# Mapping of the Inducible IkB Phosphorylation Sites That Signal Its Ubiquitination and Degradation<sup>†</sup>

JOSEPH DIDONATO,<sup>1</sup> FRANK MERCURIO,<sup>2</sup> CARIDAD ROSETTE,<sup>1</sup> JIAN WU-LI,<sup>2</sup> HELENA SUYANG,<sup>3</sup> SANKAR GHOSH,<sup>3</sup> and MICHAEL KARIN<sup>1</sup>\*

Department of Pharmacology, Program in Biomedical Sciences, University of California, San Diego School of Medicine, La Jolla, California 92093-0636<sup>1</sup>; Signal Pharmaceuticals, San Diego, California 92121<sup>2</sup>; and Section of Immunobiology and Department of Molecular Biophysics and Biochemistry, Howard Hughes Medical Institute, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, Connecticut 06520<sup>3</sup>

Received 17 November 1995/Accepted 5 January 1996

Extracellular stimuli that activate the transcription factor NF- $\kappa$ B cause rapid phosphorylation of the I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ inhibitor, which retains NF- $\kappa$ B in the cytoplasm of nonstimulated cells. Phosphorylation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  is followed by its rapid degradation, the inhibition of which prevents NF- $\kappa$ B activation. To determine the relationship between these events, we mapped the inducible phosphorylation sites of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ . We found that two residues, serines 32 and 36, were phosphorylated in response to either tumor necrosis factor, interleukin-1, or phorbol ester. Substitution of either serine blocks or slows down induction of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation. Substitutions of the homologous sites in I $\kappa$ B $\beta$ , serines 19 and 23, also prevent inducible I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  degradation. We suggest that activation of a single I $\kappa$ B kinase or closely related I $\kappa$ B kinases is the first critical step in NF- $\kappa$ B activation. Once phosphorylated, I $\kappa$ B is ubiquitinated. Unlike wild-type I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , the phosphorylation-defective mutants do not undergo inducible polyubiquitination. As substitution of a conserved lysine residue slows down the ubiquitination and degradation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  without affecting its phosphorylation, polyubiquitination is required for inducible I $\kappa$ B degradation.

The transcription factor NF-kB is composed of heterodimeric and homodimeric complexes of the Rel proteins p50 (NF-кB1), p52 (NF-кB2), p65 (RelA), RelB, and c-Rel (reviewed in references 7, 22, 33, and 42). Originally described as a constitutively active nuclear factor in B lymphocytes (41), NF-kB is cytoplasmic in most other cell types, but following exposure to a variety of extracellular stimuli, it translocates to the nucleus and activates transcription of specific target genes (reviewed in references 4, 23, and 42). The cytoplasmic retention of NF-KB in nonstimulated cells is mediated by a family of inhibitor proteins, the IkBs (reviewed in references 5 and 20). As specific molecular reagents were first available for  $I\kappa B\alpha$ , more is known about its regulation than about other IKBs. Exposure of cells to NF-KB-activating stimuli, including tumor necrosis factor alpha (TNF- $\alpha$ ), interleukin-1 (IL-1), lipopolysaccharide (LPS), 12-O-tetradecanoylphorbol-13-acetate (TPA), and UV irradiation, results in rapid  $I\kappa B\alpha$  degradation (6, 11, 14, 15, 27, 34). Recently some of these stimuli were also shown to trigger degradation of IkBB, albeit with kinetics different from that for I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation (44). In addition, inhibitors of IkB $\alpha$  degradation, most notably peptide aldehydes that also inhibit the multifunctional protease (26S proteasome), were found to prevent NF-KB activation (2, 16, 17, 32, 38, 39, 46). It was therefore suggested that degradation of IkB by the proteasome is an essential early step in the NF-KB activation pathway (reviewed in references 13 and 43).

Degradation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  is preceded by its phosphorylation. Although phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  does not cause its dissociation from NF- $\kappa B$ , it appears that the phosphorylated form may be preferentially degraded (2, 16, 17, 32, 38, 46). Phosphopeptide mapping suggested that inducible  $I\kappa B\alpha$  phosphorylation occurs on a small number of sites (16). Recently, through the use of site-directed mutagenesis, it was suggested that these sites include S-32 and S-36 (9, 10, 45, 50). However, no biochemical proof that S-32 and S-36 are indeed the inducible phosphoacceptor sites was provided, and it remains possible that substitution of these serines affects IkBa phosphorylation or metabolism indirectly. To gain better insight to the mechanism of NF-KB activation and the nature of the IKB kinase(s), we undertook biochemical identification of the inducible phosphorylation sites on I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ . Using phosphopeptide mapping and phosphoamino acid analysis coupled to digestion with different proteases, we identified the inducible phosphoacceptor sites as S-32 and S-36. This assignment was confirmed by site-directed mutagenesis, and the resulting mutants were stable following cell stimulation with either TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-1, or TPA. Interestingly, replacement of S-32 and S-36 by threonines, a substitution that usually does not interfere with protein phosphorylation by serine/threonine kinases, slowed down or blocked IKBa phosphorylation and degradation. Substitutions for these serines also interfered with conversion of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  to higher-molecular-weight polyubiquitinated forms. Substitutions at the homologous sites in IkBB, S-19 and S-23, had a similar effect and blocked signal-induced IkBB degradation. These results strongly suggest that both IkBs are targeted by the same kinases or a small group of similar kinases and are not regulated by separate pathways as previously suggested. We also identified a conserved lysine residue whose substitution interfered with the inducible polyubiquitination and degradation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  but not with its phosphorylation.

# MATERIALS AND METHODS

**Plasmids.** pHA-MAD-3 is a 3× hemagglutinin (HA)-tagged (51) version of MAD-3 (I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ ) containing the *NcoI*-to-*NotI* insert from pKGMAD-3 (16) inserted in frame behind the HA tag in pBluescript (KS<sup>+</sup>) (Stratagene). The different substitution mutants were made with the appropriate high-pressure

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. Mailing address: Department of Pharmacology, Program in Biomedical Sciences, University of California, San Diego School of Medicine 9500 Gilman Dr., La Jolla, CA 92093-0636. Phone: (619) 534-0872. Fax: (619) 534-8158.

<sup>†</sup> Dedicated to the memory of our friend Yoav Citri.

liquid chromatography-purified oligonucleotides (sequences available upon request) by using a Chameleon double-stranded DNA mutagenesis kit (Stratagene) with pHA-MAD-3 as the template. Mutants were sequenced on an ABI PRISM DNA sequencing system. pHA-I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  was made by inserting an *NcoI*-to-*NotI* insert from pBS-15f (44) in frame behind the HA tag in pBluescript (KS<sup>+</sup>) and was used as a template for making the different I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  substitution mutants by the methods described above. The wild-type (WT) and mutant HA-tagged I $\kappa$ Bs were excised from the pBluescript backbone and cloned between the *Hind*III and *Not*I sites of the pRc/ $\beta$  actin expression vector (26).

Antibodies and peptide aldehydes. Anti-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , anti-p65-C, and anti-I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  antibodies were described previously (15, 16, 44). Anti-p65 carboxyl-terminal antibody 519 (17) was a generous gift from A. Baldwin. The antibiduitin antibody was raised against sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS)-denatured ubiquitin (24) and was a generous gift from A. Haas. Anti-HA monoclonal antibody 12CA5 (51) was purified from ascites fluid. Affinity-purified antibodies against I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (c-21) and I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  (sc-20) were purchased from Santa Cruz Biotechnology. *N*-Acetyl-Leu-Leu-norleucinal (Ac-LL.R-CHO) was purchased from Calbiochem (San Diego, Calif.). Benzyloxycarbonyl-Leu-Leu-penylalaninal (Z-LLF-CHO) (49) was a generous gift of M. Orlowski and from Signal Pharmaceuticals. All peptide aldehydes were dissolved in absolute ethanol and stored at  $-80^{\circ}$ C.

Cells and transfections. NIH 3T3 and HeLa S3 cells were grown in Dulbecco's modified Eagle's medium supplemented with 10% fetal calf serum and 2 mM glutamine. Stably transfected HeLa cell pools were made by transfecting 3  $\times$  10<sup>5</sup> HeLa cells with either WT or mutant HA-I\_{\rm KB} expression vectors (1.5  $\mu g$ ) and Lipofectamine (6  $\mu$ l) as suggested by the manufacturer (Gibco-BRL). After 24 h, the medium was changed and G418 (1 mg/ml; Gibco-BRL) was added. Individual clones (at least 30 to 40 per plate) were pooled and propagated in the presence of G418.

Cell extracts. Nuclear extracts were prepared and mobility shift assays were performed as previously described (15). Cell-free translated proteins were prepared as previously described (36). To analyze IkB degradation, cells were either left untreated or stimulated with TNF-a (10 ng/ml), IL-1a (2 ng/ml; R&D Systems) or TPA (100 ng/ml; Sigma) for various times before being harvested in ice-cold phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) and pelleted at 2,000  $\times$  g at room temperature for 30 s. The cells were resuspended on ice in whole cell extract lysis buffer containing 25 mM N-2-hydroxyethylpiperazine-N'-2-ethanesulfonic acid (HEPES; pH 7.7), 0.3 M NaCl, 1.5 mM MgCl<sub>2</sub>, 0.2 mM EDTA, 0.5% (vol/vol) Triton X-100, 3 mM dithiothreitol, 40 mM  $\beta$ -glycerophosphate, 50 mM NaF, 1 mM Na<sub>3</sub>VO<sub>4</sub>, 20 mM p-nitrophenyl phosphate (Calbiochem), 10 µg each of aprotinin, leupeptin, bestatin, and pepstatin (all from Calbiochem) per ml, 100 µM tolylsulfonyl phenylalanyl chloromethyl ketone (TPCK), and 1 mM phenylmethylsulfonyl fluoride (both from Sigma). Lysates were rotated for 45 min at 4°C and centrifuged at 13,000  $\times$  g for 15 min. Protein concentration of the extracts was determined by the method of Bradford with a Bio-Rad dye system. SDS sample buffer was added to the supernatants, which were fractionated by SDS-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (PAGE) and transferred to Immobilon-P membranes. Immunoblot analysis was performed essentially as described previously (16) except that SDS-12% polyacrylamide gels were used.

Immunoprecipitation and peptide mapping. Immunoprecipitation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$ and p65 was performed as described previously (16, 35, 36). Cells were metabolically labeled with 32Pi (NEN-DuPont) as described previously (16). After 4 h of labeling, the cells were stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml), IL-1 (2 ng/ml), or TPA (100 ng/ml) and harvested in cold radioimmunoprecipitation assay (RIPA) buffer supplemented with phosphatase and protease inhibitors (16). When used, proteasome inhibitors were added 1.5 h prior to harvesting. IkBa was immunoprecipitated with IκBα antibody (16); HA-IκBβ was immunoprecipitated with anti-HA antibody 12CA5. After fractionation of the immune precipitates by SDS-PAGE (12% polyacrylamide gels) and transfer to nitrocellulose (Schleicher & Schuell), the phosphorylated IkB bands were identified by autoradiography, excised, and digested with various proteases (trypsin [Worthington]; V8, LYS-C, ASP-N, or thermolysin [Calbiochem]) or CNBr (Sigma). The resulting peptides were analyzed either by Tris-Tricine gel electrophoresis (TTE) (40) or by twodimensional phosphopeptide mapping (8, 16). For TTE analysis, the dried peptides were resuspended in 1× TTE sample buffer (0.0625 M Tris-Cl [pH 6.8], 1% SDS, 2.5% β-mercaptoethanol, 10% glycerol, 0.000125% bromophenol blue), boiled for 5 min, and fractionated on a Tris-Tricine gel consisting of a 24.75% polyacrylamide resolving gel (15 cm) containing 15% glycerol overlaid by a 10% polyacrylamide spacer gel (2 to 3 cm) and a 4% stacking gel. The spacer and resolving gel buffer was 0.1 M Tris-Cl (pH 8.45) and 0.1% SDS. The anode buffer was 0.2 M Tris-Cl (pH 8.9), and the cathode buffer (pH ~8.25) was 0.1 M Tris, 0.1 M Tricine, and 0.1% SDS. Electrophoresis was at 30 V until the samples had migrated into the stacking gel, at which time the voltage was increased to 100 V. After running, the gel was fixed for 45 min in 45% methanol-10% acetic acid-15% glycerol and then dried and exposed to X-ray film at  $-80^{\circ}$ C with an intensifying screen. Molecular mass standards (31 to 2.5 kDa; Promega), bacitracin (1.41 kDa), aprotinin (6.52 kDa), elastase substrate I (0.59 kDa), and [Leu<sup>5</sup>]-enkephalin (0.56 kDa; Calbiochem) were used to calibrate the gels.

**Analysis of IkB ubiquitination.** Cells were either left untreated or treated with the proteasome inhibitor Z-LLF-CHO (10  $\mu$ M) for 60 min and then incubated in the absence or presence of TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml) or IL-1 (2 ng/ml). At the indicated times, the cells were harvested in ice-cold PBS and lysed on ice in cold RIPA buffer supplemented with protease and phosphatase inhibitors as de-

scribed above 10 mM N-ethylmaleimide (NEM: Calbiochem) and 0.2% SDS The lysates were centrifuged at  $13,000 \times g$  for 25 min at 4°C. SDS sample buffer was added to the supernatants, which were then boiled for 10 min and fractionated on SDS-10% polyacrylamide gels. The proteins were transferred to Immobilon-P membranes (Millipore), and the immunoblots were probed with affinitypurified IKBa or IKBB antibody (Santa Cruz Biotechnology) or partially purified monoclonal antibody 12CA5 (anti-HA). Similar procedures were used to analyze anti-HA immunoprecipitates except that the immune complexes (isolated as described previously [36]) were washed in NEM-supplemented RIPA buffer and eluted with 0.1 M CAPSO (3-[cyclohexylamino]-2-hydroxy-1-propanesulfonic acid; pH 11.25; Sigma). The eluate was fractionated by SDS-PAGE (10% polyacrylamide gel) and transferred to an Immobilon-P membrane. Immunoblot analysis included affinity-purified antiubiquitin (conjugate-selective) antibody (23). To detect IkBa forms associated with p65 (RelA), cells were pretreated with Z-LLF-CHO as described above and then left unstimulated or stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml) for 12 min. The cells were then harvested and lysed in buffer which preserves the p65-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  complex (16). The lysis buffer was also supplemented with 10 mM NEM. The lysates were immunoprecipitated with C-terminal p65 antibody 519 or its preimmune serum. Immunoprecipitates were fractionated and analyzed by immunoblot analysis with IKBa antibody c-21 as described above.

### RESULTS

Biochemical identification of the inducible phosphorylation sites in I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ . I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  is phosphorylated to a low extent in resting cells, and upon cell stimulation with either TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-1, or TPA, it is highly phosphorylated on several new sites (16). To identify the inducible  $I\kappa B\alpha$  phosphorylation sites, we used high-resolution TTE to fractionate proteolyzed <sup>32</sup>P-labeled  $I\kappa B\alpha$  isolated from nonstimulated and TNF- $\alpha$ -stimulated HeLa or NIH 3T3 cells. CNBr cleavage yielded a phosphopeptide of approximately 2.5 kDa that contained the inducible phosphorylation sites, along with a few other larger peptides (which are partial cleavage products [data not shown]). Since CNBr cleaves at methionine residues, the only way it could generate a 2.5-kDa fragment of IkBa is by cleavage at M-13 and M-37 (Fig. 1A). Digestion of human IkBa with V8 protease generated a 2-kDa peptide containing the inducible phosphorylation sites (Fig. 1A). This phosphopeptide is most likely generated by cleavage at E-23 and E-40, as no other V8 digestion sites could give rise to a phosphopeptide of a similar size. Digestion of both human and mouse IkBas with endopeptidase LYS-C, which cleaves after lysine residues, produced a 4-kDa phosphopeptide containing the inducible phosphorylation sites. Considering the CNBr and V8 protease results and the distribution of lysines in the N-terminal portion of  $I\kappa B\alpha$ , this peptide is most likely due to a partial digest. As only the N-terminal portions of human and mouse IkBas contain properly spaced lysines that can give rise to such a peptide, these results are consistent with those of the CNBr and V8 digests.

Digestion with trypsin, which cleaves after positively charged residues, produced three phosphopeptides of approximately 1.0, 1.8, and 2.4 kDa that contain the inducible phosphorylation sites of both human and mouse IkBas. A larger, 6-kDa peptide contains the constitutive phosphorylation sites (Fig. 1A). Two-dimensional analysis of tryptic digests of human and mouse IkBas from TNF-a-stimulated cells revealed the presence of three major phosphopeptides (Fig. 1B) that, on the basis of comparison with IkBas isolated from nonstimulated cells, reflect inducible phosphorylation (data not shown, but see reference 16). Two-dimensional separation of a mixture of trypsin-digested human and mouse IkBas revealed that two of the phosphopeptides (1 and 3) comigrated and therefore are likely to be identical. Phosphopeptide 2, however, exhibited species-specific differences in its mobility, with the human version being more hydrophobic (Fig. 1B). The inducible tryptic phosphopeptides of human IkBa were isolated after two-dimensional separation and subjected to a secondary digest with endopeptidase ASP-N, which cleaves amino terminal to aspar-



FIG. 1. Mapping the inducible phosphorylation sites of  $I\kappa B\alpha$ . (A) In the top panel, HeLa and NIH 3T3 cells labeled with <sup>32</sup>P for 4 h were incubated with 100  $\mu$ M Ac-LLnL-CHO for 90 min prior to stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml). After 10 min, the cells were lysed, and  $I\kappa B\alpha$  was immunoprecipitated, separated by SDS-PAGE, and transferred to nitrocellulose membranes. The phosphorylated IkB $\alpha$  bands were identified by autoradiography, excised, and digested with either trypsin (TRYP; 50  $\mu$ g), or V8 protease (50  $\mu$ g), as indicated. The resulting phosphopeptides were separated on a Tris-Tricine gel and visualized by autoradiography for 3 to 4 days at  $-80^{\circ}$ C with an intensifying screen. Molecular masses (MW) are indicated in kilodaltons. The bottom panel shows a schematic depicting the location of the residues recognized by the different proteases and CNBr in human and mouse IkB $\alpha$ s. The locations of the CNBr- and V8-generated fragments containing the inducible phosphorylation sites are indicated. Note that approximately four to five times more counts per minute were loaded in the TNF $\alpha$  + lanes than the – lanes except for the V8 digest lanes, in which cases equal numbers of counts per minute were loaded. (B) Phosphopeptide maps of human and mouse IkB $\alpha$  isolated from TNF $\alpha$ -stimulated cells as described above. <sup>32</sup>P-labeled IkB $\alpha$ s were digested with trypsin, and the tryptic digests were subjected to two-dimensional separation (horizontal, high-voltage electrophoresis, vertical, thin-layer chromatography). A total of 1,500 cpm (human IkB $\alpha$ ), 1,100 cpm (mouse IkB $\alpha$ ), and 750 cpm each of human and mouse IkB $\alpha$  sindicated. Samples of the undigested and the digested petites were separated on a Tris-Tricine gel. A tryptic digest of human IkB $\alpha$  from TNF $\alpha$ -stimulated cells was used as a reference. Molecular masses (MW) are indicated in kilodaltons.

tates, or thermolysin, which cleaves amino terminal to hydrophobic residues. The different phosphopeptides were fractionated on high-resolution Tris-Tricine gels. Phosphopeptides 1 and 2 comigrated with the 1.0- and 2.4-kDa tryptic phosphopeptides, respectively (Fig. 1C), whereas phosphopeptide 3 comigrated with the 1.8-kDa tryptic phosphopeptide (data not shown). Digestion of either phosphopeptide 1 or 2 with ASP-N generated phosphopeptides migrating around 0.4 kDa, whereas thermolysin cleavage of phosphopeptide 1 generated a 0.7-kDa phosphopeptide (Fig. 1C).

Collectively, these results indicate that tryptic phosphopeptide 2 is most likely due to cleavage at R-24 and K-47, while the overlapping tryptic phosphopeptide 1 is most likely due to cleavage at R-29 and K-38. These assignments are consistent with the sizes of both phosphopeptides and the differences in hydrophobicity between the human and mouse versions of



FIG. 2. Time course analysis of WT and mutant  $I\kappa B\alpha$  degradation. (A) Cell pools stably expressing the indicated HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$  constructs were stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml). At the indicated times (minutes), whole cell lysates were prepared, and 30- $\mu$ g samples were separated by SDS-PAGE and transferred to Immobilon-P membranes. The abundances of endogenous and exogenous (HA-tagged) I $\kappa B\alpha$  were determined by immunoblotting with a polyclonal I $\kappa B\alpha$  antiserum and detection with enhanced chemical luminescence. Note that HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ (31A/35A) migrates faster than the other HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ s. (B) The different cell pools expressing WT and mutant HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$  and untransfected HeLa cells were incubated for 25 min with TNF- $\alpha$  (T; 10 ng/ml) or II-1 $\alpha$  (I; 2 ng/ml) or 67 30 min with TPA (P; 100 ng/ml). Whole cell lysates were prepared, fractionated by SDS-PAGE, and immunoblotted with anti-I $\kappa B\alpha$  antiserum as described above.

phosphopeptide 2. Within the region covered by these peptides, the two I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ s differ only at position 26, where the human version contains a leucine and the mouse polypeptide contains a valine. Phosphopeptide 3, on the other hand, is of identical hydrophobicity in both species and therefore is most likely due to cleavage at R-29 and K-47. The sizes of the thermolysin- and ASP-N-generated phosphopeptides are also consistent with these assignments. Thermolysin most likely cleaves at M-37, generating a peptide of seven amino acids. The ASP-N-generated peptides are most likely due to cleavage at D-31 and D-35. Therefore, the only sites on I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , whose phosphorylation is induced by TNF- $\alpha$ , that are compatible with all of these results are S-32 and S-36.

Mutant analysis of IkBa degradation. To confirm the assignment of S-32 and S-36 as the inducible phosphoacceptor sites and examine their roles, they were replaced by either alanines (32A, 36A, and 32A/36A) or threonines (32T and 36T). In addition, the aspartates which precede both serines were altered either singularly (31A and 35G) or doubly (31A/ 35A). The WT and mutant I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  alleles were tagged with the influenza virus HA epitope (51) and stably transfected into HeLa S3 cells. Pools of G418-resistant cells were established, and after incubation with TNF- $\alpha$ , the levels of endogenous and exogenous (HA-tagged) IκBα were examined by immunoblotting (Fig. 2A). In all cases, endogenous IkBa was degraded rapidly and very little protein was found 5 min after TNF-a addition. WT HA-IkBa was degraded with kinetics similar to that for endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ . Mutant 234A, generated as a control, was also rapidly degraded. On the other hand, mutants 32A, 36A, and 32A/36A were not degraded upon cell stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$ . Surprisingly, mutants 32T and 36T were also defective in their responses to TNF- $\alpha$ . While mutant 36T was degraded more slowly than WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , 32T was degraded with extremely slow kinetics. Interestingly, 31A and 31A/35A were also stable after cell stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$  (Fig. 2A). By contrast, mutant 35G was degraded with nearly WT kinetics (data not shown). Other mutants, in which S-262 and T-263, in the putative protein kinase C site (25), were replaced by alanines, were degraded with WT kinetics. To determine whether the different mutations affected IkBa degradation in response to other inducers, we compared the degradation kinetics of the mutants after cell stimulation with either TNF- $\alpha$ , IL-1, or TPA (Fig. 2B). The potent inducers, TNF- $\alpha$  and IL-1, caused almost complete degradation of endogenous and HA-tagged WT and

234A I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ s. All of the other mutants that were resistant to TNF- $\alpha$ -induced degradation were also refractory to IL-1-induced degradation. Similar results were obtained with the weaker inducer, TPA. Interestingly, TPA induced nearly complete degradation of endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  in the parental cells but only partial degradation in all of the HA-tagged I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ -expressing cell pools, including those that express WT and 234A HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ s. Perhaps a weaker inducer such as TPA does not fully activate all of the available I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  kinase and the presence of excess substrate renders the kinase or another component rate limiting for I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation.

To demonstrate that the WT and mutant IkBas can associate with NF-KB and block its binding to DNA, nuclear extracts of TNF-a-stimulated HeLa cells were incubated with either nonprogrammed wheat germ lysate or lysates in which WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and the different mutants were translated. The level of NF- $\kappa$ B DNA binding activity, which in these extracts is composed mostly of p50-p65 heterodimers (15), was determined by electrophoretic mobility shift assay (Fig. 3A). The different mutants were fully capable of inhibiting NF-KB binding to DNA. To show that the mutant IkBas associate with p65 (RelA) in vivo, we immunoprecipitated WT and mutant HA-IκBαs from cell lysates with anti-HA under conditions that preserve the integrity of  $I\kappa B-NF-\kappa B$  complexes (16). After the immune complexes were disrupted and separated on a denaturing gel, they were transferred to membranes that were probed with either anti-IkBa or anti-p65 antibody. As shown in Fig. 3B, both the WT and 32A/36A, 32A, 35A, and 32T mutant HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ s were associated with p65 (RelA) in nonstimulated cells.

Substitutions at serines 32 and 36 block inducible I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ phosphorylation. To determine the effects of the mutations on I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  phosphorylation, cell pools expressing the mutants were metabolically labeled with  ${}^{32}P_i$ , and endogenous and HAtagged I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  proteins were isolated by immunoprecipitation before and after cell stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$ . None of the single amino acid substitutions (31A, 32A, 32T, 35G, 36A, and 36T) prevented inducible I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  phosphorylation (data not shown). Only the double mutants 32A/36A (Fig. 4A) and 31A/ 35A (data not shown) were no longer inducibly phosphorylated in response to TNF- $\alpha$ . Most importantly, two-dimensional mapping revealed that the three TNF- $\alpha$ -inducible tryptic phosphopeptides were no longer detected in digests of HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (32A/36A) (Fig. 4A) or HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (31A/35A) (data not



FIG. 3. Mutant IκBαs can still bind to NF-κB. (A) Equal amounts of WT and mutant IκBαs synthesized in a wheat germ-coupled transcription-translation system or an equivalent volume of unprogrammed wheat germ lysate (–) were added to a nuclear extract (5 µg of protein) prepared from TNF-α-stimulated HeLa cells. The mixtures were incubated with a κB probe, and DNA binding was determined by electrophoretic mobility shift assay. (B) Cytoplasmic extracts (400 µg) from WT and the indicated mutant IκBα cell pools were immunoprecipitated (IP) either with monoclonal antibody 12CA5 (α-HA) or with anti-RelA antibody 519 or its preimmune serum (PI), as indicated. Immunopellets were fractionated by SDS-PAGE and transferred to Immobilon-P membranes for immunoblot analysis with anti-IκBα, anti-RelA (anti-p65-C), and anti-HA antibodies, as indicated.

shown). The phosphopeptides that were still present in digests of these double mutants corresponded to the constitutive phosphorylation sites, whose level of phosphorylation is considerably lower than that of the inducible sites. [The slight differences in the intensities of these phosphopeptides in the HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (32A/36A) samples are due to loading of different amounts of radioactivity.] These results indicate that S-32 and S-36 are the only inducible phosphorylation sites.

As indicated above, the single mutants 32T and 36T are still inducibly phosphorylated. To determine whether these substitutions result in appearance of phosphothreonine in I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and thus obtain further evidence for the use of these phosphoacceptor sites, HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (32T) and HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (36T) from TNF- $\alpha$ stimulated cells were subjected to phosphoamino acid analysis. After two-dimensional separation of tryptic digests of these and WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , the inducible phosphopeptides were recovered and subjected to acid hydrolysis. Figure 4B indicates that all of the phosphopeptides thus analyzed, either from WT I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (peptides 1, 2, and 3) or mutant I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ s (only peptide 1), contained only phosphoserine; no phosphothreonine could be detected. Thus, the I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  kinase appears to have a very strong preference for serines.

Similar phosphoacceptors are required for inducible I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  degradation. Comparison of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (25) and I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  (44) in the regions outside their ankyrin repeats revealed a striking similarity in the sequence surrounding S-32 and S-36 of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (Fig. 5A). Also of note are the conserved lysines and aspartates at positions 22 and 31 of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , respectively. These similarities suggest that S-19 and S-23 of I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  may also be phosphoacceptor sites for the putative I $\kappa$ B kinase. To examine this possibility, expression vectors encoding WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  and single

(19A and 23A) and double (19A/23A) substitution mutants were constructed and stably transfected into HeLa cells. G418resistant cell pools were generated and used for further analysis. Immunoblotting with IkB $\beta$ -specific antibodies (44) indicated that cell stimulation with either TNF- $\alpha$  or IL-1 resulted in degradation of endogenous IkB $\beta$  or WT HA-IkB $\beta$  within 30 min (Fig. 5B). All three substitution mutants were resistant to inducible degradation. Of note is the stabilizing effect by pretreatment of the cells with the peptide aldehyde proteasome inhibitor Z-LLF-CHO (49) (Fig. 5B, lane I+F), suggesting involvement of the proteasome in inducible IkB $\beta$  degradation, as already shown for IkB $\alpha$ . As shown in Fig. 5C, the different IkB $\beta$  mutants were all functional in inhibition of NF- $\kappa$ B DNA binding activity.

Phosphorylation-dependent ubiquitination of IkBa. As proteasome-mediated degradation depends on polyubiquitination of the target protein (reviewed in references 21, 22, and 28), it is expected that phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  leads to its ubiquitination. Recently, using an in vitro system, Chen et al. (12) demonstrated that phosphorylation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  at S-32 and S-36 is required for its ubiquitination. However, no evidence was provided to indicate that signal-induced phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$ causes its ubiquitination in living cells. To examine this important point, we stimulated cell pools expressing either WT or 32A/36A HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  with TNF- $\alpha$  in the absence or presence of the proteasome inhibitor Z-LLF-CHO. The tagged IκBα proteins were immunoprecipitated with anti-HA, and the immune complexes were separated on a denaturing gel and transferred to Immobilon-P membranes. Parallel blots were probed with either anti-HA or an antibody raised against a C-terminal I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  peptide. TNF- $\alpha$  stimulation of cells that were preincubated with the proteasome inhibitor resulted in appearance of high-molecular-weight forms of WT HA-IKBa but not of HA- $I\kappa B\alpha(32A/36A)$  (Fig. 6A). To examine whether these highmolecular-weight forms, migrating above a size of 200 kDa, are due to polyubiquitination, WT and HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (32A/36A) were precipitated with anti-HA from Z-LLF-CHO-treated cells that had been incubated in the absence or presence of TNF- $\alpha$ . Immunoblot analysis of these immune complexes with the Cterminal IkBa antibody revealed the presence of high-molecular-weight forms of WT HA-IKBa but not HA-IKBa(32A/ 36A) in TNF- $\alpha$ -treated cells (Fig. 6B). Stripping the blot and reprobing with affinity-purified antiubiquitin antibody (24) revealed that the high-molecular-weight HA-IkBa forms contain ubiquitin chains. Thus, cell stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$  results in polyubiquitination of  $I\kappa B\alpha$ , a modification that is dependent on its inducible phosphorylation at S-32 and S-36.

Previously it was shown that phosphorylation of IκBα does not induce its dissociation from NF-κB complexes (2, 16, 17, 32, 38, 46). We examined whether ubiquitination of IκBα results in dissociation from NF-κB complexes. These complexes were isolated by immunoprecipitation with anti-p65 antibodies from nonstimulated and TNF-α-stimulated cells that were preincubated with Z-LLF-CHO. Following separation on a denaturing gel and transfer to a membrane, immunoblotting of the p65-containing complexes with the C-terminal anti-IκBα antibody revealed that the high-molecular-weight forms of IκBα, whose appearance was induced by TNF-α, were still associated with p65-containing complexes (Fig. 6C). Thus, ubiquitination of IκBα also does not result in its dissociation from NF-κB.

Substitution for lysines 21 and 22 interferes with I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ ubiquitination and degradation. Experiments similar to those described above but using anti-I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  antibodies indicated that I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  is also subjected to inducible ubiquitination (data not shown). As protein ubiquitination occurs on lysine residues (28), we examined I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  for occurrence of conserved



FIG. 4. The inducible phosphorylation sites of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  are serines 32 and 36. (A) Phosphopeptide maps of WT HA-IκBα and HA-IκBα(32A/36A). Pools of HeLa cells expressing either form of HA-IkBa were metabolically labeled with <sup>32</sup>P, treated with Ac-LLnL-CHO, and left unstimulated or stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (10 ng/ml) for 10 min, and then the cells were lysed and the <sup>32</sup>P-labeled IKBas were isolated as described for Fig. 1. The excised bands corresponding to the HA-IkBas were digested with trypsin and analyzed by two-dimensional phosphopeptide mapping. Each plate was loaded with 1,200 cpm of <sup>32</sup>P-IkBa except for HA-IκBα(32A/36A) from nonstimulated cells, of which only 850 cpm was loaded. (B) Phosphoamino acid analysis of phosphopeptides (PEP) that contain TNF-a-inducible phosphorylation sites of WT, 32T, and 36T IkBas. The different <sup>32</sup>P-labeled IKB $\alpha$  proteins were isolated from TNF- $\alpha$ -stimulated cells and subjected to tryptic phosphopeptide mapping. The phosphopeptides were isolated from tryptic phosphopeptide maps and subjected to phosphoamino acid analysis. In the case of WT I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , we used phosphopeptides 1, 2, and 3 (see panel A), and in the case of the mutants, we isolated the major inducible phosphopeptide

lysine residues around their phosphoacceptor sites. The only conserved lysine is K-22 in I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and K-9 in I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  (Fig. 5A). To test whether this residue is the likely site of IkBa ubiquitination and, if so, to determine the functional importance of this modification, we replaced K-22 with an arginine. However, as residue 21 is also a lysine and frequently in the absence of the primary recognition site, the ubiquitination machinery acts on adjacent secondary sites (see reference 47 for an example), we also replaced K-21 with an arginine. Pools of HeLa cells stably expressing the 21R/22R mutant were used to analyze the effects of these substitutions on  $I\kappa B\alpha$  ubiquitination, degradation, and phosphorylation. Immunoprecipitation of HA-I $\kappa$ Ba(21R/22R) from unstimulated and TNF- $\alpha$ -stimulated cells followed by immunoblot analysis with the C-terminal anti- $I\kappa B\alpha$  antibody revealed that the extent of its conversion to higher-molecular-weight forms was considerably reduced (4.5fold) in comparison with WT HA-IκBα (Fig. 7A). Stripping and reprobing the blot with the antiubiquitin antibody confirmed the presence of ubiquitin in these more slowly migrating forms and revealed a similar decrease (threefold) in the efficiency of HA-IkBa(21R/22R) ubiquitination in comparison with its WT counterpart (data not shown).

To determine whether the reduced efficiency of ubiquitination affected the kinetics of HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (21R/22R) degradation, we measured the abundance of mutant and WT I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  after cell stimulation with TNF- $\alpha$ . As shown in Fig. 7B and C, TNF- $\alpha$ induced the degradation of HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (21R/22R), but with much slower kinetics in comparison with both endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  in the same cell pool and WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ . While the half-lives of endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and WT HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  were 2 to 2.5 min, the half-life of HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (21R/22R) was 8.5 min. Despite the marked effects on inducible ubiquitination and degradation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ , the dual 21R/22R substitution did not affect its phosphorylation. Phosphopeptide mapping of either HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (21R/22R) or endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  digested with V8 protease revealed the presence of the same 2-kDa phosphopeptide containing the TNF- $\alpha$ -inducible phosphorylation sites (Fig. 7D).

# DISCUSSION

A common mechanism, phosphorylation-induced ubiquitination, for IkB degradation. The use of protease inhibitors provided evidence that activation of the transcription factor NF-KB in response to different extracellular stimuli depends on degradation of IkBa (1, 16, 17, 32, 38, 39, 46). It was also shown that  $I\kappa B\alpha$  degradation is preceded by its inducible phosphorylation (1, 17, 32, 38, 46), and mutant analysis suggested that phosphorylation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  targets it for degradation (10, 45, 50). Although we identified two serine residues, S-32 and S-36, whose replacement by nonphosphorylatable alanines prevents inducible I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation, no direct evidence that these are indeed the sites of inducible  $I\kappa B\alpha$  phosphorylation was provided (9, 10, 45, 50). For instance, these substitutions could either affect I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  phosphorylation at other sites or prevent its degradation by altering its structure. Using phosphopeptide mapping and phosphoamino acid analysis, we have unequivocally identified S-32 and S-36 as the only sites of inducible IkB $\alpha$  phosphorylation. Replacement of either serine with an alanine is sufficient to block IkBa degradation. As inducible IkB $\alpha$  phosphorylation is prevented only by the dual 32A/36A substitution but not by single 32A or 36A substitution (data not

<sup>(</sup>peptide 1). The hydrolysates were separated by high-voltage electrophoresis at pH 3.5. The positions of nonradioactive phosphoamino acid markers loaded on the same plates are indicated. The position of free phosphate is also marked.



FIG. 5. Inhibition of IkBß degradation by substitution of serines 19 and 23. (A) Comparison of the I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  sequences in the region surrounding the inducible phosphorylation sites of IkBa. Boxes, identical residues; dots, similar residues. (B) Pools of HeLa cells stably transfected with expression vectors encoding HA-tagged WT and mutant  $I\kappa B\beta s$  were incubated in the absence or presence of TNF-a (T; 10 ng/ml) or IL-1a (I; 2 ng/ml) for 30 min. In one case, the last lane, the cells were preincubated with the proteasome inhibitor Z-LLF-CHO (10 µM) prior to addition of IL-1a. Cell lysates were separated by SDS-PAGE, transferred to Immobilon-P membranes, and analyzed for  $I\kappa B\beta$  abundance by immunoblotting with anti-IkB\beta (44). The migration positions of endogenous and exogenous (HA-tagged)  $I\kappa B\beta$  and a cross-reacting protein (NS [nonspecific]) are indicated. (C) Mutant IκBβs inhibit NF-κB DNA binding. Equal amounts of WT and the indicated mutant IkBßs synthesized in a wheat germ-coupled transcription-translation system or the equivalent amount volume of unprogrammed wheat germ lysate (-) were added to a nuclear extract (5 µg of protein) prepared as described for Fig. 3A. The mixtures were incubated with a KB probe, and DNA binding was determined by electrophoretic mobility shift assay

shown), it seems that phosphorylation of a single site is sufficient for targeting  $I\kappa B\alpha$  to the degradation pathway or that introduction of a hydrophobic residue into one of these positions may have an additional adverse effect on  $I\kappa B\alpha$  degradation (see below). The same serines (S-19 and S-23) are conserved in  $I\kappa B\beta$ , and substitution with alanines also prevents inducible  $I\kappa B\beta$  degradation. These results strongly suggest that  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  are regulated through the same mechanism.

IkB phosphorylation converts these proteins into efficient substrates for the protein ubiquitination machinery. Upon cell stimulation,  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  are rapidly modified to yield highmolecular-weight forms containing ubiquitin chains. As recently shown (12), detection of ubiquitinated IkB requires preincubation with a proteasome inhibitor, consistent with the notion that polyubiquitinated proteins are very efficient substrates for proteasomal degradation (22, 28). As the bulk of ubiquitinated I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and I $\kappa$ B $\beta$  migrates more slowly than 200 kDa, their ubiquitination is rather extensive and many of the modified molecules contain 20 or more conjugated ubiquitin molecules. As the phosphorylation-defective mutant  $I\kappa B\alpha$ (32A/36A) fails to undergo inducible ubiquitination, it can be concluded that phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  is required for its ubiquitination. Chen et al. (12) and Alkalay et al. (3), using cell-free ubiquitin-conjugating systems, have recently arrived at similar conclusions. Most likely, the phosphorylated IkB is recognized by a specific ubiquitin protein ligase (E3 [13]).

As the phosphorylated forms of both  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  are subject to inducible ubiquitination, it is likely that the ubiquitination machinery recognizes a common feature of both proteins. Because ubiquitin ligation occurs on lysine residues, we searched the two proteins for conserved lysines in their N- terminal domains, the sites of inducible phosphorylation. Only one such lysine, K-22 in I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  and K-9 in I $\kappa$ B $\beta$ , was identified. Replacement of K-22 and the adjacent K-21 with arginines results in a considerable decrease in the efficiency of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ ubiquitination and slows down its degradation rate. These substitutions, however, have no adverse effects on inducible I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ phosphorylation. It is not surprising, however, that I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (21R/ 22R) is still ubiquitinated following cell stimulation. Quite



FIG. 6. Inducible IkBa phosphorylation leads to its polyubiquitination. (A) Cell pools expressing WT  $\hat{H}A$ -I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (odd-numbered lanes) or  $\hat{H}A$ -I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ (32A) 36A) (even-numbered lanes) were either left untreated or preincubated with Z-LLF-CHO (10 µM) for 60 min and stimulated with TNF-a (10 ng/ml) as indicated. At the indicated time points, whole cell lysates were prepared, fractionated by SDS-PAGE, and transferred to Immobilon-P membranes. The blots were probed with either an anti-IKBa C-terminal affinity-purified antibody (bottom panel) or anti-HA antibody (upper panel). (B) Cells were treated as described above, and lysates were prepared 12 min after TNF- $\alpha$  stimulation and immunoprecipitated with the anti-HA antibody. The immune complexes were disrupted, fractionated by SDS-PAGE, and transferred to an Immobilon-P membrane. The blot was first probed with the anti-IKBa C-terminal antibody (bottom panel). It was then stripped and reprobed with affinity-purified antiubiquitin antibody (upper panel). The migration positions of endogenous I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  (ENDO), HA-tagged  $I\kappa B\alpha s$  (HA), and polyubiquitinated  $I\kappa B\alpha s$  [(Ub)<sub>n</sub>] are indicated. (C) HeLa cells preincubated with Z-LLF-CHO for 60 min were left unstimulated (-) or stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (+). After 12 min, whole cell lysates were prepared and subjected to immunoprecipitation with either anti-p65 (antibody 519) or preimmune serum (PI). The immune complexes were disrupted, fractionated by SDS-PAGE, and transferred to an Immobilon-P membrane. The membrane was probed with the anti-IkBa C-terminal antibody. The different forms of IkBa are marked as in panel B. Molecular masses (MW) are indicated in kilodaltons.



FIG. 7. Substitution of lysines 21 and 22 affects the ubiquitination and degradation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  but not its phosphorylation. (A) Cell pools expressing WT HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$  or HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ (21R/22R) were preincubated with Z-LLF-CHO and left unstimulated (–) or stimulated with TNF $\alpha$  (+). After 12 min, cell lysates were prepared and the HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$  (21R/22R) were immunoprecipitated (IP) with the anti-HA antibody ( $\alpha$ -HA). Immune complexes were disrupted, fractionated by SDS-PAGE, and transferred to an Immobilon-P membrane for immunoblet analysis with an anti-I $\kappa B\alpha$  C-terminal antibody. The migration positions of the HA-tagged I $\kappa B\alpha$  and polyubiquitinated HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$  (IUb)<sub>n</sub>] are indicated. (B) Cell pools expressing HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ (21R/22R) were stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$ , and at the indicated times (minutes), lysates were prepared and subjected to immunoblot analysis as described for Fig. 2A except that anti-I $\kappa B\alpha$  C-terminal antibody c-21 was used to probe the blot. (C) The relative amounts of WT HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ (IR/22R) ( $\Box$ ), and endogenous I $\kappa B\alpha$  ( $\bullet$ ) were determined by densitometric scanning of the fluorograms shown above and in Fig. 2A and plotted against the length of exposure to TNF- $\alpha$ . (D) Pools of cells expressing HA-I $B\alpha$ (21R/22R) were metabolically labeled with <sup>32</sup>P<sub>1</sub> for 4 h, pretreated with Ac-LLnL-CHO, and left unstimulated (–) or stimulated with TNF- $\alpha$  (+) for 10 min, and then the cells were lysed and the <sup>32</sup>P-labeled I $\kappa B\alpha$  swere isolated as described for Fig. 1. The excised bands corresponding to HA-I $\kappa B\alpha$ (21R/2R) and endogenous I $\kappa B\alpha$  (ENDO) were digested with V8 protease and analyzed on a high-resolution of the inducible 2-kDa phosphopeptide is indicated. In nonstimulated lanes, 200 cpm was loaded; 650 cpm was loaded on the TNF- $\alpha$ -stimulated lanes. Molecular masses (MW) are indicated in kilodaltons.

frequently, inactivation of one ubiquitination site results in the utilization of alternative sites by the ubiquitination machinery (47). At this point, we do not know whether K-21 is a physiological ubiquitination site, but since only K-22 is conserved in I $\kappa$ B $\beta$ , it is probably the primary ubiquitination site. Nevertheless, it is clear that ubiquitination of I $\kappa$ B is necessary for tagging it for degradation by the proteasome. These conclusions are consistent with many other observations on degradation of polyubiquitinated proteins (13) and the inhibition of I $\kappa$ B degradation by proteasome inhibitors.

Single or multiple IkB kinases? In response to stimulation of cells with TNF-a, IL-1, or TPA, IkBa is rapidly phosphorylated on two sites, S-32 and S-36. Substitution of either serine or their homologs in IkBB (S-19 and S-23) with nonphosphorylatable alanines is sufficient to prevent inducible IkB degradation. These results suggest that  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  may be substrates for the same IkB kinase or a small family of IkB kinases. In 70Z/3 pre-B cells, IL-1 and LPS are effective inducers of both IkB $\alpha$  and IkB $\beta$  degradation, whereas TPA induces IkBa but not IkBB degradation (44). Similar differences were found in HeLa cells, in which TNF- $\alpha$  and IL-1 induced both  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  degradation but TPA induced only IkBa degradation (data not shown). While these results were previously interpreted to suggest fundamental differences in the regulation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  (43, 44), there is also another, more parsimonious explanation. Inducible IkBB degradation occurs with considerably slower kinetics than  $I\kappa B\alpha$ degradation (15a, 44), probably because it is phosphorylated less efficiently by the IkB kinase. The mutational analysis described above and elsewhere suggests that the rate-limiting step in I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation is its phosphorylation. Once phosphorylated, I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  is rapidly ubiquitinated and degraded. Thus, the efficiency of I $\kappa$ B phosphorylation dictates how fast it will be degraded. A weaker kinase activator may still induce substantial yet slow I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation while hardly having an effect on phosphorylation and turnover of the less favored substrate, I $\kappa$ B $\beta$ . Thus, we suggest that TPA, which is not as efficient as IL-1, TNF- $\alpha$ , or LPS in induction of NF- $\kappa$ B binding activity, is simply a weaker activator of the I $\kappa$ B kinase. In agreement with this interpretation, we find that even a small increase in the level of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  in cells expressing HA-I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  is sufficient to decrease the extent of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation in response to TPA but not following stimulation with IL-1 or TNF- $\alpha$  (Fig. 2B).

The differences in the efficiency of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  phosphorylation may be dictated by residues that surround their phosphoacceptor sites. Interestingly, S-32 and S-36 of IkBa are both preceded by aspartates, one of which, D-31, is conserved in IkBB. Substitution of D-31 by an alanine is sufficient to block I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  degradation. However, as with the single substitution of the phosphoacceptor sites (i.e., 32A and 36A), the 31A mutant is still subject to inducible phosphorylation (15a). Nevertheless, the major effect of the 31A substitution is likely to be on I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$  phosphorylation because the double mutant 31A/35A, just like the double mutant 32A/36A, is no longer subjected to inducible phosphorylation (15a). Unlike D-31, D-35 is not conserved in I $\kappa$ B $\beta$ , in which the equivalent position is G-22. To examine the significance of this change, we expressed a 35G mutant of IkBa. This mutant, however, was degraded with WT kinetics (15a). Thus, it is unlikely that the D-to-G substitution accounts for the slower kinetics of IkBB degradation. Probably some of the other residues that differ between the N-terminal regions of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  are responsible for the differences in their degradation kinetics.

Degradation of IkBa was also affected by replacement of S-32 and S-36 by threonines. While mutant 32T was refractory to inducible degradation, mutant 36T was degraded more slowly than the WT protein. When isolated from TNF- $\alpha$ -stimulated cells and subjected to phosphoamino acid analysis, neither 32T nor 36T was found to contain detectable amounts of phosphothreonine. These results indicate that the IkB kinase has very strong preference for serine as a phosphoacceptor. In addition, these results suggest that S-32 is the major regulatory phosphorylation site and that the more severe effect of the 36A mutation in comparison with the 36T mutation on IkBa degradation could be due to a secondary effect of having a hydrophobic residue at position 36 rather than the mere absence of phosphorylation. The strong preference of serine as a phosphoacceptor by the IkB kinase is unusual, as most known serine kinases can also use threonine, albeit somewhat less efficiently. The only known protein kinase with a strong preference for serine is protein kinase A (29). However, since protein kinase A is activated by cyclic AMP but not by TPA, TNF- $\alpha$ , or IL-1, it is unlikely to be the I $\kappa$ B kinase. Anyhow, the strong preference for serine is likely to be useful in identification of the physiological IkB kinase. Another feature that may help in identification of the IkB kinase is the apparent preference for negatively charged residues N terminal to the phosphoacceptor site. Although their specific roles have not been tested, both  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$  have two additional conserved acidic residues that precede S-32 in IkBa and S-19 in IkBB. This feature resembles the sequence of casein kinase I phosphorylation sites (18). However, casein kinase I does not display a strong preference for serine over threonine, and its activity is constitutive (48).

Several protein kinases were previously proposed as IKB kinases. It was shown that phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  in vitro by either protein kinase A or protein kinase C prevents its binding to NF- $\kappa$ B (19). Dissociation of I $\kappa$ B $\alpha$ -NF- $\kappa$ B complexes was also reported to be induced by treatment of cell extracts with double-stranded RNA-dependent protein kinase (30). In vivo, phosphorylation of IkBa does not result in its dissociation from NF-KB (2, 16, 17, 32, 38, 46), nor do the inducible phosphorylation sites resemble known protein kinase A or C sites. Raf-1 was also suggested as an IkB kinase (31). However, Raf-1 in many cell types, including HeLa cells, is activated by growth factors but not by TNF- $\alpha$  (37). Furthermore, the only known Raf-1 substrates are MEK1 and MEK2, and their activation sites recognized by Raf-1 do not resemble the inducible IkB phosphorylation sites (1). In summary, despite the long list of putative IkB kinases, the physiologically relevant kinase(s) responsible for inducible phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  and  $I\kappa B\beta$ remains to be identified. It is clear, however, that induction of IkB phosphorylation represents the first and perhaps most critical step toward NF-KB activation.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank A. Haas for the gift of ubiquitin antibody, A. Baldwin for antibody 519, and M. Orlowski for Z-LLF-CHO. We also thank A. Israel and Y. Ben-Neriah for helpful discussions. We thank N. Aardema for excellent technical assistance, P. Alford for excellent secretarial assistance, and A. Lewis and D. Anderson at Signal Pharmaceuticals for their continued support and encouragement.

This work was supported by NIH grants CA50528 and HL35018 and by Signal Pharmaceuticals.

#### REFERENCES

- 1. Alessi, D. R., Y. Saito, D. G. Campbell, P. Cohen, G. Sithanandam, U. Rapp. A. Ashworth, C. J. Marshall, and S. Cowley. 1994. Identification of the sites in MAP kinase kinase-1 phosphorylation by p74raf-1. EMBO J. 13:1610-1619.
- 2. Alkalay, I., A. Yaron, A. Hatzubai, S. Jung, A. Avraham, O. Gerlitz, I. Pashut-Lavon, and Y. Ben-Neriah. 1995. In vivo stimulation of IKB phosphorylation is not sufficient to activate NF-KB. Mol. Cell. Biol. 15:1294-1301.
- 3. Alkalay, I., A. Yaron, A. Hatzubai, A. Orian, A. Ciechanover, and Y. Ben-Neriah. 1995. Stimulation-dependent IkBa phosphorylation marks the NF-kB inhibitor for degradation via the ubiquitin-proteasome pathway. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 92:10599-10603.
- 4. Baeuerle, P. A. 1991. The inducible transcriptional activator NF-κB: regulation by distinct protein subunits. Biochim. Biophys. Acta 1072:63-80.
- 5. Beg, A. A., and A. S. Baldwin, Jr. 1993. The IKB proteins: multifunctional regulators of Rel/NF-KB transcription factors. Genes Dev. 7:2064-2070.
- 6. Beg, A. A., T. S. Finco, P. V. Nantermet, and A. Baldwin, Jr. 1993. Tumor necrosis factor and interleukin-1 lead to phosphorylation and loss of IKBa: a mechanism for NF-KB activation. Mol. Cell. Biol. 13:3301-3310.
- 7. Blank, V., P. Kourilsky, and A. Israel. 1992. NF-KB and related proteins: Rel/dorsal homologies meet ankyrin-like repeats. Trends Biochem. Sci. 17: 135 - 140
- 8. Boyle, W. J., P. van der Geer, and T. Hunter. 1991. Phosphopeptide mapping and phosphoamino acid analysis by two-dimensional separation on thin-layer cellulose plates. Methods Enzymol. 201:110-149.
- 9. Brockman, J. A., D. C. Scherer, T. A. McKinsey, S. M. Hall, X. Qi, W. Y. Lee, and D. W. Ballard. 1995. Coupling of a signal response domain in IKBa to multiple pathways for NF-κB activation. Mol. Cell. Biol. 15:2809-2818.
- 10. Brown, K., S. Gerstberger, L. Carlson, G. Franzoso, and U. Siebenlist. 1995. Control of  $I\kappa B\alpha\mbox{-}proteolysis by site-specific, signal-induced phosphorylation.}$ Science 267:1485-1491.
- 11. Brown, K., S. Park, T. Kanno, G. Franzoso, and U. Siebenlist. 1993. Mutual regulation of the transcriptional activator NF-κB and its inhibitor, IκBα. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 90:2532-2536.
- 12. Chen, Z., J. Hagler, V. J. Palombella, F. Melandri, D. Scherer, D. Ballard, and T. Maniatis. 1995. Signal-induced site-specific phosphorylation targets IκBα to the ubiquitin-proteasome pathway. Genes Dev. 9:1586-1597.
- 13. Ciechanover, A. 1994. The ubiquitin-proteasome proteolytic pathway. Cell 79:1321.
- 14. Cordle, S. R., R. Donald, M. A. Read, and J. Hawiger, 1993. Lipopolysaccharide induces phosphorylation of MAD-3 and activation of c-Rel and related NF-KB proteins in human monocytic THP-1 cells. J. Biol. Chem. 268:11803-11810.
- 15. Devary, Y., C. Rosette, J. A. DiDonato, and M. Karin. 1993. NF-KB activation by ultraviolet light not dependent on a nuclear signal. Science 261:1442-1445
- 15a.DiDonato, J. A. Unpublished observations.
- 16. DiDonato, J. A., F. Mercurio, and M. Karin. 1995. Phosphorylation of ΙκΒα precedes but is not sufficient for its dissociation from NF-KB. Mol. Cell. Biol. 15:1302-1311.
- 17. Finco, T. S., A. A. Beg, and A. S. Baldwin, Jr. 1994. Inducible phosphorylation of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  is not sufficient for its dissociation from NF- $\kappa B$  and is inhibited by protease inhibitors. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 91:11884-11888.
- 18. Flotow, H., and P. J. Roach. 1991. Role of acidic residues as substrate determinants for casein kinase I. J. Biol. Chem. 25:3724-3727.
- 19. Ghosh, S., and D. Baltimore. 1990. Activation in vivo of NF-KB by phosphorylation of its inhibitor IkB. Nature (London) 344:678-682.
- 20. Gilmore, T. D., and P. J. Morin. 1993. The IkB proteins: members of a multifunctional family. Trends Genet. 9:427–433. 21. Goldberg, A. L. 1992. The mechanism and functions of ATP-dependent
- proteases in bacterial and animal cells. Eur. J. Biochem. 203:9-23
- 22. Goldberg, A. L. 1995. Functions of the proteasome: the lysis at the end of the tunnel. Science 268:522-523.
- 23. Grilli, M., J. J. Chiu, and M. J. Lenardo. 1993. NF-KB and Rel: participants in a multiform transcriptional regulatory system. Int. Rev. Cytol. 143:1-62.
- 24. Haas, A. L., and P. M. Bright. 1985. The immunochemical detection and quantitation of intracellular ubiquitin-protein conjugates. J. Biol. Chem. 250:12464-12473.
- 25. Haskill, S., A. A. Beg, S. M. Tompkins, J. S. Morris, A. D. Yurochko, A. Sampson-Johannes, R. Mondal, P. Ralph, and A. Baldwin, Jr. 1991. Characterization of an immediate-early gene induced in adherent monocytes that encodes IkB-like activity. Cell 65:1281-1289.
- 26. Helmberg, A., N. Auphan, C. Caelles, and M. Karin. 1995. Glucocorticoidinduced apoptosis of human leukemic cells is caused by the repressive function of the glucocorticoid receptor. EMBO J. 14:452-460.
- 27. Henkel, T., T. Machleidt, I. Alkalay, M. Kronke, T. Ben-Neriah, and P. A. Baeuerle. 1993. Rapid proteolysis of  $I\kappa B\alpha$  is necessary for activation of transcription factor NF-kB. Nature (London) 365:182-185.
- 28. Hershko, A., and A. Ciechanover. 1992. The ubiquitin system for protein degradation. Annu. Rev. Biochem. 61:761-807.
- 29. Kemp, B. E., D. J. Graves, E. Benjamini, and E. G. Krebs. 1977. Role of multiple basic residues in determining the substrate specificity of cyclic

AMP-dependent protein kinase. J. Biol. Chem. 252:4888-4894.

- Kumar, A., J. Haque, J. Lacoste, J. Hiscott, and B. R. G. Williams. 1994. Double-stranded RNA-dependent protein kinase activates transcription factor NF-κB by phosphorylating IκB. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 91:6288– 6292.
- Li, S., and J. M. Sedivy. 1993. Raf-1 protein kinase activates the NF-κB transcription factor by dissociating the cytoplasmic NF-κB-IκB complex. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 90:9247–9251.
- Lin, Y.-C., K. Brown, and U. Siebenlist. 1995. Activation of NFκB requires proteolysis of the inhibitor IκBα: signal-induced phosphorylation of IκBα alone does not release active NF-κB. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 92:3003– 3009.
- Liou, H. C., and D. Baltimore. 1993. Regulation of the NF-κB/Rel transcription factor and IκB inhibitor system. Curr. Opin. Cell Biol. 5:477–487.
- Mellits, K. D., R. T. Hay, and S. Goodbourn. 1993. Proteolytic degradation of MAD-3 (IκBα) and enhanced processing of the NF-κB precursor p105 are obligatory steps in the activation of NF-κB. Nucleic Acids Res. 21:5059– 5066.
- Mercurio, F., J. DiDonato, C. Rosette, and M. Karin. 1992. Molecular cloning and characterization of a novel Rel/NFκB family member displays structural and functional homology to NF-κB p50/-105. DNA Cell Biol. 11:523–537.
- Mercurio, F., J. A. DiDonato, C. Rosette, and M. Karin. 1993. p105 and p98 precursor proteins play an active role in NF-κB mediated signal transduction. Genes Dev. 7:705–718.
- Minden, A., A. Lin, M. McMahon, C. Lange-Carter, B. Dérijard, R. J. Davis, G. L. Johnson, and M. Karin. 1994. Differential activation of ERK and JNK MAP kinases by Raf-1 and MEKK. Science 266:1719–1723.
- Miyamoto, S., M. Maki, M. J. Schmitt, M. Hatanaka, and I. M. Verma. 1994. Tumor necrosis factor α-induced phosphorylation of IκBα is a signal for its degradation but not dissociation from NF-κB. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 91:12740–12744.
- Palombella, V. J., O. J. Rando, A. L. Goldberg, and T. Maniatis. 1994. The ubiquitin-proteasome pathway is required for processing the NF-κB precursor and the activation of NF-κB. Cell 78:773–785.

- Schägger, H., and G. von Jagow. 1987. Tricine-sodium dodecyl sulfatepolyacrylamide gel electrophoresis for the separation of proteins in the range from 1 to 100 kDa. Anal. Biochem. 166:368–379.
- Sen, R., and D. Baltimore. 1986. Inducibility of the κ immunoglobulin enhancer-binding protein NF-κB by a posttranslational mechanism. Cell 47: 921–928.
- Siebenlist, U., G. Franzoso, and K. Brown. 1994. Structure, regulation and function of NF-κB. Annu. Rev. Cell Biol. 10:405–455.
- Thanos, D., and T. Maniatis. 1995. NF-κB: a lesson in family values. Cell 80:529–532.
- Thompson, J. E., R. J. Philips, H. Erdjument-Bromage, P. Tempst, and S. Ghosh. 1995. IκBβ regulates the persistent response in a biphasic activation of NF-κB. Cell 80:573–582.
- Traenckner, E. B., H. L. Pahl, T. Henkel, K. N. Schmidt, S. Wilk, and P. A. Baeuerle. 1995. Phosphorylation of human IκBα on serines 32 and 36 controls IκBα proteolysis and NF-κB activation in response to diverse stimuli. EMBO J. 14:2876–2883.
- 46. Traenckner, E. B.-M., S. Wilk, and P. A. Baeuerle. 1994. A proteasome inhibitor prevents activation of NF-κB and stabilizes a newly phosphorylated form of IκBα that is still bound to NF-κB. EMBO J. 13:5433–5441.
- Treier, M., L. M. Staszewski, and D. Bhomann. 1994. Ubiquitin-dependent c-Jun degradation *in vivo* is mediated by the δ domain. Cell 78:787–798.
- Tuazon, P. T., and J. A. Traugh. 1991. Casein kinase I and II—multipotential serine protein kinases: structure, function and regulation. Adv. Second Messenger Phosphoprotein Res. 23:123–164.
- Vinitsky, A., C. Michaud, J. C. Powers, and M. Orlowski. 1992. Inhibition of the chymotrypsin-like activity of the pituitary proteinase complex. Biochemistry 31:9421–9428.
- Whiteside, T., M. K. Ernst, O. LeBail, C. Laurent-Winter, N. Rice, and A. Israel. 1995. N- and C-terminal sequences control degradation of MAD3/ ΙκΒα in response to inducers of NF-κB activity. Mol. Cell. Biol. 15:5339– 5345.
- Wilson, I. A., H. L. Niman, R. A. Houghten, A. R. Cherenson, M. L. Connolly, and R. A. Lerner. 1984. The structure of an antigenic determinant in a protein. Cell 37:767–778.