

**Supplementary file 1 Designs of articles related to ADR information extraction on social media (replicated from Sarker et al, reference 4 in the main manuscript)**

| Author(s)<br>year     | Social media  | Corpus size<br>& number of<br>drugs   | Compa-<br>rator <sup>a</sup>   | Gold standard (GS) features |                                      |   |  |
|-----------------------|---|---|--|-----------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|                       |   |   |  | Corpus<br>size <sup>a</sup> | Randoml<br>y<br>sampled <sup>a</sup> | Sample<br>size<br>calcula-<br>tion <sup>a</sup> | GS perfor-<br>mance<br>evaluation <sup>a</sup>                 |
| Benton<br>2011 [42]   | 11 websites<br>(breastcancer.org,<br>komen.org,<br>csn.cancer.org,<br>bcsupport.org,<br>healthboards.com,<br>cancercompass.com,<br>webmd.com,<br>dailystrength.org,<br>dailystrength.org,<br>revolutionhealth.com,<br>ehealthforum.com,<br>oprah.com) | 1,100<br>messages; 4<br>breast<br>cancer drugs  | Drug label   | -                           | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Bian 2012<br>[27]     | Twitter   | 2,000,000,000<br>tweets;<br>investigation<br>al drugs used<br>in cancer<br>treatment<br>clinical trials   | FAERS<br>(FDA)   | -                           | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Chee 2011<br>[43]     | Health and<br>Wellness<br>Yahoo! groups   | 12,519,807<br>messages; 4<br>drugs<br>withdrawn<br>from the<br>market   | FDA<br>watchlist<br>(drug that<br>have an<br>active<br>FDA<br>safety<br>alert<br>posted) | -                           | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Freifeld<br>2014 [28] | Twitter   | 61,401 (or<br>61,402)<br>tweets incl<br>4,401 *proto-<br>AEs (posts<br>with<br>'resemblance<br>to AEs') vs<br>57,000 no<br>proto-AEs;<br>23 drugs | AEs in<br>FAERS at<br>SOC level  | -                           | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Ginn 2014<br>[29]     | Twitter   | 71,571<br>tweets; 74<br>drugs   | 2<br>annotator<br>s with<br>medical<br>or  | 10,822<br>tweets            | yes                                  | Maximu<br>m 300-<br>500<br>tweets<br>per        | P,R,<br>Fscore vs<br>1 <sup>st</sup><br>annotator<br>+ Cohen's |

| Author(s)<br>year               | Social media  | Corpus size<br>& number of<br>drugs                          | Compa-<br>rator <sup>a</sup>  | Gold standard (GS) features   |                                      |   |  |
|---------------------------------|---|--|---|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|                                 |   |  |   | Corpus<br>size <sup>a</sup>   | Randoml<br>y<br>sampled <sup>a</sup> | Sample<br>size<br>calcula-<br>tion <sup>a</sup> | GS perfor-<br>mance<br>evaluation <sup>a</sup>         |
|                                 |   |  | biological<br>science<br>backgrou<br>nd;<br>Weekly<br>meetings<br>for<br>confused<br>instances.<br>For this<br>paper, the<br>1st<br>annotator<br>= Gold<br>Standard |   |                                      | drugs   | Kappa  |
| Hadzi-<br>Puric 2012<br>[30]    | 8 parenting<br>forum  | 1,290 posts;<br>9 drugs                                      | 2<br>annotator<br>s<br>experienc<br>ed in<br>pharmacy<br>and<br>research,<br>clinical<br>research<br>and<br>pediatric<br>care<br>practice)<br>+<br>literature       | 990   | NR                                   | NR  | NR   |
| Jiang and<br>Zheng<br>2013 [44] | Twitter   | 6,829 tweets;<br>5 drugs                                     | NLM<br>MedLineP<br>lus Drug<br>Informatio<br>n Site ;<br>PatientsLi<br>keMe   | -   | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Leaman<br>2010 [31]             | DailyStrength   | 6,890<br>comments; 6<br>drugs, only 4<br>with<br>annotations | 2<br>annotator<br>s<br>experienc<br>ed in<br>biology,<br>nursing,<br>clinical<br>research,<br>drug<br>surveillan<br>ce  | 3,600 incl.<br>450<br>(system<br>developme<br>nt) + 150<br>(validation) | yes                                  | NR  | Cohen's<br>kappa<br>(w/o<br>span),<br>IAA (w/<br>span) |
| Liu et Chen<br>2013 [32]        | American<br>Diabetes<br>Association<br>(community.dia<br>betes.org) | 185,874<br>posts;<br>1,348,364<br>sentences; -<br>drugs      | Manual<br>annotatio<br>n  | 200 relation<br>instances   | NR                                   | NR  | NR   |
| Nikfarjam                       | DailyStrength   | 6,890  | 2 experts   | 3,600   | yes                                  | NR  | NR   |

| Author(s)<br>year                    | Social media              | Corpus size<br>& number of<br>drugs   | Compa-<br>rator <sup>a</sup>  | Gold standard (GS) features  |                                      |   |  |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------------|---|---|--|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|                                      |                           |   |   | Corpus<br>size <sup>a</sup>  | Randoml<br>y<br>sampled <sup>a</sup> | Sample<br>size<br>calcula-<br>tion <sup>a</sup>   | GS perfor-<br>mance<br>evaluation <sup>a</sup>   |
| and<br>Gonzales<br>2011 [33]         |                           | comments; 4<br>drugs  | annotator<br>s  | annotated<br>comments;<br>incl. 1,200<br>comments<br>(evaluation)  |                                      |   |  |
| Nikfarjam<br>and Sarker<br>2015 [34] | DailyStrength,<br>Twitter | DailyStrength<br>: 6,279<br>comments,<br>Twitter:<br>1,784 tweets<br>+<br>Unsupervise<br>d learning on<br>DailyStrength<br>313,833<br>comments,<br>Twitter:<br>397,729<br>tweets; 81<br>drugs   | 2 experts<br>annotator<br>s<br>supervise<br>d by an<br>expert<br>pharmaco<br>logist | 6,279<br>DailyStreng<br>th incl.<br>4720<br>(training)+1<br>559(validati<br>on); 1,784<br>tweets incl.<br>1340<br>(training)+4<br>44<br>(validation),<br>with<br>complete<br>IAA only              | NR                                   | NR  | Cohen's<br>kappa<br>(approxim<br>ate<br>matching)  |
| O'Connor<br>2014 [35]                | Twitter                   | 1,873 tweets;<br>54 drugs   | 2 expert<br>annotator<br>s  | 10,822<br>(classificati<br>on<br>'hasADR'<br>vs<br>'noADR');<br>1,873<br>(automatic<br>ADR<br>information<br>extraction =<br>1,008<br>'hasADR' +<br>ca 1,000<br>random<br>selection of<br>'noADR') | yes                                  | Maximu<br>m 300-<br>500<br>tweets<br>per<br>drugs | IAA<br>(span,<br>concept<br>ID, binary<br>classificati<br>on) +<br>kappa<br>(binary<br>classificati<br>on) |
| Patki 2014<br>[36]                   | Dailystrength             | 20,486<br>comments<br>10,399<br>normal<br>drugs, and<br>7,327 drugs<br>with FDA-<br>issued<br>blackbox<br>warning; and<br>2,760<br>withdrawn<br>drugs10,617<br>for Machine<br>Learning; 38<br>chronic<br>disease and<br>conditions<br>drugs AND | 2 domain<br>experts<br>under the<br>guidance<br>of a<br>pharmaco<br>logy<br>expert  | 10,617 user<br>comments  | NR                                   | NR  | Cohen's<br>kappa   |

| Author(s)<br>year                           | Social media                               | Corpus size<br>& number of<br>drugs   | Compa-<br>rator <sup>a</sup>  | Gold standard (GS) features   |                                      |   |  |
|---|--|---|---|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|   |  |   |   | Corpus<br>size <sup>a</sup>   | Randoml<br>y<br>sampled <sup>a</sup> | Sample<br>size<br>calcula-<br>tion <sup>a</sup> | GS perfor-<br>mance<br>evaluation <sup>a</sup> |
|   |  | high prevalence of use (20 normal + 18 with FDA blackbox warning)                     |   |   |                                      |   |  |
| Sampathkumar 2014 [37]                      | medications.com;<br>steadyhealth.com       | Medications.com: 8,065 posts<br>SteadyHealth.com: 29,981 posts; 760 common drug names | Manual review   | 2,000 messages (medications.com) incl. 500 msg automatically annotated positive + 1500 msg automatically annotated negative           | NR                                   | NR  | NR   |
| Sarker and Gonzales 2015 [38]               | Twitter,<br>DailyStrength                  | Twitter: 10,617 tweets; 74 drugs<br>DailyStrength: Over 25,000 comments; 56 drugs     | 2 manual annotators under guidance of a 1 pharmacology expert; disagreement resolved by pharmacology expert | 10,822 instances (Twitter) incl. 1,082 tweets (10% of corpus) for IAA; 10,617 instances (DailyStrength), incl. 10% of corpus) for IAA | yes                                  | 10% of corpus                                   | Cohen's kappa                                  |
| Segura-Bedmar 2014 [39]                     | ForumClinic                                | 400 comments; 187 drugs   | 2 annotators with expertise in pharmacovigilance; disagreement resolved by a third annotator                | 400 comments  | yes                                  | NR  | Fscore   |
| Yang and Yang and Jiang and Zhang 2012 [46] | MedHelp                                    | 6,244 threads; 10 drugs   | FDA watchlist   | -   | -                                    | -   | -  |
| Yang and Wang 2013 [40]                     | Yahoo ! groups (ProzacAwareness, SSRIssex) | 6,400 posts; 2 drugs  | 3 independent medical domain  | 6,400 posts   | no (entire GS corpus)                | 200 most frequent ADRs descripti                | NR   |

| Author(s)<br>year                          | Social media  | Corpus size<br>& number of<br>drugs   | Compa-<br>rator <sup>a</sup>   | Gold standard (GS) features                |                                      |  |  |
|--|---|---|--|--|--------------------------------------|--|--|
|  |   |   |  | Corpus<br>size <sup>a</sup>                | Randoml<br>y<br>sampled <sup>a</sup> | Sample<br>size<br>calcula-<br>tion <sup>a</sup>  | GS perfor-<br>mance<br>evaluation <sup>a</sup> |
|  |   |   | experts  |  |                                      | on<br>keyword<br>er; then<br>900<br>threads<br>from<br>each<br>forum<br>which<br>contain<br>the most<br>mention<br>s of<br>these<br>ADRS |  |
| Yates and<br>Goharian<br>2013 [41]         | askpatient.com<br>; drugs.com;<br>drugratingz.co<br>m | 2,500 user<br>reviews; 5<br>breast<br>cancer drugs                                  | Manual<br>annotatio<br>n   | 125<br>(training) +<br>125<br>(validation) | NR                                   | 10% of<br>the<br>corpus  | NR   |
| Yeleswara<br>pu 2014<br>[47]               | PatientsLikeMe<br>, DayliStrength<br>MediGuard        | 13,500<br>comments ;<br>12 drugs<br>(from Wang<br>JAMIA 2009<br>and Leaman<br>2010) | FDA<br>Label<br>informatio<br>n  | -  | -                                    | -  | -  |
| Yang and<br>Yang and<br>Jiang 2014<br>[45] | MedHelp   | 16,339<br>threads; 20<br>drugs<br>extracted<br>with more<br>than 500<br>threads     | FDA SRS<br>(MedWatc<br>h); 5 ADR<br>alerted by<br>FDA<br>chosen<br>on the<br>principle<br>that the<br>drugs<br>should<br>share as<br>many<br>ADRs as<br>possible | -  | -                                    | -  | -  |

<sup>a</sup> additional columns to [1]

IAA inter annotator agreement

NA not applicable

NR not reported

P precision

R recall

#### Reference:

Sarker A, Ginn R, Nikfarjam A, O'Connor K, Smith K, Jayaraman S, et al. Utilizing social media data for pharmacovigilance: a review. J Biomed Inform 2015 Apr; 54: 202-212