Reviewer Report

Title: "RED-ML: a novel, effective RNA editing detection method based on machine learning"

Version: Original Submission   **Date:** 1/6/2017

Reviewer name: Fabrizio Costa

Reviewer Comments to Author:

The authors present a tool for the detection of RNA editing events from RNA-seq data. The authors state that such identification task is difficult since a complex pipeline needs to be carefully calibrated to address various sources of error, ranging from sequencing artifacts to mapping errors and contamination from genomic variants. They say that current alternative approaches suffer from lack of flexibility and cannot be easily modified to trade-off sensitivity vs specificity. They therefore introduce an open source tool based on a machine learning approach that can be trained on specific data sets. They show that the approach is robust w.r.t. different experimental protocols but that, due to the human specific features used, generalization suffers when data from different species is considered.

The authors have answered in a satisfactory way to the comments raised by the reviewers and it is now acceptable being clear and of interest for the communities of biologist and bioinformaticians.

Level of Interest

Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of Written English

Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript: Acceptable

Declaration of Competing Interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

- Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
- Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
- Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
- Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

- Do you have any other financial competing interests?
- Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal