

Structure of the turnover-ready state of an ancestral respiratory complex I

Corresponding Author: Professor Judy Hirst

This manuscript has been previously reviewed at another journal. This document only contains reviewer comments, rebuttal and decision letters for versions considered at Nature Communications.

This file contains all reviewer reports in order by version, followed by all author rebuttals in order by version.

Version 0:

Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1

(Remarks to the Author)

The authors have addressed my concerns in their response letter and made appropriate changes in the text. After reading the manuscript again, I would like to raise one more point related to Fig. 6 which shows different putative proton transfer pathways. Route 4 appears as a connection between the E channel and the prominent P side exit path in ND5. There is an ongoing discussion about possible P side pathways in ND4 and ND2. The figure suggests that the authors envision a continuous path along the complete length of the membrane arm and not the more traditional view of proton transfer pathways in each of the antiporter like subunits ND5,4 and 2. I think it would be good to clarify your view on this topic to avoid misunderstanding the figure.

Reviewer #2

(Remarks to the Author)

In the revised manuscript, the authors addressed all my questions. For me, the manuscript can be published as is.

Open Access This Peer Review File is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made.

In cases where reviewers are anonymous, credit should be given to 'Anonymous Referee' and the source.

The images or other third party material in this Peer Review File are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>