

BMJ Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (<u>http://bmjopen.bmj.com</u>).

If you have any questions on BMJ Open's open peer review process please email <u>info.bmjopen@bmj.com</u>

# **BMJ Open**

#### Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Cost of Chronic Diseases Treatment and Care at Public Hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia: Hospital Based Cross-Sectional Study

Journal:	BMJ Open	
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2022-070195	
Article Type:	Original research	
Date Submitted by the Author:	16-Nov-2022	
Complete List of Authors:	Terefa, Dufera; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Edosa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Tolessa, Belachew; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences Ewunetu, Adisu ; Wallaga University, Public Health Olani, Wolkite ; Wallaga University, Public Health Fetensa, Getahun; Wallaga University, Department of Nursing Chego, Melese ; Wallaga University, Public Health Abdisa, Eba ; Wallaga University, School of Nursing Turi, Ebisa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Bekuma, Tariku Tesfaye; Wallaga University, Department of Public health Getachew, Motuma; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Lensa ; Wallaga University, School of Medicine	
Keywords:	EPIDEMIOLOGY, Health economics < HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT, Health policy < HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT	

# SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

reliez oni

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Page 2 of 26

2		
3 4	1	Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Cost of Chronic Diseases Treatment and
5 6	2	Care at Public Hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia:
7 8	3	Hospital Based Cross-Sectional Study
9 10 11	4	Dufera Rikitu Terefa <sup>1</sup> , Edosa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Belachew Etana <sup>1</sup> , Adisu Ewunetu <sup>1</sup> , Wolkite
12	5	Olani <sup>1</sup> , Getahun Fetensa <sup>2</sup> , Melese Chego <sup>1</sup> , Eba Abdisa <sup>2</sup> , Ebisa Turi <sup>1</sup> , Tariku
13 14	6	Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Motuma Getachew <sup>1</sup> , Lensa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Temesgen Tilahun <sup>3</sup>
15 16	7	<sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University,
17	8	Nekemte, Ethiopia
18 19 20	9	<sup>2</sup> School of Nursing, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
21 22	10	Ethiopia
23 24	11	<sup>3</sup> School of Medicine, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
25 26	12	Ethiopia
27	13	Co-author contact details:
28 29	14	Edosa Tesfaye, E-mail: edosatesfaye2019@yahoo.com
30 31 32	15	Belachew Etana, E-mail:ba.etana@gmail.com
33 34	16	Adisu Ewunetu, E-mail:adisuewunetu2019@gmail.com
35 36	17	Wolkite Olani, E-mail: walkiteolani2020@gmail.com
37 38	18	Getahun Fetensa, E-mail: fetensagetahun@gmail.com
39 40	19	Melese Chego, E-mail: melese_chego@yahoo.com
41 42 43	20	Eba Abdisa, E-mail: ebaabdisa@rocketmail.com
44 45	21	Ebisa Turi, E-mail: ebakoturi@gmail.com
46 47 48	22	Tariku Tesfaye, E-mail: tarii2007@gmail.com
40 49	23	Motuma Getachew, E-mail: motyamo@gmail.com
50 51 52	24	Lensa Tesfaye, E-mail: lenlove539@gmail.com
53	25	Temesgen Tilahun, E-mail: ttamuko@yahoo.com
54 55	26	Corresponding author contact details:
56 57	27	Full name: Dufera Rikitu Terefa
58	28	P.O.Box=395, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia.
59 60	29	Tel. (+251)-922260706

Care at Public Hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia:
Hospital Based Cross-Sectional Study
Dufera Rikitu Terefa <sup>1</sup> , Edosa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Belachew Etana <sup>1</sup> , Adisu Ewunetu <sup>1</sup> , Wolkite Olani <sup>1</sup> , Getahun Fetensa <sup>2</sup> , Melese Chego <sup>1</sup> , Eba Abdisa <sup>2</sup> ,Ebisa Turi <sup>1</sup> , Tariku Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Motuma Getachew <sup>1</sup> , Lensa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Temesgen Tilahun <sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia
<sup>2</sup> School of Nursing, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia
<sup>3</sup> School of Medicine, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia Co-author contact details:
Edosa Tesfaye, E-mail: edosatesfaye2019@yahoo.com
Belachew Etana, E-mail:ba.etana@gmail.com
Adisu Ewunetu, E-mail:adisuewunetu2019@gmail.com
Wolkite Olani, E-mail: walkiteolani2020@gmail.com
Getahun Fetensa, E-mail: fetensagetahun@gmail.com
Melese Chego, E-mail: melese_chego@yahoo.com
Eba Abdisa, E-mail: ebaabdisa@rocketmail.com
Ebisa Turi, E-mail: ebakoturi@gmail.com
Tariku Tesfaye, E-mail: tarii2007@gmail.com
Motuma Getachew, E-mail: motyamo@gmail.com Lensa Tesfaye, E-mail: lenlove539@gmail.com
Temesgen Tilahun, E-mail: ttamuko@yahoo.com Corresponding author contact details: Full name: Dufera Rikitu Terefa

**BMJ** Open

30 E-mail:duferarikitu24@gmail.com

31 Abstract

32 Objective: Aimed to determine the impact of COVID-19 pandemic on cost of chronic
33 diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional
34 State, Ethiopia, from August 01 to 31, 2020.

Methods: An institutional based cross-sectional study design was used and the
sample size for the study (n = 642) was determined using a single population mean
formula. Data was collected using interviews and analyzed using SPSS version 25.
Descriptive statistics were performed and the cost of follow-up care before and after
the pandemic was compared using a Related-samples Wilcoxon signed-rank test,
declaring the level of significance of the median cost difference at P<0.05.</li>

**Results:** A total of 642 patients were included in the study, among whom 605 (94.2%) 42 of them responded to the interviews. There was a significant median cost difference (n 43 = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of chronic diseases among follow-up 44 patients during the pandemic compared to the costs incurred by these patients before 45 the pandemic.

46 Conclusion: The cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the 47 COVID-19 pandemic was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era. 48 Therefore, healthcare providers should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for 49 chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the 50 services at proximal health facilities.

51 Keywords: COVID-19 Pandemic, Chronic Disease, Cost of Illness, Follow up Care,
52 Ethiopia

# 53 Background

Globally, chronic diseases (CDs) are major public health problems that account for
60% of all deaths and are the cause of 35% of deaths in low and 40% of deaths
occurring in middle income countries.<sup>1-3</sup> Many low- and middle-income countries
(LMICs) are undergoing a gradual epidemiologic transition as the disease burden shifts
from infectious to non-communicable diseases.<sup>4-6</sup>

Healthcare systems in LMICs are mostly unprepared to handle the increasing burden of non-communicable diseases (NCDs), resulting in no or limited access to affordable prevention and diagnosis of NCDs.<sup>7</sup> These add up to higher NCD treatment costs, the financing of which mostly comes from households' out-of-pocket (OOP) spending .8 COVID-19 originated first in China, in Wuhan, Hubei province, in late December 2019, as a health crisis that struck the global community, causing dismal repercussions. SARS-CoV-2 has spread fast all over the world to involve over 200 countries, making it a pandemic. The World Health Organization (WHO) notified COVID-19 as a pandemic on March 12, 2020. 9, 10 

The COVID-19 pandemic disrupts entire societies, including the routine health care systems. The comprehensive effort to contain the pandemic and minimize the subsequent morbidity and mortality has affected both the continuity and quality of care for patients with CDs.<sup>11</sup>

During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19
control and prevention. This resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care
for patients with CDs. Diabetes, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, hypertension,
heart disease, asthma, cancer, and depression were the conditions reported to be
most impacted by the reduction in healthcare resources due to the pandemic.<sup>12</sup>

**BMJ** Open

Resources at all levels have shifted away from CDs management and prevention
during the outbreak, and the lock-down of many services has translated into reduced
access, a decrease in referrals, and reduced hospitalizations of patients with nonCOVID-19 pathology.<sup>13</sup>

As the pandemic continues to rapidly spread, our attention often focuses on the numbers of confirmed and probable cases, hospitalizations, and deaths, which can be called the "direct" effects of the pandemic. However, these numbers do not capture the full extent of the pandemic because it has also generated important spillover (indirect) effects by decreasing the supply of and altering patient demand for non-COVID-19related medical care. <sup>14</sup>

A lock-down, self-isolation, and social distancing are some of the measures taken by governments of different countries aimed at decelerating the pandemic spread. The pandemic influenced everyone around the globe, but it can cause more concerns for people living with chronic illnesses .<sup>15</sup>

Ethiopia had the first COVID-19 positive case confirmed on March 13th, 2020.<sup>16</sup> At this time, the government declared a state of emergency, labeling the pandemic as a national threat and launching overall preventive measures, including advising the community to stay at home, practicing strict and frequent hand washing, and wearing a face mask. The government also restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid temporary restrictions on market places, restaurants, shops, cinema houses, religious, and cities.<sup>17</sup> During this time, the number of hospital visits dropped sharply to utilize health services, including CD follow-up. <sup>18</sup> 

Many studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision
and utilization. But none of them reported the impact of the pandemic on illness costs
of chronic disease follow-up care from a patient perspective. So, the study aimed to

determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of follow-up care amongchronic disease patients at public hospitals.

#### 104 Methods and Materials

#### 105 Study Setting

This study was conducted from August 01 to 31, 2020 in East Wallaga, West
Wallaga, and Horro Guduru Wallaga zones of Oromia National Regional State,
Ethiopia.

<sup>19</sup> 109 Study Design and Costing Method

A cross-sectional institutional-based study design was used. The bottom-up costing approach was used. To analyze the cost of the treatment during the follow-up visit with respect to patient perspective and the indirect costs(income lost due to productive time lost) that were estimated using earnings lost.<sup>19</sup>

The time foregone and productive time lost were converted into indirect costs based on the daily wage rate and then multiplied by the number of working days lost. The daily wage rate for patients was estimated by dividing their monthly income by 30 days for both patients and caregivers.<sup>19</sup>

All costs included in the analysis were measured in terms of Ethiopian Birr (ETB) and were converted to US\$(US dollar) during the analysis, and the average currency exchange rate was (August 2020; US\$ = 35.99 ETB).

7 121 Study Participants

All chronic disease patients who visited public hospitals in the Wallaga Zones were
 All chronic disease patients who visited public hospitals in the Wallaga Zones were
 the source population, and all patients who visited the three Wallaga Zones' selected
 study hospitals during the study period were the study population.

Page 7 of 26

1 2

3 4	125	Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria
5 6	126	All patients of the selected CDs in the study area who visited the study hospitals
7 8 9	127	were included in the study. Patients whose age was less than 15 years old and
10 11	128	without accompanying patients who were seriously ill and unable to respond to the
12 13	129	interviews were excluded from the study.
14 15 16	130	Sample Size and Sampling Procedures
17 18	131	The sample size was determined by using the single population mean formula,
19 20	132	applying the following assumptions: two-sided alpha error ( $\epsilon$ ) set at 0.05, 95%
21 22 23	133	confidence level, and mean cost of DM ( $\mu$ ) = 48.99 ETB, and standard deviation
23 24 25	134	(SD)= 30.89 ETB <sup>20</sup> , adding 5% non-response rate.
26 27 28 29	135	Using the formula, $n = \frac{(z - \alpha/2)^{2 * \sigma^2}}{\epsilon^{2\mu^2}}$
29 30 31	136	Among thirteen public hospitals in the study area, data was collected from the
32 33	137	selected CDs of follow-up care patients from Nekemte specialized hospitals, Sire
34 35 26	138	hospital, Gida hospital, Arjo hospital, Shambu hospital, Guduru hospital, Gimbi
30 37 38	139	hospital, and Nedjo hospital.
39 40	140	The determined sample size was allocated to each study hospital proportionally
41 42	141	based on the proportion of each CDS patient who attended follow-up care.Wollega
43 44 45	142	University referral hospital was purposely excluded from the study, which was an
46 47	143	isolation and treatment center for COVID-19 during the study period, and four other
48 49	144	hospitals were excluded due to their low CDS patient flow.
50 51	145	A total of 642 participants were selected by using a systematic sampling method at
52 53 54	146	each study hospital. A simple random sampling technique was employed to select
55 56	147	the first participant from the registration book.
57 58		
60		

2 3 4	148	Data Collection Procedures
5 6	149	The structured questionnaire was developed in English after reviewing relevant
7 8	150	literature, and it was translated into Afan Oromo. Data collection and supervision
9 10 11	151	were carried out by eight data collectors, with four supervisors assigned. These data
12 13	152	collectors and supervisors were trained before the pre-test and actual data collection
14 15	153	started. The questionnaires were pre-tested in Bedele Hospital using 32(5%) of the
16 17 18	154	determined sample size. It was collected by face-to-face interview. Patients who
19 20	155	completed their chronic outpatient services and returned to leave the study hospitals
21 22	156	were interviewed.
23 24 25	157	Study Variables
26 27	158	Socio-demographic and economic characteristics, health service costs
28 29 30	159	(non-medical costs; transportation, food, accommodation, and income
31 32	160	lost, and medical costs; registration, consultation, laboratory, radiology,
33 34 35 36 37	161	and drugs) were assessed and determined.
	162	Operational Definitions
38 39	163	Before COVID-19: The period before March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first
40 41	164	confirmed COVID-19 positive case.
42 43 44	165	Chronic disease follow up patients: A patient visited the study hospital for the
45 46	166	follow-up care of one of; hypertension (HTN), diabetic's mellitus (DM), heart failure
47 48	167	(HF), mental illness, HIV (Human immune virus), stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.
49 50 51	168	Chronic disease: Any of the following illnesses that persist over time, can gradually
52 53	169	progress, do not resolve spontaneously, and may not be cured, like HTN, DM. HF,
54 55 56	170	mental illness, HIV, stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.
57 58 59 60		

Page 9 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

**Direct costs**: The expenditures in ETB spent by chronic disease patients and their families on the diagnosis and treatment of chronic illness per prescription of physicians in the study hospitals.

During COVID-19: The period after March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first
 confirmed COVID-19 positive case.

Indirect costs: the number of productive days lost by patients and their families as a
 result of chronic illness care and treatment.

Medical cost: The cost component of chronic disease patients' follow-up visits at study hospitals that includes registration, laboratory, radiology, and drug costs.

180 Non-medical cost: The cost component that includes transportation, food,
 181 accommodation, and income lost among chronic disease patients during
 182 follow-up visits at study hospitals.

<sup>31</sup> 183 Data Management and Analysis

**Patient and Public Involvement** 

Data was entered in to Epi-data version 3.1 and exported to SPSS version 25 software for analysis. Descriptive statistics and median were performed for all study variables based on their characteristics. Finally, the normality distribution of treatment cost data was checked, and it was not normally distributed. As a result, non-parametric tests were used to analyze the median cost for each cost category, as well as a 2-paired sample Wilcoxon sign rank test to compare the costs incurred before and during the pandemic lock-down, with the level of significance of the median cost difference set at p<0.05. 

193 None

#### **Results**

#### 195 Socio-demographic Characteristics

A total of 642 patients were included in the study, among whom 605 responded to the interview, making a 94.2% response rate. An almost equal number of male and female participants participated in the study. More than half of the participants, 352 (58.2%), were from urban areas, and the majority of them, 421 (69.6%), were married.

Regarding the educational status of the participants, 137 (22.6%) were illiterates who were unable to read and write (Table 1). The average participant age was 43.29 (16.5%) years, the average monthly income was  $84.32 (\pm 70.65)$  US dollars, and the average household size was  $4.46 (\pm 3.43)$ .

Table 1: Socio-demographic and economic characteristics of chronic diseases
patients visited public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional
State, Ethiopia 2020 (N= 605)

Socio-demograph	ic Characteristics (N= 605)	Frequency (n)	Percentage (%)
Sex	Male	302	49.9
	Female	303	50.1
Residence place	Urban	352	58.2
	Rural	253	41.8
Marital status	Single	130	21.5
	Married	421	69.6
	Separated	7	1.2
	Divorced	2	0.3
	Widowed	45	7.4

Religion	Orthodox	165	27.3
	Muslim	59	9.8
	Protestant	373	61.7
	Others	8	1.3
Ethnic group	Oromo	552	91.2
	Amhara	48	7.9
	Gurage	4	0.7
	Tigre	1	0.2
Educational	Illiterate	137	22.6
status	Read &Write	102	16.9
	Grade 1-8	99	16.4
	Grade 9-8	151	25.0
	Diploma and above	116	19.2
Employment	Government employee	93	15.4
status	NGO* employee	89	14.7
	Merchant	100	16.5
	Housewife	114	18.8
	Farmer	107	17.7
	Others**	102	16.9

\**NGO*= non-governmental organization, \*\* Daily laborer, students

209 Costs of Follow up Care

The total cost for the treatment of CDs before the COVID-19 pandemic among patients who incurred any one or more types of cost was on average 10.70(±10.50) US dollars, with the median cost of 8.04 US dollars among 600 patients before the pandemic. The total cost of the treatment of the diseases per follow-up visit during 

2 3 4	214
5 6	215
7 8	216
9 10 11	217
12 13	218
14 15	219
16 17	220
18 19 20	221
21 22	222
23 24	223
25 26 27	224
27 28 29	225
30 31	226
32 33	227
34 35 36	228
37 38	229
39 40	230
41 42 42	231
43 44 45	232
46 47	
48 49	233
50 51 52	234
53 54	235
55 56	_00
57	
58 59	
60	

1

the pandemic among 597 patients was 13.40(±11.54) US dollars and the median cost
was 10.41 US dollars.

The median income lost due to productivity time lost for the treatment of CDs before the pandemic was 1.48 US dollars among 501 participants who had income, which was almost similar to the income lost when visiting the study hospitals during the pandemic, which was 1.40 US dollars.

The total median non-medical cost incurred for the follow-up care was 2.57 US dollars before the pandemic among 463 patients and 5.49 US dollars among the same number of patients during the pandemic.

The total median transportation cost to travel to hospitals and travel back to their homes, the participants incurred 1.14 US dollars before the pandemic and 2.29 US dollars during the pandemic among 430 patients who paid for transportation.

The total median cost incurred for the accommodation and food during the follow-up visit was 3.43 US dollars before the pandemic and 4.29 US dollars during the pandemic among 199 participants.

The total median medical cost was 3.71 US dollars before the pandemic, whereas it was 4.29 US dollars during the pandemic hospital visit among 425 participants who paid for the prescribed drugs (Table 2).

236	Table 2: Chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care cost categories among

chronic diseases patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia

238 National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

			0
COVID-19	on (N)	(US\$)	cost difference
Pandemic			(During- Before covid-19)
Before	501	1.48	Z = 1.780, p = 0.075
During	501	1.40	
Before	430	1.14	Z = 8.028, p = 0.001
During	430	2.29	
Before	199	3.43	Z = 1.189, p = 0.169
During	199	4.29	
Before	463	2.57	Z = 4.903, p = 0.001
During	463	5.49	
		0	
Before	425	3.71	Z = 2.382, p = 0.017
During	425	4.29	
Before	600	8.04	Z = 5.05, p=0.001
During	593	10.41	1
	COVID-19 Pandemic Before During Before During Before During Before During Before During Before During	COVID-19 on (N) Pandemic Before 501 During 501 Before 430 During 430 Before 199 During 199 Before 463 During 463 During 463 During 425 Before 600 During 593	COVID-19       on (N)       (US\$)         Pandemic       501       1.48         During       501       1.40         Before       430       1.14         During       430       2.29         Before       199       3.43         During       199       4.29         Before       463       2.57         During       463       5.49         Before       425       3.71         During       425       4.29         Before       600       8.04         During       593       10.41

239 Note: 1US\$ = 35.99 ETB, August, 2020

240 Cost Difference Based on COVID-19 Pandemic

Patients were categorized according to the type of chronic disease for which they visited study hospitals (Table 3). There was a significant median cost difference (n = 243 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of follow-up care during the COVID-19 pandemic lock-down compared to the costs incurred before the pandemic (Table 4).

This showed that 348 out of 593 (58.7%) patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost of followup care during the pandemic was 10.41 US dollars compared to 8.04 US dollars before the COVID-19 pandemic.

The study showed that there was no significant median difference in income lost among patients who had income during and before the pandemic (n = 501, Z = 1.780, p = 0.075). The median income lost during the pandemic was 1.48 US dollars compared to the income lost before the pandemic, which was 1.40 US dollars.

There was a significant median cost difference in non-medical costs per patient during and before the pandemic (n = 463, Z = 4.903, p = 0.001). This showed significantly higher costs have been incurred by more than half of the patients, 276 (59.61%), during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median nonmedical cost observed among the patients was 5.49 and 2.57 US dollars per followup visit during and before the pandemic, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median cost difference of food and accommodation incurred during and before the pandemic (n = 199, Z = 1.189, p = 0.169), and the median of this cost category was 4.29 and 3.13 US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down, respectively.

The majority of the patients, 289 (67.2%), paid higher transportation fees when they visited hospitals during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference in transportation costs during and before the pandemic (n = 430, Z = 8.028, p = 0.00), which was explained by the fact that the median transportation cost was 1.14 US dollars and 2.29 US dollars during and before the pandemic, respectively.

Page 15 of 26

#### **BMJ** Open

More than half of the patients, 236 (55.5%), incurred higher costs for medical services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference during and before the pandemic (n = 425, Z =2.382, p = 0.017) in which the median cost was 4.29 and 3.71 US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down.

The study showed that the majority of the HTN patients, 128 (60.7%), paid a high amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic among 211 patients who paid for the services. There was a significant median cost difference per visit during and before the pandemic (n = 211, Z = 3.632, p = 0.00). The median cost observed among these patients was 7.58 and 10.14 US per follow-up visit before and during the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of DM patients (59.17%) paid higher costs for the services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The total cost incurred by these patients was significantly higher during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic (n = 169, Z = 3.095, p = 0.002). The median cost was 11.39 and 8.11 US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by HF patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 61, Z = -0.055, p = 0.956). Among 61 HF patients, only 31(50.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic.

Similarly, there was no statistical significance in the median difference of total cost incurred by patients who visited the hospitals for mental health follow up for the treatment of diseases during and before the pandemic era (n = 41, Z = -1.497, p = 0.134). Among 41 patients, only 20(40.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic. 

The study also showed that there was a statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by HIV patients during and before the pandemic lock-down (n = 49, Z = 3.356, p = 0.00). Among 49 patients, the majority of them 34(69.39%) incurred a higher cost per visit during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic lock-down. 

There was no statistical significance in the median difference of total cost incurred by asthma patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 28, Z = 1.731, p = 0.184). Similarly, there was no statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by epilepsy patients during and before the pandemic lock-down (n = 18, Z = 1.328, p = 0.184)(Table 4). 

Table 3: Types of chronic diseases among chronic diseases patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605) 

Types of Chronic diseases	Frequency(n)	Percentage (%)
Hypertension	214	35.4
Diabetic mellitus	173	28.6
Heart failure	62	10.2
Mental disease	51	8.4
HIV/AIDS	50	8.3
Asthma	29	4.8
Epilepsy	18	3.0
Stroke	3	0.5

Page 17 of 26

BMJ Open

Table 4: Chronic diseases follow up visit for the treatment and care cost among
chronic disease patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia
National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

Types of	Era of COVID-	Observation	Median	Significance level of
CD	19 Pandemic	(N)	(US\$)	median cost difference
				(During- Before covid-19)
HTN	Before	211	7.58	Z = 3.632, p = 0.001
	During	211	10.14	
DM	Before	169	8.12	Z = 3.095, p = 0.002
	During	169	11.39	
HF	Before	61	9.06	Z = -0.055, p = 0.956
	During	61	8.2	
Mental disease	Before	49	11.63	Z = -1.497, p = 0.134
	During	49	8.86	
HIV	Before	49	6.12	Z = 3.356, p = 0.000
	During	49	12.24	
Asthma	Before	28	7.33	Z = 1.731, p =0.184
	During	28	10.34	
Epilepsy	Before	18	5.70	Z = 1.328, p =0.184
	During	18	10.00	

313 Discussion

The study evaluated the illness cost of chronic diseases before and during the COVID-19 pandemic lock-down. Accordingly, more than half of the chronic patients (58.7%) incurred a significantly higher total cost during the pandemic lock-down compared to before the pandemic. This is explained by the median cost that was increased by 29.39% (Table 4).

This finding supports the study's findings that chronic illness costs account for more than 75% of total healthcare costs in high-income countries.<sup>22, 23</sup> During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19, and this resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs.<sup>11, 12,</sup> <sup>3</sup> <sup>24</sup> This could be explained by the fact that the global pandemic's disruption of the health-care system may impose additional costs on CD patients.

The study revealed that the non-medical cost during the follow-up visit per patient during the era of COVID-19 was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic era by the same patients, which was doubled during the pandemic. This significant difference probably might be due to a strict lock-down that could affect these patients adversely as they require regular follow-up visits that lead to further health consequences and additional costs. <sup>25, 26</sup>

Transportation costs were one of the cost categories that doubled during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost per patient per visit of this cost category during the pandemic era was significantly increased by two folds. This could be due to the fact that the government restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid a temporary restriction on public transport across-regions and cities.<sup>17, 25</sup>

The study discovered a significant median cost difference in medical costs, with the
 median of this cost category increasing by 15.6% during the pandemic. This finding

Page 19 of 26

#### **BMJ** Open

is in line with the study report that revealed that before the pandemic, one in three
Americans did not take their medications as prescribed because of high costs, but
during a global pandemic, forgoing medications involves even more risks for chronic
care patients and incurs even higher costs in the long run. <sup>27</sup>

The study also evaluated the illness cost of each selected chronic disease. Accordingly, for the follow-up care of HTN patients, the patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic, which was raised by 33.76% during the pandemic. The cost incurred before the COVIDpandemic was almost comparable with other study reports, but the cost incurred during the pandemic was higher than the study report on the cost of hypertension before the COVID-19 lockdown in Ethiopia. <sup>28</sup>

Again, the study showed that the cost of DM follow-up visit per patient during the pandemic lock-down was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by 40.53%. However, before and during the COVID-19 lock-down, the cost of DM in this study was lower than the study reports in Ethiopia. <sup>20, 29</sup> This variation could be attributed to differences in DM complications and treatment among study participants.

Despite HIV care and treatment being an exempted service in Ethiopia, patients incurred nonmedical costs. The study revealed that the cost incurred by HIV patients for follow-up treatment and care per visit per patient during the pandemic lock-down was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by two folds. The cost of HIV treatment and care reported in the study was higher than in other Ethiopian studies .<sup>30, 31</sup>

Page 20 of 26

**BMJ** Open

However, there was no significant statistical median cost difference for the follow-up care of HF, mental illness, asthma, and epilepsy during and before the pandemic; a

slight median cost difference was observed during and before the pandemic.

365 Limitation of the Study

The cost findings in the study could be underestimated for the reason that the income loss of unemployed patients and unemployed caregivers due to productivity time lost were not included in the cost estimation. However, the cost of illness analysis was limited to the patients' perspective and did not incorporate other intangible costs (stigma and discrimination, pain) associated with chronic illness, which were not also estimated in the current study.

## 372 Conclusion

This study revealed that the total cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic lock-down was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era among the same patients. A comprehensive package of chronic disease treatment and care is demanded at different levels of health facilities in the health system of the country. Therefore, healthcare providers should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the services at proximal health facilities.

**Declarations** 

#### 381 Ethical Approval and Consent to Participate

An appropriate research ethical approval was obtained from the ethical review board of Wallaga University, Institute of health sciences (Reference number: IRB/233/2020). The study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. The questionnaire was designed to be anonymous, and the result did not identify the personalities of the respondents; rather, it was presented in the 

Page 21 of 26

1 2 **BMJ** Open

3 ⊿	
4 5	
5 6	
7	
י 8	
a	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33	
34	
35	
36	
3/	
38	
39	
40 41	
41	
42 // 2	
44	
45	
46	
47	
48	
49	
50	
51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
56	
57	
58	
59	
60	

aggregated statistics. The data was kept in protected and safe locations. Paperbased data was kept in a locked cabinet, and computer-based data was password
secured. Data sharing was enacted based on the consent and permission of
research participants and the ethical and legal rules of data sharing, and it was not
accessed by a third person, except the research teams.

## **392** Authors Contribution and Conflict of interests

All authors made substantial contributions to conception and design, acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; took part in drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; gave final approval of the version to be published; and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

397 All authors declared that they have no conflicts of interest related to this work.

#### 398 **Consent for Publication**

399 NA

#### 400 Availability of Data and Materials

401 All the data supporting the study's findings are within the manuscript. Additional 402 detailed information and raw data will be shared upon request addressed to the 403 corresponding author.

ê.k

#### 404 Funding

 $\frac{7}{3}$  405 This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public,  $\frac{9}{3}$  406 commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

<sup>2</sup> 407 **Acknowledgments** 

 $\frac{1}{5}$  408 Researchers would like to acknowledge all participants in the study and respective

administrative bodies from top to bottom for their due cooperation and involvement.

<sup>59</sup> 410 **Acronyms** 

3 4	411	ETB: Ethiopian Birr, HF: Heart Failure, HIV: Human Immune Virus, HTN:
5 6	412	Hypertension, LMICs: Low-and-middle-income countries, NCDs: Non-communicable
7 8 0	413	diseases, OOP: Out-of-pocket, TB: Tuberculosis, WHO: World Health Organization
9 10 11	414	References
12 13	415	[1]. World Health Organization. A guide to implementation research in the prevention
14 15 16	416	and control of Non-communicable diseases. Geneva; Switzerland World Health
16 17 19	417	Organization; 2016.
18 19 20	418	[2].World Health Organization. Overview preventing chronic diseases: a vital
21 22	419	investment. Switzerland: 2004.
23 24	420	[3]. The World Bank. Human Development Network. The growing danger of non-
25 26 27	421	communicable diseases. Acting now to reverse course; 2011.
28 29 30 31 32 33	422	[4].Santosa, A, Byass, P. Diverse empirical evidence on epidemiological transition in
	423	low-and middle-income countries: population-based findings from INDEPTH network
	424	data. PLoS One 2016; 11, e0155753.
34 35 36	425	[5].World Health Organization. The double burden: Emerging epidemics and
37 38	426	persistent problems. World Health Report; 1999.
39 40	427	[6].Murray, C. J., Lopez, A. D. The global burden of disease: a comprehensive
41 42 42	428	assessment of mortality and disability from diseases, injuries, and risk factors in
43 44 45	429	1990 and projected to 2020: summary. Harvard School of Public Health on behalf of
46 47	430	the World Health Organization and the World Bank; 1996.
48 49	431	[7].Bollyky, T. J., Templin, T., Cohen, M., et al. Lower-income countries that face the
50 51 52	432	most rapid shift in non-communicable disease burden are also the least prepared.
53 54	433	Health Aff. 2017: 36, 1866–1875.
55 56		
57 58		
59		

Page 23 of 26

1

**BMJ** Open

[8].Engelgau MM, El-Saharty S, Kudesia P, et al. Capitalizing on the demographic

transition: tackling non-communicable diseases in South Asia: The World Bank;

2 3 4	434
5 6	435
/ 8	436
9 10 11	437
12 13	438
14 15 16	439
16 17 18	440
19 20	441
21 22	442
23 24 25	443
26 27	444
28 29	445
30 31 32	446
33 34	447
35 36	448
37 38	449
39 40 41	450
42 43	451
44 45	452
46 47 48	453
48 49 50	454
51 52	455
53 54	456
55 56 57	457
58 59 60	458

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

22

2011. [9]. Jiang H ZY, Tang W. Maintaining HIV care during the COVID-19 pandemic. The Lancet HIV. 2020 May 1; 7:308-9.

[10].WHO Director-General's opening remarks at the Mission briefing on COVID-19.

Press release. 2020. Available at:

https://www.who.int/dg/speeches/detail/whodirector-generals-opening-remarks-at-

the-mission-briefing-on-covid-19---12-march-2020

[11].World Health Organization. Information note on COVID-19 and noncommunicable diseases. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/ covid-19-and-ncds Accessed on July 21, 2020.

[12].Yogini V, Clare L, Francesco Z, et al. Impact of COVID-19 on routine care for

chronic diseases: A global survey of views from healthcare professionals; 2020.

[13].Fagan M. Huge fall in non-Covid hospital admissions and attendances. Irish Examiner; 2020.

[14].Julian C, Rebecca McG. Spillover Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic Could Drive Long-Term Health Consequences for Non-COVID-19 Patients. Health Affairs; 2020.

[15]. Chen D., Zhu L., Lin X., et al. Epilepsy control during an epidemic: emerging approaches and a new management framework. Acta Epileptologica. 2020; 2:1-9. doi: 10.1186/s42494-020-00015-z.

[16]. Ethiopian federal ministry of health. Ethiopia Confirmed the First Case Of Covid-19. Press release; 2020. Available at: http://www.moh.gov.et/ejcc/en/node/194 . Accessed on July 15, 2020.

[17].Strategic Partnership for International Health Regulations and Health Security
school of public health: COVID-19 Preparedness Bulletin Ethiopia; 2020. Available
at: https://extranet.who.int/sph/news/covid-19-preparedness-bulletin-ethiopia.

462 [18].Tamirat MA, Workeabeba A, Alemayehu W, et al. The Impact of COVID-19 on
 463 Care Seeking Behavior of Patients at Tertiary Care Follow-up Clinics: A Cross 464 Sectional Telephone Survey. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; 2020. medRxiv preprint doi:
 465 https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.11.25.20236224; 2020.

466 [19].Abhijit P. Health Economic Evaluation Methods Techniques. IOSR Journal of Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF). 2016; 7:1-9.

468 [20].Alemu Z, Workneh BD, Mohammed SA, et al. Economic Assessment of Direct
 469 Cost of Illness of Diabetes Mellitus at Dessie Referral Hospital, North East
 470 Ethiopia.2020. Int J Diabetes Clin Res 7:122. doi.org/10.23937/2377-3634/1410122

471 [21].Stanley L, David W. Hosmer Jr, et al. Adequacy of Sample Size in Health
 472 Studies. World Health Organization. 1990; pp36-39.

473 [22].Glynn LG., Valderas JM., Healy P., et al. The prevalence of multimorbidity in
 474 primary care and its effect on health care utilization and cost. J of Family Pract.
 475 2011; 28:516–23.

476 [23].Nuno R., Coleman K., Bengoa R., et al. Integrated care for chronic conditions:
 477 the contribution of the ICCC Framework. Health Policy 2012; 105:55–64.

478 [24].Baird B. How has general practice responded to the Covid-19 (coronavirus)
 479 outbreak? The `Kings Fund. Available at:https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2020/
 480 04/covid-19-general-practice. Accessed on June 25, 2020.

481 [25].Finet P, Le Bouquin Jeannes R, Dameron O, et al. Review of current
 482 telemedicine applications for chronic diseases. Toward a more integrated system?
 483 Irbm 2015;36.

Page 25 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

484 [26].French J.A., Brodie M.J., Caraballo R., et al. Keeping people with epilepsy safe
485 during the Covid-19 pandemic. Neurology. 2020; 94:1032–1037. doi:
486 10.1212/WNL.00000000009632.

487 [27].Valenz. The Effects of COVID-19 on Chronic Disease Management and Five 488 Solutions Insurers Should Embrace; 2020.

489 [28].Zawudie AB, Lemma TD, Daka DW. Cost of Hypertension Illness and
 490 Associated Factors Among Patients Attending Hospitals in Southwest Shewa Zone,
 491 Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. ClinicoEconomics and Outcomes Research
 492 2020:12 201–211.

493• [29].Samson O, Amarech G, Mulugeta T, et al. economic burden of diabetes mellitus
 494 to diabetic patients and their families attending health facilities in Addis ababa.2020.
 495 Ethiopian Medical Journal 58(3)

496 [30].Berman, P; Alebachew, A; Mann, C; Agarwal, A; Abdella, E. 2016. Costs of
497 Publicly Funded Primary Hospitals, Departments, and Exempted Services in Ethiopia
498 Supplement to Paper 1 with expanded sample of primary hospitals. Harvard T.H.
499 Chan School of Public Health; Breakthrough International Consultancy, PLC: Boston,
500 Massachusetts and Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

501 [31].Asfaw DB, Degu J, Bjarne R, et al. Cost estimates of HIV care and treatment
 502 with and without anti-retroviral therapy at Arba Minch Hospital in southern Ethiopia.
 503 Cost Effectiveness and Resource Allocation 2009, 7:6 doi:10.1186/1478-7547-7-6.

Section/Topic	ltem #	Recommendation	Reported on page #
Title and abstract	1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
		(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	2
Introduction			
Background/rationale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported	3-4
Objectives	3	State specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses	2
Methods			
Study design	4	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	5
Setting	5	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	5
Participants	6	(a) Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection of participants	6
Variables	7	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if applicable	7
Data sources/	8*	For each variable of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	-
measurement		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one group	
Bias	10	Explain how the study size was arrived at	-
Quantitative variables	10	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen and why	8
Statistical methods	12	(a) Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	8
		(b) Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	-
		(c) Explain how missing data were addressed	8
		(d) If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of sampling strategy	-
		(e) Describe any sensitivity analyses	-
Results			

### STROBE 2007 (v4) Statement—Checklist of items that should be included in reports of *cross-sectional studies*

Participants	13*	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility,	-
		confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	
		(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	-
		(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	-
Descriptive data	14*	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	8
		confounders	
		(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	-
Outcome data	15*	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	-
Main results	16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	-
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included	
		(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	-
		(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	-
Other analyses	17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses	-
Discussion			
Key results	18	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	12-14
Limitations	19	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias	15
Interpretation	20	Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence	-
Generalisability	21	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results	-
Other information			
Funding	22	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which the present article is based	16

\*Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

**Note:** An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.

# **BMJ Open**

#### Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Cost of Chronic Diseases Treatment and Care at Public Hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia: Hospital Based Cross-Sectional Study

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2022-070195.R1
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	01-Jul-2023
Complete List of Authors:	Terefa, Dufera; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Edosa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Tolessa, Belachew; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences Desisa, Adisu; Wallaga University, Public Health Olani, Wolkite ; Wallaga University, Public Health Fetensa, Getahun; Wallaga University, Department of Nursing Chego, Melese ; Wallaga University, Public Health Abdisa, Eba ; Wallaga University, School of Nursing Turi, Ebisa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Bekuma, Tariku Tesfaye; Wallaga University, Department of Public health Getachew, Motuma; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Lensa ; Wallaga University, Public Health Tilahun, Temesgen; Wallaga University, School of Medicine
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Health policy
Secondary Subject Heading:	Health economics, Health policy, Health services research, Infectious diseases, Public health
Keywords:	Health Equity, Decision Making, EPIDEMIOLOGY, Health Services Accessibility, HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT

# SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

review only

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

3 4	1	Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Cost of Chronic Diseases Treatment and
5 6	2	Care at Public Hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia:
7 8 0	3	Hospital Based Cross-Sectional Study
9 10 11	4	Dufera Rikitu Terefa <sup>1</sup> , Edosa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Belachew Etana <sup>1</sup> , Adisu Ewunetu <sup>1</sup> , Wolkite
12 13	5	Olani <sup>1</sup> , Getahun Fetensa <sup>2</sup> , Melese Chego <sup>1</sup> , Eba Abdisa <sup>2</sup> , Ebisa Turi <sup>1</sup> , Tariku
14 15 16	6	Tesfaye Bekuma <sup>1</sup> , Motuma Getachew <sup>1</sup> , Lensa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Temesgen Tilahun <sup>3</sup>
17 18	7	<sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University,
19 20	8	Nekemte, Ethiopia
21 22 22	9	<sup>2</sup> School of Nursing, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
23 24 25	10	Ethiopia
26 27	11	<sup>3</sup> School of Medicine, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
28 29 20	12	Ethiopia
30 31 32	13	Co-author contact details:
33 34	14	Edosa Tesfaye, E-mail: edosatesfaye2019@yahoo.com
35 36 27	15	Belachew Etana, E-mail:ba.etana@gmail.com
37 38 39	16	Adisu Ewunetu, E-mail:adisuewunetu2019@gmail.com
40 41	17	Wolkite Olani, E-mail: walkiteolani2020@gmail.com
42 43	18	Getahun Fetensa, E-mail: fetensagetahun@gmail.com
44 45 46	19	Melese Chego, E-mail: melese_chego@yahoo.com
47 48	20	Eba Abdisa, E-mail: ebaabdisa@rocketmail.com
49 50	21	Ebisa Turi, E-mail: ebakoturi@gmail.com
51 52 53	22	Tariku Tesfaye Bekuma, E-mail: tarii2007@gmail.com
55 54 55	23	Motuma Getachew, E-mail: motyamo@gmail.com
56 57	24	Lensa Tesfaye, E-mail: lenlove539@gmail.com
58 59 60	25	Temesgen Tilahun, E-mail: ttamuko@yahoo.com

**BMJ** Open

26 Corresponding author contact details:

- 27 Full name: Dufera Rikitu Terefa
- P.O.Box=395, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia.
- 29 Tel. (+251)-922260706
- 30 E-mail:duferarikitu24@gmail.com
- 31 Abstract

**Introduction:** Globally, around one third of the population has at least one long-term health condition that could be affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. Despite, studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization, the impact of the pandemic on cost of chronic disease treatment and care from a patient perspective was scanty. So, the study aimed to determine the impact of COVID-19 pandemic on cost of chronic diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia, from August 01 to 31, 2020. 

Methods: An institutional based cross-sectional study design was used and the
sample size for the study (n = 642) was determined using a single population mean
formula. Data was collected using interviews and analyzed using SPSS version 25.
Descriptive statistics were performed and the cost of follow-up care before and after
the pandemic was compared using a Related-samples Wilcoxon signed-rank test,
declaring the level of significance of the median cost difference at P<0.05.</li>

**Results:** A total of 642 patients were included in the study, among whom 605 (94.2%) of them responded to the interviews. There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of chronic diseases among follow-up patients during the pandemic compared to the costs incurred by these patients before the pandemic.

**Conclusion**: The cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the 52 COVID-19 pandemic was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era. 53 Therefore, healthcare providers should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for 54 chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the 55 services at proximal health facilities.

# **Keywords:** COVID-19 Pandemic, Chronic Disease, Cost of Illness, Follow up Care,

57 Ethiopia

### 58 Strengths and Limitations of the Study

- The cost findings in the study could be underestimated due to; the income loss of unemployed patients and their companions due to productivity time lost were not included in the cost estimation,
- The cost of illness analysis was limited to the patients' perspective and did not incorporate the intangible costs,
- Also, children (<15 years) and elderly (greater than 65 years) were not included in
- 65 the valuation of lost work days.
- Finally, there might be a recall bias.

#### 67 Background

Globally, chronic diseases (CDs) are the major public health problems that account for 60% of all deaths(35% in low and 40% in middle income countries).<sup>1-3</sup> Including Ethiopia many low and middle-income countries (LMICs) are undergoing a gradual epidemiologic transition as the disease burden shifts from infectious to noncommunicable diseases(NCDs).<sup>4-6</sup>Healthcare systems in these countries are mostly unprepared to handle the increasing burden of these diseases, resulting in no or limited access to affordable prevention and diagnosis of NCDs.<sup>7</sup> These challenges

#### **BMJ** Open

add up to higher NCDs treatment costs and even the financing of which mostly
 comes from households' out-of-pocket (OOP) spending.<sup>8</sup>

COVID-19 pandemic was also another challenge which disrupts entire societies, including the routine health care systems in Ethiopia. The comprehensive effort to contain the pandemic and minimize the subsequent morbidity and mortality has affected both the continuity and guality of care.9During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19 prevention and control. This resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs in this era. Diabetes, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, hypertension, heart disease, asthma, cancer, and depression were some of the conditions reported to be most impacted by the reduction in healthcare resources due to the pandemic.<sup>10</sup> Resources at all levels have shifted away from CDs management and prevention during the outbreak, and the lock-down of many services has translated into reduced access, a decrease in referrals, and reduced hospitalizations of patients with non-COVID-19 pathology.<sup>11</sup> As the pandemic continues to rapidly spread, attentions often focuses on the numbers of confirmed and probable cases, hospitalizations, and deaths, which can be called the "direct" effects of the pandemic. However, these numbers do not capture the full extent of the pandemic because it has also generated important spillover (indirect) effects by decreasing the supply of and altering patient demand for non-COVID-19-related medical care.<sup>12</sup>

In Ethiopia, the government declared a state of emergency, labeling the pandemic as a national threat and launching overall preventive measures, including advising the community to stay at home, practicing strict and frequent hand washing, and wearing a face mask. Also, restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid temporary restrictions on market places, restaurants, shops, cinema houses,

> religious, and cities.<sup>13</sup> During this time, the number of hospital visits dropped sharply to utilize health services, including CDs follow-up.<sup>14</sup> Many studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization. But, there has been little emphasis on the impact of the pandemic on illness costs of chronic disease follow-up care from a patient perspective. So, the study aimed to determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients at public hospitals.

107 Methods and Materials

# 108 Study Design and Setting

An institutional-based cross-sectional study design was used to conduct this study. It was conducted from August 01 to 31, 2020 in the three wallaga zones namely; East Wallaga, West Wallaga, and Horro Guduru Wallaga zones of Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. These three Wallaga zones are among the twenty one zones of Oromia region and were found in the western direction of the region, Oromia. The capital town of east Wallaga zone, Nekemte town; west Wallaga zone, Gimbi town and Horro Guduru Wallaga zone, shambu town were located 333km, 441km, and 314km west direction of Addis Ababa, capital city of Ethiopia, respectively. 

117 Study Participants

All chronic disease patients who visited public hospitals in the Wallaga Zones were the source population, and all patients who visited the three Wallaga Zones' selected study hospitals during the study period were the study population.

121 Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

All patients of the selected CDs in the study area who visited the study hospitals were included in the study. Patients whose age was less than 15 years old and without
Page 7 of 25

**BMJ** Open

accompanying parents who were seriously ill and unable to respond to the interviewswere excluded from the study.

## 126 Sample Size and Sampling Methods

127 The sample size was determined by using the single population mean formula, 128 applying the following assumptions: two-sided alpha error ( $\epsilon$ ) set at 0.05, 95% 129 confidence level, and mean cost of DM ( $\mu$ ) = 48.99 ETB, and standard deviation 130 (SD)= 30.89 ETB<sup>15</sup>, adding 5% non-response rate.

Among thirteen public hospitals in the study area, data was collected from the selected CDs of follow-up care patients from Nekemte specialized hospitals, Sire hospital, Gida hospital, Arjo hospital, Shambu hospital, Guduru hospital, Gimbi hospital, and Nedjo hospital which were selected using simple random sampling technique.

The determined sample size was allocated to each study hospital proportionally based on the proportion of each CD patients who attended follow-up care. Wallaga University referral hospital was purposely excluded from the study, which was an isolation and treatment center for COVID-19 during the study period, and four other hospitals were excluded due to their low CD patients flow.

Finally, to sample patients at each study hospital, systematic random sampling technique was used to select 642 participants. A simple random sampling technique was employed to select the first participant from the registration book.

#### 3 145 Data Collection

The structured questionnaire was developed in English after reviewing relevant literatures, and it was translated into Afan Oromo. Data collection and supervision were carried out by eight data collectors, with four supervisors assigned. These data

4	
5	
ر د	
6	
/	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
21	
21	
32	
33	
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
30	
29	
40	
41	
42	
43	
44	
45	
46	
17	
4/	
48	
49	
50	
51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
55	
20	
5/	
58	
59	
60	

1 2 3

collectors and supervisors were trained before the pre-test and actual data collection
started. The questionnaires were pre-tested in Bedele hospital using 32(5%) of the
determined sample size. It was collected by face-to-face interview. Patients who
completed their chronic outpatient services and returned to leave the study hospitals
were interviewed.

154 **Study Variables** 

Socio-demographic and economic characteristics, health service costs (non medical costs; transportation, food, accommodation, and income lost, and
 medical costs; registration, consultation, laboratory, radiology, and drugs)
 were assessed and determined.

#### **Operational Definitions**

Before COVID-19: The period before March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first confirmed COVID-19 positive case.

Chronic disease follow up patients: A patient visited the study hospital for the follow-up care of one of; hypertension (HTN), diabetic's mellitus (DM), heart failure (HF), mental illness, HIV (Human immune virus), stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.

Chronic disease: Any of the following illnesses that persist over time, can gradually progress, do not resolve spontaneously, and may not be cured, like HTN, DM. HF, mental illness, HIV, stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.

Direct costs: The expenditures in ETB spent by chronic disease patients and their families on the diagnosis and treatment of chronic illness per prescription of physicians in the study hospitals.

During COVID-19: The period after March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first confirmed COVID-19 positive case.

Indirect costs: the number of productive days lost by patients and their families as

a result of chronic illness treatment and care.

Medical cost: The cost component of chronic disease patients' follow-up visits at study hospitals that includes registration, laboratory, radiology, and drug costs. **Non-medical cost:** The cost component that includes transportation, food, accommodation, and income lost among chronic disease patients during follow-up visits at study hospitals.

**Data Analysis** 

Data was entered in to Epi-data version 3.1 and exported to SPSS version 25 software for analysis. Descriptive statistics were performed for all study variables based on their characteristics. The bottom-up costing approach was used to estimate the direct cost for the follow-up visit with respect to patient perspective and the indirect costs (income lost due to productive time lost) were estimated using earnings lost both before and during COVID-19 pandemic.<sup>17</sup> The time foregone and productive time lost were converted into indirect costs based on the daily wage rate and then multiplied by the number of working days lost. The daily wage rate for patients was estimated by dividing their monthly income by 30 days for both patients and caregivers.<sup>17</sup> All costs included in the analysis were measured in terms of Ethiopian Birr (ETB) and were converted to US\$(US dollar) during the analysis, and the average currency exchange rate was (August 2020; *1* US\$ = *35.99 ETB*).

Finally, the normality distribution of treatment cost data was checked, and it was not normally distributed. AS a result, non-parametric tests were used to analyze the median cost for each cost category, as well as a 2-paired sample Wilcoxon sign rank test to compare the costs incurred before and during the pandemic lock-down, with the level of significance of the median cost difference set at p<0.05.

60 177 Ethical consideration

An appropriate research ethical approval was obtained from the ethical review board of Wallaga University, Institute of health sciences (Reference number: IRB/233/2020). The study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. The questionnaire was designed to be anonymous, and the result did not identify the personalities of the respondents; rather, it was presented in the aggregated statistics. Written consent was obtained from the study participants. The data was kept in protected and safe locations. Paper-based data was kept in a locked cabinet, and computer-based data was password secured. Data sharing was enacted based the ethical and legal rules of data sharing, and it was not accessed by a third person, except the research teams. 

Patient and Public Involvement 

None

Results 

# (e) Socio-demographic Characteristics

A total of 642 patients were included in the study, among whom 605 responded to the interview, yielding 94.2% response rate. An almost equal number of male and female participated in the study. More than half of the participants, 352 (58.2%), were from urban areas, and the majority of them, 421 (69.6%), were married. 

Regarding the educational status of the participants, 137 (22.6%) were illiterates (Table 1). The average participant's age was 43.29 (SD=16.5) years, the average monthly income was 84.32 (SD=70.65) US dollars, and the average household size was 4.46 (SD=3.43). 

Table 1: Socio-demographic characteristics and classification of study participants by chronic diseases conditions in the public hospitals of the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional State, Ethiopia 2020 (N= 605)

Characteristics (N	l= 605)	Frequency (n)	Percentage
Sex	Male	302	49.9
	Female	303	50.1
Residence place	Urban	352	58.2
	Rural	253	41.8
Marital status	Single	130	21.5
	Married	421	69.6
	Separated	7	1.2
	Divorced	2	0.3
	Widowed	45	7.4
Religion	Orthodox	165	27.3
	Muslim	59	9.8
	Protestant	373	61.7
	Others	8	1.3
Ethnic group	Oromo	552	91.2
	Amhara	48	7.9
	Gurage	4	0.7
	Tigre	1	0.2
Educational	Illiterate	137	22.6
status	Read &Write	102	16.9
	Grade 1-8	99	16.4
	Grade 9-8	151	25.0
	Diploma and above	116	19.2

Employment	Government employee	93	15.4
status	NGO* employee	89	14.7
	Merchant	100	16.5
	Housewife	114	18.8
	Farmer	107	17.7
	Others**	102	16.9
Types of Chronic	Hypertension	214	35.4
diseases	Diabetic mellitus	173	28.6
	Heart failure	62	10.2
	Mental disease	51	8.4
	HIV/AIDS	50	8.3
	Asthma	29	4.8
	Epilepsy	18	3.0
	Stroke	3	0.5

\*NGO= non-governmental organization, \*\* Daily laborer, students

# **The Overall Cost of CD Follow-up Care before and during the Pandemic**

The total cost for the treatment of CDs before the COVID-19 pandemic among patients who incurred any one or more types of cost was on average 10.41(SD=10.19) US dollars, with the median cost of 9.76(IQR=8.64) US dollars among 600 patients before the pandemic. The total cost of the treatment of the diseases per follow-up visit during the pandemic among 593 patients was 13.02(SD=11.22) US dollars and the median cost was 12.27(IQR=10.40) US dollars. The median income lost due to productivity time lost for the treatment of CDs before

213 the pandemic was 1.48(IQR=2.71) US dollars among 501 participants who had

Page 13 of 25

1

BMJ Open

2 3 4	214	income, which w	as almost simi	lar to the in	icome lost wh	en visiting the	study hospitals
5 6	215	during the pande	emic, which wa	s 1.40 (IQR	e=2.85)US dol	lars.	
7 8	216	The total med	lian non-med	ical cost	incurred for	the follow-u	up care was
9 10 11	217	6.05(IQR=5.55)	US dollars	before the	e pandemic	among 463	patients and
12 13	218	7.98(IQR=7.50)	US dollars amo	ong the sam	ne number of	patients during	the pandemic.
14 15	219	The total media	n transportatio	n cost to t	ravel to hosp	itals and trave	l back to their
16 17 18	220	homes, the parti	cipants incurre	ed 1.141 (I	QR=1.94) US	dollars before	the pandemic
19 20	221	and 2.29(IQR=3	.05) US dollars	s during the	e pandemic a	imong 430 pat	ients who paid
21 22	222	for transportatior	1.				
23 24 25	223	The total mediar	cost incurred	for the acc	ommodation a	and food during	a the follow-up
26 27	224	visit was 3.43(IC	QR=4.91) US (	dollars befo	ore the pande	emic and 4.29	(IQR=633) US
28 29	225	dollars during the	e pandemic am	ong 199 pa	articipants.		, ,
30 31 32	226	The total mediar	medical cost	was 3.71(10	QR=5.22) US	dollars before	the pandemic,
33 34	227	whereas it was 4	.29 (IQR=5.91	) US dollar	s during the p	andemic hospi	tal visit among
35 36 37	228	425 participants	who paid for th	e prescribe	ed drugs (Tabl	e 2).	
38 39	229	Table 2: The ove	erall cost of chr	onic diseas	es follow-up t	reatment and c	are before and
40 41	230	during the pande	mic among ch	ronic disea	ses patients a	t public hospita	Is in the three
42 43 44	231	Wallaga zones, (	Oromia Nationa	al Regional	state, Ethiopi	a 2020(N= 605	)
45 46		Cost Categories	Era of	Observa	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance
47 48			COVID-19	tion-on		(IQR)	level of median
49							cost difference
50 51			Pandemic	(N)			(During-Before
52 53							covid-19)
54 55		Income lost	Before	501	2.27(2.75)	1.48(2.71)	Z = 1.780,
56 57		(a)	During	501	2.25(2.72)	1.40(2.85)	p = 0.075
59 60		Transportation	Before	430	1.91(2.13)	1.14(1.94)	Z = 8.028,
	l		1	1	1		I

( <i>b</i> )	During	430	3.43(4.42)	2.29(3.05)	p = 0.001
Food and	Before	199	4.67(5.05)	3.43(4.91)	Z = 1.189,
(c)	During	199	5.6(5.94)	4.29(6.33)	p = 0.169
Total nonmedical	Before	463	4.58(5.35)	6.05(5.55)	Z = 4.903,
(a+b+c) = (d)	During	463	6.81(7.58)	7.98(7.50)	p = 0.001
Total medical	Before	425	5.51(8.43)	3.71(5.22)	Z = 2.382,
cost (e)	During	425	5.93(7.81)	4.29(5.91)	p = 0.017
Total cost per	Before	600	10.41(10.19)	9.76(8.64)	Z = 5.05,
patient per visit	During	593	13.02(11.22)	12.27(10.40)	p=0.001
(d+e)					

Note: 1US\$ = 35.99 ETB, August, 2020; SD: Standard Deviation; IQR: Interquartile
Range

#### 234 Cost Difference Based on COVID-19 Pandemic

There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of follow-up care during the COVID-19 pandemic lock-down compared to the costs incurred before the pandemic (Table 3). This showed that 348 out of 593 (58.7%) patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost of follow-up care during the pandemic was 12.27(IQR=10.40) US dollars compared to 9.76(IQR=8.64) US dollars before the COVID-19 pandemic.

The study showed that there was no significant median difference in income lost among patients who had income during and before the pandemic (n = 501, Z = 1.780, p = 0.075). The median income lost during the pandemic was 1.48(IQR=2.71) US dollars compared to the income lost before the pandemic, which was 1.40(IQR=2.85) US dollars. 

Page 15 of 25

#### **BMJ** Open

There was a significant median cost difference in non-medical costs per patient during and before the pandemic (n = 463, Z = 4.903, p = 0.001). This showed significantly higher costs have been incurred by more than half of the patients, 276 (59.61%), during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median nonmedical cost observed among the patients was 7.98(IQR=7.50) and 6.05(IQR=5.55) US dollars per follow-up visit during and before the pandemic, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median cost difference of food and accommodation incurred during and before the pandemic (n = 199, Z = 1.189, p = 0.169), and the median of this cost category was 4.29(IQR=6.33) and 3.13(IQR=4.91) US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down, respectively.

The majority of the patients, 289 (67.2%), paid higher transportation fees when they visited hospitals during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference in transportation costs during and before the pandemic (n = 430, Z = 8.028, p = 0.00), which was explained by the fact that the median transportation cost was 1.14 (IQR=1.94) US dollars and 2.29 (IQR=3.05) US dollars during and before the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of the patients, 236 (55.5%), incurred higher costs for medical services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference during and before the pandemic (n = 425, Z = 2.382, p = 0.017) in which the median cost was 4.29 (IQR=5.91) and 3.71(IQR=5.22) US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down.

The study showed that the majority of the hypertensive (HTN) patients, 128 (60.7%), paid a high amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic among 211 patients who paid for the services. There was a significant median cost

difference per visit during and before the pandemic (n = 211, Z = 3.632, p = 0.00). The median cost observed among these patients was 7.58 (IQR=7.53) and 10.14 (IQR=8.74) US per follow-up visit before and during the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of diabetes mellitus (DM) patients (59.17%) paid higher costs for the services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The total cost incurred by these patients was significantly higher during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic (n = 169, Z = 3.095, p = 0.002). The median cost was 11.39 (IQR=10.87) and 8.11(IQR=9.26) US dollars during and before the pandemic lockdown, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by heart failure (HF) patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 61, Z = -0.055, p = 0.956). Among 61 HF patients, only 31(50.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic.

Similarly, there was no statistical significance in the median difference of total cost incurred by patients who visited the hospitals for mental health follow up for the treatment of diseases during and before the pandemic era (n = 41, Z =-1.497, p = 0.134). Among 41 patients, only 20(40.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic.

The study also showed that there was a statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by HIV patients during and before the pandemic lock-down (n = 49, Z = 3.356, p = 0.00). Among 49 patients, the majority of them 34(69.39%) incurred a higher cost per visit during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic lock-down.

There was no statistical significance in the median difference of total cost incurred by asthma patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 28, Z = 1.731, p = 0.184).

BMJ Open

Similarly, there was no statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by epilepsy patients during and before the pandemic lock-down (n = 18, Z = 1.328, p = 0.184) (Table 3).

Table 3: Cost of chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care by disease types among chronic disease patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

Types of	Era of	Observation	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance level
CDs	COVID-19	(N)		(IQR)	of median cost
	Pandemic	6			difference(During-
		9			Before covid-19)
HTN	Before	211	10.03(11.86)	7.58(7.53)	Z = 3.632,
	During	211	12.65(10.42)	10.14(8.74)	p = 0.001
DM	Before	169	10.64(8.42)	8.12(9.26)	Z = 3.095,
	During	169	13.56(10.49)	11.39(10.87)	p = 0.002
HF	Before	61	12.64(12.85)	9.06(8.53)	Z = -0.055,
	During	61	12.51(11.34)	8.2(12.52)	p = 0.956
Mental disease	Before	49	13.08(8.97)	11.63(10.10)	Z = -1.497,
	During	49	10.91(8.45)	8.86(10.24)	p = 0.134
HIV	Before	49	7.37(6.65)	6.12(6.76)	Z = 3.356,
	During	49	16.58(18.32)	12.24(14.25)	p = 0.000
Asthma	Before	28	8.95(6.40)	7.33(10.68)	Z = 1.731,
	During	28	12.92(12.34)	10.34(8.18)	p =0.184

4	
6	
7 8	
9	303
10 11	304
12 13	305
14 15 16	306
17 18	307
19 20	308
21 22	309
23 24 25	310
26 27	311
28 29	312
30 31 32	313
33 34	314
35 36	315
37 38	316
40 41	317
42 43	318
44 45 46	319
40 47 48	320
49 50	321
51 52	322
53 54 55	323
56 57	324
58 59 60	

Epilepsy	Before	18	7.70(7.01)	5.70(11.18)	Z = 1.328,
	During	18	10.44(5.74)	10.00(9.84)	p =0.184

Note: 1US\$ = 35.99 ETB, August, 2020; SD: Standard Deviation; IQR: Interquartile Range

#### 305 **Discussion**

This study was aimed to determine the impact of COVID-19 pandemic on cost of chronic diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. The study found that, the cost of follow-up treatment and care among chronic disease patients during COVID-19 pandemic was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era.

This indicated that, more than half of the chronic patients, 58.7%, incurred a .1 2 significantly higher total cost during the pandemic lock-down compared to before the pandemic. This finding supports the study's findings that chronic illness costs .3 account for more than 75% of total healthcare costs in high-income countries.<sup>18, 19</sup> .4 .5 During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19, and this resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with .6 .7 CDs.<sup>9, 10, 20</sup> This could be explained by the fact that the global pandemic's disruption of the health-care system may impose additional costs on CD patients. .8

The study revealed that the non-medical cost during the follow-up visit per patient during the era of COVID-19 was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic era by the same patients, which was doubled during the pandemic. This significant difference probably might be due to a strict lock-down that could affect these patients adversely as they require regular follow-up visits that lead to further health consequences and additional costs.<sup>21,22</sup> Page 19 of 25

#### **BMJ** Open

Transportation costs were one of the cost categories that doubled during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost per patient per visit of this cost category during the pandemic era was significantly increased by two folds. This could be due to the fact that the government restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid a temporary restriction on public transport across-regions and cities.<sup>13, 21</sup>

The study discovered a significant median cost difference in medical costs, with the median of this cost category increasing by 15.6% during the pandemic. This finding is in line with the study report that revealed that before the pandemic, one in three Americans did not take their medications as prescribed because of high costs, but during a global pandemic, forgoing medications involves even more risks for chronic care patients and incurs even higher costs in the long run.<sup>23</sup>

The study also evaluated the illness cost of each selected chronic disease. Accordingly, for the follow-up care of HTN patients, the patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic, which was raised by 33.76% during the pandemic. The cost incurred before the COVIDpandemic was almost comparable with other study reports, but the cost incurred during the pandemic was higher than the study report on the cost of hypertension before the COVID-19 lockdown in Ethiopia.<sup>24</sup>

Again, the study showed that the cost of DM follow-up visit per patient during the pandemic lock-down was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by 40.53%. However, before and during the COVID-19 lock-down, the cost of DM in this study was lower than the study reports in Ethiopia.<sup>15, 25</sup> This variation could be attributed to differences in DM complications and treatment among study participants. 

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Despite HIV care and treatment being an exempted service in Ethiopia, patients incurred nonmedical costs. The study revealed that the cost incurred by HIV patients for follow-up treatment and care per visit per patient during the pandemic lock-down was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by two folds. The cost of HIV treatment and care reported in the study was higher than in other Ethiopian studies.<sup>26, 27</sup>

However, there was no significant statistical median cost difference for the follow-up care of heart failure, mental illness, asthma, and epilepsy during and before the pandemic; a slight median cost difference was observed during and before the pandemic.

#### **Conclusion**

This study revealed that the total cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic lock-down was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era among the same patients. A comprehensive package of chronic disease treatment and care is demanded at different levels of health facilities in the health system of the country. Therefore, healthcare providers, hospital administrators and the local government should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the services at proximal health facilities.

#### **Declarations**

# 370 Authors Contribution and Conflict of interests

All authors made substantial contributions to conception and design, acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; took part in drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; gave final approval of the version to be published; and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

1 2		
- 3 4	375	All authors declared that they have no conflicts of interest related to this work.
5 6	376	Consent for Publication
7 8 9	377	NA
9 10 11 12	378	Availability of Data and Materials
13 14	379	All the data supporting the study's findings are within the manuscript. Additional
15 16	380	detailed information and raw data will be shared upon request addressed to the
17 18 10	381	corresponding author.
20 21 22	382	Funding
22 23 24	383	This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public,
25 26	384	commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.
27 28 29 30 31	385	Acknowledgments
	386	Researchers would like to acknowledge all participants in the study and respective
32 33	387	administrative bodies from top to bottom for their due cooperation and involvement.
34 35	388	Acronyms
36 37 28	389	ETB: Ethiopian Birr, HF: Heart Failure, HIV: Human Immune Virus, HTN:
39 40	390	Hypertension, LMICs: Low-and-middle-income countries, NCDs: Non-communicable
41 42	391	diseases, OOP: Out-of-pocket, WHO: World Health Organization
43 44	392	References
45 46	393	[1]. World Health Organization. A guide to implementation research in the prevention
47 48 49	394	and control of Non-communicable diseases. Geneva; Switzerland World Health
50 51	395	Organization; 2016.
52 53	396	[2].World Health Organization. Overview preventing chronic diseases: a vital
54 55	397	investment. Switzerland: 2004.
56 57 58	398	[3].The World Bank. Human Development Network. The growing danger of non-
59 60	399	communicable diseases. Acting now to reverse course; 2011.

Page 22 of 25

BMJ Open

1 2 3

3 4	400	[4].Santosa, A, Byass, P. Diverse empirical evidence on epidemiological transition in
5 6	401	low-and middle-income countries: population-based findings from INDEPTH network
7 8 0	402	data. PLoS One 2016; 11, e0155753.
9 10 11	403	[5].World Health Organization. The double burden: Emerging epidemics and
12 13	404	persistent problems. World Health Report; 1999.
14 15	405	[6].Murray, C. J., Lopez, A. D. The global burden of disease: a comprehensive
16 17 18	406	assessment of mortality and disability from diseases, injuries, and risk factors in
19 20	407	1990 and projected to 2020: summary. Harvard School of Public Health on behalf of
21 22	408	the World Health Organization and the World Bank; 1996.
23 24 25	409	[7].Bollyky, T. J., Templin, T., Cohen, M., et al. Lower-income countries that face the
26 27	410	most rapid shift in non-communicable disease burden are also the least prepared.
28 29	411	Health Aff. 2017: 36, 1866–1875.
30 31 32	412	[8].Engelgau MM, El-Saharty S, Kudesia P, et al. Capitalizing on the demographic
32 33 34	413	transition: tackling non-communicable diseases in South Asia: The World Bank;
35 36	414	2011.
37 38	415	[9].World Health Organization. Information note on COVID-19 and non-
39 40 41	416	communicable diseases. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/
42 43	417	covid-19-and-ncds Accessed on July 21, 2020.
44 45	418	[10].Yogini V, Clare L, Francesco Z, et al. Impact of COVID-19 on routine care for
46 47 48	419	chronic diseases: A global survey of views from healthcare professionals; 2020.
49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57	420	[11].Fagan M. Huge fall in non-Covid hospital admissions and attendances. Irish
	421	Examiner; 2020.
	422	[12].Julian C, Rebecca McG. Spillover Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic Could
	423	Drive Long-Term Health Consequences for Non-COVID-19 Patients. Health Affairs;
58 59	424	2020.

21

Page 23 of 25

**BMJ** Open

425 [13].Strategic Partnership for International Health Regulations and Health Security
426 school of public health: COVID-19 Preparedness Bulletin Ethiopia; 2020. Available
427 at: https://extranet.who.int/sph/news/covid-19-preparedness-bulletin-ethiopia.

428 [14].Tamirat MA, Workeabeba A, Alemayehu W, et al. The Impact of COVID-19 on
 429 Care Seeking Behavior of Patients at Tertiary Care Follow-up Clinics: A Cross 430 Sectional Telephone Survey. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; 2020. medRxiv preprint doi:
 431 https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.11.25.20236224; 2020.

432 [15].Alemu Z, Workneh BD, Mohammed SA, et al. Economic Assessment of Direct
433 Cost of Illness of Diabetes Mellitus at Dessie Referral Hospital, North East
434 Ethiopia.2020. Int J Diabetes Clin Res 7:122. doi.org/10.23937/2377-3634/1410122
435 [16].Stanley L, David W. Hosmer Jr, et al. Adequacy of Sample Size in Health
436 Studies. World Health Organization. 1990; pp36-39.

437 [17].Abhijit P. Health Economic Evaluation Methods Techniques. IOSR Journal of
 438 Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF). 2016; 7:1-9.

439 [18].Glynn LG., Valderas JM., Healy P., et al. The prevalence of multimorbidity in
 440 primary care and its effect on health care utilization and cost. J of Family Pract.
 441 2011; 28:516–23.

442 [19].Nuno R., Coleman K., Bengoa R., et al. Integrated care for chronic conditions:
 45 443 the contribution of the ICCC Framework. Health Policy 2012; 105:55–64.

444 [20].Baird B. How has general practice responded to the Covid-19 (coronavirus)
 445 outbreak? The `Kings Fund. Available at:https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2020/
 446 04/covid-19-general-practice. Accessed on June 25, 2020.

447 [21].Finet P, Le Bouquin Jeannes R, Dameron O, et al. Review of current
 448 telemedicine applications for chronic diseases. Toward a more integrated system?
 449 Irbm 2015;36.

**BMJ** Open

2 3 4	450	[22].French J.A., Brodie M.J., Caraballo R., et al. Keeping people with epilepsy safe
5 6	451	during the Covid-19 pandemic. Neurology. 2020; 94:1032–1037. doi:
7 8	452	10.1212/WNL.0000000000009632.
9 10 11	453	[23].Valenz. The Effects of COVID-19 on Chronic Disease Management and Five
12 13	454	Solutions Insurers Should Embrace; 2020.
14 15	455	[24].Zawudie AB, Lemma TD, Daka DW. Cost of Hypertension Illness and
16 17 18	456	Associated Factors Among Patients Attending Hospitals in Southwest Shewa Zone,
19 20	457	Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. ClinicoEconomics and Outcomes Research
21 22	458	2020:12 201–211.
23 24 25	459∙	[25].Samson O, Amarech G, Mulugeta T, et al. economic burden of diabetes mellitus
26 27	460	to diabetic patients and their families attending health facilities in Addis ababa.2020.
28 29 20	461	Ethiopian Medical Journal 58(3).
30 31 32	462•	[26].Berman, P; Alebachew, A; Mann, C; Agarwal, A; Abdella, E. 2016. Costs of
33 34	463	Publicly Funded Primary Hospitals, Departments, and Exempted Services in Ethiopia
35 36 27	464	Supplement to Paper 1 with expanded sample of primary hospitals. Harvard T.H.
37 38 39	465	Chan School of Public Health; Breakthrough International Consultancy, PLC: Boston,
40 41	466	Massachusetts and Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
42 43	467•	[27].Asfaw DB, Degu J, Bjarne R, et al. Cost estimates of HIV care and treatment
44 45 46	468	with and without anti-retroviral therapy at Arba Minch Hospital in southern Ethiopia.
47 48	469	Cost Effectiveness and Resource Allocation 2009, 7:6 doi:10.1186/1478-7547-7-6.
49 50		
51 52		
53		
54 55		
56 57		
57		
59		
00		

1

 BMJ Open

	ST	ROBE 2007 (v4) Statement—Checklist of items that should be included in reports of <i>cross-sectional studies</i>	
Section/Topic	ltem #	Recommendation	Reported on page #
Title and abstract	1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
		(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	2
Introduction			
Background/rationale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported	3-4
Objectives	3	State specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses	2
Methods			
Study design	4	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	5
Setting	5	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	5
Participants	6	(a) Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection of participants	6
Variables	7	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if applicable	7
Data sources/ measurement	8*	For each variable of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of assessment (measurement). Describe comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one group	-
Bias	9	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	-
Study size	10	Explain how the study size was arrived at	6
Quantitative variables	11	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen and why	8
Statistical methods	12	(a) Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	8
		(b) Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	-
		(c) Explain how missing data were addressed	8
		(d) If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of sampling strategy	-
		(e) Describe any sensitivity analyses	-
Results			

Participants	13*	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility,	-
		confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	
		(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	-
		(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	-
Descriptive data	14*	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	8
		confounders	
		(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	-
Outcome data	15*	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	-
Main results	16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	-
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included	
		(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	-
		(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	-
Other analyses	17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses	-
Discussion			
Key results	18	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	12-14
Limitations	19	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and	15
		magnitude of any potential bias	
Interpretation	20	Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from	-
		similar studies, and other relevant evidence	
Generalisability	21	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results	-
Other information			
Funding	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable, for the original study on		16
		which the present article is based	

\*Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

**Note:** An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

# **BMJ Open**

#### Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia: A hospital-based, cross-sectional study

Journal:	BMJ Open		
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2022-070195.R2		
Article Type:	Original research		
Date Submitted by the Author:	08-Sep-2023		
Complete List of Authors:	Terefa, Dufera; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Edosa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Tolessa, Belachew; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences Desisa, Adisu; Wallaga University, Public Health Olani, Wolkite ; Wallaga University, Public Health Fetensa, Getahun; Wallaga University, Department of Nursing Chego, Melese ; Wallaga University, Public Health Abdisa, Eba ; Wallaga University, School of Nursing Turi, Ebisa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Bekuma, Tariku Tesfaye; Wallaga University, Department of Public health Getachew, Motuma; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Lensa ; Wallaga University, Public Health		
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Health policy		
Secondary Subject Heading:	Health economics, Health policy, Health services research, Infectious diseases, Public health		
Keywords:	Health Equity, Decision Making, EPIDEMIOLOGY, Health Services Accessibility, HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT		

# SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

reliez oni

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

1

2 3	1	Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic diseases treatment and				
4 5	2	care at public hospitals in Wallaga zones. Oromia Regional State Ethionia: A				
6 7	2					
8 9	3	nospital-based, cross-sectional study				
10 11 12 13	4	Dufera Rikitu Terefa <sup>1</sup> , Edosa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Belachew Etana <sup>1</sup> , Adisu Ewunetu <sup>1</sup> , Wolkite				
	5	Olani <sup>1</sup> , Getahun Fetensa <sup>2</sup> , Melese Chego <sup>1</sup> , Eba Abdisa <sup>2</sup> , Ebisa Turi <sup>1</sup> , Tariku				
14 15 16	6	Tesfaye Bekuma <sup>1</sup> , Motuma Getachew <sup>1</sup> , Lensa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Temesgen Tilahun <sup>3</sup>				
16 17 18	7	<sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University,				
19 20	8	Nekemte, Ethiopia				
21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40	9	<sup>2</sup> School of Nursing, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,				
	10	Ethiopia				
	11	<sup>3</sup> School of Medicine, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,				
	12	Ethiopia				
	13	Co-author contact details:				
	14	Edosa Tesfaye, E-mail: edosatesfaye2019@yahoo.com				
	15	Belachew Etana, E-mail:ba.etana@gmail.com				
	16	Adisu Ewunetu, E-mail:adisuewunetu2019@gmail.com				
	17	Wolkite Olani, E-mail: walkiteolani2020@gmail.com				
42 43	18	Getahun Fetensa, E-mail: fetensagetahun@gmail.com				
44 45	19	Melese Chego, E-mail: melese_chego@yahoo.com				
46 47	20	Eba Abdisa, E-mail: ebaabdisa@rocketmail.com				
48 49 50	21	Ebisa Turi, E-mail: ebakoturi@gmail.com				
51 52	22	Tariku Tesfaye Bekuma, E-mail: tarii2007@gmail.com				
53 54	23	Motuma Getachew, E-mail: motyamo@gmail.com				
55 56	24	Lensa Tesfaye, E-mail: lenlove539@gmail.com				
57 58 59	25	Temesgen Tilahun, E-mail: ttamuko@yahoo.com				
00						

**BMJ** Open

26 Corresponding author contact details:

- 27 Full name: Dufera Rikitu Terefa
- P.O.Box=395, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia.
- 29 Tel. (+251)-922260706
- 30 E-mail:duferarikitu24@gmail.com
- 31 Abstract

**Introduction:** Globally, around one third of the population has at least one long-term health condition that could be affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. Despite, studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization, the impact of the pandemic on cost of chronic disease treatment and care from a patient perspective was scanty. So, the study aimed to determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on cost of chronic diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia, from August 1 to 31, 2020. 

Globally, around one-third of the population has at least one long-term health condition that could be affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. Despite studies revealing the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization, the impact of the pandemic on the cost of chronic disease treatment and care from a patient perspective was scanty. So, the study aimed to determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic disease treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia, from August 1 to 31, 2020. 

Methods: An institutional-based cross-sectional study design was used, and the
sample size for the study (n = 642) was determined using a single population mean
formula. Data was collected using interviews and analyzed using SPSS version 25.

> Descriptive statistics were performed, and the cost of follow-up care before and after the pandemic was compared using a related-samples Wilcoxon signed-rank test, declaring the level of significance of the median cost difference at P<0.05.

> **Results:** A total of 642 patients were included in the study, of whom 605 (94.2%) responded to the interviews. There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of chronic diseases among follow-up patients during the pandemic and the costs incurred by these patients before the pandemic.

58 Conclusion: The cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the 59 COVID-19 pandemic was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era. 60 Therefore, healthcare providers should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for 61 chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the 62 services at proximal health facilities.

Keywords: COVID-19 Pandemic, Chronic Disease, Cost of Illness, Follow up care,
Ethiopia

65 Strengths and Limitations of the Study

- A less costly and time-consuming retrospective costing approach was used.
- The cost of illness analysis in this study was limited to the patients' perspective.
- The study did not include the costs experienced by patients who were employed before the pandemic but then lost their jobs.
- Children less than 15 years of age and the elderly greater than 65 years of age
   were not included in the valuation of lost work days in the cost estimation.
- There might also be a recall bias.

# 73 Background

Chronic diseases (CDs) are the major public health problems that account for 60% of all deaths (35% in low- and middle-income countries). [1-3] including Ethiopia, many low and middle-income countries (LMICs) are undergoing a gradual epidemiologic transition as the disease burden shifts from infectious to non-communicable diseases (NCDs). [4-6] Healthcare systems in these countries are mostly unprepared to handle the increasing burden of these diseases, resulting in no or limited access to affordable prevention and diagnosis of NCDs. [7] These challenges add up to higher NCD treatment costs, whose financing mostly comes from households' out-of-pocket (OOP) spending. [8] 

The COVID-19 pandemic was also another challenge that disrupted entire societies, including the routine health care systems in Ethiopia. The comprehensive effort to contain the pandemic and minimize the subsequent morbidity and mortality has affected both the continuity and quality of care. [9] During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources were focused on COVID-19 prevention and control. This resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs in this era. Diabetes, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, hypertension, heart disease, asthma, cancer, and depression were some of the conditions reported to be most impacted by the reduction in healthcare resources due to the pandemic. [10] Resources at all levels have shifted away from CDs management and prevention during the outbreak, and the lockdown of many services has translated into reduced access, a decrease in referrals, and reduced hospitalizations of patients with non-COVID-19 pathology. [11] As the pandemic continues to rapidly spread, attention often focuses on the numbers of confirmed and probable cases, hospitalizations, and deaths, which can be called the "direct" effects of the pandemic. However, these 

numbers do not capture the full extent of the pandemic because it has also generated
 important spillover (indirect) effects by decreasing the supply of and altering patient
 demand for non-COVID-19-related medical care. [12]

In Ethiopia, the government declared a state of emergency, labeling the pandemic a national threat and launching overall preventive measures, including advising the community to stay at home, practicing strict and frequent hand washing, and wearing a face mask. Also, it restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid temporary restrictions on market places, restaurants, shops, cinema houses, religious institutions, and cities. [13] During this time, the number of hospital visits dropped sharply to utilize health services, including CD follow-up. [14] Many studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization. But there has been little emphasis on the impact of the pandemic on the costs of chronic disease follow-up care from a patient perspective. So, the study aimed to determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients at public hospitals. 

**Methods and Materials** 

<sup>0</sup> 114 Study Design and Setting

An institutional-based cross-sectional study design was used to conduct this study. It was conducted from August 1 to 31, 2020, in the three wallage zones, namely, East Wallaga, West Wallaga, and Horro Guduru Wallaga zones, of Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. These three Wallaga zones are among the twenty-one zones of the Oromia region and were found in the western direction of the region, Oromia. The capital towns of east Wallaga zone, Nekemte town; west Wallaga zone, Gimbi town; and Horro Guduru Wallaga zone, Shambu town, were located 333km, 441km, and 314km west of Addis Ababa, the capital city of Ethiopia, respectively. 

2 3 4	123	Study Participants
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	124	All chronic disease patients who visited public hospitals in the Wallaga Zones were
	125	the source population, and all patients who visited the three Wallaga Zones' selected
	126	study hospitals during the study period were the study population.
	127	Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria
14 15	128	All patients from the selected CDs in the study area who visited the study hospitals
16 17 18	129	were included in the study. Patients whose age was less than 15 years old and
19 20	130	without accompanying parents who were seriously ill and unable to respond to the
21 22	131	interviews were excluded from the study.
23 24 25	132	Sample Size and Sampling Methods
26 27	133	The sample size was determined by using the single population mean formula,
28 29	134	applying the following assumptions: two-sided alpha error ( $\epsilon$ ) set at 0.05, 95%
30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42	135	confidence level, mean cost of DM ( $\mu$ ) = 48.99 ETB, and standard deviation (SD) =
	136	30.89 ETB[15], adding a 5% non-response rate.
	137	Using the formula, n = $\frac{(z - \alpha/2)^{2 * \sigma^2}}{\epsilon^{2\mu^2}}$
	138	Among thirteen public hospitals in the study area, data was collected from the
	139	selected CDs of follow-up care patients from Nekemte specialized hospitals, Sire
43 44 45	140	hospital, Gida hospital, Arjo hospital, Shambu hospital, Guduru hospital, Gimbi
46 47	141	hospital, and Nedjo hospital, which were selected using a simple random sampling
48 49	142	technique.
50 51	143	The determined sample size was allocated to each study hospital proportionally
52 53	144	based on the proportion of CD patients who attended follow-up care. Wallaga
55 56	145	University referral hospital was purposely excluded from the study, which was an
57 58	146	isolation and treatment center for COVID-19 during the study period, and four other
59 60	147	hospitals were excluded due to their low CD patient flow.

Finally, a simple random sampling technique was used from the registration book to sample patients at each study hospital as per their proportion to select 642 participants. 

**Data Collection** 

The structured questionnaire was developed in English after reviewing relevant literature, and it was translated into Afan Oromo. Data collection and supervision were carried out by eight data collectors, with four supervisors assigned. These data collectors and supervisors were trained before the pre-test and actual data collection started. The questionnaires were pre-tested in Bedele Hospital using 32 (5%) of the determined sample size. It was collected through a face-to-face interview. Patients who completed their chronic outpatient services and returned to leave the study hospitals were interviewed. 

**Study Variables** 

Socio-demographic and economic characteristics, health service costs (non-medical costs; transportation, food, accommodation, and income lost, and medical costs; registration, consultation, laboratory, radiology, and drugs) were assessed and determined. 

#### **Operational Definitions**

Before COVID-19: The period before March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first confirmed COVID-19 positive case.

Chronic disease follow-up patients: A patient visited the study hospital for the follow-up care of one of the following: hypertension (HTN), diabetes mellitus (DM), heart failure (HF), mental illness, HIV (Human Immune Virus), stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.

Chronic disease: any of the following illnesses that persist over time, can gradually

2							
3 4		progress, do not resolve spontaneously, and may not be cured: HTN, DM, HF,					
5 6		mental illness, HIV, stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.[14]					
7 8 9	Direct costs: the expenditures in ETB spent by chronic disease patients families on the diagnosis and treatment of chronic illness per prescr						
10 11							
12 13		physicians in the study hospitals.					
14 15 16		During COVID-19: the period after March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first					
16 17 18		confirmed COVID-19 positive case.					
19 20		Indirect costs: the number of productive days lost by patients and their families as					
21 22		a result of chronic illness treatment and care.					
23 24 25		Medical cost: the cost component of chronic disease patients' follow-up visits at					
26 27		study hospitals that includes registration, laboratory, radiology, and drug costs.					
28 29		Non-medical cost: the cost component that includes transportation, food,					
30 31 32		accommodation, and income lost among chronic disease patients during					
33 34 35		follow-up visits at study hospitals.					
36 37 38	165	Data Analysis					
39 40	166	Data was entered into Epi-data version 3.1 and exported to SPSS version 25					
41 42	167	software for analysis. Descriptive statistics were performed for all study variables					
43 44 45	168	based on their characteristics. The bottom-up costing approach was used to					
45 46 47	169	estimate the direct cost of the follow-up visit with respect to the patient's perspective,					
48 49	170	and the indirect costs (income lost due to productive time lost) were estimated using					
50 51 52	171	earnings lost both before and during the COVID-19 pandemic. [17] The time					
52 53 54 55 56	172	foregone and productive time lost were converted into indirect costs based on the					
	173	daily wage rate and then multiplied by the number of working days lost. The daily					
57 58	174	wage rate for patients was estimated by dividing their monthly income by 30 days for					
59 60	175	both patients and caregivers. [17] All costs included in the analysis were measured in					

terms of Ethiopian Birr (ETB) and were converted to US\$(US dollar) during the
analysis, and the average currency exchange rate was (August 2020; *1* US\$ = *35.99 ETB*).

Finally, the normality distribution of treatment cost data was checked, and it was not normally distributed. As a result, non-parametric tests were used to analyze the median cost for each cost category, as well as a 2-paired sample Wilcoxon sign rank test to compare the costs incurred before and during the pandemic lockdown, with the level of significance of the median cost difference set at p<0.05.

## 184 Ethical consideration

An appropriate research ethical approval was obtained from the ethical review board of Wallaga University, Institute of Health Sciences (Reference number: IRB/233/2020). The study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. The guestionnaire was designed to be anonymous, and the result did not identify the personalities of the respondents; rather, it was presented in the aggregated statistics. Written consent was obtained from the study participants. The data was kept in protected and safe locations. Paper-based data was kept in a locked cabinet, and computer-based data was password-secured. Data sharing was enacted based on the ethical and legal rules of data sharing, and it was not accessed by a third party except the research teams. 

<sup>2</sup> 195 Patient and Public Involvement

196 None

2 3 4	197	Results							
5 6	198	Socio-demograp							
7 8 0	605 responded to								
9 10 11	200	the interview, yield	ding a 94.2% response rate. A	n almost equal nur	nber of males and				
12 13	201	females participat	ed in the study. More than h	half of the participa	ints, 352 (58.2%),				
14 15 16	202	were from urban a	areas, and the majority of them	n, 421 (69.6%), wer	e married.				
17 18	203	Results         Socio-demographic Characteristics         A total of 642 patients were included in the study, among whom 605 responded to the interview, yielding a 94.2% response rate. An almost equal number of males and females participated in the study. More than half of the participants, 352 (58.2%), were from urban areas, and the majority of them, 421 (69.6%), were married.         Regarding the educational status of the participants, 137 (22.6%) were illiterates (Table 1). The average participant's age was 43.29 (SD=16.5) years, the average monthly income was 84.32 (SD=70.65) US dollars, and the average household size was 4.46 (SD=3.43).         Table 1: Socio-demographic characteristics and classification of study participants by chronic diseases conditions in the public hospitals of the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional State, Ethiopia 2020 (N= 605)         Characteristics (N= 605)       Frequency (n)       Percentage (%)         Sex       Male       302       49.9         Female       303       50.1         Residence place       Urban       352       58.2         Rural       253       41.8         Marital status       Single       130       21.5         Marital status       Single       130       21.5							
19 20	204	(Table 1).The average participant's age was 43.29 (SD=16.5) years, the average monthly income was 84.32 (SD=70.65) US dollars, and the average household size was 4.46 (SD=3.43)							
21 22 23	205	monthly income w	vas 84.32 (SD=70.65) US doll	lars, and the average	ge household size				
23 24 25	206	was 4.46 (SD=3.43).							
26 27	207	Table 1: Socio-demographic characteristics and classification of study participants by							
28 29 20	208	chronic diseases conditions in the public hospitals of the three Wallaga zones,							
30 31 32	209	Oromia National Regional State, Ethiopia 2020 (N= 605)							
33 34		Characteristics (N= 605) Frequency (n) Percentage (%)							
35 36 27		Sex	Male	302	49.9				
37 38 39			Female	303	50.1				
40 41		Residence place	Urban	352	58.2				
42 43 44			Rural	253	41.8				
44 45 46		Marital status	Single	130	21.5				
47 48			Married	421	69.6				
49 50 51			Separated	7	1.2				
52 53			Divorced	2	0.3				
54 55		45	7.4						
56 57 58		Religion	Orthodox	165	27.3				
50									

	Muslim	59	9.8
	Protestant	373	61.7
	Others	8	1.3
Ethnic group	Oromo	552	91.2
	Amhara	48	7.9
	Gurage	4	0.7
	Tigre	1	0.2
Educational	Illiterate	137	22.6
status	Read &Write	102	16.9
	Grade 1-8	99	16.4
	Grade 9-8	151	25.0
	Diploma and above	116	19.2
Employment	Government employee	93	15.4
status	NGO* employee	89	14.7
	Merchant	100	16.5
	Housewife	114	18.8
	Farmer	107	17.7
	Others**	102	16.9
Types of Chronic	Hypertension	214	35.4
diseases	Diabetic mellitus	173	28.6
	Heart failure	62	10.2
	Mental disease	51	8.4
	HIV/AIDS	50	8.3
	Asthma	29	4.8

1 2		
3 4		Epilepsy
5 6 7		Stroke
8 9	210	*NGO= non-governmental org
10 11 12	211	The Overall Cost of CD Fo
12 13 14	212	The total cost for the treatn
15 16	213	patients who incurred any on
17 18	214	10.19) US dollars, with the m
19 20 21	215	patients before the pandemic
22 23	216	follow-up visit during the pane
24 25 26	217	dollars, and the median cost v
27 28 29	218	The median income lost due
30 31	219	the pandemic was 1.48 (IQR
32 33	220	income, which was almost sin
34 35 36 37	221	during the pandemic, which w
38 39	222	The total median non-medica
40 41	223	5.55) US dollars before the pa
42 43	224	dollars among the same num
44 45 46	225	The total median transportation
47 48	226	homes was 1.141 (IQR = 1.
49 50	227	3.05) US dollars during the
51 52 53	228	transportation.
54 55	229	The total median cost incurre
56 57	230	visit was 3.43 (IQR = 4.91) US
58 59 60	231	dollars during the pandemic a
00		

 3
 0.5

 ganization, \*\* Daily laborer, students

3.0

# 11 The Overall Cost of CD Follow-up Care before and during the Pandemic

The total cost for the treatment of CDs before the COVID-19 pandemic among patients who incurred any one or more types of cost was on average 10.41 (SD = 10.19) US dollars, with the median cost of 9.76 (IQR = 8.64) US dollars among 600 patients before the pandemic. The total cost of the treatment of the diseases per follow-up visit during the pandemic among 593 patients was 13.02 (SD = 11.22) US dollars, and the median cost was 12.27 (IQR = 10.40) US dollars.

The median income lost due to productivity time lost for the treatment of CDs before the pandemic was 1.48 (IQR = 2.71 US dollars) among the 501 participants who had income, which was almost similar to the income lost when visiting the study hospitals during the pandemic, which was 1.40 (IQR = 2.85 US dollars).

The total median non-medical cost incurred for the follow-up care was 6.05 (IQR = 5.55) US dollars before the pandemic among 463 patients and 7.98 (IQR = 7.50) US dollars among the same number of patients during the pandemic.

The total median transportation cost to travel to hospitals and travel back to their homes was 1.141 (IQR = 1.94) US dollars before the pandemic and 2.29 (IQR = 3.05) US dollars during the pandemic among the 430 patients who paid for transportation.

The total median cost incurred for the accommodation and food during the follow-up
visit was 3.43 (IQR = 4.91) US dollars before the pandemic and 4.29 (IQR = 633) US
dollars during the pandemic among 199 participants.

4 5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22 22
∠⊃ 24
24 25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40 ⊿1
41 42
+∠ ⊿२
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56 57
57 50
50 59
~ ~

The total median medical cost was 3.71 (IQR = 5.22) US dollars before the pandemic, whereas it was 4.29 (IQR = 5.91) US dollars during the pandemic hospital visit among the 425 participants who paid for the prescribed drugs (Table 2).

Table 2: The overall cost of chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care before and
during the pandemic among chronic diseases patients at public hospitals in the three
Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

Cost Categories	Era of	Observa	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance
	COVID-19	tion-on		(IQR)	level of median
	Dandamia	(NI)			cost difference
	Pandemic	(IN)			(During-Before
					covid-19)
Income lost	Before	501	2.27(2.75)	1.48(2.71)	Z = 1.780,
(a)	During	501	2.25(2.72)	1.40(2.85)	p = 0.075
Transportation	Before	430	1.91(2.13)	1.14(1.94)	Z = 8.028,
(b)	During	430	3.43(4.42)	2.29(3.05)	p = 0.001
Food and	Before	199	4.67(5.05)	3.43(4.91)	Z = 1.189,
(c)	During	199	5.6(5.94)	4.29(6.33)	p = 0.169
Total nonmedical	Before	463	4.58(5.35)	6.05(5.55)	Z = 4.903,
(a+b+c) = (d)	During	463	6.81(7.58)	7.98(7.50)	p = 0.001
Total medical	Before	425	5.51(8.43)	3.71(5.22)	Z = 2.382,
cost (e)	During	425	5.93(7.81)	4.29(5.91)	p = 0.017
Total cost per	Before	600	10.41(10.19)	9.76(8.64)	Z = 5.05,
patient per visit	During	593	13.02(11.22)	12.27(10.40)	p=0.001
(d+e)					
Note: 1US\$ = 35.99 ETB, August, 2020; SD: Standard Deviation; IQR: Interquartile					

59 239 Range 60

Page 15 of 26

#### 240 Cost Difference Based on COVID-19 Pandemic

There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of follow-up care during the COVID-19 pandemic lockdown and the costs incurred before the pandemic (Table 3). This showed that 348 out of 593 (58.7%) patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost of follow-up care during the pandemic was 12.27 (IQR = 10.40) US dollars, compared to 9.76 (IQR = 8.64) US dollars before the COVID-19 pandemic.

The study showed that there was no significant median difference in income lost among patients who had income during and before the pandemic (n = 501, Z =1.780, p = 0.075). The median income lost during the pandemic was 1.48 (IQR = 2.71 US dollars) compared to the income lost before the pandemic, which was 1.40 (IQR = 2.85 US dollars).

There was a significant median cost difference in non-medical costs per patient during and before the pandemic (n = 463, Z = 4.903, p = 0.001). This showed significantly higher costs were incurred by more than half of the patients, 276 (59.61%), during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median nonmedical cost observed among the patients was 7.98 (IQR = 7.50) and 6.05 (IQR = 5.55) US dollars per follow-up visit during and before the pandemic, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median cost difference of food and accommodation incurred during and before the pandemic (n = 199, Z = 1.189, p = 0.169), and the median of this cost category was 4.29 (IQR = 6.33) and 3.13 (IQR = 4.91) US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down, respectively.
> The majority of the patients, 289 (67.2%), paid higher transportation fees when they visited hospitals during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference in transportation costs during and before the pandemic (n = 430, Z = 8.028, p = 0.00), which was explained by the fact that the median transportation cost was 1.14 (IQR = 1.94) US dollars and 2.29 (IQR = 3.05) US dollars during and before the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of the patients, 236 (55.5%), incurred higher costs for medical services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference during and before the pandemic (n = 425, Z = 2.382, p = 0.017), in which the median cost was 4.29 (IQR = 5.91) and 3.71 (IQR = 5.22) US dollars during and before the pandemic lockdown.

The study showed that the majority of the hypertensive (HTN) patients, 128 (60.7%), paid a high amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic among the 211 patients who paid for the services. There was a significant median cost difference per visit during and before the pandemic (n = 211, Z = 3.632, p = 0.00). The median cost observed among these patients was 7.58 (IQR = 7.53) and 10.14 (IQR = 8.74) US per follow-up visit before and during the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of diabetes mellitus (DM) patients (59.17%) paid higher costs for services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The total cost incurred by these patients was significantly higher during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic (n = 169, Z = 3.095, p = 0.002). The median cost was 11.39 (IQR = 10.87) and 8.11 (IQR = 9.26) US dollars during and before the pandemic lockdown, respectively.

Page 17 of 26

**BMJ** Open

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by heart failure (HF) patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 61, Z = -0.055, p = 0.956). Among 61 HF patients, only 31 (50.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. Similarly, there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by patients who visited the hospitals for mental health follow-up for the treatment of diseases during and before the pandemic era (n = 41, Z =-1.497, p = 0.134). Among 41 patients, only 20 (40.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic. The study also showed that there was a statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by HIV patients during and before the pandemic lockdown (n = 49, Z = 3.356, p = 0.00). Among 49 patients, the majority of them 34(69.39%) incurred a higher cost per visit during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic lockdown. There was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by asthma patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 28, Z = 1.731, p = 0.184). Similarly, there was no statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by epilepsy patients during and before the pandemic lockdown (n = 18, Z = 1.328, p 

 $\frac{1}{5}$  306 = 0.184) (Table 3).

Table 3: Cost of chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care by disease types
among chronic disease patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones,
Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Types of	Era of	Observation	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance level
CDs	COVID-19	(N)		(IQR)	of median cost
	Pandemic				difference(During-
					Before covid-19)
HTN	Before	211	10.03(11.86)	7.58(7.53)	Z = 3.632,
	During	211	12.65(10.42)	10.14(8.74)	p = 0.001
DM	Before	169	10.64(8.42)	8.12(9.26)	Z = 3.095,
	During	169	13.56(10.49)	11.39(10.87)	p = 0.002
HF	Before	61	12.64(12.85)	9.06(8.53)	Z = -0.055,
	During	61	12.51(11.34)	8.2(12.52)	p = 0.956
Mental disease	Before	49	13.08(8.97)	11.63(10.10)	Z = -1.497,
	During	49	10.91(8.45)	8.86(10.24)	p = 0.134
HIV	Before	49	7.37(6.65)	6.12(6.76)	Z = 3.356,
	During	49	16.58(18.32)	12.24(14.25)	p = 0.000
Asthma	Before	28	8.95(6.40)	7.33(10.68)	Z = 1.731,
	During	28	12.92(12.34)	10.34(8.18)	p =0.184
Epilepsy	Before	18	7.70(7.01)	5.70(11.18)	Z = 1.328,
	During	18	10.44(5.74)	10.00(9.84)	p =0.184

311 Range

# 312 Discussion

This study was aimed at determining the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic disease treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Page 19 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

315 Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. The study found that the cost of follow-up 316 treatment and care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic 317 was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era.

This indicated that more than half of the chronic patients, 58.7%, incurred a significantly higher total cost during the pandemic lockdown compared to before the pandemic. This finding supports the study's findings that chronic illness costs account for more than 75% of total healthcare costs in high-income countries. [18, 19] However, this study was conducted during the COVID-19 pandemic and in a low-income country, but these studies were not conducted at the time of the pandemic and were also conducted in high-income countries. During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19, and this resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs. [9, 10, 20] This could be explained by the fact that the global pandemic's disruption of the health care system may impose additional costs on CD patients. 

The study revealed that the non-medical cost during the follow-up visit per patient during the era of COVID-19 was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic era by the same patients, which was doubled during the pandemic. This significant difference might be due to a strict lockdown that could affect these patients adversely as they require regular follow-up visits that lead to further health consequences and additional costs. [21,22]

Transportation costs were one of the cost categories that doubled during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost per patient per visit of this cost category during the pandemic era was significantly increased by two folds. This could be due to the fact that the government restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid a temporary restriction on public transport acrossregions and cities. [13, 21]

The study discovered a significant median cost difference in medical costs, with the median of this cost category increasing by 15.6% during the pandemic. This finding is in line with the study report that revealed that before the pandemic, one in three Americans did not take their medications as prescribed because of high costs, but during a global pandemic, forgoing medications involves even more risks for chronic care patients and incurs even higher costs in the long run. [23] However, comparing study findings in this study setting with those in a high-resource setting is taken as a weakness of this study. 

The study also evaluated the cost of each selected chronic disease. Accordingly, for the follow-up care of HTN patients, the patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic, which were raised by 33.76% during the pandemic. The cost incurred before the COVID pandemic was almost comparable with other study reports, but the cost incurred during the pandemic was higher than the study report on the cost of hypertension before the COVID-19 lockdown in Ethiopia. [24] 

Again, the study showed that the cost of DM follow-up visits per patient during the pandemic lockdown was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by 40.53%. However, before and during the COVID-19 lockdown, the cost of DM in this study was lower than the study reported in Ethiopia. [15, 25] This variation could be attributed to differences in DM complications and treatment among study participants. 

<sup>56</sup> 362 Despite HIV care and treatment being an exempted service in Ethiopia, patients
 <sup>58</sup> 363 incurred nonmedical costs. The study revealed that the cost incurred by HIV patients

Page 21 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

for follow-up treatment and care per visit per patient during the pandemic lock-down
was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was
increased by two folds. The cost of HIV treatment and care reported in the study was
higher than in other Ethiopian studies. [26, 27]

However, there was no significant statistical median cost difference for the follow-up care of heart failure, mental illness, asthma, and epilepsy during and before the pandemic; a slight median cost difference was observed during and before the pandemic.

372 Conclusion

This study revealed that the total cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic lockdown was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era among the same patients. In this study, hypertensive patients had the greatest impact on the cost of ongoing care as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. A comprehensive package of chronic disease treatment and care is demanded at different levels of health facilities in the country's health system. Therefore, healthcare providers, hospital administrators, and the local government should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the services at proximal health facilities. 

**Declarations** 

# 383 Author's Contributionship Statement

All authors made substantial contributions to conception and design, acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; took part in drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; gave final approval of the version to be published; and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

**Conflict of Interest Statement** 

3 4	389	All authors declared that they have no conflicts of interest related to this work.
5 6 7	390	Consent for Publication
/ 8 0	391	NA
9 10 11	392	Availability of Data and Materials
12 13	393	All the data supporting the study's findings are within the manuscript. Additional
14 15 16	394	detailed information and raw data will be shared upon request addressed to the
17 18	395	corresponding author.
19 20	396	Funding
21 22 23	397	This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public,
24 25	398	commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.
26 27	399	Acknowledgments
28 29 30	400	Researchers would like to acknowledge all participants in the study and respective
31 32	401	administrative bodies from top to bottom for their due cooperation and involvement.
33 34	402	Acronyms
35 36	403	ETB: Ethiopian Birr, HF: Heart Failure, HIV: Human Immune Virus, HTN:
37 38	404	Hypertension, LMICs: Low-and-middle-income countries, NCDs: Non-communicable
39 40 41	405	diseases, OOP: Out-of-pocket, WHO: World Health Organization
42 43	406	References
44 45	407	[1]. World Health Organization. A guide to implementation research in the prevention
46 47	408	and control of Non-communicable diseases. Geneva; Switzerland World Health
48 49 50	409	Organization; 2016.
50 51 52	410	[2].World Health Organization. Overview preventing chronic diseases: a vital
53 54	411	investment. Switzerland: 2004.
55 56 57	412	[3]. The World Bank. Human Development Network. The growing danger of non-
57 58 59 60	413	communicable diseases. Acting now to reverse course; 2011.

Page 23 of 26

**BMJ** Open

[4].Santosa, A, Byass, P. Diverse empirical evidence on epidemiological transition in
low-and middle-income countries: population-based findings from INDEPTH network
data. PLoS One 2016; 11, e0155753.

417 [5].World Health Organization. The double burden: Emerging epidemics and
 418 persistent problems. World Health Report; 1999.

[6].Murray, C. J., Lopez, A. D. The global burden of disease: a comprehensive
 assessment of mortality and disability from diseases, injuries, and risk factors in
 1990 and projected to 2020: summary. Harvard School of Public Health on behalf of
 the World Health Organization and the World Bank; 1996.

423 [7].Bollyky, T. J., Templin, T., Cohen, M., et al. Lower-income countries that face the
 424 most rapid shift in non-communicable disease burden are also the least prepared.
 425 Health Aff. 2017: 36, 1866–1875.

426 [8].Engelgau MM, El-Saharty S, Kudesia P, et al. Capitalizing on the demographic
 427 transition: tackling non-communicable diseases in South Asia: The World Bank;
 428 2011.

429 [9].World Health Organization. Information note on COVID-19 and non-40 430 communicable diseases. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/ 41 431 covid-19-and-ncds Accessed on July 21, 2020.

432 [10].Yogini V, Clare L, Francesco Z, et al. Impact of COVID-19 on routine care for
 6
 7 433 chronic diseases: A global survey of views from healthcare professionals; 2020.

<sup>19</sup> 434 [11].Fagan M. Huge fall in non-Covid hospital admissions and attendances. Irish <sup>10</sup> 435 Examiner; 2020.

436 [12].Julian C, Rebecca McG. Spillover Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic Could
 437 Drive Long-Term Health Consequences for Non-COVID-19 Patients. Health Affairs;
 438 2020.

[13].Strategic Partnership for International Health Regulations and Health Security
school of public health: COVID-19 Preparedness Bulletin Ethiopia; 2020. Available
at: https://extranet.who.int/sph/news/covid-19-preparedness-bulletin-ethiopia.

442 [14].Tamirat MA, Workeabeba A, Alemayehu W, et al. The Impact of COVID-19 on
443 Care Seeking Behavior of Patients at Tertiary Care Follow-up Clinics: A Cross444 Sectional Telephone Survey. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; 2020. medRxiv preprint doi:
445 https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.11.25.20236224; 2020.

446 [15].Alemu Z, Workneh BD, Mohammed SA, et al. Economic Assessment of Direct
 447 Cost of Illness of Diabetes Mellitus at Dessie Referral Hospital, North East
 448 Ethiopia.2020. Int J Diabetes Clin Res 7:122. doi.org/10.23937/2377-3634/1410122
 449 [16].Stanley L, David W. Hosmer Jr, et al. Adequacy of Sample Size in Health
 450 Studies. World Health Organization. 1990; pp36-39.

451 [17].Abhijit P. Health Economic Evaluation Methods Techniques. IOSR Journal of
 452 Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF). 2016; 7:1-9.

453 [18].Glynn LG., Valderas JM., Healy P., et al. The prevalence of multimorbidity in
 454 primary care and its effect on health care utilization and cost. J of Family Pract.
 455 2011; 28:516–23.

456 [19].Nuno R., Coleman K., Bengoa R., et al. Integrated care for chronic conditions:
 457 the contribution of the ICCC Framework. Health Policy 2012; 105:55–64.

458 [20].Baird B. How has general practice responded to the Covid-19 (coronavirus)
 459 outbreak? The `Kings Fund. Available at:https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2020/
 460 04/covid-19-general-practice. Accessed on June 25, 2020.

4 461 [21].Finet P, Le Bouquin Jeannes R, Dameron O, et al. Review of current
 462 telemedicine applications for chronic diseases. Toward a more integrated system?
 463 Irbm 2015;36.

Page 25 of 26

1 2 BMJ Open

3 4	464	[22].French J.A., Brodie M.J., Caraballo R., et al. Keeping people with epilepsy safe				
5 6	465	during the Covid-19 pandemic. Neurology. 2020; 94:1032–1037. doi:				
7 8 9	466	10.1212/WNL.000000000009632.				
10 11	467	[23].Valenz. The Effects of COVID-19 on Chronic Disease Management and Five				
12 13	468	Solutions Insurers Should Embrace; 2020.				
14 15 16	469	[24].Zawudie AB, Lemma TD, Daka DW. Cost of Hypertension Illness and				
17 18	470	Associated Factors among Patients Attending Hospitals in Southwest Shewa Zone,				
19 20	471	Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. ClinicoEconomics and Outcomes Research				
21 22 23	472	2020:12 201–211.				
24 25	473•	[25].Samson O, Amarech G, Mulugeta T, et al. economic burden of diabetes mellitus				
26 27	474	to diabetic patients and their families attending health facilities in Addis ababa.2020.				
28 29 30	475	Ethiopian Medical Journal 58(3).				
30 31 32 33 34 35	476•	[26].Berman, P; Alebachew, A; Mann, C; Agarwal, A; Abdella, E. 2016. Costs of				
	477	Publicly Funded Primary Hospitals, Departments, and Exempted Services in Ethiopia				
35 36 37	478	Supplement to Paper 1 with expanded sample of primary hospitals. Harvard T.H.				
38 39	479	Chan School of Public Health; Breakthrough International Consultancy, PLC: Boston,				
40 41	480	Massachusetts and Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.				
42 43	481•	[27].Asfaw DB, Degu J, Bjarne R, et al. Cost estimates of HIV care and treatment				
44 45 46	482	with and without anti-retroviral therapy at Arba Minch Hospital in southern Ethiopia.				
47 48	483	Cost Effectiveness and Resource Allocation 2009, 7:6 doi:10.1186/1478-7547-7-6.				
49 50						
51 52						
53 54						
55						
50 57						
58 59						
60						
		24				

Section/Topic	ltem #	Recommendation	Reported on page #
Title and abstract	1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
		(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	2
Introduction			
Background/rationale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported	3-4
Objectives	3	State specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses	2
Methods			
Study design	4	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	5
Setting	5	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data 5 collection	
Participants	6	( <i>a</i> ) Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection of participants 6	
Variables	7	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if 7 applicable	
Data sources/	8*	For each variable of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of assessment (measurement). Describe -	
measurement		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one group	
Bias	9	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	-
Study size	10	Explain how the study size was arrived at	6
Quantitative variables	11	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen and why	8
Statistical methods	12	(a) Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	8
		(b) Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	-
		(c) Explain how missing data were addressed	8
		(d) If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of sampling strategy	-
		(e) Describe any sensitivity analyses	-
Results			

# STROBE 2007 (v4) Statement—Checklist of items that should be included in reports of *cross-sectional studies*

Participants	13*	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility,	-
		confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	
		(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	-
		(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	-
Descriptive data	14*	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	8
		confounders	
		(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	-
Outcome data	15*	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	-
Main results	16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	-
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included	
		(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	-
		(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	-
Other analyses	17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses	-
Discussion			
Key results	18	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	12-14
Limitations	19	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias	15
Interpretation	20	Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence	-
Generalisability	21	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results	-
Other information			
Funding	22	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which the present article is based	16

\*Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

**Note:** An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.

# **BMJ Open**

## Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic diseases treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia: A hospital-based, cross-sectional study

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2022-070195.R3
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	19-Oct-2023
Complete List of Authors:	Terefa, Dufera; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Edosa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Tolessa, Belachew; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences Desisa, Adisu; Wallaga University, Public Health Olani, Wolkite ; Wallaga University, Public Health Fetensa, Getahun; Wallaga University, Department of Nursing Chego, Melese ; Wallaga University, Public Health Abdisa, Eba ; Wallaga University, School of Nursing Turi, Ebisa; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Bekuma, Tariku Tesfaye; Wallaga University, Department of Public Health Getachew, Motuma; Wallaga University, Public Health Tesfaye, Lensa ; Wallaga University, Public Health
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Health policy
Secondary Subject Heading:	Health economics, Health policy, Health services research, Infectious diseases, Public health
Keywords:	Health Equity, Decision Making, EPIDEMIOLOGY, Health Services Accessibility, HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT

# SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our <u>licence</u>.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which <u>Creative Commons</u> licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

reliez oni

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

1

Page 2 of 26

2		
3 4	1	Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic diseases treatment and
5 6	2	care at public hospitals in Wallaga zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia: A
7 8	3	hospital-based, cross-sectional study
9 10 11	4	Dufera Rikitu Terefa <sup>1</sup> , Edosa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Belachew Etana <sup>1</sup> , Adisu Ewunetu Desisa <sup>1</sup> ,
12 13	5	Wolkite Olani <sup>1</sup> , Getahun Fetensa <sup>2</sup> , Melese Chego <sup>1</sup> , Eba Abdisa <sup>2</sup> , Ebisa Turi <sup>1</sup> ,
14 15	6	Tariku Tesfaye Bekuma <sup>1</sup> , Motuma Getachew <sup>1</sup> , Lensa Tesfaye <sup>1</sup> , Temesgen Tilahun
16 17 19	7	3
18 19 20	8	<sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University,
21 22	9	Nekemte, Ethiopia
23 24	10	<sup>2</sup> School of Nursing, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
25 26 27	11	Ethiopia
28 29	12	<sup>3</sup> School of Medicine, Institute of Health Sciences, Wallaga University, Nekemte,
30 31	13	Ethiopia
32 33 24	14	Co-author contact details:
34 35 36	15	Edosa Tesfaye, E-mail: edosatesfaye2019@yahoo.com
37 38	16	Belachew Etana, E-mail:ba.etana@gmail.com
39 40	17	Adisu Ewunetu, E-mail:adisuewunetu2019@gmail.com
41 42 43	18	Wolkite Olani, E-mail: walkiteolani2020@gmail.com
44 45	19	Getahun Fetensa, E-mail: fetensagetahun@gmail.com
46 47	20	Melese Chego, E-mail: melese_chego@yahoo.com
48 49 50	21	Eba Abdisa, E-mail: ebaabdisa@rocketmail.com
50 51 52	22	Ebisa Turi, E-mail: ebakoturi@gmail.com
53 54	23	Tariku Tesfaye Bekuma, E-mail: tarii2007@gmail.com
55 56	24	Motuma Getachew, E-mail: motyamo@gmail.com
57 58 59 60	25	Lensa Tesfaye, E-mail: lenlove539@gmail.com

3
4
5
6
7
, Q
0
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
20 21
∠ I วา
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
37
22 22
22 24
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
15
45 46
40
4/
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
50
20
59
60

26 Temesgen Tilahun, E-mail: ttamuko@yahoo.com

- 27 Corresponding author contact details:
- 28 Full name: Dufera Rikitu Terefa
- 29 P.O.Box=395, Wallaga University, Nekemte, Ethiopia.
- 30 Tel. (+251)-922260706
- 31 E-mail:duferarikitu24@gmail.com
- 32 Abstract

**Objective:** Globally, around one third of the population has at least one long-term 33 34 health condition that could be affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. Despite the fact that studies have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision 35 and utilization, the impact of the pandemic on the cost of chronic disease treatment 36 and care from a patient perspective was scanty. So, the study aimed to determine 37 the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on cost of chronic diseases treatment and 38 care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia, from 39 August 1 to 31, 2020. 40

Methods: An institutional-based cross-sectional study design was used, and the sample size for the study (n = 642) was determined using a single population mean formula. Data was collected using interviews and analyzed using SPSS version 25. Descriptive statistics were performed, and the cost of follow-up care before and after the pandemic was compared using a related-samples Wilcoxon signed-rank test, declaring the level of significance of the median cost difference at P<0.05.</p>

47 **Results:** A total of 642 patients were included in the study, of whom 605 (94.2%)
48 responded to the interviews. There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593,
49 Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of chronic diseases among follow-up patients
50 during the pandemic and the costs incurred by these patients before the pandemic.

**Conclusion**: The cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the 52 COVID-19 pandemic was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era. 53 Therefore, healthcare providers should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for 54 chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the 55 services at proximal health facilities.

56 Keywords: COVID-19 Pandemic, Chronic Disease, Cost of Illness, Follow up care,

57 Ethiopia

# 58 Strengths and Limitations of the Study

• A less costly and time-consuming retrospective costing approach was used.

• The cost of illness analysis in this study was limited to the patients' perspective.

- The study did not include the costs experienced by patients who were employed before the pandemic but then lost their jobs.
- Children less than 15 years of age and the elderly greater than 65 years of age were not included in the valuation of lost work days in the cost estimation.
- There might also be a recall bias.

## 66 Background

67 Chronic diseases (CDs) are the major public health problems that account for 60% of 68 all deaths (35% in low- and middle-income countries). [1-3] including Ethiopia, many 69 low and middle-income countries (LMICs) are undergoing a gradual epidemiologic 70 transition as the disease burden shifts from infectious to non-communicable 71 diseases (NCDs). [4–6] Healthcare systems in these countries are mostly 72 unprepared to handle the increasing burden of these diseases, resulting in no or 73 limited access to affordable prevention and diagnosis of NCDs. [7] These challenges

#### **BMJ** Open

add up to higher NCD treatment costs, whose financing mostly comes from
households' out-of-pocket (OOP) spending. [8]

The COVID-19 pandemic was also another challenge that disrupted entire societies, including the routine health care systems in Ethiopia. The comprehensive effort to contain the pandemic and minimize the subsequent morbidity and mortality has affected both the continuity and quality of care. [9] During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources were focused on COVID-19 prevention and control. This resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs in this era. Diabetes, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, hypertension, heart disease, asthma, cancer, and depression were some of the conditions reported to be most impacted by the reduction in healthcare resources due to the pandemic. [10] Resources at all levels have shifted away from CDs management and prevention during the outbreak, and the lockdown of many services has translated into reduced access, a decrease in referrals, and reduced hospitalizations of patients with non-COVID-19 pathology. [11] As the pandemic continues to rapidly spread, attention often focuses on the numbers of confirmed and probable cases, hospitalizations, and deaths, which can be called the "direct" effects of the pandemic. However, these numbers do not capture the full extent of the pandemic because it has also generated important spillover (indirect) effects by decreasing the supply of and altering patient demand for non-COVID-19-related medical care. [12] 

In Ethiopia, the government declared a state of emergency, labeling the pandemic a national threat and launching overall preventive measures, including advising the community to stay at home, practicing strict and frequent hand washing, and wearing a face mask. Also, it restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid temporary restrictions on market places, restaurants, shops, cinema houses,

religious institutions, and cities. [13] During this time, the number of hospital visits
dropped sharply to utilize health services, including CD follow-up. [14] Many studies
have revealed the direct impact of COVID-19 on health care provision and utilization.
But there has been little emphasis on the impact of the pandemic on the costs of
chronic disease follow-up care from a patient perspective. So, the study aimed to
determine the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of follow-up care among
chronic disease patients at public hospitals.

106 Methods and Materials

# 107 Study Design and Setting

An institutional-based cross-sectional study design was used to conduct this study. It was conducted from August 1 to 31, 2020, in the three wallaga zones, namely, East Wallaga, West Wallaga, and Horro Guduru Wallaga zones, of Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. These three Wallaga zones are among the twenty-one zones of the Oromia region and were found in the western direction of the region, Oromia. The capital towns of east Wallaga zone. Nekemte town: west Wallaga zone. Gimbi town: and Horro Guduru Wallaga zone, Shambu town, were located 333km, 441km, and 314km west of Addis Ababa, the capital city of Ethiopia, respectively. 

<sup>42</sup> 43 116 **Study Participants** 

All chronic disease patients who visited public hospitals in the Wallaga Zones were
 the source population, and all patients who visited the three Wallaga Zones' selected
 study hospitals during the study period were the study population.

<sup>51</sup><sub>52</sub> 120 Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

All patients from the selected CDs in the study area who visited the study hospitals were included in the study. Patients whose age was less than 15 years old and

Page 7 of 26

**BMJ** Open

without accompanying parents who were seriously ill and unable to respond to theinterviews were excluded from the study.

127 applying the following assumptions: two-sided alpha error ( $\epsilon$ ) set at 0.05, 95%

Sample Size and Sampling Methods

128 confidence level, mean cost of DM ( $\mu$ ) = 48.99 ETB, and standard deviation (SD) =

The sample size was determined by using the single population mean formula,

129 30.89 ETB[15], adding a 5% non-response rate.

Using the formula, n =  $\frac{(z - a/2)^2 * \sigma^2}{\epsilon^2 \mu^2}$ ...... [16], n= 642.

Among thirteen public hospitals in the study area, data was collected from the selected CDs of follow-up care patients from Nekemte specialized hospitals, Sire hospital, Gida hospital, Arjo hospital, Shambu hospital, Guduru hospital, Gimbi hospital, and Nedjo hospital, which were selected using a simple random sampling technique.

The determined sample size was allocated to each study hospital proportionally based on the proportion of CD patients who attended follow-up care. Wallaga University referral hospital was purposely excluded from the study, which was an isolation and treatment center for COVID-19 during the study period, and four other hospitals were excluded due to their low CD patient flow.

Finally, a simple random sampling technique was used from the registration book to sample patients at each study hospital as per their proportion to select 642 participants. 

**Data Collection** 

The structured questionnaire was developed in English after reviewing relevant literature, and it was translated into Afan Oromo. Data collection and supervision were carried out by eight data collectors, with four supervisors assigned. These data collectors and supervisors were trained before the pre-test and actual data collection started. The questionnaires were pre-tested in Bedele Hospital using 32 (5%) of the determined sample size. It was collected through a face-to-face interview. Patients who completed their chronic outpatient services and returned to leave the study hospitals were interviewed. 

**Study Variables** 

Socio-demographic and economic characteristics, health service costs (non-medical costs; transportation, food, accommodation, and income lost, and medical costs; registration, consultation, laboratory, radiology, and drugs) were assessed and determined. 

## **Operational Definitions**

Before COVID-19: The period before March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first confirmed COVID-19 positive case.

Chronic disease follow-up patients: A patient visited the study hospital for the follow-up care of one of the following: hypertension (HTN), diabetes mellitus (DM), heart failure (HF), mental illness, HIV (Human Immune Virus), stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.

Chronic disease: any of the following illnesses that persist over time, can gradually

2		
3 4		progress, do not resolve spontaneously, and may not be cured: HTN, DM, HF,
5 6		mental illness, HIV, stroke, epilepsy, and asthma.[14]
7 8 0		Direct costs: the expenditures in ETB spent by chronic disease patients and their
9 10 11		families on the diagnosis and treatment of chronic illness per prescription of
12 13		physicians in the study hospitals.
14 15		During COVID-19: the period after March 13, 2020, when Ethiopia had the first
16 17 19		confirmed COVID-19 positive case.
19 20		Indirect costs: the number of productive days lost by patients and their families as
21 22		a result of chronic illness treatment and care.
23 24 25		Medical cost: the cost component of chronic disease patients' follow-up visits at
25 26 27		study hospitals that includes registration, laboratory, radiology, and drug costs.
28 29		Non-medical cost: the cost component that includes transportation, food,
30 31		accommodation, and income lost among chronic disease patients during
32 33 34 35		follow-up visits at study hospitals.
36 37	158	Data Analysis
38 39	159	Data was entered into Epi-data version 3.1 and exported to SPSS version 25
40 41	160	software for analysis. Descriptive statistics were performed for all study variables
42 43	161	based on their characteristics. The bottom-up costing approach was used to
44 45 46	101	based on their characteristics. The bottom-up costing approach was used to
47 48	162	estimate the direct cost of the follow-up visit with respect to the patient's perspective,
49 50	163	and the indirect costs (income lost due to productive time lost) were estimated using
51 52	164	earnings lost both before and during the COVID-19 pandemic. [17] The time
53 54	165	foregone and productive time lost were converted into indirect costs based on the
55 56	166	daily wage rate and then multiplied by the number of working days lost. The daily
57 58	167	wage rate for patients was estimated by dividing their monthly income by 30 days for
59 60	168	both patients and caregivers. [17] All costs included in the analysis were measured in

terms of Ethiopian Birr (ETB) and were converted to US\$(US dollar) during the
analysis, and the average currency exchange rate was (August 2020; *1* US\$ = *35.99 ETB*). The cost data was converted to real terms by adjusting market prices to reflect
true costs using Ethiopian inflation data.

Finally, the normality distribution of treatment cost data was checked, and it was not normally distributed. As a result, non-parametric tests were used to analyze the median cost for each cost category, as well as a 2-paired sample Wilcoxon sign rank test to compare the costs incurred before and during the pandemic lockdown, with the level of significance of the median cost difference set at p<0.05.

## <sup>4</sup> 178 Ethical consideration

An appropriate research ethical approval was obtained from the ethical review board of Wallaga University, Institute of Health Sciences (Reference number: IRB/233/2020). The study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. The questionnaire was designed to be anonymous, and the result did not identify the personalities of the respondents; rather, it was presented in the aggregated statistics. Written consent was obtained from the study participants. The data was kept in protected and safe locations. Paper-based data was kept in a locked cabinet, and computer-based data was password-secured. Data sharing was enacted based on the ethical and legal rules of data sharing, and it was not accessed by a third party except the research teams.

# 189 Patient and Public Involvement

190 None

2 3 4	191	Results					
5 6	192	Socio-demograp	hic Characteristics				
7 8 0	193	A total of 642 pat	ients were included in the stu	udy, among whom	605 responded to		
9 10 11	194	the interview, yield	ding a 94.2% response rate. A	n almost equal nur	nber of males and		
12 13	195	females participat	ed in the study. More than h	half of the participa	nts, 352 (58.2%),		
14 15 16	196	were from urban a	reas, and the majority of them	ı, 421 (69.6%), wer	e married.		
17 18	197	Regarding the ec	lucational status of the partie	cipants, 137 (22.6%	%) were illiterates		
19 20	198	(Table 1).The ave	erage participant's age was	43.29 (SD=16.5) ye	ears, the average		
21 22 23	199	monthly income w	vas 84.32 (SD=70.65) US doll	ars, and the average	ge household size		
23 24 25	200	was 4.46 (SD=3.4	3).				
26 27	201	Table 1: Socio-de	mographic characteristics and	l classification of stu	udy participants by		
28 29 20	202	chronic diseases conditions in the public hospitals of the three Wallaga zones,					
30 31 32	203	Oromia National Regional State, Ethiopia 2020 (N= 605)					
33 34		Characteristics (N	= 605)	Frequency (n)	Percentage (%)		
35 36 37		Sex	Male	302	49.9		
38 39			Female	303	50.1		
40 41		Residence place	Urban	352	58.2		
42 43 44			Rural	253	41.8		
45 46		Marital status	Single	130	21.5		
47 48			Married	421	69.6		
49 50 51			Separated	7	1.2		
52 53			Divorced	2	0.3		
54 55			Widowed	45	7.4		
56 57 58		Religion	Orthodox	165	27.3		
59	l		l				

	Muslim	59	9.8
	Protestant	373	61.7
	Others	8	1.3
Ethnic group	Oromo	552	91.2
	Amhara	48	7.9
	Gurage	4	0.7
	Tigre	1	0.2
Educational	Illiterate	137	22.6
status	Read &Write	102	16.9
	Grade 1-8	99	16.4
	Grade 9-8	151	25.0
	Diploma and above	116	19.2
Employment	Government employee	93	15.4
status	NGO* employee	89	14.7
	Merchant	100	16.5
	Housewife	114	18.8
	Farmer	107	17.7
	Others**	102	16.9
Types of Chronic	Hypertension	214	35.4
diseases	Diabetic mellitus	173	28.6
	Heart failure	62	10.2
	Mental disease	51	8.4
	HIV/AIDS	50	8.3
	Asthma	29	4.8

1 2		
3 4		
5 6 7		
7 8 9	204	*NGO=
10 11	205	The Ov
12 13	206	The tot
14 15 16	207	patients
17 18	208	10.19)
19 20 21	209	patients
22 22 23	210	follow-u
24 25	211	dollars,
26 27 28	212	The me
29 30	212	the ner
31 32	213	
33 34	214	income
35 36	215	during t
37 38 39	216	The tota
40 41	217	5.55) U
42 43	218	dollars
44 45 46	219	The tot
40 47 48	220	homes
49 50	221	3.05) l
51 52	222	transpo
53 54	222	
55 56	223	
57 58	224	visit wa
59	225	dollars

Epilepsy	18	3.0
Stroke	3	0.5

204 \*NGO= non-governmental organization, \*\* Daily laborer, students

# 5 The Overall Cost of CD Follow-up Care before and during the Pandemic

The total cost for the treatment of CDs before the COVID-19 pandemic among patients who incurred any one or more types of cost was on average 10.41 (SD = 10.19) US dollars, with the median cost of 9.76 (IQR = 8.64) US dollars among 600 patients before the pandemic. The total cost of the treatment of the diseases per follow-up visit during the pandemic among 593 patients was 13.02 (SD = 11.22) US dollars, and the median cost was 12.27 (IQR = 10.40) US dollars.

The median income lost due to productivity time lost for the treatment of CDs before the pandemic was 1.48 (IQR = 2.71 US dollars) among the 501 participants who had income, which was almost similar to the income lost when visiting the study hospitals during the pandemic, which was 1.40 (IQR = 2.85 US dollars).

The total median non-medical cost incurred for the follow-up care was 6.05 (IQR = 5.55) US dollars before the pandemic among 463 patients and 7.98 (IQR = 7.50) US dollars among the same number of patients during the pandemic.

The total median transportation cost to travel to hospitals and travel back to their homes was 1.141 (IQR = 1.94) US dollars before the pandemic and 2.29 (IQR = 3.05) US dollars during the pandemic among the 430 patients who paid for transportation.

The total median cost incurred for the accommodation and food during the follow-up visit was 3.43 (IQR = 4.91) US dollars before the pandemic and 4.29 (IQR = 633) US dollars during the pandemic among 199 participants.

5
6
7
, 8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
3/
38
39
40 11
41 42
+∠ ∕\?
44 45
45 46
40
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59

Δ

The total median medical cost was 3.71 (IQR = 5.22) US dollars before the pandemic, whereas it was 4.29 (IQR = 5.91) US dollars during the pandemic hospital visit among the 425 participants who paid for the prescribed drugs (Table 2).

Table 2: The overall cost of chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care before and during the pandemic among chronic diseases patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones, Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

[	Cost Categories	Era of	Observa	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance
		COVID-19	tion-on		(IQR)	level of median
		Dendersia				cost difference
		Pandemic	(N)			(During-Before
						covid-19)
	Income lost	Before	501	2.27(2.75)	1.48(2.71)	Z = 1.780,
	(a)	During	501	2.25(2.72)	1.40(2.85)	p = 0.075
	Transportation	Before	430	1.91(2.13)	1.14(1.94)	Z = 8.028,
	(b)	During	430	3.43(4.42)	2.29(3.05)	p = 0.001
	Food and	Before	199	4.67(5.05)	3.43(4.91)	Z = 1.189,
	accommodation	During	199	5.6(5.94)	4.29(6.33)	p = 0.169
	(C)					
	Total nonmedical	Before	463	4.58(5.35)	6.05(5.55)	Z = 4.903,
	cost	During	463	6.81(7.58)	7.98(7.50)	p = 0.001
	(a+b+c)=(d)					
	Total medical	Before	425	5.51(8.43)	3.71(5.22)	Z = 2.382,
	cost (e)	During	425	5.93(7.81)	4.29(5.91)	p = 0.017
	Total cost per	Before	600	10.41(10.19)	9.76(8.64)	Z = 5.05,
	patient per visit	During	593	13.02(11.22)	12.27(10.40)	p=0.001
	(d+e)					
232 I	Note: 1US\$ = 35	99 ETB, Augus	st, 2020; SD	: Standard Dev	viation; IQR: In	terquartile

59 233 Range

Page 15 of 26

### 234 Cost Difference Based on COVID-19 Pandemic

There was a significant median cost difference (n = 593, Z = 5.05, p = 0.001) between the cost of follow-up care during the COVID-19 pandemic lockdown and the costs incurred before the pandemic (Table 3). This showed that 348 out of 593 (58.7%) patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost of follow-up care during the pandemic was 12.27 (IQR = 10.40) US dollars, compared to 9.76 (IQR = 8.64) US dollars before the COVID-19 pandemic.

The study showed that there was no significant median difference in income lost among patients who had income during and before the pandemic (n = 501, Z =1.780, p = 0.075). The median income lost during the pandemic was 1.48 (IQR = 2.71 US dollars) compared to the income lost before the pandemic, which was 1.40 (IQR = 2.85 US dollars).

There was a significant median cost difference in non-medical costs per patient during and before the pandemic (n = 463, Z = 4.903, p = 0.001). This showed significantly higher costs were incurred by more than half of the patients, 276 (59.61%), during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median nonmedical cost observed among the patients was 7.98 (IQR = 7.50) and 6.05 (IQR = 5.55) US dollars per follow-up visit during and before the pandemic, respectively.

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median cost difference of food and accommodation incurred during and before the pandemic (n = 199, Z = 1.189, p = 0.169), and the median of this cost category was 4.29 (IQR = 6.33) and 3.13 (IQR = 4.91) US dollars during and before the pandemic lock-down, respectively.

The majority of the patients, 289 (67.2%), paid higher transportation fees when they visited hospitals during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference in transportation costs during and before the pandemic (n = 430, Z = 8.028, p = 0.00), which was explained by the fact that the median transportation cost was 1.14 (IQR = 1.94) US dollars and 2.29 (IQR = 3.05) US dollars during and before the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of the patients, 236 (55.5%), incurred higher costs for medical services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. There was a significant median cost difference during and before the pandemic (n = 425, Z = 2.382, p = 0.017), in which the median cost was 4.29 (IQR = 5.91) and 3.71 (IQR = 5.22) US dollars during and before the pandemic lockdown.

The study showed that the majority of the hypertensive (HTN) patients, 128 (60.7%), paid a high amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic among the 211 patients who paid for the services. There was a significant median cost difference per visit during and before the pandemic (n = 211, Z = 3.632, p = 0.00). The median cost observed among these patients was 7.58 (IQR = 7.53) and 10.14 (IQR = 8.74) US per follow-up visit before and during the pandemic, respectively.

More than half of diabetes mellitus (DM) patients (59.17%) paid higher costs for services during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The total cost incurred by these patients was significantly higher during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic (n = 169, Z = 3.095, p = 0.002). The median cost was 11.39 (IQR = 10.87) and 8.11 (IQR = 9.26) US dollars during and before the pandemic lockdown, respectively.

Page 17 of 26

**BMJ** Open

The study revealed that there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by heart failure (HF) patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 61, Z = -0.055, p = 0.956). Among 61 HF patients, only 31 (50.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. Similarly, there was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by patients who visited the hospitals for mental health follow-up for the treatment of diseases during and before the pandemic era (n = 41, Z =-1.497, p = 0.134). Among 41 patients, only 20 (40.82%) paid a higher amount of money during the pandemic. The study also showed that there was a statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by HIV patients during and before the pandemic lockdown (n = 49, Z = 3.356, p = 0.00). Among 49 patients, the majority of them 34(69.39%) incurred a higher cost per visit during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic lockdown. There was no statistical significance in the median difference in total cost incurred by asthma patients during and before the pandemic era (n = 28, Z = 1.731, p = 0.184). Similarly, there was no statistically significant median difference in total cost incurred by epilepsy patients during and before the pandemic lockdown (n = 18, Z = 1.328, p = 0.184) (Table 3). Table 3: Cost of chronic diseases follow-up treatment and care by disease types among chronic disease patients at public hospitals in the three Wallaga zones. 

303 Oromia National Regional state, Ethiopia 2020(N= 605)

Types of	Era of	Observation	Mean(SD)	Median	Significance level
CDs	COVID-19	(N)		(IQR)	of median cost
	Pandemic				difference(During-
					Before covid-19)
HTN	Before	211	10.03(11.86)	7.58(7.53)	Z = 3.632,
	During	211	12.65(10.42)	10.14(8.74)	p = 0.001
DM	Before	169	10.64(8.42)	8.12(9.26)	Z = 3.095,
	During	169	13.56(10.49)	11.39(10.87)	p = 0.002
HF	Before	61	12.64(12.85)	9.06(8.53)	Z = -0.055,
	During	61	12.51(11.34)	8.2(12.52)	p = 0.956
Mental	Before	49	13.08(8.97)	11.63(10.10)	Z = -1.497,
uiscuse	During	49	10.91(8.45)	8.86(10.24)	p = 0.134
HIV	Before	49	7.37(6.65)	6.12(6.76)	Z = 3.356,
	During	49	16.58(18.32)	12.24(14.25)	p = 0.000
Asthma	Before	28	8.95(6.40)	7.33(10.68)	Z = 1.731,
	During	28	12.92(12.34)	10.34(8.18)	p =0.184
Epilepsy	Before	18	7.70(7.01)	5.70(11.18)	Z = 1.328,
	During	18	10.44(5.74)	10.00(9.84)	p =0.184

304 Note: 1US\$305 Range

# **Discussion**

This study was aimed at determining the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the cost of chronic disease treatment and care at public hospitals in Wallaga Zones, Page 19 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

309 Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. The study found that the cost of follow-up 310 treatment and care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic 311 was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era.

This indicated that more than half of the chronic patients, 58.7%, incurred a significantly higher total cost during the pandemic lockdown compared to before the pandemic. This finding supports the study's findings that chronic illness costs account for more than 75% of total healthcare costs in high-income countries. [18, 19] However, this study was conducted during the COVID-19 pandemic and in a low-income country, but these studies were not conducted at the time of the pandemic and were also conducted in high-income countries. During the pandemic, most global healthcare resources are focused on COVID-19, and this resource reallocation could disrupt the continuum of care for patients with CDs. [9, 10, 20] This could be explained by the fact that the global pandemic's disruption of the health care system may impose additional costs on CD patients. 

The study revealed that the non-medical cost during the follow-up visit per patient during the era of COVID-19 was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic era by the same patients, which was doubled during the pandemic. This significant difference might be due to a strict lockdown that could affect these patients adversely as they require regular follow-up visits that lead to further health consequences and additional costs. [21,22]

Transportation costs were one of the cost categories that doubled during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic. The median cost per patient per visit of this cost category during the pandemic era was significantly increased by two folds. This could be due to the fact that the government restricted the movement of its people from place to place and laid a temporary restriction on public transport acrossregions and cities. [13, 21]

The study discovered a significant median cost difference in medical costs, with the median of this cost category increasing by 15.6% during the pandemic. This finding is in line with the study report that revealed that before the pandemic, one in three Americans did not take their medications as prescribed because of high costs, but during a global pandemic, forgoing medications involves even more risks for chronic care patients and incurs even higher costs in the long run. [23] However, comparing study findings in this study setting with those in a high-resource setting is taken as a weakness of this study. 

The study also evaluated the cost of each selected chronic disease. Accordingly, for the follow-up care of HTN patients, the patients incurred significantly higher costs during the pandemic compared to before the pandemic, which were raised by 33.76% during the pandemic. The cost incurred before the COVID pandemic was almost comparable with other study reports, but the cost incurred during the pandemic was higher than the study report on the cost of hypertension before the COVID-19 lockdown in Ethiopia. [24] 

Again, the study showed that the cost of DM follow-up visits per patient during the pandemic lockdown was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by 40.53%. However, before and during the COVID-19 lockdown, the cost of DM in this study was lower than the study reported in Ethiopia. [15, 25] This variation could be attributed to differences in DM complications and treatment among study participants. 

<sup>56</sup> 356 Despite HIV care and treatment being an exempt service in Ethiopia, patients
 <sup>58</sup> 357 incurred nonmedical costs. The study revealed that the cost incurred by HIV patients

Page 21 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

for follow-up treatment and care per visit per patient during the pandemic lockdown was significantly higher than the cost incurred before the pandemic, which was increased by twofold. The cost of HIV treatment and care reported in the study was higher than in other Ethiopian studies. [26, 27]

However, there was no significant statistical median cost difference for the follow-up care of heart failure, mental illness, asthma, and epilepsy during and before the pandemic; a slight median cost difference was observed during and before the pandemic.

**Conclusion** 

This study revealed that the total cost of follow-up care among chronic disease patients during the COVID-19 pandemic lockdown was significantly higher compared to before the pandemic era among the same patients. In this study, hypertensive patients had the greatest impact on the cost of ongoing care as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. A comprehensive package of chronic disease treatment and care is demanded at different levels of health facilities in the country's health system. Therefore, healthcare providers, hospital administrators, and the local government should arrange special fee waiver mechanisms for chronic disease healthcare costs during such types of pandemics and provide the services at proximal health facilities. 

**Declarations** 

# 377 Author's Contributionship Statement

All authors made substantial contributions to conception and design, acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; took part in drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; gave final approval of the version to be published; and agreed to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

60 382 Conflict of Interest Statement

3 4	383	All authors declared that they have no conflicts of interest related to this work.						
5 6 7	384	Consent for Publication						
, 8 9	385	NA						
10 11	386	Availability of Data and Materials						
12 13	387	All the data supporting the study's findings are within the manuscript. Addit						
14 15 16	388	detailed information and raw data will be shared upon request addressed to the						
17 18	389	corresponding author.						
19 20	390	Funding						
21 22 23	391	This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public,						
24 25	392	commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.						
26 27	393	Acknowledgments						
28 29 30	394	Researchers would like to acknowledge all participants in the study and respective						
31 32	395	administrative bodies from top to bottom for their due cooperation and involvement.						
33 34	396	Acronyms						
35 36	397	ETB: Ethiopian Birr, HF: Heart Failure, HIV: Human Immune Virus, HTN:						
37 38	398	Hypertension, LMICs: Low-and-middle-income countries, NCDs: Non-communicable						
39 40 41	399	diseases, OOP: Out-of-pocket, WHO: World Health Organization						
42	400	References						
43 44 45	401	[1]. World Health Organization. A guide to implementation research in the prevention						
46 47	402	and control of Non-communicable diseases. Geneva; Switzerland World Health						
48 49 50	403	Organization; 2016.						
50 51 52	404	[2].World Health Organization. Overview preventing chronic diseases: a vital						
53 54	405	investment. Switzerland: 2004.						
55 56 57	406	[3]. The World Bank. Human Development Network. The growing danger of non-						
58 59 60	407	communicable diseases. Acting now to reverse course; 2011.						

Page 23 of 26

 **BMJ** Open

[4].Santosa, A, Byass, P. Diverse empirical evidence on epidemiological transition in
low-and middle-income countries: population-based findings from INDEPTH network
data. PLoS One 2016; 11, e0155753.

411 [5].World Health Organization. The double burden: Emerging epidemics and
 412 persistent problems. World Health Report; 1999.

[6].Murray, C. J., Lopez, A. D. The global burden of disease: a comprehensive
 assessment of mortality and disability from diseases, injuries, and risk factors in
 1990 and projected to 2020: summary. Harvard School of Public Health on behalf of
 the World Health Organization and the World Bank; 1996.

417 [7].Bollyky, T. J., Templin, T., Cohen, M., et al. Lower-income countries that face the
 418 most rapid shift in non-communicable disease burden are also the least prepared.
 419 Health Aff. 2017: 36, 1866–1875.

420 [8].Engelgau MM, El-Saharty S, Kudesia P, et al. Capitalizing on the demographic
 421 transition: tackling non-communicable diseases in South Asia: The World Bank;
 422 2011.

423 [9].World Health Organization. Information note on COVID-19 and non-40 424 communicable diseases. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/ 41 425 covid-19-and-ncds Accessed on July 21, 2020.

426 [10].Yogini V, Clare L, Francesco Z, et al. Impact of COVID-19 on routine care for
 6
 7 427 chronic diseases: A global survey of views from healthcare professionals; 2020.

 $^{9}_{0}$  428 [11].Fagan M. Huge fall in non-Covid hospital admissions and attendances. Irish  $^{1}_{2}$  429 Examiner; 2020.

4 30 [12].Julian C, Rebecca McG. Spillover Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic Could
 431 Drive Long-Term Health Consequences for Non-COVID-19 Patients. Health Affairs;
 432 2020.
## **BMJ** Open

[13].Strategic Partnership for International Health Regulations and Health Security
school of public health: COVID-19 Preparedness Bulletin Ethiopia; 2020. Available
at: https://extranet.who.int/sph/news/covid-19-preparedness-bulletin-ethiopia.

436 [14].Tamirat MA, Workeabeba A, Alemayehu W, et al. The Impact of COVID-19 on
 437 Care Seeking Behavior of Patients at Tertiary Care Follow-up Clinics: A Cross 438 Sectional Telephone Survey. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; 2020. medRxiv preprint doi:
 439 https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.11.25.20236224; 2020.

440 [15].Alemu Z, Workneh BD, Mohammed SA, et al. Economic Assessment of Direct
 441 Cost of Illness of Diabetes Mellitus at Dessie Referral Hospital, North East
 442 Ethiopia.2020. Int J Diabetes Clin Res 7:122. doi.org/10.23937/2377-3634/1410122
 443 [16].Stanley L, David W. Hosmer Jr, et al. Adequacy of Sample Size in Health

 $\frac{3}{9}$  444 Studies. World Health Organization. 1990; pp36-39.

445 [17].Abhijit P. Health Economic Evaluation Methods Techniques. IOSR Journal of
 446 Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF). 2016; 7:1-9.

447 [18].Glynn LG., Valderas JM., Healy P., et al. The prevalence of multimorbidity in
 448 primary care and its effect on health care utilization and cost. J of Family Pract.
 449 2011; 28:516–23.

450 [19].Nuno R., Coleman K., Bengoa R., et al. Integrated care for chronic conditions:
 451 the contribution of the ICCC Framework. Health Policy 2012; 105:55–64.

452 [20].Baird B. How has general practice responded to the Covid-19 (coronavirus)
 453 outbreak? The `Kings Fund. Available at:https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2020/
 454 04/covid-19-general-practice. Accessed on June 25, 2020.

455 [21].Finet P, Le Bouquin Jeannes R, Dameron O, et al. Review of current
 456 telemedicine applications for chronic diseases. Toward a more integrated system?
 457 Irbm 2015;36.

Page 25 of 26

1

BMJ Open

2 3 4	458	[22].French J.A., Brodie M.J., Caraballo R., et al. Keeping people with epilepsy safe					
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 44 45 46 47 46 47 47 47 47 47 47 47 47 47 47	459	during the Covid-19 pandemic. Neurology. 2020; 94:1032–1037. doi:					
	460	10.1212/WNL.000000000009632.					
	461	[23].Valenz. The Effects of COVID-19 on Chronic Disease Management and Five					
	462	Solutions Insurers Should Embrace; 2020.					
	463	[24].Zawudie AB, Lemma TD, Daka DW. Cost of Hypertension Illness and					
	464	Associated Factors among Patients Attending Hospitals in Southwest Shewa Zone,					
	465	Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia. ClinicoEconomics and Outcomes Research					
	466	2020:12 201–211.					
	467•	[25].Samson O, Amarech G, Mulugeta T, et al. economic burden of diabetes mellitus					
	468	to diabetic patients and their families attending health facilities in Addis ababa.2020.					
	469	Ethiopian Medical Journal 58(3).					
	470∙	[26].Berman, P; Alebachew, A; Mann, C; Agarwal, A; Abdella, E. 2016. Costs of					
	471	Publicly Funded Primary Hospitals, Departments, and Exempted Services in Ethiopia					
	472	Supplement to Paper 1 with expanded sample of primary hospitals. Harvard T.H.					
	473	Chan School of Public Health; Breakthrough International Consultancy, PLC: Boston,					
	474	Massachusetts and Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.					
	475∙	[27].Asfaw DB, Degu J, Bjarne R, et al. Cost estimates of HIV care and treatment					
	476	with and without anti-retroviral therapy at Arba Minch Hospital in southern Ethiopia.					
47 48	477	Cost Effectiveness and Resource Allocation 2009, 7:6 doi:10.1186/1478-7547-7-6.					
49 50							
51 52							
53 54							
55 56							
57							
58 59							
60							
		24					

BMJ Open

Section/Topic	ltem #	Recommendation	Reported on page #
Title and abstract	1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
		(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	2
Introduction			
Background/rationale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported	3-4
Objectives	3	State specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses	2
Methods			
Study design	4	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	5
Setting	5	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	5
Participants	6	(a) Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection of participants	6
Variables	7	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if applicable	7
Data sources/	8*	For each variable of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	-
measurement	0	comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one group	
BIBS	10	Explain how the study size was arrived at	-
Quantitative variables	10	Explain how the study size was arrived at Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen and why	8
Statistical methods	12	(a) Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	8
		(b) Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	-
		(c) Explain how missing data were addressed	8
		(d) If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of sampling strategy	-
		(e) Describe any sensitivity analyses	-
Results			

## STROBE 2007 (v4) Statement—Checklist of items that should be included in reports of *cross-sectional studies*

Participants	13*	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility,	-
		confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	
		(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	-
		(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	-
Descriptive data	14*	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	8
		confounders	
		(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	-
Outcome data	15*	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	-
Main results	16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	-
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included	
		(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	-
		(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	-
Other analyses	17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses	-
Discussion			
Key results	18	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	12-14
Limitations	19	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias	15
Interpretation	20	Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence	-
Generalisability	21	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results	-
Other information			
Funding	22	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which the present article is based	16

\*Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

**Note:** An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.