

PEER REVIEW HISTORY

BMJ Open publishes all reviews undertaken for accepted manuscripts. Reviewers are asked to complete a checklist review form (<http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/resources/checklist.pdf>) and are provided with free text boxes to elaborate on their assessment. These free text comments are reproduced below.

ARTICLE DETAILS

TITLE (PROVISIONAL)	Father's roles and perspectives on healthcare seeking for children with pneumonia: Findings of a qualitative study in a rural community of the Philippines
AUTHORS	Sato, Mari; Oshitani, Hitoshi; Tamaki, Raita; Oyamada, Nobuko; Sato, Kineko; Nadra, Alkaff; Landicho, Jhoys; Alday, Portia; Lupisan, Socorro; Tallo, Veronica

VERSION 1 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Shally Awasthi King George's Medical University, Lucknow, India
REVIEW RETURNED	08-May-2018

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>This is an interesting study where authors have collected information on fathers perspective on caring for their children with pneumonia. These were fathers of children who had participated in a previous pneumonia study. There are certain issues with the study</p> <p>a) It appears that a convenience sample of fathers was selected. Why were only 12 fathers selected? Of these 8 had experienced previous hospitalization of their children. The authors themselves know that this is limitation of their work yet did nothing to rectify it.</p> <p>b) No mention has been made about the qualitative research theory used in this work or for that matter research model being tested.</p> <p>c) Since only semi-structured interviews were done no data triangulation was possible to test for consistency of responses.</p> <p>d) Conclusions state that "It is crucial to address the issues associated with the medical cost and the credibility of health facilities to improve fathers' health seeking behaviour" and are not aligned with the objectives. arch on fathers' roles, perspectives and experiences are limited, whereas research on mothers is available. This study objectives were to assess "fathers' actions and perspectives with respect to the selection of care and treatment for children with pneumonia"</p>
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	Alessandra Bazzano PhD, MPH Tulane University, USA
REVIEW RETURNED	09-Jul-2018

GENERAL COMMENTS	The authors have selected an important topic to address, but the qualitative methods as described are not sufficient to provide reassurance to readers that the study has been appropriately conducted and reported. The authors are suggested to review the COREQ guidelines and to revise the study design & methodology sections extensively to align with these required elements.
-------------------------	--

	http://www.equator-network.org/reporting-guidelines/coreq/ Once this has been done, the manuscript should be reviewed, but review cannot be conducted until this quality assurance step has been met. At present the paper does not provide appropriate detail to allow for review.
--	--

REVIEWER	Camielle Noordam Fontys, The Netherlands
REVIEW RETURNED	18-Jul-2018

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>Dear authors,</p> <p>As you rightfully mention, it is of crucial importance to focus on fathers' perspectives on illness and care seeking in order to better understand what is required to decrease childhood morbidity and mortality.</p> <p>Below are some aspects which you might want to consider.</p> <p>Consistency with regard to the objective/ aim throughout the paper, including the abstract. In the title you state that the manuscript focusses on the 'perspectives' and 'challenges', while elsewhere you state that it is about aspects such as: 'roles', 'actions', 'responsibilities', 'perspectives', 'behavior' and/ or 'experiences'.</p> <p>Page 5, these are your key messages; however, they are currently still rather 'weak'. As this section will be the most read section of the paper, I suggest you to have a second/ third look at it. For example, the grammar of the first is rather poor. You could possibly consider: "While previous studies have focused on mothers in regard to care-seeking behavior for their children, this study reveals that the role of fathers is of key importance when aiming to identify challenges in accessing care". Also I suggest to have a second look at the other two points. The third could be strengthened by: "While this study was only conducted in a rural municipality in the Philippines, it does suggest that medical cost and credibility of health facilities are likely to affect care-seeking behavior in similar settings." Please don't feel obliged to copy the above, they are only suggestions to strengthen this section.</p> <p>Background:</p> <p>The second sentence on page 6 (line 10) is incorrect. The proven interventions are not pneumonia, diarrhea and malaria.</p> <p>Page 6 (line 32) you state that antibiotics are available in most health facilities in LMIC, I suggest to only refer to Philippines. There is such a wide variation in availability of antibiotics, that I would not generalize here.</p> <p>Page 7 (line 20) seems to be a description of the research methods. Suggest to only have the aim clarified in the background section.</p>
-------------------------	--

	<p>Methods:</p> <p>Page 7 (line 46) suggest to add 'semi-structured' to the study design.</p> <p>Results:</p> <p>Page 13 (table 2 and 3) 'father has limited knowledge about pneumonia/ medicine'. Is this a conclusion from the authors, or statement of the fathers? Overall the results could benefit from a second/third review, whereby you focus on consistencies and ensure that it (solely) reflects a fathers perspective.</p> <p>Page 18, line 10. Is [29] a reference to Mirzaei et al? Why do you have a reference in your results?</p> <p>Discussion:</p> <p>Overall your discussion is interesting, in some sections it is however unclear if you are referring to your own study or to literature. For example page 20, line 12 states: "fathers also play an important role in arranging money for treatment", while this sentence does have a reference, it would read easier if you would clarify this in the written text. For example, As confirmed by other studies, fathers play an important role in arranging the money for treatment. This as they</p> <p>Line 24, page 20: I assume it is "... SES score was associated with a "higher" incidence of a pneumonia-like episode..."</p> <p>Conclusion:</p> <p>There seems to be an emphasis on the lack of knowledge; however, it must be clarified if this was their perception. If not, I believe quantitative research is required to strengthen such conclusions and that you might have other conclusions which you might want to address here (which appear stronger from your study, e.g. elaborate on credibility of health facilities, differences in perceptions and involving fathers in care-seeking activities/ programs).</p> <p>Therefore, this manuscript is valuable as the study area is under-researched. However, the manuscript could benefit from one or two more reviews, to ensure that the text is more consistent, the key messages/ 'red-line' are/ is clarified and grammar errors are removed.</p>
--	--

VERSION 1 – AUTHOR RESPONSE

Reviewer: 1

This is an interesting study where authors have collected information on fathers perspective on caring for their children with pneumonia. These were fathers of children who had participated in a previous pneumonia study. There are certain issues with the study

1. It appears that a convenience sample of fathers was selected. Why were only 12 fathers selected? Of these 8 had experienced previous hospitalization of their children. The authors themselves know that this is limitation of their work yet did nothing to rectify it.

Thank you for your comments.

We selected the study site where we conducted the cohort study for several years because we had extensive information based on which we could select our participants. As we mentioned in the manuscript, we selected 12 fathers whose children had pneumonia-like episodes within the six months prior to the interviews. Our data suggested that siblings of children with pneumonia-like episodes are more likely to have had past hospitalizations. In addition, most of our study subjects had three or more children. Therefore we believe that it is still reasonable for 8 out of 12 fathers to have experienced previous hospitalizations.

2. No mention has been made about the qualitative research theory used in this work or for that matter research model being tested.

Thank you for your comments.

We employed the theory of planned behaviour (TPB) to discuss what factors influenced their intention when fathers selected care and treatment for their children. We did not ask the questions based on the TPB items – intention, attitude, subjective norms, and perceived behaviour control – because we expected and hoped to obtain the entire picture of fathers' views and did not want to narrow our focus.

3. Since only semi-structured interviews were done no data triangulation was possible to test for consistency of responses.

Thank you for your comments. We have included the following sentence in the limitations:

'Second, this study was conducted in just one rural municipality of the Philippines which is located in a remote island, and the interviews were conducted with only 12 fathers'. (p.25)

4. Conclusions state that "It is crucial to address the issues associated with the medical cost and the credibility of health facilities to improve fathers' health seeking behaviour" and are not aligned with the objectives. arch on fathers' roles, perspectives and experiences are limited, whereas research on mothers is available. This study objectives were to assess "fathers' actions and perspectives with respect to the selection of care and treatment for children with pneumonia"

Thank you for your comments. We have changed the conclusion as follows:

'Fathers in our study tended to take responsibility for caring for their sick children and made treatment decisions when their children had pneumonia-like episodes. They usually waited and observed their sick children at home or relied on traditional healers before using formal health facilities. Arranging money for the treatment of their sick children was their major role. Regarding their role in deciding the treatment options, health care providers need to understand fathers' roles and perspectives when formulating health education programs. It is crucial to consider cultural backgrounds such as local beliefs. It is also imperative to address issues related to medical cost and the credibility of health facilities to improve fathers' healthcare seeking behaviours'. (p.25–26)

'It is crucial to consider the cultural background and also imperative to address issues related to medical cost and the credibility of health facilities to improve fathers' healthcare seeking behaviour'. (p4: Abstract)

Reviewer: 2

The authors have selected an important topic to address, but the qualitative methods as described are not sufficient to provide reassurance to readers that the study has been appropriately conducted and reported. The authors are suggested to review the COREQ guidelines and to revise the study design & methodology sections extensively to align with these required elements. <http://www.equator-network.org/reporting-guidelines/coreq/> Once this has been done, the manuscript should be reviewed, but review cannot be conducted until this quality assurance step has been met. At present the paper does not provide appropriate detail to allow for review.

Thank you for your suggestion.

We have prepared the consolidated criteria for reporting qualitative studies (COREQ): 32-item checklist as a separate file.

The criteria we could not follow were included in the limitations. (p.25)

Reviewer: 3

As you rightfully mention, it is of crucial importance to focus on fathers' perspectives on illness and care seeking in order to better understand what is required to decrease childhood morbidity and mortality. In the file attached are some comments you might want to consider.

1. Consistency with regard to the objective/aim throughout the paper, including the abstract. In the title you state that the manuscript focuses on the "perspectives" and "challenges" while elsewhere you state that it is about aspects such as; "roles, actions, responsibilities, perspectives, behavior and/or experiences"

Thank you for your comments. We re-read your suggestion, and we realized that there were some inconsistent sentences in the manuscript. We have changed the title, objectives, and other parts as follows:

'Fathers' roles and perspectives on healthcare seeking for children with pneumonia: Findings of a qualitative study in a rural community of the Philippines' (Title, p.1)

'This study aims to reveal fathers' roles and perspectives with respect to the selection of care and treatment for children with pneumonia in a remote island of the Philippines'. (Abstract, p.3)

'This study was conducted to reveal fathers' roles and perspectives on the selection of care and treatment for childhood pneumonia in a remote island of the Philippines' (p.8)

2. Page5. These are your key messages; however, they are currently still rather "weak". As this section will be the most read section of the paper, I suggest you to have a second/third look at it. For example, the grammar of the first is rather poor. You could possibly consider: "While previous studies have focused on mothers in regard to care-seeking behavior for their children, this study reveals that the role of fathers is of key importance when aiming to identify challenges in accessing care". Also I suggested having a second look at the other two points. The third could be strengthened by: "While this study was only considered in a rural municipality in the Philippines, it does suggest that medical cost and credibility of health facilities are likely to affect care-seeking behaviour in similar settings. "Please do not feel obliged to copy the above; they are only suggestion to strengthen this section.

Thank you for your suggestion. We have changed the key messages as follows:

- While most of previous studies focused on mothers' healthcare seeking behaviour for their children with pneumonia, this study emphasized the roles and perspectives of fathers, which are of key importance when making a final decision in healthcare seeking.
- We employed the framework of the theory of planned behaviour to discuss what factors influenced fathers' intention in selecting care and treatment for their children with pneumonia.
- While this study only considered a rural municipality in the Philippines and interviews were conducted with only 12 fathers, it does suggest that the medical cost and credibility of health facilities are likely to affect healthcare seeking behaviour in similar settings. (p.5)

3. The 2nd sentence on page 6 (line 10) is incorrect. The proven interventions are not pneumonia, diarrhea and malaria.

Thank you for your comment. We have corrected this sentence as follows:

“Most of these deaths occur in low- and middle-income countries owing to preventable or treatable infectious diseases such as pneumonia, diarrhoea, and malaria.” (p.6)

4. Page 6 (line 32). You state that antibiotics are available in most health facilities in LMIC, I suggest to only referring to Philippines. There is such a wide variation in availability of antibiotics, that I would not generalize here.

Thank you for your comment. We have changed the sentence according to your suggestion as below: “Effective antibiotics for bacterial pneumonia are usually available in most health facilities in the Philippines.”(p.6)

5. Page7 (line 20) seems to be a description of the research methods. Suggest to only having the aim clarified in the background section.

Thank you for your suggestion. We have moved this description from the background to the methods section. (p.8)

6. Page7 (line46) suggests adding “semi-structured” to the study design.

Thank you for your recommendation. Since we have explained the semi-structured interviews in the data collection section, we did not mention it in the design section as well. However, according to your suggestion, we have added the following sentence:

“This study employed a qualitative investigation method using semi-structured individual interviews.”(p.7-8)

7. Page 13 (table2 and 3) “father has limited knowledge about pneumonia/medicine”. Is this a conclusion from the authors, or statement of the fathers? Overall the results could benefit from a second/third review, whereby you focus on consistencies and ensure that it reflects a father’s perspectives.

Thank you for your comment. We reconsidered the statements on codes and subcategories and changed these parts according to your suggestion as follows:

‘Some fathers do not know about pneumonia’ (Table 2, p.14)

‘Some fathers do not have enough knowledge about medication’ (Table 3, p.17)

8. Page18 (line10). Is [29] a reference to Mizaei et al? Why do you have a reference in your result?

Thank you for your comment. We inserted this reference as we thought that readers may not understand the meaning of piang. However, we have now explained this in the discussion section and we have changed the sentence as follows in the results section:

‘Sometimes when the child had fever, people said the child had piang (sprain or dislocation of tissues or bones)’. (p.18–19)

9. Overall your discussion is interesting in some sections it is however unclear if you are referring to you own study or to literature. For example page 20 (line 12) states, “ father also play an important role in arranging money for treatment” while this sentence dose have a references. It would read

easier if you would clarify this in the written text. For example, as confirmed by other studies, father plays an important role in arranging the money for treatment. This as they....

Thank you for your suggestion. We have changed the sentences as below:

'As confirmed by previous studies, fathers play an important role in financing for child care.³³ They recognized this as their responsibility and attempted to fulfil it. In this study, it was found that paying incidental costs, such as those for medicine, posed a significant problem for fathers when healthcare facilities including hospitals could not provide free medication for their children'.(p.22)

10. Page20 (line 24) I assume it is "...SES score associated with a "higher" incidence of a pneumonia-like episode..."

Thank you for your comments. We have added "higher" as follows:

'Our study participants were generally poor, and our previous study conducted in Biliran Island indicated that low SES score was associated with a higher incidence of pneumonia-like episodes'. (p.21)

11. There seems to be an emphasis on the lack of knowledge; however, it must be clarified if this was their perception. If not, I believe quantitative research is required to strengthen such conclusions and that you might have other conclusions which you might want to address here(which appear stronger from your study, e.g. elaborate on credibility of health facilities, differences in perceptions and involving fathers in care-seeking activities/programs).

Thank you for your comments.

As we mentioned in the results section, we found that some fathers did not have enough knowledge of medication such as antibiotics; they did not know the names and dosage. Some fathers also did not know about pneumonia. They honestly mentioned that although they had heard of pneumonia, their understanding on pneumonia varied. We discussed these findings using references to previous studies in the discussion section. However, according to your suggestions, we have removed the knowledge issues and changed the conclusion as below:

'Fathers in our study tended to take responsibility for caring for their sick children and made treatment decisions when their children had pneumonia-like episodes. They usually waited and observed their sick children at home or relied on traditional healers before using formal health facilities. Arranging money for the treatment of their sick children was their major role. Regarding their role in deciding the treatment options, healthcare providers need to understand fathers' roles and perspectives when formulating health education programs. It is crucial to consider cultural backgrounds such as local beliefs. It is also imperative to address issues related to medical cost and the credibility of health facilities to improve fathers' health seeking behaviours'. (p.25–26)

VERSION 2 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Alessandra Bazzano Tulane University School of Public Health and Tropical Medicine, USA
REVIEW RETURNED	11-Sep-2018

GENERAL COMMENTS	The authors have sufficiently responded to the comments, and are to be congratulated for good work in presenting their findings on an important topic.
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	A.C. Noordam Fontys, The Netherlands
-----------------	---

REVIEW RETURNED	23-Sep-2018
GENERAL COMMENTS	An interesting manuscript, to my opinion it is now ready for publication.