# **Supplementary Online Content**

Tasillo A, Salomon JA, Trikalinos TA, Horsburgh CR, Marks SM, Linas BP. Cost-effectiveness of testing and treatment for latent tuberculosis infection in residents born outside the United States with and without medical comorbidities in a simulation model. *JAMA Intern Med*. Published online October 16, 2017. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.3941

## **eAppendix.** Meta-analysis

This supplementary material has been provided by the authors to give readers additional information about their work.

#### **eAppendix.** Meta-analysis

## **Introduction**

The goal of this analysis is to investigate the relative costs and health benefits associated with testing and treatment for latent tuberculosis infection (LTBI) in foreign-born U.S. residents. We sought to determine which strategy or strategies are cost-effective in the U.S. healthcare system.

Our analysis is conducted through a computer model that we designed to simulate the lifetime progression of a cohort of people with and without latent tuberculosis infection (LTBI). The model is constructed using TreeAge software version 2016 (TreeAge Corporation, Williamstown, MA). Through this model we simulate both the cascade of testing, diagnosis and treatment for LTBI and the remaining lifetime health outcomes of TB morbidity, mortality, and quality adjusted life years gained (QALYs). We use population-level averages of costs and health outcomes to calculate incremental costeffectiveness measures and draw conclusions about which strategies being studied are most cost effective for clinical practice.

## **Research Question**

For each population studied we developed a model with similar structure but different input values to identify which, if any, of the selected testing strategies would be most cost effective to achieve the greatest QALYs at a commonly used willingness to pay (WTP) cost threshold of \$100,000 per QALY gained.

© 2017 American Medical Association. All rights reserved. 2

#### **Populations of Interest**

We defined four populations of interest: foreign-born with no comorbidities (FB-NC), foreign-born with diabetes mellitus (FB-D), foreign-born with HIV (FB-HIV), and foreign-born with end v-stage renal disease (FB-ESRD). These populations have different life expectancies, associated healthcare costs and rates of TB reactivation.

#### *Costs*

We applied economic costs from the healthcare sector perspective. All costs in our analysis are reported in 2015 dollars; any costs from literature reported in other years were adjusted using an online calculator reflecting the Consumer Price Index (CPI) found at www.usinflationcalculator.com. We assumed that average costs from various data sources for the U.S. population overall would be equivalent to those specifically for FB populations. We used U.S. age- and sex-specific averages of background healthcare costs for the FB-NC population; we estimated costs using payments for care as reported by the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ) Medical Expenditure Panel Survey  $(MEPS)$ .<sup>1</sup> We obtained U.S. average payments for diabetes from the Diabetes Care Survey supplement to MEPS and applied them to FB-D. For FB-ESRD costs, we used a publish report of insurance claims among individuals with end-stage renal disease.<sup>2,3</sup> The FB-HIV population has healthcare costs associated with U.S. residents with HIV as reported by Cost-Effectiveness of Preventing AIDS Complications (CEPAC) group.<sup>4</sup> All other healthcare costs are estimated as follows. Physician and lab costs are estimated using Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) Medicare allowable fee schedules for physician and lab services. Pharmaceutical wholesale prices are used to

© 2017 American Medical Association. All rights reserved. 3

estimate medication costs and are obtained from Redbook© Online. While these data sources overestimate to some extent actual economic costs, they are the best estimates of costs that we were able to obtain.

#### *Life Expectancy*

The FB-NC population has a life expectancy without LTBI of 80 years, consistent with that of the general U.S. population.<sup>5</sup> The FB-HIV population has a life expectancy without LTBI of 69 years.<sup>4,6</sup> The FB-D population has a life expectancy without LTBI of 75 years.<sup>7</sup> The FB-ESRD population has a life expectancy without LTBI of 69 years.<sup>8</sup> On general, life expectancy is decreased in those with LTBI due to the risk of TB reactivation and subsequent possibility of death.

## **Testing Strategies**

**No testing** In this strategy, no testing is performed. Thus, no TB cases are prevented, no individuals initiate LTBI treatment and the risk of TB reactivation throughout the lifetime is unmitigated.

**TST** In this strategy, a tuberculin skin test (TST) is placed and patients are required to return within 48 to 72 hours to have the results read. In the base case, 82% of patients returned to have their TST read, while the remainder are lost to follow up.<sup>9</sup> The results of this single test are considered to be final—those with a positive result are diagnosed with LTBI while those with a negative result receive no further clinical intervention.

**IGRA** In this strategy, a blood sample is taken for analysis using interferon gamma release assay (IGRA). The results of this single test are considered to be final—those

with a positive result are diagnosed with LTBI while those with a negative result receive no further clinical intervention.

**Confirm positive** In this strategy, a TST is placed and patients are required to return to have the test results read, with the same loss to follow-up as in the "TST" strategy. If the result is negative, no further action is taken. If, however, the result is positive, a blood sample is taken for IGRA. Only those individuals with positive results on both TST and IGRA are diagnosed with LTBI; those who have a negative result for either test do not receive any further clinical intervention. This strategy is used to "confirm" the positive findings of TST.

**Confirm negative** In this strategy, a blood sample is taken for IGRA analysis. If the result is positive, the patient is diagnosed with LTBI. If the result is negative, a TST is placed and patients are required to return for results, with the same loss to follow-up as in the "TST" strategy. If the results of both tests are negative, no further intervention is received. If the result of the TST is positive, the patient is diagnosed with LTBI. This strategy "confirms" any negative IGRA with a follow-up TST.

## **Test Characteristics**

There is no gold standard against which to quantify the performance of commercially-available tests for LTBI. Estimates from the literature are varied and depend heavily on population of interest, especially by age, health status and country of origin. We conducted a thorough review of available literature followed by a comprehensive meta-analysis to estimate the performance of both TST and IGRA.

Our literature search identified 41 studies reporting the cross-classification of results of TST and IGRA for LTBI in various populations.10-50 From these, we extracted cross-classification of results of TST and IGRA by age and by whether subjects: were immigrants; originated from countries with an annual TB case rate greater than 50 per 100,000 population; had history of BCG vaccination; had recent contact with active TB cases; or had a comorbidity of interest, and on the. We developed a Bayesian hierarchical random effects model that treated the unobserved disease status as a latent variable. For each of three comorbid categories (no comorbidities, HIV, diabetes mellitus/ESRD) the model generated probability distributions of the sensitivity and specificity for TST and IGRA. In our primary analysis, we used average test performance from these distributions and assumed test independence (Table S1).

Table S1 Test characteristics developed through hierarchical Bayesian metaanalysis and regression



## **Treatment**

We estimate that 90% of individuals diagnosed with LTBI will initiate treatment.<sup>51</sup> We model a regimen of twelve weeks of self-administered high dose isoniazid and rifapentine  $(3HP)$ .<sup>52</sup> We estimated the cost of this regimen to include the cost of the medicines as well as a monthly physician visit. Of those who initiate treatment, 78.3% are estimated to complete the three-month course.<sup>53</sup> Patients who initiate treatment have an equal

probability of dropping out of treatment each month, and thus partial cost is accrued for those who do not finish the regimen. Of those who do drop out, a small proportion  $\langle 2\% \rangle$ do so due to hepatotoxicity,  $52,53$  Of those who develop hepatotoxicity, 0.1% die.<sup>54</sup> Both non-fatal and fatal drug-induced hepatotoxicity are associated with additional cost; for non-fatal cases this includes the cost of two specialty physician visits as well as two liver panels (a total of \$323), estimated using Medicare allowable physician fees for a one new and one established physician visit (CPT codes 99203 and 99204) and Medicare allowable lab fees for a liver panel (CPT code 80076). For fatal cases, we estimated the cost of hospitalization with other liver disease at \$13,780, obtained from the AHRQ National Inpatient Sample.<sup>55</sup> After the completion of treatment, patients experience a 90% reduction in the monthly risk of tuberculosis. Patients who initiate, but fail to complete, treatment are assumed not to receive any partial benefit.

## **Reactivation of LTBI**

Persons with latent tuberculosis infection are exposed to a probability of TB reactivation every month throughout the simulation. The reactivation rate for foreign-born U.S. residents based on TST results was adjusted using the Rogan-Gladen calculation to account for the possibility that false-positive and false-negative results might have distorted the true reactivation rate.<sup>56</sup> The rate of reactivation in foreign-born persons reported by Shea, *et. al* was 98 cases per 100,000 person-years at risk; after correction, the rate used in the model was 104 cases per 100,000 person-years at risk. This probability of reactivation was increased by a factor of 1.8 in persons with either diabetes mellitus or end-stage renal disease.<sup>57</sup> For individuals with HIV, the probability of TB

© 2017 American Medical Association. All rights reserved. 7

reactivation was adjusted to hit a lifetime target of reactivation for infected and untreated individuals of  $10\%$ <sup>58</sup> This baseline probability of reactivation is decreased by 10% each decade; this reduction in probability accounts for the potential for self-cure of LTBI over time as demonstrated by reductions in TST positivity when individuals are re-tested after ten years.59 Although epidemiological data may demonstrate increased reactivation in older persons, this is confounded with higher prevalence of disease in earlier birth cohorts. $^{60}$  Of those who progress to reactivation TB, 50.3% develop a case severe enough to warrant hospitalization and increased medical attention; we model this through the proportion of individuals developing cavitary tuberculosis.<sup>61</sup> This estimate aligns with the 49% of patients found by Taylor *et al* to require hospitalization during the course of their TB illness.<sup>62</sup> Non-severe tuberculosis results in excess mortality and cost and decreased quality of life for six months; severe tuberculosis extends for a total of nine months. Costs associated with tuberculosis include the multi-drug pharmaceutical regimen, clinical visits, chest x-rays, contact tracing and bacterial cultures and total \$2,900 in TB treated in an outpatient setting. We assumed that severe disease includes the cost of a hospitalization episode with tuberculosis, obtained from the AHRQ National Inpatient Sample  $(\$25,200).$ <sup>55</sup> Of those who develop reactivation TB, 5% die, with the majority of deaths concentrated in severe cases.<sup>63</sup> Once a person has survived active TB, they are no longer exposed to the risk of reactivation. For every active case of tuberculosis, we model  $0.25$  additional cases.<sup>64</sup> The effect of additional cases is the difference in both qualityadjusted life expectancy and lifetime healthcare costs between an otherwise healthy 35 year old and one with tuberculosis.

# **Sensitivity Analyses**



The results of key sensitivity analyses referenced in manuscript text are presented below.









































## **eReferences**

- 1. Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. Total health services-mean and median expenses per person with expense and distribution of expenses by source of payment: medical expenditure panel survey household component data. Generated interactively. [Internet]. http://meps.ahrq.gov/mepsweb/. Accessed 15 July, 2013.
- 2. Economic Costs of Diabetes in the U.S. in 2012. *Diabetes Care.*  2013;36(4):1033-1046.
- 3. Joyce AT, Iacoviello JM, Nag S, et al. End-Stage Renal Disease-Associated Managed Care Costs Among Patients With and Without Diabetes. *Diabetes Care.*  2004;27(12):2829-2835.
- 4. Schackman BR, Gebo KA, Walensky RP, et al. The lifetime cost of current human immunodeficiency virus care in the United States. *Medical Care.*  2006;44(11):990-997.
- 5. *2013 Mortality Tables.* National Vital Statistics System;2015.
- 6. Schackman BR, Fleishman JA, Su AE, et al. The Lifetime Medical Cost Savings from Preventing HIV in the United States. *Medical care.* 2015;53(4):293-301.
- 7. Franco OH, Steyerberg EW, Hu FB, Mackenbach J, Nusselder W. Associations of diabetes mellitus with total life expectancy and life expectancy with and without cardiovascular disease. *Archives of internal medicine.* 2007;167:1145-1151.
- 8. *USRDS Annual Data Report.* United States Renal Data System;2015.
- 9. Desale M, Bringardner P, Fitzgerald S, Page K, Shah M. Intensified Case-Finding for Latent Tuberculosis Infection Among the Baltimore City Hispanic Population. *J Immigrant Minority Health.* 2013;15(4):680-685.
- 10. Current laboratory methods for the diagnosis of tuberculosis. In: Bloom BR, ed. *Tuberculosis: protection, pathogenesis, and control*. Washington, DC: American Society for Microbiology; 1994.
- 11. T-SPOT.TB Visual Procedure Guide for in vitro diagnostic use. Oxford Immunotec; 2006.
- 12. Tuberculosis. *Fact Sheet No 104, Accessed April 10, 2007*2007.
- 13. Adegbola RA, Hill P, Baldeh I, et al. Surveillance of drug-resistant Mycobacterium tuberculosis in The Gambia. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2003;7.
- 14. Adetifa IMO, Lugos MD, Hammond A, et al. Comparison of two interferon gamma release assays in the diagnosis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection and disease in The Gambia. *BMC Infectious Diseases.* 2007;7(1):122.
- 15. Aiken AM, Hill PC, Fox A, et al. Reversion of the ELISPOT test after treatment in Gambian tuberculosis cases. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2006;6.
- 16. Almeida LM, Barbieri MA, Da Paixao AC, Cuevas LE. Use of purified protein derivative to assess the risk of infection in children in close contact with adults with tuberculosis in a population with high Calmette-Guerin bacillus coverage. *Pediatr Infect Dis J.* 2001;20.
- 17. Arend SM, Thijsen SF, Leyten EM, et al. Comparison of two interferon-gamma assays and tuberculin skin test for tracing tuberculosis contacts. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med.* 2007;175.
- 18. Black GF, Weir RE, Floyd S, et al. BCG-induced increase in interferon-gamma response to mycobacterial antigens and efficacy of BCG vaccination in Malawi and the UK: two randomised controlled studies. *Lancet.* 2002;359.
- 19. Detjen AK, Keil T, Roll S, et al. Interferon-gamma release assays improve the diagnosis of tuberculosis and nontuberculous mycobacterial disease in children in a country with a low incidence of tuberculosis. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2007;45.
- 20. Dewan PK, Grinsdale J, Kawamura LM. Low sensitivity of a whole-blood interferon-gamma release assay for detection of active tuberculosis. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2007;44.
- 21. Diel R, Nienhaus A, Lange C, Meywald-Walter K, Forssbohm M, Schaberg T. Tuberculosis contact investigation with a new, specific blood test in a lowincidence population containing a high proportion of BCG-vaccinated persons. *Respir Res.* 2006;7.
- 22. Dinnes J, Deeks J, Kunst H, et al. A systematic review of rapid diagnostic tests for the detection of tuberculosis infection. *Health Technol Assess.* 2007;11.
- 23. Dogra S, Narang P, Mendiratta DK, et al. Comparison of a whole blood interferon-gamma assay with tuberculin skin testing for the detection of tuberculosis infection in hospitalized children in rural India. *J Infect.* 2007;54.
- 24. Ferrara G, Losi M, D'Amico R, et al. Use in routine clinical practice of two commercial blood tests for diagnosis of infection with Mycobacterium tuberculosis: a prospective study. *Lancet.* 2006;367.
- 25. Goletti D, Carrara S, Vincenti D, et al. Accuracy of an immune diagnostic assay based on RD1 selected epitopes for active tuberculosis in a clinical setting: a pilot study. *Clinical microbiology and infection : the official publication of the European Society of Clinical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases.* 2006;12.
- 26. Harada N, Nakajima Y, Higuchi K, Sekiya Y, Rothel J, Mori T. Screening for tuberculosis infection using whole-blood interferon-gamma and Mantoux testing among Japanese healthcare workers. *Infection control and hospital epidemiology.*  2006;27.
- 27. Hill PC, Brookes RH, Adetifa IM, et al. Comparison of enzyme-linked immunospot assay and tuberculin skin test in healthy children exposed to Mycobacterium tuberculosis. *Pediatrics.* 2006;117.
- 28. Hill PC, Brookes RH, Fox A, et al. Large-scale evaluation of enzyme-linked immunospot assay and skin test for diagnosis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection against a gradient of exposure in The Gambia. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2004;38.
- 29. Hill PC, Brookes RH, Fox A, et al. Longitudinal Assessment of an ELISPOT Test for Mycobacterium tuberculosis Infection. *PLoS Med.* 2007;4.
- 30. Huebner RE, Schein MF, Bass JB. The tuberculin skin test. *Clin Infect Dis.*  1993;17.
- 31. Igari H, Watanabe A, Sato T. Booster phenomenon of QuantiFERON-TB Gold after prior intradermal PPD injection. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2007;11.
- 32. Jasmer RM, Nahid P, Hopewell PC. Clinical practice. Latent tuberculosis infection. *N Engl J Med.* 2002;347.
- 33. Jeffries DJ, Hill PC, Fox A, et al. Identifying ELISPOT and skin test cut-offs for diagnosis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in The Gambia. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2006;10.
- 34. Kang YA, Lee HW, Hwang SS, et al. Usefulness of Whole-Blood Interferon-Gamma Assay and Interferon-Gamma Enzyme-Linked Immunospot Assay in the Diagnosis of Active Pulmonary Tuberculosis. *Chest.* 2007;132.
- 35. Kang YA, Lee HW, Yoon HI, et al. Discrepancy between the tuberculin skin test and the whole-blood interferon gamma assay for the diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection in an intermediate tuberculosis-burden country. *Jama.*  2005;293.
- 36. Lalvani A, Brookes R, Hambleton S, Britton WJ, Hill AV, McMichael AJ. Rapid effector function in CD8+ memory T cells. *J Exp Med.* 1997;186.
- 37. Lee JY, Choi HJ, Park IN, et al. Comparison of two commercial interferongamma assays for diagnosing Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Eur Respir J.* 2006;28.
- 38. Leyten EM, Prins C, Bossink AW, et al. Effect of tuberculin skin testing on a Mycobacterium tuberculosis-specific interferon-gamma assay. *Eur Respir J.*  2007;29.
- 39. Lienhardt C, Fielding K, Sillah J, et al. Risk factors for tuberculosis infection in sub-Saharan Africa: a contact study in The Gambia. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med.*  2003;168.
- 40. Menzies D, Pai M, Comstock G. Meta-analysis: new tests for the diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection: areas of uncertainty and recommendations for research. *Ann Intern Med.* 2007;146.
- 41. Mori T, Sakatani M, Yamagishi F, et al. Specific detection of tuberculosis infection: an interferon-gamma-based assay using new antigens. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med.* 2004;170.
- 42. Mudido PM, Guwatudde D, Nakakeeto MK, et al. The effect of bacille Calmette-Guerin vaccination at birth on tuberculin skin test reactivity in Ugandan children. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 1999;3.
- 43. Naseer A, Naqvi S, Kampmann B. Evidence for boosting Mycobacterium tuberculosis-specific IFN-gamma responses at 6 weeks following tuberculin skin testing. *Eur Respir J.* 2007;29.
- 44. Pai M, Gokhale K, Joshi R, et al. Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in health care workers in rural India: comparison of a whole-blood interferon gamma assay with tuberculin skin testing. *Jama.* 2005;293.
- 45. Pai M, Menzies D. The new IGRA and the old TST: making good use of disagreement. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med.* 2007;175.
- 46. Pai M, Riley LW, Colford JM. Interferon-gamma assays in the immunodiagnosis of tuberculosis: a systematic review. *Lancet Infect Dis.* 2004;4.
- 47. Pitman R, Jarman B, Coker R. Tuberculosis transmission and the impact of intervention on the incidence of infection. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2002;6.
- 48. Qiagen. QuantiFERON-TB Gold In-Tube: technical information. [Website]. http://www.cellestis.com: . Accessed December 2015.
- 49. Tsiouris SJ, Coetzee D, Toro PL, Austin J, Stein Z, El-Sadr W. Sensitivity analysis and potential uses of a novel gamma interferon release assay for diagnosis of tuberculosis. *J Clin Microbiol.* 2006;44.
- 50. Wang L, Turner MO, Elwood RK, Schulzer M, FitzGerald JM. A meta-analysis of the effect of Bacille Calmette Guerin vaccination on tuberculin skin test measurements. *Thorax.* 2002;57.
- 51. Colson PW, Hirsch-Moverman Y, Bethel J, et al. Acceptance of treatment for latent tuberculosis infection: prospective cohort study in the United States and Canada. *The International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease.*  2013;17(4):473-479.
- 52. Sterling TR, Villarino ME, Borisov AS, et al. Three Months of Rifapentine and Isoniazid for Latent Tuberculosis Infection. *New England Journal of Medicine.*  2011;365(23):2155-2166.
- 53. Belknap R, Borisov AS, Holland DP, et al. Adherence to Once-Weekly Self-Administered Isoniazid and Rifapentine for Latent TB infection: iAdhere [Abstract]. 2015 Conference on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections.
- 54. Kopanoff DE, Snider DE, Jr., Caras GJ. Isoniazid-Related Hepatitis. *American Review of Respiratory Disease.* 1978;117:991-1001.
- 55. AHRQ. *Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project National Inpatient Sample.* U.S. Health and Human Services 2015.
- 56. Rogan W, Gladen B. Estimating Prevalence from the Results of a Screening Test. *American Journal of Epidemiology.* 1978;107(1):71-76.
- 57. Pérez A, Brown HS, Restrepo BI. Association between tuberculosis and diabetes in the Mexican border and non-border regions of Texas. *The American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene.* 2006;74(4):604-611.
- 58. Salgame P, Geadas C, Collins L, Jones-López E, Ellner JJ. Latent tuberculosis infection – Revisiting and revising concepts. *Tuberculosis.* 2015;95(4):373-384.
- 59. Ferebee S. Controlled chemoprophylaxis trials in tuberculosis. A general review. *Bibliotheca tuberculosea.* 1970;26:28-106.
- 60. Winston CA, Navin TR. Birth cohort effect on latent tuberculosis infection prevalence, United States. *BMC Infectious Diseases.* 2010;10(1):206.
- 61. Moran A, Harbour DV, Teeter LD, Musser JM, Graviss EA. Is Alcohol Use Associated With Cavitary Disease in Tuberculosis ? 2007;31(1):33-38.
- 62. Taylor Z, Marks SM, Ríos Burrows NM, Weis SE, Stricof RL, Miller B. Causes and costs of hospitalization of tuberculosis patients in the United States. *The International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease.* 2000;4(10):931-939.
- 63. CDC. *Reported tuberculosis in the United States, 2014.* Atlanta, GA: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, CDC;October 2015.
- 64. Moonan PK, Ghosh S, Oeltmann JE, Kammerer JS, Cowan LS, Navin TR. Using Genotyping and Geospatial Scanning to Estimate Recent Mycobacterium tuberculosis Transmission , United States. 2012;18(3).