# Quantitation of the  $O_2$ -Dependent,  $CO_2$ -Reversible Component of the Postillumination  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  Exchange Transient in Tobacco and Maize Leaves

Received for publication January 12, 1987 and in revised form March 25, 1987

RICHARD B. PETERSON

Department of Biochemistry and Genetics, The Connecticut Agricultural Experiment Station, P.O. Box 1106, New Haven, Connecticut 06504

#### ABSTRACT

The postillumination transient of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange and its relation to photorespiration has been examined in leaf discs from tobacco (Nicotiana tabacum) and maize (Zea mays). Studies of the transients observed by infrared gas analysis at 1, 21, and 43%  $O<sub>2</sub>$  in an open system were extended using the nonsteady state model described previously (Peterson and Ferrandino 1984 Plant Physiol 76: 976-978). Cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange equivalents (i.e. nanomoles  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ ) versus time were derived from the analyzer responses of individual transients. In tobacco  $(C_3)$ , subtraction of the time course of cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange under photorespiratory conditions (21 or 43%  $O_2$ ) from that obtained under nonphotorespiratory conditions (1%  $O_2$ ) revealed the presence of an  $O_2$ -dependent and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -reversible component within the first 60 seconds following darkening. This component was absent in maize  $(C_4)$  and at low external  $O_2$ : $CO_2$ ratios (i.e. <100) in tobacco. The size of the component in tobacco increased with net photosynthesis as irradiance was increased and was positively associated with inhibition of net photosynthesis by  $O_2$ . This relatively simple and rapid method of analysis of the transient is introduced to eliminate some uncertainties associated with estimation of photorespiration based on the maximal rate of postillumination  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ evolution. This method also provides a useful and complementary tool for detecting variation in photorespiration.

In spite of lingering controversy regarding the magnitude and detailed biochemical mechanism of photorespiration in  $C_3$ leaves, two key properties of the process are strongly supported by all investigators. These are the  $O<sub>2</sub>$ -dependent nature of photorespiration and the antagonistic effect of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . Each of the various methods for measurement of photorespiration possesses biases that produce divergent quantitative estimates of this process. Nevertheless, all indicate that a higher gas phase concentration ratio of  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  results in a greater proportion of recently fixed carbon being partitioned to the photorespiratory pathway (1, 17). Such observations with intact leaf tissue have been strengthened by the discovery of the bifunctional nature of RuBP' carboxylase-oxygenase (8). In vitro studies clearly indicate that the enzyme will either carboxylate a RuBP to form <sup>2</sup> PGAs or oxygenate a RuBP to form P-glycolate plus PGA. The relative velocities of the two reactions depend on the relative availabilities of  $CO_2$  and  $O_2$  and upon temperature (1, 8). The accurate in vivo estimation of photorespiration is difficult because neither net depletion nor accumulation of any metabolite occurs, therefore no straightforward basis is provided for assay. Also, leaf stomatal and mesophyll diffusive resistances to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $O<sub>2</sub>$  exchange complicate interpretation of photorespiration assays using  ${}^{14}CO_2$ or  ${}^{18}O_2$  (17).

One method frequently employed to estimate photorespiration is the postillumination burst of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  originally described by Decker (3). The phenomenon is commonly interpreted in terms of metabolism of a residual pool of light-generated photorespiratory substrate in a suddenly darkened leaf, and since  $CO_2$ -fixing capacity rapidly disappears upon darkening much of the photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  may diffuse out of the leaf and be detected (3, 7, 16, 17). The method has been criticized, however, since (a) the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolved is being driven by a continuously depleting substrate pool, (b) it contains an unknown contribution from dark respiration, and (c) some  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation capacity must persist after darkening so that an unknown portion of the photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  is refixed. The purpose of this study was to introduce a method of analysis of the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange transient that would circumvent these limitations.

In previous publications (4-6, 11, 12) a numerical simulator was used to estimate the time course of the leaf  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange rate during the postillumination transient. Open flow-through systems employing an IRGA typically exhibit a nonsteady state response to the rapid changes in  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange rate associated with the transient. This study uses the model to compare transients produced under nonphotorespiratory  $(1\% O_2)$  and photorespiratory (21 and 43%  $O_2$ ) conditions when all other conditions are constant. An initial  $O_2$ -dependent and totally  $CO_2$ -reversible component may be isolated and its size (expressed as  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ ) exchange equivalents) determined. The presence of this component is dependent upon photosynthesis and its magnitude is highly correlated with the inhibition of net photosynthesis by  $O_2$ . Estimation of this  $O_2$ -dependent component constitutes a new alternative to other means of analysis of the postillumination transient in the study of photorespiration.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

Plant Material. Nicotiana tabacum var. Havana Seed was grown in a greenhouse in pots containing a soil:perlite (3:1) medium. Leaf samples of Zea mays var. Sweet Sue were collected from field-grown plants just prior to the tasseling stage.

Sample Preparation. Excised leaves were washed and leaf discs prepared as described previously (1 1). A sample consisted of ten discs  $(20.1 \text{ cm}^2, 400 \text{ mg}$  fresh weight, 0.6 mg Chl).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Abbreviations: RuBP, ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate; PGA, 3-phosphoglycerate; IRGA, infrared gas analyzer; NPS, net photosynthetic rate; F, flow rate;  $R_i$ , mean CO<sub>2</sub> exchange rate over time interval i;  $C_1$ , incoming  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ ; AP, assimilatory power; P, cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange.

CO<sub>2</sub> Exchange Measurements. The IRGA open flow-through system described previously (11) was used with the following modifications.

Dry,  $CO_2$ -free flushing gas (1, 21, or 43%  $O_2$  [balance N<sub>2</sub>]) was blended with either 1% or 5%  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (balance air) to provide the desired final  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ . The gas stream was divided with a portion undergoing humidification by passage through a gas washing bottle containing distilled H<sub>2</sub>O. A flowmeter and needle valve in the nonhumidified branch of the gas stream provided control of the RH of the flushing gas when the two streams subsequently reconverged. The dew point of the flushing gas was preset at 11°C as monitored by a Dew Point Hygrometer (EG and G Co. model 880-Cl, Waltham, MA) situated downstream from the Beckman 865 IRGA. The  $[CO_2]$  in the flushing gas,  $C_1(\mu L^{-1})$ , was measured by injection of <sup>a</sup> sample into <sup>a</sup> second IRGA (13). The differential IRGA response  $(\Delta[\mu] CO_2 L^{-1}] mV^{-1})$  was calibrated by controlled injection of  $N_2$  into the gas stream to generate a known  $\Delta$ [CO<sub>2</sub>] between the reference and sample cells. A system of valves permitted convenient bypassing of the assimilation chamber by the gas stream to permit zeroing of the IRGA.

In order to maximize the resolution of the IRGA to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ exchange transients no desiccants or traps were used to remove excess water vapor arising from transpiration by the leaf discs or evaporation of the surrounding water. Thus a water vapor concentration differential ( $\Delta$ [H<sub>2</sub>O]) existed in the flushing gas leaving the chamber (chamber gas) relative to that entering (reference gas). The  $\Delta[H_2O]$  results potentially in overestimation of the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  assimilation rate due to dilution of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (15). The  $\Delta[H<sub>2</sub>O]$ was calculated (as  $\Delta \mu I H_2O L^{-1}$ ), assuming ideal gas behavior, from dew point measurements of the reference and chamber gases and tabular data on dew point-relative humidity and weight per liter of saturated aqueous vapor. A correction,  $C_D(\mu l L^{-1})$  =  $C_1 \times \Delta[H_2O] \times 10^{-6}$ , was calculated and added to the observed  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration of the chamber gas ( $C<sub>obs</sub>$ ) to compensate for the effect of dilution by  $H_2O$  vapor.

Experiments with water only in the chamber revealed that  $C_1$  $-C_{obs} \neq C_D$ . This was judged to be caused by IR absorption by  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  due to overlapping absorption by  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  at wavelengths to which the IRGA is sensitive. In the absence of net CO<sub>2</sub> exchange a second algebraic correction,  $C_A (\mu \text{LO}_2 \text{L}^{-1})$ , for IR absorption by H<sub>2</sub>O was determined such that  $C_A = C_1 - C_{obs}$  $-C_D$ . The IRGA response  $[\Delta(\mu H_2 O L^{-1}) mV^{-1}]$  to IR absorption by a water vapor concentration differential was nearly constant over a range of  $C_1$  of zero to 2400  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> when the reference gas dew point was 11° C. Since the IRGA response to  $\triangle [CO_2]$ expressed as  $\Delta(\mu I CO_2 L^{-1})$ mV<sup>-1</sup> increases with  $C_1$  so too does  $C_A$ . In the presence of net CO<sub>2</sub> exchange  $C_A$  is given by  $[\Delta(\mu)]$  $CO_2$  L<sup>-1</sup>)mV<sup>-1</sup>]  $\times \Delta(\mu l H_2O L^{-1})/[\Delta(\mu l H_2O L^{-1})mV^{-1}]$ . The IR absorption error opposes the dilution error so that the corrected chamber gas  $[CO_2]$  is  $C_{cor} = C_{obs} + C_D - C_A$ . Considering IR absorption alone the ratio of the individual concentration differentials of  $H_2O$  and  $CO_2$  associated with equal IRGA response (*i.e.*  $\Delta H_2O:\Delta CO_2$ ) ranged from 7300 at  $C_1 = 0$  to 440 at  $C_1 =$  $2430 \mu l L^{-1}$ .

The IRGA output (5 V full scale) was recorded by <sup>a</sup> strip chart recorder and a Kaypro II microcomputer. The latter employed a model Q3024 analog-to-digital converter (Quansitronics Corp., Houston, PA). The system was capable of reading and storing a digitized IRGA response (mV) once every 0.146 s. A typical postillumination transient was initiated by recording the IRGA response for 5 s to provide an estimate of the steady state  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ assimilation rate in the light. Immediately following, the light source was extinguished on software command and the IRGA response recorded for 2 to 4 min. Transients were recorded in duplicate, each with at least <sup>5</sup> min of prior illumination under steady state conditions of photosynthesis.

All calculations and statistical analyses were performed with a Kaypro II or 2X microcomputer.

### RESULTS

Test of the Nonsteady-State IRGA Response Model. The measuring system consists of a small leaf chamber connected by narrow inlet tubing to the IRGA measuring cell. The cell is represented as a series of eight interconnected compartments each of equal volume (11). The model simulates the IRGA response to leaf  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange  $R(t)$  over successive time intervals of  $\Delta t = 0.65$  s (12). In the current study a sequential and unbiased approach for estimating  $R(t)$  utilized the observed IRGA response and Equation 7 of Peterson  $(11)$ . The mean CO<sub>2</sub> exchange rate  $R_i (\mu | s^{-1})$  for a 0.65 s interval i was calculated using the integrated and rearranged Equations 7 and 10 of Peterson and Ferrandino (12). Cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange (i.e. nmol  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ ) over  $n$  successive 0.65 s time intervals is

$$
\sum_{i=1}^{n} 0.65 R_{i}.
$$
 (1)

All time courses of cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange described here have been corrected for the effect of the 1.42 <sup>s</sup> delay associated with the tubing connecting the leaf chamber and IRGA measuring cell.

An experiment was devised to test how well the model would predict known fluctuations in  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange. A syringe pump injected  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  at a controlled rate into the empty leaf chamber on command. Figure <sup>1</sup> shows the IRGA response to three sequential pulses of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  of 180, 60, and 30 s duration separated by 120 s intervals during which the pump was off. During the first and second pulses the system attained steady state as noted by the equilibrium response of the IRGA. The precise rate of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ injection could be calculated using the steady state equation  $(R)$  $= F\Delta [CO_2]$ ) and was found to be 18.3 µl CO<sub>2</sub> min<sup>-1</sup>. When the observed IRGA response was analyzed using the IRGA response model, a linear increase in cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange consistent with a constant injection rate was obtained for those intervals when the pump was activated (Fig. 2). The predicted injection of CO2 halted abruptly when the pump was turned off even though the IRGA response (Fig. 1) required about 60 s to return fully to zero. Note also that the calculated total amount of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ introduced during each pulse is proportional to the total time the pump was on and agrees satisfactorily with the amount



FIG. 1. IRGA response to repeated injections by a syringe pump. The open system described in "Materials and Methods" was equilibrated with air containing 407  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> at a flow rate of 0.985 L min<sup>-1</sup>. Arrows indicate when the pump was turned on and off. See text for additional details.



FIG. 2. Time course of cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  injection calculated from the response in Figure 1 using the IRGA response model.



FIG. 3. Top panels: representative IRGA responses to postillumination transients recorded at  $32^{\circ}$ C and three levels of ambient  $O_2$  and two levels of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  with a single sample of tobacco leaf discs  $(20.1 \text{ cm}^2)$ . The flow rate was  $1.0 \,$ L min<sup>-1</sup> and the irradiance during preillumination was 484  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>. At (1) the time scale has been divided by ten. Bottom panels: associated time courses of cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> exchange calculated from the first 65 s of the IRGA responses in the top panels according to Equation 1. Note that the curves have been displaced for clarity. Shown also  $(\leftarrow)$  are minimal estimates of assimilatory power (AP) based on total net  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake in the dark at 1%  $O<sub>2</sub>$  (see Laisk and Kiirats [9] and text). Values for AP were 124 and 88.5 nmol at 232 and 1290  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup>, respectively.

expected from the known rate of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  injection.

Time Course of Cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  Exchange during the Postillumination Transient. Although the IRGA response model adequately predicts cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange versus time (Equation 1), this is not true for the calculated time course of  $R_i$  itself. Due to even slight noise in the IRGA resp course of  $R_i$  quickly becomes extremely erratic and certainly does not reflect the true course of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange in the assimilation chamber. These seemingly contradictory observations are reconciled by the fact that since the noise contribution to the predicted time course of  $R_i$  is random in both magnitude and sign its cumulative effect becomes acceptably small after a few iterations of the model in comparison to the total true net  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ exchange (i.e. Fig. 2).

Figure 3 (lower panels) shows time courses of cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  possible. exchange obtained with tobacco at varying levels of  $O_2$  and  $CO_2$ .

Some residual noise was evident in these curves due to the aforementioned oscillations in  $R_i$ , but the progress of cumulative<br>  $\begin{array}{ccc}\n\vdots & \vdots \\
\vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\
\hline\n\vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\
\vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\
\end{array}$  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange may be readily discerned. The comparatively greater noise at 1290  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> results from the reduced sensitivity of the IRGA at high  $[CO_2]$ . The cumulative  $CO_2$ exchange always rose to a  $(+)$  peak 5 to 20 s following darkening and was associated with completion of net uptake of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  by the leaf sample. Subsequently, net  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  release (-) occurred causing cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> exchange to decline. At low [CO<sub>2</sub>] (232  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup>) increasing  $[O_2]$  dramatically reduced the net quantity of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ fixed in the dark and increased the rate of subsequent decline in cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange. After about 1 min of darkness the rates of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolution tended to converge across the various  $O<sub>2</sub>$ on off  $\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$  levels yet a residual  $O_2$ -dependence was still evident after 4 min  $\frac{1}{520}$  650 of darkness. At high  $[CO_2]$  (1290  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup>) the time course of cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange was qualitatively similar to that observed at low  $[CO_2]$  yet the effect of  $[O_2]$  was not nearly as pronounced. Thus cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange during the first minute of the postillumination transient shows a  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -reversible dependence upon  $O_2$  consistent with the properties of photores-

<sup>50</sup> Perspective on Effect of  $O_2$  on Postillumination Transient. The  $\begin{bmatrix} \cos_2 \end{bmatrix}$  1280, M is 1200, Widely accepted explanation for the effect of O<sub>2</sub> on the transient <sup>20</sup> (neglecting dark respiration for a moment) involves production <sup>10</sup> of CO<sub>2</sub> during metabolism of residual photorespiratory substrate(s) immediately following darkening. Under such circum-  $\frac{1}{2}$ <sup>-10</sup> stances refixation of photorespiratory CO<sub>2</sub> declines and thus the CO2 released may escape the leaf and be detected. This simple concept neglects, however, the finite pool of assimilatory power (9) composed primarily of RuBP which continues to consume  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $O<sub>2</sub>$  in the dark until the AP is exhausted. For instance, the observation of a pronounced 'burst' of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  release following darkening indicates that under such conditions the total quantity of photorespiratory CO<sub>2</sub> produced exceeds the amount of AP available for its refixation. When the quantity of photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  produced is similar to or less than the amount of AP available for refixation, a distinct 'burst' of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  may not be <sup>200</sup> observed and photorespiration would be seriously underesti-TIME (sec) mated. Nevertheless, even a low rate of photorespiration will affect the time course of the transient insofar as it diminishes net uptake of atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  by competing for the available RuBP through the processes of oxygenation and refixation of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . Thus, at the moment of darkening, a leaf sample possesses (a) a pool of potentially 'CO<sub>2</sub>-fixing' equivalents (*i.e.* AP) which overlaps partially with (b) a pool of 'photorespiratory' equivalents representing  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to be released from the photorespiratory substrate(s) plus that proportion of the total RuBP pool which will be oxygenated by RuBP carboxylase-oxygenase. The observed total net quantity (nmol) of  $CO_2$  exchanged (or cumulative  $CO_2$  exchange, see above) at the end of the postillumination transient is the difference between the magnitudes of these two quantities. This concept assumes nothing about the time course of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ exchange and does not distinguish photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  which escapes the leaf from photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  which is refixed by RuBP or from RuBP equivalents which are oxygenated.

> The occurrence during the transient of mitochondrial dark respiration which is supplied by a distinct and essentially infinite substrate pool represents a third, and time-dependent, component of cumulative postillumination  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange but does not alter significantly the overall concept described. The  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  released by dark respiration should merge with the photorespiratory  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ flux and similarly undergo refixation or escape from the leaf. If independent estimates of the contributions of dark respiration and AP to cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange were available, direct measurement of the photorespiratory equivalent pool would be

**Estimation of the Photorespiratory Equivalent Pool.** Two use-

ful conjectures are advanced to construct a practical basis for performing the stated objective. These are, when all other conditions are constant, (a) dark respiration is unaffected by increasing the  $[O_2]$  above 1%, and (b) any effect of increasing the  $[O_2]$ above 1% on the steady state AP pool is mediated by RuBP carboxylase-oxygenase. Thus, the difference in cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ exchange between transients recorded at  $1\%$  O<sub>2</sub> (no photorespiration) and high  $[O_2]$  would be associated with decarboxylation of photorespiratory substrate(s), oxygenation of RuBP, and any  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -reversible effect of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  on AP. The significance and validity of the above assumptions will be discussed later within the context of effects of varying environmental conditions and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ fixation pathway ( $C_3$  versus  $C_4$ ) on estimates of  $O_2$ -dependent cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange.

The  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchange transients were recorded at 1%  $O<sub>2</sub>$  and at 21 and 43%  $O<sub>2</sub>$  under otherwise identical conditions of irradiance, temperature, and ambient  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$  with the same or replicate samples of leaf discs. The IRGA response model and Equation 1 were used to calculate the difference (nmol) in cumulative  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ exchange for the two transients using  $P = \sum [R_i(1\% O_2) - R_i(k\%$  $[O_2]$ .  $\Delta t$  where  $\Sigma R_1(1\% O_2)$ .  $\Delta t$  and  $\Sigma R_1(k\% O_2)$ .  $\Delta t$  are estimates of cumulative  $CO_2$  exchange at 1%  $O_2$  and a specified higher  $O_2$ concentration k, respectively, and  $\Delta t = 0.65$  s.

Representative time courses of P at 21%  $O_2$  and 43%  $O_2$  for tobacco at four levels of  $[CO_2]$  and for maize at these  $O_2$ concentrations and 340  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> are shown in Figure 4. The results with tobacco indicate the time course of P has an initial rapidly increasing  $O_2$ -dependent component which was usually complete within 30 <sup>s</sup> followed by a linear slow phase. The initial rapid phase became less evident as the  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$  was increased with tobacco and was greatly suppressed in maize. The quantity of



FIG. 4. Typical time courses obtained for  $P$  (see text) for two samples consisting of 10 leaf discs (20.1 cm<sup>2</sup>) from tobacco (A–D) and for a single sample from maize (E). The results with tobacco were acquired from two leaf samples over two consecutive days; the data in panels (A) and (C) were from the first day and the data in panels (B) and (D) from the second day. The ambient  $CO_2$  concentrations ( $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup>) were (A) 221; (B) 540; (C) 1268; (D) 2249; and (E) 343. The irradiance was 484  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>.  $s^{-1}$  in the experiments with tobacco and 692  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> $\cdot$ s<sup>-1</sup> for maize. The temperature was 32°C. The solid lines are linear regression fits of the slow phase and are employed to estimate the total  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exchanged during the rapid phases (*i.e.*  $P_f$ = Y-intercept values [nmol] in parentheses).

 $CO<sub>2</sub>$  contained in the rapid phase was estimated by linear extrapolation to time zero  $(P<sub>d</sub>)$ . The slope of the slow phase sometimes increased with  $[O_2]$  in tobacco (Fig. 4). Also, there was occasionally a lag between completion of the rapid phase and onset of the slow phase (Fig. 4C). The characteristics of the lag were not associated with any particular set of environmental conditions but varied among leaf samples. A similar prominent lag was noted for maize at  $21\%$  O<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 4E). The initial rapid phase was consistently observed among samples of tobacco and its relative magnitude appeared to diminish with increasing  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ . Thus particular attention was focused on  $P_f$ .

The results in Table <sup>I</sup> compare photosynthetic properties of tobacco at 21% and 43%  $O_2$  over a wide range of  $[CO_2]$ . At both levels of  $O_2$ , NPS increased up to 1273  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> but decreased somewhat at 2252  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup>. Inhibition of NPS by O<sub>2</sub> profoundly decreased over this range of  $[CO_2]$ . The estimated  $\hat{P}_f$  decreased markedly with increasing  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ . Other results presented here (see next section) suggested that NPS exerts an independent effect on  $P_f$ . Thus, values of  $P_f$  were normalized to their corresponding NPS values before examining further the effects of  $O<sub>2</sub>$ and CO2. When results were combined from several experiments and values of  $P_f/NPS$  were plotted against their associated  $O<sub>2</sub>:CO<sub>2</sub>$  ratios, the points fell along an exponential function (Fig. 5, top). The line of best fit extrapolated to very near the origin indicating that any detectable effect of  $O_2$  on the early phase of the transient is eliminated at infinite  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ . Shown for comparison are the associated values of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  inhibition normalized to the NPS rate as described in the legend to Figure <sup>5</sup> (bottom).

Effect of Irradiance on  $P_f$ . Table II shows results obtained when irradiance was varied from just above light compensation (89  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>) to saturation (638  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>) and the [CO<sub>2</sub>]

#### Table I. Interactive Effects of  $O_2$  and  $CO_2$  on Net Photosynthesis,  $O_2$ Inhibition, and  $P_f$  in Leaf Discs from Tobacco and Maize

The irradiance was 484  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup> in the experiments with tobacco and 692  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup> for maize. The temperature was 32°C. The O<sub>2</sub> 200 inhibition was calculated as (NPS  $[1\% O_2]$  – NPS  $[k\% O_2]$ )/NPS $(1\% O_2)$ where  $k$  is 21 or 43. Each value is a mean obtained from three leaf samples and includes the results of Figure 4 ( $\pm$ SD). Values of NPS (1%)  $O_2$ ) were 4.54  $\pm$  0.65, 7.56  $\pm$  1.14, 8.39  $\pm$  1.36, and 5.86  $\pm$  0.70  $\mu$ mol  $CO_2$  cm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> for tobacco at 226, 544, 1273, and 2252  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. The NPS (1% O<sub>2</sub>) for maize was 8.34  $\pm$  1.96  $\mu$ mol CO<sub>2</sub>  $cm^{-2} \cdot h^{-1}$ . Details of experimental procedures are in "Materials and Methods." See text for method of estimation of  $P_f$ .



 $\mu$ mol CO<sub>2</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>.  $\frac{6}{3}$ %. Cnmol cm<sup>-2</sup>.



FIG. 5. (Top) Relationship of  $P_0/NPS$  with ambient  $O_2/CO_2$  for tobacco and maize. The points shown represent means of triplicate determinations (±SD) and were collected from experiments described herein (Tables <sup>I</sup> and II). Results from several additional experiments not included in the Tables are presented also (100-340  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup>). All experiments with tobacco were performed at 490 to 640  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup> and 30° to 32°C. The experiments with tobacco performed at 21%  $O_2$  (O) are distinguished from those performed at  $43\%$  ( $\bullet$ ). Shown also are results observed with leaf discs from maize (irradiance = 692  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>, 32°C) under 21% and 43%  $O_2$  and 343  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> (\*). The solid line is an exponential function relating the two variables for tobacco according to  $y = me^{ax} + b$ , where  $b = -6.53 \times 10^{-2}$ ,  $m = 5.65 \times 10^{-2}$ ,  $a = 1.40 \times 10^{-2}$  $10^{-3}$ , and the correlation coefficient = 0.985 (P < 0.001). (Bottom) Associated  $O_2$  inhibition values for tobacco calculated as (NPS [1%  $O_2$ ]  $-$  NPS  $[k\% O_2]$ )/NPS( $k\% O_2$ ), where k is 21 or 43, for comparison with the data in the upper half of the figure. Solid line is the linear regression fit to the data  $(y = mx + b)$  where  $m = 0.138$ ,  $b = -20.15$  and the correlation coefficient =  $0.939$  (P <  $0.001$ ).

## Table II. Effects of Irradiance on Net Photosynthesis,  $O_2$  Inhibition, and  $P_f$  in Leaf Discs of Tobacco

The external  $[CO_2]$  was 340  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup> and the temperature was 32°C. Values of NPS (1% O<sub>2</sub>) were  $6.67 \pm 0.21$ ,  $5.61 \pm 0.22$ ,  $3.42 \pm 0.07$ , and  $1.86 \pm 0.06$  µmol CO<sub>2</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup>·h<sup>-1</sup> at 638, 307, 151, and 89 µE m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. Each value is a mean obtained from three leaf samples (±  $SD$ ). The  $O<sub>2</sub>$  inhibition values are calculated as described in Table I.



 $\mu$  mol CO<sub>2</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>. b %. cnmol cm<sup>-2</sup>.

was maintained at a constant 340  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup>. The percent inhibition of NPS by either 21 or 43%  $O<sub>2</sub>$  increased somewhat as the irradiance decreased. Of special interest, the values of  $P_f$  increased with irradiance at constant external  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  suggesting that this quantity is associated with one or more products of photosynthesis.

### DISCUSSION

The reproducible  $O_2$ -dependent,  $CO_2$ -reversible component of cumulative  $CO_2$  exchange  $(P_f)$  observed during the early phase of the postillumination transient is assumed to be generated from a combination of (a) decarboxylation of residual photorespiratory substrate(s), (b) oxygenation of a portion of the remaining RuBP, and (c) any effect of photorespiration on the size of the AP pool during steady state photosynthesis. Together these three elements comprise the 'photorespiratory equivalent pool.'

Since the AP pool figures prominently in the estimation of the photorespiratory equivalent pool consideration will be given first to its characteristics and response to  $[O_2]$ . Laisk *et al.* (9) concluded that this capacity for  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake in the dark was largely composed of RuBP based on similar absolute magnitudes and dependencies on  $[O_2]$  and  $[CO_2]$ . In the present study, minimal estimates of the AP pool in tobacco leaf discs could be obtained at  $1\%$  O<sub>2</sub> from the  $(+)$  maximum in postillumination cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> exchange (Fig. 3). At 32°C and 484  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>.s<sup>-1</sup>, mean values  $(\pm s_D)$  of 6.5  $\pm$  0.2, 4.0  $\pm$  0.5, 4.7  $\pm$  0.6, and 2.6  $\pm$  1.2 nmol CO<sub>2</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup> were observed at 220, 536, 1264, and 2249  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> respectively  $(N = 3)$ . My values are comparable to the RuBP concentration of  $C_3$  leaves as published elsewhere especially when expressed on a Chl basis (2, 9, 10) and also agree with these earlier results since increasing  $[CO_2]$  lowers the RuBP level. My results are consistent with the assumption that the capacity for postillumination  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake and the RuBP pool are equivalent. Direct estimation of assimilatory power at elevated  $[O_2]$  was not possible with the apparatus described here.

Badger et al. (2) reported that  $21\%$  O<sub>2</sub> lowers the level of RuBP in bean and sunflower leaves by 50% relative to  $2\%$  O<sub>2</sub> (see also Ref. 9). Perchorowicz and Jensen  $(10)$  found no effect of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  on the RuBP level at 350 and 1400  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> in wheat seedlings. At 100  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup>, however, 21% O<sub>2</sub> lowered the RuBP level by about  $60\%$  relative to  $1.1\%$  O<sub>2</sub>. Lack of more extensive and systematic information regarding the mediating effects of  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ , irradiance, species, and sample history make generalization difficult regarding the effect of  $O_2$  on the RuBP concentration. This subject is relevant to the present study because if elevated  $[O_2]$ lowered the RuBP content, this would likely result in <sup>a</sup> commensurate increase in the measured  $P_f$ . A probable cause for a lower RuBP level at high  $[O_2]$  is the depleting effect of the RuBP oxygenase activity on the RuBP pool (2). As all three elements that make up the  $P_f$ depend on the interaction of RuBP carboxylase-oxygenase with  $O_2$ , all should be reversible with  $CO_2$ . Figure 5 shows that the effect of  $O_2$  on  $P_f$  (and, thus, including effects of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  on the RuBP level) disappears as  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations reach levels high enough to suppress RuBP oxygenase activity (8). The results with maize (Fig. 5, Table I) reinforce this interpretation overall since little or no  $P_f$  was detectable in this  $C_4$  species which does not photorespire significantly (16).

The origin of the  $O_2$ -dependent  $CO_2$  release during the 'slow' phase of the time course of  $P$  (Fig. 4) is less certain. This process may simply represent an  $O_2$ -dependent dark respiration above  $1\%$  O<sub>2</sub>. Alternatively, it may be associated with utilization of photorespiratory intermediates, such as glycerate, by mitochondrial dark respiration. The linear extrapolation to time zero (Fig. 4) should remove, however, any contribution of this phase of the transient to  $P_f$ .

A possible source of error in estimation of  $P_f$  concerns the solubility of CO<sub>2</sub> in water ( $\alpha_{\text{CO}_2} = 0.66$  at 30°C; see Umbreit [14]). During measurement of the transient the chamber  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ rises as NPS falls to zero and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolution proceeds. Thus, some  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  will dissolve in the unbuffered  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  present in the chamber as the aqueous phase equilibrates with the gas phase, thereby falsely resembling  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake by the leaf tissue. A representative example employing conditions of, and NPS values interpolated from, Table <sup>I</sup> shows that this error has a minor effect on the estimate of  $P_f$ . With the chamber  $[CO_2]$  initially at 340  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup> at high irradiance and  $F = 1.0$  L min<sup>-1</sup> the final [CO<sub>2</sub>] rises to approximately 400  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub> L<sup>-1</sup> at 1% O<sub>2</sub> and approximately 380  $\mu$ l L<sup>-1</sup> at 21% O<sub>2</sub>. Thus, about 0.40 and 0.27  $\mu$ l CO<sub>2</sub>, respectively, will dissolve in the 10 ml aqueous phase subsequent to darkening of the chamber. The difference,  $0.13 \mu$ l (0.25 nmol  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  cm<sup>-2</sup> leaf area), could add to  $P<sub>f</sub>$  to the extent of about 4%. Since this is a maximal estimate and assumes instantaneous equilibration of gaseous and aqueous phases, the influence of this effect on estimates of  $P_f$  may be safely neglected.

My previous studies of the postillumination transient have been concerned with estimation of the peak rate of net postillumination  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolution occurring 6 to 10 s after darkening as a measure of photorespiration (4-6, 11, 12). The method used a reiterative computerized fitting routine to maximize agreement between predicted and observed IRGA responses. The current analysis, while not capable of yielding an estimate of the absolute rate of photorespiration, provides complementary information and requires much less time for processing the experimental data. Since no arbitrarily chosen rate function is imposed upon  $R(t)$ , the opportunity for introduction of bias is reduced. Earlier reports (4, 5, 12) have also described a strong dependence of the peak rate of postillumination  $CO_2$  evolution on the  $O_2:CO_2$  ratio so that the latter and  $P_f$  are directly associated and reflect different aspects of the same process.

The size of the photorespiratory equivalent pool  $(P_i)$  is positively associated with inhibition of NPS by  $O<sub>2</sub>$  (Table I, Fig. 5). Interestingly,  $21\%$  O<sub>2</sub> was generally somewhat less inhibitory to NPS than was 43% when the external  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  ratio was constant (Fig. 5, bottom). This could reflect differences between the external  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  ratio and that which occurred at the site of  $CO_2$ fixation in the chloroplast. The apparatus employed in these studies did not allow measurement of leaf internal  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$ . Nevertheless, the response of  $P_1/NPS$  to the  $O_2:C_2$  ratio was independent of the external  $[O_2]$  (Fig. 5, top). Studies of the kinetics of RuBP carboxylase-oxygenase in vitro indicate that the partitioning of carbon to P-glycolate is controlled by the  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  ratio at the enzyme active site (8). While not providing a comprehensive test of the validity of this enzyme mechanism in accounting for the regulation of photorespiration in vivo, the results of Figure 5 (top) are consistent with the aforementioned key property of RuBP carboxylase-oxygenase assuming that the chloroplast  $O<sub>2</sub>:CO<sub>2</sub>$  ratio is proportional to the atmospheric ratio. Thus, the nonreciprocal effects of  $[O_2]$  and  $[CO_2]$  on  $O_2$  inhibition of NPS may be associated with other direct or indirect effects of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  on photosynthesis besides promotion of photorespiration.

Release of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  from photorespiratory intermediates, oxygen-

ation of RuBP in the dark, and RuBP oxygenase-mediated regulation of the RuBP pool size in the light would all have additive effects on the measured value of  $P_f$ . Varieties which partition less carbon to the glycolate pathway because of reduced RuBP oxygenase activity and/or convert a smaller proportion of glycolate carbon to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (4–6) should show a lower  $P<sub>f</sub>$ NPS. The strong effect of the  $O_2$ : $CO_2$  ratio on this quantity (Fig. 5) tends to support this contention. One strategy in efforts to improve crop yields by manipulation of photosynthesis is to identify genetic differences in photorespiratory capacity among existing  $C_3$  varieties or in mutants derived from plant cell culture (18). Estimation of the photorespiratory equivalent pool could prove useful in this search.

Acknowledgments-The author wishes to thank F. J. Ferrandino, K. R. Hanson, and I. Zelitch for helpful discussions and E. Hennessey for technical assistance.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- 1. ARTUS NN, SC SOMERVILLE, CR SOMERVILLE <sup>1986</sup> The biochemistry and cell biology of photorespiration. CRC Crit Rev Plant Sci 4: 121-147
- 2. BADGER MR, TD SHARKEY, <sup>S</sup> VON CAEMMERER <sup>1984</sup> The relationship between steady-state gas exchange of bean leaves and the levels of carbon-reductioncycle intermediates. Planta 160: 305-313
- 3. DECKER JP <sup>1955</sup> A rapid, postillumination deceleration of respiration in green leaves. Plant Physiol 30: 82-84
- 4. HANSON KR, RB PETERSON 1985 The stoichiometry of photorespiration during  $C_3$ -photosynthesis is not fixed: evidence from combined physical and stereochemical methods. Arch Biochem Biophys 237: 300-313
- 5. HANSON KR, RB PETERSON <sup>1986</sup> Regulation of photorespiration in leaves: Evidence that the fraction of ribulose bisphosphate oxygenated is conserved and stoichiometry fluctuates. Arch Biochem Biophys 246: 332-346
- 6. HANSON KR, RB PETERSON <sup>1987</sup> Photorespiration stoichiometry in leaves estimated by combined physical and stereochemical methods: Allowance for isomerase-catalyzed 3H losses in ribulose bisphosphate regeneration. Arch Biochem Biophys 252: 591-605
- 7. HEICHEL GH <sup>1971</sup> Response of respiration of tobacco leaves in light and darkness and the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation concentration to prior illumination and oxygen. Plant Physiol 48: 178-182
- 8. LAING WA, WL OGREN, RH HAGEMAN <sup>1974</sup> Regulation of soybean net photosynthetic  $CO_2$  fixation by the interaction of  $CO_2$ ,  $O_2$ , and ribulose 1,5-
- diphosphate carboxylase. Plant Physiol 54: 678–685<br>9. LAISK A, O KIIRATS, V OJA 1984 Assimilatory power (postillumination CO<sub>2</sub> uptake) in leaves. Plant Physiol 76: 723-729
- 10. PERCHOROWICZ JT, RG JENSEN <sup>1983</sup> Photosynthesis and activation of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase in wheat seedlings. Plant Physiol 71: 955-960
- 11. PETERSON RB 1983 Estimation of photorespiration based on the initial rate of postillumination CO<sub>2</sub> release. I. A nonsteady state model for measurement of CO<sub>2</sub> exchange transients. Plant Physiol 73: 978–982
- 12. PETERSON RB, FJ FERRANDINO 1984 A numerical approach to measurement of CO2 exchange transients by infrared gas analysis. Plant Physiol 76: 976- 978
- 13. PETERSON RB, I ZELITCH 1982 Relationship between net CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation and dry weight accumulation in field-grown tobacco. Plant Physiol 70: 677-685
- 14. UMBREIT WW <sup>1972</sup> Carbon dioxide and bicarbonate. In WW Umbreit, RH Burris, JF Stauffer, eds, Manometric and Biochemical Techniques, Ed. 5. Burgess, Minneapolis, pp 20-29
- 15. VON CAEMMERER S, GD FARQUHAR <sup>1981</sup> Some relationships between the biochemistry of photosynthesis and the gas exchange of leaves. Planta 153: 376-387
- 16. ZELITCH <sup>I</sup> 1971 Photosynthesis, Photorespiration, and Plant Productivity. Academic Press, New York
- 17. ZELITCH I 1979 Photorespiration: studies with whole tissues. In M Gibbs, E Latzko, eds, Photosynthesis II, Photosynthetic Carbon Metabolism and Related Processes. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, pp 353-367
- 18. ZELITCH 1 1982 The close relationship between net photosynthesis and crop yield. BioScience 32: 796-802