# Dynamics of Changing Intercellular CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration (c<sub>i</sub>) during Drought and Determination of Minimum Functional c<sub>i</sub>

# **Tim Brodribb\***

Department of Plant Science, University of Tasmania, P.O. Box 252C, Tasmania 7001, Australia

Nine conifer species with narrow (<5 mm), single-veined leaves were selected for the purpose of examining changes in intercellular CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (c<sub>i</sub>) during drought. Due to the leaf morphology of the study plants, the confounding effects of nonhomogenous photosynthesis common to most reticulate-veined angiosperms were largely avoided, giving a clear picture of c<sub>i</sub> dynamics under increasing drought. A characteristic biphasic response was observed in all species, with an initial stomatal control phase resulting in a substantial reduction in ci as stomatal conductance (gs) decreased. As gs reached low levels, a strong nonstomatal limitation phase was observed, causing ci to increase as gs approached a minimum. This nonstomatal phase was linked to a concomitant rapid decrease in the fluorescence parameter quantum efficiency, indicating the onset of nonreversible photoinhibition. The ratio of internal to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (c<sub>i</sub>/c<sub>a</sub>) decreased from values of between 0.68 and 0.57 in undroughted plants to a minimum,  $(c_i/c_a)min$ , which was well defined in each species, ranging from 0.10 in Actinostrobus acuminatus to 0.36 in Acmopyle pancheri. A high correlation was found to exist between (c./c.)min and leaf water potential measured at  $(c_i/c_a)min$ . Species developing high maximum intrinsic water use efficiencies (low [c<sub>i</sub>/c<sub>a</sub>]min), such as A. acuminatus, did so at lower leaf water potentials (-4.5 MPa) than more mesic species (-1.75 MPa for A. pancheri). It is concluded that in the absence of patchy stomatal closure,  $(c_i/c_a)min$ gives a good representation of the drought tolerance of foliage.

It has long been established that during drought,  $g_s$  decreases, reducing water loss from the leaf (Slatyer, 1967). In the absence of other effects, such a decrease in conductance will produce a CO<sub>2</sub> "supply" limitation of photosynthesis (Farquhar and Sharkey, 1982) by causing the  $c_i$  to become depleted. Recently, however, the importance of reduced  $g_s$  in limiting A during drought has been questioned. Many authors have described "nonstomatal" inhibition of photosynthesis as an important influence during drought, attributing this to impaired chloroplast function in leaves subject to water deficits (Boyer, 1971; Graan and Boyer, 1990; Majumdar et al., 1991; Gunasekera and Berkowitz, 1993).

Nonstomatal inhibition of photosynthesis has been commonly invoked to explain results of gas-exchange studies showing unchanging or increasing c<sub>i</sub> in the leaves of droughted plants and a strong depression in the relationship between A and c<sub>i</sub> (Ehleringer and Cook, 1984; Wong et al., 1985; Grieu et al., 1988; VanRensberg and Kruger, 1993; Anderson et al., 1995). The suggestion that during drought nonstomatal effects become important soon after  $\psi_1$  begins to drop is not consistent, however, with data obtained in fluorescence studies, which indicate that leaf photochemistry is resistant to moderate drought stress (Sharkey and Badger, 1982; Genty et al., 1987; Cornic et al., 1989) and that during drought an increased flow of electrons to O<sub>2</sub> reflects decreasing c<sub>i</sub> (Cornic and Briantais, 1991). Integrated measures of c<sub>i</sub>, such as carbon isotope discrimination in leaves, also suggest that c<sub>i</sub> is lower in water-stressed plants (Smith and Osmond, 1987; Hubick et al., 1988; Ehleringer et al., 1992; Donovan and Ehleringer, 1994). This disparity between gas-exchange data and other measures of c, has been attributed to patchy stomatal closure in response to drought.

Implicit in the calculation of A and g<sub>s</sub> from gas-exchange parameters is uniform stomatal aperture on the leaf being measured (Farquhar and Sharkey, 1982). In the case of patchy stomatal closure, the whole  $A(c_i)$  relationship is erroneously depressed, leading to the conclusion that photosynthesis is being directly inhibited (Terashima et al., 1988). Heterogeneity in the distribution of photosynthesis has been observed in most species examined (Pospisilova and Santrucek, 1994) and appears to be associated with the reticulate venation typically found in broad-leaved angiosperms. This type of venation tends to subdivide the leaf lamina, especially in the case of heterobaric leaves, in which bundle-sheath extensions from the veins to the epidermis compartmentalize the leaf into small aereoles. Studies of chlorophyll fluorescence (Downton et al., 1988; Cardon et al., 1994; Siebke and Weis, 1995) and radiolabeling (Terashima et al., 1988) have shown that during drought or ABA application, groups of aereoles can be actively photosynthetic while adjacent parts of the leaf are not measurably assimilating. This spatial heterogeneity in leaf photosynthesis has prevented an accurate understanding of the dynamics of changing c, during drought.

The aim of this study was to measure changes in  $c_i$  and A during drought in species with a low potential for nonuniform gas exchange. By using functionally amphis-

Abbreviations: A, assimilation;  $c_{a'}$  ambient  $CO_2$  concentration;  $c_{i'}$  intercellular  $CO_2$  concentration;  $c_i/c_a min$ , minimum  $c_i/c_a$  attained during drought;  $F_v/F_{m'}$  quantum efficiency;  $g_{s'}$  stomatal conductance;  $\psi_{l'}$  leaf water potential.

<sup>\*</sup> E-mail brodribb@postoffice.utas.edu.au; fax 61-02-202698.

tomatous species with single-veined leaves < 5 mm in width, the problem of leaf subdivision was avoided and the potential for rapid lateral diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> throughout the leaf was maximized. Potential patchy effects were also avoided by slowly and evenly inducing drought (Gunasekera and Berkowitz, 1992; Wise et al., 1992). These measurements allowed determination of a minimum attainable  $c_i/c_a$  during drought, a parameter that could be compared between species and that reflects the relative drought tolerance of the species examined.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

# **Plant Material**

Cuttings of the conifers Acmopyle pancheri (Brongn. and Glis) Pilger, Diselma archerii Hook.f., Lagarostrobos franklinii (Hook.) C.J.Quinn, Podocarpus lawrencii Hook.f., and Microstrobos niphophilus Garden and Johnson, and seed from Actinostrobus acuminatus Parlatore, Athrotaxis selaginoides D.Don, Callitris rhomboidea R.Br., Dacrycarpus dacrydioides (Rich.) de Laubenfels, and two angiosperms, Eucalyptus tenuiramis Miq. and Acacia melanoxylon R.Br., were propagated in sand in Hobart (Tasmania, Australia). Seedlings and rooted cuttings were transferred to a pine-bark potting mix in large (3 L) pots and grown under ambient glasshouse light and temperature. A minimum of three individuals per species were used in experimental work.

During droughting, water was withheld from plants, causing a gradual decrease in soil water content (due to the large pot size and relatively small plants). Water was withheld until the dark-adapted  $F_v/F_m$  was approximately 0.7, at which point plants were at their maximum drought tolerance (see "Results"). This took between 2 and 4 weeks, during which time gas-exchange measurements were taken every 1 to 5 d depending on desiccation rate.

# Gas Exchange

Fluxes of  $CO_2$  and water vapor were measured on leaves using an open-flow system. An ADC mk. 3 (Hoddleson, UK) IR gas analyzer was used to measure  $CO_2$  differentials between cuvette and reference air, and a modified Dew-10 dew-point hygrometer (General Eastern, Waterton, MA) was used to monitor water vapor content of pre- and postcuvette air.

Air was supplied from compressed air cylinders, and different partial pressures of  $CO_2$  were produced by removing different proportions of  $CO_2$  from the air during tank fills. In undroughted plants,  $c_a$  was varied from 360 to 160  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> to give  $c_i$  values within the range likely to be found in the field, and photosynthetic  $CO_2$  compensation concentration was measured by recirculating air through the leaf chamber, allowing the leaf to draw down  $c_a$  until net  $CO_2$  uptake ceased. Measurements during drought were made with  $c_a$  held constant at approximately atmospheric concentration (360 ± 15  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup>). The dew point of the influx air was maintained at 0°C by passing air over water at 0°C or at around 8°C by passing air through a column of hydrated ferrous sulfate, resulting in leaf to air vapor pressure deficits of 8 to 10 mbar bar<sup>-1</sup>.

The leaf cuvette was constructed from ultra-high-density polyethylene and glass, and all tubing was stainless steel so as to minimize adsorption of water vapor and  $CO_2$ . Gas-flow rates were generally 300 to 400 mL min<sup>-1</sup> and the volume of the cuvette was 20 mL. At these relatively high flow rates, the boundary layer conductance of the leaves, which were generally >3 mm in width, was at least 1 order of magnitude greater than the maximum leaf conductance.

Leaf temperature was maintained at  $20 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C by pumping water from a controlled-temperature water bath through a jacket surrounding the cuvette and was measured by a thermocouple placed in contact with the abaxial surface of the leaf. The light source was a 24-V, 250-W tungsten lamp that provided 1500  $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> to the leaf surface. Leaf area was measured using a digital camera (EDC-1000, Electrim, Princeton, NJ) to determine the projected area of foliage in the chamber.

Calculation of gas-exchange parameters were made, according to von Caemmerer and Farquhar (1981), with  $c_i$  corrected for water vapor efflux from the leaf.

# $\psi_{1}$

Measurements of  $\psi_1$  were carried out immediately after gas-exchange readings using a Scholander (Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organization, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia) pressure bomb. Due to the destructive nature of the Scholander technique and the small amount of plant material available,  $\psi_1$  could be determined only once or twice per plant. These measurements were made as  $c_i$  approached a minimum, enabling the  $\psi_1$  to be defined at minimum  $c_i$ .

# Fluorescence

In one species (*Podocarpus lawrencii*), the optimum  $F_v/F_m$  was measured to determine nonreversible photochemical inhibition during drought. Measurements were made on every second plant after the completion of gas-exchange readings. This involved dark adapting whole plants for 3 h (to ensure complete oxidation of the plastoquinone pool) before  $F_v/F_m$  readings were taken. Fifteen leaves from each plant were measured, using a PSM mk. 2 fluorometer (Biomonitor, Umeå, Sweden).

# **Stomatal Aperture**

Stomatal aperture was measured every 3 d during the drought of a single *Acacia melanoxylon* plant. It was not possible to use *Eucalyptus* or any of the conifers, since the sunken nature of the stomata did not allow accurate impressions to be made of the guard cells. Leaves were detached after measurement of gas exchange and epidermal impressions were made by immediately coating the abaxial surface of the leaf with nail varnish (cellulose acetate). Closed stomata were easily distinguished from open or partially open stomata when impressions were examined under the light microscope, so it was possible to measure the percentage of closed stomata in leaves subject to increasing drought.

# RESULTS

# Gas Exchange and Fluorescence in P. lawrencii

Within the range of  $c_i$  produced by varying  $c_a$  from compensation to atmospheric concentration, a linear regression ( $r^2 = 0.935$ ) described the A versus  $c_i$  response curve for well-watered *P. lawrencii* (Fig. 1). At an ambient CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of 360 µmol mol<sup>-1</sup> (approximately atmospheric),  $c_i$  for *P. lawrencii* was 205 ± 5 µmol mol<sup>-1</sup>.

Once water was withheld, gs and A decreased slowly over the 1st week. Generally, gas exchange was found to drop sharply during the 2nd week of drought, continuing at low values during the 3rd and 4th weeks. Figure 2 illustrates this trend in a single replicate. Accompanying the decrease in gas exchange was a steep decline in  $c_i$ , typically from around 205  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> (c<sub>i</sub>/c<sub>a</sub> of around 0.6) on the 1st d of water stress, to minimum values between 71 and 88  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 1).  $c_i/c_a$  is expressed in preference to c<sub>i</sub> since it accounts for variation in c<sub>a</sub> (Fig. 2c). Minimum values of c<sub>i</sub> were typically reached after 20 to 28 d without water, at which point  $\psi_1$  was -3.0 MPa and  $c_i$  was quite close to the compensation value of 53  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>. Until the point of minimum c<sub>i</sub> there was no difference in carboxylation efficiency between droughted and undroughted plants (Fig. 1), indicating that nonstomatal limitation was not significantly increased. Only when A and gs reached very low levels was there any deviation from the unstressed carboxylation curve, indicating a rapid increase in nonstomatal limitation. This can be seen in Figure 1, where  $c_i$  approaches and then exceeds  $c_a$  as assimilation approaches 0. This rapid increase in nonstomatal limitation occurred when  $\psi_1$  fell below -3.0 MPa.

Figure 3a shows the response of  $c_i/c_a$  to decreasing  $g_s$  during drought. The curve shown in Figure 3a represents



**Figure 1.** The relationship between A and  $c_i$  in undroughted *P. lawrencii* (itrif), with  $c_a$  ranging from compensation to atmospheric concentration, and droughted plants ( $\bigcirc$ ), with  $c_a$  constant at 360  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>. A linear regression ( $r^2 = 0.935$ ) was used to fit the data from undroughted plants. Arrows show the progression of A and  $c_i$  during droughting.



**Figure 2.** Decreasing  $g_s(a)$ , A (b), and  $c_i/c_a(c)$  in a single replicate of *P. lawrencii* during droughting. Minimum  $g_s$  in plants was generally reached 25 to 30 d after water was withheld.

the expected response if assimilation was limited only by  $g_{s'}$  i.e. nonstomatal factors were insignificant. Points falling at increasing distances above this curve reflect an increasing component of nonstomatal limitation. During the initial stomatal limitation phase between conductances of 320 and 45 mmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, a curvilinear relationship was observed between  $c_i/c_a$  and  $g_s$ . The lowest value of  $c_i/c_a$  occurred at a  $g_s$  of 45 mmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, with  $c_i/c_a$  (and hence nonstomatal limitation) increasing rapidly at conductances below this level. Photosynthesis in plants that were allowed to reach this phase of rapidly increasing  $c_i/c_a$  did not completely recover after rewatering, and several individuals sustained leaf damage.

The average  $F_v/F_m$  of *P. lawrencii* leaves from unstressed plants was 0.78  $\pm$  0.008, which falls within the normal range for unstressed plants (Björkman and Demmig, 1987). During droughting,  $F_v/F_m$  decreased only slightly as  $g_s$ dropped from 320 to 45 mmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Below this  $g_{s'}$ however,  $F_v/F_m$  was found to fall rapidly to values below 0.70 (Fig. 3b). In all plants where the average  $F_v/F_m$  fell below 0.7, leaves became necrotic or were shed after rewatering.



Leaf conductance (mmol.m<sup>-2</sup>.sec<sup>-1</sup>)

**Figure 3.** Changing ratios of  $c_i/c_a$  (a) and  $F_v/F_m$  (b) as  $g_s$  declined during drought in *P. lawrencii*. Each value of  $F_v/F_m$  represents the average of 15 leaves. A log function has been used to fit the  $F_v/F_m$  data ( $r^2 = 0.696$ ).  $c_i/c_a$  also decreased logarithmically before reaching a minimum value,  $c_i/c_amin$ , increasing markedly thereafter. A line representing the theoretical relationship between conductance and  $c_i/c_a$  under conditions in which  $g_s$  was the primary factor controlling decreasing photosynthesis is shown using the regression in Figure 1. This has been extended only to the  $g_s$  at which  $c_i/c_a$  was a minimum.

# **Other Conifers**

The response described above for *P. lawrencii* was characteristic of all the conifers measured. In all species  $c_i/c_a$  decreased during drought to  $(c_i/c_a)min$  at low  $g_s$ . Continued droughting beyond this point resulted in a pronounced increase in  $c_i/c_a$  as direct (nonstomatal) limitation of photosynthesis became significant. The minimum  $c_i/c_a$  for each species was averaged from at least three replicates (Table I).

A large degree of interspecific variation was observed in  $(c_i/c_a)min$ , with a maximum value of 0.36 in *A. pancheri* ranging to a minimum of 0.10 in *A. acuminatus*. Minimum  $c_i/c_a$  was strongly correlated ( $r^2 = 0.976$ ) with the  $\psi_1$  measured at  $(c_i/c_a)min$  (Fig. 4).

# **Broad-Leaved Angiosperms**

In contrast to the conifers, both *A. melanoxylon* and *E. tenuiramis* showed only minor decreases in  $c_i/c_a$  during the drought period. There was, however, a similar rapid increase in  $c_i/c_a$  as  $g_s$  approached 0. As in Figure 3a, the curves in Figures 5 and 6 represent the expected response if decreasing A was a pure function of  $g_s$  (insignificant nonstomatal component). The early divergence from this curve as  $g_s$  decreased would typically be interpreted as indicating an increase in nonstomatal limitation during the early stages of drought.

Increasing numbers of closed stomata were observed in stomatal impressions from *A. melanoxylon* leaves as a single plant was subject to drought (Fig. 5). Although average stomatal aperture was found to decrease as plants were droughted, closed stomata were clearly distinguished from partially open stomata, and a high proportion of stomata were found to close early during drought, while leaf conductance was still relatively high.

Changes in  $F_v/F_m$  in *E. tenuiramis* during drought were similar to those seen in *Podocarpus* (Fig. 3b), with no significant decrease until  $g_s$  fell below about 70 mmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, at which point a significant depression in quantum efficiency was found to occur.

The  $\psi_1$  immediately prior to the rapid increase in  $c_i/c_a$  was -2.9 and -3.20 MPa in *A. melanoxylon* and *E. tenuira-mis*, respectively.

<b>Table I.</b> Mean $c_i/c_a$ at approximately atmospheric [CO <sub>2</sub> ] for the nine species of conifers used
$(c_i/c_a)$ min refers to the mean minimum $c_i/c_a$ attained during drought. $\Psi_1$ at $(c_i/c_a)$ min represents the
lowest value of $\Psi_1$ measured at (c,/c <sub>a</sub> )min.

Species	Habitat <sup>a</sup>	c <sub>i</sub> /c <sub>a</sub> at c <sub>a</sub> = 360 µmol mol <sup>−1</sup>	(c <sub>i</sub> /c <sub>a</sub> )min	Ψ <sub>I</sub> at (c <sub>i</sub> /c <sub>a</sub> )min
				MPa
A. acuminatus	Dry sandy heathland	$0.63 \pm 0.0016$	0.10	-4.50
C. rhomboidea	Open woodland	$0.68 \pm 0.0017$	0.21	-3.20
P. lawrencii	Wet forest-alpine forest	$0.59 \pm 0.012$	0.21	-3.00
D. archerii	Wet montane-alpine forest	$0.57 \pm 0.014$	0.25	-2.90
M. niphophilus	Wet alpine forest	$0.60 \pm 0.010$	0.26	-2.70
A. selaginoides	Cool-temperate rainforest	$0.66 \pm 0.0075$	0.29	-2.10
L. franklinii	Cool-temperate rainforest	$0.65 \pm 0.0068$	0.30	-2.30
D. dacrydioides	Cool-temperate rainforest	$0.68 \pm 0.0057$	0.33	-1.90
A. pancheri	Tropical rainforest	$0.67 \pm 0.020$	0.36	-1.75
<sup>a</sup> Habitat descript	tions are from Enright and Hill (	1995).		



**Figure 4.** The relationship between  $c_i/c_amin$  and  $\psi_1$  at  $c_i/c_amin$  in the nine conifer species examined: *A. pancheri*,  $\mathbf{\nabla}$ ; *A. selaginoides*,  $\mathbf{\Box}$ ; *A. acuminatus*,  $\mathbf{\Phi}$ ; *C. rhomboidea*,  $\mathbf{\times}$ ; *D. dacridioides*,  $\mathbf{\oplus}$ ; *D. archerii*,  $\mathbf{\Xi}$ ; *L. franklinii*,  $\mathbf{\Delta}$ ; *P. lawrencii*,  $\mathbf{\Theta}$ ; *M. nipphophilus*,  $\mathbf{*}$ . A highly significant linear regression is shown ( $r^2 = 0.976$ ). Each point represents the avarage  $c_i/c_amin$  from at least three individuals, and  $\psi_1$  at  $c_i/c_amin$  represents the water potential reading that corresponded most closely with  $c_i/c_amin$ .

# DISCUSSION

The combination of narrow, single-vein leaf morphology and the drought regime used in this study should have minimized patchy stomatal closure and photosynthetic heterogeneity, adding a high degree of confidence to  $c_i$ calculations presented here. In contrast to previous studies



**Figure 5.** Response of  $c_s/c_a$  to decreasing  $g_s$  during drought in *A.* melanoxylon ( $\blacktriangle$ ). The curve shown represents the theoretical response if decreasing  $g_s$  explained the decline in photosynthesis (cf. Fig. 3a). Also shown is the percentage of stomata seen to be completely closed at six times during drought intensification in a single *A.* melanoxylon plant ( $\bigcirc$ ).



**Figure 6.** Drought response of  $c_i/c_a$  and  $g_s$  in *E. tenuiramis*; again the curve represents the theoretical response if decreasing photosynthesis was stomatally driven. Also shown are  $F_v/F_m$  data for a single replicate during drought.

(Wong et al., 1985), large variations in  $c_i$  were found to occur during drought, with an initial draw-down of  $c_i$  to between 25 and 55% of unstressed levels, followed by a rapid increase as  $\psi_1$  fell below a critical level.

During the initial "draw-down" phase, there was no evidence of nonstomatal limitation in any of the conifers studied. This is illustrated for P. lawrencii in Figure 3a, where the data show no systematic deviation from the theoretical curve produced if photosynthesis were responding only to increasing stomatal limitation of gas exchange (insignificant, nonstomatal component). Nonstomatal factors did, however, become important in plants droughted beyond  $(c_i/c_a)min$ , producing a sharp increase in  $c_i/c_a$  as  $g_s$  approached 0 (Fig. 3a). The fluorescence data for P. lawrencii also illustrate these two phases in drought response. Initially,  $F_v/F_m$  was found to slowly decline in parallel with  $c_i/c_a$ , presumably as a result of increased nonphotochemical energy dissipation, since Calvin cycle activity was inhibited by limiting CO2 concentration in the chloroplast (Cornic et al., 1989; Cornic and Briantais, 1991). As  $g_s$  approached 0 and  $c_i/c_a$  began to increase, there was a concomitant steep drop in  $F_v/F_m$  (Fig. 3b). This indicates a rapid loss of fluorescence from PSII for some reason other than CO<sub>2</sub> limitation and may represent direct inhibition of photochemistry, Calvin cycle activity, or both. The most likely explanation for this rapid onset of photoinhibition is that plants droughted beyond  $(c_i / c_a)min$  sustained damage to the photosynthetic apparatus. This is supported by the fact that these plants did not recover predrought photosynthetic rates, and after 2 to 4 d of continued drought they also showed visual signs of leaf damage.  $\psi_1$  measured at  $(c_i/c_a)$  min therefore represents the minimum  $\psi_i$  prior to the onset of irreversible photoinhibition. Values of  $\psi_1$  at  $(c_i/$  $c_a$ )min ranged widely from -1.75 to -4.5 MPa, reflecting the wide range of habitats from which different species were collected. In comparison, initial cell damage in rapidly desiccated *Helianthus* leaves was found to occur at a  $\psi_1$ of -1.5 MPa, with the majority of mesophyll cells damaged at -2.6 MPa (Fellows and Boyer, 1978). The leaves of the conifer species used here were clearly more robust than those of Helianthus, a fact that is hardly surprising considering the perennial, woody nature of these species.

 $c_i/c_a$  is inversely proportional to the "intrinsic" water use efficiency and, hence,  $(c_i/c_a)min^{-1}$  represents the maximum water use efficiency attainable during drought. Qualitative comparison of  $(c_i/c_a)min$  with habitat indicates that species developing low  $(c_i/c_a)min$  were from drier habitats (*A. acuminatus* grows in dry heathland), and species with higher  $(c_i/c_a)min$  were from rainforest (*A. pancheri* grows in tropical cloud forest) (Table I). These qualitative observations are strongly supported by the highly significant correlation between  $(c_i/c_a)min$  and  $\psi_i$  at  $(c_i/c_a)min$ (Fig. 4), indicating that  $(c_i/c_a)min$  provides a good index of drought tolerance (of the foliage at least) in plants not susceptible to patchy photosynthesis.

The dynamic response described for the narrow-leaved conifers was not found to occur in the broad-leaved angiosperm species used here. Both species exhibited relatively constant  $c_i/c_a$  during drought, as described in many other studies (Wong et al., 1985; Anderson et al., 1995). This type of response has classically been interpreted as showing a gradual increase in nonstomatal limitation of photosynthesis during drought. The data presented here do not, how-ever, show any evidence for nonstomatal inhibition in *E. tenuiramis* until leaf conductance had declined to around 25% of the level found in undroughted plants (Fig. 6), indicating that the leaves had responded to drought well before nonreversible photoinhibition became significant.

The fact that both species are relatively drought tolerant, with *A. melanoxylon* foliage found to withstand  $\psi_l$  of around -3.5 MPa (Brodribb and Hill, 1993) and *E. tenuiramis* capable of surviving soil water potentials in the field of around -2.9 MPa without leaf damage (M. Battaglia and N. Davidson, personal communication), also suggests that it is unlikely that direct inhibition of photosynthesis should have occurred soon after water was withheld. Patchy stomatal closure provides a better explanation for the responses illustrated in Figures 5 and 6, and this is confirmed for *A. melanoxylon*, in which the number of stomata found to be fully closed increased rapidly with the onset of drought (Fig 5). This type of preemptive stomatal closure may be explained by fluxes of ABA that are released from the roots and translocated in the xylem (Khalil and Grace, 1993; Jackson et al., 1995), since it has been shown that initial translocation of ABA occurs at  $\psi_1$  values equivalent to only mild drought (Correia and Pereira, 1994).

At some stage during drought it is inevitable that direct inhibition of photosynthesis will occur either by physical effects, such as turgor loss or cell damage, or by loss of chemical function in the chloroplasts. The important question is whether nonstomatal inhibition occurs early during drought, depressing photosynthesis while significant rates of gas exchange are taking place, or whether this effect occurs only in highly stressed plants as  $g_s$  approaches a minimum. All narrow-leaved conifers in this study exhibited the latter response to drought, resulting in substantial reductions in  $c_i/c_a$  prior to any expression of nonstomatal inhibition. This result supports <sup>13</sup>C discrimination and fluorescence data, indicating a dynamic response of  $c_i/c_a$  to drought and a minimal nonstomatal influence on assimilation until plants are subject to a severe water stress.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author gratefully acknowledges Bob Hill and Greg Jordan for commenting on the manuscript, Mark Hovendon for useful discussion, and the Australian Antarctic Division for the use of the fluorometer.

Received December 13, 1995; accepted February 2, 1996. Copyright Clearance Center: 0032–0889/96/111/0179/07.

### LITERATURE CITED

- Anderson JE, Nowak RS, Rasmuson KE, Toft NL (1995) Gas exchange and resource use efficiency of *Leymus cinereus* (Poaceae): diurnal and seasonal responses to naturally declining soil moisture. Am J Bot 82: 699–708
- **Björkman O, Demmig B** (1987) Photon yield of  $O_2$  evolution and chlorophyll fluorescence at 77K among vascular plants of diverse origins. Planta **170**: 489–504
- **Boyer JS** (1971) Nonstomatal inhibition of photosynthesis in sunflower at low leaf water potential and high light intensities. Plant Physiol **48**: 532–536
- Brodribb Ť, Hill RS (1993) A physiological comparison of leaves and phyllodes in Acacia melanoxylon. Aust J Bot 41: 293–305
- **Cardon ZG, Mott KA, Berry JA** (1994) Dynamics of patchy stomatal movements, and their contribution to steady-state and oscillating stomatal conductance calculated using gas exchange techniques. Plant Cell Environ **17**: 995–1007
- **Cornic G, Briantais J-M** (1991) Partitioning of photosynthetic electron flow between  $CO_2$  and  $O_2$  reduction in a  $C_3$  leaf (*Phaseolus vulgaris*) at different  $CO_2$  concentrations and during drought stress. Planta **183**: 178–184
- Cornic G, Le Gouallec J-L, Briantais J-M, Hodges M (1989) Effect of dehydration and high light on photosynthesis of two C<sub>3</sub> plants (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L and *Elatostema repens* Hall.f). Planta 177: 84–90
- **Correia MJ, Pereira JS** (1994) Abscisic acid in apoplastic sap can account for the restriction in leaf conductance of white lupins during moderate soil drying and after rewatering. Plant Cell Environ **17**: 845–852
- Donovan LA, Ehleringer JR (1994) Potential for selection on plants for water-use efficiency as estimated by carbon isotope discrimination. Am J Bot 81: 927–935
- Downton WJS, Loveys BR, Grant WJR (1988) Stomatal closure fully accounts for the inhibition of photosynthesis by abscisic acid. New Phytol 108: 263–266

- Ehleringer JR, Cook CS (1984) Photosynthesis in *Encelia farinosa* Gray in response to decreasing leaf water potential. Plant Physiol 75: 688–693
- Ehleringer JR, Phillips SL, Comstock JP (1992) Seasonal variation in the carbon isotopic composition of desert plants. Funct Ecol 6: 396–404
- Enright NJ, Hill RS (1995) Ecology of the Southern Conifers. Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, Australia
- Farquhar GD, Sharkey TD (1982) Stomatal conductance and photosynthesis. Annu Rev Plant Physiol 33: 317–345
- Fellows RJ, Boyer JS (1978) Altered ultrastructure of cells of sunflower leaves having low water potentials. Protoplasma 93: 381-395
- Genty B, Briantais J-M, Viera Da Silva JB (1987) Effects of drought on primary photosynthetic processes of cotton leaves. Plant Physiol 83: 360–364
- Graan T, Boyer JS (1990) Very high  $CO_2$  partially restores photosynthesis in sunflower at low water potentials. Planta 181: 378–384
- **Grieu P, Guehl JM, Aussenac G** (1988) The effects of soil and atmospheric drought on photosynthesis and stomatal control of gas exchange in three coniferous species. Physiol Plant **73**: 97–104
- Gunasekera G, Berkowitz GA (1992) Heterogenous stomatal closure in response to drought is not a universal phenomenon. Plant Physiol 98: 660–665
- Gunasekera G, Berkowitz GA (1993) Use of transgenic plants with ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase antisense DNA to evaluate the rate limitation of photosynthesis under water stress. Plant Physiol 103: 629–635
- Hubick KT, Shorter R, Farquhar GD (1988) Heritability and genotype X environment interactions of carbon discrimination and transpiration efficiency in peanut. Aust J Plant Physiol 15: 799–813
- Jackson GE, Irvine J, Grace J, Khalil AAM (1995) Abscisic acid concentrations and fluxes in droughted conifer saplings. Plant Cell Environ 18: 13–22

- Khalil AAM, Grace J (1993) Does xylem sap ABA control the stomatal behaviour of water stressed sycamore (*Acer pseudoplatanus* L.) seedlings? J Exp Bot **44**: 1127–1134
- Majumdar S, Ghosh S, Glick BR, Dumbroff EB (1991) Activities of chlorophyllase, phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase and ribulose-1,5- bisphosphate carboxylase in the primary leaves of soybean during senescence and drought. Physiol Plant 81: 473–480
- Pospisilova J, Santrucek J (1994) Stomatal patchiness. Biol Plant 36: 481-510
- Sharkey TD, Badger MR (1982) Effects of water stress on photosynthetic electron transport, photophosphorylation and metabolite level of *Xanthium strumarium* cells. Planta 156: 199–206
- Siebke K, Weis E (1995) Assimilation images of leaves of Glechoma hederacea—analysis of non-synchronous stomata related oscillations. Planta 196: 155–165
- Slatyer RO (1967) Plant-Water Relationships. Academic Press, New York
- Smith SD, Osmond CB (1987) Stem photosynthesis in a desert ephemeral, *Eriogonum inflatum*. Oecologia 72: 533–541
  Terashima I, Wong S-C, Osmond B, Farquhar GD (1988) Char-
- Terashima I, Wong S-C, Osmond B, Farquhar GD (1988) Characterisation of non-uniform photosynthesis induced by abscisic acid in leaves having different mesophyll anatomies. Plant Cell Physiol 29: 385–394
- vanRensburg L, Krüger GH (1993) Comparative analysis of different drought stress-induced suppression of and recovery in carbon dioxide fixation: stomatal and non-stomatal limitation in *Nicotiana tabacum* L. J Plant Physiol **142**: 296–306
- von Caemmerer S, Farquhar GD (1981) Some relationships between the biochemistry of photosynthesis and gas exchange of leaves. Planta 153: 376–387
- Wise RR, Ortiz-Lopez A, Ort DR (1992) Spatial distribution of photosynthesis during drought in field-grown and acclimated and nonacclimated growth chamber-grown cotton. Plant Physiol 100: 26–32
- Wong S-C, Cowan IR, Farquhar GD (1985) Leaf conductance in relation to rate of CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation. III. Influences of water stress and photoinhibition. Plant Physiol **78**: 830–834