

BMJ Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (<u>http://bmjopen.bmj.com</u>).

If you have any questions on BMJ Open's open peer review process please email <u>info.bmjopen@bmj.com</u>

# **BMJ Open**

# **Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol**

Journal	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2023-072098
Article Type:	Protocol
Date Submitted by the Author	
Complete List of Authors	<ul> <li>Hempel, Susanne; University of Southern California</li> <li>Danz, Margie; University of Southern California</li> <li>Robinson, Karen; Johns Hopkins Medicine, Division of Health Sciences</li> <li>Informatics</li> <li>Bolshakova, Maria; University of Southern California, Preventive</li> <li>Medicine</li> <li>Rodriguez, Jesus; University of Southern California</li> <li>Mears, Alanna; University of Southern California</li> <li>Pham, Cindy; University of Southern California, Preventive Medicine</li> <li>Motala, Aneesa; University of Southern California, Preventive Medicine</li> <li>Motala, Aneesa; University of Southern California, Southern California</li> <li>Evidence Review Center</li> <li>Tolentino, Danica; University of Southern California, Molecular Microbiology and Immunology</li> <li>Johnston, Jill; USC Keck School of Medicine</li> </ul>
Keywords	INTERNAL MEDICINE, Systematic Review, GENERAL MEDICINE (see Internal Medicine)
Keywords	

SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts

# Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol

Susanne Hempel,<sup>1</sup> Margie Danz,<sup>1</sup> Karen A. Robinson,<sup>2</sup> Maria Bolshakova,<sup>1</sup> Jesus Rodriguez,<sup>1</sup> Alanna Mears,<sup>1</sup> Cindy Pham,<sup>1</sup> Sachi Yagyu,<sup>1</sup> Aneesa Motala,<sup>1</sup> Danica Tolentino,<sup>1</sup> Omid Akbari,<sup>3</sup> Jill Johnston<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Southern California Evidence Review Center, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, USA

<sup>2</sup> Evidence-based Practice Center, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, USA

<sup>3</sup> Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, University of Southern California, Los Angeles,

USA

<sup>4</sup> Population and Public Health Science, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, USA

Corresponding author

Dr. Susanne Hempel; Southern California Evidence Review Center, University of Southern California, Keck School of Medicine, 2001 N Soto Street, Los Angeles, CA 90033; USA; <u>susanne.hempel@med.usc.edu</u>

Word count: 3,210

# ABSTRACT

Introduction: Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) is characterized by reported adverse responses to environmental exposures of common chemical agents (e.g., perfumes, paint, cleaning products, and other inhaled or ingested agents) in low doses considered non-toxic for the general population. There is currently no consensus on whether MCS can be established as a distinct disorder.

Methods and analysis: The scoping review of the literature will be guided by five questions: How is MCS defined and how is it diagnosed? What methods are used to report prevalence and incidence estimates of MCS? What are the characteristics of the body of scientific evidence that addresses whether MCS is a distinct disorder or syndrome? What underlying mechanisms for MCS have been proposed in the scientific literature? Which treatment and management approaches for MCS have been evaluated in empirical research studies? We will conduct a comprehensive search in 14 research databases. Citation screening will be supported by machine learning algorithms. Two independent reviewers will assess eligibility of full text publications against prespecified criteria. Data abstraction will support concise evidence tables. A formal consultation exercise will elicit input from experts and stakeholders regarding the review results and presentation. The existing evidence about MCS will be documented in a user-friendly visualization in the format of an evidence map.

Ethics and dissemination: Determined to be exempt from review (UP-22-00516). Results will be disseminated through a journal manuscript and data will be publicly accessible through an online data repository.

Registration: The protocol is registered in Open Science Framework (osf.io/4a3wu).

(249 words)

# Keywords

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity, Idiopathic Environmental Illness, Chemical Intolerance, Scoping Review, Evidence Map

# Strengths and Limitations

- The scoping review of the literature will be guided by five questions: How is MCS defined and how is it diagnosed? What methods are used to report prevalence and incidence estimates of MCS? What are the characteristics of the body of scientific evidence that addresses whether MCS is a distinct disorder or syndrome? What underlying mechanisms for MCS have been proposed in the scientific literature? Which treatment and management approaches for MCS have been evaluated in empirical research studies?
- We will conduct a comprehensive search in 14 multi-disciplinary research databases. Citation screening will be supported by machine learning algorithms. Two independent reviewers will assess eligibility of full text publications against prespecified criteria.
- Data abstraction will support concise evidence tables. A formal consultation exercise will elicit input from experts and stakeholders regarding the review results and presentation.

The existing evidence about MCS will be documented in a user-friendly visualization in the format of an evidence map.

For beer terien only

**BMJ** Open

# Introduction

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) is characterized by reported adverse responses to environmental exposures of common chemical agents in low doses considered non-toxic for the general population. These may be solvents such as paint and cleaning products, odorants such as perfume and scented soaps, air pollutants such as cigarette smoke and smog, or materials such as new furnishings or new carpets. Symptoms are nonspecific, involve multiple organ systems, and may include nausea, dizziness, headache, abdominal pain, fatigue, and depression, among others.<sup>1-3</sup> Responses generalize from individual to sets of often unrelated chemical agents and limit social and occupational functioning.<sup>2 4-8</sup> More recently, the condition has been described as an idiopathic environmental intolerance.<sup>1 9-11</sup>

To date, tens of thousands of publications have addressed MCS in the international lay and scientific literature.<sup>12</sup> However, little consensus exists regarding MCS, including defining characteristics and the underlying nature of the condition as toxigenic or psychogenic.<sup>13-15</sup> Prevalence estimates vary considerably, suggesting differences in operationalizations of the definition and diagnostic criteria for MCS.<sup>16-19</sup> Individual symptoms reported by patients are not unique to MCS and the lack of consensus, including whether MCS should be considered a distinct disorder, hinders the identification and differential diagnosis of MCS in clinical practice.<sup>20-22</sup> A large number of potentially underlying mechanisms of action for MCS have been described that span immune system dysregulation, neural sensitization and hyperresponsivity, neurogenic inflammation, limbic system dysfunction, oxidative stress hypothesis, genetic theories, and classical conditioning [4]. Regardless of the challenges in operationalizing definitions and establishing its etiology, MCS is an international phenomenon that has been

described in different formats and terms for decades [4]. It is a distressing and puzzling condition for patients as well as their healthcare providers.<sup>23-25</sup> Some mechanism of action considerations have resulted in interventions for patients; however, no comprehensive review of the evaluated treatment and management options exists that currently successfully supports patients describing MCS symptoms.<sup>26 27</sup> Surveys describe multiple, often not evidence-based treatment approaches tried by patients, and the lack of clinical guidance leaves healthcare practitioners guessing how to best address MCS in their patients.<sup>8 27-29</sup>

Despite the large number of publications addressing MCS, there is a lack of research syntheses providing an overview of the existing evidence base on MCS. However, we believe that the existing evidence base needs to be mapped as a first step in order to advance research and practice in this complex field. Before trying to establish the most salient definition of MCS or most plausible mechanism of action leading to MCS in a systematic review, a scoping review should systematically identify, explore, and characterize the existing research literature. The proposed work will be based on a scoping review of the literature. Scoping reviews are systematic literature review approaches that explore research fields to systematically capture the volume and content of scientific literature that is relevant to guiding questions for the review.<sup>30-32</sup> To address the complexity of the topic, it is critical that a comprehensive review casts a wide net, incorporating research from different disciplines and conceptual positions. Our planned scoping review will use extensive literature searches to map the existing literature. The review will provide an overview of definitions and diagnostic criteria of MCS, identify prevalence and incidence research, document the body of evidence addressing the question of whether MCS is a distinct disorder, compile a compendium of suggested mechanisms of MCS, and provide an overview of the literature on MCS treatment and management that has been published to date.

#### **BMJ** Open

This scoping review was prospectively registered and will be conducted according to established procedures to provide a systematic and transparent exploration of the literature.<sup>33</sup> The findings of the scoping review will be presented as an evidence map. Evidence maps are an evidence synthesis tool that provide a visualization of a large evidence base to provide readers with a concise overview.<sup>34 35</sup> Evidence maps allow a visual and user friendly research overview suitable for a large and diverse research field, effectively mapping the existing evidence.<sup>34 36-43</sup> The evidence map will document the presence and absence of research on MCS for the five questions guiding the review in a user-friendly format.

# **Guiding Questions**

The following review questions will guide the scoping review:

- GQ1: How is Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) defined and how is it diagnosed?
- GQ2: What methods are used to report prevalence and incidence estimates of MCS?
- GQ3: What are the characteristics of the body of scientific evidence that addresses whether MCS is a distinct disorder or syndrome?
- GQ4: What underlying mechanisms for MCS have been proposed in the scientific literature?
- GQ5: Which treatment and management approaches for MCS have been evaluated in empirical research studies?

# **Review Aim**

The review will answer the guiding questions with the identified scientific literature in a userfriendly format. A systematic evidence map will provide a visualization of the existing evidence and research gaps.

# Methods and Analysis

 The review is registered in the Open Science Framework (OSF).<sup>12</sup> The scoping review will follow the steps for scoping reviews outlined by Arksey and Malloy: Stage 1: identifying the research question; Stage 2: identifying relevant studies; Stage 3: study selection; Stage 4: charting the data; Stage 5: collating, summarizing and reporting the results. In addition, a consultation exercise to inform and validate findings from the scoping review will be conducted. The following outlines the steps in detail. The reporting will follow established guidelines.<sup>31 44</sup>

# Search Strategy

We will search the international literature on MCS using different taxonomy and nomenclature. Literature searches will be designed, executed, and documented by an experienced evidence review center librarian. The scoping review addresses multiple aspects of MCS and the search strategy covers multiple databases to ensure that all scientific literature relevant to MCS will be identified. The use of multiple sources is a key method to minimize selection bias being introduced into the review. We plan on searching the following databases to obtain a diverse set of citations potentially relevant to MCS from different disciplines:

- PubMed (biomedical)
- CINAHL (nursing)
- Embase (biomedical)
- Web of Science (general scientific database)
- Scopus (health sciences)

2	
3	
4	• PsycINFO (behavioral and social sciences)
5	• Healthears Administration Database (nublic health administration)
6	Healthcare Administration Database (public health administration)
7 8	• Current Contents Connect (multidisciplingmy)
9	Current Contents Connect (multidisciplinary)
10	• DIOSIS Citation Index (life gaignees)
11	BIOSIS Citation Index (life sciences)
12	• Environment Index (environmental research)
13 14	• Environment index (environmental research)
15	Environmental Science Database
16	Environmental Science Database
17	HERO (Health & Environmental Research Online)
18 10	• TIERO (Treatur de Environmental Researen Omme)
19 20	• SciFinder (chemical literature)
21	• Sen inder (enemiear interature)
22	• Agricultural & Environmental Science Collection (includes AGRICOLA, environmental
23	
24 25	research)
25 26	
27	The search strategy is shown in the appendix. Content experts provided input regarding
28	
29	individual search terms and databases.
30 21	
31 32	In addition, our review will be informed by existing comprehensive reviews on the topic. <sup>4 45</sup>
33	
34	Reviews will be systematically identified through the systematic review filter in PubMed and the
35	
36 37	Cochrane Database of Systematic Review (SDSR). We will screen the international registry
38	
39	PROSPERO for ongoing efforts that could inform this project during the update search period;
40	summer the the maintening in the last only true and sing offer to the to
41	currently, the registry includes only two ongoing efforts that address selected aspects of MCS. <sup>46</sup>
42 43	47
44	
45	For individual guiding questions, we will search additional sources, including selected and
46	Tor marviduar balande questions, we will search additional sources, meruding selected and
47	pre-specified grey literature sources. For definitions and diagnostic criteria (GQ1), we will
48 49	pre specifica grey inclutice sources. For definitions and anglissue effectia $(SQT)$ , we will
50	search the website of global organizations such as the World Health Organization (WHO).
51	
52	Searches for prevalence research (GQ2) will reference-mine existing reviews. <sup>5</sup> We will review
53 54	
54 55	reports identified in PubMed Health regarding consensus statements on MCS as a distinct
56	
57	
58	
59 60	For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml
00	

disorder (GQ3) and regarding published suggested mechanisms of action (GQ4). For intervention studies (GQ5), we will search repositories of practice guidelines including G-I-N<sup>48</sup> and the ECRI-maintained guideline database.<sup>49</sup> In addition, we will search the U.S. trial registry clinicaltrials.gov<sup>50</sup> and the International Clinical Trials Registry Platform maintained by the WHO.<sup>51</sup>

In addition, we will reference-mine relevant reviews and included studies and consult with content experts to ensure that all relevant literature has been captured.

# Eligibility Criteria and Screening

We will use a PICOTSO (population, intervention/exposure, comparator, outcome, timing, setting, and other limiter) framework to structure the eligibility criteria. For each guiding question, we will determine detailed inclusion and exclusion criteria. The criteria, thus far, are as 4.0 follows:

- Population: •
  - Publications reporting definitions GQ1) and studies reporting on the prevalence and incidence (GQ2) of MCS will be limited to those that explicitly state *multiple* chemical sensitivity, chemical intolerance, or idiopathic environmental intolerance with a reference to chemical sensitivities. Publications reporting exclusively on the prevalence of individual sick building syndrome symptoms will be excluded.
  - Eligible populations for GQ3 and GQ4 will include those that either state *multiple chemical sensitivity* or those that are characterized by symptoms of idiopathic environmental intolerance with a reference to chemical sensitivity. Populations will not be restricted to human participants diagnosed with MCS, and will instead

## BMJ Open

r	
2 3	include a wide range of research that may contribute to establishing MCS as a
4	
5 6	diagnosis and exploring relevant mechanisms.
7	
8	$\circ$ GQ5 will be limited to samples of human participants where a majority (75% or
9	
10	more) is diagnosed with MCS, idiopathic environmental intolerance for
11 12	
13	chemicals, the equivalent of the ICD-10-CM Code F45.9 (somatoform disorder,
14	
15	unspecified), or studies that report on a subgroup of the patients of interest.
16	
17	Intervention/exposure/independent variable:
18	
19	• We will accept definitions of MCS and descriptions that include diagnostic
20	
21	criteria (GQ1).
22 23	emena (GQ1).
23	- Drevelance and incidence measures need to state the exiteria of MCS elecular to be
24	• Prevalence and incidence measures need to state the criteria of MCS clearly to be
26	
27	eligible (GQ2).
28	
29	<ul> <li>GQ3 studies assessing whether MCS is a distinct disorder (i.e., distinct from other</li> </ul>
30	
31	"physical" disorders or "psychiatric" disorders) need to provide empirical
32	
33	evidence of discriminatory power to support the authors' conclusions or need to
34	
35	be based on formal expert consensus methods. Opinions of individual authors will
36 37	
38	not be eligible.
39	not de englidie.
40	• Eligible publications suggesting underlying mechanisms (GQ4) may include
41	• Eligible publications suggesting underlying mechanisms (GQ4) may include
42	avidence for the exact of MCS or the course of the disease including TU T
43	evidence for the onset of MCS or the course of the disease, including TILT
44	
45	(toxicant-induced loss of tolerance describing an initiation and a triggering stage).
46	
47	• Studies evaluating interventions (GQ5) to prevent, manage, or treat MCS will be
48	
49 50	eligible. Interventions will not be restricted by the content or treatment approach,
51	
52	and may include interventions aiming to avoid triggers, focusing on coping with
53	
54	MCS symptoms, desensitization, or addressing the causes of MCS. In addition,
55	
56	
57	

interventions in patients diagnosed with MCS will be eligible regardless of the intervention focus (patient-centered rather than intervention-centered approach). Case studies of individual patients will be included if focused on intervention rather than the natural course of the condition and the description is published in a peer-reviewed scientific journal.

- Comparator: Studies will be eligible regardless of the presence of a comparator.
- Outcome: GQ1 publications will need to provide sufficiently detailed descriptions that can be operationalized as a definition or diagnostic criteria. GQ2 studies will need to report a numerical estimate of the prevalence or incidence of MCS. GQ3 and GQ4 will not be limited by reported outcomes. GQ5 studies may report on patient health (self or clinician report), physiological or psychosocial measures assessing the effect of the intervention (effectiveness as well as safety indicators); quantitative and qualitative data will be eligible. Studies reporting only on treatment uptake, patient or provider acceptability of treatments, or treatment costs will be excluded.
- Timing: GQ1 studies will be included regardless of the publication year (e.g., definitions from the 1980s are eligible). GQ2 studies will be eligible regardless of the timing of the exposure or assessment (e.g., childhood exposure, symptoms tested in adults); however, only prevalence and incidence estimate elicited in the last ten years will be eligible (historic estimates will be excluded). GQ3 and GQ4 studies will not be restricted by time of exposure or follow-up, and retrospective, concurrent, and prospective studies will be eligible. GQ5 studies will be included regardless of the intervention duration and follow up.

- Setting: Studies will not be restricted by setting and will be drawn from the international literature.
- Other limiters: English-language publications disseminated to a wide audience through a scientific journal will be eligible. Studies published in abbreviated form (e.g., conference abstracts) will not be eligible for inclusion.

Systematic reviews and relevant narrative reviews will be retained for reference-mining. Multiple publications on the same study (i.e., studies defined by the included participants) will be consolidated into one study record to ensure that a given study is not counted multiple times regardless of the number of publications reported on the study. The literature flow will be transparently documented in a citation management program.

# **Inclusion Screening Process**

We will use an online database (DistillerSR) designed for literature reviews to screen the search output. The team will design detailed citation and full text screening forms to ensure a transparent, consistent, and unambiguous approach. Citations found to be potentially relevant by at least one reviewer will be obtained as full text. Citations screening will be supported by machine learning algorithms to reduce reviewer errors and bias. All citations excluded by a human reviewer will be screened for relevance by the machine learning algorithm to ensure that no potentially relevant study has been missed.

Full text screening will apply the detailed eligibility criteria. Training will ensure a shared understanding of all inclusion and exclusion criteria across reviewers. Full text publications will be screened by two independent reviewers and any discrepancies will be resolved through discussion in the review team. Dual screening reduces reviewer bias and errors and is critical for this complex topic. The screening decisions and reasons for exclusion of studies will be tracked

in the online database and citation management software. This allows us to reconstruct a detailed literature flow and facilitates the documentation of included and excluded publications. Reasons for exclusion will match the exclusion criteria dimensions to orient the reader. The literature flow will be documented in a flow diagram.

Studies excluded at full text will be documented in the appendix of the review together with a reason for exclusion. We will retain background papers, i.e., papers to cite or reviews to reference-mine. We will report the number of included studies and the number of publications reporting on each study across the review and for each guiding question.

# **Data Abstraction**

The data abstraction will provide a concise overview of the evidence.

For **GQ1** (definitions and diagnostic criteria), we will document the suggested definitions and the approach to establish it. We will document published diagnostic criteria of MCS and for diagnostic accuracy studies, the type (e.g., self report questionnaire, objective test such as exposure chamber and challenge test) and name of the test will be recorded.

For **GQ2** (prevalence and incidence), we will document the data type (e.g., prevalence or incidence), the method of assessment (e.g., self report, medical record), and the operationalization of MCS (definition, criteria). We will distinguish general, unselected populations (e.g., students) from targeted samples with potentially increased risk (e.g., Gulf War veterans). For each study, we will record the country, sample size, and year of estimate, and identify any published prospective studies.

For **GQ3** (MCS as a distinct disorder), we will document the aim of the study, the employed study design, and the analytic approach to evaluate MCS as a distinct disorder. We will record the type of research approach used to determine whether MCS should or should not be considered a

#### **BMJ** Open

distinct disorder or syndrome (e.g., establishing a unique biomarker, analyzing symptom clusters, documenting explained variance)<sup>22</sup> and differentiate the use of direct, mechanistic, and parallel evidence by the authors.<sup>52-54</sup> We will abstract the authors' conclusion regarding their conceptual agreement with MCS as a distinct disorder with a differential clinical diagnosis.

For **GQ4** (underlying mechanisms), we will broadly categorize the study type and approach to indicate whether the study addresses the etiology or pathogenic development and whether the approach assumes a biological or psychological hypothesis. For each study, we will categorize the suggested mechanisms (e.g., immune system dysregulation, neural sensitization and hyperresponsivity, neurogenic inflammation, limbic system dysfunction, oxidative stress hypothesis, genetic theories, or classical conditioning).<sup>5</sup> This will involve collating and reviewing all identified mechanisms and establishing a categorization system based on the published literature and identified approaches. We will also establish a compendium of frameworks and diagrams reported by the authors. For this, figures published under the Creative Commons will be included in the compendium; for all others, the publisher will be contacted to request permission to use the figure.

**GQ5** (therapy and management for MCS) will collate all identified interventions and broadly categorizing interventions as prevention, management, or treatment. We will document the focus of the intervention (e.g., aiming to alter the course of the condition, coping strategies) together with the broad therapeutic approach (removing triggers from environment, diet, supplements, masks, devices, [off-label] medication, psychological approaches). The categorization system will built on existing reviews and the identified empirical research.<sup>22</sup> We will also abstract the author group, publication year, and country.

Data will be abstracted by one reviewer and checked by an experienced literature review methodologist. We will export data into tables and figures or data files for further analysis.

# **Consultation Exercise**

The last step of the scoping review process will be a consultation exercise. We will ask multidisciplinary technical experts and stakeholders in MCS research, practice, and advocacy to review the results of the scoping review. These reviewers will not have been involved in the review process and will assess the review *de novo*. Previous experiences have shown that this last step of stakeholder involvement provides invaluable input and adds to the usefulness and validity of the end product.<sup>33 55 56</sup> The consultation exercise will be conducted as an online survey sent to participants together with the review to elicit structured feedback on the content and presentation of the review. The input will contribute to the presentation of the scoping review 4.04 results.

# Patient and Public Involvement

The planned review was presented at a stakeholder meeting organized by the funding agency that included a patient representative. Several stakeholders are also part of the scientific steering committee that reviewed this protocol (see acknowledgement section). The results of the review will be distributed to stakeholders in a formal consultation exercise as outlined above. This step will be instrumental in ensuring a user-friendly presentation of results that is useful to patients and the public.

# **Result Presentation**

Characteristics of all studies meeting inclusion criteria will be documented in concise evidence tables to provide a broad documentation of the underlying evidence base. Findings across studies will be documented in an evidence map. This visual and user friendly research overview will map the existing evidence on MCS.

The evidence map will use a bubble plot format with a limited number of dimensions to display the existing research. Each bubble in the plot will represent a study and the size of the bubble will represent the size of the study. The plot will use the x-axis to display existing types of research studies to characterize the evidence base further. The y-axis can be used to characterize the guiding question addressed by the research. In addition, the shape of the bubble and/or shading may represent different study designs and methodological characteristics. The optimal display will be selected based on input from the consultation exercise.

The tables and figures will be accompanied by a narrative that summarizes the identified evidence base. This scoping review and evidence map will provide a broad overview of the existing research on MCS. It also aims to facilitate a future systematic review of the literature that will answer definitive research questions (e.g., what is the prevalence of MCS and the effectiveness of treatments for MCS). Scoping and mapping has become increasingly useful to prepare more definitive systematic reviews that answer closed questions, in particular for large and controversial topics.<sup>34 35 40 44 57 58</sup> The scoping review will provide context and information on which topic areas are to date amenable to a formal systematic review of the literature. The future systematic review will address a narrower scope of approaches that have been identified in this

scoping review, assess the quality of evidence for distinct topics of interest, and synthesize the evidence.

In addition to documenting the existing evidence base, we will clearly outline gaps in the literature identified in this scoping review. The gap presentation will use the scoping review's eligibility framework to transparently document existing gaps and future research needs. The gap analysis will make concrete recommendations to facilitate future research.

# Ethics and Dissemination and Data Availability

The scoping review was determined to be exempt from further review by the University of Southern California Institutional Review Board (IRB) review in July 2022 (ID UP-22-00516). The results of the review will be disseminated through a journal manuscript. Data of the scoping review will be publicly available through an online data repository (SRDR+).

# **Author Contributions**

SH obtained funding; SH, MD, KR, OA, JJ designed the study, SH, MD, MB, JR, AlM, CP screened literature to prepare this manuscript; AnM and DT manage the data; SY conducted the literature searches; all authors contributed conceptually to the work and edited this manuscript.

# **Competing Interests**

None of the authors have any conflicts of interest to declare.

# Funding

This work was supported by the Marilyn Brachman Hoffman Foundation [ID 015153-00001].

# Acknowledgements

We thank Dori Germolec, Howard Hu, Jon Samet, and Roberta White for their thoughtful comments. We also thank Tatjana Walker for her feedback and support.

# References

 Consensus on Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Multiple chemical sensitivity: a 1999 consensus. Arch Environ Health 1999;54(3):147-9 doi: 10.1080/00039899909602251[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

- Workshop on Multiple Chemical S, World Health Organization. Programme for the Promotion of Chemical S, International Programme for Chemical S. Report of the Workshop on Multiple Chemical Sensitivities (MCS), Berlin, Germany, 21-23 February 1996. Geneva: World Health Organization, 1996.
- Cone JE, Harrison R, Reiter R. Patients with multiple chemical sensitivities: clinical diagnostic subsets among an occupational health clinic population. Occup Med 1987;2(4):721-38
- 4. Driesen L, Patton R, John M. The impact of multiple chemical sensitivity on people's social and occupational functioning; a systematic review of qualitative research studies. J

Psychosom Res 2020;**132**:109964 doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychores.2020.109964[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

# 5. Zucco GM, Doty RL. Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Brain Sci 2021;12(1) doi:

10.3390/brainsci12010046[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

- 6. Winder C. Mechanisms of multiple chemical sensitivity. Toxicol Lett 2002;128(1-3):85-97 doi: 10.1016/s0378-4274(01)00536-7[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- Cullen MR. The worker with multiple chemical sensitivies An overview. Occup. Med.-State Art Rev. 1987;2(4):655-61
- Alameda Cuesta A, Pazos Garciandía Á, Oter Quintana C, Losa Iglesias ME. Fibromyalgia, Chronic Fatigue Syndrome, and Multiple Chemical Sensitivity: Illness Experiences. Clin Nurs Res 2021;30(1):32-41 doi: 10.1177/1054773819838679[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 9. AAAI Board of Directors. Idiopathic environmental intolerances. American Academy of Allergy, Asthma and Immunology (AAAAI) Board of Directors. J Allergy Clin Immunol 1999;103(1 Pt 1):36-40
- ACOEM Environmental Medicine Committee. ACOEM position statement. Multiple chemical sensitivities: idiopathic environmental intolerance. College of Occupational and Environmental Medicine. J Occup Environ Med 1999;41(11):940-2
- Lacour M, Zunder T, Schmidtke K, Vaith P, Scheidt C. Multiple chemical sensitivity syndrome (MCS)--suggestions for an extension of the U.S. MCS-case definition. Int J Hyg Environ Health 2005;208(3):141-51 doi: 10.1016/j.ijheh.2005.01.017[published Online First: Epub Date].

Page 21 of 39	BMJ Open
1	
2 3	12. Hempel S, Danz M, Robinson KA, Bolshakova M, Imasuen E, Rodriguez J, et al. Multiple
4 5	Chemical Sensitivity. Secondary Multiple Chemical Sensitivity 2022. osf.io/4a3wu
6 7	
8 9	13. Regal Ramos RJ. [Can we rule out that fibromyalgia, chronic fatigue syndrome and multiple
10 11	chemical sensitivity are psychosomatic diseases?]. Semergen 2015;41(7):349-53 doi:
12 13	10.1016/j.semerg.2015.04.015[published Online First: Epub Date] .
14 15	14. Staudenmayer H. Clinical consequences of the EI/MCS "diagnosis": two paths. Regul
16 17 18	Toxicol Pharmacol 1996;24(1 Pt 2):S96-110 doi: 10.1006/rtph.1996.0084[published
19 20	Online First: Epub Date] .
21 22	15. Gots RE. Multiple chemical sensitivities: distinguishing between psychogenic and
23 24	toxicodynamic. Regul Toxicol Pharmacol 1996;24(1 Pt 2):S8-15 doi:
25 26 27	10.1006/rtph.1996.0071[published Online First: Epub Date] .
28 29	16. Heo Y, Kim SH, Lee SK, Kim HA. Factors Contributing to the Self-Reported Prevalence of
30 31	Multiple Chemical Sensitivity in Public Facility Workers and the General Population of
32 33	Korea. J uoeh 2017; <b>39</b> (4):249-58 doi: 10.7888/juoeh.39.249[published Online First:
34 35 36	Epub Date] .
37 38	17. Cui X, Lu X, Hiura M, Oda M, Hisada A, Miyazaki W, et al. Prevalence and interannual
39 40	changes in multiple chemical sensitivity in Japanese workers. Environ Health Prev Med
41 42 43	2014;19(3):215-9 doi: 10.1007/s12199-014-0378-6[published Online First: Epub Date] .
44 45	18. Kipen HM, Hallman W, Kelly-McNeil K, Fiedler N. Measuring chemical sensitivity
46 47	prevalence: a questionnaire for population studies. Am J Public Health 1995;85(4):574-7
48 49	doi: 10.2105/ajph.85.4.574[published Online First: Epub Date] .
50 51 52	
53 54	
55 56	
57	
58 59 60	For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

- Dupas D, Dagorne MA. [Multiple chemical sensitivity: a diagnosis not to be missed]. Rev Mal Respir 2013;30(2):99-104 doi: 10.1016/j.rmr.2012.06.016[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 20. Dantoft TM, Andersson L, Nordin S, Skovbjerg S. Chemical intolerance. Curr Rheumatol Rev 2015;11(2):167-84 doi: 10.2174/157339711102150702111101[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 21. Herr C, Eikmann T. [Environmental-medical diagnosis and therapy. Hasty diagnosis of unspecified environmental syndromes should be avoided]. Fortschr Med 1998;116(33):26-9
- 22. Watanabe M, Tonori H, Aizawa Y. Multiple chemical sensitivity and idiopathic environmental intolerance (part two). Environ Health Prev Med 2003;7(6):273-82 doi: 10.1007/bf02908886[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 23. Sparks PJ, Daniell W, Black DW, Kipen HM, Altman LC, Simon GE, et al. Multiple chemical sensitivity syndrome: a clinical perspective. II. Evaluation, diagnostic testing, treatment, and social considerations. J Occup Med 1994;36(7):731-7
- 24. Gibson PR, Lindberg A. Physicians' perceptions and practices regarding patient reports of multiple chemical sensitivity. ISRN Nurs 2011;2011:838930 doi: 10.5402/2011/838930[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 25. Phillips T, Rees T. (In)Visibility Online: The Benefits of Online Patient Forums for People with a Hidden Illness: The Case of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS). Med Anthropol Q 2018;32(2):214-32 doi: 10.1111/maq.12397[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
  26. Description: The Case of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) and Anthropol Date]|.
- 26. Ross GH. Treatment options in multiple chemical sensitivity. Toxicol Ind Health 1992;8(4):87-94

### BMJ Open

27. Gibson PR, Elms AN, Ruding LA. Perceived treatment efficacy for conventional and
alternative therapies reported by persons with multiple chemical sensitivity. Environ
Health Perspect 2003;111(12):1498-504 doi: 10.1289/ehp.5936[published Online First:
Epub Date] .
28. Skovbjerg S, Johansen JD, Rasmussen A, Thorsen H, Elberling J. General practitioners'
experiences with provision of healthcare to patients with self-reported multiple chemical
sensitivity. Scand J Prim Health Care 2009;27(3):148-52 doi:
10.1080/02813430902888355[published Online First: Epub Date] .
29. Rest KM. A survey of AOEC physician practices and attitudes regarding multiple chemical
sensitivity. Toxicol Ind Health 1992;8(4):51-65
30. McGowan J, Straus S, Moher D, Langlois EV, O'Brien KK, Horsley T, et al. Reporting
scoping reviews-PRISMA ScR extension. J Clin Epidemiol 2020;123:177-79 doi:
10.1016/j.jclinepi.2020.03.016[published Online First: Epub Date] .
31. Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension
for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Ann Intern Med
2018;169(7):467-73 doi: 10.7326/M18-0850[published Online First: Epub Date]].
32. Peters MDJ, Marnie C, Colquhoun H, Garritty CM, Hempel S, Horsley T, et al. Scoping
reviews: reinforcing and advancing the methodology and application. Syst Rev
2021;10(1):263 doi: 10.1186/s13643-021-01821-3[published Online First: Epub Date] .
33. Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. International
Journal of Social Research Methodology 2005;8(1):19-32

- 34. Miake-Lye IM, Hempel S, Shanman R, Shekelle PG. What is an evidence map? A systematic review of published evidence maps and their definitions, methods, and products. Syst Rev 2016;5:28 doi: 10.1186/s13643-016-0204-x[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 35. Hempel S. Conducting Your Literature Review. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association, 2019.
- 36. Apaydin EA, Maher AR, Raaen L, Motala A, Baxi S, Shanman RM, et al. The Use of Technology in the Clinical Care of Depression: An Evidence Map. J Clin Psychiatry 2018;79(5) doi: 10.4088/JCP.18r12118[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 37. Apaydin EA, Partikian A, Rollison J, Baxi S, Fu N, Hempel S. An evidence map of treatments for infantile epilepsy. Epilepsy Res 2021;178:106781 doi: 10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2021.106781[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 38. Apaydin EA, Richardson AS, Baxi S, Vockley J, Akinniranye O, Ross R, et al. An evidence map of randomised controlled trials evaluating genetic therapies. BMJ Evid Based Med 2020 doi: 10.1136/bmjebm-2020-111448[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- Bouskill K, Hempel S, Richardson A, Ganz PA, Baxi S, Zutshi R, et al. Evidence map of ductal carcinoma in situ management options. Menopause 2019;26(11):1250-58 doi: 10.1097/GME.00000000001397[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 40. Hempel S, Taylor SL, Solloway MR, Miake-Lye IM, Beroes JM, Shanman R, et al. Evidence Map of Acupuncture. Washington (DC), 2014.
- 41. Hilton LG, Marshall NJ, Motala A, Taylor SL, Miake-Lye IM, Baxi S, et al. Mindfulness meditation for workplace wellness: An evidence map. Work 2019;63(2):205-18 doi: 10.3233/WOR-192922[published Online First: Epub Date]].

### BMJ Open

42. Mahe	r AR, Apaydin EA, Raaen L, Motala A, Baxi S, Hempel S. The Use of Technology in
th	e Clinical Care of Anxiety: An Evidence Map. Psychiatr Serv 2021;72(2):195-99 doi:
10	0.1176/appi.ps.202000178[published Online First: Epub Date] .
43. Sollov	way MR, Taylor SL, Shekelle PG, Miake-Lye IM, Beroes JM, Shanman RM, et al. An
ev	vidence map of the effect of Tai Chi on health outcomes. Syst Rev 2016;5(1):126 doi:
10	).1186/s13643-016-0300-y[published Online First: Epub Date] .
44. Hadda	away N, Macura B, Whaley P, Pullin A. ROSES for Systematic Review Protocols.
Ve	ersion 1.0: figshare, 2018. 10.6084/m9.figshare.5897269.v4.
ht	tps://figshare.com/articles/online_resource/ROSES_for_Systematic_Review_Protocols/
58	397269
45. De Lu	aca C, Raskovic D, Pacifico V, Thai JC, Korkina L. The search for reliable biomarkers
of	disease in multiple chemical sensitivity and other environmental intolerances. Int J
Er	nviron Res Public Health 2011;8(7):2770-97 doi: 10.3390/ijerph8072770[published
O	nline First: Epub Date] .
46. Mette	Toft, Rukayya Nasir Sani, Danijela Gasevic, Ruth McQuillan, Anne Martin. Multiple
ch	emical sensitivity: prevalence, triggers, symptoms, and impact on lifestyle. A
sy	stematic review of epidemiological studies. 2018
47. Sunita	a Vohra, Mohammad Karkhaneh, Salima Punja, Susanne King-Jones, Karin Olson.
Sy	stematic review of evidence for the effectiveness of mind-body interventions to treat
М	ultiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS). 2017
48. Guide	lines International Network. Welcome to Guidelines International Network. Secondary
	elcome to Guidelines International Network. <u>https://g-i-n.net/</u> .

	https://www.ecri.org/solutions/ecri-guidelines-trust.
50. U	J.S. National Library of Medicine. ClinicalTrials Homepage. Secondary ClinicalTrials
	Homepage. <u>https://clinicaltrials.gov/</u> .
51. V	Vorld Health Organization. International Clinical Trials Registry Platform. Secondary
	International Clinical Trials Registry Platform. https://trialsearch.who.int/.
52. F	edak KM, Bernal A, Capshaw ZA, Gross S. Applying the Bradford Hill criteria in the 21st
	century: how data integration has changed causal inference in molecular epidemiology.
	Emerg Themes Epidemiol 2015;12:14 doi: 10.1186/s12982-015-0037-4[published Onlir
	First: Epub Date] .
53. H	Iill AB. The Environment and Disease: Association or Causation? Proc R Soc Med
	1965; <b>58</b> :295-300
54. H	Iowick J, Glasziou P, Aronson JK. The evolution of evidence hierarchies: what can
	Bradford Hill's 'guidelines for causation' contribute? J R Soc Med 2009;102(5):186-94
	doi: 10.1258/jrsm.2009.090020[published Online First: Epub Date] .
55. H	Iempel S, Bolshakova M, Turner B, Dinalo J, Rose D, Motala A, et al. Evidence-Based
	Quality Improvement: A Scoping Review of the Literature. Journal of General Internal
	Medicine in press
56. T	orriani-Pasin C, Demers M, Polese JC, Bishop L, Wade E, Hempel S, et al. mHealth
	technologies used to capture walking and arm use behavior in adult stroke survivors: a
	scoping review beyond measurement properties. Disabil. Rehabil. 2021:1-13 doi:
	10.1080/09638288.2021.1953623[published Online First: Epub Date] .

1	
2	
3	57. United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). ORD Staff Handbook for
4	
5 6	Developing IRIS Assessments (Public Comment Draft, Nov. 2020). Secondary ORD
7	
8	Staff Handbook for Developing IRIS Assessments (Public Comment Draft, Nov. 2020)
9	
10	2020. https://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/iris_drafts/recordisplay.cfm?deid=350086.
11 12	
13	58. Hempel S, Xenakis L, Danz M. Systematic Reviews for Occupational Safety and Health
14	
15	Questions: Resources for Evidence Synthesis: RAND Corporation, 2016:102.
16	
17	
18 19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24 25	
25	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31 32	Questions: Resources for Evidence Synthesis: RAND Corporation, 2016:102.
33	
34	
35	
36 37	
37 38	
39	
40	
41	
42	
43 44	
44	
46	
47	
48	
49	
50 51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
56 57	
57 58	
59	
60	For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

# Appendix: Search Strategies

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol

# PubMed

"multiple chemical sensitivity"[MeSH Terms] OR ("multiple"[Title/Abstract] AND
"chemical"[Title/Abstract] AND "sensitivity"[Title/Abstract]) OR "multiple chemical
sensitivity"[Title/Abstract] OR ("multiple"[Title/Abstract] AND "chemical"[Title/Abstract]
AND "sensitivities"[Title/Abstract]) OR "multiple chemical sensitivities"[Title/Abstract]
OR "MCS syndrome"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical intolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR
"chemical y intolerant"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical hypersensitivity"[Title/Abstract] OR
"chemical AIDS"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical sensitivity disorder"[Title/Abstract] OR
"chemical sensitivity syndromes"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemophobia"[Title/Abstract] OR
"chemical sensitivity syndromes"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemophobia"[Title/Abstract]
OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR "sensitivity to environmental
chemicals"[Title/Abstract] OR ("chemical"[Title/Abstract] OR "sensitivity to environmental
illness"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical"] AND "environmental
illness"[Title/Abstract] OR "twentieth century disease"[Title/Abstract] OR
"20th century disease"[Title/Abstract] OR "sick building syndrome"[Title/Abstract] OR
"building-related illness"[Title/Abstract]

OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR "mast cell activation syndrome"[Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances"[Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental illness"[Title/Abstract] Limit: English language

**BMJ** Open

# Agricultural & Environmental Science Collection

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome") OR noft("chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia") OR noft("environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses") OR noft("total allergy syndrome") OR noft("twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness") OR noft("toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance") OR noft("mast cell activation syndrome") OR noft("idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness"))

AND

(stype.exact("Scholarly Journals" OR "Other Sources" OR "Reports")

AND

la.exact("ENG"))

# BIOSIS

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" (Topic) or "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" (Topic) or "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically

induced environmental illnesses" (Topic) or "total allergy syndrome" (Topic) or "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" (Topic) or "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" (Topic) or "mast cell activation syndrome" (Topic) or "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" (Topic)

AND Article (Document Types)

AND English (Languages)

## CINAHL

TI ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR SU ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical Page 31 of 39

#### **BMJ** Open

"environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness") OR AB ("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness")

AND

English language

# **Current Contents**

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR

"chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" (Topic)

and

English (Language)

and

Article or Review Article or Correction (Document Types)

# EMBASE

('multiple chemical sensitivity':ti,ab,kw OR 'multiple chemical sensitivities':ti,ab,kw OR 'mcs syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemically intolerant':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical hypersensitivity':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical aids':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical sensitivity disorder':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical sensitivity syndromes':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemophobia':ti,ab,kw OR 'environmental chemical odor intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'sensitivity to environmental chemicals':ti,ab,kw OR ('chemical':ti,ab,kw AND 'environmental illness':ti,ab,kw) OR 'chemically induced environmental illnesses':ti,ab,kw OR 'total allergy syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'twentieth century disease':ti,ab,kw OR '20th century disease':ti,ab,kw OR 'sick building syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'building-related illness':ti,ab,kw OR 'toxicant induced loss of tolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'toxicant-induced loss of tolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'mast cell activation

#### **BMJ** Open

syndrome':ti,a	ab,kw OR 'idiopathic environmental intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'idiopathic
environmenta	l intolerances':ti,ab,kw OR 'idiopathic environmental illness':ti,ab,kw)
AND	

english:la

AND

('article'/it OR 'review'/it)

#### **Environment Index**

TI ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR SU ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

"total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR AB ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR

AND

English language

## **Environmental Science**

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced

#### **BMJ** Open

environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental illness") AND stype.exact("Reports" OR "Working Papers" OR "Scholarly Journals") AND la.exact("English")) AND stype.exact("Reports" OR "Working Papers" OR "Scholarly Journals")

And

Source Type: Reports, Scholarly Journals, Working Papers

AND

Language: English

#### **Healthcare Administration**

noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" )Limits applied

P.C.

### AND

 Source type: Reports, Scholarly Journals

AND

Language: English

### HERO

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness"

AND

Language: English

#### **PsycINFO**

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome") OR noft("chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia") OR noft("environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to

#### **BMJ** Open

environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses") OR noft("total allergy syndrome") OR noft("twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness") OR noft("toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance") OR noft("mast cell activation syndrome") OR noft("idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness"))

AND

(la.exact("ENG")

la.exacu \_\_\_\_\_ AND stype.exact("Scholarly Journals"))

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness"

AND

**BMJ** Open

#### English language

AND

Exclude: Patent, Book, Commentary, Conference, Dissertation, Editorial, Letter

#### **SCOPUS**

(TITLE-ABS-KEY ("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "buildingrelated illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness")

AND (LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "ar") OR LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "re"))

AND

(LIMIT-TO (LANGUAGE, "English"))

#### Web of Science

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR

#### **BMJ** Open

"chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th ...
,se" OR "su.,
,s of tolerance" OR "1.
," OR "idiopathic environmental.
...
,ices" OR "idiopathic environmental illnes..
,itish (Language)
,ND
Article or Review Article (Document Types) century disease" OR "sick building syndrome" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation

# **BMJ Open**

#### Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol: Overview of Research and MCS Construct

Journal:	BMJ Open	
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2023-072098.R1	
Article Type:	: Protocol	
Date Submitted by the Author:	10-Aug-2023	
Complete List of Authors:	Hempel, Susanne; University of Southern California Danz, Margie; University of Southern California Robinson, Karen; Johns Hopkins Medicine, Division of Health Sciences Informatics Bolshakova, Maria; University of Southern California, Preventive Medicine Rodriguez, Jesus; University of Southern California Mears, Alanna; University of Southern California Pham, Cindy; University of Southern California Yagyu, Sachi; University of Southern California, Preventive Medicine Motala, Aneesa; University of Southern California, Southern California Evidence Review Center Tolentino, Danica; University of Southern California Akbari, Omid; University of Southern California, Molecular Microbiology and Immunology Johnston , Jill; USC Keck School of Medicine	
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Diagnostics	
Secondary Subject Heading:	Epidemiology	
Keywords:	INTERNAL MEDICINE, Systematic Review, GENERAL MEDICINE (see Internal Medicine)	

## SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts

# Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol: Overview of Research and MCS Construct

Susanne Hempel,<sup>1</sup> Margie Danz,<sup>1</sup> Karen A. Robinson,<sup>2</sup> Maria Bolshakova,<sup>1</sup> Jesus Rodriguez,<sup>1</sup> Alanna Mears,<sup>1</sup> Cindy Pham,<sup>1</sup> Sachi Yagyu,<sup>1</sup> Aneesa Motala,<sup>1</sup> Danica Tolentino,<sup>1</sup> Omid Akbari,<sup>3</sup> Jill Johnston<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Southern California Evidence Review Center, University of Southern California, Los Angeles,

USA

<sup>2</sup> Evidence-based Practice Center, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, USA

<sup>3</sup> Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, University of Southern California, Los Angeles,

USA

<sup>4</sup> Population and Public Health Science, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, USA

Corresponding author

Dr. Susanne Hempel; Southern California Evidence Review Center, University of Southern California, Keck School of Medicine, 1845 N Soto Street, Los Angeles, CA 90033; USA; <u>susanne.hempel@med.usc.edu</u>

Word count: 3,511

## ABSTRACT

Introduction: Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) has been characterized by reported adverse responses to environmental exposures of common chemical agents (e.g., perfumes, paint, cleaning products, and other inhaled or ingested agents) in low doses considered non-toxic for the general population. There is currently no consensus on whether MCS can be established as a distinct disorder.

Methods and analysis: The scoping review of the literature will be guided by five questions: How is MCS defined and which diagnostic criteria have been proposed? What methods are used to report prevalence and incidence estimates of MCS? What are the characteristics of the body of scientific evidence that addresses whether MCS is a distinct disorder or syndrome? What underlying mechanisms for MCS have been proposed in the scientific literature? Which treatment and management approaches for MCS have been evaluated in empirical research studies? We will conduct a comprehensive search in 14 research databases. Citation screening will be supported by machine learning algorithms. Two independent reviewers will assess eligibility of full text publications against prespecified criteria. Data abstraction will support concise evidence tables. A formal consultation exercise will elicit input from experts and stakeholders regarding the review results and presentation. The existing evidence about MCS will be documented in a user-friendly visualization in the format of an evidence map. Ethics and dissemination: Determined to be exempt from review (UP-22-00516). Results will be disseminated through a journal manuscript and data will be publicly accessible through an online data repository.

Registration: The protocol is registered in Open Science Framework (osf.io/4a3wu).

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

#### (249 words)

## **Keywords**

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity, Idiopathic Environmental Intolerance, Chemical Intolerance, Scoping Review, Evidence Map

## Strengths and Limitations

- This scoping review will cast a wide net capturing multiple important aspects of the complex construct multiple chemical sensitivity (MCS).
- A formal consultation exercise will provide input from experts and stakeholders.
- The existing research on MCS will be documented in a user-friendly visualization in the format of an evidence map.
- A scoping review can only provide a broad overview of the existing research.
- The lack of standardized terminology for the MCS construct makes identifying and documenting relevant research challenging.

## Introduction

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) has been characterized by reported adverse responses to environmental exposures of common chemical agents in low doses considered non-toxic for the general population. These may be solvents such as paint and cleaning products, odorants such as perfume and scented soaps, air pollutants such as cigarette smoke and smog, or materials such as new furnishings or new carpets. Symptoms are nonspecific, involve multiple organ systems, and may include nausea, dizziness, headache, abdominal pain, fatigue, and depression, among others [1-3]. Responses generalize from individual to sets of often unrelated chemical agents and limit social and occupational functioning [2, 4-8]. Terminology varies and some authors describe the condition more broadly as an idiopathic environmental intolerance [2, 9, 10]. Other researchers have called for a paradigm shift, moving away from terms that characterize the symptoms ("sensitivities") to a more neutral description as *symptoms associated with environmental factors* (SAEF) [11 12].

To date, tens of thousands of publications have addressed MCS in the international lay and scientific literature [13]. However, little consensus exists regarding MCS, including its defining characteristics [14-19]. Prevalence estimates vary considerably, suggesting differences in operationalizations of the definition and diagnostic criteria for MCS [20-23]. Individual symptoms reported by patients are not unique to MCS and the lack of consensus, including whether MCS should be considered a distinct disorder, hinders the identification and differential diagnosis of MCS in clinical practice [24-26]. Much debate centers around the underlying nature of the condition as toxigenic or psychogenic [27-29]. A large number of potentially underlying mechanisms of action for MCS have been described (e.g., immune system dysregulation, neural

Page 5 of 37

#### **BMJ** Open

sensitization and hyperresponsivity, neurogenic inflammation, limbic system dysfunction, oxidative stress hypothesis, genetic theories, and classical conditioning) [5]. Regardless of the challenges in operationalizing definitions and establishing its etiology, MCS is an internationally recognized phenomenon that has been described in different formats and terms for decades [5]. It is a distressing and puzzling condition for patients as well as their healthcare providers [30-32]. Some hypotheses about mechanisms of action have resulted in proposed interventions for patients; however, no comprehensive review of the evaluated treatment and management options exists that currently successfully supports patients describing MCS symptoms [33, 34]. Few attempts have been made to establish consensus on how patients presenting with MCS should be assessed or treated in clinical practice and new guidelines highlight the need for a complex multidisciplinary approach [35]. Surveys describe multiple, often not evidence-based treatment approaches that have been tried by patients, and the lack of clinical guidance leaves healthcare practitioners guessing how to best address MCS in their patients [8, 34, 36, 37].

Despite the large number of publications addressing MCS, there is a lack of research syntheses that provide an overview of the existing evidence base on the condition. We believe that the existing evidence base needs to be mapped as a first step in order to advance research and practice in this complex field. Before trying to establish the most salient case definition of MCS or the most plausible underlying mechanism(s) leading to MCS in a systematic review, a scoping review should systematically identify, explore, and characterize the existing research literature. The proposed work will be based on this type of review. Scoping reviews are systematic literature review approaches that explore research fields to capture the volume and content of scientific literature that is relevant to guiding questions for the review [38-40]. To address the complexity of the topic, it is critical that a comprehensive review cast a wide net,

incorporating research from different disciplines and conceptual positions. Our planned scoping review will use extensive literature searches to map the existing literature. The review will provide an overview of proposed definitions of and diagnostic criteria for MCS, identify prevalence and incidence research, document the body of evidence addressing the question of whether MCS is a distinct disorder, compile a compendium of suggested underlying mechanisms of MCS etiology and processes, and provide an overview of the literature on MCS treatment and management that has been published to date.

This scoping review was prospectively registered and will be conducted according to established procedures to provide a systematic and transparent exploration of the literature [41]. The findings of the scoping review will be presented as an evidence map. Evidence maps are an evidence synthesis tool that provide a visualization of a large evidence base to provide readers with a concise overview [42 43]. They allow a visual and user friendly research overview suitable for a large and diverse research field, effectively mapping the existing evidence [42, 44-51]. The evidence map will document the presence and absence of research on MCS for the five questions guiding the review in a user-friendly format.

#### **Guiding Questions**

07/ The following review questions will guide the scoping review:

- GQ1: How is Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS) defined and which diagnostic criteria have been proposed?
- GQ2: What methods are used to report prevalence and incidence estimates of MCS?
- GQ3: What are the characteristics of the body of scientific evidence that addresses whether MCS is a distinct disorder or syndrome?

- GQ4: What underlying mechanisms for MCS have been proposed in the scientific literature?
- GQ5: Which treatment and management approaches for MCS have been evaluated in empirical research studies?

#### **Review Aim**

The review will answer the guiding questions with the identified scientific literature in a userfriendly format. A systematic evidence map will provide a visualization of the existing evidence and research gaps. Methods and Analysis

The review is registered in the Open Science Framework (OSF) [13]. The scoping review will follow the steps for scoping reviews outlined by Arksey and Malloy: Stage 1: identifying the research question; Stage 2: identifying relevant studies; Stage 3: study selection; Stage 4: charting the data; Stage 5: collating, summarizing and reporting the results. In addition, a consultation exercise to inform and validate findings from the scoping review will be conducted. The planned duration is April 2022 to December 2023. The following outlines the steps in detail. The reporting will follow established guidelines [39, 52].

#### Search Strategy

We will search the international literature on MCS using different taxonomy and nomenclature. Literature searches will be designed, executed, and documented by an experienced evidence review center librarian. The scoping review addresses multiple aspects of MCS, and the search

strategy covers multiple databases to ensure that all scientific literature relevant to MCS will be identified. The use of multiple sources is a key method to minimize selection bias being introduced into the review. We plan on searching the following databases to obtain a diverse set of citations potentially relevant to MCS from different disciplines:

- PubMed (biomedical)
- CINAHL (nursing)

- Embase (biomedical)
- Web of Science (general scientific database)
- Scopus (health sciences)
- PsycINFO (behavioral and social sciences)
- Healthcare Administration Database (public health administration)
- Current Contents Connect (multidisciplinary)
- BIOSIS Citation Index (life sciences)
- Environment Index (environmental research)
- Environmental Science Database
- HERO (Health & Environmental Research Online)
- SciFinder (chemical literature)
- Agricultural & Environmental Science Collection (includes AGRICOLA, environmental research)

The search strategy is shown in the appendix. Content experts provided input regarding individual search terms and databases.

In addition, our review will be informed by existing comprehensive reviews on the topic [4,

12, 16, 17, 24, 35, 53-61]. Reviews will be systematically identified through the systematic

Page 9 of 37

#### **BMJ** Open

review filter in PubMed and the Cochrane Database of Systematic Review (SDSR). We will screen the international registry PROSPERO for ongoing efforts that could inform this project during the update search period; currently, the registry includes only two ongoing efforts that address selected aspects of MCS [62, 63].

For individual guiding questions, we will search additional sources, including selected and pre-specified grey literature sources. For definitions and diagnostic criteria (GQ1), we will search the website of global organizations such as the World Health Organization (WHO). Searches for prevalence research (GQ2) will reference-mine existing reviews [5]. We will review reports identified in PubMed Health regarding consensus statements on MCS as a distinct disorder (GQ3) and regarding published suggested underlying mechanisms (GQ4). For intervention studies (GQ5), we will search repositories of practice guidelines including <u>G-I-N</u> [64] and the <u>ECRI</u>-maintained guideline database.[65] In addition, we will search the U.S. trial registry <u>clinicaltrials.gov</u> [66] and the International Clinical Trials Registry Platform maintained by the WHO [67].

In addition, we will reference-mine relevant reviews and included studies and consult with content experts to ensure that all relevant literature has been captured.

#### **Eligibility Criteria and Screening**

We will use a PICOTSO (population, intervention/exposure, comparator, outcome, timing, setting, and other limiter) framework to structure the eligibility criteria. For each guiding question, we will determine detailed inclusion and exclusion criteria. The criteria, thus far, are as follows:

• Population:

- Publications reporting definitions (GQ1) and studies reporting on the prevalence and incidence (GQ2) of MCS will be limited to those that explicitly state *multiple chemical sensitivity, chemical intolerance,* or *idiopathic environmental intolerance* with a reference to *chemical* sensitivities (rather than electromagnetic sensitivity or other conditions not associated with perceived exposure to chemical agents, solvents, odorants, air pollutants, or materials). Publications reporting exclusively on the prevalence of individual sick building syndrome symptoms or electromagnetic hypersensitivity will be excluded.
- Eligible populations for GQ3 and GQ4 will include those that either state *multiple chemical sensitivity* or those that are characterized by symptoms of idiopathic environmental intolerance or exposure to environmental factors with a reference to chemical agents, solvents, odorants, air pollutants, or materials . Populations will not be restricted to human participants diagnosed with MCS, and will instead include a wide range of research that may contribute to establishing MCS as a diagnosis and exploring relevant underlying mechanisms.
- GQ5 will be limited to samples of human participants where some participants are characterized by MCS, idiopathic environmental intolerance for chemicals, the equivalent of the ICD-10-CM Code F45.9 (somatoform disorder, unspecified), or studies that report on a subgroup of the patients of interest.
- Intervention/exposure/independent variable:
  - We will accept definitions of MCS and descriptions that include diagnostic criteria (GQ1).

1		
2		
3		
2 3 4		
5		
6		
7		
/		
8		
9		
10		
11 12		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
10		
17		
18		
19		
20		
20 21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
20		
27		
28		
29		
30		
31		
32		
33		
34		
35		
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		
51		
52		
53		
55 54		
54		
55		
56		
57		
58		
59		
60		

- Prevalence and incidence measures need to state the criteria of MCS clearly to be eligible (GQ2).
- GQ3 studies assessing whether MCS is a distinct disorder (i.e., distinct from other "physical" disorders or "psychiatric" disorders) need to provide empirical evidence of discriminatory power to support the authors' conclusions or need to be based on formal expert consensus methods. Opinions of individual authors will not be eligible.
- Eligible publications suggesting underlying mechanisms (GQ4) may include evidence for the onset of MCS or the course of the disease, including TILT (toxicant-induced loss of tolerance describing an initiation and a triggering stage).
- Studies evaluating interventions (GQ5) to prevent, manage, or treat MCS will be eligible. Interventions will not be restricted by the content or treatment approach and may include interventions aiming to avoid triggers, focusing on coping with MCS symptoms, desensitization, or addressing the causes of MCS. In addition, interventions in patients diagnosed with MCS will be eligible regardless of the intervention focus (patient-centered rather than intervention-centered approach). Case studies of individual patients will be included if focused on intervention rather than the natural course of the condition and the description is published in a peer-reviewed scientific journal.
- Comparator: Studies will be eligible regardless of the presence of a comparator.
- Outcome: GQ1 publications will need to provide sufficiently detailed descriptions that can be operationalized as a definition or diagnostic criteria. GQ2 studies will need to report a numerical estimate of the prevalence or incidence of MCS. GQ3 and GQ4 will

not be limited by reported outcomes. GQ5 studies may report on patient health (self or clinician report), physiological or psychosocial measures assessing the effect of the intervention (effectiveness as well as safety indicators); quantitative and qualitative data will be eligible. Studies reporting only on treatment uptake, patient or provider acceptability of treatments, or treatment costs will be excluded.

- Timing: GQ1 studies will be included regardless of the publication year (e.g., definitions from the 1980s are eligible). GQ2 studies will be eligible regardless of the timing of the exposure or assessment (e.g., childhood exposure, symptoms tested in adults). GQ3 and GQ4 studies will not be restricted by time of exposure or follow-up, and retrospective, concurrent, and prospective studies will be eligible. GQ5 studies will be included regardless of the intervention duration and follow up.
- Setting: Studies will not be restricted by setting and will be drawn from the international literature.
- Other limiters: English-language publications disseminated to a wide audience through a scientific journal will be eligible. Studies published in abbreviated form (e.g., conference abstracts) will not be eligible for inclusion.

Systematic reviews and relevant narrative reviews will be retained for reference-mining. Multiple publications on the same study (i.e., studies defined by the included participants) will be consolidated into one study record to ensure that a given study is not counted multiple times regardless of the number of publications reported on the study. The literature flow will be transparently documented in a citation management program.

#### **BMJ** Open

#### **Inclusion Screening Process**

We will use an online database (DistillerSR) designed for literature reviews to screen the search output. The team will design detailed citation and full text screening forms to ensure a transparent, consistent, and unambiguous approach. Citations found to be potentially relevant by at least one reviewer will be obtained as full text. Citations screening will be supported by machine learning algorithms to reduce reviewer errors and bias. All citations excluded by a human reviewer will be screened for relevance by the machine learning algorithm to ensure that no potentially relevant publication has been missed.

Full text screening will apply the detailed eligibility criteria. Training will ensure a shared understanding of all inclusion and exclusion criteria across reviewers. Full text publications will be screened by two independent reviewers and any discrepancies will be resolved through discussion in the review team. Dual screening reduces reviewer bias and errors and is critical for this complex topic. The screening decisions and reasons for exclusion of studies will be tracked in the online database and citation management software. This allows us to reconstruct a detailed literature flow and facilitates the documentation of included and excluded publications. Reasons for exclusion will match the exclusion criteria dimensions to orient the reader. The literature flow will be documented in a flow diagram.

Studies excluded at full text will be documented in the appendix of the review together with a reason for exclusion. We will retain background papers, i.e., papers to cite or reviews to reference-mine. We will report the number of included studies and the number of publications reporting on each study across the review and for each guiding question.

#### **Data Abstraction**

The data abstraction will provide a concise overview of the evidence.

For **GQ1** (definitions and diagnostic criteria), we will document the suggested definitions and the approach to establish it. We will document published diagnostic criteria of MCS and for diagnostic accuracy studies, the type (e.g., self-report questionnaire, objective test such as exposure chamber and challenge test) and name of the test will be recorded.

For **GQ2** (prevalence and incidence), we will document the data type (e.g., prevalence or incidence), the method of assessment (e.g., self-report, medical record), and the operationalization of MCS (definition, criteria). We will distinguish general, unselected populations (e.g., students) from targeted samples with potentially increased risk (e.g., Gulf War veterans). For each study, we will record the country, sample size, and year of estimate, and identify any published prospective studies.

For **GQ3** (MCS as a distinct disorder), we will document the aim of the study, the employed study design, and the analytic approach to evaluate MCS as a distinct disorder. We will record the type of research approach used to determine whether MCS should or should not be considered a distinct disorder or syndrome (e.g., establishing a unique biomarker, analyzing symptom clusters, documenting explained variance) [26] and differentiate the use of direct, mechanistic, and parallel evidence by the authors [68-70]. We will abstract the authors' conclusion regarding their conceptual agreement with MCS as a distinct disorder with a differential clinical diagnosis.

For **GQ4** (underlying mechanisms), we will broadly categorize the study type and approach to indicate which aspect of the condition the study addresses (e.g., the general etiology or a specific process such as the mechanism of generalizing across agents) and whether the approach assumes a biological, psychological, or other (e.g., multiple processes) hypothesis. For each study, we will

#### **BMJ** Open

categorize the suggested mechanisms (e.g., immune system dysregulation, neural sensitization and hyperresponsivity, neurogenic inflammation, limbic system dysfunction, oxidative stress hypothesis, genetic theories, or classical conditioning) [5]. This will involve collating and reviewing all identified mechanisms and establishing a categorization system based on the published literature and identified approaches. We will also establish a compendium of frameworks and diagrams reported by the authors. For this, figures published under a Creative Commons license will be included in the compendium; for all others, the publisher will be contacted to request permission to use the figure.

**GQ5** (therapy and management for MCS) will collate all identified interventions and broadly categorizing interventions as prevention, management, or treatment. We will document the focus of the intervention (e.g., aiming to alter the course of the condition, coping strategies) together with the broad therapeutic approach (removing triggers from environment, diet, supplements, masks, devices, [off-label] medication, psychological approaches). The categorization system will built on existing reviews and the identified empirical research [26]. We will also abstract the author group, publication year, and country.

Data will be abstracted by one reviewer and checked by an experienced literature review methodologist. We will export data into tables and figures or data files for further analysis.

#### **Consultation Exercise**

The last step of the scoping review process will be a consultation exercise. We will ask multidisciplinary technical experts and stakeholders in MCS research, practice, and advocacy to review the results of the scoping review. These reviewers will not have been involved in the review process and will assess the review *de novo*. Previous experiences have shown that this last step of stakeholder involvement provides invaluable input and adds to the usefulness and validity of the end product [41, 71, 72]. The consultation exercise will be conducted as an online survey sent to participants together with the review to elicit structured feedback on the content and presentation of the review. The input will contribute to the presentation of the scoping review results.

#### Patient and Public Involvement

The planned review was presented at a stakeholder meeting organized by the funding agency that included a patient representative. Several stakeholders are also part of the scientific steering committee that reviewed this protocol (see acknowledgement section). The results of the review will be distributed to stakeholders in a formal consultation exercise as outlined above. This step will be instrumental in ensuring a user-friendly presentation of results that is useful to patients eliez. and the public.

## **Result Presentation**

Characteristics of all studies meeting inclusion criteria will be documented in concise evidence tables to provide a broad documentation of the underlying evidence base. Findings across studies will be documented in an evidence map. This visual and user friendly research overview will map the existing evidence on MCS.

The evidence map will use a limited number of dimensions to display the existing research. Displaying the evidence as a bubble plot, each bubble in the plot will represent a study and the size of the bubble will represent the size of the study. The plot will use the x-axis to display existing types of research studies to characterize the evidence base further. The v-axis

#### **BMJ** Open

can be used to characterize the guiding question addressed by the research. In addition, the shape of the bubble and/or shading may represent different study designs and methodological characteristics. The optimal display will be selected based on input from the consultation exercise.

The tables and figures will be accompanied by a narrative that summarizes the identified evidence base. This scoping review and evidence map will provide a broad overview of the existing research on MCS. It also aims to facilitate a future systematic review of the literature that will answer definitive research questions (e.g., what is the prevalence of MCS and the effectiveness of treatments for MCS). Scoping and mapping has become increasingly useful to prepare more definitive systematic reviews that answer closed questions, in particular for large and controversial topics [42, 43, 48, 52, 73, 74]. The scoping review will provide context and information on which topic areas are to date amenable to a formal systematic review of the literature. The future systematic review will address a narrower scope of approaches that have been identified in this scoping review, assess the quality of evidence for distinct topics of interest, and synthesize the evidence.

In addition to documenting the existing evidence base, we will clearly outline gaps in the literature identified in this scoping review. The gap presentation will use the scoping review's eligibility framework to transparently document existing gaps and future research needs. The gap analysis will make concrete recommendations to facilitate future research.

## Ethics and Dissemination and Data Availability

The scoping review was determined to be exempt from further review by the University of Southern California Institutional Review Board (IRB) review in July 2022 (ID UP-22-00516). The results of the review will be disseminated through a journal manuscript. Data of the scoping review will be publicly available through an online data repository (SRDR+).

## Author Contributions

SH obtained funding; SH, MD, KR, OA, JJ designed the study, SH, MD, MB, JR, AlM, CP screened literature to prepare this manuscript; AnM and DT manage the data; SY conducted the literature searches; all authors contributed conceptually to the work and edited this manuscript.

## **Competing Interests**

None of the authors have any conflicts of interest to declare.

## Funding

This work was supported by the Marilyn Brachman Hoffman Foundation [ID 015153-00001].

## Acknowledgements

We thank Dori Germolec, Howard Hu, Jon Samet, and Roberta White for their thoughtful comments. We also thank Tatjana Walker at the at the Marilyn Brachman Hoffman Foundation for her feedback and support.

## References

- 1. Consensus on Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Multiple chemical sensitivity: a 1999 consensus. Arch Environ Health 1999;**54**(3):147-9 doi: 10.1080/00039899909602251[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- Workshop on Multiple Chemical S, World Health Organization. Programme for the Promotion of Chemical Safety, International Programme for Chemical Safety. Report of the Workshop on Multiple Chemical Sensitivities (MCS), Berlin, Germany, 21-23 February 1996. Geneva: World Health Organization, 1996.
- Cone JE, Harrison R, Reiter R. Patients with multiple chemical sensitivities: clinical diagnostic subsets among an occupational health clinic population. Occup Med 1987;2(4):721-38
- 4. Driesen L, Patton R, John M. The impact of multiple chemical sensitivity on people's social and occupational functioning; a systematic review of qualitative research studies. J Psychosom Res 2020;132:109964 doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychores.2020.109964[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 5. Zucco GM, Doty RL. Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Brain Sci 2021;**12**(1) doi: 10.3390/brainsci12010046[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 6. Winder C. Mechanisms of multiple chemical sensitivity. Toxicol Lett 2002;**128**(1-3):85-97 doi: 10.1016/s0378-4274(01)00536-7[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 7. Cullen MR. The worker with multiple chemical sensitivies An overview. Occup. Med.-State Art Rev. 1987;2(4):655-61
- Alameda Cuesta A, Pazos Garciandía Á, Oter Quintana C, Losa Iglesias ME. Fibromyalgia, Chronic Fatigue Syndrome, and Multiple Chemical Sensitivity: Illness Experiences. Clin Nurs Res 2021;30(1):32-41 doi: 10.1177/1054773819838679[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 9. American Academy of Allergy Asthma and Immunology (AAAAI) Board of Directors. Idiopathic environmental intolerances. J Allergy Clin Immunol 1999;**103**(1 Pt 1):36-40
- ACOEM Environmental Medicine Committee. ACOEM position statement. Multiple chemical sensitivities: idiopathic environmental intolerance. College of Occupational and Environmental Medicine. J Occup Environ Med 1999;41(11):940-2
- Van den Bergh O, Brown RJ, Petersen S, Witthöft M. Idiopathic Environmental Intolerance: A Comprehensive Model. Clinical Psychological Science 2017;5(3):551-67 doi: 10.1177/2167702617693327[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- Haanes JV, Nordin S, Hillert L, et al. "Symptoms associated with environmental factors" (SAEF) - Towards a paradigm shift regarding "idiopathic environmental intolerance" and related phenomena. J Psychosom Res 2020;131:109955 doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychores.2020.109955[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 13. Hempel S, Danz M, Robinson KA, et al. Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Secondary Multiple Chemical Sensitivity 2022. osf.io/4a3wu

 Gad SC. Multiple Chemical Sensitivity: A Moderator's Viewpoint. International Journal of Toxicology (Taylor & Francis) 1999;18(6):379-81 doi: 10.1080/109158199225080[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

1 2 3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

31 32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39 40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47 48

49

50

51

52

53

- 15. Hyams KC. Developing case definitions for symptom-based conditions: the problem of specificity. Epidemiol Rev 1998;20(2):148-56 doi:
  - 10.1093/oxfordjournals.epirev.a017977[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- Kreutzer R. Idiopathic environmental intolerance: case definition issues. Occup Med 2000;15(3):511-7
- Lacour M, Zunder T, Schmidtke K, Vaith P, Scheidt C. Multiple chemical sensitivity syndrome (MCS)--suggestions for an extension of the U.S. MCS-case definition. Int J Hyg Environ Health 2005;208(3):141-51 doi: 10.1016/j.ijheh.2005.01.017[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 18. Rossi S. PA. Multiple chemical sensitivity: review of the state of the art in epidemiology, diagnosis, and future perspectives. J Occup Environ Med 2018;60(2):138-46
- Sparks PJ, Daniell W, Black DW, et al. Multiple chemical sensitivity syndrome: a clinical perspective. I. Case definition, theories of pathogenesis, and research needs. J Occup Med 1994;36(7):718-30
- 20. Heo Y, Kim SH, Lee SK, Kim HA. Factors Contributing to the Self-Reported Prevalence of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity in Public Facility Workers and the General Population of Korea. J uoeh 2017;**39**(4):249-58 doi: 10.7888/juoeh.39.249[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 21. Cui X, Lu X, Hiura M, et al. Prevalence and interannual changes in multiple chemical sensitivity in Japanese workers. Environ Health Prev Med 2014;19(3):215-9 doi: 10.1007/s12199-014-0378-6[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 22. Kipen HM, Hallman W, Kelly-McNeil K, Fiedler N. Measuring chemical sensitivity prevalence: a questionnaire for population studies. Am J Public Health 1995;85(4):574-7 doi: 10.2105/ajph.85.4.574[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 23. Dupas D, Dagorne MA. [Multiple chemical sensitivity: a diagnosis not to be missed]. Rev Mal Respir 2013;**30**(2):99-104 doi: 10.1016/j.rmr.2012.06.016[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 24. Dantoft TM, Andersson L, Nordin S, Skovbjerg S. Chemical intolerance. Curr Rheumatol Rev 2015;**11**(2):167-84 doi: 10.2174/157339711102150702111101[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 25. Herr C, Eikmann T. [Environmental-medical diagnosis and therapy. Hasty diagnosis of unspecified environmental syndromes should be avoided]. Fortschr Med 1998;116(33):26-9
- 26. Watanabe M, Tonori H, Aizawa Y. Multiple chemical sensitivity and idiopathic environmental intolerance (part two). Environ Health Prev Med 2003;7(6):273-82 doi: 10.1007/bf02908886[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 27. Regal Ramos RJ. [Can we rule out that fibromyalgia, chronic fatigue syndrome and multiple chemical sensitivity are psychosomatic diseases?]. Semergen 2015;41(7):349-53 doi: 10.1016/j.semerg.2015.04.015[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 28. Staudenmayer H. Clinical consequences of the EI/MCS "diagnosis": two paths. Regul Toxicol Pharmacol 1996;**24**(1 Pt 2):S96-110 doi: 10.1006/rtph.1996.0084[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

2	
3	
Δ	
-	
4 5 6	
6	
7	
8	
9	
9 10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	
16	
17	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
21 22 23	
23	
23 24 25 26	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33	
34	
35	
35 36 37	
37	
38	
39	
40 41	
41	
42	
43	
44	
45	
46	
47	
48	
49	
50	
50 51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
56	
57	
58	
59	
60	
00	

29. Gots RE. Multiple chemical sensitivities: distinguishing between psychogenic and toxicodynamic. Regul Toxicol Pharmacol 1996;**24**(1 Pt 2):S8-15 doi: 10.1006/rtph.1996.0071[published Online First: Epub Date]].

- Sparks PJ, Daniell W, Black DW, et al. Multiple chemical sensitivity syndrome: a clinical perspective. II. Evaluation, diagnostic testing, treatment, and social considerations. J Occup Med 1994;36(7):731-7
- 31. Gibson PR, Lindberg A. Physicians' perceptions and practices regarding patient reports of multiple chemical sensitivity. ISRN Nurs 2011;2011:838930 doi: 10.5402/2011/838930[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 32. Phillips T, Rees T. (In)Visibility Online: The Benefits of Online Patient Forums for People with a Hidden Illness: The Case of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS). Med Anthropol Q 2018;**32**(2):214-32 doi: 10.1111/maq.12397[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 33. Ross GH. Treatment options in multiple chemical sensitivity. Toxicol Ind Health 1992;**8**(4):87-94
- 34. Gibson PR, Elms AN, Ruding LA. Perceived treatment efficacy for conventional and alternative therapies reported by persons with multiple chemical sensitivity. Environ Health Perspect 2003;111(12):1498-504 doi: 10.1289/ehp.5936[published Online First: Epub Date].
- 35. Damiani G, Alessandrini M, Caccamo D, et al. Italian Expert Consensus on Clinical and Therapeutic Management of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS). Int J Environ Res Public Health 2021;**18**(21) doi: 10.3390/ijerph182111294[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 36. Skovbjerg S, Johansen JD, Rasmussen A, Thorsen H, Elberling J. General practitioners' experiences with provision of healthcare to patients with self-reported multiple chemical sensitivity. Scand J Prim Health Care 2009;27(3):148-52 doi: 10.1080/02813430902888355[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 37. Rest KM. A survey of AOEC physician practices and attitudes regarding multiple chemical
- sensitivity. Toxicol Ind Health 1992;8(4):51-65
- 38. McGowan J, Straus S, Moher D, et al. Reporting scoping reviews-PRISMA ScR extension. J Clin Epidemiol 2020;123:177-79 doi: 10.1016/j.jclinepi.2020.03.016[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Ann Intern Med 2018;169(7):467-73 doi: 10.7326/M18-0850[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- Peters MDJ, Marnie C, Colquhoun H, et al. Scoping reviews: reinforcing and advancing the methodology and application. Syst Rev 2021;10(1):263 doi: 10.1186/s13643-021-01821-3[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 41. Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. International Journal of Social Research Methodology 2005;**8**(1):19-32
- 42. Miake-Lye IM, Hempel S, Shanman R, Shekelle PG. What is an evidence map? A systematic review of published evidence maps and their definitions, methods, and products. Syst Rev 2016;5:28 doi: 10.1186/s13643-016-0204-x[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 43. Hempel S. *Conducting Your Literature Review*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association, 2019.

- 44. Apaydin EA, Maher AR, Raaen L, et al. The Use of Technology in the Clinical Care of Depression: An Evidence Map. J Clin Psychiatry 2018;79(5) doi: 10.4088/JCP.18r12118[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 45. Apaydin EA, Partikian A, Rollison J, Baxi S, Fu N, Hempel S. An evidence map of treatments for infantile epilepsy. Epilepsy Res 2021;**178**:106781 doi: 10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2021.106781[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 46. Apaydin EA, Richardson AS, Baxi S, et al. An evidence map of randomised controlled trials evaluating genetic therapies. BMJ Evid Based Med 2020 doi: 10.1136/bmjebm-2020-111448[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 47. Bouskill K, Hempel S, Richardson A, et al. Evidence map of ductal carcinoma in situ management options. Menopause 2019;26(11):1250-58 doi: 10.1097/GME.00000000001397[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 48. Hempel S, Taylor SL, Solloway MR, et al. Evidence Map of Acupuncture. Washington (DC), 2014.
- 49. Hilton LG, Marshall NJ, Motala A, et al. Mindfulness meditation for workplace wellness: An evidence map. Work 2019;63(2):205-18 doi: 10.3233/WOR-192922[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 50. Maher AR, Apaydin EA, Raaen L, Motala A, Baxi S, Hempel S. The Use of Technology in the Clinical Care of Anxiety: An Evidence Map. Psychiatr Serv 2021;72(2):195-99 doi: 10.1176/appi.ps.202000178[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 51. Solloway MR, Taylor SL, Shekelle PG, et al. An evidence map of the effect of Tai Chi on health outcomes. Syst Rev 2016;**5**(1):126 doi: 10.1186/s13643-016-0300-y[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 52. Haddaway N, Macura B, Whaley P, Pullin A. ROSES for Systematic Review Protocols. Version 1.0: figshare, 2018.
- 53. De Luca C, Raskovic D, Pacifico V, Thai JC, Korkina L. The search for reliable biomarkers of disease in multiple chemical sensitivity and other environmental intolerances. Int J Environ Res Public Health 2011;**8**(7):2770-97 doi: 10.3390/ijerph8072770[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 54. Das-Munshi J, Rubin GJ, Wessely S. Multiple chemical sensitivities: A systematic review of provocation studies. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2006;118(6):1257-64 doi: 10.1016/j.jaci.2006.07.046[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 55. Viziano A, Micarelli A, Pasquantonio G, Della-Morte D, Alessandrini M. Perspectives on multisensory perception disruption in idiopathic environmental intolerance: a systematic review. Int Arch Occup Environ Health 2018;91(8):923-35 doi: 10.1007/s00420-018-1346-z[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 56. Laura D, Robert P, Mary J. The impact of multiple chemical sensitivity on people's social and occupational functioning; a systematic review of qualitative research studies. Journal of Psychosomatic Research 2020;**132** doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychores.2020.109964[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 57. Romero Pérez P. A First Urological Approach to the Genitourinary Manifestations of Multiple Chemical Sensitivity. Systematic Review. Arch Esp Urol 2022;75(7):584-611 doi: 10.56434/j.arch.esp.urol.20227507.87[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 58. Kurt TL. Multiple chemical sensitivities--a syndrome of pseudotoxicity manifest as exposure perceived symptoms. J Toxicol Clin Toxicol 1995;33(2):101-5 doi:
  - 10.3109/15563659509000457[published Online First: Epub Date]|.

- 59. Sparks PJ. Idiopathic environmental intolerances: overview. Occup Med 2000;15(3):497-510
- 60. Clinical ecology. American College of Physicians. Ann Intern Med 1989;111(2):168-78
- 61. Decker JT, Aarestad D, Elliott W, Lowe C. Chemical sensitivity in the workplace. Journal of Social Work in Disability & Rehabilitation 2002;1(4):45-61
- 62. Mette Toft, Rukayya Nasir Sani, Danijela Gasevic, Ruth McQuillan, Anne Martin. Multiple chemical sensitivity: prevalence, triggers, symptoms, and impact on lifestyle. A systematic review of epidemiological studies. 2018
- 63. Sunita Vohra, Mohammad Karkhaneh, Salima Punja, Susanne King-Jones, Karin Olson. Systematic review of evidence for the effectiveness of mind-body interventions to treat Multiple Chemical Sensitivity (MCS). 2017
- 64. Guidelines International Network. Welcome to Guidelines International Network. Secondary Welcome to Guidelines International Network. <u>https://g-i-n.net/</u>.
- 65. ECRI. ECRI Guidelines Trust. Secondary ECRI Guidelines Trust. https://www.ecri.org/solutions/ecri-guidelines-trust.
- 66. U.S. National Library of Medicine. ClinicalTrials Homepage. Secondary ClinicalTrials Homepage. <u>https://clinicaltrials.gov/</u>.
- 67. World Health Organization. International Clinical Trials Registry Platform. Secondary International Clinical Trials Registry Platform. <u>https://trialsearch.who.int/</u>.
- 68. Fedak KM, Bernal A, Capshaw ZA, Gross S. Applying the Bradford Hill criteria in the 21st century: how data integration has changed causal inference in molecular epidemiology. Emerg Themes Epidemiol 2015;12:14 doi: 10.1186/s12982-015-0037-4[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 69. Hill AB. The Environment and Disease: Association or Causation? Proc R Soc Med 1965;**58**:295-300
- 70. Howick J, Glasziou P, Aronson JK. The evolution of evidence hierarchies: what can Bradford Hill's 'guidelines for causation' contribute? J R Soc Med 2009;102(5):186-94 doi: 10.1258/jrsm.2009.090020[published Online First: Epub Date]].
- 71. Hempel S, Bolshakova M, Turner B, et al. Evidence-Based Quality Improvement: A Scoping Review of the Literature. Journal of General Internal Medicine in press
- 72. Torriani-Pasin C, Demers M, Polese JC, et al. mHealth technologies used to capture walking and arm use behavior in adult stroke survivors: a scoping review beyond measurement properties. Disabil. Rehabil. 2021:1-13 doi: 10.1080/09638288.2021.1953623[published Online First: Epub Date]|.
- 73. United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). ORD Staff Handbook for Developing IRIS Assessments (Public Comment Draft, Nov. 2020). Secondary ORD Staff Handbook for Developing IRIS Assessments (Public Comment Draft, Nov. 2020) 2020. <u>https://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/iris\_drafts/recordisplay.cfm?deid=350086</u>.
- 74. Hempel S, Xenakis L, Danz M. Systematic Reviews for Occupational Safety and Health Questions: Resources for Evidence Synthesis: RAND Corporation, 2016:102.

## Appendix: Search Strategies

Multiple Chemical Sensitivity Scoping Review Protocol

#### PubMed

"multiple chemical sensitivity" [MeSH Terms] OR ("multiple" [Title/Abstract] AND "chemical"[Title/Abstract] AND "sensitivity"[Title/Abstract]) OR "multiple chemical sensitivity"[Title/Abstract] OR ("multiple"[Title/Abstract] AND "chemical"[Title/Abstract] AND "sensitivities" [Title/Abstract]) OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" [Title/Abstract] OR "MCS syndrome" [Title/Abstract] OR "chemical intolerance" [Title/Abstract] OR "chemically intolerant"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical hypersensitivity"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical AIDS"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical sensitivity disorder"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes"[Title/Abstract] OR "chemophobia"[Title/Abstract] OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" [Title/Abstract] OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals"[Title/Abstract] OR ("chemical"[Title/Abstract] AND "environmental illness"[Title/Abstract]) OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses"[Title/Abstract] OR "total allergy syndrome" [Title/Abstract] OR "twentieth century disease" [Title/Abstract] OR "20th century disease" [Title/Abstract] OR "building-related illness" [Title/Abstract] OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" [Title/Abstract] OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance"[Title/Abstract] OR "mast cell activation syndrome"[Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" [Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances"[Title/Abstract] OR "idiopathic environmental illness"[Title/Abstract] OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors" [Title/Abstract] Limit: English language

**BMJ** Open

#### **Agricultural & Environmental Science Collection**

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome") OR noft("chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia") OR noft("environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses") OR noft("total allergy syndrome") OR noft("twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness") OR noft("toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance") OR noft("mast cell activation syndrome") OR noft("idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors"))

#### AND

(stype.exact("Scholarly Journals" OR "Other Sources" OR "Reports")

#### AND

la.exact("ENG"))

#### BIOSIS

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" (Topic) or "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" (Topic) or "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to

environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" (Topic) OR "total allergy syndrome" (Topic) OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" (Topic) or "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" (Topic) OR "mast cell activation syndrome" (Topic) OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" (Topic) OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors" (Topic)

AND Article (Document Types)

AND English (Languages)

#### **CINAHL**

TI ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR SU ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically indolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR

Page 27 of 37

#### **BMJ** Open

"chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR AB ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors")

AND

English language

#### **Current Contents**

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR

"chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" (Topic) OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors" (Topic) and

English (Language)

and

Article or Review Article or Correction (Document Types)

#### EMBASE

('multiple chemical sensitivity':ti,ab,kw OR 'multiple chemical sensitivities':ti,ab,kw OR 'mcs syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemically intolerant':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical hypersensitivity':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical aids':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical sensitivity disorder':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemical sensitivity syndromes':ti,ab,kw OR 'chemophobia':ti,ab,kw OR 'environmental chemical odor intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'sensitivity to environmental chemicals':ti,ab,kw OR ('chemical':ti,ab,kw AND 'environmental illness':ti,ab,kw) OR 'chemically induced environmental illnesses':ti,ab,kw OR 'total allergy syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'twentieth century disease':ti,ab,kw OR '20th century disease':ti,ab,kw OR 'building-related illness':ti,ab,kw OR 'toxicant induced loss of tolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'toxicant-induced loss of

N.L.R

tolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'mast cell activation syndrome':ti,ab,kw OR 'idiopathic environmental intolerance':ti,ab,kw OR 'idiopathic environmental intolerances':ti,ab,kw OR 'idiopathic environmental illness':ti,ab,kw OR symptoms associated with environmental factors':ti,ab,kw) AND

english:la

AND

('article'/it OR 'review'/it)

#### **Environment Index**

TI ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR SU ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR "environmental chemical odor

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

> illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" ) OR AB ( "multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors")

AND

English language

#### **Environmental Science**

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental

#### **BMJ** Open

chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors") AND stype.exact("Reports" OR "Working Papers" OR "Scholarly Journals") AND la.exact("English")) AND stype.exact("Reports" OR "Working Papers" OR "Scholarly Journals") And Source Type: Reports, Scholarly Journals, Working Papers

AND

Language: English

#### **Healthcare Administration**

noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic

re-jie

environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors")Limits applied AND

Source type: Reports, Scholarly Journals

AND

Language: English

#### **HERO**

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR OR "building-related illness" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR

Language: English

#### **PsycINFO**

(noft("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome") OR noft("chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR

#### **BMJ** Open

"chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia") OR noft("environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses") OR noft("total allergy syndrome") OR noft("twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness") OR noft("toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance") OR noft("mast cell activation syndrome") OR noft("idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors")) ıls"))

AND

(la.exact("ENG")

AND

stype.exact("Scholarly Journals"))

#### SciFinder

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR

"idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors"

AND

English language

AND

Exclude: Patent, Book, Commentary, Conference, Dissertation, Editorial, Letter

#### **SCOPUS**

(TITLE-ABS-KEY ("multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors")

AND

(LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "ar") OR LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "re"))

AND

(LIMIT-TO (LANGUAGE, "English"))

**BMJ** Open

#### Web of Science

"multiple chemical sensitivity" OR "multiple chemical sensitivities" OR "MCS syndrome" OR "chemical intolerance" OR "chemically intolerant" OR "chemical hypersensitivity" OR "chemical AIDS" OR "chemical sensitivity disorder" OR "chemical sensitivity syndromes" OR "chemophobia" OR "environmental chemical odor intolerance" OR "sensitivity to environmental chemicals" OR ("chemical" AND "environmental illness") OR "chemically induced environmental illnesses" OR "total allergy syndrome" OR "twentieth century disease" OR "20th century disease" OR "building-related illness" OR "toxicant induced loss of tolerance" OR "Toxicant-Induced Loss of Tolerance" OR "mast cell activation syndrome" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerance" OR "idiopathic environmental intolerances" OR "idiopathic environmental illness" OR "symptoms associated with environmental factors" (Topic)

L. C. Z. O. J.

AND

English (Language)

AND

Article or Review Article (Document Types)

#### Checklist item Section and topic Item No ADMINISTRATIVE INFORMATION Title<sup>.</sup> Identify the report as a protocol of a systematic review (p 1) Identification 1a If the protocol is for an update of a previous systematic review, identify as such Update 1b Registration 2 If registered, provide the name of the registry (such as PROSPERO) and registration number (p 7) Authors: Contact 3a Provide name, institutional affiliation, e-mail address of all protocol authors; provide physical mailing address of corresponding author (p 1, system) Describe contributions of protocol authors and identify the guarantor of the review (p 17-18) Contributions 3b If the protocol represents an amendment of a previously completed or published protocol, identify as such and list changes; 4 Amendments otherwise, state plan for documenting important protocol amendments Support: Indicate sources of financial or other support for the review (p 18) Sources 5a Provide name for the review funder and/or sponsor (p 18) 5b Sponsor Describe roles of funder(s), sponsor(s), and/or institution(s), if any, in developing the protocol (p. 18) Role of sponsor or funder 5c **INTRODUCTION** Describe the rationale for the review in the context of what is already known (p 4) Rationale 6 7 Provide an explicit statement of the question(s) the review will address with reference to participants, interventions, Objectives comparators, and outcomes (PICO) (p 7) **METHODS** Eligibility criteria Specify the study characteristics (such as PICO, study design, setting, time frame) and report characteristics (such as years 8 considered, language, publication status) to be used as criteria for eligibility for the review (p 9-12) Describe all intended information sources (such as electronic databases, contact with study authors, trial registers or other Information sources 9 grey literature sources) with planned dates of coverage (p 7-9) Present draft of search strategy to be used for at least one electronic database, including planned limits, such that it could be Search strategy 10 repeated (appendix) Study records: Data management 11a Describe the mechanism(s) that will be used to manage records and data throughout the review (p 12-13)

## PRISMA-P (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic review and Meta-Analysis Protocols) 2015 checklist: recommended items to address in a systematic review protocol\*

 BMJ Open

Selection process	11b	State the process that will be used for selecting studies (such as two independent reviewers) through each phase of the review (that is, screening, eligibility and inclusion in meta-analysis) (p 12)		
Data collection process	11c	Describe planned method of extracting data from reports (such as piloting forms, done independently, in duplicate), any processes for obtaining and confirming data from investigators (p 15)		
Data items	12	List and define all variables for which data will be sought (such as PICO items, funding sources), any pre-planned data assumptions and simplifications (p 13-15)		
Outcomes and prioritization	13	List and define all outcomes for which data will be sought, including prioritization of main and additional outcomes, with rationale (p 13-15)		
Risk of bias in individual studies	14	Describe anticipated methods for assessing risk of bias of individual studies, including whether this will be done at the outcome or study level, or both; state how this information will be used in data synthesis (N/A)		
Data synthesis	15a	Describe criteria under which study data will be quantitatively synthesised (p 16-17)		
	15b	If data are appropriate for quantitative synthesis, describe planned summary measures, methods of handling data and methods of combining data from studies, including any planned exploration of consistency (such as $I^2$ , Kendall's $\tau$ ) (p 16-17)		
	15c	Describe any proposed additional analyses (such as sensitivity or subgroup analyses, meta-regression) (N/A)		
	15d	If quantitative synthesis is not appropriate, describe the type of summary planned (p 16-17)		
Meta-bias(es)	16	Specify any planned assessment of meta-bias(es) (such as publication bias across studies, selective reporting within studies) (N/A)		
Confidence in cumulative evidence	17	Describe how the strength of the body of evidence will be assessed (such as GRADE) (N/A)		

\* It is strongly recommended that this checklist be read in conjunction with the PRISMA-P Explanation and Elaboration (cite when available) for important clarification on

the items. Amendments to a review protocol should be tracked and dated. The copyright for PRISMA-P (including checklist) is held by the PRISMA-P Group and is

distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution Licence 4.0.

From: Shamseer L, Moher D, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, Shekelle P, Stewart L, PRISMA-P Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015: elaboration and explanation. BMJ. 2015 Jan 2;349(jan02 1):g7647.