

Reviewer Report

Title: Unveiling Patterns in Spatial Transcriptomics Data: A Novel Approach Utilizing Graph Attention Autoencoder and Multi-Scale Deep Subspace Clustering Network

Version: Original Submission **Date: 4/3/2024**

Reviewer name: Qianqian Song

Reviewer Comments to Author:

This paper presents a well-structured and thoroughly evaluated framework for spatial analysis of ST data. It introduces STMSGAL, a novel framework for analyzing ST data, which incorporates graph attention autoencoder and multi-scale deep subspace clustering. With its robust performance and potential utility in advancing research, STMSGAL shows promising results to allow it as a good tool for researchers exploring cellular spatial organization and disease pathology. Specifically, I have some comments as below: 1) The paper provides the evaluation of STMSGAL against five other methods using multiple datasets, demonstrating its outperformance across various evaluation metrics such as Davies-Bouldin, Calinski-Harabasz, S_{Dbw} , and ARI values. However, the authors lack of comparisons with most recent methods, such as STAGATE (PMID: 35365632) and SiGra (PMID: 37699885). 2) When evaluating the performance of STMSGAL, the authors only include the DLPFC visium datasets and two other separate datasets. More evaluation datasets may be needed to ensure a robust, unbiased, and generalizable performance. 3) STMSGAL incorporates different components in the framework, such as the graph attention autoencoder and multi-scale deep subspace clustering. Ablation study may be needed to justify the contribution and necessity of these components. 4) Currently there are many tools developed for spatial domain identification, I recommend the authors to discuss the anticipated impact of STMSGAL, as well as potential points for future/further refinement of this tool.

Level of Interest

Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript: Choose an item.

Quality of Written English

Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript: Choose an item.

Declaration of Competing Interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

- Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

- Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
- Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
- Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
- Do you have any other financial competing interests?
- Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

No competing interest.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

Choose an item.

To further support our reviewers, we have joined with Publons, where you can gain additional credit to further highlight your hard work (see: <https://publons.com/journal/530/gigascience>). On publication of this paper, your review will be automatically added to Publons, you can then choose whether or not to claim your Publons credit. I understand this statement.

Yes Choose an item.