 20.68 / D < 0.000	), ai – 42 (r² ≤ 101)	0.00001)	,1 - 51 /0	0 0.25 0.5
Test for subgroup differ	rences: Chi <sup>2</sup> = 5.79.	df = 1 (P = 0.	02). I² = 8	2.7%	

Fig 3. Overall prevalence of depression among persons with epilepsy in population setting and clinic setting.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.g003

				Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean Difference	SE	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV, Random, 95% Cl
BDI/BDI-II					
Bosak 2015	0.29065744 (	0.02670975	4.1%	0.29 [0.24, 0.34]	
Canuet 2009	0.44736842 (	0.04656913	3.7%	0.45 [0.36, 0.54]	
Han 2015	0.68286445	0.0235343	4.1%	0.68 [0.64, 0.73]	•
Lopez-Gomez 2005	0.42738589	0.03186637	4.0%	0.43 [0.36, 0.49]	
Milovanović 2014	0.33004926	0.03300371	4.0%	0.33 [0.27, 0.39]	
Pompili 2007	0.41747573	0.0485908	3.6%	0.42 [0.32, 0.51]	
Tsegabrhan 2014	0.49333333 (	0.02886495	4.0%	0.49 [0.44, 0.55]	
Yildirim 2018	0.4602649	0.02868077	4.0%	0.46 [0.40, 0.52]	
Zheng 2019 Subtotal (95% Cl)	0.19565217 (	0.02924525	4.0% 35.6%	0.20 [0.14, 0.25] <b>0.42 [0.31, 0.52]</b>	-
Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> =	0.03; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 222.18, d	f = 8 (P < 0.0	00001); l²	= 96%	
Test for overall effect:	Z = 7.63 (P < 0.00001	)			
HADS					
Cramer 2005	0.3681592	0.03401916	3.9%	0.37 [0.30, 0.43]	
Kwan 2008	0.3805668	0.03089329	4.0%	0.38 [0.32, 0.44]	
Lee 2018	0.42553191 (	0.04163796	3.8%	0.43 [0.34, 0.51]	
Mensah 2006	0.27855711 (	0.02006817	4.2%	0.28 [0.24, 0.32]	
Peterson 2014	0.28673835	0.0270748	4.1%	0.29 [0.23, 0.34]	
Tegegne 2015	0.32771084	0.0230409	4.1%	0.33 [0.28, 0.37]	
Subtotal (95% CI)	0.00.01.12 - 40.00.16		Z4.1%	0.34 [0.30, 0.38]	•
Test for overall effect:	Z = 15.51 (P < 0.000)	= 5 (P = 0.00 1)	03); 12 = 72	2%	
PHQ-9	0.0000470	00050704	4.00/	0.07/0.04 0.001	
Alsaadi 2015	0.2688172	0.03250761	4.0%	0.27 [0.21, 0.33]	
Chaka 2018	0.43838863	0.02415413	4.1%	0.44 [0.39, 0.49]	
Jo 2020	0.3015873	0.04088625	3.8%	0.30 [0.22, 0.38]	
Viguera 2017	0.33125354	0.01120946	4.3%	0.33 [0.31, 0.35]	<b></b>
Hotorogonoity: Tou <sup>2</sup> -	0 00, Chi2 - 22 97 df	-2/D < 0.00	10.2 /0	0.34 [0.27, 0.40]	•
Test for overall effect:	Z = 9.96 (P < 0.00001)	= 3 (P < 0.00 )	001); 1- = 0	57 70	
DSM-IV					
Adewuva 2005	0.28431373	0.04466426	3.7%	0.28 [0.20, 0.37]	
Kui 2014	0.30232558	0.03132165	4.0%	0.30 [0.24, 0.36]	
Tellez-Zenteno 2007	0.17391304 (	0.02382971	4.1%	0.17 [0.13, 0.22]	
Subtotal (95% CI)			11.8%	0.25 [0.16, 0.34]	
Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> =	0.01; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 12.35, df	= 2 (P = 0.00	02); l² = 84	4%	
Test for overall effect:	Z = 5.39 (P < 0.00001	)			
	0.0000000		4.00/	0.00 10.00 0.401	
Jovel 2016	0.39090909	0.03289786	4.0%	0.39 [0.33, 0.46]	
LI 2019	0.29934924	0.02132993	4.2%	0.30 [0.26, 0.34]	
Subtotal (95% CI)	0.52620087 (	0.02333137	4.1%	0.53 [0.48, 0.57]	
Hotorogonoitu Tou? -	0 02: Chi2 - 51 60 -4	- 2 (D - 0.0)	00011.12 -	0.41 [0.20, 0.33]	
Test for overall effect:	Z = 5.46 (P < 0.00001)	- 2 (P < 0.00 )	0001); I* =	30 %	
Total (95% CI)			100 0%	0 36 [0 32 0 41]	•
Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> -	0 01. Chi2 - 452 02 4	f = 21 / D > 0	000010	2 - 05%	<b>↓ ↓ ↓</b>
Test for overall effect:	Z = 15.74 (P < 0.0000)	n - 24 (P < 0 1)			0 0.25 0.5
Test for subgroup diffe	erences: Chi <sup>2</sup> = $6.47.$ d	t = 4 (P = 0.7)	$17$ ). $ ^2 = 38$	3.2%	

Fig 4. Overall prevalence of depression among persons with epilepsy by different depression diagnostic tool.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.g004

Author, year	Sample (n)	Age range studied	Risk factors	Examined factors	Statistical method	Depression scales
Adewuya 2005 [ <u>12</u> ]	102	12-18	Frequency of seizures, number of antiepileptic drugs, perception of stigma	Age, gender, level of education/class, age of onset of illness, duration of epilepsy, seizure type, types of AEDs, number of AEDs	Regression analysis	DSM-IV
Alsaadi 2015 [ <u>13</u> ]	186	18-65	Age, gender	Marital status, nationality, seizure frequency age, gender, epilepsy classification, number of seizures in the 6 months prior to the clinic visit	Multi regression mode	PHQ-9
Bosak 2015 [ <u>16]</u>	289	NR	Age, frequent seizures, use medications	Age, gender, marital status, education level, occupational activity, use of antidepressant	Logistic regression modeling	BDI
Chaka 2018 [ <u>18]</u>	422	≥18	Female, single, perceived stigma, medication adherence, current substance use	Age, gender, ethnicity, marital status, religion, residence, education, occupation, with whom living now	Logistic regression analysis	PHQ-9
Cianchetti 2018 [19]	326	8-18	Severity and duration of the epilepsy	Sex, education, epilepsy severity, disease duration, antiepileptic treatment	Chi-square or Fisher's exact test	SAFA-D
Espinosa 2016 [24]	220	18–79	Unemployed	Age, sex, education, marital status, and occupational activity, risk factors for epilepsy, age of diagnosis, type of seizures, frequency of seizures, treatment with antiepileptic drugs, and therapeutic response	A multiple linear regression model	NDDI-E
Kui 2014 [ <u>30</u> ]	215	>18	Employment status, presence of chronic medical illnesses, drug responsiveness	Education, marriage status, employment status, gender, age, age at seizure onset, duration of epilepsy, seizure type, aetiology of epilepsy, epileptic family history, previous status epilepticus, EEG findings, neuroimaging findings outcome of epilepsy, chronic medical illnesses	A binary logistic regression	DSM-IV
Lee 2018 [ <u>32</u> ]	141	>18	Higher neuroticism, lower self-esteem, marital status, and lower extroversion	Gender, age at the first seizure onset, marriage, job, economic class, presence vs. absence of perceived stigma	Stepwise linear regression model	HADS
Lopez-Gomez 2005 [ <u>34</u> ]	241	NR	Seizure frequency	Age, gender, marital status, educational degree, or type of economic activity	A logistic regression model	BDI Madrs
Mensah 2006 [ <u>35</u> ]	499	18–78	Unemployment	Gender, marital status, or monotherapy or polytherapy antiepileptic medication	A stepwise multiple regression analysis	HADS
Milovanović 2014 [ <u>36</u> ]	203	18-65	Educational level	Age, educational level, occupational status, marital status, epilepsy history, seizure types, seizure frequency, comorbidity, drug treatment	Hierarchical multiple regression analysis	BDI-II
Peterson 2014 [39]	279	≥18	Employment status, high levels of social stigma, ineffective control of seizures	Gender, employment, marital status, education	Pearson correlations and block recursive regression	HADS
Somayajula 2015 [44]	165	>16	Married	Gender, married, unemployment, graduate age	Logistic regression	ICD-10
Stefanello 2011 [45]	153	≥13	Unemployment, fewer years of schooling, age above 41	Age, gender, marital status, occupation schooling, economic group	Logistic regression analysis	HAD
Tegegne 2015 [ <u>46</u> ]	415	≥18	Using poly-therapy of anticonvulsants, perceived stigma, inability to read or write	Age, gender, marital status, residence, religion, ethnicity, educational status, occupation, monthly income, frequency of seizure	Logistic regression analysis	HADS
Tsegabrhan 2014 [ <u>48</u> ]	300	>18	Epilepsy-related perceived stigma, high seizure frequency, low educational status	Age, duration of illness, marital status, educational status, occupation, place of residence, seizure frequency, type of AEDs, epilepsy-related perception of stigma	Bivariate logistic regression	BDI-II
Viguera 2018 [49]	1763	≥18	Age, black race, lower income, lower health-related quality-of-life, higher LSSS score (worse severity)	Age, gender, race, marital status, household median income, patient-reported health-related quality of life, disease-specific performance scale	Univariate logistic regression models	PHQ-9
Wang 2018 [50]	458	≥18	Income, frequent seizures	Gender, marital status, age, income, education, age at seizure onset, polytherapy	NR	C-NDDI-E

#### Table 5. Risk factors of depression with epilepsy (n = 20).

(Continued)

Author, year	Sample (n)	Age range studied	Risk factors	Examined factors	Statistical method	Depression scales
Yildirim 2018 [51]	302	15-73	Female, lower education and income levels, never employed, higher seizure frequency	Gender, marital status, educational level, occupation, income level, seizure frequency, seizure type, medication, family history of epilepsy	A multivariate linear regression	BDI
Zhao 2012 [53]	140	15-71	Complex partial seizures, number of seizure types	Gender, seizure type, seizure frequency, number of anti-epilepsy drugs	NR	HAMD

Table 5. (Continued)

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0278907.t005

95% CI, 0.23–0.31) was lower than that based on clinical evaluation (34%, 95% CI, 0.30–0.39). The difference between them was statistically significant (P = 0.01). The diagnosis of depression is based on many different scales [63]. Epilepsy is diagnosed through the patient's clinical symptoms as well as imaging and electroencephalogram changes [64]; however, some population-based diagnoses of epilepsy use questionnaires. We believe that the diagnosis of epilepsy based on clinical features is more accurate than population settings. This condition can perhaps explain the big heterogeneity in the findings because epilepsy was associated with depression [65].

We did subgroup analysis for scales of depression to estimate whether different depression scales affect the above results. The subgroup analysis showed different incidence rates using different scales. These range from 30% to 34% and were statistically significant (P<0.0001). However, we do not believe that this difference represents a difference in the detection rates of these scales. First, the I<sup>2</sup> of the results is 97%. Second, some scales were only used once in our cohort of papers. However, some studies have shown that the clinical use of NDDI-E, HADS, and other scales is not the main driver for these inconsistent results [41]. Thus, we eliminated studies that included these factors and obtained more reasonable results, i.e., no statistical difference between subgroups (Fig 4).

A meta-analysis reported that epilepsy was associated with an increased risk of depression [66]. Risk factors for depression in epilepsy were summarized based on the literature to further investigate the factors influencing the association between epilepsy and depression. There were 20 studies reporting risk factors about depression in epilepsy (Table 5). Seizure frequency, low income, unemployment, and perception of stigma were associated with depression in PWE. A study found that seizure frequency (P = 0.36) was not associated with depression [13]. This article did not limit the disease course during the inclusion criteria for patients with epilepsy, which is the main factor influencing depression in patients with epilepsy.

Although there are fewer studies reporting the incidence of epilepsy with depression in our meta-analysis, some studies suggest that depression is associated with epilepsy. Depression in epilepsy can change the response to treatment, aggravate the condition, reduce the quality of life, and increase the risk of suicidal tendencies among patients with epilepsy [61]. A study reported that major depression was associated with a sixfold increased risk of unprovoked seizures (95% CI, 1.56–22) [67].

This work focused more on the relationship between epilepsy and depression and the risk factors for depression in patients with epilepsy. Our study found that people pay more attention to the prevalence of depression in epilepsy than that epilepsy in depression. Moreover, it has been reported that epilepsy and depression share a common pathogenic mechanism [7]; thus, we believe that our study has implications for clinical work.

There are some limitations in this article. A wide variety of age ranges from 0.03 to 96 were sampled; this decreased the number of studies that could be pooled for further analyses. The

studies had varied clinical diagnostic criteria used for depression or epilepsy. MINI is most frequently used in diagnosis of depression as gold standard [41]. Some studies suggested that PHQ-9, NDDI-E and HAMD did not differ statistically from MINI in the diagnosis of depression [23,41]. No studies have yet reported whether statistical differences exist between different diagnostic methods of epilepsy—this may influence the rate of depression in epilepsy or vice versa.

#### Conclusion

Our study found that epilepsy was associated with an increased risk of depression. We worked with a limited number of studies, and their number was unevenly distributed among the three groups (depression in epilepsy, epilepsy in depression, and comorbidity); however, we can still draw some conclusions. Epilepsy is associated with an incidence of depression, and depression is associated with the severity of epilepsy. We thus need pay more attention to mental health for patients with epilepsy. The treatment of depression requires a more positive method, and interpretation of this meta-analysis requires caution. There was a large heterogeneity among the studies, and it may influence our results. More studies are needed in distinct populations and with accurate estimates to inform public health policy and prevention. This can help define health resource needs in these populations.

### Supporting information

S1 File. Supplementary material: Search strategies, depression and epilepsy, and final search.

(PDF)

**S2 File. PRISMA 2009 checklist.** (PDF)

## **Author Contributions**

Conceptualization: Shao-kun Qin, Zi-xian Yang.

Formal analysis: Zi-xian Yang, Zhen-wei Guan, Jin-hu Zhang.

Funding acquisition: Shao-kun Qin, Lin Pei.

Methodology: Shao-kun Qin, Xin Ping.

Project administration: Ye Lu.

Software: Shao-kun Qin, Zi-xian Yang, Jin-hu Zhang, Xin Ping.

Supervision: Lin Pei.

Writing - original draft: Shao-kun Qin, Zi-xian Yang.

Writing - review & editing: Ye Lu, Lin Pei.

#### References

- Nevitt SJ, Sudell M, Cividini S, Marson AG, Tudur Smith C. Antiepileptic drug monotherapy for epilepsy: a network meta-analysis of individual participant data. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2022; 4(4): Cd011412. https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD011412.pub4 PMID: 35363878
- Fiest KM, Sauro KM, Wiebe S, Patten SB, Kwon CS, Dykeman J, et al. Prevalence and incidence of epilepsy: a systematic review and meta-analysis of international studies. Neurology. 2017; 88(3):296–303. https://doi.org/10.1212/WNL.00000000003509 PMID: 27986877

- Maguire MJ, Marson AG, Nevitt SJ. Antidepressants for people with epilepsy and depression. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2021; 4(4):Cd010682. https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD010682.pub3 PMID: 33860531
- Lu Y, Sun G, Yang F, Guan Z, Zhang Z, Zhao J, et al. Baicalin regulates depression behavior in mice exposed to chronic mild stress via the Rac/LIMK/cofilin pathway. Biomed Pharmacother. 2019; 116:109054. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biopha.2019.109054 PMID: 31176122
- Mazarati AM, Pineda E, Shin D, Tio D, Taylor AN, Sankar R. Comorbidity between epilepsy and depression: role of hippocampal interleukin-1beta. Neurobiol Dis. 2010; 37(2):461–67. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nbd.2009.11.001 PMID: 19900553
- Ping X, Qin SK, Liu SN, Lu Y, Zhao YN, Cao YF, et al. Effects of Huazhuo Jiedu Shugan Decoction on cognitive and emotional disorders in a rat model of epilepsy: possible involvement of AC-cAMP-CREB signaling and NPY expression. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med. 2019; 2019:4352879. <u>https:// doi.org/10.1155/2019/4352879 PMID: 31915447</u>
- Błaszczyk B, Czuczwar SJ. Epilepsy coexisting with depression. Pharmacol Rep. 2016; 68(5):1084–92. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pharep.2016.06.011 PMID: 27634589
- Lacey CJ, Salzberg MR, D'Souza WJ. What factors contribute to the risk of depression in epilepsy?— Tasmanian Epilepsy Register Mood Study (TERMS). Epilepsia. 2016; 57(3):516–22. https://doi.org/10. 1111/epi.13302 PMID: 26763001
- Subota A, Pham T, Jette N, Sauro K, Lorenzetti D, Holroyd-Leduc J. The association between dementia and epilepsy: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Epilepsia. 2017; 58(6):962–72. https://doi.org/10. 1111/epi.13744 PMID: 28397967
- Mohammadi MR, Alavi SS, Ahmadi N, Khaleghi A, Kamali K, Ahmadi A, et al. The prevalence, comorbidity and socio-demographic factors of depressive disorder among Iranian children and adolescents: to identify the main predictors of depression. J Affect Disord. 2019; 247:1–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2019.01.005 PMID: 30640024
- Nuyen J, Schellevis FG, Satariano WA, Spreeuwenberg PM, Birkner MD, van den Bos GA, et al. Comorbidity was associated with neurologic and psychiatric diseases: a general practice-based controlled study. J Clin Epidemiol. 2006; 59(12):1274–84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2006.01.005 PMID: 17098570
- Adewuya AO, Ola BA. Prevalence of and risk factors for anxiety and depressive disorders in Nigerian adolescents with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2005; 6(3):342–47. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2004. 12.011 PMID: 15820341
- Alsaadi T, El Hammasi K, Shahrour TM, Shakra M, Turkawi L, Almaskari B, et al. Prevalence of depression and anxiety among patients with epilepsy attending the epilepsy clinic at Sheikh Khalifa Medical City, UAE: a cross-sectional study. Epilepsy Behav. 2015; 52(Pt A):194–99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. yebeh.2015.09.008 PMID: 26448591
- 14. Baker GA, Jacoby A, Buck D, Brooks J, Potts P, Chadwick DW. The quality of life of older people with epilepsy: findings from a UK community study. Seizure. 2001; 10(2):92–99. https://doi.org/10.1053/seiz.2000.0465 PMID: 11407951
- Bautista RE, Erwin PA. Analyzing depression coping strategies of patients with epilepsy: a preliminary study. Seizure. 2013; 22(9):686–91. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seizure.2013.05.004 PMID: 23711614
- Bosak M, Turaj W, Dudek D, Siwek M, Szczudlik A. Depressogenic medications and other risk factors for depression among Polish patients with epilepsy. Neuropsychiatr Dis Treat. 2015; 11:2509–17. https://doi.org/10.2147/NDT.S91538 PMID: 26491329
- Canuet L, Ishii R, Iwase M, Ikezawa K, Kurimoto R, Azechi M, et al. Factors associated with impaired quality of life in younger and older adults with epilepsy. Epilepsy Res. 2009; 83(1):58–65. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2008.09.001 PMID: 18976886
- Chaka A, Awoke T, Yohannis Z, Ayano G, Tareke M, Abate A, et al. Determinants of depression among people with epilepsy in central Ethiopia. Ann Gen Psychiatry. 2018; 17:27. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/</u> s12991-018-0197-z PMID: 29942342
- Cianchetti C, Bianchi E, Guerrini R, Baglietto MG, Briguglio M, Cappelletti S, et al. Symptoms of anxiety and depression and family's quality of life in children and adolescents with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2018; 79:146–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2017.11.030 PMID: 29289902
- Cramer JA, Blum D, Reed M, Fanning K. The influence of comorbid depression on seizure severity. Epilepsia. 2003; 44:1578–84. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0013-9580.2003.28403.x PMID: 14636331
- Cramer JA, Blum D, Fanning K, Reed M, Epilepsy Impact Project G. The impact of comorbid depression on health resource utilization in a community sample of people with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2004; 5 (3):337–42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2004.01.010 PMID: 15145303

- Cramer JA, Brandenburg N, Xu X. Differentiating anxiety and depression symptoms in patients with partial epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2005; 6(4):563–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2005.02.017 PMID: 15907750
- Di Capua D, Garcia-Garcia ME, Reig-Ferrer A, Fuentes-Ferrer M, Toledano R, Gil-Nagel A, et al. Validation of the Spanish version of the Neurological Disorders Depression Inventory for Epilepsy (NDDI-E). Epilepsy Behav. 2012; 24(4):493–96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2012.06.005 PMID: 22784672
- Espinosa Jovel CA, Ramirez Salazar S, Rincon Rodriguez C, Sobrino Mejia FE. Factors associated with quality of life in a low-income population with epilepsy. Epilepsy Res. 2016; 127:168–74. <u>https://</u> doi.org/10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2016.08.031 PMID: 27608435
- Ettinger A, Reed M, Cramer J. Depression and comorbidity in community-based patients with epilepsy or asthma. NEUROLOGY. 2004; 63:1008–14. https://doi.org/10.1212/01.wnl.0000138430.11829.61
   PMID: 15452291
- Fuller-Thomson E, Brennenstuhl S. The association between depression and epilepsy in a nationally representative sample. Epilepsia. 2009; 50(5):1051–58. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-1167.2008</u>. 01803.x PMID: 19183219
- Gaitatzis A, Carroll K, Majeed A, Sander JW. The epidemiology of the comorbidity of epilepsy in the general population. Epilepsia. 2004; 45(12):1613–22,. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0013-9580.2004</u>. 17504.x PMID: 15571520
- Han SH, Kim B, Lee SA, Korean Qo LiESG. Contribution of the family environment to depression in Korean adults with epilepsy. Seizure. 2015; 25:26–31. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seizure.2014.11.011</u> PMID: 25645631
- Jo S, Kim HJ, Kim HW, Koo YS, Lee SA. Sex differences in factors associated with daytime sleepiness and insomnia symptoms in persons with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2020; 104(Pt A):106919. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2020.106919 PMID: 32058302
- Kui C, Yingfu P, Chenling X, Wenqing W, Xiuhua L, Di S. What are the predictors of major depression in adult patients with epilepsy? Epileptic Disord. 2014; 16(1):74–79. <u>https://doi.org/10.1684/epd.2014</u>. 0634 PMID: 24691300
- Kwan P, Yu E, Leung H, Leon T, Mychaskiw MA. Association of subjective anxiety, depression, and sleep disturbance with quality-of-life ratings in adults with epilepsy. Epilepsia. 2009; 50(5):1059–66. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-1167.2008.01938.x PMID: 19170734
- Lee SA, Jeon JY, No SK, Park H, Kim OJ, Kwon JH, et al. Factors contributing to anxiety and depressive symptoms in adults with new-onset epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2018; 88:325–31. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.yebeh.2018.10.005 PMID: 30340902
- Li Q, Chen D, Zhu LN, Wang HJ, Xu D, Tan G, et al. Depression in people with epilepsy in West China: status, risk factors and treatment gap. Seizure. 2019; 66:86–92. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seizure.2019. 02.014 PMID: 30818182
- Lopez-Gomez M, Ramirez-Bermudez J, Campillo C, Sosa AL, Espinola M, Ruiz I. Primidone is associated with interictal depression in patients with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2005; 6(3):413–16. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2005.01.016 PMID: 15820351
- Mensah SA, Beavis JM, Thapar AK, Kerr M. The presence and clinical implications of depression in a community population of adults with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2006; 8(1):213–19. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2005.09.014</u> PMID: 16337435
- Milovanovic M, Martinovic Z, Toskovic O. Determinants of quality of life in people with epilepsy in Serbia. Epilepsy Behav. 2014; 31:160–66. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2013.12.015 PMID: 24424279
- Mori Y, Kanemoto K, Onuma T, Tanaka M, Oshima T, Kato H, et al. Anger is a distinctive feature of epilepsy patients with depression. The Tohoku journal of experimental medicine. 2014; 232(2):123–28. https://doi.org/10.1620/tjem.232.123 PMID: 24561543
- Ottman R, Lipton RB, Ettinger AB, Cramer JA, Reed ML, Morrison A, et al. Comorbidities of epilepsy: results from the Epilepsy Comorbidities and Health (EPIC) survey. Epilepsia. 2011; 52(2):308–15. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-1167.2010.02927.x PMID: 21269285
- Peterson CL, Walker C, Shears G. The social context of anxiety and depression: exploring the role of anxiety and depression in the lives of Australian adults with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2014; 34:29–33. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2014.03.005 PMID: 24681382
- Pompili M, Lester D, Innamorati M, Girardi P. Depression, hopelessness and suicide risk among patients suffering from epilepsy. Ann Ist Super SanItà. 2007; 43 (4):425–29. PMID: 18209276
- Rashid H, Katyal J, Sood M, Tripathi M. Depression in persons with epilepsy: a comparative study of different tools in Indian population. Epilepsy Behav. 2021; 115:107633. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2020.107633">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2020.107633</a> PMID: 33309426

- Ridsdale L, Wojewodka G, Robinson E, Landau S, Noble A, Taylor S, et al. Characteristics associated with quality of life among people with drug-resistant epilepsy. J Neurol. 2017; 264(6):1174–84. https:// doi.org/10.1007/s00415-017-8512-1 PMID: 28550480
- Silagadze K, Kasradze S, Silagadze T, Lomidze G. Validation of a Georgian version of the Neurological Disorders Depression Inventory for Epilepsy (NDDI-E). Epilepsy Behav. 2019; 101(Pt A):106587. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2019.106587 PMID: 31698261
- Somayajula S, Vooturi S, Jayalakshmi S. Psychiatric disorders among 165 patients with juvenile myoclonic epilepsy in India and association with clinical and sociodemographic variables. Epilepsy Behav. 2015; 53:37–42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2015.09.024 PMID: 26519664
- 45. Stefanello S, Marín-Léon L, Fernandes PT, Li LM, Botega NJ. Depression and anxiety in a community sample with epilepsy in Brazil. Arg Neuropsiguiatr. 2011; 69(2-B):342–48.
- 46. Tegegne MT, Mossie TB, Awoke AA, Assaye AM, Gebrie BT, Eshetu DA. Depression and anxiety disorder among epileptic people at Amanuel Specialized Mental Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. BMC Psychiatry. 2015; 15:210. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12888-015-0589-4 PMID: 26328614
- Tellez-Zenteno JF, Patten SB, Jette N, Williams J, Wiebe S. Psychiatric comorbidity in epilepsy: a population-based analysis. Epilepsia. 2007; 48(12):2336–44. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-1167.2007</u>. 01222.x PMID: 17662062
- Tsegabrhan H, Negash A, Tesfay K, Abera M. Co-morbidity of depression and epilepsy in Jimma University specialized hospital, Southwest Ethiopia. Neurology India. 2014; 62(6):649–55. <u>https://doi.org/10.4103/0028-3886.149391 PMID: 25591679</u>
- 49. Viguera AC, Fan Y, Thompson NR, Lapin B, Chaitoff A, Griffith SD, et al. Prevalence and predictors of depression among patients with epilepsy, stroke, and multiple sclerosis using the Cleveland Clinic Knowledge Program within the neurological institute. Psychosomatics. 2018; 59(4):369–78. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psym.2017.12.003 PMID: 29580558
- Wang HJ, Tan G, Deng Y, He J, He YJ, Zhou D, et al. Prevalence and risk factors of depression and anxiety among patients with convulsive epilepsy in rural West China. Acta neurologica Scandinavica. 2018; 138(6):541–47. https://doi.org/10.1111/ane.13016 PMID: 30125939
- Yildirim Z, Ertem DH, Ceyhan Dirican A, Baybas S. Stigma accounts for depression in patients with epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2018; 78:1–6. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2017.10.030 PMID: 29161628
- Zeber JE, Copeland LA, Amuan M, Cramer JA, Pugh MJ. The role of comorbid psychiatric conditions in health status in epilepsy. Epilepsy Behav. 2007; 10(4):539–46. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2007</u>. 02.008 PMID: 17416208
- Zhao T, Sun MY, Yu PM, Zhu GX, Tang XH, Shi YB, et al. Evaluation of clinical aspects and quality of life as risk factors for depression in patients with epilepsy. Seizure. 2012; 21(5):367–70. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.seizure.2012.03.006 PMID: 22472268
- 54. Zheng Y, Ding X, Guo Y, Chen Q, Wang W, Zheng Y, et al. Multidisciplinary management improves anxiety, depression, medication adherence, and quality of life among patients with epilepsy in eastern China: a prospective study. Epilepsy Behav. 2019; 100(Pt A):106400. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.</u> 2019.07.001 PMID: 31634729
- Kumar N, Lhatoo R, Liu H, Colon-Zimmermann K, Tatsuoka C, Chen P, et al. Depressive symptom severity in individuals with epilepsy and recent health complications. J Nervous Mental Dis. 2019; 207 (4):284–90. https://doi.org/10.1097/NMD.00000000000963 PMID: 30865078
- 56. Sah SK, Rai N, Sah MK, Timalsena M, Oli G, Katuwal N, et al. Comorbid depression and its associated factors in patients with epilepsy treated with single and multiple drug therapy: a cross-sectional study from Himalayan country. Epilepsy Behav. 2020; 112:107455. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2020</u>. 107455 PMID: 33181908
- St Germaine-Smith C, Liu M, Quan H, Wiebe S, Jette N. Development of an epilepsy-specific risk adjustment comorbidity index. Epilepsia. 2011; 52(12):2161–67. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-1167. 2011.03292.x PMID: 22004000
- Ngugi AK, Kariuki SM, Bottomley C, Kleinschmidt I, Sander JW, Newton CR. Incidence of epilepsy: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Neurology. 2011; 77(10):1005–12. https://doi.org/10.1212/WNL. 0b013e31822cfc90 PMID: 21893672
- Kanner AM. Depression and epilepsy: do glucocorticoids and glutamate explain their relationship? Curr Neurol Neurosci Rep. 2009; 9(4):307–12. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11910-009-0046-1 PMID: 19515283
- 60. Bell GS, Sander JW. Suicide and epilepsy. Curr Opin Neurol. 2009; 22(2):174–78. <u>https://doi.org/10.</u> 1097/WCO.0b013e328328f8c3 PMID: 19532042
- Kanner AM. Depression and epilepsy: a new perspective on two closely related disorders. Epilepsy Curr. 2006; 6(5):141–46. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1535-7511.2006.00125.x PMID: 17260039

- Hitiris N, Mohanraj R, Norrie J, Sills GJ, Brodie MJ. Predictors of pharmacoresistant epilepsy. Epilepsy Res. 2007; 75(2–3):192–96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2007.06.003 PMID: 17628429
- 63. Thijs RD, Surges R, O'Brien TJ, Sander JW. Epilepsy in adults. Lancet. 2019; 393(10172):689–701. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(18)32596-0 PMID: 30686584
- 64. Gill SJ, Lukmanji S, Fiest KM, Patten SB, Wiebe S, Jetté N. Depression screening tools in persons with epilepsy: a systematic review of validated tools. Epilepsia. 2017; 58(5):695–705. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/epi.13651</u> PMID: 28064446
- **65.** Chu C. Association between epilepsy and risk of depression: a meta-analysis. Psychiatry Res. 2022; 312:114531. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2022.114531 PMID: 35413534
- Yang Y, Yang M, Shi Q, Wang T, Jiang M. Risk factors for depression in patients with epilepsy: a metaanalysis. Epilepsy Behav. 2020; 106:107030. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2020.107030</u> PMID: 32248060
- 67. Hesdorffer DC, Hauser WA, Annegers JF, Cascino G. Major depression is a risk factor for seizures in older adults. Ann Neurol. 2000; 47(2):246–49. PMID: 10665498