Supplemental Table 1. Characteristics of Participants for Prototypic and Comorbid Cases.

| | Prototypic Cases | Comorbid Cases | Comorbid Cases |
|--|------------------|----------------|----------------|
| | | DSM Condition | FFM Condition |
| | 19.84 | 20.52 | 18.53 |
| Years of Experience and (SD) | (8.85) | (8.98) | (8.82) |
| | 31.84 | 33.86 | 33.40 |
| Clinical Working Hours per Week and (SD) | (11.83) | (13.21) | (13.15) |
| | 10.88 | 10.97 | 12.30 |
| Hours/Week with Pers. Disorder Patients and (SD) | (8.13) | (9.91) | (10.70) |
| Gender | | | |
| Male | 45.99% | 46.32% | 41.67% |
| Female | 50.27% | 49.47% | 57.29% |
| No Response | 3.74% | 4.21% | 1.04% |
| Degree | | | |
| Ph.D. | 29.14% | 28.42% | 30.21% |
| Psy.D. | 6.95% | 4.21% | 1.04% |
| M.D. | 30.21% | 32.63% | 34.38% |
| Masters or | 28.34% | 24.21% | 26.04% |
| higher in S.W. | | | |
| Unspecified Masters | 2.67% | 6.32% | 8.33% |
| Other or Unknown | 2.67% | 4.21% | 0.00% |
| Theoretical Orientation | | | |
| Cognitive or Cognitive-Behavioral | 61.5% | 70.5% | 64.6% |
| Psychodynamic | 55.1% | 61.1% | 47.9% |
| Interpersonal/System | 36.9% | 39.0% | 37.5% |
| Eclectic | 35.3% | 22.1% | 34.4% |
| Biological | 33.7% | 35.8% | 35.4% |

| Е | Behavioral | 29.4% | 21.1% | 27.1% |
|----|-------------------|-------|-------|-------|
| H | Humanistic | 16.6% | 13.7% | 13.5% |
| F | Psychoanalytic | 12.8% | 14.7% | 8.3% |
| C | Other | 12.8% | 15.8% | 4.2% |
| Em | ployment Setting | | | |
| F | Private Practice | 70.0% | 75.8% | 70.8% |
| H | Hopsital | 31.6% | 29.5% | 38.5% |
| C | Clinic | 31.0% | 25.3% | 26.0% |
| A | Academic Position | 21.9% | 29.5% | 28.1% |
| F | Forensics | 9.6% | 9.5% | 9.4% |
| C | Other | 16.6% | 19.0% | 11.5% |
| | | | | |

Supplemental Table 2. Mean Number of Correct Diagnoses per Personality Disorder for Prototypic Cases.

| Pers. Disorder | FFM | DSM | SWAP |
|----------------|------|------|------|
| Cluster A | | | |
| Paranoid | 0.43 | 1.00 | 0.80 |
| Schizoid | 0.65 | 0.88 | 0.58 |
| Schizotypal | 0.34 | 0.59 | 0.69 |
| Cluster B | | | |
| Antisocial | 0.50 | 0.95 | 0.87 |
| Borderline | 0.41 | 0.95 | 0.94 |
| Histrionic | 0.29 | 0.78 | 0.56 |
| Narcissistic | 0.56 | 0.94 | 0.95 |
| Cluster C | | | |
| Avoidant | 0.35 | 0.61 | 0.50 |
| Dependent | 0.53 | 0.82 | 0.82 |
| OCPD | 0.75 | 0.89 | 0.88 |
| | | | |

Supplemental Table 3. Mean Number of Incorrect Diagnoses per Personality Disorder for Prototypic Cases.

| Pers. Disorder | FFM | DSM | SWAP |
|----------------|------|------|------|
| Cluster A | | | |
| Paranoid | 1.09 | 0.25 | 0.55 |
| Schizoid | 1.24 | 0.41 | 0.74 |
| Schizotypal | 1.05 | 1.41 | 0.88 |
| Cluster B | | | |
| Antisocial | 1.00 | 0.25 | 1.04 |
| Borderline | 0.94 | 0.16 | 0.47 |
| Histrionic | 1.24 | 0.58 | 0.89 |
| Narcissistic | 0.81 | 0.20 | 0.25 |
| Cluster C | | | |
| Avoidant | 1.55 | 1.13 | 1.20 |
| Dependent | 1.37 | 0.47 | 0.47 |
| OCPD | 0.80 | 0.28 | 0.30 |

Supplemental Figures 1a-c. Profiles and Diagnoses of the Three Comorbid Cases in both the DSM and FFM Conditions

Note: The disorders shown in brackets associated with each *DSM* symptom were not presented to participants. The FFM profiles presented to participants looked like Figure 1a.

Supplemental Figure 1a: Earnest

| DSM Profile | FFM Profile | |
|--|----------------------|------|
| Avoids occupational activities that involve significant | Neuroticism Facets | |
| interpersonal contact, because of fears of criticism, | Anxiousness | 4.33 |
| disapproval, or rejection. [Avoidant] | Angry Hostility | 3.50 |
| Is inhibited in new interpersonal situations because of | Depressiveness | 4.07 |
| feelings of inadequacy. [Avoidant] | Self-consciousness | 4.54 |
| Reads hidden demeaning or threatening meanings into | Impulsivity | 1.85 |
| benign remarks or events. [Paranoid] | Vulnerability | 3.76 |
| Almost always chooses solitary activities. [Schizoid] | Extraversion Facets | 3.70 |
| Views self as socially inept, personally unappealing, or | Warmth | 1.84 |
| inferior to others. [Avoidant] | Gregariousness | 1.47 |
| Is unwilling to get involved with people unless certain of | Assertiveness | 1.60 |
| being liked. [Avoidant] Shows restraint within intimate relationships because of the | Activity | 2.00 |
| fear of being shamed or ridiculed. [Avoidant] | Excitement-Seeking | 1.52 |
| Is preoccupied with being criticized or rejected in social | Positive Emotions | 1.69 |
| situations. [Avoidant] | Openness Facets | 1.05 |
| Lacks close friends or confidants other than first-degree | Fantasy | 4.07 |
| relatives. [Schizoid & Schizotypal] | Aesthetics | 3.00 |
| Has little, if any, interest in having sexual experiences with | Feelings | 2.59 |
| another person. [Schizoid] | Actions | 2.79 |
| Is unusually reluctant to take personal risks or to engage in | Ideas | 3.14 |
| <pre>any new activities because they may prove embarrassing. [Avoidant]</pre> | Values | 1.93 |
| Neither desires nor enjoys close relationships, including | Agreeableness Facets | 1.55 |
| being part of a family. [Schizoid] | Trust | 1.88 |
| being part of a farmly. [Beinzola] | Straightforwardness | 3.01 |
| | Altruism | 2.85 |
| | Compliance | 3.27 |
| | Modesty | 3.83 |
| | Tendermindedness | 3.13 |
| | Conscientious Facets | 0.10 |
| | Competence | 3.71 |
| | Order | 3.64 |
| | Dutifulness | 3.71 |
| | Achievement Striving | 3.75 |
| | Self-Discipline | 3.69 |
| | Deliberation | 3.97 |
| | 2 0 2 | , |
| | | |
| | | |

Participant's Diagnoses from the DSM Profile

Correct Diagnoses Avoidant 63% Schizoid 42% Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% Social Anxiety 19% Paranoid 14%

Participant's Diagnoses from the FFM Profile

| 32% |
|-------|
| 16% |
| |
| 28% |
| 20 /0 |
| 23% |
| 20% |
| |

Supplemental Figure 1b: Madeline

| DSM I | Profile | FFM Profile | |
|--|--|---|------|
| Requires excessive admiration | . [Narcissistic] | Neuroticism Facets | |
| Interaction with others is ofter | | Anxiousness | 2.28 |
| inappropriate sexually sedu | ctive or provocative behavior. | Angry Hostility | 3.41 |
| [Histrionic] | | Depressiveness | 2.24 |
| Impulsivity in at least two area | | Self-consciousness | 1.28 |
| | sex, substance abuse, reckless | Impulsivity | 4.08 |
| driving, binge eating). Note | | Vulnerability | 2.00 |
| self-mutilating behavior. [Bo | | Extraversion Facets | |
| Inappropriate, intense anger o | | Warmth | 2.26 |
| (e.g., frequent displays of t | | Gregariousness | 4.56 |
| recurrent physical fights). [| | Assertiveness | 4.69 |
| Shows arrogant, haughty beha [Narcissistic] | aviors or attitudes. | Activity | 4.72 |
| Lacks empathy: is unwilling to | recognize or identify with the | Excitement-Seeking | 4.74 |
| feelings and needs of others | | Positive Emotions | 4.19 |
| There is evidence of Conduct I | | | 4.15 |
| 15 years. [Antisocial] | one of the contract of the con | Openness Facets | 2.65 |
| Consistently uses physical app | earance to draw attention to | Fantasy | 2.65 |
| self. [Histrionic] | | Aesthetics | 2.82 |
| Considers relationships to be r | nore intimate than they | Feelings | 2.15 |
| actually are. [Histrionic] | | Actions | 4.14 |
| Is preoccupied with fantasies of | | Ideas | 3.19 |
| brilliance, beauty, or ideal le | | Values | 4.28 |
| Is interpersonally exploitative, | | Agreeableness Facets | |
| others to achieve his or her | | Trust | 2.14 |
| Identity disturbance: markedly | | Straightforwardness | 1.77 |
| self-image or sense of self. | | Altruism | 2.22 |
| | nse interpersonal relationships | Compliance | 1.69 |
| characterized by alternating | | Modesty | 1.27 |
| idealization and devaluation Is uncomfortable in situations | | Tendermindedness | 1.60 |
| center of attention. | III WINCH HE OF SHE IS NOT THE | Conscientious Facets | |
| | arked reactivity of mood (e.g., | Competence | 4.35 |
| | irritability, or anxiety usually | Order | 3.64 |
| | y rarely more than a few days. | Dutifulness | 3.00 |
| [Borderline] | ,, | Achievement Striving | 4.74 |
| Shows self-dramatization, the | atricality, and exaggerated | Self-Discipline | 3.51 |
| expression of emotion. [His | | aDeliberation | 2.24 |
| Has a grandiose sense of self- | | | |
| achievements and talents, e | expects to be recognized as | | |
| superior without commensu | ırate achievements). | | |
| [Narcissistic] | | | |
| Pauticinantia Diagnas | | Pauticinantie Disense | |
| Participant's Diagnos from the DSM Profil | | Participant's Diagnos from the FFM Profile | |
| | | | • |
| Correct Diagnoses | 600/ | Correct Diagnoses | 4401 |
| Borderline | 68% | Borderline | 11% |
| Histrionic | 46% | Histrionic | 11% |
| Narcissistic | 59% | Narcissistic | 26% |
| Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% | | Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% | |
| Antisocial, Sociopathic or | 39% | Antisocial, Sociopathic or | 34% |
| Psychopathic | | Psychopathic | |
| | | Bipolar or Manic | 22% |
| | | | |

Supplemental Figure 1c: Ted

| DSM Profile | FFM Profile | |
|--|------------------------------|--------------|
| Lacks empathy: is unwilling to recognize or identify with the | Neuroticism Facets | |
| feelings and needs of others. [Narcissistic] | Anxiousness | 1.49 |
| Has a grandiose sense of self-importance (e.g., exaggerates | Angry Hostility | 4.14 |
| achievements and talents, expects to be recognized as | Depressiveness | 2.12 |
| superior without commensurate achievements). | Self-consciousness | 1.38 |
| [Narcissistic] | Impulsivity | 2.84 |
| Shows arrogant, haughty behaviors or attitudes. | Vulnerability | 1.58 |
| [Narcissistic] | Extraversion Facets | 1.50 |
| Deceitfulness, as indicated by repeated lying, use of aliases, | Warmth | 1.95 |
| or conning others for personal profit or pleasure. [Antisocial] | Gregariousness | 3.45 |
| Neither desires nor enjoys close relationships, including | Assertiveness | 4.08 |
| being part of a family. [Schizoid] | Activity | 4.10 |
| Has a sense of entitlement, i.e., unreasonable expectations | Excitement-Seeking | 4.38 |
| of especially favorable treatment or automatic compliance | Positive Emotions | 3.11 |
| with his or her expectations. [Narcissistic] | Openness Facets | 3.11 |
| Lacks close friends or confidents other than first-degree | Fantasy | 3.03 |
| relatives. [Schizoid & Schizotypal] | Aesthetics | 3.22 |
| Reckless disregard for safety of self or others. [Antisocial] | | 2.08 |
| Failure to conform to social norms with respect to lawful | Feelings Actions | 3.85 |
| behaviors as indicated by repeatedly performing acts that | Ideas | 3.88 |
| are grounds for arrest. [Antisocial] | Values | 2.75 |
| Lack of remorse, as indicated by being indifferent to or | | 2.75 |
| rationalizing having hurt, mistreated, or stolen from | Agreeableness Facets | 1 71 |
| another. [Antisocial] Believes that he or she is "special" and unique and can only | Trust Straightforwardness | 1.71 1.16 |
| be understood by, or should associate with, other special | _ | 1.10 |
| or high-status people (or institutions). [Narcissistic] | Altruism | |
| Is interpersonally exploitative, i.e., takes advantage of | Compliance | 1.88 |
| others to achieve his or her own ends. [Narcissistic] | Modesty | 1.40 |
| Irritability and aggressiveness, as indicated by repeated | Tendermindedness | 1.25 |
| physical fights or assaults. [Antisocial] | Conscientious Facets | 4 22 |
| | Competence | 4.33 |
| | Order | 4.48 |
| | Dutifulness | 3.36 |
| | Achievement Striving | 4.00 |
| | Self-Discipline | 3.41 |
| | Deliberation | 3.93 |
| Participant's Diagnoses | Participant's Diagno | |
| from the DSM Profile | from the FFM Prof | iie |
| Correct Diagnoses | Correct Diagnoses | |

Correct Diagnoses Antisocial 79% Narcissistic 58% Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% Sociopathic or Psychopathic (can be mapped onto 12% Antisocial)

| Correct Diagnoses | |
|---------------------------|-------|
| Antisocial | 26% |
| Narcissistic | 23% |
| Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% | |
| Obsessive-Compulsive | 30% |
| Pers. D. or D. | 30 70 |
| Paranoid | 16% |
| Bipolar or Manic | 13% |

Familiarity with DSM as a Covariate in Study 2

One explanation why participants in the DSM condition reported slightly higher familiarity with the DSM-IV than participants in the FFM condition is that they may have been reminded of the DSM criterial symptoms while looking at the DSM case profiles. In contrast, participants in the FFM condition may have felt less familiar with the DSM after having a difficult time providing correct DSM diagnoses. We ran additional statistical analyses using familiarity with the DSM-IV as a covariate and these analyses confirmed that the difference in familiarity did not lead to any of the main findings in Study 2. These findings are presented below.

Correct Diagnoses. Though familiarity with the DSM was a significant predictor of the overall accuracy score, F(1,187)=5.15, p=.02, the effect of DSM vs. FFM was still significant as well, F(1,187)=147.95, p<.01.

Incorrect Diagnoses. An ANOVA using familiarity with the DSM as a covariate, did not find familiarity with the DSM to be a significant predictor of the number of incorrect diagnoses F(1,187)<1, and the effect of DSM vs. FFM was still significant F(1,187)=19.84, p<.01.

Utility Ratings. Familiarity with the DSM was a significant predictor of all six utility questions (all p's<.05). However, even with DSM as a covariate, participants still gave significantly higher utility ratings for DSM than FFM for five of the six utility questions (all p's<.05). For the question about communicating with clients, even after accounting for familiarity with the DSM, the average utility rating was still higher for FFM than DSM as was found in the initial analysis, (p=.05).