BMJ Paediatrics Open

BMJ Paediatrics Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Paediatrics Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (<u>http://bmjpaedsopen.bmj.com</u>).

If you have any questions on BMJ Paediatrics Open's open peer review process please email <u>info.bmjpo@bmj.com</u>

BMJ Paediatrics Open

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities

Open
2046
oko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director S-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre, uram ohns Hopkins University, Division of General Internal rtment of Medicine, School of Medicine, Mijna; University of Groningen, University Medical Center partment of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental
ational therapy, Rehabilitation
•





I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

for Review Only

VIEWPOINT

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities

Bolajoko O. Olusanya^{a#}, M.K.C. Nair,^b Scott M. Wright,^c Mijna Hadders-Algra,^d

On behalf of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC)

^aCenter for Healthy Start Initiative, 286A Corporation Drive, Dolphin Estate, Ikoyi, Lagos 101223, Nigeria. Tel: +2348033344300. Email: <u>bolajoko.olusanya@uclmail.net</u>

^bNIMS-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre, Thiruvananthapuram, India. Email: <u>cdcmkc@gmail.com</u>

^cDivision of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, Johns Hopkins Medicine, United States of America. Email: <u>swright@jhmi.edu</u>

^dUniversity of Groningen, University Medical Center Groningen, Department of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental Neurology and University of Groningen, Faculty of Religion, Culture and Society, 9712 CP Groningen, The Netherlands. Email: <u>m.hadders-algra@umcg.nl</u>

#Corresponding author

Author contributions: All authors contributed equally to the drafting of this manuscript and approved the final version for submission.

Acknowledgment

We thank members of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC) for helpful suggestions on the draft of this paper.

Short title: Disability in Early Childhood

Funding Source: No external funding was received by any of the authors for this work.

Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Ethics statements:

Patient consent for publication: Not applicable. Ethics approval: Not applicable.

Abbreviations: ECD, Early childhood development; LMICs, Low- and middle-income countries; NCF, Nurturing care framework; SDGs, Sustainable Development Goals; UNICEF, United Nations Children's Fund; WHO, World Health Organisation; DIPAS, Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy.

Word count: -1198 References: 15

BMJ Paediatrics Open

The global commitment under the Sustainable Development Goals 2015-2030 (SDGs) to leave no one behind has prompted a growing interest in children with disabilities by policy makers, academics, donors and governments as these children have historically been marginalised and excluded in global health agenda. Global pledges and resolutions aimed at addressing the needs of children with disabilities can be traced to 1946 when UNICEF promised to ensure that the most disadvantaged children and countries in the greatest need will be prioritised in everything it does.^{1,2} In this viewpoint, we examine the progress made on this commitment by UNICEF in the last decade as the lead UN agency for child health and development globally.

In May 2013, UNICEF devoted its annual State of the World's Children report to highlighting the plights of children with disabilities.³ In September 2013, UNICEF convened a special forum of stakeholders under the auspices of the Global Partnership on Children with Disabilities to draw special attention to findings in the State of the World Report. A major outcome from this forum was the establishment of eight task forces to address specific issues affecting children with disabilities including early childhood development (ECD), inclusive education, assistive technology, and nutrition. The ECD task force was expected to build on prior work by UNICEF, WHO and other stakeholders to promote effective action plans for children with disabilities.⁴ The UNICEF forum was preceded by a High-level meeting of the General Assembly on disability and development held at the UN Headquarters to champion a disability-inclusive agenda for the SDGs. The dignitaries at the UN meeting included the President of the UN General Assembly, the Secretary-General, the Deputy Secretary-General, the Chair of the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and other stakeholders.

In September 2015, ECD was recognised as a critical component of human capital and development and included as a specific target in the SDGs (SDG 4.2).⁵ This target was tailored towards ensuring

access to inclusive and equitable quality education for children under 5 years with or at risk of developmental disabilities and encapsulated the global vision and commitment for ECD. The target also underscored the need for a well-coordinated multisectoral program of early intervention across the health, education and welfare sectors for childhood disabilities. As emphasised in the 2013 State of the World's Children, the ultimate proof of equity and success in global child health will be whether all children with disabilities enjoy their rights – including access to services, support and opportunities – on par with other children.³

In May 2018, UNICEF, WHO and the World Bank launched an independent global ECD initiative, tagged the Nurturing Care Framework (NCF), which was not originally aimed at children with disabilities as envisaged under the SDGs.⁶ The limitations of recent attempts to adapt the NCF for children with disabilities and the need for an independent ECD framework for inclusive education for children under 5 years with disabilities have been previously discussed.⁷ The necessity for a disability-focused global initiative has also been reinforced by a UNICEF report which showed substantial and disproportionate disadvantages faced by children with disabilities compared to children without disabilities in several crucial domains of child development, health, and education.⁸ A WHO report has shown that services to routinely identify and support children with disabilities generally do not exist in low- and middle-income countries (LMICs), despite the high prevalence of developmental disabilities in this region.⁹ These inequities clearly suggest that little progress had been achieved since 2013 to address the needs of children with disabilities and their families, especially in LMICs. Moreover, except for the ECD task force which is now independently run with a focus on all children, virtually all the task forces established in 2013 are no longer active.

As part of the efforts to reverse the slow progress since 2013, UNICEF in December 2022 launched an ambitious and unprecedented plan to promote disability-inclusion within its organisation and

BMJ Paediatrics Open

external activities tagged Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030.¹⁰ DIPAS prioritised interventions aimed at promoting disability inclusion within and across UNICEF's sectors - including early childhood screening, detection, and intervention; access to disability-inclusive health and nutrition services throughout the life course; disability-inclusive education and skills development; and support for inclusive and effective child protection systems. UNICEF also pledged to allocate at least 10 per cent of its organisational budget to progressively advance disability inclusion by 2030, compared to less than 4 percent (or US\$245 million) of its total disbursements (US\$6.3 billion) for disability inclusion in 2021.¹⁰

However, a clear educational pathway from birth to school entry for children with disabilities as envisioned by the SDGs has not been articulated.¹¹⁻¹³ This omission is likely to divert the attention of national governments and the plethora of ECD practitioners away from global commitments on inclusive education.¹⁴ ECD for school readiness and inclusive education is most successful and likely to have the greatest impact when school systems are willing and able to accept children with disabilities - and meet their educational needs. Inclusive education facilitates vocational opportunities that maximises productivity and future earnings to enable those with disabilities live independently. Hence, the global commitment under the SDGs on ECD provides a unifying agenda that should be prioritised over any sectoral initiatives within and outside the UN system. Moreover, any policy on inclusive education that is not anchored on ECD is unlikely to be inclusive as it will only serve children who survive till school age with milder disabilities. The engagements by UNICEF with other stakeholders (including disabled persons organisations and parent groups) must be geared towards implementing the agreed global agenda for ECD under the SDGs.¹¹

The promise of a minimum budget of 10 per cent in investment for disability inclusion is laudable.¹⁵ However, the success of DIPAS is not likely to be measured solely in monetary terms, but also by

BMJ Paediatrics Open

independently verifiable performance benchmarks such as the number of children with disabilities that receive school readiness services for inclusive education. It is unclear if a root cause analysis of the slow progress achieved since 2013 despite the high-level participation and enthusiasm at the meetings had been conducted to forestall a similar outcome for DIPAS. Some practical steps required to ensure sustainable impact in LMICs have now been recommended by a group of accomplished stakeholders with and without lived experience of disability in accordance with the provisions in the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.¹¹

As we approach the 10th anniversary of the various initiatives in 2013 for disability-inclusive development and with only seven years to the end of the SDGs, UNICEF would need to recalibrate DIPAS for sustainable impact. There is also a need to ensure that long-standing commitments are prioritised over new programmes regardless of changes in leadership within the organisation. Donors and governments need clarity and guidance on the global commitment and agenda for children with disabilities - especially in LMICs. This would not only restore trust but equally forestall potential failures of current plans. It is our view that UNICEF has the wherewithal and clout to lead and make things happen. The future envisioned by the SDGs for children with disabilities and their families globally begins today.

References

- 1. UNICEF. Mission Statement. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/about-us/mission-statement</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Cheung VG, Hadders-Algra M, et al. Sustainable Development Goals summit 2023 and global pledge on disability-focused early childhood development. Lancet Global Health 2023 (in press).
- 3. UNICEF. The State of the World's Children: Children with Disabilities. New York. May 2013.
- 4. WHO, UNICEF. Early childhood development and disability: discussion paper. WHO, Geneva,
2012.Availableat:

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/75355/9789241504065_eng.pdf?sequence=1 (accessed 28 April 2023)

- 5. Resolution A/RES/70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. In: Seventieth United Nations General Assembly, New York, 25 September 2015. New York: United Nations; 2015. Available at: <u>http://www.un.org/ga/search/viewdoc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- WHO, UNICEF, and World Bank Group. Nurturing care for early childhood development: a framework for helping children survive and thrive to transform health and human potential. Geneva: World Health Organisation; 2018. Available at: <u>https://nurturing-care.org/ncf-for-ecd</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Newton CRJ. The Nurturing Care Framework and Children with Developmental Disabilities in LMICs. Pediatrics. 2023;151(4):e2022056645. doi: 10.1542/peds.2022-056645.
- UNICEF. Seen, Counted, Included: Using data to shed light on the well-being of children with disabilities, UNICEF, New York, 2021. Available at: <u>https://data.unicef.org/resources/children-</u> with-disabilities-report-2021/ (accessed 28 April 2023)
- 9. Global report on health equity for persons with disabilities. Geneva: World Health Organisation;
 2022. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240063600 (accessed 28 April 2023)
- UNICEF. Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030, UNICEF, New York, December 2022. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/unicef-disability-inclusion-policy-and-strategy-dipas-2022-2030</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).

- 11. Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Berman BD, et al. Global leadership is needed to optimise early childhood development for children with disabilities. Nat Med. 2023 Apr 13. doi: 10.1038/s41591-023-02291-x. Epub ahead of print.
- 12. Olusanya BO, Boo NY, de Camargo OK, et al. Child health, inclusive education and development. Bull World Health Organ. 2022;100:459-461.
- 13. Olusanya BO, Halpern R, Cheung VG, et al. Disability in children: a global problem needing a well-coordinated global action. BMJ Paediatr Open. 2022;6:e001397.
- 14. Shawar YR, Shiffman J. Generation of global political priority for early childhood development: the challenges of framing and governance. Lancet. 2017;389:119-124.
- ation . governanc. . Smythe T, Wr., .es Collaborators (GRL. .rly childhood. Lancet Child Adc. 15. Olusanya BO, Nair MKC, Smythe T, Wright S, Hadders-Algra M; Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC). UNICEF and global leadership for disability inclusion in early childhood. Lancet Child Adolesc Health. 2023;7(5):e11.

BMJ Paediatrics Open

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities 2013-2023

Paediatrics Open o-2023-002046.R1 point in-2023 inya, Bolajoko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director MKC; NIMS-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre,
point In-2023 Inya, Bolajoko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director
in-2023 inya, Bolajoko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director
inya, Bolajoko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director
vananthapuram ht, Scott; Johns Hopkins University, Division of General Internal cine, Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, ers-Algra, Mijna; University of Groningen, University Medical Center ngen, Department of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental blogy
th, Occupational therapy, Rehabilitation





I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

for Review Only

VIEWPOINT

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities, 2013-2023

Bolajoko O. Olusanya^{a#}, M.K.C. Nair,^b Scott M. Wright,^c Mijna Hadders-Algra,^d

On behalf of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC)

^aCenter for Healthy Start Initiative, 286A Corporation Drive, Dolphin Estate, Ikoyi, Lagos 101223, Nigeria. Tel: +2348033344300. Email: <u>bolajoko.olusanya@uclmail.net</u>

^bNIMS-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre, Thiruvananthapuram, India. Email: <u>cdcmkc@gmail.com</u>

^cDivision of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, Johns Hopkins Medicine, United States of America. Email: <u>swright@jhmi.edu</u>

^dUniversity of Groningen, University Medical Center Groningen, Department of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental Neurology and University of Groningen, Faculty of Religion, Culture and Society, 9712 CP Groningen, The Netherlands. Email: <u>m.hadders-algra@umcg.nl</u>

#Corresponding author

Author contributions: All authors contributed equally to the drafting of this manuscript and approved the final version for submission.

Acknowledgment

We thank members of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC) for helpful suggestions on the draft of this paper.

Short title: Disability in Early Childhood

Funding Source: No external funding was received by any of the authors for this work.

Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Ethics statements:

Patient consent for publication: Not applicable. Ethics approval: Not applicable.

Abbreviations: ECD, Early childhood development; LMICs, Low- and middle-income countries; NCF, Nurturing care framework; SDGs, Sustainable Development Goals; UNICEF, United Nations Children's Fund; WHO, World Health Organisation; DIPAS, Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy.

Word count: -1282 References: 17

BMJ Paediatrics Open

The global commitment under the Sustainable Development Goals 2015-2030 (SDGs) to leave no one behind has prompted a growing interest in children with disabilities by policy makers, academics, donors, and governments as these children have historically been marginalised and excluded in global health agenda. Global pledges and resolutions aimed at addressing the needs of children with disabilities can be traced to 1946 when UNICEF promised to ensure that the most disadvantaged children and countries in the greatest need will be prioritised in everything it does.^{1,2} In this viewpoint, we examine the progress made on this commitment by UNICEF in the last decade as the lead UN agency for child health and development globally.

In May 2013, UNICEF devoted its annual State of the World's Children report to highlighting the plights of children with disabilities.³ In September 2013, UNICEF convened a special forum of stakeholders under the auspices of the Global Partnership on Children with Disabilities to draw special attention to findings in the State of the World Report. A major outcome from this forum was the establishment of eight task forces to address specific issues affecting children with disabilities including early childhood development (ECD) for young children, as well as inclusive education, assistive technology, and nutrition for children and adolescents. The ECD task force was expected to build on prior work by UNICEF, WHO and other stakeholders to promote effective action plans for children with disabilities.⁴ The UNICEF forum was preceded by a High-level meeting of the General Assembly on disability and development held at the UN Headquarters to champion a disability-inclusive agenda for the SDGs. The dignitaries at the UN meeting included the President of the UN General Assembly, the Secretary-General, the Deputy Secretary-General, the Chair of the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and other stakeholders.

In September 2015, ECD was recognised as a critical component of human capital and development and included as a specific target in the SDGs (SDG 4.2).⁵ This target was tailored towards ensuring

access to inclusive and equitable quality education for children under 5 years with or at risk of developmental disabilities and encapsulated the global vision and commitment for ECD. The target also underscored the need for a well-coordinated multisectoral program of early intervention across the health, education and welfare sectors for childhood disabilities. As emphasised in the 2013 State of the World's Children, the ultimate proof of equity and success in global child health will be whether all children with disabilities enjoy their rights – including access to services, support and opportunities – on par with other children.³

In May 2018, UNICEF, WHO and the World Bank launched an independent global ECD initiative, tagged the Nurturing Care Framework (NCF), which was not originally aimed at children with disabilities as envisaged under the SDGs.⁶ The limitations of recent attempts to adapt the NCF for children with disabilities and the need for an independent ECD framework for inclusive education for children under 5 years with disabilities have been previously discussed.⁷ The necessity for a disability-focused global initiative has also been reinforced by a UNICEF report which showed substantial and disproportionate disadvantages faced by children with disabilities compared to children without disabilities in several crucial domains of child development, health, and education.⁸ A WHO report has shown that services to routinely identify and support children with disabilities generally do not exist in low- and middle-income countries (LMICs), despite the high prevalence of developmental disabilities in this region.⁹ These inequities clearly suggest that little progress had been achieved since 2013 to address the needs of children with disabilities and their families, especially in LMICs. Moreover, except for the ECD task force which is now independently run with a focus on all children, virtually all the task forces established in 2013 are no longer active.

Besides the historical contributions to the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in a growing number of countries that began in 1990, there has been relatively slow progress

BMJ Paediatrics Open

since 2013. To reverse this trend, in December 2022 UNICEF launched an ambitious and unprecedented plan to promote disability-inclusion within its organisation and external activities tagged Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030.¹⁰ DIPAS prioritised interventions aimed at promoting disability inclusion within and across UNICEF's sectors - including early childhood screening, detection, and intervention; access to disability-inclusive health and nutrition services throughout the life course; disability-inclusive education and skills development; and support for inclusive and effective child protection systems. UNICEF also pledged to allocate at least 10 per cent of its organisational budget to progressively advance disability inclusion by 2030, compared to less than 4 percent (or US\$245 million) of its total disbursements (US\$6.3 billion) for disability inclusion in 2021.¹⁰

However, a clear educational pathway from birth to school entry for children with disabilities as envisioned by the SDGs has not been articulated.¹¹⁻¹³ This omission is likely to divert the attention of national governments and the plethora of ECD practitioners away from global commitments on inclusive education.¹⁴ ECD for school readiness and inclusive education is most successful and likely to have the greatest impact when school systems are willing and able to accept children with disabilities - and meet their educational needs. Inclusive education facilitates vocational opportunities that maximises productivity and future earnings to enable those with disabilities live independently. Hence, the global commitment under the SDGs on ECD provides a unifying agenda that should be prioritised over any sectoral initiatives within and outside the UN system. Moreover, any policy on inclusive education that is not anchored on ECD is unlikely to be inclusive as it will only serve children who survive till school age with milder disabilities. The engagements by UNICEF with other stakeholders (including disabled persons organisations and parent groups) must be geared towards implementing the agreed global agenda for ECD under the SDGs.¹¹

The promise of a minimum budget of 10 per cent in investment for disability inclusion is laudable.¹⁵ However, the success of DIPAS is not likely to be measured solely in monetary terms; in addition, there will need to be independently verifiable performance benchmarks such as the number of children with disabilities that receive school readiness services for inclusive education. It is unclear if a root cause analysis of the slow progress achieved since 2013 despite the high-level participation and enthusiasm at the meetings had been conducted to inform DIPAS in hopes of realising more positive outcomes. Practical steps to ensure sustainable impact in LMICs have now been recommended by a group of accomplished stakeholders with and without lived experience of disability in accordance with the provisions in the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.¹¹ Examples of successful programmes that can be adapted and developed into a global ECD strategy for children with disabilities include the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (USA),¹⁶ and the RBSK Early Detection and Intervention Programme in India.¹⁷

As we approach the 10th anniversary of the various initiatives in 2013 for disability-inclusive development and with only seven years to the end of the SDGs, UNICEF should consider recalibrating DIPAS for sustainable impact in the target population [see Box 1].^{2,7,11-13} There is also a need to ensure that long-standing commitments are prioritised over new programmes regardless of changes in leadership within the organisation. Donors and governments need clarity and guidance on the global commitment and agenda for children with disabilities - especially in LMICs. This would not only restore trust but equally forestall potential failures of current plans. It is our view that UNICEF has the wherewithal and clout to lead and make things happen. The future envisioned by the SDGs for children with disabilities and their families globally begins today.

References

- UNICEF. Mission Statement. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/about-us/mission-statement</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Cheung VG, Hadders-Algra M, et al. Sustainable Development Goals summit 2023 and the global pledge on disability-focused early childhood development. Lancet Glob Health. 2023 Jun;11(6):e823-e825.
- 3. UNICEF. The State of the World's Children: Children with Disabilities. New York. May 2013.
- 4. WHO, UNICEF. Early childhood development and disability: discussion paper. WHO, Geneva,
2012.Availableat:

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/75355/9789241504065_eng.pdf?sequence=1 (accessed 28 April 2023)

- 5. Resolution A/RES/70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. In: Seventieth United Nations General Assembly, New York, 25 September 2015. New York: United Nations; 2015. Available at: <u>http://www.un.org/ga/search/viewdoc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- WHO, UNICEF, and World Bank Group. Nurturing care for early childhood development: a framework for helping children survive and thrive to transform health and human potential. Geneva: World Health Organisation; 2018. Available at: <u>https://nurturing-care.org/ncf-for-ecd</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Newton CRJ. The Nurturing Care Framework and Children with Developmental Disabilities in LMICs. Pediatrics. 2023;151(4):e2022056645. doi: 10.1542/peds.2022-056645.
- UNICEF. Seen, Counted, Included: Using data to shed light on the well-being of children with disabilities, UNICEF, New York, 2021. Available at: <u>https://data.unicef.org/resources/children-</u> with-disabilities-report-2021/ (accessed 28 April 2023)
- 9. Global report on health equity for persons with disabilities. Geneva: World Health Organisation;
 2022. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240063600 (accessed 28 April 2023)
- UNICEF. Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030, UNICEF, New York, December 2022. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/unicef-disability-inclusion-policy-and-strategy-dipas-2022-2030</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).

- 11. Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Berman BD, et al. Global leadership is needed to optimize early childhood development for children with disabilities. Nat Med. 2023 May;29(5):1056-1060.
- 12. Olusanya BO, Boo NY, de Camargo OK, et al. Child health, inclusive education and development. Bull World Health Organ. 2022;100:459-461.
- 13. Olusanya BO, Halpern R, Cheung VG, et al. Disability in children: a global problem needing a well-coordinated global action. BMJ Paediatr Open. 2022;6:e001397.
- 14. Shawar YR, Shiffman J. Generation of global political priority for early childhood development: the challenges of framing and governance. Lancet. 2017;389:119-124.
- 15. Olusanya BO, Nair MKC, Smythe T, Wright S, Hadders-Algra M; Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC). UNICEF and global leadership for disability inclusion in early childhood. Lancet Child Adolesc Health. 2023;7(5):e11.
- 16. US Department of Education. Individuals with Disabilities Education Act. Statute chapter 33. https://sites.ed.gov/idea/statute-chapter-33 (accessed 6 June 2023).
- 17. Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India. Operational guidelines. Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakram child health screening and early intervention services under the national rural health mission. May 2014. https://nhm.gov.in/images/pdf/programmes/RBSK/Operational_Guidelines/Operational-Guidelines-DEIC-RBSK.pdf (accessed 6 June 2023).

Box. Recommendations for Optimising DIPAS for Children with Disabilities and SDG 4.2*

- Undertake a comprehensive review of national disability-inclusive or disability-focused ECD programmes worldwide
- Conduct systematic reviews on childhood disabilities, school readiness, and inclusive education in low- and middle-income countries
- Develop a global ECD strategy for implementing SDG 4.2 from birth to age 5 years in partnership with relevant organisations and stakeholders
- Avoid or de-emphasise any omnibus ECD programmes that do not reflect the statutory priorities of UNICEF and the extensive published evidence on the disproportionate health inequities and inequality experienced by children with disabilities
- Institute monitoring mechanisms for evaluating country-level implementation of the global disability-focused ECD
- Facilitate a global fund for promoting school readiness and inclusive education for children with disabilities

*Sources: references 2,7, 11, 12, & 13

ECD: early childhood development, DIPAS: Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy; SDG: Sustainable Development Goal

Liezonz

BMJ Paediatrics Open

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities, 2013-2023

Journal:	BMJ Paediatrics Open
Manuscript ID	bmjpo-2023-002046.R2
Article Type:	Viewpoint
Date Submitted by the Author:	09-Jun-2023
Complete List of Authors:	Olusanya, Bolajoko; Centre for Healthy Start Initiative, Director Nair, MKC; NIMS-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre, Thiruvananthapuram Wright, Scott; Johns Hopkins University, Division of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, Hadders-Algra, Mijna; University of Groningen, University Medical Center Groningen , Department of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental Neurology
Keywords:	Growth, Occupational therapy, Rehabilitation





I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

for Review Only

VIEWPOINT

Global Progress Towards Early Childhood Development for Children with Disabilities, 2013-2023

Bolajoko O. Olusanya^{a#}, M.K.C. Nair,^b Scott M. Wright,^c Mijna Hadders-Algra,^d

On behalf of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC)

^aCenter for Healthy Start Initiative, 286A Corporation Drive, Dolphin Estate, Ikoyi, Lagos 101223, Nigeria. Tel: +2348033344300. Email: <u>bolajoko.olusanya@uclmail.net</u>

^bNIMS-Spectrum-Child Development Research Centre, Thiruvananthapuram, India. Email: <u>cdcmkc@gmail.com</u>

^cDivision of General Internal Medicine, Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, Johns Hopkins Medicine, United States of America. Email: <u>swright@jhmi.edu</u>

^dUniversity of Groningen, University Medical Center Groningen, Department of Pediatrics, Division of Developmental Neurology and University of Groningen, Faculty of Religion, Culture and Society, 9712 CP Groningen, The Netherlands. Email: <u>m.hadders-algra@umcg.nl</u>

#Corresponding author

Author contributions: All authors contributed equally to the drafting of this manuscript and approved the final version for submission.

Acknowledgment

We thank members of the Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC) for helpful suggestions on the draft of this paper.

Short title: Disability in Early Childhood

Funding Source: No external funding was received by any of the authors for this work.

Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Ethics statements:

Patient consent for publication: Not applicable. Ethics approval: Not applicable.

Abbreviations: ECD, Early childhood development; LMICs, Low- and middle-income countries; NCF, Nurturing care framework; SDGs, Sustainable Development Goals; UNICEF, United Nations Children's Fund; WHO, World Health Organisation; DIPAS, Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy.

Word count: -1248 References: 17

BMJ Paediatrics Open

The global commitment under the Sustainable Development Goals 2015-2030 (SDGs) to leave no one behind has prompted a growing interest in children with disabilities by policy makers, academics, donors, and governments as these children have historically been marginalised and excluded in global health agenda. Global pledges and resolutions aimed at addressing the needs of children with disabilities can be traced to 1946 when UNICEF promised to ensure that the most disadvantaged children and countries in the greatest need will be prioritised in everything it does. (1, 2) In this viewpoint, we examine the progress made on this commitment by UNICEF in the last decade as the lead UN agency for child health and development globally.

In May 2013, UNICEF devoted its annual State of the World's Children report to highlighting the plights of children with disabilities.(3) In September 2013, UNICEF convened a special forum of stakeholders under the auspices of the Global Partnership on Children with Disabilities to draw special attention to findings in the State of the World Report. A major outcome from this forum was the establishment of eight task forces to address specific issues affecting children with disabilities including early childhood development (ECD) for young children, as well as inclusive education, assistive technology, and nutrition for children and adolescents. The ECD task force was expected to build on prior work by UNICEF, WHO and other stakeholders to promote effective action plans for children with disabilities.(4) The UNICEF forum was preceded by a High-level meeting of the General Assembly on disability and development held at the UN Headquarters to champion a disability-inclusive agenda for the SDGs.

In September 2015, ECD was recognised as a critical component of human capital and development and included as a specific target in the SDGs (SDG 4.2). (5) This target was tailored towards ensuring access to inclusive and equitable quality education for children under 5 years with or at risk of developmental disabilities and encapsulated the global vision and commitment for ECD. The target also underscored the need for a well-coordinated multisectoral program of early intervention across the health, education and welfare sectors for childhood disabilities. As emphasised in the 2013 State of the World's Children, the ultimate proof of equity and success in global child health will be whether all children with disabilities enjoy their rights – including access to services, support and opportunities – on par with other children.(3)

In May 2018, UNICEF, WHO and the World Bank launched an independent global ECD initiative, tagged the Nurturing Care Framework (NCF), which was not originally aimed at children with disabilities as envisaged under the SDGs.(6) The limitations of recent attempts to adapt the NCF for children with disabilities and the need for an independent ECD framework for inclusive education for children under 5 years with disabilities have been previously discussed.(7) The necessity for a disability-focused global initiative has also been reinforced by a UNICEF report which showed substantial and disproportionate disadvantages faced by children with disabilities compared to children without disabilities in several crucial domains of child development, health, and education.(8) A WHO report has shown that services to routinely identify and support children with disabilities generally do not exist in low- and middle-income countries (LMICs), despite the high prevalence of developmental disabilities in this region.(9) These inequities clearly suggest that little progress had been achieved since 2013 to address the needs of children with disabilities and their families, especially in LMICs. Moreover, except for the ECD task force which is now independently run with a focus on all children, virtually all the task forces established in 2013 are no longer active.

Besides the historical contributions to the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in a growing number of countries that began in 1990, there has been relatively slow progress since 2013. To reverse this trend, in December 2022 UNICEF launched an ambitious and unprecedented plan to promote disability-inclusion within its organisation and external activities

tagged Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030.(10) DIPAS prioritised interventions aimed at promoting disability inclusion within and across UNICEF's sectors - including early childhood screening, detection, and intervention; access to disability-inclusive health and nutrition services throughout the life course; disability-inclusive education and skills development; and support for inclusive and effective child protection systems. UNICEF also pledged to allocate at least 10 per cent of its organisational budget to progressively advance disability inclusion by 2030, compared to less than 4 percent (or US\$245 million) of its total disbursements (US\$6.3 billion) for disability inclusion in 2021 (10).

However, a clear educational pathway from birth to school entry for children with disabilities as envisioned by the SDGs has not been articulated.(11-13) This omission is likely to divert the attention of national governments and the plethora of ECD practitioners away from global commitments on inclusive education.(14) ECD for school readiness and inclusive education is most successful and likely to have the greatest impact when school systems are willing and able to accept children with disabilities - and meet their educational needs. Inclusive education facilitates vocational opportunities that maximises productivity and future earnings to enable those with disabilities live independently. Hence, the global commitment under the SDGs on ECD provides a unifying agenda that should be prioritised over any sectoral initiatives within and outside the UN system. Moreover, any policy on inclusive education that is not anchored on ECD is unlikely to be inclusive as it will only serve children who survive till school age with milder disabilities. The engagements by UNICEF with other stakeholders (including disabled persons organisations and parent groups) must be geared towards implementing the agreed global agenda for ECD under the SDGs.(11)

The promise of a minimum budget of 10 per cent in investment for disability inclusion is laudable.(15) However, the success of DIPAS is not likely to be measured solely in monetary terms; in addition, there will need to be independently verifiable performance benchmarks such as the number of children with disabilities that receive school readiness services for inclusive education. It is unclear if a root cause analysis of the slow progress achieved since 2013 despite the high-level participation and enthusiasm at the meetings had been conducted to inform DIPAS in hopes of realising more positive outcomes. Practical steps to ensure sustainable impact in LMICs have now been recommended by a group of accomplished stakeholders with and without lived experience of disability in accordance with the provisions in the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.(11) Examples of successful programmes that can be adapted and developed into a global ECD strategy for children with disabilities include the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (USA),(16) and the RBSK Early Detection and Intervention Programme in India.(17)

As we approach the 10th anniversary of the various initiatives in 2013 for disability-inclusive development and with only seven years to the end of the SDGs, UNICEF should consider recalibrating DIPAS for sustainable impact in the target population [see Box 1].^(2,7,11-13) There is also a need to ensure that long-standing commitments are prioritised over new programmes regardless of changes in leadership within the organisation. Donors and governments need clarity and guidance on the global commitment and agenda for children with disabilities - especially in LMICs. This would not only restore trust but equally forestall potential failures of current plans. It is our view that UNICEF has the wherewithal and clout to lead and make things happen. The future envisioned by the SDGs for children with disabilities and their families globally begins today.

References

- UNICEF. Mission Statement. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/about-us/mission-statement</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Cheung VG, Hadders-Algra M, et al. Sustainable Development Goals summit 2023 and the global pledge on disability-focused early childhood development. Lancet Glob Health. 2023 Jun;11(6):e823-e825.
- 3. UNICEF. The State of the World's Children: Children with Disabilities. New York. May 2013.
- 4. WHO, UNICEF. Early childhood development and disability: discussion paper. WHO, Geneva,
2012.Availableat:

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/75355/9789241504065_eng.pdf?sequence=1 (accessed 28 April 2023)

- 5. Resolution A/RES/70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development. In: Seventieth United Nations General Assembly, New York, 25 September 2015. New York: United Nations; 2015. Available at: <u>http://www.un.org/ga/search/viewdoc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- WHO, UNICEF, and World Bank Group. Nurturing care for early childhood development: a framework for helping children survive and thrive to transform health and human potential. Geneva: World Health Organisation; 2018. Available at: <u>https://nurturing-care.org/ncf-for-ecd</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).
- Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Newton CRJ. The Nurturing Care Framework and Children with Developmental Disabilities in LMICs. Pediatrics. 2023;151(4):e2022056645. doi: 10.1542/peds.2022-056645.
- UNICEF. Seen, Counted, Included: Using data to shed light on the well-being of children with disabilities, UNICEF, New York, 2021. Available at: <u>https://data.unicef.org/resources/children-</u> with-disabilities-report-2021/ (accessed 28 April 2023)
- 9. Global report on health equity for persons with disabilities. Geneva: World Health Organisation;
 2022. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240063600 (accessed 28 April 2023)
- UNICEF. Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy (DIPAS) 2022–2030, UNICEF, New York, December 2022. Available at: <u>https://www.unicef.org/unicef-disability-inclusion-policy-and-strategy-dipas-2022-2030</u> (accessed 28 April 2023).

- 11. Olusanya BO, Gulati S, Berman BD, et al. Global leadership is needed to optimize early childhood development for children with disabilities. Nat Med. 2023 May;29(5):1056-1060.
- 12. Olusanya BO, Boo NY, de Camargo OK, et al. Child health, inclusive education and development. Bull World Health Organ. 2022;100:459-461.
- 13. Olusanya BO, Halpern R, Cheung VG, et al. Disability in children: a global problem needing a well-coordinated global action. BMJ Paediatr Open. 2022;6:e001397.
- 14. Shawar YR, Shiffman J. Generation of global political priority for early childhood development: the challenges of framing and governance. Lancet. 2017;389:119-124.
- 15. Olusanya BO, Nair MKC, Smythe T, Wright S, Hadders-Algra M; Global Research on Developmental Disabilities Collaborators (GRDDC). UNICEF and global leadership for disability inclusion in early childhood. Lancet Child Adolesc Health. 2023;7(5):e11.
- 16. US Department of Education. Individuals with Disabilities Education Act. Statute chapter 33. https://sites.ed.gov/idea/statute-chapter-33 (accessed 6 June 2023).
- 17. Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India. Operational guidelines. Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakram child health screening and early intervention services under the national rural health mission. May 2014. https://nhm.gov.in/images/pdf/programmes/RBSK/Operational_Guidelines/Operational-Guidelines-DEIC-RBSK.pdf (accessed 6 June 2023).

Box. Recommendations for Optimising DIPAS for Children with Disabilities and SDG 4.2*

- Undertake a comprehensive review of national disability-inclusive or disability-focused ECD programmes worldwide
- Conduct systematic reviews on childhood disabilities, school readiness, and inclusive education in low- and middle-income countries
- Develop a global ECD strategy for implementing SDG 4.2 from birth to age 5 years in partnership with relevant organisations and stakeholders
- Avoid or de-emphasise any omnibus ECD programmes that do not reflect the statutory priorities of UNICEF and the extensive published evidence on the disproportionate health inequities and inequality experienced by children with disabilities
- Institute monitoring mechanisms for evaluating country-level implementation of the global disability-focused ECD
- Facilitate a global fund for promoting school readiness and inclusive education for children with disabilities

*Sources: references 2,7, 11, 12, & 13

ECD: early childhood development, DIPAS: Disability Inclusion Policy and Strategy; SDG: Sustainable Development Goal

Liezonz