

JAMIA M1062 ONLINE DATA SUPPLEMENT Table 1:

Structure and size of the review criteria of BMJ, JAMIA, CONSORT and of the proposed refined quality criteria.

	BMJ	JAMIA	CONSORT	Proposed refined quality criteria
Significance, scientific impact	16 criteria (as part of rejection checklist)	(part of criteria for specific types of papers)		5 criteria
General quality of content	12 criteria (as part of rejection checklist) 6 criteria (as part of scientific reliability)	(part of criteria for specific types of papers)		25 criteria
Additional criteria for certain types of papers	12 criteria for qualitative research 11 for general statistics 26 for RCT 35 for health economics papers 23 for clinical management guidelines	5 criteria for review papers 3 criteria for viewpoint papers 4 criteria for application reports 6 criteria for model formulation papers 6 criteria for research papers	21 criteria for RCT reports	10 criteria for empirical investigations (incl. RCT) 7 for qualitative research papers 5 for methodological papers 7 for application reports 7 for systematic reviews 6 for viewpoint papers
Originality	1 criteria	(part of criteria for specific types of papers)		3 criteria
Coverage of literature	1 criteria (as part of scientific reliability)	(part of criteria for specific types of papers)		4 criteria
Organization of paper		(part of criteria for specific types of papers)		14 criteria