

# Supporting Information

Faith and Surovell 10.1073/pnas.0908153106

## SI Methods

Simulations were written as macros in Microsoft Excel. Details are provided below.

**Continental Simulation.** There are 1,955 stratigraphic occurrences of 31 genera of extinct North American mammals. Of those stratigraphic occurrences, 66 are associated with a terminal Pleistocene taxon date (12,000–10,000 radiocarbon years B.P.) (Table 1 and Table S2). Those 66 terminal Pleistocene taxon dates are distributed among 16 genera, providing an empirical probability of observing a terminal Pleistocene fossil occurrence of 3.4% (66 of 1,955). The continental simulation randomly assigns each of the 1,955 stratigraphic occurrences a pre- or post-12,000 radiocarbon years B.P. date based on this probability (3.4%). Afterward, the total number of genera receiving a terminal Pleistocene taxon date is tallied. This process is repeated 10,000 times and provides a sampling distribution of the number of genera that we can expect to recover from the terminal Pleistocene, if all of the taxa had survived to that time. From this distribution, we are able to calculate the probability of observing 16 or fewer terminal Pleistocene genera. This simulation assumes that all of the 31 genera included in the analysis survived to the terminal Pleistocene and that all of the fossil occurrences are equally likely to receive a terminal Pleistocene taxon date.

Restricting the analysis to include only the highest rated radiocarbon dates requires minor changes to the simulation parameters. There are 24 highly rated terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon dates distributed among 11 genera. The empirical probability of observing a highly rated terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon date is 1.2%. Each of the 1,955 stratigraphic occurrences is assigned a pre- or post-12,000 radiocarbon years B.P. date based on this probability. This process is repeated 10,000 times, and the probability of observing 11 or fewer terminal Pleistocene genera is determined.

**Biogeographic Simulation.** The biogeographic simulation recognizes seven physiographic zones across the continental United States (Fig. 2). The number of stratigraphic occurrences of extinct genera and the frequency of terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon dates in each zone are reported in Table S4. In this simulation, the stratigraphic occurrences of a given genus are

assigned randomly to a physiographic zone based on its relative abundance in each zone (derived from Table S4). The simulated fossil occurrence is then assigned a pre- or post-12,000 radiocarbon years B.P. taxon date based on the relative frequency of terminal Pleistocene taxon dates known from that zone (Table S4). For example, there are four fossil occurrences of *Glyptotherium*, one located in the Interior Plains and three from the Atlantic Plains (Table S4). Each of the four fossil occurrences is reassigned randomly to one of these physiographic zones based on the relative abundance of *Glyptotherium* in each zone (0.25 for the Interior Plains and 0.75 for the Atlantic Plains). Next, the four simulated fossil occurrences are assigned randomly to a pre- or post-12,000 radiocarbon years B.P. date based on the probability of observing a terminal Pleistocene fossil occurrence within each physiographic zone (Interior Plains, 21 terminal Pleistocene taxon dates of 590 fossil occurrences, 0.0344; Atlantic Plains, 4 terminal Pleistocene taxon dates of 370 fossil occurrences, 0.0107). This is carried out for each of the 31 extinct genera, and the number of genera that receive a terminal Pleistocene taxon date is tallied. The process is repeated 10,000 times, and the probability of observing 16 or fewer terminal Pleistocene genera is determined.

The biogeographic simulation also examines the possibility of preterminal Pleistocene extinctions. The simulation follows the procedures described above except that we prohibited between 0 and 15 randomly selected genera from receiving a terminal Pleistocene taxon date. This process was carried out for 16 separate trials of 10,000 iterations, varying the number of preterminal Pleistocene extinctions from 0 to 15. As above, the number of genera receiving a terminal Pleistocene taxon date is calculated. This simulation allows us to consider how many genera can disappear before 12,000 radiocarbon years B.P. before the empirical observation of 16 terminal Pleistocene genera becomes statistically unlikely.

Restricting the analysis to include only the highest rated radiocarbon requires minor changes to the simulation parameters. In this case, a simulated fossil occurrence is assigned a terminal Pleistocene taxon date based on the relative frequency of highly reliable radiocarbon dates in each physiographic zone (Table S4). Because only 11 genera are associated with such dates, we now calculate the number of times that we observe 11 or fewer terminal Pleistocene genera.

- Meltzer DJ, Mead JI (1985) in *Environments and Extinctions: Man in Late Glacial North America*, eds Mead JI, Meltzer DJ (Center for the Study of Early Man, Orono, ME), pp 145–173.
- Beck MW (1996) On discerning the cause of late Pleistocene megafaunal extinctions. *Paleobiology* 22:91–103.
- Grayson DK (2007) Deciphering North American Pleistocene extinctions. *J Anthropol Res* 63:185–213.
- Fiedel S (2009) in *American Megafaunal Extinctions at the End of the Pleistocene*, ed Haynes GA (Springer, Dordrecht, The Netherlands), pp 21–37.
- Steadman DW, Stafford TW, Funk RE (1997) Nonassociation of paleoindians with AMS-dated late Pleistocene mammals from the Dutchess Quarry Caves, New York. *Quat Res* 47:106–116.
- Schubert BW, Graham RW, McDonald HG, Grimm EC, Stafford TW (2004) Latest Pleistocene paleoecology of Jefferson's ground sloth (*Megalonyx jeffersonii*) and elk-moose (*Cervalces scottii*) in northern Illinois. *Quat Res* 61:231–240.
- Kooyman B, et al. (2001) Identification of horse exploitation by Clovis hunters based on protein analysis. *Am Antiq* 66:686–691.
- Kelley RL, et al. (2006) Multiple approaches to formation processes: The Pine Spring site, southwest Wyoming. *Geoarchaeology* 21:615–638.
- FAUNMAP (1994) A database documenting late Quaternary distributions of mammal species in the United States, Illinois State Museum Scientific Papers 25 (Illinois State Museum, Springfield, IL).
- Grayson DK (1991) Late Pleistocene mammalian extinctions in North America. *J World Prehistory* 5:193–231.
- Kropf M, Mead JI, Anderson RS (2007) Dung, diet, and the palaeoenvironment of the extinct shrub-ox (*Eucatherium collinum*) on the Colorado Plateau, USA. *Quat Res* 67:143–151.
- Dansie AJ, Jerrems WJ (2005) in *Paleoamerican Origins: Beyond Clovis*, eds Bonnicksen R, Lepper BT, Stanford D, Waters MR (Center for the Study of First Americans, College Station, TX), pp 51–80.
- Tankersley KB, Landefeld CS (1998) Geochronology of Sheriden Cave, Ohio: The 1997 Field Season. *Curr Res Pleistocene* 15:136–138.
- Madsen DB (2000) in *Intermountain Archaeology*, eds Madsen DB, Metcalfe D (Univ of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah), University of Utah Anthropological Papers No. 122, pp 100–113.
- Farrow JO, McClain J (1996) in *Palaeoecology and Palaeoenvironments of Late Cenozoic Mammals: Tributes to the Career of C.S. (Rufus) Churcher*, eds Stewart KM, Seymour KL (Univ of Toronto Press, Toronto), pp 322–330.
- Hofreiter M, Betancourt JL, Pelliza Sbriller A, Markgraf V, McDonald HG (2003) Phylogeny, diet, and habitat of an extinct ground sloth from Cuchillo Cura, Neuquen Province, southwest Argentina. *Quat Res* 59:364–378.
- Redmond BG, Tankersley KB (2005) Evidence of early paleoindian bone modification and use at the Sheriden Cave site (33WY252), Wyandot County, Ohio. *Am Antiq* 70:503–526.

18. Muniz M (1998) Preliminary results of excavations and analysis of Little River Rapids: A prehistoric inundated site in North Florida. *Curr Res Pleistocene* 15:48–49.
19. Webb SD, Hemmings CA, Muniz MP (1998) New radiocarbon dates for Vero tapir and stout-legged llama from Florida. *Curr Res Pleistocene* 15:127–128.
20. McDonald HG (2002) in *Papers on the Vertebrate Paleontology of Idaho Honoring John A. White*, eds Akersten W, Thompson ME, Meldrun DJ, Rapp RA, McDonald HG (Idaho Museum of Natural History, Pocatello, ID), Idaho Museum of Natural History Occasional Paper 37, Vol. 2, pp 141–149.
21. Frison GC (2000) A  $^{14}\text{C}$  date on a late-Pleistocene *Camelops* at the Casper-Hell Gap site, Wyoming. *Curr Res Pleistocene* 17:28–29.
22. Huckelberry G, et al. (2001) Terminal Pleistocene/Early Holocene environmental change at the Sunshine Locality, North-Central Nevada, USA. *Quat Res* 55:303–312.
23. Fisher DC (1984) Mastodon butchery by North American Paleo-Indians. *Nature* 308:271–272.
24. Robinson G, Burney LP, Burney DA (2005) Landscape paleoecology and megafaunal extinction in southeastern New York. *Ecol Monogr* 75:295–315.
25. Rhodes AN, et al. (1998) Identification of bacterial isolates obtained from intestinal contents associated with 12,000-year-old mastodon remains. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 64:651–658.
26. Waters MR, Stafford TW (2007) Redefining the age of Clovis: Implications for the peopling of the New World. *Science* 315:1122–1126.
27. Hills LV, Harington CR (2003) New radiocarbon dates for Columbian mammoth and Mexican horse from southern Alberta and the Late glacial regional fauna. *Quat Sci Rev* 22:1521–1523.
28. Agenbroad LD, Johnson J, Morris D, Stafford TW (2005) in *Proceedings of the Sixth California Islands Symposium*, eds Garcelon DK, Schwemm CA (Institute for Wildlife Studies, Arcata, CA), pp 3–7.
29. Gillette DD, Madsen DB (1993) The Columbian Mammoth, *Mammuthus columbi* from the Wasatch Mountains of central Utah. *J Vertebr Paleontol* 67:669–680.
30. Thulman DK, Webb DS (2001) Mid-Wisconsinian date associated with *Eremotherium laurillardii* in Withlacoochee River, north Florida. *Curr Res Pleistocene* 18:115–117.
31. Pettitt PB, Davies W, Gamble CS, Richards MB (2003) Paleolithic radiocarbon chronology: Quantifying our confidence beyond two half-lives. *J Archaeol Sci* 30:1685–1693.

Table S1. Extinct late Pleistocene genera of North America (after ref. 3)

Order	Family	Genus	Common name
Cingulata	Pampatheriidae	<i>Pampatherium</i>	Southern pampathere
		<i>Holmesina</i>	Northern pampathere
Pilosa	Glyptodontidae	<i>Glyptotherium</i>	Simpson's glyptodont
	Megalonychidae	<i>Megalonyx</i>	Jefferson's ground sloth
	Megatheriidae	<i>Eremotherium</i>	Rusconi's ground sloth
		<i>Nothrotheriops</i>	Shasta ground sloth
Carnivora	Mylodontidae	<i>Paramylodon</i>	Harlan's ground sloth
	Mustelidae	<i>Brachyprotoma</i>	Short-faced skunk
	Canidae	<i>Cuon*</i>	Dhole
		<i>Tremarctos*</i>	Florida cave bear
	Ursidae	<i>Arctodus</i>	Giant short-faced bear
		<i>Smilodon</i>	Dirktooth
		<i>Homotherium</i>	Scimitar cat
	<i>Miracinonyx</i>	American cheetah	
Rodentia	Castoridae	<i>Castoroides</i>	Giant beaver
	Hydrochoeridae	<i>Hydrochoerus*</i>	Holmes' capybara
		<i>Neochoerus</i>	Pinckney's capybara
Lagomorpha	Leporidae	<i>Aztlanolagus</i>	Aztlan rabbit
Perissodactyla	Equidae	<i>Equus*</i>	Horses
	Tapiridae	<i>Tapirus*</i>	Tapirs
Artiodactyla	Tayassuidae	<i>Mylohyus</i>	Long-nosed peccary
		<i>Platygonus</i>	Flat-headed peccary
		<i>Camelops</i>	Yesterday's camel
	Camelidae	<i>Hemiauchenia</i>	Large-headed llama
		<i>Palaeolama</i>	Stout-legged llama
		<i>Navahoceros</i>	Mountain deer
	Cervidae	<i>Cervalces</i>	Elk-moose
	Antilocapridae	<i>Capromeryx</i>	Diminutive pronghorn
		<i>Tetrameryx</i>	Shuler's pronghorn
		<i>Stockoceros</i>	Pronghorns
	Bovidae	<i>Saiga*</i>	Saiga
		<i>Euceratherium</i>	Shrub ox
		<i>Bootherium</i>	Harlan's musk ox
<i>Mammut</i>		American mastodon	
Proboscidea	Mammutidae	<i>Mammut</i>	American mastodon
	Elephantidae	<i>Mammuthus</i>	Mammoths

\*Genus survives outside North America.

**Table S2. Reliable terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon dates**

Genus	Site	Date	Material dated	Ref.
<i>Palaeolama</i>	Woody Long, MO	10,890 ± 130	Unpublished	10
<i>Euceratherium</i>	Bechan Cave, UT	11,630 ± 150*	Dung	11
	Falcon Hill, NV	11,950 ± 50	Bone collagen (AMS)	12
<i>Castoroides</i>	Sheriden Cave, OH	10,850 ± 60*	Bone collagen (AMS)	13
	Dutchess Quarry Cave, NY	11,670 ± 70	Bone collagen (AMS)	5
<i>Smilodon</i>	Rancho la Brea, CA	11,130 ± 275*	Bone	1
<i>Arctodus</i>	Huntington Dam, UT	10,870 ± 75*	Bone collagen (AMS)	14
	Sheriden Cave, OH	11,480 ± 60*	Bone collagen (AMS)	13
<i>Cervalces</i>	Lang Farm, IL	11,405 ± 50*	Bone collagen (AMS)	6
	Kendallville, IN	11,420 ± 70*	Bone collagen (AMS)	15
<i>Nothrotheriops</i>	Rampart Cave, AZ (Dung Unit 1)	10,400 ± 275*	Dung	1
	Rampart Cave, AZ (Dung Unit 2)	11,020 ± 200*	Dung	1
	Aden Crater, NM	11,080 ± 200	Dung	1
	Muav Caves, AZ	10,650 ± 220	Dung	1
	Guadalupe Mts., TX	10,750 ± 140	Dung	1
	Gypsum Cave, NV	11,005 ± 100	Dung	16
	Williams Cave, TX	11,140 ± 320	Dung	1
	Shelter Cave, NM	11,330 ± 370	Dung	1
<i>Mylohyus</i>	Sheriden Cave, OH	11,860 ± 40*	Bone collagen (AMS)	17
<i>Megalonyx</i>	Little River Rapids, FL	11,450 ± 90	Wood	18
	Lang Farm, IL	11,485 ± 40*	Bone collagen (AMS)	6
<i>Tapirus</i>	Lehner Ranch, AZ	10,940 ± 100	Charcoal	1
	Little River Rapids, FL	11,450 ± 90	Wood	19
<i>Platygonus</i>	Sheriden Cave, OH	11,060 ± 60	Bone collagen (AMS)	17
	Franklin Peccary, ID	11,340 ± 50	Bone collagen (AMS)	20
<i>Bootherium</i>	Wally's Beach, Alberta	10,980 ± 80	Bone collagen (AMS)	7
<i>Camelops</i>	Jaguar Cave, ID	10,370 ± 350	Charcoal	1
	Lehner Ranch, AZ	10,940 ± 100	Charcoal	1
	Pine Springs, WY	11,180 ± 45	Bone collagen (AMS)	8
	Casper, WY	11,190 ± 50	Bone collagen (AMS)	21
	Sunshine Locality, NV	11,390 ± 60	Bone collagen (AMS)	22
	Tule Springs, NV	11,500 ± 500	Charcoal	1
	Dry Cave, NM	11,880 ± 250	Charcoal	1
<i>Mammut</i>	Pleasant Lake, MI	10,395 ± 100	Wood	23
	Rappuhn, MI	10,400 ± 400	Wood	1
	Hiscock, NY	10,630 ± 80*	Bone collagen (AMS)	4
	Deerfield, WI	10,780 ± 60*	Bone collagen (AMS)	4
	Grandville, MI	10,920 ± 190	Bone collagen (AMS)	4
	Lehner Ranch AZ	10,940 ± 100	Charcoal	1
	Temple Hill, NY	11,000 ± 80	Bone collagen (AMS)	24
	Burning Tree, OH	11,390 ± 80*	Bone collagen (AMS)	25
	Heisler, MI	11,770 ± 110*	Bone collagen (AMS)	25
<i>Mammuthus</i>	Pyramid Lake, NV	10,340 ± 50	Bone collagen (AMS)	12
	Rawhide Butte, WY	10,550 ± 350	Charcoal	1
	Big Bone Lick, KY	10,600 ± 250	Wood	1
	Lange-Ferguson, SD	10,710 ± 130*	Bone collagen (AMS)	26
	Colby, WY	10,790 ± 30*	Bone collagen (AMS)	26
	Bindloss Gravel Pit, AB	10,930 ± 100	Bone collagen (AMS)	27
	Dent, CO	10,940 ± 30*	Bone collagen (AMS)	26
	Lehner Ranch, AZ	10,940 ± 100	Charcoal	1
	Domebo, OK	10,960 ± 30*	Bone collagen (AMS)	26
	Santa Rosa, CA	11,030 ± 50*	Bone collagen (AMS)	28
	Blackwater Draw, NM	11,040 ± 500	Plant remains	1
	Murray Springs, AZ	11,150 ± 450	Charcoal	1
	Huntington Dam, UT	11,220 ± 110*	Bone	29
	Bechan Cave, UT	11,670 ± 300*	Dung	2
	Little River Rapids, FL	11,450 ± 90	Wood	18
<i>Equus</i>	Jaguar Cave, ID	10,370 ± 350	Charcoal	1
	Pashley Gravel Pit, AB	10,870 ± 45	Bone collagen (AMS)	27
	Lehner Ranch, AZ	10,940 ± 100	Charcoal	1
	Rancho la Brea, CA	10,940 ± 510	Bone	1
	Fishbone Cave, NV - Horse #1	11,210 ± 50*	Bone collagen (AMS)	12
	Fishbone Cave, NV - Horse #2	11,350 ± 40*	Bone collagen (AMS)	12
	Wally's Beach, Alberta	11,330 ± 70	Bone collagen (AMS)	7
	Little River Rapids, FL	11,450 ± 90	Wood	18
	Pine Springs, WY	11,530 ± 50	Bone collagen (AMS)	8

AMS, accelerator mass spectrometry.

\*Radiocarbon date considered highly reliable according to Pettitt et al. (31).

Table S3. Last appearance dates (LADs) for extinct North American genera\*

Genus	LAD	Site	Ref. or FAUNMAP machine no.
<i>Aztlanolagus</i>	>31,150	U-Bar Cave	1173
<i>Eremotherium</i>	<b>38,860 ± 1,300</b>	Munroe Sloth Site	(30)
<i>Glyptotherium</i>	23,230 ± 490	Laubach Cave No. 3	718
<i>Brachyprotoma</i>	13,740 ± 145	Frankstown Cave	890
<i>Miracinonyx</i>	14,935 ± 610	Haystack Cave	736
<i>Tetrameryx</i>	23,230 ± 490	Laubach Cave No. 3	718
<i>Hydrochoerus</i>	12,000 ± 300	Avery Island	339
<i>Homotherium</i>	13,970 ± 310	Laubach Cave No. 2	719
<i>Navahoceros</i>	12,860 ± 400	Black Rock Canyon	1015
<i>Stockoceros</i>	12,520 ± 200	Shelter Cave	1304
<i>Palaeolama</i>	<b>10,890 ± 130</b>	Woody Long	(10)
<i>Euceratherium</i>	<b>11,630 ± 150</b>	Bechan Cave	(11)
<i>Tremarctos</i>	23,230 ± 490	Laubach Cave #3	718
<i>Holmesina</i>	21,150 ± 400	West Palm Beach	1669
<i>Capromeryx</i>	12,200 ± 200	Rancho la Brea	(1)
<i>Castoroides</i>	<b>10,850 ± 60</b>	Sheriden Cave	(13)
<i>Smilodon</i>	<b>11,130 ± 275</b>	Rancho la Brea	(1)
<i>Arctodus</i>	<b>10,870 ± 75</b>	Huntington Mammoth	(14)
<i>Cervalces</i>	<b>11,405 ± 50</b>	Lang Farm	(6)
<i>Nothrotheriops</i>	<b>10,400 ± 275</b>	Rampart Cave	(1)
<i>Paramylodon</i>	<b>20,450 ± 460</b>	Rancho la Brea	(1)
<i>Mylohyus</i>	<b>11,860 ± 40</b>	Sheridan Cave	(17)
<i>Megalonyx</i>	<b>11,450 ± 90</b>	Little River Rapids	(18)
<i>Hemiauchenia</i>	12,210 ± 430	Dagget Waste Locality	1364
<i>Tapirus</i>	<b>10,940 ± 90</b>	Lehner Ranch	(1)
<i>Platygonus</i>	<b>11,060 ± 60</b>	Sheridan Cave	(17)
<i>Bootherium</i>	<b>10,980 ± 80</b>	Wally's Beach	(7)
<i>Camelops</i>	<b>10,370 ± 350</b>	Jaguar Cave	(1)
<i>Mammut</i>	<b>10,395 ± 100</b>	Pleasant Lake	(1)
<i>Mammuthus</i>	<b>10,340 ± 40</b>	Pyramid Lake	(1)
<i>Equus</i>	<b>10,370 ± 350</b>	Jaguar Cave	(7)

\*For those taxa lacking a reliable radiocarbon date, the reported LAD is the youngest preterminal Pleistocene radiocarbon date reported by FAUNMAP (9). Only dates in bold are considered reliable according to Meltzer and Mead (1).

**Table S4. Abundances of extinct Pleistocene genera and terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon dates across seven physiographic zones**

	Pacific Mountain System	Intermontane Plateau	Rocky Mountain System	Interior Plains	Interior Highlands	Appalachian Highlands	Atlantic Plains
<i>Aztlanolagus</i>	0	1	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Eremotherium</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
<i>Glyptotherium</i>	0	0	0	1	0	0	3
<i>Brachyprotoma</i>	0	1	0	1	2	1	0
<i>Miracinonyx</i>	0	1	4	0	0	0	0
<i>Tetrameryx</i>	0	3	0	2	0	0	0
<i>Hydrochoerus</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
<i>Homotherium</i>	0	3	1	3	0	0	2
<i>Navahoceros</i>	0	5	1	3	0	0	0
<i>Stockoceros</i>	0	9	0	1	0	0	0
<i>Palaeolama</i>	0	0	0	0	1	0	14
<i>Euceratherium</i>	7	9	0	0	0	0	0
<i>Tremarctos</i>	0	0	0	1	0	2	15
<i>Holmesina</i>	0	0	0	1	0	0	21
<i>Capromeryx</i>	11	11	0	6	0	0	0
<i>Castoroides</i>	0	0	0	2	21	5	9
<i>Smilodon</i>	13	6	1	5	3	0	9
<i>Arctodus</i>	7	12	3	6	6	1	3
<i>Cervalces</i>	0	0	0	28	4	6	0
<i>Nothrotheriops</i>	10	32	0	2	0	0	0
<i>Paramylodon</i>	13	8	1	6	5	0	17
<i>Mylohyus</i>	0	0	0	11	6	16	20
<i>Megalonyx</i>	11	4	0	15	5	6	16
<i>Hemiauchenia</i>	5	23	1	12	1	0	16
<i>Tapirus</i>	5	6	0	2	9	12	31
<i>Platygonus</i>	3	4	1	35	19	14	21
<i>Bootherium</i>	1	13	26	56	9	4	3
<i>Camelops</i>	23	64	21	29	1	1	8
<i>Mammut</i>	11	7	1	120	24	19	40
<i>Mammuthus</i>	27	71	16	188	8	5	41
<i>Equus</i>	34	140	29	75	17	17	76
Terminal Pleistocene taxon dates*	3/2	25/8	6/1	22/11	2/0	4/2	4/0

\*Terminal Pleistocene taxon dates are reported as (no. of terminal Pleistocene radiocarbon dates)/(no. of terminal Pleistocene taxon dates considered highly reliable according to ref. 31).