# **Photosynthesis of Grass Species Differing in Carbon Dioxide Fixation Pathways<sup>1</sup>**

VI. DIFFERENTIAL EFFECTS OF TEMPERATURE AND LIGHT INTENSITY ON PHOTORESPIRATION IN C<sub>3</sub>, C<sub>4</sub>, AND INTERMEDIATE SPECIES

Received for publication March 11, 1980 and in revised form May 23, 1980

R. HAROLD BROWN AND JACK A. MORGAN Department of Agronomy, University of Georgia, Athens, Georgia 30602

# ABSTRACT

The effects of temperature and photosynthetically active radiation levels on photorespiration were investigated in Panicum milioides Nees ex Trin. and Panicum schenckii Hack., species known to have low photorespiration rates and other characteristics intermediate between C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> species. Comparisons were made with the C<sub>3</sub> grass species tall fescue (Festuca arundinacea Schreb.). An increase in temperature from 20 to 35 C raised photorespiration from 7.3 to 10.2 milligrams per square decimeter per hour in tall fescue, but the increase in P. schenckii was less than 1 milligram per square decimeter per hour. Increases in temperature caused much less change in CO<sub>2</sub> compensation concentration in P. milioides and P. schenckii than in tall fescue, values of 160 microliters per liter being obtained in tall fescue at 40 C compared to about 40 microliters per liter for P. milioides and P. schenckii. Photorespiration in P. schenckii increased by only about 1 milligram CO<sub>2</sub> per square decimeter per hour as the photosynthetically active radiation level was raised from 100 to 2,000 microEinsteins per square meter per second. Loss of CO2 into CO2-free air actually decreased from 2.2 to 1.0 milligrams per square decimeter per hour as the radiation level was raised from 100 to 1,100 microEinsteins per square meter per second but tended to rise again at 2,000 microEinsteins per square meter per second. In contrast, photorespiration in tall fescue tripled with radiation level over the same range, reaching a maximum value of 7.2 milligrams per square decimeter per hour as determined by extrapolation of the CO<sub>2</sub> response curves to zero CO<sub>2</sub>. The CO<sub>2</sub> compensation concentration in tall fescue was nearly insensitive to photosynthetically active radiation above 140 microEinsteins per square meter per second but, in P. milioides and P. schenckii, it decreased from values of 69 and 62 microliters per liter, respectively, to values of 21 and 16 as the radiation level was increased from 50 to 1075 microEinsteins per square meter per second. Interpolation of CO2-response curves showed that an increase in photosynthetically active radiation level from 100 to 2,000 microEinsteins per square meter per second reduced the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation value of P. schenckii from 38 to 19 microliters per liter. Data from these experiments indicate reduced photorespiration or a CO<sub>2</sub>-recycling mechanism in P. milioides and P. schenckii which causes apparent photorespiration to be nearly insensitive to temperature in the 20 to 35 C range and to decrease at high radiation intensities.

reduction in carboxylation of RuBP because  $O_2$  completes with  $CO_2$  for carboxylation sites and (b) the production and oxidation of glycolate to produce  $CO_2$  (13, 21). This oxidation of glycolate and resulting loss of  $CO_2$  is known as PR. The PR component of  $O_2$  inhibition of AP appears to be the smaller of the two. Ku and Edwards (10) estimated that PR made up a larger proportion of  $O_2$  inhibition in wheat as temperature was increased from 25 to 35 C but, even at the higher temperature, it constituted less than 30% of the total inhibition at 300  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> of CO<sub>2</sub>. Ludwig and Canvin (14) found that PR accounted for one-third of the inhibition of AP by 21%  $O_2$  in sunflower.

Increases in temperature cause PR to rise in  $C_3$  species as shown by CO<sub>2</sub> loss in CO<sub>2</sub>-free air in the light (7), extrapolation of CO<sub>2</sub>response curves to zero CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (10), and the postillumination CO<sub>2</sub> burst (6). The increase in PR was attributed by Ku and Edwards (10) to an increase in the solubility ratio of O<sub>2</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub>, but Laing *et al.* (13) reported a decreased affinity of RuBP carboxylase for CO<sub>2</sub> and an increased affinity for O<sub>2</sub> as temperature increased. Increases in PR with increased light intensity would be expected through its effects on RuBP regeneration (4) and from the current views on the mechanism of action of RuBP carboxylase/oxygenase (13). Stimulation of PR by light intensity has been shown by the techniques mentioned above for temperature effects (6, 20). Increases in PR at high temperatures are accompanied by steep increases in  $\Gamma$ , whereas light intensity above the compensation point has very little effect on  $\Gamma$  (6, 20).

Panicum milioides, Panicum schenckii, and Panicum decipiens have been shown to exhibit less  $O_2$  inhibition of AP by 21%  $O_2$ than  $C_3$  species (1, 2, 8, 11, 15). This reduced  $O_2$  inhibition has been ascribed to low photorespiration rates rather than reduced  $O_2$  sensitivity of carboxylation efficiency (2, 15). Photorespiration estimated from the extrapolation of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curves of AP was low and nearly insensitive to  $O_2$  in P. milioides and P. schenckii, whereas the slope of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curve (carboxylation efficiency) was reduced by a similar amount in the two Panicum species and tall fescue, a C<sub>3</sub> species (2). The similar reduction in carboxylation efficiency at 21% O<sub>2</sub> indicates C<sub>3</sub> photosynthesis in P. milioides and P. schenckii. Keck and Ogren (8), however, found less sensitivity of carboxylation efficiency to  $O_2$  in *P. milioides* than in the  $C_3$  plant soybean (*Glycine max* [L.]) Merr.). Rathnam and Chollet (16–18) have concluded from (a) enzyme localization, (b) increased O<sub>2</sub> sensitivity of photosynthesis upon inhibition of phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase, and (c) initial products of  ${}^{14}CO_2$  assimilation that reduced O<sub>2</sub> sensitivity in *P. milioides* is due to a limited  $C_4$  cycle.

Whatever the reason for reduced  $O_2$  inhibition of AP, *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* have been shown to have  $\Gamma$  values between those of C<sub>4</sub> and C<sub>3</sub> species and lower PR (loss of CO<sub>2</sub> in CO<sub>2</sub>-free air) than the C<sub>3</sub> species tall fescue (1, 2, 15).

The inhibition of AP<sup>2</sup> by 21% O<sub>2</sub> in C<sub>3</sub> species is due to (a) the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This research was supported by state and Hatch funds allocated to the Georgia Agricultural Experiment Stations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Abbreviations: AP, apparent photosynthesis; RuBP, ribulose bisphosphate:  $\Gamma$ , CO<sub>2</sub> compensation concentration; PR, photorespiration.

Inasmuch as increases in temperature and light intensity are known to stimulate PR in  $C_3$  species, experiments were conducted to examine effects of these environmental factors on photorespiratory loss of CO<sub>2</sub> in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii*. Comparisons were made with the C<sub>3</sub> species tall fescue (*Festuca arundinacea* Schreb.) and, in some experiments, with the C<sub>4</sub> species *Panicum maximum* Jacq.

#### **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

Plants of *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, *P. maximum*, and tall fescue were grown in the greenhouse at maximum daytime temperatures of 25 to 35 C and night-time minima of 15 to 20 C. Supplemental lighting from 1500-w multivapor lamps was used to provide at least 1,500  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> of PAR during midday at plant height. Tillers were transplanted to pots containing a soil/peat/Perlite mixture and were fertilized with complete Hoagland solution. When plants were well-established, the following experiments were conducted.

Temperature Effects on PR and  $\Gamma$ . PR in *P. schenckii* and tall fescue was estimated from measurements of AP at CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations entering the leaf chamber of 3, 37, 62, 115, and 165  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> and leaf temperatures of 20 and 35 C. The youngest fully expanded leaf on a tiller was placed in a small leaf chamber and AP was measured. Measurements of AP and transpiration and calculation of substomatal CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were as described earlier (2). PAR at the leaf surface was 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Estimates of PR were made by extrapolating the AP-intercellular CO<sub>2</sub> concentration regression line to zero CO<sub>2</sub>. Estimates of  $\Gamma$  were made from the regression equation at AP = 0.

Effects of temperature on  $\Gamma$  were determined in a separate experiment by the Mylar bag technique of Goldsworthy and Day (5). In this experiment, measurements were made on *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, *P. maximum*, and tall fescue. Temperatures inside the bags were maintained at 15, 25, 35, and 40 C by setting the growth chamber in which the bags were placed at the appropriate temperatures. PAR inside the bags was 1,600  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Three replications of measurements were made for each temperature and species.

Light Intensity Effects on PR and  $\Gamma$ . Estimates of PR were made for *P. schenckii* and tall fescue at PAR levels of 100 and 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> by measuring AP at these intensities and at CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations used in the temperature experiments described above. Leaf temperature was maintained at 30 C. Photorespiration and  $\Gamma$  were calculated from CO<sub>2</sub>-response curves as described in the previous section.

Dark respiration and PR were also estimated by measuring CO<sub>2</sub> evolution in CO<sub>2</sub>-free air for *P. schenckii*, *P. maximum*, and tall fescue. Young, fully expanded leaves were enclosed in the leaf chambers and exposed to PAR levels of 0, 100, 300, 600, 1,100, and 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. At each PAR level, leaves were exposed to air containing 300  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> until AP or dark respiration reached a steady level. The leaf then was flushed with CO<sub>2</sub>-free air and CO<sub>2</sub> evolution was measured until an equilibrium was reached, usually 5 to 10 min. Concentrations of CO<sub>2</sub> in the exhaust of the leaf chamber ranged from zero to 10  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup>. For some leaves, measurements were made in sequences from lowest to highest PAR levels, and for others the sequence was reversed. The sequence did not appear to affect the response of CO<sub>2</sub> evolution to light intensity. Leaves were maintained at 30 C during measurements.

Measurements of  $\Gamma$  were made on *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, *P. maximum*, and tall fescue using a modification of the Mylar bag technique (5). Leaf sections were floated on water in two Petri dishes which were placed in Mylar bags. The bags then were inflated with air or with N<sub>2</sub> containing 3.7% O<sub>2</sub>. Each Mylar bag was fitted with a rubber septum from which 20-ml samples were withdrawn with a hypodermic syringe. Samples were injected into

a flowing N<sub>2</sub> stream which passed through the sample cell of an IR gas analyzer. N<sub>2</sub> was passed through the reference cell also. The analyzer was calibrated by injecting into the sample N<sub>2</sub> stream 20-ml samples of air with known CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the range of 0 to 100  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup>. Determinations were made at 50, 140, 225, 450, and 1,100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. The lower PAR levels were attained by shading the Mylar bags with plastic shade screens; the highest level was the full PAR level in the growth chamber.

The bags were placed in a growth chamber at  $1,100 \ \mu E \ m^{-2} \ s^{-1}$ and allowed to reach an equilibrium CO<sub>2</sub> concentration ( $\Gamma$ ). Air temperature inside the bags was maintained at 30 C by adjusting temperature of the growth chamber. After the determination was made at  $1,100 \ \mu E \ m^{-2} \ s^{-1}$ , the bags were shaded to produce the next lower illumination level, chamber temperature was again adjusted, and bags allowed to reach CO<sub>2</sub> equilibrium.

# RESULTS

Temperature Effects on PR and  $\Gamma$ . Photorespiration in tall fescue estimated from extrapolation of plots of substomatal CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations against AP increased from 7.3 to 10.2 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> as temperature was raised from 20 to 35 C (Fig. 1). The slopes of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curves of tall fescue were not changed by increased temperature, indicating that reductions in AP at 35 C compared to 20 C are mainly due to increased PR. In *P. schenckii*, PR was increased only slightly, from 2.5 to 3.3 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 35 C compared to 20 C. The slope of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curve was increased slightly at the higher temperature, indicating a higher carboxylation efficiency.

The intercepts of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curves at AP = 0 show that  $\Gamma$  was responsive to temperature in tall fescue, but not in *P. schenckii*. Whereas  $\Gamma$  was not changed in *P. schenckii*, it was increased from 43 to 62  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> in tall fescue as temperature was raised from 20 to 35 C. Data in Figure 2 also show a contrast among species in the response of  $\Gamma$  to temperature. In tall fescue,  $\Gamma$  increased from 40 to 160  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> as temperature was increased from 15 to 40 C but, in *P. schenckii* and *P. milioides*,  $\Gamma$  increased from 8 to only 39  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> over the same temperature range. In contrast to the lack of temperature response for these species in Figure 1,  $\Gamma$  rose 12  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> as temperature was increased from 20 to 35 C in Figure 2. In the C<sub>4</sub> species *P. maximum*,  $\Gamma$  responded only slightly to temperature, rising to about 10  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> at 40 C.

Effects of Light Intensity on PR and  $\Gamma$ . PR in tall fescue estimated from extrapolation of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curve increased from 2.4 to 7.2 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> as PAR was increased from 100 to 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 3). The slope of the CO<sub>2</sub>-response curve



FIG. 1. Relationships between AP and substomatal  $CO_2$  concentrations for tall fescue and *P. schenckii* at 20 and 35 C. Data are averages of five measurements.



FIG. 2. Effect of temperature on the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation concentration ( $\Gamma$ ) of tall fescue, *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, and *P. maximum*. Data are averages of three determinations.



FIG. 3. Relationships between AP and substomatal CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations for tall fescue and *P. schenckii* at PAR levels of 100 and 2000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Data are averages of five measurements.

was greatly increased at the higher intensity, and the curves for the two intensities intersected near the compensation point. Thus, although PR was greatly increased by high PAR levels,  $\Gamma$  was affected only slightly. In *P. schenckii*, PR was only 2.8 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and was reduced by only 1 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> by lowering the PAR level to 100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. In contrast to tall fescue,  $\Gamma$  in *P. schenckii* was increased at the low PAR level from 19 to 38  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup>.

Evolution of CO<sub>2</sub> into CO<sub>2</sub>-free air increased in tall fescue with increases in PAR levels from 2.4 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> in darkness to 4.3 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 4). Estimates of PR in this experiment are lower than in Figure 3 because the estimate is of CO<sub>2</sub> evolved from the leaf, whereas in Figure 3, CO<sub>2</sub> evolution into intercellular spaces is estimated. A portion of the CO<sub>2</sub> evolved into intercellular spaces would be recycled reducing CO<sub>2</sub> evolution from the leaf. In contrast to the response in tall fescue, PR was decreased in *P. schenckii* as PAR levels were increased to 1,100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and then rose again as PAR was increased further to 2,000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Estimates of PR from extrapolation of CO<sub>2</sub>response curves were higher at 2000  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> than at 100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, whereas estimates from flushing with air showed a reverse



FIG. 4. Loss of CO<sub>2</sub> in CO<sub>2</sub>-free air (PR) as a function of PAR levels for tall fescue, *P. schenckii* and *P. maximum*. Data are averages of six measurements for *P. schenckii* and four each for tall fescue and *P. maximum*. Vertical lines are  $\pm 1$  sD.



FIG. 5. Effect of PAR level and  $O_2$  concentration on  $CO_2$  compensation concentrations ( $\Gamma$ ) in tall fescue, *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, and *P. maximum*. Data are averages of four determinations.

trend. Nevertheless, PR rates at the high and low PAR levels were low and varied only about 1 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>. Minimum PR for *P.* schenckii was 1 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 1,100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and, at the same PAR level, PR in tall fescue was approximately 4 times as great. Evolution of CO<sub>2</sub> in *P. maximum* dropped from 2.4 mg dm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> in darkness to near zero at 100  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and remained very low at all higher PAR levels.

Measurement of  $\Gamma$  by the Mylar bag technique resulted in responses at 21% O<sub>2</sub> similar to those shown in Figure 3; that is,  $\Gamma$ changed little in tall fescue from a value of 62 µl I<sup>-1</sup> as PAR level was increased from 140 to 1075 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 5). There was a rise to 73 µl I<sup>-1</sup> when the PAR level was reduced to 50 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. The  $\Gamma$  values of *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* at 21% O<sub>2</sub> decreased from 69 and 62 µl I<sup>-1</sup> at 50 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> to 21 and 16 µl I<sup>-1</sup> at 1,075 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. At 3.7% O<sub>2</sub>,  $\Gamma$  in tall fescue, *P. milioides*, and *P. schenckii* decreased with increased PAR in a similar pattern, the decrease being steep from 50 to 225 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and only slight from 225 to 1,075 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. In *P. maximum*,  $\Gamma$  was not affected by O<sub>2</sub> and the decrease from 50 to 1,075 µE m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> was only from 8.5 to 6 µl I<sup>-1</sup>.

An estimate of the effect of  $O_2$  on  $\Gamma$  was made by subtracting those values obtained at 3.7% from those at 21% (data not shown). The  $O_2$  effect was similar in *P. milioides*, *P. schenckii*, and tall fescue at 50  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, with  $\Gamma$  being 38 to 44  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> higher at 21 than at 3.7%  $O_2$ . Whereas the  $O_2$  effect on  $\Gamma$  in tall fescue increased from 38 to 48  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup> with increased PAR level, O<sub>2</sub> effect on  $\Gamma$  in *P*. *milioides* and *P*. *schenckii* decreased by 31 and 32  $\mu$ l l<sup>-1</sup>, respectively.

## DISCUSSION

In previous reports (2, 15) it was suggested that the reduced  $O_2$  sensitivity of AP in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* was due to a low PR rate rather than reduced sensitivity of carboxylation to  $O_2$ . Experiments reported here confirm the low PR in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii*, although the rates are not as low as those reported by Brown (2). The low PR rates were not very sensitive to temperature nor light intensity, factors which exert a striking influence on PR on  $C_3$  species.  $O_2$  has also been shown to have a relatively small effect on PR in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* (2, 11, 15) compared to its influence on PR in  $C_3$  species.

The low PR rate in *P. schenckii* and *P. milioides* could be due to low CO<sub>2</sub> production or more efficient refixation of CO<sub>2</sub> than in C<sub>3</sub> species. More efficient refixation might be indicated by the decrease in PR and  $\Gamma$  as light intensity was increased. Data in Figures 4 and 5 indicate that PR in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* is similar to that in the C<sub>3</sub> species tall fescue, at low light intensities, but differences in PR increase with PAR levels up to about 1,100  $\mu E m^{-2} s^{-1}$ . If the difference in  $\Gamma$  at the two O<sub>2</sub> concentrations can be attributed to PR, then it is obvious that light intensity has a quite different effect on the photorespiratory component of  $\Gamma$  in the C<sub>3</sub> and intermediate species. This difference in response of PR and  $\Gamma$  to light is compatible with data presented earlier (2) showing similar O<sub>2</sub> inhibition of AP at low light intensities for the three species mentioned above, but reduced inhibition in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* compared to tall fescue at high intensities.

Since PR has been shown to increase with light intensity in C<sub>3</sub> species (6, 20, 21), presumably due to increased RuBP levels (4), and since photosynthesis in P. milioides and P. schenckii is apparently predominantly C<sub>3</sub>, the production and oxidation of glycolate in these species may also be expected to increase with light intensity. If such an increase occurs, a light-dependent, CO2recycling mechanism must operate and become more efficient with increased light intensity. If a limited C<sub>4</sub> cycle operates in these intermediate species, as suggested by data of Rathnam and Chollet (16-18), it apparently becomes more influential on total CO<sub>2</sub> exchange with increased light intensity. It is not clear why a low level of  $C_4$  metabolism should exert a relatively stronger effect on gas exchange as light intensity increases. Perhaps CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the bundle sheath cells increases at higher light intensities, reducing O<sub>2</sub> inhibition of RuBP carboxylation. This could explain the reduced formation of glycolate in P. milioides compared to the C3 species Hordeum vulgare L. observed by Servaites *et al.* (19) at 1,500  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. It is not consistent, however, with the observation of carboxylation efficiencies in *P. milioides* and *P.* schenckii similar to those of  $C_3$  species (2, 11). In fact, the lack of traits associated with C4 photosynthesis at atmospheric CO2 and O<sub>2</sub> levels, such as high AP rates, increased H<sub>2</sub>O use efficiency, and low  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  ratios compared to C<sub>3</sub> species (1-3, 20), may mean that the  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanism is ineffectual in these species. Disagreement over the extent of <sup>14</sup>C labeling of initial products of the  $C_4$  cycle (9, 12, 18) and compartmentation of enzymes involved in the two phases of C4 photosynthesis (12, 16, 18) leaves open the question of  $C_4$  cycle activity in *P. milioides* 

#### and P. schenckii.

The low PR rates in *P. milioides* and *P. schenckii* have been confirmed in these experiments and have been found to be much less sensitive to temperature and light intensity than in  $C_3$  species. The low sensitivity of PR to temperature, light intensity, and  $O_2$ and its decrease, at least up to PAR levels of about one-half of full sunlight, indicates some carbon metabolism different from that typical of  $C_3$  plants. Perhaps phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase plays a role in recycling of photorespired  $CO_2$  as suggested earlier (8, 9, 12) but without a  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanism similar to  $C_4$  plants to raise carboxylation efficiency.

### LITERATURE CITED

- BROWN RH 1976 Characteristics related to photosynthesis and photorespiration of *Panicum milioides*. In RH Burris, CC Black, eds, CO<sub>2</sub> Metabolism and Plant Productivity. University Park Press, Baltimore, pp 311-325
- BROWN RH 1980 Photosynthesis of grass species differing in carbon dioxide fixation pathways. IV. Analysis of reduced oxygen response in *Panicum* millioides and *Panicum schenckii*. Plant Physiol 65: 346-349
- BROWN, RH, RE SIMMONS 1979 Photosynthesis of grass species differing in CO<sub>2</sub> fixation pathways. I. Water use efficiency. Crop Sci 19: 375–379
- COLLATZ GJ, MR BADGER 1978 The interaction between photosynthesis and ribulose-P<sub>2</sub> concentration. Effects of light, CO<sub>2</sub>, and O<sub>2</sub>. Carnegie Inst Wash Year Book 77: 248-251
- GOLDSWORTHY A, PR DAY 1970 A simple technique for the rapid determination of plant CO<sub>2</sub> compensation points. Plant Physiol 46: 850-851
- HEATH OVS 1969 The Physiological Aspects of Photosynthesis. Stanford University Press, Stanford
- 7. HOFSTRA G, JD HESKETH 1969 Effects of temperature on the gas exchange of leaves in the light and dark. Planta 85: 228-237
- KECK RW, WL ÖGREN 1976 Differential oxygen response of photosynthesis in soybean and *Panicum milioides*. Plant Physiol 58: 552-555
- KESTLER DP, BC MAYNE, TB RAY, LD GOLDSTEIN, RH BROWN, CC BLACK 1975 Biochemical components of the photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> compensation point of higher plants. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 66: 1439–1445
- KU SB, GE EDWARDS 1977 Oxygen inhibition of photosynthesis. II. Kinetic characteristics as affected by temperature. Plant Physiol 59: 991-999
- KU SB, GE EDWARDS 1978 Photosynthetic efficiency of Panicum hians and Panicum milioides in relation to C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> plants. Plant Cell Physiol 19: 665– 675
- KU SB, GE EDWARDS, R KANAI 1976 Distribution of enzymes related to C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> pathway of photosynthesis between mesophyll and bundle sheath cells of *Panicum hians* and *Panicum milioides*. Plant Cell Physiol 17: 615-620
- LAING WA, WL OGREN, RH HAGEMAN 1974 Regulation of soybean net photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> fixation by the interaction of CO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>2</sub>, and ribulose 1,5-diphosphate carboxylase. Plant Physiol 54: 678-685
- 14. LUDWIG LJ, DŤ CANVIN 1971 The rate of photorespiration during photosynthesis and the relationship of the substrate of light respiration to the products of photosynthesis in sunflower leaves. Plant Physiol 48: 712-719
- MORGAN JA, RH BROWN, BJ REGER 1980 Photosynthesis in grass species differing in carbon dioxide fixation pathways. III. Oxygen response and enzyme activities of species in the Laxa group of Panicum. Plant Physiol 65: 156-159
- RATHNAM CKM, R CHOLLET 1978 CO<sub>2</sub> donation by malate and aspartate reduces photorespiration in *Panicum milioides*, a C<sub>3</sub>-C<sub>4</sub> intermediate species. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 85: 801-808
- RATHNAM CKM, R CHOLLET 1979 Phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase reduces photorespiration in *Panicum milioides*, a C<sub>3</sub>-C<sub>4</sub> intermediate species. Arch Biochem Biophys 193: 346-354
- RATHNAM CKM, Ř CHOLLET 1979 Photosynthetic carbon metabolism in Panicum milioides, a C<sub>3</sub>-C<sub>4</sub> intermediate species: evidence for a limited C<sub>4</sub> dicarboxylic acid pathway of photosynthesis. Biochim Biophys Acta 548: 500-519
- SERVAITES JC, LE SCHRADER, GE EDWARDS 1978 Glycolate synthesis in a C<sub>3</sub>, C<sub>4</sub>; and intermediate photosynthetic plant type. Plant Cell Physiol 19: 1399-1405
- WHITEMAN PC, D KOLLER 1967 Interactions of carbon dioxide concentration, light intensity, and temperature on plant resistances to water vapor and carbon dioxide diffusion. New Phytol 66: 463-473
- 21. ZELITCH I 1971 Photosynthesis, Photorespiration, and Plant Productivity Academic Press, New York