### Web Material

# Evidence on Vulnerability and Susceptibility to Health Risks Associated with Short-Term Exposure to Particulate Matter: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

#### Web Table 1. Studies of effect modification for associations between particulate matter and mortality

*Note:* The results presented show (+) when a higher level of the effect modifier is associated with a higher health risk estimate and a (-) when a higher level of the effect modifier is associated with a lower health risk estimate. Only statistically significant associations are reported in the table. Reference numbers refer to the reference list for the Web Material, which differs from the reference list for the main text.

| Study                                      | Location and<br>timeframe  | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure | Health outcome                  | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results   |
|--|--|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Aga et al. (2003) <sup>1</sup>             | 28 European cities<br>(~5yrs within 1990s<br>for most cities)          | PM <sub>10</sub> .<br>Lag 01     | Mortality for persons<br>≥65yrs | <b>Community level:</b> NO <sub>2</sub> ,<br>temperature, humidity,<br>age (% elderly, ≥65yrs<br>vs. all ages), region                | Poisson regression.<br>Two-stage<br>hierarchical model<br>for effect<br>modification.           | Long-term NO <sub>2</sub><br>levels (+)<br>Long-term<br>temperatures (+)<br>Long-term relative<br>humidity (-)  |
| Analitis et al.<br>(2006) <sup>2</sup>     | 29 European cities   | PM <sub>10</sub> .<br>Lag 01     | Mortality: CVD,<br>respiratory  | <b>Community level:</b><br>temperature, humidity,<br>NO <sub>2</sub> , age (% elderly),<br>age-standardized<br>mortality rate, region | City-specific time<br>series. Second stage<br>hierarchical model<br>for effect<br>modification. | Factors explaining<br>>10% of<br>heterogeneity for<br>CVD:<br>Temperature (+)<br>Precipitation (-)<br>NO <sub>2</sub> (+)<br>Proportion elderly<br>(+)<br>Age-standardized<br>mortality rate (-)<br>region (higher in<br>South) |
| Balakrishnan et al.<br>(2011) <sup>3</sup> | Chennai, India<br>(formerly Madras)<br>and Delhi, India<br>(2002-2004) | PM <sub>10</sub> .<br>Lag 0, 1   | Mortality                       | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> sex, age (0-4, 5-44, 45-64, ≥65yrs), season (MarAug., SepFeb.)                            | Generalized<br>additive models.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.                   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |

| Study                                       | Location and<br>timeframe      | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure | Health outcome   | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results                          |
|---|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|---|--|
| Bateson and<br>Schwartz (2004) <sup>4</sup> | Cook County, IL<br>(1988-1991) | PM <sub>10.</sub> Lag 01         | Mortality: persons<br>with history of<br>hospitalization for<br>heart or lung disease,<br>for persons ≥35yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: prior hospital<br>admissions (myocardial<br>infarction (MI), diabetes,<br>congestive heart failure<br>(CHF), COPD,<br>conduction disorders),<br>age, sex<br>Community level:<br>income, education (%<br>adults with bachelor's<br>degree), % adults with<br>non-English language   | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.  | Co-morbidities: MI,<br>diabetes, CHF (+)                   |
| Bell, et al.<br>(2009) <sup>5</sup>         | 100 US cities<br>(1987-2000)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0         | Mortality  | <b>Community level:</b> long-<br>term levels of $PM_{2.5}$<br>chemical components<br>(Al, As, Ca, Cl, Cu, EC,<br>Fe, K, Mg, Na <sup>+</sup> , NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup> ,<br>Ni, Nitrate, OCM, Pb, Si,<br>Sulfate, Ti, V, Zn),<br>education (% of those<br>$\geq 25$ yrs with high school<br>degree), median<br>household income, race<br>(% of self-identifying as<br>Black/African-<br>American), urbanicity (%<br>of living in urban<br>setting), population | City-specific times<br>series. Bayesian<br>hierarchical<br>modeling to<br>generate overall<br>estimates and for<br>effect modification.           | Ni (+): PM <sub>10</sub><br>associations with<br>mortality |
| Bell et al. (2009) <sup>6</sup>             | 184 US cities<br>(1987-2000)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1         | Mortality  | Community level:<br>Central AC, any AC<br>including window units.  | City-specific time<br>series. Bayesian<br>hierarchical analysis<br>to estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification. | Central AC (-)   |

| Study                               | Location and<br>timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome                        | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results   |
|-------------------------------------|---|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|---|
| Biggeri et al. (2005)               | 6 Italian cities for<br>mortality (1990-<br>1999). Not all cities<br>had data for all<br>years. | PM <sub>10</sub> , based<br>on TSP for 2<br>cities. Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 01,<br>12, 03 | Mortality: total                      | Individual or daily<br>level: age (0-64, 65-74,<br>$\geq$ 75yrs), age (<64,<br>$\geq$ 65yrs), season (warm:<br>May-Sep., cool: Oct<br>Apr.)<br>Community level: time<br>(1990-1994 vs. 1995-<br>1999) ), SMR, age (%<br>elderly), SES<br>(deprivation index), mean<br>temperature, long-term<br>NO <sub>2</sub> , PM <sub>10</sub> /NO <sub>2</sub> ratio, log<br>long-term PM <sub>10</sub> | City-specific time<br>series. Fixed effects,<br>random effects, and<br>Bayesian models to<br>generate overall<br>estimates.<br>Interaction terms in<br>city-specific model<br>to investigate effect<br>modification by<br>season or age.<br>Bayesian random<br>effects model to<br>investigate effect<br>modification by<br>community-level | SMR (+)<br>Season: higher in<br>warm season   |
| Cakmak et al (2011)<br><sup>8</sup> | 7 cities in Chile<br>(1997-2007)  | PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> .<br>Lag 06                                     | Mortality                             | Individual or daily<br>level: Sex, age (<64, 65-<br>74, 75-84, ≥85yrs),<br>employment<br>(unemployed, blue-collar,<br>white-collar), education<br>( <primary high<br="" primary="" school,="">school, some college,<br/>university).<br/>Community level:<br/>income (quartiles)</primary>   | City-specific time<br>series. Random<br>effects model to<br>estimate overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Sex (higher in<br>women): $PM_{2.5}$ ,<br>$PM_{10}$<br>Age (+): $PM_{2.5}$ ,<br>$PM_{10}$<br>Education (-)<br>Age (+): $PM_{2.5}$ ,<br>$PM_{10}$<br>Income (-): $PM_{2.5}$<br>Employment status<br>(-) (higher risk<br>estimates for<br>unemployed than<br>white-collar<br>employment): $PM_{10}$ |
| Chen et al. (2010) <sup>9</sup>     | Anshan, China<br>(2004-2006)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Mortality: total,<br>cardio-pulmonary | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> age (5-64, 65-74, 75+yrs), sex   | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Age (+)   |

| Study                                    | Location and<br>timeframe         | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                                 | Health outcome   | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results  |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|---|--|--|
| De Leon et al.<br>(2003) <sup>10</sup>   | New York, NY, US<br>(1985-1994)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Mortality:<br>circulatory, cancer                                      | Individual or daily<br>level: age ( $<75$ , $\geq 75$ yrs);<br>contributing cause of<br>death as respiratory,<br>pneumonia ( $\geq 75$ yrs),<br>COPD ( $\geq 75$ yrs)   | Poisson regression.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
| Diaz et al. (2012) <sup>11</sup>         | Madrid, Spain<br>(2003-2005)      | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1   | Mortality: total,<br>respiratory,<br>circulatory, cerebro-<br>vascular | Individual or daily<br>level: Saharan dust days<br>(binary variable based<br>backwards trajectory<br>models, dust maps, and<br>satellite imagery), season<br>(warm: May-Sep., cool:<br>OctApr.)                                       | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by season.                      | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
| Dominici, et al.<br>(2007) <sup>12</sup> | 69 US urban cities<br>(1987-2000) | PM <sub>10</sub> .Lag 1  | Mortality.   | <b>Community level:</b> Long-<br>term PM <sub>2.5</sub> Ni, PM <sub>2.5</sub> V<br>(average levels for 2000-<br>2005)   | City-specific time<br>series.<br>Bayesian<br>hierarchical model<br>incorporating<br>community-level<br>modifiers for effect<br>modification.     | PM <sub>2.5</sub> Ni, V (+).<br>Associations lose<br>statistical<br>significance when<br>New York, NY is<br>removed. |
| Faustini et al.<br>(2011) <sup>13</sup>  | 10 Italian cities<br>(2001-2005)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag<br>02 (total), lag<br>03<br>(respiratory) | Mortality: total,<br>respiratory, for<br>persons ≥35yrs                | Individual or daily<br>level: age, sex, acute<br>conditions based on<br>previous 28 days<br>hospitalizations, chronic<br>conditions based on<br>previous 2yrs<br>hospitalizations, death<br>site, (warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: Oct -Mar.) | City-specific case-<br>crossover. Random<br>effects meta-<br>analysis for overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | Warm season (+):<br>respiratory  |

| Study                                    | Location and<br>timeframe | Exposure<br>and lag | Health outcome         | Potential effect<br>modifiers              | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results |
|--|---------------------------|---------------------|------------------------|--|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
|  |                           | structure           |                        | <b>.</b>                                   |                      |                                   |
| Forastiere et al. $(2000)$ <sup>14</sup> | 9 Italian cities          | $PM_{10}$ . Lag 01  | Mortality, for persons | Individual or daily                        | City-specific case-  | Age (+)                           |
| (2008)                                   | (1997-2004)               |                     | <u>&gt;</u> 55yrs      | <b>level:</b> age $(53-64, 63-74, 75, 84)$ | crossover. Kandoni-  | Previous chronic                  |
|  |                           |                     |                        | $73-64, \geq 03918$ , sex,                 | enects meta-         | other isohomia heart              |
|  |                           |                     |                        | hospital discharged 2.28                   | analysis for overall | disease (1)                       |
|  |                           |                     |                        | days before death in                       | associations.        | Dravious acuto                    |
|  |                           |                     |                        | hospital pursing home)                     |                      | hospitalization for               |
|  |                           |                     |                        | hospitalizations in 2                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | provious years excluding                   |                      | circulation (1)                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | 28 days before death for                   |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | primary or secondary                       |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | diagnosis (malignant                       |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | neonlasms: disorders or                    |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | thyroid gland: diabetes                    |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | mellitus: anemias:                         |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | coagulation defects:                       |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | diseases of valves.                        |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | hypertensive disease:                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | previous acute MI                          |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | (AMI): other ischemic                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | heart diseases: pulmonary                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | circulation: conduction                    |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | disorders: heart failure:                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | chronic pulmonary                          |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | disease: diseases of                       |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | arteries, arterioles, and                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | capillaries).                              |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | hospitalization within 28                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | days before death with                     |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | primary diagnosis                          |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | (malignant neoplasms;                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | diabetes mellitus;                         |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | anemias; hypertensive                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | disease; AMI; other acute                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | ischemic heart disease;                    |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | pulmonary circulation;                     |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | cardiac dyshythmias;                       |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | heart failure;                             |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | cerebrovascular diseases;                  |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | diseases of arteries,                      |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | arterioles, capillaries;                   | 5                    |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | pneumonia; chronic                         |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | pulmonary disease; renal                   |                      |                                   |
|  |                           |                     |                        | failure)                                   |                      |                                   |

| Study                                     | Location and<br>timeframe    | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure         | Health outcome                                       | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results                                      |
|---|------------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|
| Forastiere et al.<br>(2005) <sup>15</sup> | Rome, Italy (1998-2000)      | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 01 | Mortality: out of<br>hospital coronary               | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (<65, 65-<br>74, >74yrs),<br>hospitalizations during<br>preceding 3yrs with<br>primary or secondary<br>diagnosis (diabetes,<br>hypertension, COPD,<br>angina, other ischemic<br>heart disease, conduction<br>disorders, dysrhythmias,<br>or heart failure)  | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Forastiere et al.<br>(2007) <sup>16</sup> | Rome, Italy (1998-2001)      | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01                | Mortality, for persons<br>≥35yrs                     | <b>Community level:</b><br>income, SES index<br>(based on education,<br>occupation,<br>unemployment, family<br>size, crowding, and<br>proportion of dwellings<br>rented/owned) (4 strata<br>by 20 <sup>th</sup> , 50 <sup>th</sup> , and 80 <sup>th</sup><br>percentiles), population-<br>weighted traffic<br>emissions (4 strata by<br>20 <sup>th</sup> , 50 <sup>th</sup> , and 80 <sup>th</sup><br>percentiles) | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.  | Income (-)<br>SES (-)  |
| Franklin, et al<br>(2007) <sup>17</sup>   | 27 US cities (1997-<br>2002) | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 1                | Mortality: all-cause,<br>respiratory, CVD,<br>stroke | Individual or daily<br>level: age ( $\geq$ 75 vs. <75)<br>and sex<br>Community level: region<br>(east vs. west), PM <sub>2.5</sub><br>levels (annual PM <sub>2.5</sub><br>concentrations > or $\leq$ 15<br>µg/m <sup>3</sup> ), prevalence of<br>central AC  | City-specific case-<br>crossover.<br>Interaction terms in<br>a case-crossover for<br>individual or daily<br>level modifiers and<br>random effects<br>meta-regression for<br>community-level<br>level modifiers. | Age (+): all-cause,<br>stroke  |

| Study  | Location and<br>timeframe  | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results   |
|--|--|--|---|--|---|---|
| Franklin, et al.<br>(2008) <sup>18</sup>     | 25 US cities (2000-2005). Not all cities had data for all years. | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01  | Mortality   | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>Community level: region<br>(west vs. east), fraction of<br>PM <sub>2.5</sub> for components<br>(Al, As, Br, Cr, EC, Fe,<br>K, Mn, Sodium ion, Ni,<br>Nitrate, Ammonium ion,<br>Organic carbon, Pb, Si,<br>Sulfate, V, Zn)  | City-speicifc time-<br>series. Random<br>effects meta-<br>regression to<br>generate overall<br>estimate and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by season. | Season (higher in<br>Spring): total<br>Fraction PM <sub>2.5</sub> for<br>Al, As, sulfate, Si,<br>Ni (+) |
| Garrett and<br>Casimiro (2011) <sup>19</sup> | Lisbon, Portugal<br>(2004-2006)                                  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>02  | Mortality: total, CVD   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (all ages vs.<br>≥65yrs)   | Generalized<br>additive modeling.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                                  |
| Goldberg et al.<br>(2000) <sup>20</sup>      | Montreal, Canada<br>(1984-1993)                                  | Predicted<br>PM <sub>2.5</sub> based<br>on COH,<br>sulfate, and<br>visibility<br>data. Lag 0,<br>1, 02 | Mortality: total,<br>neoplasms, lung<br>cancer, CVD,<br>coronary artery<br>disease, other | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<65, ≥65yrs),<br>pre-existing conditions<br>(cancer, acute upper<br>respiratory disease,<br>chronic upper respiratory<br>disease, acute lower<br>respiratory disease,<br>airways disease, acute<br>coronary artery disease,<br>chronic coronary artery<br>disease, CHF,<br>hypertension,<br>cerebrovascular disease,<br>any coronary artery<br>disease, any CVD<br>disease, none) | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | Age (+): total<br>mortality for<br>persons with pre-<br>existing chronic<br>coronary artery<br>disease  |

| Study  | Location and<br>timeframe          | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                       | Health outcome   | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results                                      |
|--|------------------------------------|--|--|---|---|--|
| Goldberg et al.<br>(2006) <sup>21</sup>      | Montreal, Canada                   | PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> .<br>Lag 0, 1, 02 | Mortality with<br>underlying cause as<br>diabetes, for persons<br>≥65yrs       | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, season (warm:<br>AprSep., cool: Oct<br>Mar.), underlying cause<br>of death of diabetes<br>mellitus vs. classified as<br>diabetes 1 yr before death<br>(for death that may or<br>may not have been<br>attributed to diabetes),<br>co-morbidities (chronic<br>coronary artery disease,<br>atherosclerosis, CHF,<br>CVD, airways disease,<br>cancer | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.        | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Gouveia and<br>Fletcher (2000) <sup>22</sup> | Sao Paulo, Brazil<br>(1991-1993)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0, 1                            | Mortality  | Individual or daily<br>level: age (1 month-5yrs,<br>5-12, 12-40, 40-50, 50-<br>60, 60-65, 65-70, 70-75,<br>75-80, 80-85, ≥85yrs)<br>Community level: SES<br>based on residence (4<br>groups) for >65yrs   | Time series.<br>Interaction term for<br>effect modification.      | Age (+)  |
| Huang et al. (2012)                          | Xi'an, China (2004-<br>2008)       | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>6, 06  | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, coronary,<br>respiratory                             | Individual or daily<br>level: season (warm:<br>Nov. 15-Mar. 15, cool:<br>Mar. 16-Nov. 14), age (0-<br>44, 45-64, ≥65yrs, total<br>mortality), sex (total<br>mortality)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.        | Season (higher for<br>cool period): ≥65yrs                             |
| Ito and Thurston<br>(1996) <sup>24</sup>     | Cook County, IL,<br>US (1985-1990) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01                              | Mortality: total,<br>circulatory,<br>respiratory cancer, for<br>persons ≥15yrs | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> race (black, white),<br>sex, age (15-60, ≥60yrs,<br>all ages)   | Poisson regression.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |

| Study                                      | Location and timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure  | Health outcome                       | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results                                      |
|--|--|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Kan et al. (2008) <sup>25</sup>            | Shangai, China<br>(2001-2004)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag<br>01  | Mortality: total, CVD<br>respiratory | Individual or daily<br>level: age (5-44, 45-64,<br>≥65yrs, total mortality<br>only), sex (total mortality<br>only), education<br>attainment (illiterate or<br>primary school, middle<br>school or above), season<br>(warm: AprSep., cool:<br>OctMar.) | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Katsouyanni et al.<br>(1997) <sup>26</sup> | 5 European cities<br>(1975-1992). Not all<br>cities had data for<br>all years. | $PM_{10}$ based<br>on TSP for 3<br>cities, $PM_{13}$<br>for 2 cities,<br>$PM_7$ for 1<br>city. Lag 0, 1,<br>2, 3, 01, 02,<br>03 | Mortality                            | Individual or daily<br>level: Region (eastern vs.<br>western), season   | City-specific times<br>series.                             | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |

| Study                                       | Location and<br>timeframe  | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure  | Health outcome                        | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results  |
|---|--|---|---------------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Katsouyanni et al.<br>(2009) <sup>27</sup>  | 32 European cities<br>(1990-1997), 95 US<br>cities (1987-1996),<br>12 Canadian cities<br>(1981-1999). For<br>community level<br>modifiers, 21<br>European cities, 15<br>US cities.<br>Not all cities had<br>data for all years or<br>pollutants. | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1,<br>01 (age), Lag<br>01<br>(community<br>level<br>modifiers) | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory | Individual or daily<br>level: age ( $<74$ , $\ge75$ yrs)<br>Community level: NO <sub>2</sub> ,<br>SO <sub>2</sub> , NO <sub>2</sub> /PM <sub>10</sub> ,<br>exposure, population,<br>population density,<br>temperature, humidity,<br>crude mortality rate, age-<br>standardized mortality<br>rate, % cardiorespiratory<br>deaths, age (% $\ge75$ yrs),<br>region, unemployment<br>(21 European cities, 15<br>US cities), number of<br>monitors, monitor<br>density, education (%<br>with >12yrs), and others.<br>Not all cities had data on<br>all effect modifiers | City-specific time<br>series. Stratification<br>for effect<br>modification by age.<br>Meta-regression<br>models for effect<br>modification by<br>community level<br>variables. | NO <sub>2</sub> (+): Europe<br>Temperature (+)<br>Humidity (-):<br>Europe<br>Humidity (+): US<br>% of<br>cardiorespiratory<br>deaths (+): US<br>Crude mortality rate<br>(+): US<br>Unemployment (+)<br>Age (+) |
| Katsouyanni, et al.<br>(2001) <sup>28</sup> | 29 European cities<br>(1990-1997). Not all<br>cities had data for<br>all years.  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01   | Mortality                             | <b>Community level:</b> long-<br>term average of other<br>pollutants (e.g., NO <sub>2</sub> ),<br>temperature, and<br>humidity, age adjusted<br>mortality rate, age<br>adjusted lung cancer<br>mortality rate, region<br>(Central-Eastern,<br>Southern, North<br>Western), location<br>(latitude and longitude),<br>age (% >65yrs)  | City-specific time<br>series. Fixed-effects<br>or random effects<br>meta-regression to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.          | NO <sub>2</sub> (+)<br>PM <sub>10</sub> /NO <sub>2</sub> (-)<br>Humidity (-)<br>Temperature (+)<br>Age-standardized<br>annual mortality<br>rate (-)<br>Age (-)   |

| Study                                   | Location and<br>timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome   | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|---|---|--|--|---|---|--|
| Levy et al. (2000) <sup>29</sup>        | 29 estimates from<br>21 time series<br>studies (19/29<br>estimates from US).<br>Time frame varies<br>by original study. | $PM_{10}$ , some<br>estimated<br>from TSP as<br>$PM_{10}$ /TSP =<br>0.55 (lag<br>varies by<br>original<br>study) | Mortality  | Community level:<br>baseline mortality rate,<br>age (% ≥65yrs), poverty,<br>prevalence of gas stoves,<br>prevalence of central AC.<br>Most analyses for 19 US<br>risk estimates | Meta-regression<br>random effects<br>model to combine<br>risk estimates from<br>29 previously<br>conducted time<br>series studies and<br>estimate effect<br>modification.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
| Li et al. (2011) <sup>30</sup>          | Tianjin, China<br>(2077-2009)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory,<br>cardio-pulmonary,<br>stroke, ischemic heart<br>disease | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> temperature, age<br>(<65, ≥65yrs)   | Poisson regression.<br>Interaction spline<br>models, interaction<br>terms, and<br>stratification for<br>effect modification.  | Warm (+): CVD,<br>cardiopulmonary,<br>ischemic heart<br>disease. Stroke for<br>$\geq$ 65 yr).<br>Age (+): total<br>mortality on high<br>temperature days |
| Ma et al. (2011) <sup>31</sup>          | Shenyang, China<br>(8/06-12/08)   | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01  | Mortality: total,<br>respiratory, CVD  | Individual or daily<br>level: season (warm:<br>May-Oct., cool: Nov<br>Apr.), age (5-64, 65-74,<br>≥75yrs), sex  | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Warm (+): total<br>mortality.  |
| Martins et al. (2004)<br>32             | 6 regions in Sao<br>Paulo, Brazil (1997-<br>1999)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>moving<br>averages of<br>lag 2 to lag 7   | Mortality:<br>respiratory, for<br>persons ≥60yrs   | <b>Community level:</b><br>college education, age, %<br>of people living in slums,<br>income  | Time series.<br>Correlation of SES<br>indicators and PM <sub>10</sub><br>risk estimates.  | Education (-):<br>respiratory<br>Income (-):<br>respiratory  |
| Nawrot et al. (2007) $_{33}^{33}$       | Flanders, Belgium<br>(1997-2003)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5   | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory  | Individual or daily<br>level: season (warm:<br>AprSep., cool: Oct<br>Mar.)  | Time series.<br>Interaction terms<br>and stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Warm(+): total,<br>CVD   |
| Oliveira et al.<br>(2011) <sup>34</sup> | Rio de Janeiro<br>State, Brazil (1/02-<br>12/06)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>6, 7, 8, 9.   | Mortality: respiratory   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (all, ≥65years),<br>sex   | Poisson regression.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |

| Study                                   | Location and<br>timeframe  | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                        | Health outcome                   | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results   |
|---|--|---|----------------------------------|--|---|---|
| O'Neill et al. (2004)                   | Mexico City (1994-<br>1998)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>05       | Mortality                        | <b>Community level:</b><br>region (5 regions),<br>particle measurement<br>method   | Region-specific<br>Poisson regression.<br>Random effects<br>model to estimate<br>overall associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| O'Neill, et al.<br>(2008) <sup>36</sup> | Mexico City,<br>Mexico; Santiago,<br>Chile; Sao Paulo,<br>Brazil (1998-2002) | PM <sub>10</sub><br>Lag 0, 1,<br>distributed<br>lag 0-5 | Mortality, for persons<br>≥21yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: Education (none,<br>some primary, some<br>secondary, secondary or<br>more), age (>65yrs vs. all<br>adults), sex  | City-specific time<br>series. Stratification<br>for effect<br>modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| Ostro et al. (2008) <sup>37</sup>       | 6 California<br>counties, US (2000-<br>2003)                                 | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3                   | Mortality: CVD                   | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, race/ethnicity<br>(white, Hispanic, black),<br>education ( <high school,<br="">≥high school)</high>   | City-specific time-<br>series. Random<br>effects meta-<br>analysis to estimate<br>overall associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| Ou et al. (2008) <sup>38</sup>          | Hong Kong (1998)   | PM <sub>10.</sub> Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3                     | Mortality, for persons<br>≥30yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: housing type<br>(private, public<br>government housing for<br>low income),<br>employment (never<br>employed, white collar,<br>blue collar), education<br>(none, primary,<br>secondary) | Time series.<br>Interaction terms<br>and stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Employment (-): lower<br>associations for<br>white-collar group<br>than blue-collar or<br>never employed<br>groups<br>Housing (-): lower<br>associations for<br>private housing<br>Education: lower<br>associations for<br>primary education<br>than those with no<br>education |

| Study                                  | Location and<br>timeframe                        | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure              | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|--|--|---|---|--|---|--|
| Ou et al. (2012) <sup>39</sup>         | Hong Kong (mid-<br>Dec. 1997 – mid-<br>Jan.1999) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag<br>02.                 | Mortality, for persons<br>≥30yrs  | Individual or daily<br>level: dietary intake<br>10yrs before death<br>(≥1/week, seldom/never)<br>for fish, meat, vegetables,<br>fruits, soy, dairy.  | Case-crossover.<br>Linear odds ratio<br>model for effect<br>modification on<br>additive scale.  | Fruit consumption<br>(-)<br>Soy consumption (-)<br>Dairy consumption<br>(+)  |
| Peng et al.<br>(2005) <sup>40</sup>    | 100 US cities<br>(2000-2005)                     | PM <sub>10</sub>                              | Mortality   | Individual or daily<br>level: season (summer:<br>June-Aug., etc. or as non-<br>linear function)<br>Community level:<br>region (7 regions)  | Time series.<br>Stratification and<br>non-linear models<br>for effect<br>modification by<br>season. Bayesian<br>hierarchical<br>modeling to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification by<br>region. | Season (higher in<br>summer)<br>Geographical region<br>(higher in<br>California), but not<br>tested for<br>statistically<br>significance |
| Qian et al. (2010) <sup>41</sup>       | Wuhan, China<br>(7/00-6/04)                      | PM <sub>10</sub> .<br>Lag 0, 1, 01,<br>02, 04 | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, stroke, cardiac,<br>respiratory, cardio-<br>pulmonary, non-<br>cardio-pulmonary | Individual or daily<br>level: temperature ( $<5^{th}$ , 5-95 <sup>th</sup> , >95 <sup>th</sup> percentile),<br>temperature (normal,<br>extremely cold,<br>extremely hot), sex, age<br>( $<65$ , $\geq 65$ yrs)         | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by sex and age.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>by lag 01<br>temperature.   | Temperature (+):<br>higher risk<br>estimates at<br>extremely hot days<br>than normal days,<br>total, CVD,<br>cardiopulmonary             |
| Rainham et al.<br>(2005) <sup>42</sup> | Toronto, Canada<br>(1981-1999)                   | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2            | Mortality: total,<br>cardio-respiratory,<br>non-cardio-<br>respiratory                                    | Individual or daily<br>level: weather (spatial<br>synoptic classification<br>system with 7 levels: one<br>of 6 categories or a<br>transition between<br>categories), season<br>(winter: DecFeb.,<br>summer: June-Aug.) | Time-series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |

| Study  | Location and<br>timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results   |
|--|---|------------------------------------|---|---|--|---|
| Revich and<br>Shaposhnikov<br>(2010) <sup>43</sup> | Moscow, Russia<br>(2003-2005)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 01 | Mortality: total,<br>ischemic heart<br>disease and angina<br>pectoris, cerebro-<br>vascular | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> age (all ages vs.<br>≥75yrs), O <sub>3</sub> levels   | Time-series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by age. Analysis of<br>$PM_{10}$ and mortality<br>without O <sub>3</sub><br>adjustment in subset<br>of data with >90 <sup>th</sup><br>percentile O <sub>3</sub> for in<br>effect modification<br>of $PM_{10}$ by O <sub>3</sub> . | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| Samoli et al. (2005)<br>44                         | 22 European cities<br>(1990-1997). Not all<br>cities had data for<br>all years. | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag<br>01       | Mortality: total,<br>respiratory  | <b>Community level:</b> air<br>pollution levels (e.g.,<br>NO <sub>2</sub> ), geographic region<br>(Southern, Western,<br>Eastern), climate, age-<br>standardized annual<br>mortality rate | City-specific time<br>series. Second stage<br>regression to<br>estimate overall<br>associationsand<br>investigate effect<br>modification.  | Different exposure-<br>response curve by<br>region ( <i>in general</i> ,<br>higher in Southern<br>region): total,<br>respiratory<br>Temperature (+):<br>total<br>Standardized<br>mortality rate (-):<br>total<br>NO <sub>2</sub> (+): total |

| Study                                    | Location and<br>timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome                        | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|--|---|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| Samoli et al.<br>(2008)<br><sup>45</sup> | 90 US cities<br>(1987-1996),<br>32 European cities<br>(1990-1997),<br>12 Canadian cities<br>(1987-1996).<br>Not all cities had<br>data for all years. | $PM_{10}$ on days<br>with<br><150µg/m <sup>3</sup> .<br>$PM_{10}$<br>estimated<br>from TSP for<br>10 European<br>cities. Lag 0,<br>1, 01, 02 | Mortality                             | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<75, ≥75yrs)<br>Community specific:<br>unemployment,<br>temperature, humidity,<br>monitor density in<br>relation to population<br>size, health status of<br>population (% of<br>cardiorespiratory deaths,<br>mortality rate,<br>standardized mortality<br>rate), region (Canada,<br>Europe, US)<br>Not all cities had data for<br>all effect modifiers. | City-specific time<br>series. Meta-<br>regression to<br>combine risk<br>estimates across<br>cities and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by age.<br>Not all cities<br>included in all<br>analyses. | Age (+)<br>Unemployment (+)<br>Temperature (+):<br>Europe only<br>Humidity (-):<br>Europe<br>Crude mortality rate<br>(+): US<br>% of<br>cardiorespiratory<br>deaths among ≥75<br>people (+) (US<br>only) |
| Samoli et al. (2011)<br>46               | Athens, Greece<br>(2001-2006)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1   | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> windblown desert<br>dust (yes, no), sex, age<br>(<75, ≥75yrs)  | Time-series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by sex and age.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>by desert dust.   | Desert dust (-):<br>total, CVD,<br>respiratory mortality<br>for ≥75yrs; total<br>mortality for <75yrs  |
| Schwartz et al.<br>(2000) <sup>47</sup>  | 10 US cities (1986-<br>1993)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Mortality.                            | <b>Community level:</b><br>unemployment, % in<br>poverty, education (%<br>with college degree), race<br>(% non-white), location<br>of death (in or out of<br>hospital)   | City-specific time<br>series. Second stage<br>meta-regression to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |

| Study                                      | Location and<br>timeframe                               | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|--|---|----------------------------------|---|--|---|--|
| Serinelli et al.<br>(2010) <sup>48</sup>   | 8 Italian cities<br>(1997–2004)                         | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag<br>01     | Mortality: out-of-<br>hospital for<br>ischaemic heart<br>disease, for persons<br>>35yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: age (35-64, 65-74,<br>75-84, ≥85yrs), sex,<br>season (cool: OctMar.,<br>warm: AprSep.),<br>comorbidities:<br>(hospitalization 29 days<br>to 2yrs earlier for<br>malignant neoplasm,<br>diabetes mellitus;<br>anaemias; hypertensive<br>diseases; previous AMI;<br>other ischaemic heart<br>diseases; cardiac<br>dysrhythmias; heart<br>failure; cerebrovascular<br>diseases; pneumonia;<br>chronic pulmonary<br>diseases of<br>arteries, arterioles, and<br>capillaries) | City specific case-<br>crossover. Meta-<br>regression random<br>effects model to<br>estimate overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by age.<br>Analysis for effect<br>modification other<br>than age for persons<br>>65yrs. | Income (-)<br>Previous<br>hospitalization for<br>cardiac<br>dysrhythmias (-) |
|  |   |                                  |   | Community level:<br>income ( $<20^{th}$ , $20^{th}$ -540 <sup>th</sup> , 51-80 <sup>th</sup> , >80 <sup>th</sup> percentile),<br>region (community)  |   |  |
| Siemiatycki et al.<br>(2003) <sup>49</sup> | US cities from the<br>ACS and Harvard 6<br>Cities Study | PM <sub>2.5</sub>                | Mortality: total,<br>cardio-pulmonary,<br>lung cancer                                   | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, occupational<br>"dirtiness score" (7 point<br>scale), smoking status<br>(ever, never), prevalence<br>of exposure to known<br>lung carcinogens (yes,<br>no), education ( <high<br>school, high school,<br/>&gt;high school, for ACS<br/>only)</high<br>  | Cox proportional<br>hazards model.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.       |

| Study                                     | Location and<br>timeframe        | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                 | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models   | Statistically significant results  |
|---|----------------------------------|--|---|---|--|--|
| Son et al. (2012) <sup>50</sup>           | Seoul, Korea (2000-<br>2007)     | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 01, 02        | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory, for<br>persons ≥35yrs                                      | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (35-64,<br>$65-74$ , $\geq 75$ yrs), education<br>( $\leq 12$ , $>12$ yrs, unknown),<br>marital status (never<br>married, married,<br>divorced, widowed,<br>unknown), employment<br>(professional, manual,<br>housewife/unemployed,<br>unknown). | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                                   |
| Stafoggia, et al.<br>(2008) <sup>51</sup> | 9 Italian cities<br>(1997-2004)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01                        | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory,<br>non-cardio-<br>respiratory, for<br>persons $\geq$ 35yrs | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> season, apparent<br>temperature (<50 <sup>th</sup> , 50-<br>75 <sup>th</sup> , >75 <sup>th</sup> percentile)  | City-specific case-<br>crossover. Random<br>effects meta-<br>analysis to estimate<br>overall associations.<br>Interaction terms<br>within each<br>temperature stratum<br>for effect<br>modification. | Apparent<br>temperature (+)<br>Season (higher in<br>summer): CVD,<br>non-<br>cardiorespiratory,<br>total |
| Tobias et al. (2011)<br><sup>52</sup>     | Madrid, Spain<br>(2003-2005)     | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4         | Mortality   | Individual or daily<br>level: Saharan dust days<br>(binary variable based<br>backwards trajectory<br>models, dust maps, and<br>satellite imagery)   | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                                   |
| Villeneuve et al.<br>(2003) <sup>53</sup> | Vancouver, Canada<br>(1986-1999) | PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> .<br>Lag 02 | Mortality: total,<br>respiratory, CVD for<br>persons ≥65yrs.                                      | <b>Community level:</b><br>income (3 categories)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                                   |

| Study                                   | Location and<br>timeframe       | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                        | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results                                      |
|---|---------------------------------|---|---|--|---|--|
| Wichmann et al.<br>(2000) <sup>54</sup> | Erfurt, Germany<br>(9/95-12/98) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>05       | Mortality   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<70, 70-79,<br>≥80yrs), season (4<br>seasons), prevalent<br>diseases (CVD or<br>respiratory, CVD but not<br>respiratory, respiratory,<br>other)   | Poisson regression.   | Season: higher in<br>winter than summer,<br>lag 0                      |
| Wilson et al. (2007)<br>55              | Phoenix, AZ, US<br>(1995-1997)  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> ,<br>PM <sub>10-2.5</sub> . Lag<br>05 | Mortality: CVD  | <b>Community level:</b> % in poverty, % with high school education, for 3 zip codes.   | Times series.<br>Comparison of risks<br>across 3 SES zones<br>for effect<br>modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Wong et al. (2008)<br>56                | Hong Kong, China<br>(1996-2002) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4                 | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory   | <b>Community level:</b> social<br>deprivation index for 209<br>town planning units<br>based on unemployment,<br>income, education, one-<br>person household, marital<br>status, subtenancy   | Time series. Case<br>only and<br>stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Wong et al. (2010)<br>57                | Hong Kong (1996-<br>2002)       | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 01,<br>04      | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory.<br>Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory,<br>ARD, ALRI, COPD,<br>asthma | Individual or daily<br>level: age (all ages vs.<br>≥65yrs, mortality,<br>hospital admissions for<br>CVD, respiratory,<br>COPD), age (all ages vs.<br>0-14yrs, hospital<br>admissions for ARD,<br>ALRI, asthma), influenza<br>based on virologic data<br>Community level: social<br>deprivation index (SDI)<br>(3 groups) (mortality<br>only) | Poisson regression.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>by influenza.<br>Stratification and<br>case-only model for<br>effect modification<br>by SDI.<br>Stratification for<br>other effect<br>modifiers. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |

| Study                                     | Location and<br>timeframe  | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure | Health outcome   | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results                                      |
|---|--|----------------------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Yang et al. (2012) 58                     | Guangzhou, China<br>(2007-2008)  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01    | Mortality  | Individual or daily<br>level: age (5-64, ≥65yrs),<br>sex, education (illiterate<br>or primary school, middle<br>school or above)                      | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Zauli et al. (2011) <sup>59</sup>         | 6 Italian cities<br>(8/02-12/06)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1         | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, respiratory,<br>persons ≥75yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: Saharan dust days<br>(binary variable based on<br>coarse particle count),<br>season (warm: May-Sep.,<br>cool: OctApril) | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by season.                       | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Zanobetti, et al.<br>(2000) <sup>60</sup> | 4 US cities<br>(Chicago, Detroit,<br>Minneapolis-St.<br>Paul, Pittsburgh)<br>(1986-1993) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01        | Mortality  | Individual or daily<br>level: race (white, black),<br>sex, education (<12,<br>$\geq$ 12yrs)   | City-specific time<br>series. Inverse<br>variance weighting<br>to estimate overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | Sex (higher in<br>women)   |
| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2009) <sup>61</sup>  | 112 US cities<br>(1999-2005)   | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01    | Mortality: total,<br>CVD, MI, stroke,<br>respiratory     | Individual or daily level<br>specific: season (4<br>seasons)<br>Community level:<br>region (6 groups)   | City-specific time<br>series. Random<br>effects meta<br>analysis to generate<br>overall estimates.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | Season (higher in spring)  |

| Study                                | Location and<br>timeframe   | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure   | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers   | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--|---|---|---|--|
| Zeka, et al.<br>(2005) <sup>62</sup> | 20 US cities<br>(1989-2000) | PM <sub>10</sub> Lag 0,<br>1, 2  | Mortality: total, heart<br>disease, ischaemic<br>heart disease, MI,<br>dysrhythmias, heart<br>failure, stroke,<br>respiratory disease,<br>pneumonia, COPD | Community level:<br>prevalence of central AC,<br>population<br>density, standardized<br>mortality rates,<br>proportion of elderly<br>(>65, >75, or >85yrs),<br>daily<br>minimum apparent<br>temperature (mean and<br>variance) in summer<br>(June-Aug.), daily<br>maximum apparent<br>temperature (mean and<br>variance) in winter (Dec<br>Feb.),% PM <sub>10</sub> from<br>traffic | City-specific Case-<br>crossover.<br>Maximum<br>likelihood meta-<br>regression to<br>estimate overall risk<br>and investigate<br>effect modification. | Population density<br>(+)<br>% PM <sub>10</sub> from traffic<br>(+)<br>Variance of summer<br>apparent<br>temperature (+)   |
| Zeka, et al.<br>(2006) <sup>63</sup> | 20 US cities<br>(1989-2000) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>01, 02, 03.<br>Different lags<br>by cause of<br>mortality | Mortality: all-cause,<br>heart disease, AMI,<br>respiratory, stroke   | Individual or daily<br>level: in- vs. out-of-<br>hospital death, sex,<br>diabetes, pneumonia,<br>season (Spring/Fall vs.<br>Winter/Summer), race<br>(white, black), age (<65,<br>65-75, >75yrs), education<br>(<8, 8-12yrs, >13yrs),<br>contributing cause of<br>death (pneumonia, heart<br>failure, stroke, diabetes),<br>menopause (post<br>menopause, pre-<br>menopause)         | Case-crossover for<br>first stage. Second<br>stage of random<br>effects meta<br>analysis.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.               | Age (+): total, heart<br>disease, stroke<br>Location of death<br>(out-of-hospital<br>higher than in<br>hospital): all-<br>cause, heart<br>disease, stroke<br>Season (higher in<br>Spring/Autumn):<br>respiratory |

## Web Table 2. Studies of effect modification for associations between particulate matter and hospital admissions or emergency from visits

*Note:* The results presented show (+) when a higher level of the effect modifier is associated with a higher health risk estimate and a (-) when a higher level of the effect modifier is associated with a lower health risk estimate. Only statistically significant associations are reported in the table. Reference numbers refer to the reference list for the Web Material, which differs from the reference list for the main text.

| Study                            | Location and<br>timeframe    | Exposure<br>and lag<br>structure                              | Health outcome  | Potential effect<br>modifiers  | Statistical models  | Statistically significant results  |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---|--|---|--|
| Bell et al. (2008) <sup>64</sup> | 202 US cities<br>(1999-2005) | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2                            | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory, for<br>persons >64yrs                       | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>(summer: June-<br>Aug., etc. or as non-<br>linear function)<br>Community level:<br>region (4 groups) | Time series.<br>Stratification and<br>non-linear models<br>for effect<br>modification by<br>season. Bayesian<br>hierarchical<br>modeling to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification by<br>region. | Season (higher in<br>winter)<br>Region (higher in<br>northeast than<br>southeast): CVD |
| Bell et al. (2009) <sup>6</sup>  | 168 US cities<br>(1999-2005) | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0<br>(CVD),<br>lag 2<br>(respiratory) | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory, for<br>persons >65yrs (PM <sub>2.5</sub> ). | <b>Community level:</b><br>Central AC, any AC<br>including window<br>units.  | City-specific time<br>series. Bayesian<br>hierarchical analysis<br>to estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.   | Central AC (-):<br>PM <sub>2.5</sub> and CVD<br>hospital admissions                    |

| Bell, et al.<br>(2009) <sup>5</sup>      | 106 US counties<br>(1999-2005)                         | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0   | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory  | <b>Community level:</b><br>long-term levels of<br>$PM_{2.5}$ chemical<br>components (Al, As,<br>Ca, Cl, Cu, EC, Fe,<br>K, Mg, Na+, NH4+,<br>Ni, Nitrate, OCM,<br>Pb, Si, Sulfate, Ti,<br>V, Zn), education<br>(% of those $\geq 25$ yrs<br>with high school<br>degree), median<br>household income,<br>race (% of self-<br>identifying as<br>Black/African-<br>American),<br>urbanicity (% of<br>living in urban<br>setting) population | City-specific times<br>series. Bayesian<br>hierarchical<br>modeling to<br>generate overall<br>estimates and for<br>effect modification. | Ni,V, EC (+): PM <sub>2.5</sub><br>risk estimates for<br>CVD and<br>respiratory<br>admission |
|--|--|---|---|---|---|--|
| Belleudi et al.<br>(2010) <sup>65</sup>  | Rome, Italy (2001-2005)                                | PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> .<br>Lag 0, 1, 2,<br>3, 4, 5, 6, 01,<br>02, 05, 06 | Emergency hospital<br>admissions: acute coronary<br>syndrome, heart failure,<br>lower respiratory tract<br>infection, COPD, for<br>persons >35yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: age (35-64,<br>65-74, >75yrs),<br>previous COPD<br>admissions, season<br>(Winter as Dec<br>March, summer as<br>June-Sep.,<br>Spring/Fall as April,<br>May, Oct., and<br>Nov.)   | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | General trends:<br>Age (+)<br>Season: winter (+)   |
| Bhaskaran et al.<br>(2011) <sup>66</sup> | 15 conurbations in<br>England and Wales<br>(2003-2006) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 1-<br>6, 7-12, 13-<br>18, 19-24,<br>25-72, 1-71<br>hrs           | Hospital admissions: MI   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<60, 60-<br>69, 70-79, >80yrs),<br>prior coronary heart<br>disease, smoking<br>status, season<br>(Summer as June-<br>Aug. vs. non-<br>summer)  | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                       |

| Biggeri et al. (2005)                  | 8 Italian cities<br>(1990-1999). Not all<br>cities had data for<br>all years. | PM <sub>10</sub> , based<br>on TSP for 2<br>cities. Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 01,<br>12, 03 | Hospital admissions:<br>cardiac, respiratory  | Individual or daily<br>level: age (0-64, 65-<br>74, >75yrs)<br>Community level:<br>age (% elderly),<br>PM <sub>10</sub> /NO <sub>2</sub> ratio, log<br>long-term PM <sub>10</sub> | City-specific time<br>series. Fixed effects,<br>random effects, and<br>Bayesian models to<br>generate overall<br>estimates.<br>Interaction terms in<br>city-specific model<br>to investigate effect<br>modification by age.<br>Bayesian random<br>effects model to<br>investigate effect<br>modification by<br>community-level<br>modifiers. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
|--|---|--|---|---|--|--|
| Buadong et al.<br>(2009) <sup>67</sup> | Bangkok, Thailand<br>(4/02-12/06)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 02, 03   | Hospital admissions: CVD  | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> age (<15, 15-<br>64, >65yrs)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Bunch et al. (2011)<br>68              | Wasatch Front, Utah<br>(1993-2008)  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>cumulative<br>lags up to 21<br>days                    | Hospital admissions: atrial fibrillation  | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (<55,<br>55-64, 65-74,<br>>75yrs), previous or<br>subsequent<br>admissions (MI,<br>asthma, COPD,<br>sleep apnea)                           | Case-crossover.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Burra et al. (2009) <sup>69</sup>      | Toronto, Canada<br>(1996-2001)  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>02, 03, 04, 05   | Ambulatory physician<br>consultations: asthma, for<br>children (1-17yrs) and<br>adults (18-64yrs) | Individual or daily<br>level: age, sex<br>Community level:<br>income (quintiles)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Income (-).  |

| Canova et al. (2012)<br>70 | London (5/08-7/10)               | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 03  | Hospital admissions:<br>COPD, asthma, for<br>persons >18yrs | Individual or daily<br>level: Serum<br>vitamin C, uric acid,<br>vitamin E, or<br>vitamin A (> or <<br>median); 10  | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.     | Vitamin C (-)<br>Smoking (+)   |
|----------------------------|----------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|
|                            |                                  |  |   | antioxidant genes;<br>age (18-34, 35-54,<br>>55yrs); previous<br>diagnosis of asthma,<br>COPD, or both;<br>smoking (current,<br>former/never)  |   |  |
| Cao et al. (2009) '1       | Shanghai, China<br>(2005-2007)   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 3<br>for outpatient<br>visits, L0 for<br>emergency<br>room visits | Hospital outpatient and<br>emergency room visits            | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>(warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: OctMar.)  | Poisson regression.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.               |
| Cheng et al. (2009)<br>72  | Kaohsiung, Taiwan<br>(1996-2006) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Hospital admissions:<br>pneumonia                           | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>diagnosis<br>(hypertension,<br>diabetes,<br>dysrhythmia,<br>COPD, upper<br>respiratory<br>infection, asthma,<br>cerebrovascular<br>disease, CHF,<br>ischemic heart<br>disease),<br>temperature (> or <<br>25°C) | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.     | Co-morbidities:<br>higher with upper<br>respiratory<br>infection.<br>Temperature (-) |

| Chiu and Yang<br>(2009) <sup>73</sup>   | Taipei, Taiwain<br>(2000-2006)                                     | PM <sub>10</sub> . L0                           | Emergency room visits:<br>arrhythmias   | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>diagnosis<br>(hypertension,<br>diabetes, CHF,<br>COPD, pneumonia,<br>upper respiratory<br>infection, asthma),<br>temperature (> or <<br>23°C) | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
|---|--|---|---|--|--|--|
| Colais et al. (2012)<br><sup>74</sup>   | 9 Italian cities<br>(2000-2005                                     | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>01                 | Hospital admissions: all<br>cardiac, acute coronary<br>syndrome, arrhythmias and<br>conduction disorders, heart<br>failure  | Individual or daily<br>level: age, sex,<br>hospital diagnosis in<br>previous 2yrs<br>(CVD, respiratory)  | City-specific case-<br>crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>in city-specific<br>models. Random<br>effects meta-<br>regression to<br>combine risk<br>estimates across<br>cities. | Sex (higher in men):<br>arrhythmias<br>Sex (higher in<br>women): heart<br>failure<br>Age (+): coronary<br>events |
| Dales et al. (2009)<br><sup>75</sup>    | 7 Chilean urban<br>centers in Santiago<br>Province (2001-<br>2005) | PM <sub>2.5</sub> , PM <sub>10</sub> .<br>Lag 0 | Hospital admissions:<br>headache (migraine; other<br>specified cause, cause not<br>specified)   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<64,<br>>64yrs), sex, season<br>(AprSep., Oct<br>Mar.)  | City-specific time-<br>series. Random-<br>effects model to<br>estimate overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
| Dominici et al.<br>(2006) <sup>76</sup> | 204 US cities<br>(1999-2002)                                       | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2              | Hospital admissions:<br>respiratory, CVD, cerebro-<br>vascular disease,<br>peripheral vascular<br>disease, ischemic heart<br>disease, heart rhythm<br>disturbances, heart failure,<br>COPD, respiratory tract<br>infection, for persons<br>>65yrs | <b>Community level:</b><br>region (East vs.<br>West, 7 regions)  | City-specific time<br>series. Bayesian<br>hierarchical<br>modeling to<br>estimate overall<br>associations.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Region: higher in<br>east than west for<br>heart rhythm<br>disturbances  |

| Fung et al. (2005) 77 | Windsor, Ontario, | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,  | Hospital admissions:        | Individual or daily         | Time series.         | No statistically     |
|-----------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
|                       | Canada (4//95-    | 01, 02                     | cardiac                     | <b>level:</b> age (<65,     | Stratification for   | significant evidence |
|                       | 12/00)            |                            |                             | >65yrs)                     | effect modification. | of effect            |
|                       | ,                 |                            |                             |                             |                      | modification.        |
| Haley et al. (2009)   | New York, NY, US  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0- | Hospital admissions: heart  | Individual or daily         | Area-specific case-  | Age (+)              |
| 78                    | (2001-2005)       | 2                          | failure, for persons >35yrs | level: age (35-64,          | crossover. Inverse   |                      |
|                       | ````              |                            |                             | 65-74, 65-84,               | variance weighting   |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | >85yrs), co-                | to generate overall  |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | morbidities                 | estimates.           |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | (atherosclerosis,           |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | previous heart              |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | failure admissions.         |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | ischemic heart              |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | disease, conduction         |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | disorder, diabetes,         |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | COPD), season               |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | (warm, cool), year          |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | (,, ,, ,                    |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | Community level:            |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | SES (% in poverty           |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | as 0-7, 7-20, 20-           |                      |                      |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | 100%)                       |                      |                      |
| Janssen, et al        | 14 US counties    | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01  | Hospital admissions:        | Community level:            | City-specific time   | AC (-): for CVD,     |
| (2002) <sup>79</sup>  | (1985-1994)       | (CVD), lag                 | COPD, CVD, pneumonia,       | central AC                  | series.              | for COPD for cities  |
|                       |                   | 12 (COPD                   | for persons >65yrs          | prevalence, long-           | Meta-regression to   | with non-winter      |
|                       |                   | and                        |                             | term temperature,           | combine risk         | PM10 peaks           |
|                       |                   | pneumonia)                 |                             | PM10 source                 | estimates.           | PM10 from            |
|                       |                   | 1 ,                        |                             | (highway vehicles,          |                      | highway vehicles,    |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | highway diesels,            |                      | highway diesels, oil |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | coal combustion, oil        |                      | combustion, metal    |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | combustion, wood            |                      | processing (+): for  |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | burning, metal              |                      | CVD                  |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | processing, fugitive        |                      | PM10 from fugitive   |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | dust), population           |                      | dust (+): for CVD    |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | density, vehicle            |                      | Population           |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | miles                       |                      | density(+): for CVD  |
|                       |                   |                            |                             | travelled/mile <sup>2</sup> |                      | VMT/mile2 (+): for   |
|                       |                   |                            |                             |                             |                      | CVD                  |

| Kim et al. (2007) <sup>80</sup>     | Seoul, Korea (2002)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 02            | Emergency out-patient<br>hospital visits: asthma | Individual or daily<br>level: Korean<br>National Health<br>Insurance premium<br>as SES indicator<br>(quintiles).<br>Community level:<br>Korean National<br>Health Insurance<br>premium for 5<br>regions | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms<br>and stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
|-------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|--|
| Lanki et al (2006) <sup>81</sup>    | 3 European cities:<br>Helsinki (1993-<br>1999), Rome (1998-<br>2000), Stockholm<br>(1994-1999) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3 | AMI hospital discharge for<br>persons >35yrs     | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<75,<br>>75), season (Apr<br>Sep., OctMar.),<br>death within 28<br>days after<br>hospitalization (yes,<br>no)  | City-specific<br>general additive<br>model. Pooled<br>overall risk<br>weighted by inverse<br>of squared standard<br>errors of risk<br>estimates.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Lee et al. (2008) <sup>82</sup>     | Taipei ,Taiwan<br>(warm days in<br>1996-2005)  | PM <sub>10</sub> . L02               | Hospital admissions: CHF                         | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>diagnosis<br>(hypertension,<br>diabetes,<br>dysrhythmia,<br>COPD)  | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Mann et al. (2002)<br><sup>83</sup> | South Coast Air<br>Basin of California,<br>US (AprOct. for<br>1988-1995)                       | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2    | Hospital admissions:<br>ischemic heart disease   | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>diagnosis<br>(arrhythmia, CHF)   | Poisson regression.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |

| Medina-Ramon et al. (2006) <sup>84</sup> | 36 US cities<br>(1986-1999)                     | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1    | Hospital admissions:<br>COPD, pneumonia, for<br>persons >65yrs          | Community level:<br>season (warm,<br>cool), mean<br>temperature,<br>variance of<br>temperature, %<br>>65yrs in poverty,<br>prevalence of<br>central AC, annual   | City-specific case-<br>crossover. Meta-<br>regression using<br>restricted maximum<br>likelihood random<br>effects models to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect | Warm (+): COPD<br>% persons >65 in<br>poverty (-):<br>pneumonia<br>Emphysema<br>mortality rate for<br>persons >65 (-):<br>COPD<br>Mean temperature (- |
|--|---|-----------------------------------|---|--|---|---|
|  |   |                                   |   | emphysema for<br>persons >65yrs (as<br>indication of<br>smoking), % PM10<br>from traffic.  | Modifiers other than<br>season examined for<br>warm season only.  | Central AC (-):<br>pneumonia  |
| Middleton et al.<br>(2008) <sup>85</sup> | Nicosia, Cyprus<br>(1995-2004)                  | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>02   | Hospital admissions: total,<br>CVD, respiratory, cardio-<br>respiratory | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (<15,<br>$\geq$ 15yrs, total,<br>respiratory), dust<br>storm days (binary<br>indicator based on<br>PM <sub>10</sub> levels and<br>trends,<br>meteorological data,<br>backwards<br>trajectory models),<br>season (warm vs.<br>cold months, total,<br>CVD, respiratory) | Poisson regression.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by sex and age.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>by season and<br>temperature.                      | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| Namdeo et al (2011)<br>86                | Leeds metropolitan<br>area, UK (4/02-<br>12/05) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2 | Hospital admissions:<br>respiratory                                     | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> age (<60, 60-<br>69, 70-74, 75-79,<br>>80yrs)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |

| Nuvolone et al.<br>(2011) <sup>87</sup> | Tuscany, Italy<br>(2000-2005)          | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>02, 05, 35 | Hospital admissions: AMI  | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (<75,<br>>75yrs), season<br>(warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: OctMar.),<br>secondary diagnosis<br>or hospitalization<br>within previous 3yrs<br>(hypertension,<br>COPD, diabetes,<br>cardiac arrhythmia,<br>heart failure, | Region-specific<br>case-crossover (5<br>regions). Interaction<br>terms for effect<br>modification by co-<br>morbidities.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by age, sex, season.<br>Random effects<br>meta-analysis to<br>estimate overall | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
|---|--|---|---|--|---|--|
|   |  |   |   | cardiac disease)   | associations.   |  |
| Oftedal et al. (2003)<br>88             | Drammen, Norway<br>(1994-2000)         | PM <sub>10</sub>  | Hospital admission:<br>respiratory  | Individual or daily<br>level: time (1994-<br>1997, 1998-2000)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Oudin et al. (2010)<br>89               | Scania, Sweden<br>(2001-2005)          | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2                         | Hospital admissions:<br>ischemic stroke,<br>hemorrhagic stroke  | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (< or<br>> 78yrs), season<br>(warm: May-Sep.,<br>cold: OctApr),<br>smoking status (yes,<br>no, unknown), city<br>resident (yes, no)   | Time series and<br>case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Peel et al. (2007) <sup>90</sup>        | Atlanta, GA, US<br>(1993-2000)         | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 02                                 | Emergency department<br>visits: ischemic heart<br>disease, dysrhythmia,<br>peripheral and cerebro-<br>vascular disease, CHF | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>diagnosis<br>(hypertension,<br>diabetes, COPD,<br>dysrhythmia)  | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Hypertension (+):<br>CHF<br>CHF (-): ischemic<br>heart disease         |
| Qorbani et al.<br>(2012) <sup>91</sup>  | Tehran, Iran (Apr.<br>4-Sep. 10, 2007) | $PM_{10}$ . Lag 0<br>(24hrs before<br>onset)              | Emergency hospital<br>admissions: first episode<br>of acute coronary<br>syndrome (n=250)                                    | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<60,<br>>60), sex, diabetes,<br>hypertension,<br>smoking (never,<br>current, former)  | Case crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |

| Ren et al.<br>(2006) <sup>92</sup>        | Brisbane, Australia<br>(1996-2001)             | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2  | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory.<br>Emergency hospital visits:<br>CVD, respiratory.<br>Mortality: total, CVD   | Individual or daily<br>level: maximum<br>temperature.   | Time-series.<br>Bivariate response<br>surface model,<br>nonstratifica-<br>tion parametric<br>model, and<br>stratification<br>parametric model<br>for effect<br>modification. | Temperature (+):<br>respiratory hospital<br>admissions, CVD<br>emergency hospital<br>visits, respiratory<br>emergency, total<br>mortality, CVD<br>mortality |
|---|--|--|---|---|--|---|
| Silverman and Ito<br>(2010) <sup>93</sup> | New York, NY, US<br>(AprAug. for<br>1999-2006) | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01  | Urgent or emergency<br>asthma hospital<br>admissions: ICU, non-ICU  | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level</b> : age (<6, 6-18,<br>19-49, >50yrs)   | Time series. □2 test<br>of heterogeneity on<br>pollution risks<br>across age groups.   | Age with highest<br>risk estimate in<br>school-age children<br>(6-18yrs), then<br>generally decreasing<br>with age.   |
| Sousa et al. (2012)<br>94                 | Rio de Janeiro,<br>Brazil (9/00-12/05)         | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5,<br>6, 7  | Emergency hospital<br>admissions: respiratory   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (<1, 1-5,<br>>65yrs)  | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.  |
| Stieb et al (2000) <sup>95</sup>          | Saint John, Canada<br>(1992-1996)              | PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> .<br>Single day<br>and multiple-<br>day lags up<br>to 10 days<br>previous | Emergency department<br>visits: cardiac (MI/angina,<br>CHF,<br>dysrhythmia/conduction<br>disturbance, total cardiac),<br>respiratory (asthma,<br>COPD, respiratory<br>infection, total respiratory) | Individual or daily<br>level: season (all<br>year vs. May-Sep.),<br>presentation of<br>complaint for<br>asthma (yes, no),<br>visit resulted in<br>hospital admission<br>(yes, no), smoking<br>status (yes, no),<br>smoker in<br>household (yes, no),<br>time outdoors in<br>previous week (<2,<br>2-4, >4 hrs), asthma<br>status (mild,<br>moderate, severe),<br>asthma medication<br>use for asthmatics<br>(yes, no) | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.   | Presented complaint<br>of asthma (+)  |

| Tramuto et al.<br>(2011) <sup>96</sup>   | Palermo, Italy<br>(2004-2007)              | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 2, 3, 4, 5 | Emergency room<br>admissions: respiratory, for<br>persons >16yrs                                 | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>(warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: OctMar.),<br>sex, age (16-44, 45-<br>54, 55-64, 65-74,<br>75-84, >85yrs)   | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.    | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|
| Tsai et al. (2012) <sup>97</sup>         | Taipei, Taiwan<br>(1999-2009)              | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 02                  | Hospital admissions: MI  | Individual or daily<br>level: secondary<br>CVD diagnosis<br>(hypertension,<br>diabetes, CHF,<br>arrhythmias),<br>weather (warm vs.<br>cool days)  | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.    | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Villeneuve et al. (2012) <sup>98</sup>   | Edmonton, Canada<br>(2003-2009)            | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag 0,<br>1, 02        | Hospital visits: stroke,<br>ischemic stroke,<br>hemorrhagic stroke,<br>transient ischemic attack | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>(warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: OctMar.)   | Case-crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.    | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification. |
| Wellenius et al.<br>(2005) <sup>99</sup> | Allegheny<br>County, PA, US<br>(1987–1999) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0                   | Hospital admission: CHF,<br>for persons >65yrs   | Individual or daily<br>level: age (65-79,<br>>80yrs), sex,<br>secondary diagnoses<br>of atrial fibrillation<br>other cardiac<br>arrhythmias, COPD,<br>essential<br>hypertension, type 2<br>diabetes, AMI<br>within the past 30<br>days,<br>old MI, angina<br>pectoris, other<br>ischemic heart<br>disease, and acute<br>respiratory<br>infections | Case-crossover.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification. | Recent MI (+)  |

| Wellenius et al<br>(2006) <sup>100</sup> | 7 US cities (1986–<br>1999)                      | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0  | Hospital admission: CHF,<br>for persons >65yrs  | Individual or daily<br>level: age (65-79,<br>>80yrs), sex, race<br>(white, other),<br>secondary diagnoses<br>(type 2 diabetes<br>mellitus, AMI    | City-specific case-<br>crossover. Random<br>effects to generate<br>overall estimates.   | Hypertension (-)  |
|--|--|---------------------------|---|---|---|---|
|  |  |                           |   | within the past 30<br>days, acute<br>respiratory<br>infection, COPD,<br>cardiac arrhythmias,<br>essential<br>hypertension)                        |   |   |
| Wong et al. (2002)                       | London (1992-<br>1994), Hong Kong<br>(1995-1997) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01 | Emergency hospital<br>admissions: asthma (15-<br>64yrs), respiratory<br>(>65yrs), cardiac (all<br>ages), ischemic heart<br>disease (all ages) | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>(warm: AprSep.,<br>cool: OctMar.)   | City-specific time<br>series. Interaction<br>terms for effect<br>modification.  | Season:<br>Higher in cool<br>period: cardiac<br>Higher in warm<br>period: respiratory<br>for London |
| Wong et al. (2009)                       | Hong Kong, (1996–<br>2002)                       | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01 | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, respiratory, acute<br>respiratory disease, COPD.<br>Mortality: COPD, CVD,<br>respiratory                         | Individual or daily<br>level: sex<br>Community level:<br>influenza intensity<br>based on<br>proportions of<br>specimens positive<br>for influenza | Time series.<br>Interaction terms for<br>effect modification<br>for influenza<br>intensity.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification<br>by sex. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.                              |

| Zanobetti, et al.<br>(2000) <sup>103</sup> | Chicago, IL, US<br>(1985-1994)                                   | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01 | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, COPD, pneumonia                  | Individual or daily<br>level: age (≤75 vs.<br>>75), sex, race<br>(white, other),<br>previous admission<br>or secondary<br>diagnosis (COPD,<br>asthma, acute<br>bronchitis, acute<br>respiratory illness,<br>pneumonia, MI,<br>CHF, conduction<br>disorders,<br>dyshrethmias) | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.  | Acute respiratory<br>illness (+): CVD<br>Conduction<br>disorders (+): CVD,<br>pneumonia<br>Dyshrethmias (+):<br>pneumonia<br>Previous CVD<br>admissions (+):<br>COPD<br>Heart failure (+):<br>COPD |
|--|--|---------------------------|---|--|---|--|
| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2000) <sup>104</sup>  | 10 US cities (1986-<br>1994)                                     | PM <sub>10</sub>          | Hospital admissions:<br>pneumonia, COPD for<br>persons >65yrs | <b>Community level:</b><br>race (white, other),<br>% in poverty,<br>temperature,<br>humidity   | City-specific time-<br>series. Inverse-<br>variance weighted<br>meta-regression to<br>estimate overall<br>associations and<br>investigate effect<br>modification.   | Humidity (+):<br>COPD  |
| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2001) <sup>105</sup>  | Cook County, IL,<br>US (1988-1994)                               | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01 | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, pneumonia, COPD                  | <b>Individual or daily</b><br><b>level:</b> diabetes, age<br>(<75, >75yrs)   | Time series.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification   | Diabetes (+): CVD  |
| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2002) <sup>106</sup>  | 3 US cities<br>(Chicago, Detroit,<br>Pittsburgh) (1988-<br>1994) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 01 | Hospital admissions:<br>CVD, for persons >65yrs               | Individual or daily<br>level: age (75-74,<br>>75yrs), secondary<br>diagnosis of<br>diabetes  | City-specific time<br>series. Stratification<br>by age and diabetes<br>status for effect<br>modification in city-<br>specific models.<br>Second stage meta-<br>regression with<br>interaction terms for<br>effect modification. | Diabetes (+):<br>Chicago or overall<br>risk across 4 cities<br>Age (+): overall risk<br>for persons without<br>diabetes.   |

| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2005) <sup>107</sup> | 21 US cities (1985–<br>1999) | PM <sub>10</sub> . Lag 0      | Hospital admissions: MI,<br>for persons >65yrs                                      | Individual or daily<br>level: sex, age (<<br>75, >75yrs),<br>previous admission<br>(atrial fibrillation,<br>COPD, diabetes,<br>CHF), secondary<br>diagnosis of<br>pneumonia  | City-specific case-<br>crossover.<br>Stratification for<br>effect modification.<br>Meta-regression to<br>estimate overall<br>sasociations. | No statistically<br>significant evidence<br>of effect<br>modification.   |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|--|--|--|
| Zanobetti et al.<br>(2009) <sup>108</sup> | 26 US cities<br>(2000-2003)  | PM <sub>2.5</sub> . Lag<br>01 | Emergency hospital<br>admissions: CVD, MI,<br>CHF, respiratory disease,<br>diabetes | Individual or daily<br>level: season<br>Community level:<br>income, poverty,<br>education ( <high<br>school, &gt;high<br/>school), poverty (%<br/>&gt;65yrs in poverty),<br/>prevalence of<br/>central AC, fraction<br/>of PM2.5 that is:<br/>As, Al, Br, Cr, Fe,<br/>Pb, Mn, Ni, K, Si,<br/>V, Zn, nitrate,<br/>sulfate, ammonium,<br/>sodium ion, EC,<br/>organic carbon</high<br> | City-specific time-<br>series. Random<br>effects meta-<br>analysis to estimate<br>overall associations.                                    | Season: higher in<br>spring than summer<br>for CVD, higher in<br>spring than summer<br>or autumn for CHF.<br>Br (+): CVD<br>V (+): CVD<br>Al (+): CVD, CHF<br>Ni (+): CVD, CHF<br>Ni (+): CVD, MI,<br>CHF, respiratory<br>Organic carbon (+):<br>MI, diabetes<br>As (+): MI<br>Cr (+): MI<br>Na+ (+): CVD, MI,<br>respiratory<br>Mn (+): MI<br>K(+): MI<br>EC (+): diabetes<br>As (+): diabetes<br>sulfate (+): diabetes |

## Web Figure 1. Funnel plot of effect modification by sex

Note: Blue lines and points reflect results for men; pink lines and points reflect results for women. Open circles reflect observed estimates from the studies; closed circles reflect "filled" studies from the "trim and fill" method. Solid blue and pink vertical lines represent the overall risk estimates for men and women, respectively; dashed vertical lines represent the overall risk estimates adjusted for publication bias. The gray vertical line represents the null (i.e., no association).



## Web Figure 2. Funnel plot of effect modification by age

Note: Black lines and points reflect results for older populations; green lines and points reflect results for younger populations. Open circles reflect observed estimates from the studies; closed circles reflect "filled" studies from the "trim and fill" method. Solid black and green vertical lines represent the overall risk estimates for older and younger populations, respectively; dashed vertical lines represent the overall risk estimates adjusted for publication bias. The gray vertical line represents the null (i.e., no association).



### References

- 1. Aga, E., et al., Short-term effects of ambient particles on mortality in the elderly: results from 28 cities in the APHEA2 project. *Eur Respir J Suppl*, 2003. 40:28s-33s.
- 2. Analitis, A., et al., Short-term effects of ambient particles on cardiovascular and respiratory mortality. *Epidemiology*, 2006. 17(2):230-3.
- 3. Balakrishnan, K., et al., Short-term effects of air pollution on mortality: results from a time-series analysis in Chennai, India. *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2011(157):7-44.
- 4. Bateson, T.F. J. Schwartz, Who is sensitive to the effects of particulate air pollution on mortality? A casecrossover analysis of effect modifiers. *Epidemiology*, 2004. 15(2):143-9.
- 5. Bell, M.L., et al., Hospital admissions and chemical composition of fine particle air pollution. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*, 2009. 179(12):1115-20.
- 6. Bell, M.L., et al., Adverse health effects of particulate air pollution: modification by air conditioning. *Epidemiology*, 2009. 20(5):682-6.
- 7. Biggeri, A., et al., Meta-analysis of the Italian studies of short-term effects of air pollution (MISA), 1990-1999. *Int J Occup Environ Health*, 2005. 11(1):107-22.
- 8. Cakmak, S., et al., The risk of dying on days of higher air pollution among the socially disadvantaged elderly. *Environ Res*, 2011. 111(3):388-93.
- 9. Chen, R., et al., Ambient air pollution and daily mortality in Anshan, China: a time-stratified case-crossover analysis. *Sci Total Environ*, 2010. 408(24):6086-91.
- 10. De Leon, S.F., G.D. Thurston, K. Ito, Contribution of respiratory disease to nonrespiratory mortality associations with air pollution. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*, 2003. 167(8):1117-23.
- 11. Diaz, J., A. Tobias, C. Linares, Saharan dust and association between particulate matter and case-specific mortality: a case-crossover analysis in Madrid (Spain). *Environ Health*, 2012. 11:11.
- 12. Dominici, F., et al., Does the effect of PM10 on mortality depend on PM nickel and vanadium content? A reanalysis of the NMMAPS data. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2007. 115(12):1701-3.
- 13. Faustini, A., et al., The relationship between ambient particulate matter and respiratory mortality: a multicity study in Italy. *Eur Respir J*, 2011. 38(3):538-47.
- 14. Forastiere, F., et al., Particulate matter and daily mortality: a case-crossover analysis of individual effect modifiers. *Epidemiology*, 2008. 19(4):571-80.
- 15. Forastiere, F., et al., A case-crossover analysis of out-of-hospital coronary deaths and air pollution in Rome, Italy. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*, 2005. 172(12):1549-55.
- 16. Forastiere, F., et al., Socioeconomic status, particulate air pollution, and daily mortality: differential exposure or differential susceptibility. *Am J Ind Med*, 2007. 50(3):208-16.
- 17. Franklin, M., A. Zeka, J. Schwartz, Association between PM2.5 and all-cause and specific-cause mortality in 27 US communities. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol*, 2007. 17(3):279-87.
- 18. Franklin, M., P. Koutrakis, P. Schwartz, The role of particle composition on the association between PM2.5 and mortality. *Epidemiology*, 2008. 19(5):680-9.
- 19. Garrett, P. E. Casimiro, Short-term effect of fine particulate matter (PM(2).(5)) and ozone on daily mortality in Lisbon, Portugal. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int*, 2011. 18(9):1585-92.
- 20. Goldberg, M.S., et al., Identifying subgroups of the general population that may be susceptible to short-term increases in particulate air pollution: a time-series study in Montreal, Quebec. *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2000(97):7-113; discussion 115-20.
- 21. Goldberg, M.S., et al., Associations between ambient air pollution and daily mortality among persons with diabetes and cardiovascular disease. *Environ Res*, 2006. 100(2):255-67.
- 22. Gouveia, N. T. Fletcher, Time series analysis of air pollution and mortality: effects by cause, age and socioeconomic status. *J Epidemiol Community Health*, 2000. 54(10):750-5.
- 23. Huang, W., et al., Seasonal variation of chemical species associated with short-term mortality effects of PM(2.5) in Xi'an, a Central City in China. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2012. 175(6):556-66.
- 24. Ito, K. G.D. Thurston, Daily PM10/mortality associations: an investigations of at-risk subpopulations. *J Expo Anal Environ Epidemiol*, 1996. 6(1):79-95.
- 25. Kan, H., et al., Season, sex, age, and education as modifiers of the effects of outdoor air pollution on daily mortality in Shanghai, China: The Public Health and Air Pollution in Asia (PAPA) Study. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2008. 116(9):1183-8.

- 26. Katsouyanni, K., et al., Short-term effects of ambient sulphur dioxide and particulate matter on mortality in 12 European cities: results from time series data from the APHEA project. Air Pollution and Health: a European Approach. *BMJ*, 1997. 314(7095):1658-63.
- 27. Katsouyanni, K., et al., Air pollution and health: a European and North American approach (APHENA). *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2009(142):5-90.
- 28. Katsouyanni, K., et al., Confounding and effect modification in the short-term effects of ambient particles on total mortality: results from 29 European cities within the APHEA2 project. *Epidemiology*, 2001. 12(5):521-31.
- 29. Levy, J.I., J.K. Hammitt, J.D. Spengler, Estimating the mortality impacts of particulate matter: what can be learned from between-study variability? *Environ Health Perspect*, 2000. 108(2):109-17.
- 30. Li, G., et al., Does temperature enhance acute mortality effects of ambient particle pollution in Tianjin City, China. *Sci Total Environ*, 2011. 409(10):1811-7.
- 31. Ma, Y., et al., Fine particulate air pollution and daily mortality in Shenyang, China. *Sci Total Environ*, 2011. 409(13):2473-7.
- 32. Martins, M.C., et al., Influence of socioeconomic conditions on air pollution adverse health effects in elderly people: an analysis of six regions in Sao Paulo, Brazil. *J Epidemiol Community Health*, 2004. 58(1):41-6.
- 33. Nawrot, T.S., et al., Stronger associations between daily mortality and fine particulate air pollution in summer than in winter: evidence from a heavily polluted region in western Europe. *J Epidemiol Community Health*, 2007. 61(2):146-9.
- 34. Oliveira, M.S., et al., Differential susceptibility according to gender in the association between air pollution and mortality from respiratory diseases. *Cad Saude Publica*, 2011. 27(9):1827-36.
- 35. O'Neill, M.S., et al., Do associations between airborne particles and daily mortality in Mexico City differ by measurement method, region, or modeling strategy? *J Expo Anal Environ Epidemiol*, 2004. 14(6):429-39.
- 36. O'Neill, M.S., et al., Air pollution and mortality in Latin America: the role of education. *Epidemiology*, 2008. 19(6):810-9.
- 37. Ostro, B.D., et al., The impact of components of fine particulate matter on cardiovascular mortality in susceptible subpopulations. *Occup Environ Med*, 2008. 65(11):750-6.
- 38. Ou, C.Q., et al., Socioeconomic disparities in air pollution-associated mortality. *Environ Res*, 2008. 107(2):237-44.
- 39. Ou, C.Q., et al., Dietary habits and the short-term effects of air pollution on mortality in the Chinese population in Hong Kong. *J Epidemiol Community Health*, 2012. 66(3):254-8.
- 40. Peng, R.D., et al., Seasonal analyses of air pollution and mortality in 100 US cities. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2005. 161(6):585-94.
- 41. Qian, Z., et al., Part 2. Association of daily mortality with ambient air pollution, and effect modification by extremely high temperature in Wuhan, China. *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2010(154):91-217.
- 42. Rainham, D.G., et al., Synoptic weather patterns and modification of the association between air pollution and human mortality. *Int J Environ Health Res*, 2005. 15(5):347-60.
- 43. Revich, B. D. Shaposhnikov, The effects of particulate and ozone pollution on mortality in Moscow, Russia. *Air Qual Atmos Health*, 2010. 3(2):117-123.
- 44. Samoli, E., et al., Estimating the exposure-response relationships between particulate matter and mortality within the APHEA multicity project. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2005. 113(1):88-95.
- 45. Samoli, E., et al., Acute effects of ambient particulate matter on mortality in Europe and North America: results from the APHENA study. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2008. 116(11):1480-6.
- 46. Samoli, E., et al., Does the presence of desert dust modify the effect of PM10 on mortality in Athens, Greece? *Sci Total Environ*, 2011. 409(11):2049-54.
- 47. Schwartz, J., Harvesting and long term exposure effects in the relation between air pollution and mortality. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2000. 151(5):440-8.
- 48. Serinelli, M., et al., Particulate matter and out-of-hospital coronary deaths in eight Italian cities. *Occup Environ Med*, 2010. 67(5):301-6.
- 49. Siemiatycki, J., et al., Controlling for potential confounding by occupational exposures. *J Toxicol Environ Health A*, 2003. 66(16-19):1591-603.
- 50. Son, J.Y., et al., Susceptibility to air pollution effects on mortality in Seoul, Korea: a case-crossover analysis of individual-level effect modifiers. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol*, 2012. 22(3):227-34.

- 51. Stafoggia, M., et al., Does Temperature Modify the Association between Air Pollution and Mortality? A Multicity Case-Crossover Analysis in Italy. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2008.
- 52. Tobias, A., et al., Short-term effects of particulate matter on total mortality during Saharan dust outbreaks: a case-crossover analysis in Madrid (Spain). *Sci Total Environ*, 2011. 412-413:386-9.
- 53. Villeneuve, P.J., et al., A time-series study of air pollution, socioeconomic status, and mortality in Vancouver, Canada. *J Expo Anal Environ Epidemiol*, 2003. 13(6):427-35.
- 54. Wichmann, H.E., et al., Daily mortality and fine and ultrafine particles in Erfurt, Germany part I: role of particle number and particle mass. *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2000(98):5-86; discussion 87-94.
- 55. Wilson, W.E., T.F. Mar, J.Q. Koenig, Influence of exposure error and effect modification by socioeconomic status on the association of acute cardiovascular mortality with particulate matter in Phoenix. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol*, 2007. 17 Suppl 2:S11-9.
- 56. Wong, C.M., et al., The effects of air pollution on mortality in socially deprived urban areas in Hong Kong, China. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2008. 116(9):1189-94.
- 57. Wong, C.M., et al., Part 4. Interaction between air pollution and respiratory viruses: time-series study of daily mortality and hospital admissions in Hong Kong. *Res Rep Health Eff Inst*, 2010(154):283-362.
- 58. Yang, C., et al., A time-stratified case-crossover study of fine particulate matter air pollution and mortality in Guangzhou, China. *Int Arch Occup Environ Health*, 2012. 85(5):579-85.
- 59. Zauli Sajani, S., et al., Saharan dust and daily mortality in Emilia-Romagna (Italy). *Occup Environ Med*, 2011. 68(6):446-51.
- 60. Zanobetti, A. J. Schwartz, Race, gender, and social status as modifiers of the effects of PM10 on mortality. *J Occup Environ Med*, 2000. 42(5):469-74.
- 61. Zanobetti, A. J. Schwartz, The effect of fine and coarse particulate air pollution on mortality: a national analysis. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2009. 117(6):898-903.
- 62. Zeka, A., A. Zanobetti, J. Schwartz, Short term effects of particulate matter on cause specific mortality: effects of lags and modification by city characteristics. *Occup Environ Med*, 2005. 62(10):718-25.
- 63. Zeka, A., A. Zanobetti, J. Schwartz, Individual-level modifiers of the effects of particulate matter on daily mortality. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2006. 163(9):849-59.
- 64. Bell, M.L., et al., Seasonal and regional short-term effects of fine particles on hospital admissions in 202 US counties, 1999-2005. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2008. 168(11):1301-10.
- 65. Belleudi, V., et al., Impact of fine and ultrafine particles on emergency hospital admissions for cardiac and respiratory diseases. *Epidemiology*, 2010. 21(3):414-23.
- 66. Bhaskaran, K., et al., The effects of hourly differences in air pollution on the risk of myocardial infarction: case crossover analysis of the MINAP database. *BMJ*, 2011. 343:d5531.
- 67. Buadong, D., et al., Association between PM10 and O3 levels and hospital visits for cardiovascular diseases in Bangkok, Thailand. *J Epidemiol*, 2009. 19(4):182-8.
- 68. Bunch, T.J., et al., Atrial fibrillation hospitalization is not increased with short-term elevations in exposure to fine particulate air pollution. *Pacing Clin Electrophysiol*, 2011. 34(11):1475-9.
- 69. Burra, T.A., et al., Social disadvantage, air pollution, and asthma physician visits in Toronto, Canada. *Environ Res*, 2009. 109(5):567-74.
- 70. Canova, C., et al., PM10-induced Hospital Admissions for Asthma and Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: The Modifying Effect of Individual Characteristics. *Epidemiology*, 2012. 23(4):607-15.
- 71. Cao, J., et al., Association of ambient air pollution with hospital outpatient and emergency room visits in Shanghai, China. *Sci Total Environ*, 2009. 407(21):5531-6.
- 72. Cheng, M.F., et al., Air pollution and hospital admissions for pneumonia: are there potentially sensitive groups? *Inhal Toxicol*, 2009. 21(13):1092-8.
- 73. Chiu, H.F. C.Y. Yang, Air pollution and emergency room visits for arrhythmias: are there potentially sensitive groups? *J Toxicol Environ Health A*, 2009. 72(13):817-23.
- 74. Colais, P., et al., Particulate air pollution and hospital admissions for cardiac diseases in potentially sensitive subgroups. *Epidemiology*, 2012. 23(3):473-81.
- 75. Dales, R.E., S. Cakmak, C.B. Vidal, Air pollution and hospitalization for headache in Chile. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2009. 170(8):1057-66.
- 76. Dominici, F., et al., Fine particulate air pollution and hospital admission for cardiovascular and respiratory diseases. *Jama*, 2006. 295(10):1127-34.
- 77. Fung, K.Y., et al., Air pollution and daily hospital admissions for cardiovascular diseases in Windsor, Ontario. *Can J Public Health*, 2005. 96(1):29-33.

- 78. Haley, V.B., T.O. Talbot, H.D. Felton, Surveillance of the short-term impact of fine particle air pollution on cardiovascular disease hospitalizations in New York State. *Environ Health*, 2009. 8:42.
- 79. Janssen, N.A., et al., Air conditioning and source-specific particles as modifiers of the effect of PM(10) on hospital admissions for heart and lung disease. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2002. 110(1):43-9.
- 80. Kim, S.Y., et al., Air pollution, socioeconomic position, and emergency hospital visits for asthma in Seoul, Korea. *Int Arch Occup Environ Health*, 2007. 80(8):701-10.
- 81. Lanki, T., et al., Associations of traffic related air pollutants with hospitalisation for first acute myocardial infarction: the HEAPSS study. *Occup Environ Med*, 2006. 63(12):844-51.
- 82. Lee, I.M., et al., Air pollution and hospital admissions for congestive heart failure: are there potentially sensitive groups? *Environ Res*, 2008. 108(3):348-53.
- 83. Mann, J.K., et al., Air pollution and hospital admissions for ischemic heart disease in persons with congestive heart failure or arrhythmia. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2002. 110(12):1247-52.
- 84. Medina-Ramon, M., A. Zanobetti, J. Schwartz, The effect of ozone and PM10 on hospital admissions for pneumonia and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a national multicity study. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2006. 163(6):579-88.
- 85. Middleton, N., et al., A 10-year time-series analysis of respiratory and cardiovascular morbidity in Nicosia, Cyprus: the effect of short-term changes in air pollution and dust storms. *Environ Health*, 2008. 7:39.
- 86. Namdeo, A., A. Tiwary, E. Farrow, Estimation of age-related vulnerability to air pollution: assessment of respiratory health at local scale. *Environ Int*, 2011. 37(5):829-37.
- 87. Nuvolone, D., et al., Short-term association between ambient air pollution and risk of hospitalization for acute myocardial infarction: results of the cardiovascular risk and air pollution in Tuscany (RISCAT) study. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2011. 174(1):63-71.
- 88. Oftedal, B., et al., Traffic related air pollution and acute hospital admission for respiratory diseases in Drammen, Norway 1995-2000. *Eur J Epidemiol*, 2003. 18(7):671-5.
- 89. Oudin, A., et al., Estimation of short-term effects of air pollution on stroke hospital admissions in southern Sweden. *Neuroepidemiology*, 2010. 34(3):131-42.
- 90. Peel, J.L., et al., Ambient air pollution and cardiovascular emergency department visits in potentially sensitive groups. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2007. 165(6):625-33.
- 91. Qorbani, M., et al., Effect of air pollution on onset of acute coronary syndrome in susceptible subgroups. *East Mediterr Health J*, 2012. 18(6):550-5.
- 92. Ren, C. S. Tong, Temperature modifies the health effects of particulate matter in Brisbane, Australia. *Int J Biometeorol*, 2006. 51(2):87-96.
- 93. Silverman, R.A. K. Ito, Age-related association of fine particles and ozone with severe acute asthma in New York City. *J Allergy Clin Immunol*, 2010. 125(2):367-373 e5.
- 94. Sousa, S.I., et al., Short-term effects of air pollution on respiratory morbidity at Rio de Janeiro--Part II: health assessment. *Environ Int*, 2012. 43:1-5.
- 95. Stieb, D.M., et al., Air pollution, aeroallergens and cardiorespiratory emergency department visits in Saint John, Canada. *J Expo Anal Environ Epidemiol*, 2000. 10(5):461-77.
- 96. Tramuto, F., et al., Urban air pollution and emergency room admissions for respiratory symptoms: a casecrossover study in Palermo, Italy. *Environ Health*, 2011. 10:31.
- 97. Tsai, S.S., et al., Air pollution and hospital admissions for myocardial infarction: are there potentially sensitive groups? *J Toxicol Environ Health A*, 2012. 75(4):242-51.
- 98. Villeneuve, P.J., et al., Short-term effects of ambient air pollution on stroke: Who is most vulnerable? *Sci Total Environ*, 2012. 430:193-201.
- 99. Wellenius, G.A., et al., Particulate Air Pollution and the Rate of Hospitalization for Congestive Heart Failure among Medicare Beneficiaries in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. *Am J Epidemiol*, 2005. 161(11):1030-6.
- 100. Wellenius, G.A., J. Schwartz, M.A. Mittleman, Particulate air pollution and hospital admissions for congestive heart failure in seven United States cities. *Am J Cardiol*, 2006. 97(3):404-8.
- 101. Wong, C.M., et al., A tale of two cities: effects of air pollution on hospital admissions in Hong Kong and London compared. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2002. 110(1):67-77.
- 102. Wong, C.M., et al., Modification by influenza on health effects of air pollution in Hong Kong. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2009. 117(2):248-53.
- 103. Zanobetti, A., J. Schwartz, D. Gold, Are there sensitive subgroups for the effects of airborne particles? *Environ Health Perspect*, 2000. 108(9):841-5.
- 104. Zanobetti, A., J. Schwartz, D.W. Dockery, Airborne particles are a risk factor for hospital admissions for heart and lung disease. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2000. 108(11):1071-7.

- 105. Zanobetti, A. J. Schwartz, Are diabetics more susceptible to the health effects of airborne particles? *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*, 2001. 164(5):831-3.
- 106. Zanobetti, A. J. Schwartz, Cardiovascular damage by airborne particles: are diabetics more susceptible? *Epidemiology*, 2002. 13(5):588-92.
- 107. Zanobetti, A. J. Schwartz, The effect of particulate air pollution on emergency admissions for myocardial infarction: a multicity case-crossover analysis. *Environ Health Perspect*, 2005. 113(8):978-82.
- 108. Zanobetti, A., et al., Fine particulate air pollution and its components in association with cause-specific emergency admissions. *Environ Health*, 2009. 8:58.