Supporting Information: Late Neandertals in Southeastern Iberia: Sima de las Palomas del Cabezo Gordo, Murcia, Spain

Michael J. Walker, Josep Gibert, Mariano V. López, A. Vincent Lombardi, Alejandro Pérez-Pérez, Josefina Zapata, Jon Ortega, Thomas Higham, Alistair Pike, Jean-Luc Schwenninger, João Zilhão, Erik Trinkaus

Supporting Information I: The Sima de la Palomas

SI Figure 1. Map of Iberia with the location of the Sima de las Palomas (blue circle). The other sites include the late Neandertals from Oliveira, early Aurigiacian sites (all north of the "Ebro Frontier"), and Middle-Upper Paleolithic sites in southern Iberia that lack early Aurignacian levels.

SI Figure 2. View of the Cabezo Gordo from the Campo de Cartagena plain. The position of the Sima de las Palomas is indicated by the arrow.

SI Figure 3. View up the side of the Cabezo Gordo, with the position of the modern upper entrance of the Sima de las Palomas (covered by a protective grill) indicated.

SI Figure 4. Stratigraphic column (above) and horizontal plan (below) of the Sima de las Palomas. A: Upper Cutting excavation area; B: lower excavation area; C: scaffolding; D: tunnel extended from the lower portion to the outside by $19th$ century miners. Scale = 10 m.

SI Figure 5. The Upper Cutting of the Sima de las Palomas at the end of the 2008 excavation season, with the west, north and east profiles. The burnt horizons are evident in the north and especially east profiles, and the éboulis is evident in the west profile. Lower scale $= 1$ m.

SI Figure 6. Stratigraphic rendition of the 2008 Upper Cutting profiles. A: Éboulis above the northwestern corner of the excavated cutting; B: Levels 2m-2o breccia containing human bones; C: Projection of the scree slope (éboulis) which is less perceptible in this rear profile than it had been in now removed sections parallel to it in the foreground; D: Uppermost limit (levels \sim 2h-2i) of lens of burnt sediment mainly in the northeastern area of the cutting; E: Lower limit of burnt ashy sediment (levels 2m-2o) in the northern and eastern area of the cutting.

SI Figure 7. Relative positions of the burnt sediment level, a marble slab, the two more complete Palomas human mandibles, and dating samples in the Palomas Upper Cutting. Dark gray: maximum extent of fusiform lens of dark-gray burnt sediment; Light gray: lower layer of dark-gray sediment. 1: Éboulis level 2h Palomas 96 metacarpal (APSLP1); 2: Unburnt bone from level 2i (APSLP4); 3: Level 2d Palomas 80 immature mandible; 4: Level 2f Palomas 59 mandible with the 14 C dated burnt bone (OxA-10666) cemented to the mandibular lingual surface; 5: Levels 2k-2l flat thin marble slab with the directly overlying sediment dated by OSL (X2509); 6: Level 2l unburnt bone (APSLP6).

SI Figure 8. Horizontal distribution of samples and levels in the Upper Cutting of the Sima de la Palomas. Numbers and letters as in SI Figures 6 and 7. F: horizontal limit of the éboulis scree slope.

Supporting Information II: The human remains from the Sima de la Palomas del Cabezo Gordo.

SI Table 1. Sima de la Palomas human fossil inventory. Separate portions of individual specimens are listed together but given a, b, c, etc. designations. The list for Palomas (SP) 96 is incomplete, since the specimen is still in analysis. This list replaces all previous inventories (*e.g*., ref. 1). The remains are curated in the Área de Antropología Física, Universidad de Murcia.

Supporting Information III: Radiocarbon Dating of the Sima de las Palomas

 Two samples of burnt animal bone were dated at the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit, University of Oxford. We detached by drilling a featureless fragment of burnt animal bone that had been cemented to the lingual surface of the unburnt Palomas 59 Neandertal mandibular corpus (OxA-10666). This fragment was dated along with a further determination subsequently obtained from a burnt rabbit bone (OxA-15423).

 Burning significantly reduces the protein content of bone, making excessively burnt material impractical to date by targeting collagen. Burning is an important influence on the degradation of bone and its susceptibility to contamination. It also influences the interpretation one can place on relative stable N and C isotope values; the C:N ratio almost always goes higher than the standard range for fresh collagen of 2.9 to 3.5 (2); since collagen is removed and the nitrogen is only in the collagen, proportionately more carbon is present. Alteration to the $\delta^{13}C$ value is apparent even in bones that are only slightly burnt, possibly due to increased exposure to contamination or differential loss of amino acids in the collagen. The material isolated for dating is often only approximately characterizable. Usually, it is characterized simply as carbonaceous material insoluble in acid or alkali, and it consists largely of pyrolised collagen which is often further degraded and subject to post-depositional leaching. It is sometimes difficult, in cases where the carbon content is low, to rule out sediment-derived carbon contamination. Comparison of the δ^{13} C values of the extracted carbon with the values expected for bone collagen and sediment carbon is one way to assess the possibility of gross error.

 Both bone fragments from Sima de las Palomas were crushed and pretreated using an acid-base-acid sequence, which is the standard treatment for charcoal at ORAU, prior to AMS dating. For OxA-10666, the insoluble residue comprised 5.3% of the total weight of the original sample and contained 8.0% carbon when combusted. The AMS radiocarbon result obtained was $34,450 \pm 600$ (OxA-10666). The δ^{13} C value of -21.0‰ is consistent with collagen-derived carbon, implying >75% of the carbon dated is from the bone. Sediment-derived carbon cannot be ruled out; it is most likely to have an age similar to that of the bone in which it as deposited, though it could be younger or older. There is, therefore, a possibility that the bone is older than measured, because a small amount of younger carbon would have a disproportionate effect on the age. The C:N atomic ratio of 6.9 is higher than the range for fresh bone, but this is not unexpected given the burning of the sample.

 A similar situation applies to OxA-15423. However, the combustion yield (%C) indicates that this sample is composed of much higher amounts of carbon than OxA-10666. There are two possibilities. First, the sample is composed of a majority of plant-derived carbon. This is considered less likely, since there is a significant proportion of nitrogen in the sample, which is not expected from plant matter, and therefore a low C:N atomic ratio closer to collagenous values was obtained. Second, the bone is partially pyrolyzed, and there is a higher proportion of collagenous material than usually expected. The analytical data are consistent with this conclusion. The δ^{13} C value is more indicative of collagen-derived carbon. Taken together, the results provide increased confidence in the results being finite and not underestimates of age. The consistency in the two ages is a further measure of the probable finite nature of these dates.

 In the absence of an agreed calibration curve for the period before 26,000 cal BP, we compared our results against the Cariaco Basin dataset, Cariaco06 (3). It provides 95% confidence intervals for the dates of 40,950 to 37,622 cal BP for OxA-10666 and 40,986 to 38,850 cal BP for OxA-15423. Alternative comparisons [Fairbanks0107 (4) and quickcal2007 1.5 (www.calpal.de)] provide statistically indistinguishable mean age estimates.

SI Table 2. Radiocarbon results and associated analytical data for the burnt bone samples from Sima de las Palomas. %Yield is the percentage yield of material resulting after the chemical pretreatment of the samples, whose starting weight is listed in the Used column in milligrams. %C is the carbon yield upon combustion. δ^{13} C is reported with respect to VPDB and expressed in a per mille scale. C:N is the atomic ratio of carbon to nitrogen. Values were measured using an IRMS operating in continuous flow mode using a He gas.

Supporting Information IV: Uranium-Series Dating of Bones from the Sima de las Palomas

 Bone is an open system with respect to uranium, and therefore the calculation of a Useries date from measured U-series isotopes requires a model of uranium uptake (or loss). We use the Diffusion-Adsorption (D-A) model to account for uranium uptake in bone (5). The D-A model predicts the spatial distributions ('profiles') of uranium and U-series isotopes across a bone section as uranium is taken up by the bone. It predicts that, under constant geochemical conditions, ∪-shaped uranium profiles will develop that gradually flatten over time as the bone equilibrates with the uranium in the groundwater of the burial environment. At equilibrium, the profile is uniform and uranium ceases to be incorporated into the bone. Under constant geochemical conditions, diffusion of uranium from the outer surfaces of the bone into the center leads to a ∪-shaped distribution of apparent dates, with the closed system date (i.e., the U-series date calculated assuming no uptake or loss of uranium) at the surfaces of the bone approximating the true age of the sample, and with underestimated apparent dates towards the centre (SI Figs. 9 and 10). Pike et al. (6-8) have shown that for bones where the profiles indicate uranium uptake has proceeded under relatively constant conditions, the D-A model can be used to calculate an open system date. Bone for which U-series dates have been calculated successfully using this method,

SI Figure 9. U concentration profiles across a transverse section of bone predicted by the D-A model for different uptake regimes. Shown here are U concentration profiles predicted for diffusive uptake under constant conditions with the bone nearing equilibrium with the ground water $(A-1)$; diffusive uptake under constant conditions with the bone far from equilibrium $(A-1)$ 2); leaching of uranium after initial uptake (B); and a recent increase in the uptake of uranium, 'recent uptake' (C). From Eggins et al. (9)

SI Figure 10. Date profiles for a 30 ky bone predicted by the D-A model for the uptake regimes shown in Fig. 1. Diffusive uptake under constant conditions (A-1) shows apparent closed system dates decreasing towards the centre of the bone section, although dates are not as underestimated as for bones further from equilibrium with the groundwater (A-2). The leaching of U after initial uptake increases the ²³⁰Th/U giving over-estimated apparent closed-system dates (B). Recent increased uptake of U (C) gives underestimated apparent closed-system dates, and can lead to a characteristic \cap distribution of dates. From Eggins et al. (9)

typically have ∪-shaped or uniform U concentration profiles, and a ∪-shaped distribution of apparent closed system U-series dates. Bones with irregular profiles, or profiles indicative of the leaching of uranium (\cap , or M shaped) are rejected as unsuitable for dating.

 U-series dating was attempted for several bones from the Sima de las Palomas using laser ablation multicollector plasma mass spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS). Bones were sectioned using a diamond disc, ultrasonically cleaned, dried overnight in an oven, and mounted in putty on a teflon disc and placed in the laser cell. U-series isotopes were measured on a Finnigan Neptune multi-collector ICP-MS with a 193 nm ArF Excimer laser. The laser spot size was 90 μm, and the sample traversed at 0.5 mm/min with a repetition rate of 10 Hz to ablate a track from the outer to the inner surface of the bone section. Bone sections, with isotopes previously measured using TIMS were used as calibration standards (for further details, see refs 7-9).

 The measured profiles are shown in SI Figs. 11-13, and sample information is in SI Table 3. All profiles show near uniform uranium concentration and U-series date profiles, which is indicative of the bones having reached equilibrium with the burial environment relatively rapidly. Rapid equilibrium can occur in bones that are diagenetically altered. Bone porosity increases the rate of diffusion, and at the same time the partition coefficient of uranium between the groundwater and the bone reduces as the internal surface area of the bone decreases through the loss or growth of the smallest bone mineral crystals (5). Under constant conditions, rapidly equilibrated bones can approximate to a closed system, since at equilibrium U uptake ceases. We have calculated whole bone closed system dates by integrating the U-series isotopes across the profiles (SI Table 3). However, these dates must be treated as of unknown accuracy, since a change in the geochemistry of the burial environment will result in the bone rapidly reequilibrating, which may include further uptake of uranium (leading to underestimated apparent dates) or the loss of uranium (leading to older apparent dates). Normally these phenomena can be identified by the characteristic shape of the uranium profiles as the bone re-equilibrates (SI Figs. 9 and 10). If equilibrium is too rapid, however, evidence of gain or loss of uranium is not apparent.

SI Table 3. Closed system U-series dates on bone from Palomas. Errors given at 2σ. The dates were calculated by integration of the total U-series isotopes across a profile of a transverse section of bone from outer to inner surface. One bone with irregular profiles has been excluded.

SI Figure 11. U-series and U concentration profile of APSLP1. The profiles were measured three times. The solid and broken lines represent the closed system date and uncertainty calculated from the combined data.

SI Figure 12. U-series and U concentration profile of APSLP4.

SI Figure 13. U-series and U concentration profile of APSLP6

Supporting Information V: Optically Stimulated Luminescence Dating

 Optically stimulated luminescence (OSL) dating provides an estimate of the time elapsed since luminescent minerals were last exposed to sunlight (10,11) and optical dating of sedimentary quartz has become a well established technique within Quaternary science (12,13). Light-shielded grains may accumulate charge from the effects of the environmental radiation flux to which they are exposed, and the dose received by the sample, also referred to as the paleodose, can be measured using the luminescence signal. A burial age estimate is obtained by dividing the palaeodose by the environmental dose rate.

A bloc sample weighing \approx 1.5 kg was collected from the top of layer 2k for optical dating. All sample preparations took place at the Research Laboratory for Archaeology and the History of Art, University of Oxford under low intensity safe-lighting provided by filtered sodium lamps emitting at 588 nm. Laboratory procedures were designed to yield sand-sized (180-250 μm) grains of quartz for optical dating according to standard preparation methods, including the removal of the outer parts of the sample, followed by wet sieving, HCl acid digestion, density separation and etching in 68% HF acid to dissolve feldspar minerals and remove the outer 6-8 μm alpha-dosed layer.

 OSL measurements were conducted using an automated system (Risø TL/OSL-DA-12 reader) and are based on a conventional single-aliquot regeneration (SAR) measurement protocol (14). Multi-grain aliquots were stimulated using 15 mW cm^2 of green-plus-blue (420–550 nm) light from a filtered tungsten-halogen lamp for 100 s at 125°C. The natural and regenerative doses were preheated at 260°C for 10 s, and the test doses (which are used to correct for any sensitivity changes) were preheated at a reduced temperature of 240°C for 10 s before optical stimulation. The ultraviolet OSL emission at ≈370 nm was detected using an Electron Tubes Ltd 9235QB photomultiplier tube fitted with 7.5 mm of Hoya U-340 filter. The absence of infraredsensitive minerals (*e.g*. feldspars) was checked and confirmed using an infrared bleach provided by a solid state laser diode (830 Δ 10nm; 1W cm²) at 50°C for 100 s before green-light stimulation. Laboratory doses used for constructing dose response curves were given using a calibrated ⁹⁰Sr/⁹⁰Y beta source housed within the reader. Multi-grain palaeodoses were determined from the first 2 s of OSL, using the final 10 s as background.

An instrumental reproducibility uncertainty of 2% was added (in quadrature) to each OSL measurement error. Single aliquot dose-response curves (SI Figure 14) were fitted using a saturating-exponential-plus-linear function using a weighted linear fitting procedure based on propagation of all measurement errors. Tests of protocol performance were made for thermal transfer and test-dose sensitivity correction, which returned thermally-transferred signals of <3% of the natural OSL at zero applied dose, and a mean 'recycling ratio' of 0.98 for duplicate regenerative doses. Measurements based on six aliquots provided a mean weighted palaeodose of 72.36 ± 4.99 Gy (SI Figure 15).

SI Figure 14. Single aliquot regenerative dose response curve for a quartz aliquot from sample $X2509$ (green square = natural OSL signal; blue circles = regeneration doses; red circle = repeated dose point).

To calculate the environmental dose rate, we combined the results of *in situ γ*-ray spectroscopy measurements with elemental analysis by inductively coupled plasma mass spectroscopy (ICP-MS) using a fusion sample preparation method. A portable *γ*-ray spectrometer (Ortec Micronomad multi channel analyser equipped with a 3x3 inch NaI (Tl) scintillator crystal) was employed in a 4π -geometry and calibrated against the Oxford calibration blocks (15). Such on-site measurements provide direct estimation of the total *γ*-ray radiation field (≈30 cm radius sphere of the sampling location). Unfortunately, no readings could be acquired at the precise location of sample X2509 due to the hardness of the indurated sediment, which made it impossible to auger a suitable hole to insert the detector. Instead, the external gamma dose rate was derived from a spectrum obtained slightly higher up in the northern profile [layer 2b] and which provided a value of 0.458 Gy/ka.

The beta dose rate was derived from the concentrations of potassium (0.78%), thorium (3.7 ppm) and uranium (1.2 ppm) obtained by the laboratory-based ICP-MS analysis of the sediment. These values were converted to dose rates, making allowance for beta-dose attenuation and sample water content (16) . Account was also taken of the cosmic-ray contribution (adjusted for site altitude, geomagnetic latitude, thickness of the cave roof, as well as thickness and water content of the sediment overburden) according to values provided by Prescott and Hutton (17). To calculate the optical ages, we assume that the measured radionuclide activities have prevailed throughout the period of sample burial and our calculations are based on an estimated mean field water content of 2-8% of the dry weight of the sediment. The total dose rate based on combined *γ*-ray spectroscopy measurements and ICP-MS analysis was 1.32 ± 0.06 Gy/ka. A slightly higher environmental dose rate of 1.38 Gy/ka is obtained if the calculations are solely based on the elemental analysis of the sedimentary matrix. Given the proximity of the OSL sample to a slab of marble, it seems more appropriate to use the lower dose rate value provided by the combination of field radioactivity measurements and laboratory-based ICP-MS analysis. The latter would not take into account the potential contribution of fragments of limestone and marble, which are present within the sedimentary units and which tend to have lower concentrations of radioisotopes. Based on the above premises, the calculated OSL age estimate for sample $X2509$ is 54.7 ± 4.7 ka cal BP.

Supporting Information VI: Additional Data for the Palomas Human Remains

SI Table 4. Mandibular corpus breadths at the mental foramen for the Palomas mature mandibles and summary values for the comparative samples [mean \pm SD (N)], in millimeters. The Neandertal sample includes Palomas 1, 6 and 23. MPMH: Middle Paleolithic modern humans; EUP: Early Upper Paleolithic humans; MUP: Middle Upper Paleolithic humans.

SI Table 5. Root lengths from the cervix to the root apex for mature teeth with complete closure for Palomas and the comparative sample teeth, in millimeters $[mean \pm SD(N)]$, range]. Neandertal and Upper Paleolithic data from refs 18-20 and personal measurement. The Neandertal sample includes Palomas 1 and 24. Data are unavailable for the MPMH. Kruskal-Wallis (K-W) P-values are provided for comparisons across the three comparative samples.

SI Table 6. Labiolingual crown diameters for Palomas mandibular anterior teeth and summary values for the comparative samples [mean \pm SD (N)], in millimeters. The Neandertal sample includes Palomas 1 and 89.

SI Table 7. Manual distal phalanx 2-4 articular lengths and distal tuberosity breadth for Palomas 28 and summary values for the comparative samples $[\text{mean} \pm SD(N)]$, in millimeters. There are no known EUP distal manual phalanges. For the comparative samples, given uncetainty in assigning distal phalanges 2-4 to digit, available data are averaged by individual prior to sample summary statistic computations.

Supporting Information References

- 1. Walker MJ (2001) in *A Very Remote Period Indeed*. eds Milliken S, Cook J (Oxbow, Oxford), pp 153-159.
- 2. DeNiro MJ (1985) Post-mortem preservation and alteration of *in vivo* bone collagen isotope ratios in relation to paleodietary reconstruction. *Nature* 317:806-809.
- 3. Hughen K, Southon J, Lehmanc S, Bertranda C, Turnbull J. 2006. Marine-derived 14C calibration and activity record for the past 50,000 years updated from the Cariaco Basin. *Quatern Sci Rev* 25:3216–3227.
- 4. Fairbanks RG *et al*. (2005) Marine radiocarbon calibration curve spanning 0 to 50,000 years B.P. based on paired 230Th/234U/238U and 14C dates on pristine corals. *Quatern Sc Rev* 24:1781-1796 (http://www.radiocarbon.ldeo.columbia.edu/research/radcarbcal.htm).
- 5. Millard AR, Hedges REM (1996). A diffusion-adsorption model of uranium uptake by archaeological bone. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 60**:**2139-2152.
- 6. Pike AWG, Hedges REM, VanCalsteren P (2002). U-series dating of bone using the diffusionadsorption model. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 66**:**4273-4286.
- 7. Pike AWG, Eggins S, Grün R, Thackeray F (2004) U-series dating of TP1, an almost complete human skeleton from Tuinplaas (Springbok Flats), South Africa**.** *S Afr J Sci* 100:381-383.
- 8. Pike AWG, Eggins S, Grün R, Hedges REM, Jacobi RM (2005) U-series dating of the Late Pleistocene fauna from Wood Quarry (Steetley), Notinghamshire, UK. *J Quatern Sci* 20:59-65.
- 9. Eggins SM *et al*. (2005) In situ U-series dating by laser ablation multi-collector ICPMS: new prospects for Quaternary geochronology. *Quatern Sci Rev* 24:2523-2538.
- 10. Huntley DJ, Godfrey-Smith DI, Thewalt MLW (1985) Optical dating of sediments. *Nature* 313:105–107.
- 11. Aitken MJ (1998) *An Introduction to Optical Dating* (Oxford University Press, Oxford).
- 12. Duller GAT (2004) Luminescence dating of Quaternary sediments: recent advances. *J Quatern Sci* 19:183-192.
- 13. Lian O, Roberts RG (2006) Dating the Quaternary: progress in luminescence dating of sediments. *Quatern Sci Rev* 25:2449-2468.
- 14. Murray AS, Wintle AG (2000) Luminescence dating of quartz using an improved singlealiquot regenerative-dose protocol. *Rad Meas*, 32:57-73.
- 15. Rhodes EJ, Schwenninger JL (2007) Dose rates and radioisotope concentrations in the concrete calibration blocks at Oxford. *Ancient TL* 25:5–8.
- 16. Adameic G, Aitken M (1998) Dose rate conversion factors: update. *Ancient TL* 16:37-50.
- 17. Prescott J R, Hutton JT (1994) Cosmic ray contributions to dose rates for luminescence and ESR dating: large depths and long-term time variations. *Rad Meas* 23:497–500.
- 18. Matiegka, J. (1934). *Homo předmostensis. Fosilní človĕk z Předmostí na Moravĕ I. Lebky* (Česká Akademie Vĕd a Umĕní, Prague)
- 19. Vlček E (1969) *Neandertaler der Tschechoslowakei* (Academia Prag, Prague).
- 20. Bailey SE (2005) in *Current Trends in Dental Morphology Research*, ed Zadzinska E (University of Lodz Press, Lodz), pp 201–210.