

This is an electronic appendix to the paper by Jennions & Møller 2002 Relationships fade with time: a meta-analysis of temporal trends in publication in ecology and evolution. *Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B* **269**, 43–48.

Electronic appendices are refereed with the text. However, no attempt has been made to impose a uniform editorial style on the electronic appendices.

## APPENDIX A

### Original meta-analyses used

1. Arnqvist, G., Nilsson. T. 2000. The evolution of polyandry: multiple mating and female fitness in insects. *Anim. Behav.* **60**, 145-164.
2. Boissier, J., Morand, S., Mone, H. 1999. A review of performance and pathogenicity of male and female *Schistosoma mansoni* during the life cycle. *Parasitology* **119**, 447-454.
3. Brett, M.T., Goldman, C. 1996. A meta-analysis of the freshwater trophic cascade. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* **93**, 7723-7726.
4. Côté, I.M., Poulin, R. 1995. Parasitism and group size in social animals: a meta-analysis. *Behavioral Ecology* **6**, 159-165.
5. Côté, I.M., Sutherland, W.J. 1997. The effectiveness of removing predators to protect bird populations. *Conservation Biology* **11**, 395-405.
6. Curtis, P.S. 1996. A meta-analysis of leaf gas exchange and nitrogen in trees grown under elevated carbon dioxide. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **19**, 127-137. (Using the data file at: <http://cdiac.esd.ornl.gov/epubs/ndp/ndp072/ndp072.html>)
7. Curtis, P.S., Wang, X. 1998. A meta-analysis of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> effects on woody plant mass, form, and physiology. *Oecologia* **113**, 299-313.
8. Downing, J.A., Osenberg, C.W., Sarnelle, O. 1999. Meta analysis of marine nutrient enrichment experiments: Variation in the magnitude of nutrient limitation. *Ecology* **80**, 1157-1167.
9. Englund, G., Sarnelle, O., Cooper S.D. 1999. The importance of data selection criteria: Meta analyses of stream predation experiments. *Ecology* **80**, 1132-1141.
10. Fernandez-Duque, E., Valeggia, C. 1994. Meta-analysis: a valuable tool in conservation research. *Conservation Biology* **8**, 555-561.
11. Fiske, P., Rintamäki, P., Karvonen, E. 1998. Mating success in lekking males: a meta-analysis. *Behavioral Ecology* **9**, 328-338.
12. Gontard-Danek, M.C., Møller, A.P. 1999. The strength of sexual selection: A meta analysis of bird studies. *Behavioral Ecology* **10**, 476- 486.
13. Gurevitch, J., Hedges, L.V. 1993. Meta-analysis: combining the results of independent experiments. In: S. Scheiner, J. Gurevitch (eds.). *Design and Analysis of Experiments*, pp. 378-398, Chapman & Hall, New York. (As presented in Rosenberg et al. 2000).

14. Järvinen, A. 1991. A meta-analytic study of the effects of female age on laying-date and clutch-size in the Great Tit *Parus major* and the Pied Flycatcher *Ficedula hypoleuca*. *Ibis* **133**, 62-67.
15. Jennions, M.J., Møller A.P., Petrie, M. 2001. Sexually selected traits and adult survival: a meta-analysis of the phenotypic relationship. *Quarterly Review of Biology* **76**, 3-36.
16. Koricheva, J. 2001. Meta-analysis of sources of variation in fitness costs of plant antiherbivore defenses. *Ecology* (in press).
17. Koricheva, J., Larsson, S., Haukioja, E., Keinanen, M. 1999. Regulation of woody plant secondary metabolism by resource availability: Hypothesis testing by means of meta analysis. *Oikos* **83**, 212-226.
18. Koricheva, J., Larsson, S., Haukioja, E. 1998. Insect performance on experimentally stressed woody plants: a meta-analysis. *Annual Review of Entomology* **43**, 195-216.
19. Leung, B., Forbes, M.R. 1996. Fluctuating asymmetry in relation to stress and fitness: effects of trait type as revealed by meta-analysis. *Ecoscience* **3**, 400-413. (using the data file at [www.biology.ualberta.ca/palmer.hp/DataFiles.htm](http://www.biology.ualberta.ca/palmer.hp/DataFiles.htm))
20. Micheli, F. 1997. Eutrophication, fisheries and consumer-dynamics in marine pelagic ecosystems. *Science* **285**, 1396-1398.
21. McCurdy, D.G., Shutler, D., Mullie, A., Forbes, M.R. 1998. Sex-biased parasitism of avian hosts: relation to blood parasite taxon and mating system. *Oikos* **82**, 303-312.
22. Møller, A.P. 1999. Asymmetry as a predictor of growth, fecundity and survival. *Ecology Letters* **2**, 149-156.
23. Møller, A.P. 2000. Developmental stability and pollination. *Oecologia* **123**, 149-157.
24. Møller, A.P., Alatalo, R.V. 1999. Good genes effects in sexual selection. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B* **266**, 85-91.
25. Møller, A.P., Christe, P., Lux, E. 1999. Parasitism, host immune function, and sexual selection. *Quarterly Review of Biology* **74**, 3-20.
26. Møller, A.P., Ninni, P. 1998. Sperm competition and sexual selection: a meta-analysis of paternity studies of birds. *Behavioural Ecology and Sociobiology* **43**, 345-358.
27. Møller, A.P., Shykoff, J.A. 1999. Morphological developmental stability in plants: Patterns and causes. *International Journal of Plant Sciences* **160**, S135-S146.
28. Møller, A.P., Thornhill, R. 1998. Bilateral symmetry and sexual selection: a meta-analysis. *American Naturalist* **151**, 174-192.
29. Mosqueira, I., Côté, I.M., Jennings, S., Reynolds, J.D. 2000. Conservation benefits of marine reserves for fish populations. *Animal Conservation* **3**, 321-332.
30. Osenberg, C.W., Sarnelle, O., Cooper, S.D., Holt, R.D. 1999. Resolving ecological questions through meta analysis: Goals, metrics, and models. *Ecology* **80**, 1105-1117. (Data set 1)
31. Osenberg, C.W., Sarnelle, O., Cooper, S.D., Holt, R.D. 1999. Resolving ecological questions through meta analysis: Goals, metrics, and models. *Ecology* **80**, 1105-1117. (Data set 2)
32. Poulin, R. 2000. Manipulation of host behaviour by parasites: A weakening paradigm? *Proceedings of the Royal Society Biological Sciences Series B* **267**, 787-792.

33. Poulin, R. 2000. Variation in the intraspecific relationship between fish length and intensity of parasitic infection: Biological and statistical causes. *Journal of Fish Biology* **56**, 123-137.
34. Riessen, H.P. 1999. Predator-induced life history shifts in *Daphnia*: a synthesis of studies using meta-analysis. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* **56**, 2487-2494.
35. Schalk, G., Forbes, M.R. 1997. Male biases in parasitism of mammals: effects of study type, host age, and parasite taxon. *Oikos* **78**, 67-74.
36. Schmitz, O.J., Hamback, P.A., Beckerman, A.P. 2000. Trophic cascades in terrestrial systems: A review of the effects of carnivore removals on plants. *American Naturalist* **155**, 141-153.
37. Sheridan, L.A.D., Poulin, R., Ward, D.F., Zuk, M. 2000. Sex differences in parasitic infections among arthropod hosts: Is there a male bias? *Oikos* **88**, 327-334.
38. Sokolovska, N., Rowe, L., Johansson, F. 2000. Fitness and body size in mature odonates. *Ecological Entomology* **25**, 239-248.
39. Thornhill, R., Møller, A.P. 1999. The relative importance of size and asymmetry in sexual selection. *Behavioral Ecology* **9**, 546-551. (Only effect sizes for size)
40. Tonhasca, A.J., Byrne, D.N. 1994. The effects of crop diversification on herbivorous insects: a meta-analytic approach. *Ecological Entomology* **19**, 239-244.
41. Van Zandt, P.A., Mopper, S. 1998. A meta-analysis of adaptive deme formation in phytophagous insect populations. *American Naturalist* **152**, 595-604.
42. Van der Werf, E. 1992. Lack's clutch size hypothesis: an examination of the evidence using meta-analysis. *Ecology* **73**, 1699-1705.
43. Vollestad, L.A., Hindar, K., Møller, A.P. 1999. A meta analysis of fluctuating asymmetry in relation to heterozygosity. *Heredity* **83**, 206-218.
44. Wang, X., Curtis, P.S. 2001. A meta-analytical test of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> effects on plant respiration. *Plant Ecology* (in press).

#### Meta-analyses inspected but not used

These prospective studies were examined and excluded because either: (1) They did not present effect sizes for original empirical studies, only mean effect sizes, and the authors were unable to send original effect sizes; (2) they had been updated and therefore overlapped with a more recent meta-analysis that we did include; (3) there was almost no variation in year of publication; (4) too few effect sizes were given ( $n < 5$ ); (5) they were generally unsuitable because they presented complex statistics where effect size depended on a continuous variable; (6) we did not include studies where heritability was the effect size because it is unclear whether heritability ( $h^2$ ) or an effect size calculated from the P-value of the associated regression should be used.

1. Arnqvist, G., Rowe, L., Krupa, J.J., Sih, A. 1996. Assortative mating by size: a meta-analysis of mating patterns in water striders. *Evolutionary Ecology* **10**, 265-284.
2. Davis, W.J. 1993. Contamination of coastal versus ocean surface waters: A brief meta-analysis. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* **26**, 128-134.

3. Drake, P., Baldo, F., Saenz, V., Arias, A.M. 2000. Macrobenthic community structure in estuarine pollution assessment on the Gulf of Cadiz (SW Spain): Is the Phylum level meta analysis approach applicable? *Marine Pollution Bulletin* **38**, 1038-1047.
4. Duarte, C.M. 1999. Seagrass ecology at the turn of the millennium: Challenges for the new century. *Aquatic Botany* **65**, 7-20.
5. Englund, G., Evander, D. 1999. Interactions between sculpins, net spinning caddis larvae and midge larvae. *Oikos* **85**, 117-126.
6. Goffinet, B., Gerber, S. 2000. Quantitative trait loci: A meta analysis. *Genetics* **155**, 463-473.
7. Gurevitch, J., Morrison, J.A., Hedges, L.V. 2000. The interaction between competition and predation: A meta analysis of field experiments. *American Naturalist* **155**, 435-453.
8. Gurevitch, J., Morrow, L.L., Wallace, A., Walsh, J.S. 1992. A meta-analysis of competition in Field experiments. *American Naturalist* **140**, 539-572.
9. Goldberg, D.E., Rajaniemi, T., Gurevitch, J., Stewart, O.A. 1999. Empirical approaches to quantifying interaction intensity: Competition and facilitation along productivity gradients. *Ecology* **80**, 1118-1131.
10. Gwaze, D.P., Bridgwater, F.E., Byram, T.D., Woolliams, J.A., Williams, C.G. 2000. Predicting age age genetic correlations in tree breeding programs: A case study of *Pinus taeda* L. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics* **100**, 199-206.
11. Hamilton, W.J., Poulin, R. 1997. The Hamilton and Zuk hypothesis: a meta analytic approach. *Behaviour* **134**, 299-320.
12. Harper, D.G.C. 2000. Feather mites, pectoral muscle condition, wing length and plumage coloration of passerines. *Anim. Behav.* **58**, 553-562.
13. Jonsson, N.N., Mayer, D.G. 1999. Estimation of the effects of buffalo fly (*Haematobia irritans exigua*) on the milk production of dairy cattle based on a meta-analysis of literature data. *Medical and Veterinary Entomology* **13**, 372-376.
14. Lehrer, M. 2000. Shape perception in the honeybee: Symmetry as a global framework. *International Journal of Plant Sciences.* **160**, S51-S65.
15. Monteiro, L.R., Granadeiro, J.P., Furness, R.W., Oliveira, P. 1999. Contemporary patterns of mercury contamination in the Portuguese Atlantic inferred from mercury concentrations in seabird tissues. *Marine Environmental Research* **47**, 137-156.
16. Møller, A.P., Christe, P., Erritzøe, J., Mavarez, J. 1998. Condition, disease and immune defence. *Oikos* **83**, 301-306.
17. Møller, A.P., Thornhill, R. 1997. A meta-analysis of the heritability of developmental stability. *Journal of evolutionary Biology* **10**, 1-16.
18. Osenberg, C.W., Sarnelle, O., Cooper, S.D. 1997. Effect size in ecological experiments: the application of biological models in meta-analysis. *American Naturalist* **150**, 798-812.
19. Osler, G.H.R., Beattie, A.J. 1999. Taxonomic and structural similarities in soil oribatid communities. *Ecography* **22**, 567-574.
20. Planque, B., Fredou, T. 1999. Temperature and the recruitment of Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*). *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* **56**, 2069-2077.
21. Pomiankowski, A., Møller, A.P. 1995. A resolution of the lek paradox. *Proceedings of the Royal Society Biological Sciences Series B* **260**, 21-29.

22. Poorter, H., Nagel, O. 2000. The role of biomass allocation in the growth response of plants to different levels of light, CO<sub>2</sub>, nutrients and water: A quantitative review. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* **27**, 595-607.
23. Poulin, R. 1994. Meta-analysis of parasite-induced behavioural changes. *Animal Behaviour* **48**, 137-146.
24. Poulin, R. 1996. Sexual inequalities in helminth infections: a cost of being a male? *American Naturalist* **147**, 287-295.
25. Ridenour, T.A., Heath, A.C. 1999. A note on issues in meta analysis for behavioral genetic studies using categorical phenotypes. *Behavior Genetics* **29**, 155-162.
26. Simmons, L.W., Tomkins, J.L., Kotiaho, J.S., Hunt, J. 1999. Fluctuating paradigm. *Proceedings of the Royal Society Biological Sciences Series B.* **266**, 593-595.
27. Snedaker, S.C., Araujo, R.J., Capin, A.A., Hearon, M.D., Ofengand, E.A. 1999. Organochlorine compounds in subtropical and tropical marine organisms: A meta analysis. *Toxicology and Industrial Health* **15**, 214-230.
28. Stevens, R.D., Willig, M.R. 1999. Size assortment in New World bat communities. *Journal of Mammalogy* **80**, 644-658.
29. Stolley, D.S., Bissonette, J.A., Kadlec, J.A. 1999. Evaluation of methods to estimate gosling survival. *Journal of Field Ornithology* **70**, 374-379.
30. Swaine, M.D., Becker, P. 1999. Woody life form composition and association on rainfall and soil fertility gradients in Ghana. *Plant Ecology* **145**, 167-173.
31. Thrush, S.F., Hewitt, J.E., Cummings, V.J., Green, M.O., Funnell, G.A., Wilkinson, M.R. 2000. The generality of field experiments: Interactions between local and broad scale processes. *Ecology* **81**, 399-415.
32. Tufto, J., Saether, B.E., Engen, S., Arcese, P., Jerstad, K., Rostad, O.W., Smith, J.N. M. 2000. Bayesian meta analysis of demographic parameters in three small, temperate passerines. *Oikos* **88**, 273-281.
33. Van Dongen, S. 2000. The heritability of fluctuating asymmetry: A Bayesian hierarchical model. *Annales Zoologici Fennici* **37**, 15-23.
34. Warwick, R.M., Clarke, K.R. 1993. Comparing the severity of disturbance: A meta-analysis of marine macrobenthic community data. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **92**, 221-231.
35. Westlake, K.P., Rowe, L. 1999. Developmental costs of male sexual traits in the water strider *Rheumatobates rileyi*. *Canadian Journal of Zoology* **77**, 917-922.
36. Wooster, D. 1994. Predator impacts on stream benthic prey. *Oecologia* **99**, 7-15.
37. Xiong, S., Nilsson, C. 1999. The effects of plant litter on vegetation: A meta analysis. *Journal of Ecology* **87**, 984-994.