

BMJ Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (http://bmjopen.bmj.com).

If you have any questions on BMJ Open's open peer review process please email info.bmjopen@bmj.com

### **BMJ Open**

## Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A respondent-driven sampling study from 11 major towns

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-028247
Article Type:	Research
Date Submitted by the Author:	28-Nov-2018
Complete List of Authors:	Amogne, Minilik; Lunds Universitet, social medicin and global health; Ethiopian Public Health Institute, TB/HIV Department Balcha, Taye; Armauer Hansen Research Institute Agardh, Anette; Lund Univ, Clinical Sciences
Keywords:	female sex workers, physical violence, rape, Substance use, Ethiopia

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

### Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A respondent-driven sampling study from 11 major towns

Minilik Demissie Amogne<sup>1,2</sup>, Taye Tolera Balcha<sup>3</sup>, Anette Agardh<sup>1</sup>

Author affiliation

- Social Medicine and Global Health, Department of Clinical Sciences Malmo, Lund University, Malmo, Sweden
- 2. Ethiopian public health institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- 3. Armauer Hansen Research Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Corresponding author

Minilik Demissie Amogne, minilik\_demissie.amogne@med.lu.se

#### **Abstract**

**Objective:** This study examined the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia.

**Design:** A cross-sectional study using respondent-driven sampling was conducted among 4900 FSWs in 11 major towns in Ethiopia in 2014. A structured interview was performed, and blood specimens for HIV, and CD4 testing were collected. Data were examined using descriptive statistics and multiple logistic regression analyses.

**Results:** Among FSWs, 17.5% reported physical beating within the past year and 15.2% reported rape since they started selling sex. FSWs aged 35+ years (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were less exposed to physical beating than those aged 15-24 years. FSWs working on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR1.35,95% CI1.02, 1.78) were more exposed to physical beating than FSWs working in bars/hotels. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), or who chewed khat frequently were significantly more exposed to physical violence. Rape was associated with having a low monthly income, drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33,95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy episodic drinking in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), and chewing khat 3-4 days per week (AOR2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98). Condom breakage was more frequent among FSWs who reported both physical beating (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84) and rape (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55).

**Conclusion:** FSWs in Ethiopia are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, targeted efforts are needed for prevention and harm reduction.

**Key words:** female sex workers, physical violence, rape, substance use, Ethiopia

#### Strengths and limitations of this study

- One of the strengths of this study is that it involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country with a large sample size.
- The second strength is the sampling technique; the study used a respondent-driven sampling technique which is recommended for hard to reach populations.
- However, the study also had limitations. First, sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias.
- Second, recall bias could occur because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they start selling sex.

#### Introduction

As per WHO definition, violence is the intentional use of physical force or power against another person or group, which has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, or sexual or psychological harm (1). Violence against women is a global phenomenon, as more than one in three women worldwide is beaten, coerced into sex or abused in her lifetime (2). Furthermore, violence is one of the main contributors to poor sexual and reproductive health among women, leading to unintended pregnancy, self-induced abortions, gynecologic problems, sexual dysfunction, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs), including HIV (3, 4).

In most countries, female sex work is either illegal or has an uncertain legal status; for example, prostitution is not illegal but approaching sex workers in public is illegal; this makes authorities reluctant to offer protection or support, which in turn legitimizes violence and discrimination against sex workers (5). In the case of Ethiopia, it is illegal to operate a brothel or procure sex workers as a commercial activity, but the sale of sex by women is neither prohibited nor legally recognized as a profession (6). Female sex workers (FSWs) frequently face harassment and violence, not only because of their illegitimate status, but also as a manifestation of gender inequality and discrimination directed towards women (7, 8).

Violence against FSWs can be perpetrated by anyone, including policemen, intimate partners, and clients. In Adama and Mekelle towns in Ethiopia, nearly 60% and 75% of female sex workers, respectively, reported lifetime violence (9, 10). In the same study in Adama, 8% of

FSW reported forced sex since they started sex work (10). In another study conducted among homeless street females in Bahirdar town, 11.4% of them reported having been raped during the last one year period (11). In Uganda, 40% of FSWs reported physical abuse and 49 % had been raped at least once in their lifetime (12). In another study conducted in Hunan, China and Karnataka, India, 16% and 9% of female sex workers, respectively, reported work-related violence (13, 14).

Several risk factors have been found to have an association with physical and sexual violence against FSWs. Socio-economic characteristics, risky sexual behaviors and substance abuse are the most mentioned factors worldwide (9, 10, 15, 16). A randomized controlled trial study in Kenya and South Africa showed that alcohol consumption reduction by FSWs had a significant contribution to violence reduction (17, 18). Moreover, establishments where alcohol and other drugs are consumed, associates with an increased likelihood of people becoming violent towards sex workers (8, 19). However, other studies suggest that FSWs who work outdoors face more violence than those who work indoors (20, 21).

Violence towards FSWs may also be associated with condom use and condom breakage. Studies conducted among FSWs have found several intentional and unintentional factors associated with condom breakages during sex work. These factors included being drunk or high on drugs, wearing unfitting condoms, incorrect condom use, and having violent or rough sex(22, 23). Moreover, violence towards FSWs may also be linked to disagreement over condom use, which increases the risk of acquiring HIV and other STIs (21, 24-26). In Ethiopia, the weighted HIV prevalence among FSWs is estimated to be 23% (27), while it is 1.2 % in the general population (28), which shows the magnitude of the potential risk exposure among FSWs. In addition, violence also prevents sex workers from seeking appropriate health services (26, 29, 30).

In general, 120,000 to 160,000 FSWs are estimated to live in Ethiopia, working in different venues, mainly in bars and hotels, Key-mebrat (red lighthouses), local drinking houses, and on the street (27). Currently, the number of female sex workers is growing, with increasing numbers of young girls entering the sex trade.

This study explores the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia. Successful strategies for handling the trauma may vary by the type of violence experienced. Therefore, identification of risk factors that are specific to various types of violence has the potential to inform the development of evidence-based prevention programs. In addition, generating such types of evidence based on national level data will help to promote more effective prevention for female sex workers.

#### Methods

#### Study design

This study was part of a larger study concerning HIV prevalence and related risk factors among female sex workers and long distance drivers that was carried out in Ethiopia in 2014. A cross-sectional study design using Respondent Driven Sampling technique (RDS) was used for data collection. RDS is a complex sampling method based on a chain-referral design and recommended for hard-to-reach populations. In all 11 towns included as study locations, initial FSW "seeds" were selected to start the sampling process. Seeds were selected purposively to represent the type of sex worker, age category, and geographic location. They were identified through formative assessments with key stakeholders working with FSWs and representatives of FSWs. The selected seeds were those who were well-connected with their community and reported large social networks.

A maximum of three recruits per seed was allowed and only one-time participation was ensured by using a fingerprint scanning device. Recruitment pattern (who recruited whom) was tracked and network size was also determined.

#### Study area, period and population

The study locations were the seven major regional towns and the four main transport corridor towns. The seven major regional towns were: Addis Ababa, Bahirdar, Mekelle, Hawassa, Adama, Gambela, and Dire-dawa. The four transport corridor towns were Semera-Logia (Addis Ababa-Djibouti route), Kombolcha (Addis Ababa-Mekelle route), Metema (Addis Ababa-Metema route) and Shashemene (Addis Ababa -Moyale route).

The source populations were all female sex workers living in those selected eleven towns. For the purpose of the study, female sex workers were defined as follows: 'women who practice sexual activity with the pre-conditions of financial or in-kind benefits'. The inclusion criteria were: receiving money or other benefits for sex with four or more people within the last 30 days, being 15 and above years old, properly recruited by a peer (present with the coupon) and giving consent both for the interview and blood drawing.

#### Sample size

The source study protocol calculated sample size of 400 female sex workers in each town using anticipated HIV prevalence of 25%, 6% precision, 95% CI and design effect of two. However, the number of female sex workers who participated in each town was not exactly 400, and the total number of FSWs who participated in the study was 4900.

#### **Data collection procedure**

Six seed FSWs were selected to initiate coupon-based recruitment. Eligible FSWs who provided informed consent to participate were administered a face to face interview in a private room by a nurse with a structured questionnaire in Amharic language. They then provided blood specimens for HIV, CD4 and viral load testing in a private room. When the process was completed, participants were provided with up to three coupons and instructed to recruit their FSW peers into the study. To compensate the time and costs of transport, a primary incentive of 100 ETB (\$5.0) and additional 50 ETB (\$2.5) for each eligible peer she enrolled into the study was given. An electronic data base for tracking coupons and recruitment was established with participant ID, fingerprint code, and a pre-printed label that was scanned. The data collection tools and questionnaire were pretested in a pilot study; feedbacks from the pilot study was used to finalize the data collection tools and field logistic and operational procedures. The questionnaire included: socio-demographic characteristics, sexual risk exposure, sexual behaviors, condom use, history of STI symptoms, alcohol and drug use consumption, violence related issues, knowledge of HIV transmission, and HIV testing history.

#### **Variables**

Violence was assessed with two dependent variables, which were physical beating during the last one year and rape since sex selling started. The following questions were asked: "When exchanging sex for money during the last one year, have you ever been physically beaten by a sexual partner or client?" and "Have you ever been raped or forced to have sex against your will since you start selling sex?" responses were dichotomized into a Yes and No variable for analysis. For both of the questions, all who had reported beating and rape at least once were considered as exposed to violence (Yes).

The independent measures included current age, monthly income from selling sex, marital status, educational status, sex selling venue, khat chewing, alcohol drinking, HIV status, and condom breakage.

Current age was a continuous variable and for the purpose of analysis was categorized as ten year intervals: younger (15-24), middle age (25-34), and older one (35+), with the younger age group used as the reference category. Monthly income from selling sex was an open-ended question and for the analysis was categorized in to 1000Birr (\$50) intervals considering the cost of living in the country. Educational status was categorized as no formal education, primary first cycle (grade 1-4), primary second cycle (grade 5-8), and secondary and above for analysis, in accordance with the country education system.

In addition, sex workers were categorized based on their sex selling venue, where bar/hotel was used as the reference because it is the most common FSW working venue. In addition, this venue category has better security than the other venues and the numbers of FSWs in this category were higher than the rest.

Alcohol consumption was measured through different approaches including frequency of alcohol consumption, number of drinks per specific day and frequency of heavy episodic drinking (6 or more standard drinks per day). Khat chewing was assessed according to the frequency of days they chewed in a week.

#### **Data analysis**

Statistical analysis was performed using SPSS Version 20. Descriptive statistics were used to provide summary measures (means, frequencies). Odds ratios (crude and adjusted) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) were obtained using bivariate and multivariate logistic regression analysis. Those independent variables significantly associated with the outcome variable in the bivariate analysis were included in the multivariate analysis. Cases with missing data were excluded from the analyses. Significance was accepted at p-value <0.05.

#### **Ethical considerations**

Permission for data use was obtained from the Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI). The protocol was cleared at the Scientific and Ethical Research Office (SERO) of EPHI, the Ethiopian Science and Technology Ministry Ethical Committee, and CDC-Atlanta IRB. Individual written informed consent was obtained from each participant for the interview and blood sample collection while the study was conducted.

#### Results

#### Socio-demographic and other background characteristics

A total of 4900 female sex workers participated in the study. Demographic, socioeconomic and other background characteristics of the participants are shown in Table 1. The majority of the participants were between 15 to 24 years old with a mean age of 24 years (SD= 5.7); 44 % of them were divorced, separated or widowed. A quarter of them reported being uneducated and 40% of them earned on average less than \$50 per month. Regarding sex selling starting age, the majority started selling sex between the ages of 18-24 years, although nearly 25% started before the age of 18. FSWs worked in different eating, drinking and recreation establishments and also other venues; 33% recruited their clients in bars/hotels, followed by 26.5% on the street and 20% in local drinking houses (Table 1).

Table 1. Distribution of socio-demographic and other background characteristics among
4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage

Age		
15-24	2831	57.8
25-34	1700	34.7
35+	369	7.5
Total	4900	100.0
Missing	0	
Mean age of respondents = 24.16 SD= 5.7		
<b>Educational status</b>		
No Education	1224	25.0
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	764	16.0
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	2062	42.0
Secondary & above	831	17.0
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel	1613	33.0
Local drinking houses	983	20.1
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	261	5.3
Red Light houses	429	8.8
Street	1295	26.5
Others	304	6.2
Total	4885	100.0
Missing	15	
Current marital status		
Never Married	2698	55.2
Married/Cohabited	37	0.8
Separated/Divorced	1976	40.5
Widowed	173	3.5
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Sex selling starting age		
Less than 15	120	2.5
15 - 17	1088	22.3
18 - 24	2864	58.7
25 - 29	583	12.0
30 & Above	220	4.5
Total	4875	100.0

Missing	25	
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 (<\$50)	1932	39.6
1001 – 2000 (\$50-\$100)	1554	31.8
2001 – 3000 (\$100-\$150)	812	16.6
3001 – 4000 (\$150-\$200)	318	6.5
4001 – 5000 (\$200-\$250)	150	3.1
Above 5000 (>\$250)	117	2.4
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	17	

#### Behavioral and other related factors

Table 2 shows the prevalence of behavioral and other factors. The majority (70%) of the respondents consumed alcohol and of those, 15.8% had drunk so much on a typical day within the past 30 days that they did not remember what happened the next day. About half of the respondents chewed khat and 23.8% of them chewed almost every day (5-7 days a week).

Regarding condom use, 25.5% of them reported condom breakage within the past 30 days prior to the study. HIV/AIDS status of the respondents was also assessed and a quarter of them (23%) were HIV positive. With regard to physical and sexual violence experience, 17.5% of them reported physical beating within the past 12 months and 15.2% reported having been raped since they started selling sex. (Table 2)

Table 2. Behavioral and other related factors among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Frequency alcohol consumption		
Never	1493	30.6
Once a month or less	222	4.5
2 - 4 days a month	492	10.1
2 - 3 days a week	1394	28.5
4 or more days a week	1283	26.3
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Alcohol containing drinks on a typic	al day	
1 or 2	806	23.8

3 or 4	1383	40.8
5 or 6	742	21.9
7 to 9	296	8.7
10 or more	164	4.8
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Frequency of heavy episodic drinkin	g	
Never	1863	54.9
Less than monthly	236	7.0
Monthly	299	8.8
Weekly	630	18.6
Daily or almost daily	363	10.7
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Drunk so much and can't remember	,	
what happened the next day		
Yes, in last 30 days	534	15.8
Yes, not in last 30 days	233	6.9
No	2609	77.2
Don't remember	4	0.1
Total	3380	100.0
Missing	11	
Frequency of khat chewing		
Never	2431	49.8
Less than once a week	577	11.8
1-2 days per week	429	8.8
3-4 days per week	284	5.8
5-7 days per week	1162	23.8
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	17	100.0
Condom breakage in the past 30 day		
Yes	1243	25.5
No	3635	74.5
Total	4878	
Missing	22	
HIV status		
Negative	3708	76.0
Positive	1173	24.0
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	
Ever been raped or forced to have se		
since start selling sex		
No	4142	84.8
Yes	742	15.2
Total	4884	100.0

Missing	16	
Physically beaten in the last 12 mont	ths	
No	4026	82.5
Yes	855	17.5
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	

#### Bivariate regression analysis outcome

Table 3 shows the bivariate logistic regression results; each independent variable was analyzed separately against the two outcome variables. The variables that were significantly associated with physical violence were: age, educational level, monthly income, current marital status, sex selling venues, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. Variables significantly associated with rape were: educational level, income from selling sex, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. HIV status was not significantly associated with either physical violence or rape.

Table 3. Bivariate logistic regression analyses results of independent variables associated with physically beaten in the last 12 months and ever been raped since start selling sex, odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI)

Variables	Physical beating OR (95% CI)	Rape OR (95% CI)
Age		,
15-24*		
25-34	1.02 (0.87, 1.19)	1.02 (0.86, 1.21)
35+	0.52 (0.37, 0.74)	0.88 (0.64, 1.20)
<b>Educational level</b>	, , ,	, , ,
No Education*		
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	1.01 (0.79, 1.31)	1.45 (1.14,1.85)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	1.35 (1.11, 1.63)	1.08 (0.88,1.32)
Secondary & above	1.49 (1.18, 1.87)	1.09 (0.85,1.41)
Monthly income from selling sex	, , ,	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *		
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.44 (1.20, 1.73)	0.69 (0.58, 0.85)

2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.67 (1.35, 2.07)	0.51 (0.39, 0.66)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.61 (1.19, 2.17)	0.65 (0.46, 0.92)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	2.12 (1.44, 3.14)	1.01 (0.66, 1.55)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.62 (1.01, 2.58)	0.75 (0.44, 1.27)
Current marital status		
Never Married*		
Married/Cohabited	1.05 (0.46, 2.41)	0.69 (0.24, 1.96)
Separated/Divorced	0.93 (0.80, 1.09)	1.03 (0.88, 1.21)
Widowed	0.59 (0.37, 0.95)	1.39 (0.95, 2.06)
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel*		
Local drinking houses	0.87 (0.69, 1.09)	-
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	0.45 (0.28, 0.71)	-
Red Light houses	0.95 (0.71, 1.27)	-
Street	1.51 (1.26, 1.82)	-
Others	1.37 (1.01, 1.86)	-
Frequency alcohol consumption	, , ,	
Never*		
2 - 4 days a month	1.82 (1.35, 2.44)	1.74 (1.27, 2.38)
2 - 3 days a week	2.07 (1.66, 2.57)	1.87 (1.48, 2.36)
4 or more days a week	3.54 (2.87, 4.37)	3.43 (2.75, 4.28)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day		
1 or 2*		
3 or 4	1.39 (1.09, 1.76)	1.16 (0.92, 1.46)
5 or 6	2.03 (1.58, 2.62)	1.09 (0.84, 1.43)
7 to 9	2.19 (1.59, 3.03)	0.98 (0.68, 1.41)
10 or more	2.76 (1.88, 4.03)	1.78 (1.20, 2.65)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking		
Never* Less than monthly	1 42 (1 02 1 00)	1 20 (0 00 1 05)
Monthly	1.43 (1.03, 1.98)	1.39 (0.99, 1.95)
Weekly	1.23 (0.90, 1.66)	1.59 (1.18, 2.13)
Daily or almost daily	1.73 (1.39, 2.14)	1.03 (0.80, 1.31)
Drunk so much and can't remember what	1.97 (1.53, 2.55)	1.69 (1.29, 2.21)
happened the next day		
No*		
Yes, in the last 30 days	2.90 (2.37, 3.56)	1.66 (1.33, 2.07)
Yes, before last 30 days	2.22 (1.65, 2.99)	1.27 (0.91, 1.78)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week	, , ,	, ,

Never*		
Less than once a week	1.24 (0.96, 1.60)	0.89 (0.67, 1.19)
1-2 days per week	1.67 (1.28, 2.18)	2.89 (2.26, 3.69)
3-4 days per week	2.49 (1.87, 3.34)	2.92 (2.19, 3.89)
5-7 days per week	2.48 (2.08, 2.96)	1.47 (1.21, 1.79)
Condom breakage		
No*		
Yes	1.99 (1.69,2.33)	1.62 (1.37, 1.92)
HIV test result		
Negative* Positive	1.04 (0.88, 1.24)	0.88 (0.73, 1.07)

**Note: \* Reference category** 

#### Multivariate analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten)

Table 4 shows the results of the multivariate analysis used to identify factors associated with physical violence after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers aged 35 years or above (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were significantly less exposed to physical violence when compared with the younger age group (15-24 years). FSWs who attend primary 1st cycle education (AOR 0.71, 95% CI 0.52, 0.97) were also less exposed to physical beating than those who report no education. On the other hand, FSWs who worked on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63,95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) were more exposed to physical violence compared with FSWs who worked in bars/hotels. Moreover, substance use was significantly related to physical violence exposure. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), those who did not remember what happened the next day due to heavy alcohol consumption both in the past 30 days (AOR 1.98, 95% CI 1.58, 2.49), and before past 30 days (AOR 1.85, 95% CI 1.35, 2.53), FSWs who chewed khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 1.58, 95% CI 1.13, 2.21) and 5-7 days per week (AOR 1.43, 95% CI 1.13, 1.80) were significantly more exposed to physical violence. Condom breakage experience within the past 30 days prior to the study was also significantly associated with physical violence (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84).

Table 4. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten) in the past twelve month among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95% CI)
Age	
15-24*	
25-34	1.04 (0.82, 1.22)
35+	0.59 (0.38, 0.92)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	0.71 (0.52, 0.97)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	0.98 (0.77, 1.26)
Secondary & above	1.14 (0.85, 1.53)
Monthly income from selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *	
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.13 (0.90, 1.41)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.14 (0.87, 1.48)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.12 (0.77, 1.61)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	1.44 (0.93, 2.24)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.12 (0.63, 1.99)
Current marital status	•
Never Married*	0 (0 (0 - 1 - 1 0 0)
Married/Cohabited	0.68 (0.24, 1.89)
Separated/Divorced	1.08 (0.88, 1.29)
Widowed	0.87 (0.48, 1.59)
Sex selling venues	
Bar/Hotel*	1.25 (1.02, 1.70)
Local drinking houses	1.35 (1.02, 1.78)
Spa/massage/beauty salon/own house	1.04 (0.58, 1.84)
Red Light houses	1.63 (1.12, 2.38)
Street	1.92 (1.53, 2.39)
Others	1.39 (0.98, 1.99)
Frequency alcohol consumption Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.25 (0.77, 2.04)
2 - 3 days a week	1.32 (0.84, 2.06)
4 or more days a week	1.92 (1.21, 3.04)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day	
1 or 2*	

3 or 4	1.08 (0.84, 1.39)		
5 or 6	1.15 (0.85, 1.57)		
7 to 9	1.09 (0.74, 1.64)		
10 or more	1.14 (0.72, 1.81)		
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking			
Never*			
Less than monthly	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)		
Monthly	0.84 (0.59, 1.18)		
Weekly	1.07 (0.82, 1.39)		
Daily or almost daily	0.99 (0.71, 1.38)		
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the next			
day			
No*			
Yes, in the last 30 days 1.98 (1.58, 2.49)			
Yes, before last 30 days	1.85 (1.35, 2.53)		
Frequency of khat chewing in a week			
Never*			
Less than once a week	1.04 (0.77, 1.42)		
1-2 days per week	1.30 (0.96, 1.77)		
3-4 days per week	1.58 (1.13, 2.21)		
5-7 days per week	1.43 (1.13, 1.80)		
Condom breakage			
No*			
Yes	1.51 (1.25, 1.84)		

**Note: \* Reference category** 

#### Multivariate analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)

Table 5 shows the results of the multivariate logistic regression analyses to identify factors that were significantly associated with rape after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers with a monthly income of \$50 to \$200 were significantly less exposed to rape compared to those with a monthly income of below \$50. Drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), those with experience of heavy drinking in the last 30 days and did not remember what happened the next day (AOR 1.34, 95% CI 1.05, 1.72), experience of HED in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), experience of HED almost daily (AOR 1.49, 95% CI 1.06, 2.11) and chewing khat1-2 days (AOR 2.13, 95% CI 1.61, 2.83) and 3-4 days (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98) per week were positively associated

with rape. Moreover, condom breakage (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55) was significantly more frequent among FSWs who reported rape.

Table 5. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape) since sex selling start among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95% CI)
Monthly income from selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *	
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	0.62 (0.49, 0.77)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	0.42 (0.32, 0.57)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	0.45 (0.29, 0.69)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	0.84 (0.53, 1.33)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	0.62 (0.34, 1.15)
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.57 (0.17, 1.97)
Separated/Divorced	1.01 (0.83, 1.22)
Widowed	1.61 (0.98, 2.63)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	1.06 (0.79, 1.43)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	0.83 (0.65, 1.07)
Secondary & above	0.92 (0.68, 1.25)
Current marital status  Never Married*  Married/Cohabited  Separated/Divorced  Widowed  Cducational level  No Education*  Primary 1st cycle (1-4)  Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)  Secondary & above  Crequency of alcohol consumption  Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.15(0.69, 1.89)
2 - 3 days a week	1.24(0.78, 1.96)
4 or more days a week	2.33(1.47,3.73)
Drunk so much and can't remember what hap	
next day No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.34 (1.05, 1.72)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking Never*	
Less than monthly	1.61 (1.12, 2.32)
Monthly	1.71 (1.24, 2.38)
•	
Weekly	1.04 (0.78, 1.38)

Daily or almost daily	1.49 (1.06, 2.11)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week Never*	
less than once a week	0.83 (0.59, 1.16)
1-2 days per week	2.13 (1.61, 2.83)
<ul><li>3-4 days per week</li><li>5-7 days per week</li></ul>	2.15 (1.55, 2.98) 1.06 (0.83, 1.36)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.26 (1.03, 1.55)

**Note: \* Reference category** 

#### **Discussion**

According to this study, 17.5% of FSWs in Ethiopia had been physically beaten within the past 12 months and 15.2% had been raped since they start selling sex. Age, sex selling venues, and high consumption of alcohol and khat were significant predictors of physical violence (beating). On the other hand, the significant predictors of sexual violence (rape) were low income and also high consumption of alcohol and khat.

The prevalence of both physical violence and sexual violence (rape) was lower than prevalence found in studies conducted in Uganda, Ivory Coast, and Kenya (9, 12, 30, 31). However, when compared to the studies conducted in Adama (Ethiopia), China, India, and Mexico the current study reported a higher prevalence of both physical and sexual violence (10, 11, 13, 14, 32). The difference in the definition of violence used might be one of the possible explanations for the difference between the current results and those found in other studies in Africa. Most of the studies assessed all forms of physical and sexual violence while the current study assessed solely physical beating and forced penetrative sex (rape). On the other hand, differences in results across settings might also be due to differences in background and contextual factors such as socio-economic status and cultural aspects.

Several studies showed that younger FSWs are more exposed to physical and sexual violence (13, 33) in line with the current findings that younger FSWs (15-24 years) were at higher risk for physical violence when compared to their older counter parts (35+ years). The lack of experience in identifying perpetrators and the perpetrator approach towards young FSWs may play a role in increased exposure to violence.

Even though sex work is not a legally recognized profession in Ethiopia, most of the establishments where the sex workers are based (hotels, bars/restaurants, night clubs etc.) operate legally with working licenses. Nevertheless, some FSWs work on the street and in red-light houses where they manage their own working area. Consequently, the levels of exposure to physical violence vary according to their working area. The present study revealed that FSWs who mainly work in bar and hotels face less physical beating when compared with FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses. This finding is in line with the studies conducted in New York City and England (20, 21). This might be due to the level of protection in their working areas and/or due to the type of clients who frequents those localities.

Furthermore, an association between alcohol use and higher frequency of physical violence and rape was reported. In particular, FSWs who consume alcohol more than four days a week and those with experience of HED were significantly exposed to violence. Several studies conducted in Ethiopia, Uganda, and Kenya also reported similar findings (9, 10, 12, 19). High level of alcohol consumption places FSWs in disadvantaged situations by intensifying their vulnerability (8). Research reviews also report that alcohol use impairs FSWs' ability to detect the risk of violence and increases their vulnerability to risk-prone situations (34, 35)

Correspondingly, chewing khat more days in a week was significantly associated with exposure to physical violence and rape. Khat is a stimulant, and after chewing an individual may become talkative, alert, feel excitement, increased self-esteem, and increased imagination (36). After chewing khat, some of the users consume alcohol-containing drinks to decrease the level of stimulation. Although there is no study on the relationship between khat chewing and exposure to violence among FSWs, most FSWs chew khat before departing to work and drink alcohol during working hours to minimize the effect, which in turn exposes them to HED and violence.

In addition, the resistance to condom use from clients and the violence experience may create a difficult situation for FSWs with regard to proper use of condoms, which further exposes FSWs to HIV and other STIs. In this study there were a significant relationship between condom breakage and history of physical beating and rape. Even though there was no significant association between HIV and violence, the proportion of HIV positive FSWs in the sample was high (23%). A study conducted in Benin reported a similar finding concerning the association between condom breakage and violence, but unlike our study there was a significant association between HIV and violence experience (23).

In general, there were some similarities but also differences concerning the predictors of rape and physical violence. For example, being in the younger age group was a significant predictor of physical beating but not for rape, and having lower income was associated with exposure to rape but not to physical beating. Nevertheless, based on the current data, it is difficult to draw any conclusions about why one variable would matter for physical beating but not for rape. The reasons underlying the differences are currently unknown, and further research might be required to gain an understanding of the patterns observed.

#### **Methodological considerations**

There are a limited number of studies on violence among FSWs in Ethiopia and the existing studies are restricted to one city (9, 10). One of the strengths of this study is that it involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country. The second strength is the sampling technique; the study used a respondent-driven sampling technique which is recommended for hard to reach populations and is believed to give a representative sample of the target population. The third strength is the assessment of their HIV status on site using the national testing algorithm. In addition, the pilot study conducted prior to the actual implementation added strength for the main study protocol.

This study also had limitations. First, sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias. Second, recall bias could occur because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they start

selling sex. We tried to minimize underreporting through intense interviewer training. In addition, since it is a cross-sectional study, participants are assessed only once; thus, it would be difficult to infer the temporal association between a risk factor and an outcome. In addition, the results regarding correlates of physical and sexual violence among FSWs in Ethiopia might have limited generalizability across settings. However, these results are likely to be relevant for other FSWs in other African countries that have a similar setting as Ethiopia, and may inform targeted prevention strategies for this key population.

#### Conclusion

In general, FSWs are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and are high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, to reduce physical and sexual violence, strategies to secure and improve their work environment should be a critical component of targeted interventions. Increasing awareness regarding the role of khat chewing and alcohol drinking towards vulnerability to violence should be an integral component of HIV prevention and violence reduction programs. In addition, targeted efforts should be made for the younger FSWs to reduce their vulnerability.

#### Acknowledgments

We would like to express gratitude to the study participants and the data collectors.

**Conflict of Interest**: None to declare.

#### **Authors contributions**

MA and AA developed the study design. MA analyzed and interpreted the data and drafted the manuscript. AA was involved in the data analysis and interpretation, and in the writing of the manuscript. TT was involved in the interpretation of the data and contributed to the writing of the manuscript. All authors approved the final manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no specific grant from any funding agency.

**Data sharing statement:** No additional data available.

#### Reference

- 1. Jewkes R. Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention. The lancet 2002; 359 (9315): 1423-9.
- 2. World Health Organization, Global and regional estimates of violence against women: prevalence and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence: executive summary.
- 3. Glasier A, Gulmezoglu AM, Schmid GP, Moreno CG, Van Look PF. Sexual and reproductive health: a matter of life and death. The Lancet 2006; 368 (9547):1595-607.
- 4. Perry A. Risk Factors of Gender-based Sexual Violence. RTM Insights;23.
- 5. Godwin J. Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific. Bangkok: United Nations Development Programme.
- 6. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Article 634: (Proclamation No. 414/2004) 2004.
- 7. World Health Organization, Addressing violence against women and achieving the Millennium Development Goals. 2005.
- 8. World Health Organization, Addressing Violence against Sex Workers 2013.
- 9. Alemayehu M, Yohannes G, Damte A, Fantahun A, Gebrekirstos K, Tsegay R, et al. Prevalence and predictors of sexual violence among commercial sex workers in Northern Ethiopia. Reproductive health 2015; 12 (1):47.
- 10. Mooney A, Kidanu A, Bradley HM, Kumoji EK, Kennedy CE, Kerrigan D. Work-related violence and inconsistent condom use with non-paying partners among female sex workers in Adama City, Ethiopia. BMC public health 2013; 13 (1):771.
- 11. Misganaw AC, Worku YA. Assessment of sexual violence among street females in Bahir-Dar town, North West Ethiopia: a mixed method study. BMC Public Health; 13 (1): 825.
- 12. Schwitters A, Swaminathan M, Serwadda D, Muyonga M, Shiraishi RW, Benech I, et al. Prevalence of rape and client-initiated gender-based violence among female sex workers: Kampala, Uganda, 2012. AIDS and Behavior; 19 (1):68-76.
- 13. Beattie TS, Bhattacharjee P, Ramesh B, Gurnani V, Anthony J, Isac S, et al. Violence against female sex workers in Karnataka state, south India: impact on health, and reductions in violence following an intervention program. BMC Public Health. p. 476.
- 14. Kelvin EA, Sun X, Mantell JE, Zhou J, Mao J, Peng Y. Vulnerability to sexual violence and participation in sex work among high-end entertainment centre workers in Hunan Province, China. Sexual health;10 (5):391-9.
- 15. Wolffers I. Violence repression and other health threats. Research for sex work 2001;4:1-2.
- 16. Hanck SE, Blankenship KM, Irwin KS, West BS, Kershaw T. Assessment of self-reported sexual behavior and condom use among female sex workers in India using a polling box approach: a preliminary report. Sexually transmitted diseases 2008; 35 (5): 489-94.

- 17. Parcesepe AM, Kelly L, Martin SL, Green S, Sinkele W, Suchindran C, et al. The impact of an alcohol harm reduction intervention on interpersonal violence and engagement in sex work among female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya: Results from a randomized controlled trial. Drug and alcohol dependence;161:21-8.
- 18. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam WK, Parry CD, Morojele NK. Substance use, sexual risk, and violence: HIV prevention intervention with sex workers in Pretoria. AIDS and Behavior 2006; 10 (2):131.
- 19. Chersich M, Luchters S, Malonza I, Mwarogo P, King'Ola N, Temmerman M. Heavy episodic drinking among Kenyan female sex workers is associated with unsafe sex, sexual violence and sexually transmitted infections. International journal of STD & AIDS2007. p. 764-9.
- 20. Church S, Henderson M, Barnard M, Hart G. Violence by clients towards female prostitutes in different work settings: questionnaire survey. Bmj2001;322(7285):524-5.
- 21. El-Bassel N, Witte SS, Wada T, Gilbert L, Wallace J. Correlates of partner violence among female street-based sex workers: substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. AIDS patient care and STDs 2001;15(1):41-51.
- 22. Masvawure TB, Mantell JE, Tocco JU, Gichangi P, Restar A, Chabeda SV, et al. Intentional and unintentional condom breakage and slippage in the sexual interactions of female and male sex workers and clients in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior; 22(2):637-48.
- 23. Tounkara FK, Diabata S, Guadou FA, Ahoussinou Cm, Kintin Fdr, Zannou DM, et al. Violence, condom breakage and HIV infection among female sex workers in Benin, West Africa. Sexually transmitted diseases; 41(5):312.
- 24. Choi SY, Chen KL, Jiang ZQ. Client-perpetuated violence and condom failure among female sex workers in southwestern China. Sex Transm Dis 2008.
- 25. Wilson KS, Deya R, Yuhas K, Simoni J, Vander Stoep A, Shafi J, et al. A prospective cohort study of intimate partner violence and unprotected sex in HIV-positive female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior; 20(9):2054-64.
- 26. Okal J, Chersich MF, Tsui S, Sutherland E, Temmerman M, Luchters S. Sexual and physical violence against female sex workers in Kenya: a qualitative enquiry. AIDS care; 23 (5):612-8.
- 27. Ethiopian National Key Population HIV Bio-behavioral Surveillance Round I Report. 2013
- 28. HIV Related Estimates and Projections for Ethiopia-2015
- 29. Decker MR, Lyons C, Billong SC, Njindam IM, Grosso A, Nunez GT, et al. Gender-based violence against female sex workers in Cameroon: prevalence and associations with sexual HIV risk and access to health services and justice. Sex Transm Infect; 92 (8): 599-604.

- 30. Lyons CE, Grosso A, Drame FM, Ketende S, Diouf D, Ba I, et al. Physical and Sexual Violence Affecting Female Sex Workers in Abidjan, CÃ'te d'Ivoire: Prevalence, and the Relationship with the Work Environment, HIV, and Access to Health Services. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes; 75(1):9-17.
- 31. Wilson KS, Deya R, Masese L, Simoni JM, Stoep AV, Shafi J, et al. Prevalence and correlates of intimate partner violence in HIV-positive women engaged in transactional sex in Mombasa, Kenya. International journal of STD & AIDS;27(13):1194-203.
- 32. Semple SJ, Stockman JK, Pitpitan EV, Strathdee SA, Chavarin CV, Mendoza DV, et al. Prevalence and correlates of client-perpetrated violence against female sex workers in 13 Mexican cities. PloS one;10(11):e0143317.
- 33. Silverman JG. Adolescent female sex workers: invisibility, violence and HIV. Archives of disease in childhood:archdischild178715.
- 34. George WH, Stoner SA. Understanding acute alcohol effects on sexual behavior. Annual review of sex research2000;11(1):92-124.
- 35. Mbonye M, Rutakumwa R, Weiss H, Seeley J. Alcohol consumption and high risk sexual behaviour among female sex workers in Uganda. African Journal of AIDS Research;13(2):145-51.
- 36. WHO. <a href="http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality\_safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf">http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality\_safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf</a>.

### Reporting checklist for cross sectional study.

Based on the STROBE cross sectional guidelines.

#### Instructions to authors

Complete this checklist by entering the page numbers from your manuscript where readers will find each of the items listed below.

Your article may not currently address all the items on the checklist. Please modify your text to include the missing information. If you are certain that an item does not apply, please write "n/a" and provide a short explanation.

Upload your completed checklist as an extra file when you submit to a journal.

In your methods section, say that you used the STROBE cross sectional reporting guidelines, and cite them as:

von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies.

			Page
		Reporting Item	Number
Title	<u>#1a</u>	Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
Abstract	<u>#1b</u>	Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	1

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Background /	<u>#2</u>	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the	2
rationale		investigation being reported	
Objectives	<u>#3</u>	State specific objectives, including any prespecified	3
		hypotheses	
Study design	<u>#4</u>	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	4
Setting	<u>#5</u>	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including	4, 5, 6
		periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	
Eligibility criteria	<u>#6a</u>	Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of	5
		selection of participants.	
	<u>#7</u>	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential	6
		confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if	
		applicable	
Data sources /	<u>#8</u>	For each variable of interest give sources of data and details of	6
measurement		methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	
		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one	
		group. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
Bias	<u>#9</u>	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	2, 18
Study size	<u>#10</u>	Explain how the study size was arrived at	5
Quantitative	<u>#11</u>	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the	6
variables		analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen,	
		and why	

Statistical	<u>#12a</u>	Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control	7
methods		for confounding	
	<u>#12b</u>	Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and	NA
		interactions	
	<u>#12c</u>	Explain how missing data were addressed	8
	<u>#12d</u>	If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of	NA
		sampling strategy	
	<u>#12e</u>	Describe any sensitivity analyses	7
Participants	<u>#13a</u>	Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg	5
		numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility, confirmed	
		eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and	
		analysed. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	<u>#13b</u>	Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	5
	<u>#13c</u>	Consider use of a flow diagram	
Descriptive data	<u>#14a</u>	Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic,	
		clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	
		confounders. Give information separately for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	#14b	Indicate number of participants with missing data for each	8, 9 in
		variable of interest	tables
Outcome data	<u>#15</u>	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures.	na
	For pe	eer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml	

		Give information separately for exposed and unexposed	
		groups if applicable.	
Main results	#16a	Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-	7 - 10
		adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and	
		why they were included	
	<u>#16b</u>	Report category boundaries when continuous variables were	
		categorized	
	<u>#16c</u>	If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into	
		absolute risk for a meaningful time period	
Other analyses	<u>#17</u>	Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and	10 -16
		interactions, and sensitivity analyses	
Key results	<u>#18</u>	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	
Limitations	<u>#19</u>	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of	18
		potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and	
		magnitude of any potential bias.	
Interpretation	<u>#20</u>	Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives,	16 -18
		limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies,	
		and other relevant evidence.	
Generalisability	<u>#21</u>	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study	19
		results	
Funding	#22	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the	20
-		present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which	

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

the present article is based

The STROBE checklist is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License CC-BY. This checklist can be completed online using https://www.goodreports.org/, a tool made by the EQUATOR Network in collaboration with Penelope.ai



### **BMJ Open**

# Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-028247.R1
Article Type:	Research
Date Submitted by the Author:	12-Feb-2019
Complete List of Authors:	Amogne, Minilik; Lunds Universitet, social medicin and global health; Ethiopian Public Health Institute, TB/HIV Department Balcha, Taye; Armauer Hansen Research Institute Agardh, Anette; Lund Univ, Clinical Sciences
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Public health
Secondary Subject Heading:	Public health, Sexual health, HIV/AIDS, Epidemiology
Keywords:	female sex workers, physical violence, rape, Substance use, Ethiopia

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns

Minilik Demissie<sup>1,2</sup>, Taye Tolera Balcha<sup>3</sup>, Anette Agardh<sup>1</sup>

Author affiliation

- Social Medicine and Global Health, Department of Clinical Sciences Malmo, Lund University, Malmo, Sweden
- 2. Ethiopian public health institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- 3. Armauer Hansen Research Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Corresponding author

Minilik Demissie Amogne, minilik demissie@med.lu.se or minewdem@gmail.com

#### **Abstract**

**Objective:** This study examined the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia.

Design: A cross-sectional study using a respondent-driven sampling technique

**Setting:** Eleven major towns in Ethiopia

**Participants:** 4900 female sex workers (FSWs)

Main outcome measures: The prevalence of physical beating and rape and factors contributing

**Results:** Among FSWs, 17.5% reported physical beating within the past year and 15.2% reported rape since they started selling sex. FSWs aged 35+ years (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were less exposed to physical beating than those aged 15-24 years. FSWs working on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR1.35,95% CI1.02, 1.78) experienced more physical beating than FSWs working in bars/hotels. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), and who chewed khat frequently experienced more physical violence. Rape was associated with having a low monthly income, drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33,95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy episodic drinking in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), and chewing khat 3-4 days per week (AOR2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98). Condom breakage was more frequent among FSWs who reported both physical beating (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84) and rape (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55).

**Conclusion:** FSWs in Ethiopia are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, targeted efforts are needed for prevention and harm reduction.

**Keywords:** female sex workers, physical violence, rape, substance use, Ethiopia

#### Strengths and limitations of this study

- The study involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country with a large sample size.
- The study used a respondent-driven sampling technique which is recommended for hard to reach populations.
- Sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias.
- Recall bias could occur because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they start selling sex.
- Due to a cross-sectional study design, it would be difficult to infer the temporal association between a risk factor and an outcome

#### Introduction

As per WHO definition, violence is the intentional use of physical force or power against another person or group, which has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, or sexual or psychological harm (1). Violence against women is a global phenomenon, as more than one in three women worldwide is beaten, coerced into sex or abused in her lifetime (2). Furthermore, violence is one of the main contributors to poor sexual and reproductive health among women, leading to unintended pregnancy, self-induced abortions, gynecologic problems, sexual dysfunction, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs), including HIV (3, 4).

In most countries, female sex work is either illegal or has an uncertain legal status; for example, prostitution is not illegal but approaching sex workers in public is illegal; this makes authorities reluctant to offer protection or support, which in turn legitimizes violence and discrimination against sex workers (5). In the case of Ethiopia, it is illegal to operate a brothel or procure sex workers as a commercial activity, but the sale of sex by women is neither prohibited nor legally recognized as a profession (6). Female sex workers (FSWs) frequently face harassment and violence, not only because of their illegitimate status, but also as a manifestation of gender inequality and discrimination directed towards women (7, 8).

Violence against FSWs can be perpetrated by anyone, including policemen, intimate partners, and clients. In Adama and Mekelle towns in Ethiopia, nearly 60% and 75% of female sex workers, respectively, reported lifetime violence (9, 10). In the same study in Adama, 8% of FSW reported forced sex since they started sex work (10). In another study conducted among homeless street females in Bahirdar town, 11.4% of them reported having been raped during the last one year period (11). In Uganda, 40% of FSWs reported physical abuse and 49 % had been raped at least once in their lifetime (12). In another study conducted in Hunan, China and Karnataka, India, 16% and 9% of female sex workers, respectively, reported work-related violence (13, 14).

Several risk factors have been found to have an association with physical and sexual violence against FSWs. Socio-economic characteristics, risky sexual behaviors and substance abuse are the most mentioned factors worldwide (9, 10, 15, 16). A randomized controlled trial study in Kenya and South Africa showed that alcohol consumption reduction by FSWs had a significant contribution to violence reduction (17, 18). Moreover, establishments where alcohol and other drugs are consumed, associates with an increased likelihood of people becoming violent towards sex workers (8, 19). However, other studies suggest that FSWs who work outdoors face more violence than those who work indoors (20, 21).

Violence towards FSWs may also be associated with condom use and condom breakage. Studies conducted among FSWs have found several intentional and unintentional factors associated with condom breakages during sex work. These factors included being drunk or high on drugs, wearing unfitting condoms, incorrect condom use, and having violent or rough sex(22, 23). Moreover, violence towards FSWs may also be linked to disagreement over condom use, which increases the risk of acquiring HIV and other STIs (21, 24-26). In Ethiopia, the weighted HIV prevalence among FSWs is estimated to be 23% (27), while it is 1.2 % in the general population (28), which shows the magnitude of the potential risk exposure among FSWs. In addition, violence also prevents sex workers from seeking appropriate health services (26, 29, 30).

In general, 120,000 to 160,000 FSWs are estimated to live in Ethiopia, working in different venues, mainly in bars and hotels, Key-mebrat (red lighthouses), local drinking houses, and on

the street (27). Currently, the number of female sex workers is growing, with increasing numbers of young girls entering the sex trade.

This study explores the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia. Successful strategies for handling the trauma may vary by the type of violence experienced. Therefore, identification of risk factors that are specific to various types of violence has the potential to inform the development of evidence-based prevention programs. In addition, generating such types of evidence based on national level data will help to promote more effective prevention for female sex workers.

#### **Methods**

#### Study design

This study was part of a larger study concerning HIV prevalence and related risk factors among female sex workers and long distance drivers that was carried out in Ethiopia in 2014. A cross-sectional study design using Respondent Driven Sampling technique (RDS) was used for data collection. RDS is a complex sampling method based on a chain-referral design and recommended for hard-to-reach populations. In all 11 towns included as study locations, initial FSW "seeds" were selected to start the sampling process. Seeds were selected purposively to represent the type of sex worker, age category, and geographic location. They were identified through formative assessments with key stakeholders working with FSWs and representatives of FSWs. The selected seeds were those who were well-connected with their community and reported large social networks.

A maximum of three recruits per seed was allowed and only one-time participation was ensured by using a fingerprint scanning device. Recruitment pattern (who recruited whom) was tracked and network size was also determined.

#### Study area, period and population

The study locations were the seven major regional towns and the four main transport corridor towns. The seven major regional towns were: Addis Ababa, Bahirdar, Mekelle, Hawassa, Adama, Gambela, and Dire-dawa. The four transport corridor towns were Semera-Logia (Addis

Ababa-Djibouti route), Kombolcha (Addis Ababa-Mekelle route), Metema (Addis Ababa-Metema route) and Shashemene (Addis Ababa -Moyale route).

The source populations were all female sex workers living in those selected eleven towns. For the purpose of the study, female sex workers were defined as follows: 'women who practice sexual activity with the pre-conditions of financial or in-kind benefits'. The inclusion criteria were: receiving money or other benefits for sex with four or more people within the last 30 days, being 15 and above years old, properly recruited by a peer (present with the coupon) and giving consent both for the interview and blood drawing.

#### Sample size

The source study protocol calculated sample size of 400 female sex workers in each town using anticipated HIV prevalence of 25%, 6% precision, 95% CI and design effect of two. However, the number of female sex workers who participated in each town was not exactly 400, and the total number of FSWs who participated in the study was 4900.

#### **Data collection procedure**

Six seed FSWs were selected to initiate coupon-based recruitment. Eligible FSWs who provided informed consent to participate were administered a face to face interview in a private room by a nurse with a structured questionnaire in Amharic language. They then provided blood specimens for HIV, CD4 and viral load testing in a private room. When the process was completed, participants were provided with up to three coupons and instructed to recruit their FSW peers into the study. To compensate the time and costs of transport, a primary incentive of 100 ETB (\$5.0) and additional 50 ETB (\$2.5) for each eligible peer she enrolled into the study was given. An electronic data base for tracking coupons and recruitment was established with participant ID, fingerprint code, and a pre-printed label that was scanned. The data collection tools and questionnaire were pretested in a pilot study; feedbacks from the pilot study was used to finalize the data collection tools and field logistic and operational procedures. The questionnaire included: socio-demographic characteristics, sexual risk exposure, sexual behaviors, condom use, history of STI symptoms, alcohol and drug use consumption, violence related issues, knowledge of HIV transmission, and HIV testing history.

#### **Variables**

Violence was assessed with two dependent variables, which were physical beating during the last one year and rape since sex selling started. The following questions were asked: "When exchanging sex for money during the last one year, have you ever been physically beaten by a sexual partner or client?" and "Have you ever been raped or forced to have sex against your will since you start selling sex?" responses were dichotomized into a Yes and No variable for analysis. For both of the questions, all who had reported beating and rape at least once were considered as exposed to violence (Yes).

The independent measures included current age, monthly income from selling sex, marital status, educational status, sex selling venue, khat chewing, alcohol drinking, HIV status, and condom breakage.

Current age was a continuous variable and for the purpose of analysis was categorized as ten year intervals: younger (15-24), middle age (25-34), and older one (35+), with the younger age group used as the reference category. Monthly income from selling sex was an open-ended question and for the analysis was categorized in to 1000Birr (\$50) intervals considering the cost of living in the country. Educational status was categorized as no formal education, primary first cycle (grade 1-4), primary second cycle (grade 5-8), and secondary and above for analysis, in accordance with the country education system.

In addition, sex workers were categorized based on their sex selling venue, where bar/hotel was used as the reference because it is the most common FSW working venue. In addition, this venue category has better security than the other venues and the numbers of FSWs in this category were higher than the rest.

Alcohol consumption was measured through different approaches including frequency of alcohol consumption, number of drinks per specific day and frequency of heavy episodic drinking (6 or more standard drinks per day).

Khat chewing was assessed with the frequency of days they chewed in a week. Khat (Catha edulis) is a stimulant leave, and after chewing an individual may become talkative, alert, feel excitement, increased self-esteem, and increased imagination (31). Khat chewing is also popular

among FSWs, as it is a means to spend the day time, to be active during the night for sex work and to socialize with each other.

# Data analysis

Statistical analysis was performed using SPSS Version 20. Descriptive statistics were used to provide summary measures (means, frequencies). Odds ratios (crude and adjusted) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) were obtained using bivariate and multivariate logistic regression analysis. Those independent variables significantly associated with the outcome variable in the bivariate analysis were included in the multivariate analysis. Cases with missing data were excluded from the analyses. Significance was accepted at p-value <0.05.

#### **Ethical considerations**

Permission for data use was obtained from the Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI). The protocol was cleared at the Scientific and Ethical Research Office (SERO) of EPHI, the Ethiopian Science and Technology Ministry Ethical Committee, and CDC-Atlanta IRB. Individual written informed consent was obtained from each participant for the interview and blood sample collection while the study was conducted.

#### **Patient and Public Involvement**

No patients were involved in the development of research question, the outcome measures, the design or implementation of the study. Nevertheless, Due to the nature of respondent driven sampling technique, an assessment was conducted to identify seeds and hotspot areas for the actual data collection. These assessment was conducted in collaboration with organizations working with FSWs and with active member of FSWs in the towns. The primary result is planned to disseminate by publication in a peer-reviewed journals and to present the study at national level for stakeholders working with FSWs.

#### **Results**

# Socio-demographic and other background characteristics

A total of 4900 female sex workers participated in the study. Demographic, socioeconomic and other background characteristics of the participants are shown in Table 1. The majority of the participants were between 15 to 24 years old with a mean age of 24 years (SD= 5.7); 44 % of

them were divorced, separated or widowed. A quarter of them reported being uneducated and 40% of them earned on average less than \$50 per month. Regarding sex selling starting age, the majority started selling sex between the ages of 18-24 years, although nearly 25% started before the age of 18. FSWs worked in different eating, drinking and recreation establishments and also other venues; 33% recruited their clients in bars/hotels, followed by 26.5% on the street and 20% in local drinking houses (Table 1).

Table 1. Distribution of socio-demographic and other background characteristics among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Age		
15-24	2831	57.8
25-34	1700	34.7
35+	369	7.5
Total	4900	100.0
Missing	0	
Mean age of respondents = 24.16		
SD=5.7		
<b>Educational status</b>		
No Education	1224	25.0
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	764	16.0
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	2062	42.0
Secondary & above	831	17.0
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel	1613	33.0
Local drinking houses	983	20.1
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	261	5.3
Red Light houses	429	8.8
Street	1295	26.5
Others	304	6.2
Total	4885	100.0
Missing	15	
Current marital status		
Never Married	2698	55.2
Married/Cohabited	37	0.8
ividified/ Condotted	31	0.0

Separated/Divorced	1976	40.5
Widowed	173	3.5
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Sex selling starting age		
Less than 15	120	2.5
15 - 17	1088	22.3
18 - 24	2864	58.7
25 - 29	583	12.0
30 & Above	220	4.5
Total	4875	100.0
Missing	25	
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 (<\$50)	1932	39.6
1001 – 2000 (\$50-\$100)	1554	31.8
2001 – 3000 (\$100-\$150)	812	16.6
3001 – 4000 (\$150-\$200)	318	6.5
4001 – 5000 (\$200-\$250)	150	3.1
Above 5000 (>\$250)	117	2.4
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	17	

#### Behavioral and other related factors

Table 2 shows the prevalence of behavioral and other factors. The majority (70%) of the respondents consumed alcohol and of those, 15.8% had drunk so much on a typical day within the past 30 days that they did not remember what happened the next day. About half of the respondents chewed khat and 23.8% of them chewed almost every day (5-7 days a week).

Regarding condom use, 25.5% of them reported condom breakage within the past 30 days prior to the study. HIV/AIDS status of the respondents was also assessed and a quarter of them (23%) were HIV positive. With regard to physical and sexual violence experience, 17.5% of them reported physical beating within the past 12 months and 15.2% reported having been raped since they started selling sex. (Table 2)

Table 2. Behavioral and other related factors among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Frequency alcohol consumpt	ion	
Never	1493	30.6
Once a month or less	222	4.5
2 - 4 days a month	492	10.1
2 - 3 days a week	1394	28.5
4 or more days a week	1283	26.3
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Alcohol containing drinks on		
1 or 2	806	23.8
3 or 4	1383	40.8
5 or 6	742	21.9
7 to 9	296	8.7
10 or more	164	4.8
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Frequency of heavy episodic	drinking	
Never	1863	54.9
Less than monthly	236	7.0
Monthly	299	8.8
Weekly	630	18.6
Daily or almost daily	363	10.7
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Drunk so much and can't ren		
what happened the next day		
Yes, in last 30 days	534	15.8
Yes, not in last 30 days	233	6.9
No	2609	77.2
Don't remember	4	0.1
Total	3380	100.0
Missing	11	
Frequency of khat chewing		
Never	2431	49.8
Less than once a week	577	11.8
1-2 days per week	429	8.8
3-4 days per week	284	5.8
5-7 days per week	1162	23.8
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	4883 17	100.0
Condom breakage in the past		
Yes	1243	25.5
No	3635	74.5
110	10	74.3
	10	

m . 1	4070	
Total	4878	
Missing	22	
HIV status		
Negative	3708	76.0
Positive	1173	24.0
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	
Ever been raped or forced to have sex		
since start selling sex		
No	4142	84.8
Yes	742	15.2
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Physically beaten in the last 12 months		
No	4026	82.5
Yes	855	17.5
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	

# **Bivariate regression analysis outcome**

Table 3 shows the bivariate logistic regression results; each independent variable was analyzed separately against the two outcome variables. The variables that were significantly associated with physical violence were: age, educational level, monthly income, current marital status, sex selling venues, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. Variables significantly associated with rape were: educational level, income from selling sex, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. HIV status was not significantly associated with either physical violence or rape.

Table 3. Bivariate logistic regression analyses results of independent variables associated with physically beaten in the last 12 months and ever been raped since start selling sex, odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI)

Variables	Physical beating OR (95% CI)	Rape OR (95% CI)
Age		
15-24*		
25-34	1.02 (0.87, 1.19)	1.02 (0.86, 1.21)
35+	0.52 (0.37, 0.74)	0.88 (0.64, 1.20)
	11	, , ,

Educational level		
No Education*	4 04 (0 =0 4 04)	
Primary 2nd avala (5.8)	1.01 (0.79, 1.31)	1.45 (1.14,1.85)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	1.35 (1.11, 1.63)	1.08 (0.88,1.32)
Secondary & above	1.49 (1.18, 1.87)	1.09 (0.85,1.41)
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *		
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.44 (1.20, 1.73)	0.69 (0.58, 0.85)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.67 (1.35, 2.07)	0.51 (0.39, 0.66)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.61 (1.19, 2.17)	0.65 (0.46, 0.92)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	2.12 (1.44, 3.14)	1.01 (0.66, 1.55)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.62 (1.01, 2.58)	0.75 (0.44, 1.27)
Current marital status		
Never Married*		
Married/Cohabited	1.05 (0.46, 2.41)	0.69 (0.24, 1.96)
Separated/Divorced	0.93 (0.80, 1.09)	1.03 (0.88, 1.21)
Widowed	0.59 (0.37, 0.95)	1.39 (0.95, 2.06)
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel*		
Local drinking houses	0.87 (0.69, 1.09)	-
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	0.45 (0.28, 0.71)	-
Red Light houses	0.95 (0.71, 1.27)	-
Street	1.51 (1.26, 1.82)	-
Others	1.37 (1.01, 1.86)	-
Frequency alcohol consumption Never*		
2 - 4 days a month	1.82 (1.35, 2.44)	1.74 (1.27, 2.38)
2 - 3 days a week	2.07 (1.66, 2.57)	1.87 (1.48, 2.36)
4 or more days a week	3.54 (2.87, 4.37)	3.43 (2.75, 4.28)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day	3.31 (2.07, 1.37)	(=1,1, 1,=1)
1 or 2*		
3 or 4	1.39 (1.09, 1.76)	1.16 (0.92, 1.46)
5 or 6	2.03 (1.58, 2.62)	1.09 (0.84, 1.43)
7 to 9	2.19 (1.59, 3.03)	0.98 (0.68, 1.41)
10 or more	2.76 (1.88, 4.03)	1.78 (1.20, 2.65)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	_,, ( ( ,, ,, ,, ,, ,, )	, , ,
Never*		
Less than monthly	1.43 (1.03, 1.98)	1.39 (0.99, 1.95)
Monthly	1.23 (0.90, 1.66)	1.59 (1.18, 2.13)

Weekly	1.73 (1.39, 2.14)	1.03 (0.80, 1.31)
Daily or almost daily	1.97 (1.53, 2.55)	1.69 (1.29, 2.21)
Drunk so much and can't remember what		
happened the next day No*		
Yes, in the last 30 days	2.90 (2.37, 3.56)	1.66 (1.33, 2.07)
Yes, before last 30 days	2.22 (1.65, 2.99)	1.27 (0.91, 1.78)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week Never*		
Less than once a week	1.24 (0.96, 1.60)	0.89 (0.67, 1.19)
1-2 days per week	1.67 (1.28, 2.18)	2.89 (2.26, 3.69)
3-4 days per week	2.49 (1.87, 3.34)	2.92 (2.19, 3.89)
5-7 days per week	2.48 (2.08, 2.96)	1.47 (1.21, 1.79)
Condom breakage		
No*		
Yes	1.99 (1.69,2.33)	1.62 (1.37, 1.92)
HIV test result		
Negative*		
Positive	1.04 (0.88, 1.24)	0.88 (0.73, 1.07)

**Note: \* Reference category** 

# Multivariate analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten)

Table 4 shows the results of the multivariate analysis used to identify factors associated with physical violence after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers aged 35 years or above (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were significantly less experienced to physical violence when compared with the younger age group (15-24 years). FSWs who attend primary 1st cycle education (AOR 0.71, 95% CI 0.52, 0.97) were also less likely to experience physical beating than those who report no education. On the other hand, FSWs who worked on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63,95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) have an increased odd of experience to physical violence compared with FSWs who worked in bars/hotels. Moreover, substance use was significantly related to physical violence. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), those who did not remember what happened the next day due to heavy alcohol consumption both in the past 30 days (AOR 1.98, 95% CI 1.58, 2.49), and before past 30 days (AOR 1.85, 95% CI 1.35, 2.53),

FSWs who chewed khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 1.58, 95% CI 1.13, 2.21) and 5-7 days per week (AOR 1.43, 95% CI 1.13, 1.80) have more likelihood of experiencing physical violence. Condom breakage experience within the past 30 days prior to the study was also significantly associated with physical violence (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84).

Table 4. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten) in the past twelve month among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95% CI)
Age	
15-24*	
25-34	1.04 (0.82, 1.22)
35+	0.59 (0.38, 0.92)
Educational level	
No Education*	0.71 (0.52, 0.07)
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	0.71 (0.52, 0.97)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	0.98 (0.77, 1.26)
Secondary & above	1.14 (0.85, 1.53)
Monthly income from selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *	
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.13 (0.90, 1.41)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.14 (0.87, 1.48)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.12 (0.77, 1.61)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	1.44 (0.93, 2.24)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250) 1.12 (0.63, 1.99	
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.68 (0.24, 1.89)
Separated/Divorced	1.08 (0.88, 1.29)
Widowed	0.87 (0.48, 1.59)
Sex selling venues	,
Bar/Hotel*	
Local drinking houses	1.35 (1.02, 1.78)
Spa/massage/beauty salon/own house	1.04 (0.58, 1.84)
Red Light houses	1.63 (1.12, 2.38)
Street	1.92 (1.53, 2.39)
Others	1.39 (0.98, 1.99)
Frequency alcohol consumption	

Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.25 (0.77, 2.04)
2 - 3 days a week	1.32 (0.84, 2.06)
4 or more days a week	1.92 (1.21, 3.04)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day	
1 or 2*	
3 or 4	1.08 (0.84, 1.39)
5 or 6	1.15 (0.85, 1.57)
7 to 9	1.09 (0.74, 1.64)
10 or more	1.14 (0.72, 1.81)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	
Never*	
Less than monthly	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Monthly	0.84 (0.59, 1.18)
Weekly	1.07 (0.82, 1.39)
Daily or almost daily	0.99 (0.71, 1.38)
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the next	
day No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.98 (1.58, 2.49)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.85 (1.35, 2.53)
	1.03 (1.33, 2.33)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week Never*	
Less than once a week	1.04 (0.77, 1.42)
1-2 days per week	1.30 (0.96, 1.77)
3-4 days per week	1.58 (1.13, 2.21)
5-7 days per week	1.43 (1.13, 1.80)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.51 (1.25, 1.84)
Note: * Deference estagony	

**Note: \* Reference category** 

# Multivariate analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)

Table 5 shows the results of the multivariate logistic regression analyses to identify factors that were significantly associated with rape after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers with a monthly income of \$50 to \$200 have significantly less experience of rape compared to those with a monthly income of below \$50. Drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), those with experience of heavy drinking in the last 30 days and did not remember what happened the next day (AOR 1.34,

95% CI 1.05, 1.72), experience of heavy episodic drinking (HED) in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), experience of HED almost daily (AOR 1.49, 95% CI 1.06, 2.11) and chewing khat1-2 days (AOR 2.13, 95% CI 1.61, 2.83) and 3-4 days (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98) per week were positively associated with rape. Moreover, condom breakage (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55) was significantly more frequent among FSWs who reported rape.

Table 5. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape) since sex selling start among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

<b>Variables</b>		OR (95% CI)
Monthly income from	selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (	<\$50) <b>*</b>	
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50	0-\$100)	0.62 (0.49, 0.77)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$10	00-\$150)	0.42 (0.32, 0.57)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$15	50-\$200)	0.45 (0.29, 0.69)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$20	00-\$250)	0.84 (0.53, 1.33)
Above 5000 birr (>\$2	250)	0.62 (0.34, 1.15)
Current marital status	s	
Never Married*		
Married/Cohabited		0.57 (0.17, 1.97)
Separated/Divorced		1.01 (0.83, 1.22)
Widowed		1.61 (0.98, 2.63)
<b>Educational level</b>		
No Education*		
Primary 1st cycle (1-	-4)	1.06 (0.79, 1.43)
Primary 2nd cycle (5	5-8)	0.83 (0.65, 1.07)
Secondary & above		0.92 (0.68, 1.25)
Frequency of alcohol c	consumption	
Never*		
2 - 4 days a month		1.15(0.69, 1.89)
2 - 3 days a week		1.24(0.78, 1.96)
4 or more days a wee	ek	2.33(1.47,3.73)
Drunk so much and ca	an't remember what happe	ened the
next day	••	
No*		
Yes, in the last 30 da	3	1.34 (1.05, 1.72)
Yes, before last 30 da	ays	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Frequency of heavy ep	pisodic drinking	

Less than monthly	1.61 (1.12, 2.32)
Monthly	1.71 (1.24, 2.38)
Weekly	1.04 (0.78, 1.38)
Daily or almost daily	1.49 (1.06, 2.11)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week Never*	
less than once a week	0.83 (0.59, 1.16)
1-2 days per week	2.13 (1.61, 2.83)
3-4 days per week	2.15 (1.55, 2.98)
5-7 days per week	1.06 (0.83, 1.36)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.26 (1.03, 1.55)

**Note: \* Reference category** 

# **Discussion**

According to this study, 17.5% of FSWs in Ethiopia had been physically beaten within the past 12 months and 15.2% had been raped since they start selling sex. Age, sex selling venues, and high consumption of alcohol and khat were significant predictors of physical violence (beating). On the other hand, the significant predictors of sexual violence (rape) were low income and also high consumption of alcohol and khat.

The prevalence of both physical violence and sexual violence (rape) was lower than prevalence found in studies conducted in Uganda, Ivory Coast, and Kenya (9, 12, 30, 32). However, when compared to the studies conducted in Adama (Ethiopia), China, India, and Mexico the current study reported a higher prevalence of both physical and sexual violence (10, 11, 13, 14, 33). The difference in the definition of violence used might be one of the possible explanations for the difference between the current results and those found in other studies in Africa. Most of the studies assessed all forms of physical and sexual violence while the current study assessed solely physical beating and forced penetrative sex (rape). On the other hand, differences in results across settings might also be due to differences in background and contextual factors such as socio-economic status and cultural aspects.

Several studies showed that younger FSWs are more exposed to physical and sexual violence (13, 34) in line with the current findings that younger FSWs (15-24 years) were at higher risk for physical violence when compared to their older counter parts (35+ years). The lack of experience in identifying perpetrators and the perpetrator approach towards young FSWs may play a role in increased exposure to violence. This finding is significant because younger FSWs entering the sex trade is increasing. Therefore to reduce the vulnerability of younger FSWs; targeted harm reduction program including awareness creation on how they could be exposed to violence and factors which increases the likelihood of violence should be introduced to the interventions program.

Even though sex work is not a legally recognized profession in Ethiopia, most of the establishments where the sex workers are based (hotels, bars/restaurants, night clubs etc.) operate legally with working licenses. Nevertheless, some FSWs work on the street and in red-light houses where they manage their own working area. Consequently, the levels of experience to physical violence vary according to their working area. The present study revealed that FSWs who mainly work in bar and hotels face less physical beating when compared with FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses. This finding is in line with the studies conducted in New York City and England (20, 21). This might be due to the level of protection in their working areas and/or due to the type of clients who frequents those localities. This signifies that engaging bar/hotel managers in the prevention activity could be additional strategy to increase the effectiveness of harm reduction programs.

Furthermore, an association between alcohol use and higher frequency of physical violence and rape was reported. In particular, FSWs who consume alcohol more than four days a week and those with experience of HED significantly experienced violence. Several studies conducted in Ethiopia, Uganda, and Kenya also reported similar findings (9, 10, 12, 19). A large proportion of female sex workers (FSWs) and their clients use alcohol prior to or during sex to helps them to solicit clients and overcome their shyness (35, 36). In particular high level of alcohol consumption places FSWs in disadvantaged situations by intensifying their vulnerability (8). Research reviews also report that alcohol use impairs FSWs' ability to detect the risk of violence and increases their vulnerability to risk-prone situations (37, 38). The consequences HED is not

just limited to physical effects of intoxication but further exposes them to violence and risky sexual behaviors.

Correspondingly, chewing khat more days in a week was significantly associated with experience of physical violence and rape. After chewing khat, some of the users consume alcohol-containing drinks to decrease the level of stimulation. Although there is no study on the relationship between khat chewing and experience to violence among FSWs, most FSWs chew khat before departing to work and drink alcohol during working hours to minimize the effect, which in turn exposes them to HED and violence. Even though the correlation of alcohol and khat on the current study is low; Some says drinking alcohol after chewing khat will reduce the stimulant effect. Further studies should assess the contribution of Khat chewing to increasing violence experience independently.

In addition, the resistance to condom use from clients and the violence experience may create a difficult situation for FSWs with regard to proper use of condoms, which further exposes FSWs to HIV and other STIs. In this study there were a significant relationship between condom breakage and history of physical beating and rape. Even though there was no significant association between HIV and violence, the proportion of HIV positive FSWs in the sample was high (23%). A study conducted in Benin reported a similar finding concerning the association between condom breakage and violence, but unlike our study there was a significant association between HIV and violence experience (23). This finding signifies that providing condom only will not be effective to prevent HIV and other STIs transmission; rather working on factors contributing for not utilizing condom properly (like violence) could play an important role on HIV prevention programs.

In general, there were some similarities but also differences concerning the predictors of rape and physical violence. For example, being in the younger age group was a significant predictor of physical beating but not for rape, and having lower income was associated with experience to rape but not to physical beating. Nevertheless, based on the current data, it is difficult to draw any conclusions about why one variable would matter for physical beating but not for rape. The

reasons underlying the differences are currently unknown, and further research might be required to gain an understanding of the patterns observed.

# **Methodological considerations**

There are a limited number of studies on violence among FSWs in Ethiopia and the existing studies are restricted to one city (9, 10). One of the strengths of this study is that it involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country. The second strength is the sampling technique; the study used a respondent-driven sampling technique which is recommended for hard to reach populations and is believed to give a representative sample of the target population. The third strength is the assessment of their HIV status on site using the national testing algorithm. In addition, the pilot study conducted prior to the actual implementation added strength for the main study protocol.

This study also had limitations. First, sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias. Second, recall bias could occur because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they start selling sex. We tried to minimize underreporting through intense interviewer training. In addition, since it is a cross-sectional study, participants are assessed only once; thus, it would be difficult to infer the temporal association between a risk factor and an outcome. In addition, the results regarding correlates of physical and sexual violence among FSWs in Ethiopia might have limited generalizability across settings. However, these results are likely to be relevant for other FSWs in other African countries that have a similar setting as Ethiopia, and may inform targeted prevention strategies for this key population.

# **Conclusion**

In general, FSWs are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and are high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, to reduce physical and sexual violence, strategies to secure and improve their work environment should be a critical component of targeted interventions. Increasing awareness regarding the role of khat chewing and alcohol drinking towards vulnerability to violence should be an integral component

of HIV prevention and violence reduction programs. In addition, targeted efforts should be made for the younger FSWs to reduce their vulnerability.

# Acknowledgments

We would like to express gratitude to the study participants and the data collectors.

Conflict of Interest: None to declare.

#### **Authors contributions**

MA and AA developed the study design. MA analyzed and interpreted the data and drafted the manuscript. AA was involved in the data analysis and interpretation, and in the writing of the manuscript. TT was involved in the interpretation of the data and contributed to the writing of the manuscript. All authors approved the final manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no specific grant from any funding agency.

**Data sharing statement:** No additional data available.

# Reference

- 1. Jewkes R. Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention. The Lancet. 2002; 359 (9315): 1423-9.
- 2. World Health Organization, Global and regional estimates of violence against women: prevalence and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence: executive summary.
  - https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/85239/9789241564625\_eng.pdf;jsessionid=6 E940F74EB1BC5204EEDE0FC6D26F358?sequence=1
- 3. Glasier A, Gulmezoglu AM, Schmid GP, Moreno CG, Van Look PF. Sexual and reproductive health: a matter of life and death. The Lancet. 2006; 368 (9547): 1595-607.
- 4. Perry A. Risk Factors of Gender-based Sexual Violence. RTM Insights. Issue 23:: May 2012. <a href="http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgender-basedsexual\_violence\_rtminsights23.pdf">http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgender-basedsexual\_violence\_rtminsights23.pdf</a>
- Godwin J. Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific. Bangkok: United Nations Development Programme.
  - http://www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/hivaids/English/HIV-2012-SexWorkAndLaw.pdf
- 6. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Article 634: (Proclamation No. 414/2004) 2004.

- 7. World Health Organization, Addressing violence against women and achieving the Millennium Development Goals. 2005.
  - https://www.who.int/gender/documents/MDGs&VAWSept05.pdf
- 8. World Health Organization, Addressing Violence against Sex Workers 2013. <a href="https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex">https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex</a> worker implementation/swit <a href="https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex">https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex</a> worker implementation/swit <a href="https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex">chpt2.pdf</a>
- 9. Alemayehu M, Yohannes G, Damte A, Fantahun A, Gebrekirstos K, Tsegay R, et al. Prevalence and predictors of sexual violence among commercial sex workers in Northern Ethiopia. Reproductive Health. 2015;12(1):47.
- 10.Mooney A, Kidanu A, Bradley HM, Kumoji EK, Kennedy CE, Kerrigan D. Work-related violence and inconsistent condom use with non-paying partners among female sex workers in Adama City, Ethiopia. BMC Public Health. 2013;13(1):771.
- 11.Misganaw AC, Worku YA. Assessment of sexual violence among street females in Bahir-Dar town, North West Ethiopia: a mixed method study. BMC Public Health. 2013 Sep 10;13:825.
- 12. Schwitters A, Swaminathan M, Serwadda D, Muyonga M, Shiraishi RW, Benech I, et al. Prevalence of rape and client-initiated gender-based violence among female sex workers: Kampala, Uganda, 2012. AIDS and Behavior. 2015 Feb;19 Suppl 1:S68-76.
- 13.Beattie TS, Bhattacharjee P, Ramesh B, Gurnani V, Anthony J, Isac S, et al. Violence against female sex workers in Karnataka state, south India: impact on health, and reductions in violence following an intervention program. BMC Public Health. Aug 11, 2010, p. 476.
- 14.Kelvin EA, Sun X, Mantell JE, Zhou J, Mao J, Peng Y. Vulnerability to sexual violence and participation in sex work among high-end entertainment centre workers in Hunan Province, China. Sexual Health. 2013 Nov;10(5):391-9.
- 15. Wolffers I. Violence repression and other health threats. Research for Sex Work. 2001;4:1-2. https://www.nswp.org/sites/nswp.org/files/research-for-sex-work-4-english.pdf
- 16.Hanck SE, Blankenship KM, Irwin KS, West BS, Kershaw T. Assessment of self-reported sexual behavior and condom use among female sex workers in India using a polling box approach: a preliminary report. Sexually Transmitted Diseases. 2008; 35(5):489-94.
- 17. Parcesepe AM, Kelly L, Martin SL, Green S, Sinkele W, Suchindran C, et al. The impact of an alcohol harm reduction intervention on interpersonal violence and engagement in sex work among female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya: Results from a randomized controlled trial. Drug and Alcohol Dependence. Jan 2016, 161:21-8.
- 18. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam WK, Parry CD, Morojele NK. Substance use, sexual risk, and violence: HIV prevention intervention with sex workers in Pretoria. AIDS and Behavior. 2006;10(2):131.
- 19. Chersich M, Luchters S, Malonza I, Mwarogo P, King'Ola N, Temmerman M. Heavy episodic drinking among Kenyan female sex workers is associated with unsafe sex, sexual violence and sexually transmitted infections. International Journal of STD & AIDS 2007. p. 764-9.

- 20.Church S, Henderson M, Barnard M, Hart G. Violence by clients towards female prostitutes in different work settings: questionnaire survey. BMJ. 2001;322(7285):524-5.
- 21.El-Bassel N, Witte SS, Wada T, Gilbert L, Wallace J. Correlates of partner violence among female street-based sex workers: substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. AIDS Patient Care and STDs. 2001;15(1):41-51.
- 22. Masvawure TB, Mantell JE, Tocco JU, Gichangi P, Restar A, Chabeda SV, et al. Intentional and unintentional condom breakage and slippage in the sexual interactions of female and male sex workers and clients in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior. 2018 Feb;22(2):637-648.
- 23. Tounkara FK, Diabate S, Guedou FA, Ahoussinou Cm, Kintin Fdr, Zannou DM, et al. Violence, condom breakage and HIV infection among female sex workers in Benin, West Africa. Sexually Transmitted Diseases. 2014 May;41(5):312-8..
- 24.Choi SY, Chen KL, Jiang ZQ. Client-perpetuated violence and condom failure among female sex workers in south western China. Sexually Transmitted Diseases 2008.
- 25. Wilson KS, Deya R, Yuhas K, Simoni J, Vander Stoep A, Shafi J, et al. A prospective cohort study of intimate partner violence and unprotected sex in HIV-positive female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior. 2016 Sep;20(9):2054-64.
- 26.Okal J, Chersich MF, Tsui S, Sutherland E, Temmerman M, Luchters S. Sexual and physical violence against female sex workers in Kenya: a qualitative enquiry. AIDS Care. 2011 May; 23(5): 612-8.
- 27. Ethiopian National Key Population HIV Bio-behavioral Surveillance Round I Report. 2013
- 28.HIV Related Estimates and Projections for Ethiopia-2015
- 29.Decker MR, Lyons C, Billong SC, Njindam IM, Grosso A, Nunez GT, et al. Gender-based violence against female sex workers in Cameroon: prevalence and associations with sexual HIV risk and access to health services and justice. Sexually Transmitted Diseases. 2016 Dec; 92(8): 599-604.
- 30.Lyons CE, Grosso A, Drame FM, Ketende S, Diouf D, Ba I, et al. Physical and Sexual Violence Affecting Female Sex Workers in Abidjan, CÃ'te d'Ivoire: Prevalence, and the Relationship with the Work Environment, HIV, and Access to Health Services. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes.May 2017, 75(1):9-17.
- 31. World Health Organization, Assessment of khat (Catha edulis Forsk) 34th ECDD 2006/4.4. <a href="http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality-safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf">http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality-safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf</a>.
- 32. Wilson KS, Deya R, Masese L, Simoni JM, Stoep AV, Shafi J, et al. Prevalence and correlates of intimate partner violence in HIV-positive women engaged in transactional sex in Mombasa, Kenya. International Journal of STD & AIDS. 2016 Nov; 27(13): 1194-203.
- 33. Semple SJ, Stockman JK, Pitpitan EV, Strathdee SA, Chavarin CV, Mendoza DV, et al. Prevalence and correlates of client-perpetrated violence against female sex workers in 13 Mexican cities. PloS one. November 23, 2015; 10 (11): e0143317.
- 34.Silverman JG. Adolescent female sex workers: invisibility, violence and HIV. Archives of disease in childhood. Archives of Disease in Childhood. 2011 May; 96(5): 478-81.

- 35. Sharma S, Singh S, Talukdar B. Understanding the Factors Associated with Alcohol Use among Female Sex Workers in a High HIV Prevalence Northeast State of India. J Infec Dis Treat. 2016; 2:1.
- 36. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam W. Violence against substance-abusing South African sex workers: intersection with culture and HIV risk. AIDS Care. 2005;17(sup1):55-64.
- 37.George WH, Stoner SA. Understanding acute alcohol effects on sexual behavior. Annual review of sex research. 2000;11(1):92-124.
- 38. Mbonye M, Rutakumwa R, Weiss H, Seeley J. Alcohol consumption and high risk sexual behaviour among female sex workers in Uganda. African Journal of AIDS Research. 2014;13(2):145-51. ):145-51.

# Reporting checklist for cross sectional study.

Based on the STROBE cross sectional guidelines.

# Instructions to authors

Complete this checklist by entering the page numbers from your manuscript where readers will find each of the items listed below.

Your article may not currently address all the items on the checklist. Please modify your text to include the missing information. If you are certain that an item does not apply, please write "n/a" and provide a short explanation.

Upload your completed checklist as an extra file when you submit to a journal.

In your methods section, say that you used the STROBE cross sectional reporting guidelines, and cite them as:

von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies.

			Page
		Reporting Item	Number
Title	<u>#1a</u>	Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
Abstract	<u>#1b</u>	Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	1

Background /	<u>#2</u>	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the	2
rationale		investigation being reported	
Objectives	<u>#3</u>	State specific objectives, including any prespecified	3
		hypotheses	
Study design	<u>#4</u>	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	4
Setting	<u>#5</u>	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including	4, 5, 6
		periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	
Eligibility criteria	<u>#6a</u>	Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of	5
		selection of participants.	
	<u>#7</u>	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential	6
		confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if	
		applicable	
Data sources /	<u>#8</u>	For each variable of interest give sources of data and details of	6
measurement		methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	
		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one	
		group. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
Bias	<u>#9</u>	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	2, 18
Study size	<u>#10</u>	Explain how the study size was arrived at	5
Quantitative	<u>#11</u>	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the	6
variables		analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen,	
		and why	

Statistical	<u>#12a</u>	Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control	7
methods		for confounding	
	#12b	Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and	NA
		interactions	
	#40-	Evalois how spissing data ways addressed	0
	<u>#12c</u>	Explain how missing data were addressed	8
	<u>#12d</u>	If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of	NA
		sampling strategy	
	<u>#12e</u>	Describe any sensitivity analyses	7
Participants	<u>#13a</u>	Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg	5
		numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility, confirmed	
		eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and	
		analysed. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	<u>#13b</u>	Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	5
	<u>#13c</u>	Consider use of a flow diagram	
Descriptive data	<u>#14a</u>	Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic,	
		clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	
		confounders. Give information separately for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	<u>#14b</u>	Indicate number of participants with missing data for each	8, 9 in
		variable of interest	tables
Outcome data	<u>#15</u>	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures.	na
	F		

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Give information separately for exposed and unexposed

		groups if applicable.	
Main results	<u>#16a</u>	Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-	7 - 10
		adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	
		interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and	
		why they were included	
	<u>#16b</u>	Report category boundaries when continuous variables were	
		categorized	
	<u>#16c</u>	If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into	
		absolute risk for a meaningful time period	
Other analyses	<u>#17</u>	Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and	10 -16
		interactions, and sensitivity analyses	
Key results	<u>#18</u>	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	
Limitations	<u>#19</u>	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of	18
		potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and	
		magnitude of any potential bias.	
Interpretation	<u>#20</u>	Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives,	16 -18
		limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies,	
		and other relevant evidence.	
Generalisability	<u>#21</u>	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study	19
		results	
Funding	<u>#22</u>	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the	20
		present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which	
	For pe	eer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml	

the present article is based

The STROBE checklist is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License CC-BY. This checklist can be completed online using https://www.goodreports.org/, a tool made by the EQUATOR Network in collaboration with Penelope.ai



# **BMJ Open**

# Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-028247.R2
Article Type:	Research
Date Submitted by the Author:	05-Apr-2019
Complete List of Authors:	Amogne, Minilik; Lunds Universitet, social medicin and global health; Ethiopian Public Health Institute, TB/HIV Department Balcha, Taye; Armauer Hansen Research Institute Agardh, Anette; Lunds University Faculty of Medicine
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Public health
Secondary Subject Heading: Public health, Sexual health, HIV/AIDS, Epidemiology	
Keywords:	female sex workers, physical violence, rape, Substance use, Ethiopia

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns Minilik Demissie<sup>1,2</sup>, Taye Tolera Balcha<sup>3</sup>, Anette Agardh<sup>1</sup>

#### Author affiliation

- 1. Social Medicine and Global Health, Department of Clinical Sciences, Malmo, Lund University, Malmo, Sweden
- 2. Ethiopian Public Health Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- 3. Armauer Hansen Research Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Corresponding author

Minilik Demissie Amogne, minilik.demissie@med.lu.se

#### **Abstract**

**Objective:** This study examined the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia.

**Design:** A cross-sectional study using respondent-driven sampling technique

**Setting:** Eleven major towns in Ethiopia

Participants: 4900 female sex workers (FSWs)

Main outcome measures: The prevalence of experiences of physical beating and rape

**Results:** Among FSWs, 17.5% reported physical beating within the past year and 15.2% reported rape since they started selling sex. FSWs aged 35+ years (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were less exposed to physical beating than those aged 15-24 years. FSWs working on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) experienced more physical beating than FSWs working in bars/hotels. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), and who chewed khat frequently experienced more physical violence. Rape was associated with having a low monthly income, drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy episodic drinking in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), and chewing khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98). Condom breakage was more

frequent among FSWs who reported both physical beating (AOR1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84) and rape (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55).

**Conclusion:** FSWs in Ethiopia are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, targeted efforts are needed for prevention and harm reduction.

**Key words:** female sex workers, physical violence, rape, substance use, Ethiopia

# Strengths and limitations of this study

- The study involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country with a large sample size.
- The study used a respondent-driven sampling, a technique which is recommended for hard to reach populations.
- Sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias.
- Recall bias could have occurred because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they started selling sex.
- Due to a cross-sectional study design, the influence of alcohol use/Khat chewing must be interpreted with caution, since the participants' current consumption status might not be an accurate indicator of the consumption status at the time of the violence.

#### Introduction

As per WHO definition, violence is the intentional use of physical force or power against another person or group, which has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, or sexual or psychological harm (1). Violence against women is a global phenomenon, as more than one in three women worldwide is beaten, coerced into sex, or abused in her lifetime (2). Furthermore, violence is one of the main contributors to poor sexual and reproductive health among women, leading to unintended pregnancy, self-induced abortions, gynecologic problems, sexual dysfunction, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs), including HIV (3, 4).

In most countries, female sex work is either illegal or has an uncertain legal status, For example, prostitution is not illegal but approaching sex workers in public is illegal; this makes authorities reluctant to offer protection or support, which in turn legitimizes violence and discrimination against sex workers (5). In the case of Ethiopia, it is illegal to operate a brothel or procure sex workers as a commercial activity, but the sale of sex by women is neither prohibited nor legally recognized as a profession (6). Female sex workers (FSWs) frequently face harassment and violence, not only because of their illegitimate status, but also as a manifestation of gender inequality and discrimination directed towards women (7, 8).

Violence against FSWs can be perpetrated by anyone, including policemen, intimate partners, and clients. In Adama and Mekelle towns in Ethiopia, nearly 60% and 75% of female sex workers, respectively, reported lifetime violence (9, 10). In the same study in Adama, 8% of FSW reported forced sex since they started sex work(10). In another study conducted among homeless street females in Bahirdar town, 11.4% of them reported having been raped during the last one year period (11). In Uganda, 40% of FSWs reported physical abuse and 49 % had been raped at least once in their lifetime (12). In another study conducted in Hunan, China and Karnataka, India,16% and 9% of female sex workers, respectively, reported work-related violence (13, 14).

Several risk factors have been found to have an association with physical and sexual violence against FSWs. Socio-economic characteristics, risky sexual behaviors and substance abuse are the most mentioned factors worldwide (9, 10, 15, 16). A randomized controlled trial study in Kenya and South Africa showed that alcohol consumption reduction by FSWs had a significant

contribution to violence reduction (17, 18). Moreover, establishments where alcohol and other drugs are consumed are associated with an increased likelihood of people becoming violent towards sex workers (8, 19). However, other studies suggest that FSWs who work outdoors face more violence than those who work indoors (20, 21).

Violence towards FSWs may also be associated with condom use and condom breakage. Studies conducted among FSWs have found several intentional and unintentional factors associated with condom breakages during sex work. These factors included being drunk or high on drugs, wearing unfitting condoms, incorrect condom use, and having violent or rough sex (22, 23). Moreover, violence towards FSWs may also be linked to disagreement over condom use, which increases the risk of acquiring HIV and other STIs (21, 24-26). In Ethiopia, the weighted HIV prevalence among FSWs is estimated to be 23% (27), while it is 1.2 % in the general population (28), which shows the magnitude of the potential risk exposure among FSWs. In addition, violence also prevents sex workers from seeking appropriate health services (26, 29, 30).

In general, 120,000 to 160,000 FSWs are estimated to live in Ethiopia, working in different venues, mainly in bars and hotels, Key-mebrat (red lighthouses), local drinking houses, and on the street (27). Currently, the number of female sex workers is growing, with increasing numbers of young girls entering the sex trade.

This study explores the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia. Successful strategies for handling the trauma may vary by the type of violence experienced. Therefore, identification of risk factors that are specific to various types of violence has the potential to inform the development of evidence-based prevention programs. In addition, generating such types of evidence based on national level data will help to promote more effective prevention for female sex workers.

#### Methods

#### Study design

This study was part of a larger study concerning HIV prevalence and related risk factors among female sex workers and long-distance drivers that was carried out in Ethiopia in 2014. A cross-sectional study design using Respondent Driven Sampling technique (RDS) was used for data collection. RDS is a complex sampling method based on a chain-referral design and recommended for hard-to-reach populations. At all data collection sites, initial FSW "seeds" were selected to start the sampling process. Seeds were selected purposively to represent the type of sex worker, age category, and geographic location. They were identified through formative assessments with key stakeholders working with FSWs and representatives of FSWs. The selected seeds were those who were well-connected with their community and reported large social networks.

A maximum of three recruits per seed was allowed and only one-time participation was ensured by using a fingerprint scanning device. Recruitment pattern (who recruited whom) was tracked and network size was also determined.

# Study area, period and population

The study locations were the seven major regional towns and the four main transport corridor towns. The seven major regional towns were: Addis Ababa, Bahirdar, Mekelle, Hawassa, Adama, Gambela, and Dire-dawa. The four transport corridor towns were Semera-Logia (Addis Ababa-Djibouti route), Kombolcha (Addis Ababa-Mekelle route), Metema (Addis Ababa-Metema route) and Shashemene (Addis Ababa - Moyale route).

The source populations were all female sex workers living in those selected eleven towns. For the purpose of the study, female sex workers were defined as follows: 'women who practice sexual activity with the pre-conditions of financial or in-kind benefits'. The inclusion criteria were: receiving money or other benefits for sex with four or more people within the last 30 days, being 15 and above years old, properly recruited by a peer (present with the coupon) and giving consent both for the interview and blood drawing.

# Sample size

The source study protocol calculated sample size of 400 female sex workers in each town using anticipated HIV prevalence of 25%, 6% precision, 95% CI, and design effect of two. However, the number of female sex workers who participated in each town was not exactly 400, and the total number of FSWs who participated in the study was 4900.

# **Data collection procedure**

Six seed FSWs were selected to initiate coupon-based recruitment. Eligible FSWs who provided informed consent to participate were administered a face to face interview in a private room by a nurse with a structured questionnaire in Amharic language. They then provided blood specimens for HIV, CD4 and viral load testing in a private room. When the process was completed, participants were provided with up to three coupons and instructed to recruit their FSW peers into the study. To compensate the time and costs of transport, a primary incentive of 100 ETB (\$5.0) and additional 50 ETB (\$2.5) for each eligible peer she enrolled into the study was given. An electronic data base for tracking coupons and recruitment was established with participant ID, fingerprint code, and a pre-printed label that was scanned. The data collection tools and questionnaire were pretested in a pilot study; feedback from the pilot study was used to finalize the data collection tools and field logistic and operational procedures. The questionnaire included: socio-demographic characteristics, sexual risk exposure, sexual behaviors, condom use, history of STI symptoms, alcohol and drug use consumption, violence related issues, knowledge of HIV transmission, and HIV testing history.

# **Variables**

Violence was assessed with two dependent variables, which were physical beating during the last one year and rape since sex selling started. The following questions were asked: "When exchanging sex for money during the last one year, have you ever been physically beaten by a sexual partner or client?" and "Have you ever been raped or forced to have sex against your will since you start selling sex?". Responses were dichotomized into a Yes and No variable for analysis. For both of the questions, all who had reported beating and rape at least once were considered as having experienced violence (Yes).

The different time periods used to assess experiences of physical beating and rape were based on the presumed frequency of the two different types of violence. Physical beating might occur more frequently, while rape presumably occurs less frequently. Therefore, to measure the general burden of the two experiences, We specifically selected the time period that might be appropriate for the recall of the particular experience.

The independent measures included current age, monthly income from selling sex, marital status, educational status, sex selling venue, khat chewing, alcohol drinking, HIV status, and condom breakage.

Current age was a continuous variable and for the purpose of analysis was categorized as ten-year intervals: younger (15-24), middle age (25-34), and older one (35+), with the younger age group used as the reference category. Monthly income from selling sex was an open-ended question and for the analysis was categorized into 1000Birr (\$50) intervals considering the cost of living in the country. Educational status was categorized as no formal education, primary first cycle (grade 1-4), primary second cycle (grade 5-8), and secondary and above for analysis, in accordance with the country education system.

In addition, sex workers were categorized based on their sex selling venue, where bar/hotel was used as the reference because it is the most common FSW working venue. In addition, this venue category has better security than the other venues, and there were greater numbers of FSWs in this category.

Alcohol consumption was measured through different approaches including frequency of alcohol consumption, number of drinks per specific day and frequency of heavy episodic drinking (6 or more standard drinks per day).

Frequency of Khat chewing was assessed according to the number of days that they chewed in a week. Khat (Catha edulis) is a stimulant leaf, and after chewing Khat, an individual may become talkative, alert, feel excitement, increased self-esteem, and increased imagination (31). Khat chewing is also popular among FSWs, as it is a means to spend the day time, to be active during the night for sex work and to socialize with each other.

#### **Data analysis**

Statistical analysis was performed using SPSS Version 20. Descriptive statistics were used to provide summary measures (means, frequencies). Odds ratios (crude and adjusted) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) were obtained using bivariate and multivariate logistic regression analysis. Those independent variables significantly associated with the outcome variable in the bivariate analysis were included in the multivariate analysis. In addition, correlation analysis was performed to examine potential multicollinearity; no correlation was found between the variables. Cases with missing data were excluded from the analyses. Significance was accepted at p-value <0.05.

During data collection, we did not specifically assess where FSWs experienced the violence (in the current town or in another town). Because FSWs are highly mobile from one town to another, it would be biased to assume that their experiences of violence occurred in any one town. Therefore, during analysis, we did not conduct any cluster effect analysis.

#### **Ethical considerations**

Permission for data use was obtained from the Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI). The protocol was cleared at the Scientific and Ethical Research Office (SERO) of EPHI, the Ethiopian Science and Technology Ministry Ethical Committee, and CDC-Atlanta IRB. Individual written informed consent was obtained from each participant for the interview and blood sample collection while the study was conducted.

#### **Patient and Public Involvement**

During the design or implementation of the study, no patients were involved in the development of the research question and outcome measures. Nevertheless, due to the nature of the respondent driven sampling methodology, an assessment was conducted to identify seeds and hotspot areas for the actual data collection. This assessment was conducted in collaboration with organizations working with FSWs and an active member of FSWs in those organizations. The primary results will be disseminated by publication in peer-reviewed journals and presented at the national level for stakeholders working with FSWs.

#### Results

# Socio-demographic and other background characteristics

A total of 4900 female sex workers participated in the study. Demographic, socioeconomic and other background characteristics of the participants are shown in Table 1. The majority of the participants were between 15 to 24 years old with a mean age of 24years (SD= 5.7); 44 % of them were divorced, separated or widowed. A quarter of them reported being uneducated and 40% of them earned on average less than \$50 per month. Regarding sex selling starting age, the majority started selling sex between the ages of 18-24years, although nearly 25% started before the age of 18. FSWs worked in different eating, drinking and recreation establishments and also other venues; 33% recruited their clients in bars/hotels, followed by 26.5% on the street and 20% in local drinking houses (Table 1).

Table 1. Distribution of socio-demographic and other background characteristics among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Age	16.	
15-24	2831	57.8
25-34	1700	34.7
35+	369	7.5
Total	4900	100.0
Missing	0	
Mean age of respondents $= 24.16$		
SD= 5.7		
<b>Educational status</b>		
No Education	1224	25.0
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	764	16.0
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	2062	42.0
Secondary & above	831	17.0
Total	4881	100.0

Missing	19	
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel	1613	33.0
Local drinking houses	983	20.1
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	261	5.3
Red-light houses	429	8.8
Street	1295	26.5
Others	304	6.2
Total	4885	100.0
Missing	15	
Current marital status		
Never Married	2698	55.2
Married/Cohabited	37	0.8
Separated/Divorced	1976	40.5
Widowed	173	3.5
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Sex selling starting age		
Less than 15	120	2.5
15 - 17	1088	22.3
18 - 24	2864	58.7
25 - 29	583	12.0
30 & Above	220	4.5
Total	4875	100.0
Missing	25	
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 (<\$50)	1932	39.6
1001 – 2000 (\$50-\$100)	1554	31.8
2001 – 3000 (\$100-\$150)	812	16.6
3001 – 4000 (\$150-\$200)	318	6.5

4001 – 5000 (\$200-\$250)	150	3.1
Above 5000 (>\$250)	117	2.4
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	17	

#### Behavioral and other related factors

Table 2 shows the prevalence of behavioral and other factors. The majority (70%) of the respondents consumed alcohol and of those, 15.8% had drunk so much on a typical day within the past 30 days that they did not remember what happened the next day. About half of the respondents chewed khat and 23.8% of them chewed almost every day (5-7 days a week).

Regarding condom use, 25.5% of them reported condom breakage within the past 30 days prior to the study. HIV/AIDS status of the respondents was also assessed and a quarter of them (23%) were HIV positive. With regard to physical and sexual violence experience, 17.5% of them reported physical beating within the past 12 months and 15.2% reported having been raped since they started selling sex. (Table 2)

Table 2. Behavioral and other related factors among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Frequency alcohol consumption	on	<b>7</b> 0.
Never	1493	30.6
Once a month or less	222	4.5
2 - 4 days a month	492	10.1
2 - 3 days a week	1394	28.5
4 or more days a week	1283	26.3
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	

# Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day

1 or 2	806	23.8
3 or 4	1383	40.8
5 or 6	742	21.9
7 to 9	296	8.7
10 or more	164	4.8
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking		
Never	1863	54.9
Less than monthly	236	7.0
Monthly	299	8.8
Weekly	630	18.6
Daily or almost daily	363	10.7
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Drunk so much and can't remember		
what happened the next day		
Yes, in last 30 days	534	15.8
Yes, not in last 30 days	233	6.9
No	2609	77.2
Don't remember	4	0.1
Total	3380	100.0
Missing	11	
Frequency of khat chewing		
Never	2431	49.8
Less than once a week	577	11.8
1-2 days per week	429	8.8
3-4 days per week	284	5.8
5-7 days per week	1162	23.8
Total	4883	100.0

Missing	17	
Condom breakage in the past 30 days		
Yes	1243	25.5
No	3635	74.5
Total	4878	
Missing	22	
HIV status		
Negative	3708	76.0
Positive	1173	24.0
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	
Ever been raped or forced to have sex		
since start selling sex		
No	4142	84.8
Yes	742	15.2
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Physically beaten in the last 12 months		
No	4026	82.5
Yes	855	17.5
Total	4881	100.0
Missing	19	

#### Bivariate regression analysis outcome

Table 3 shows the bivariate logistic regression results; each independent variable was analyzed separately against the two outcome variables. The variables that were significantly associated with physical violence were: age, educational level, monthly income, current marital status, sex selling venues, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. Variables

significantly associated with rape were: educational level, income from selling sex, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week and condom breakage. HIV status was not significantly associated with either physical violence or rape.

Table 3. Bivariate logistic regression analyses of independent variables associated with physically beaten in the last 12 months and ever been raped since start selling sex, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI)

Variables	Physical beating	Rape	
	OR (95% CI)	OR (95% CI)	
Age			
15-24*			
25-34	1.02 (0.87, 1.19)	1.02 (0.86, 1.21)	
35+	0.52 (0.37, 0.74)	0.88 (0.64, 1.20)	
Educational level			
No Education*			
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	1.01 (0.79, 1.31)	1.45 (1.14,1.85)	
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	1.35 (1.11, 1.63)	1.08 (0.88,1.32)	
Secondary & above	1.49 (1.18, 1.87)	1.09 (0.85,1.41)	
Monthly income from selling sex			
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *			
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.44 (1.20, 1.73)	0.69 (0.58, 0.85)	
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.67 (1.35, 2.07)	0.51 (0.39, 0.66)	
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.61 (1.19, 2.17)	0.65 (0.46, 0.92)	
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	2.12 (1.44, 3.14)	1.01 (0.66, 1.55)	
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.62 (1.01, 2.58)	0.75 (0.44, 1.27)	
Current marital status			
Never Married*			
Married/Cohabited	1.05 (0.46, 2.41)	0.69 (0.24, 1.96)	
Separated/Divorced	0.93 (0.80, 1.09)	1.03 (0.88, 1.21)	

Widowed	0.59 (0.37, 0.95)	1.39 (0.95, 2.06)
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel*		
Local drinking houses	0.87 (0.69, 1.09)	-
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	0.45 (0.28, 0.71)	-
Red-light houses	0.95 (0.71, 1.27)	-
Street	1.51 (1.26, 1.82)	-
Others	1.37 (1.01, 1.86)	-
Frequency alcohol consumption		
Never*		
2 - 4 days a month	1.82 (1.35, 2.44)	1.74 (1.27, 2.38)
2 - 3 days a week	2.07 (1.66, 2.57)	1.87 (1.48, 2.36)
4 or more days a week	3.54 (2.87, 4.37)	3.43 (2.75, 4.28)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day		
1 or 2*		
3 or 4	1.39 (1.09, 1.76)	1.16 (0.92, 1.46)
5 or 6	2.03 (1.58, 2.62)	1.09 (0.84, 1.43)
7 to 9	2.19 (1.59, 3.03)	0.98 (0.68, 1.41)
10 or more	2.76 (1.88, 4.03)	1.78 (1.20, 2.65)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking		
Never*		
Less than monthly	1.43 (1.03, 1.98)	1.39 (0.99, 1.95)
Monthly	1.23 (0.90, 1.66)	1.59 (1.18, 2.13)
Weekly	1.73 (1.39, 2.14)	1.03 (0.80, 1.31)
Daily or almost daily	1.97 (1.53, 2.55)	1.69 (1.29, 2.21)
Drunk so much and can't remember what		
happened the next day		
No*		
Yes, in the last 30 days	2.90 (2.37, 3.56)	1.66 (1.33, 2.07)
Yes, before last 30 days	2.22 (1.65, 2.99)	1.27 (0.91, 1.78)

#### Frequency of khat chewing in a week

Never*		
Less than once a week	1.24 (0.96, 1.60)	0.89 (0.67, 1.19)
1-2 days per week	1.67 (1.28, 2.18)	2.89 (2.26, 3.69)
3-4 days per week	2.49 (1.87, 3.34)	2.92 (2.19, 3.89)
5-7 days per week	2.48 (2.08, 2.96)	1.47 (1.21, 1.79)
Condom breakage		
No*		
Yes	1.99 (1.69,2.33)	1.62 (1.37, 1.92)
HIV test result		
Negative*		
Positive	1.04 (0.88, 1.24)	0.88 (0.73, 1.07)

Note: \* Reference category

#### Multivariate analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten)

Table 4 shows the results of the multivariate analysis used to identify factors associated with physical violence after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers aged 35 years or above (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were significantly less likely to experience physical violence when compared with the younger age group (15-24years). FSWs who had attended primary 1st cycle education (AOR 0.71, 95% CI 0.52, 0.97) were also less likely to experience physical beating than those who reported no education. On the other hand, FSWs who worked on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) have an increased odds of experiencing to physical violence compared with FSWs who worked in bars/hotels. Moreover, substance use was significantly related to physical violence. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), those who did not remember what happened the next day due to heavy alcohol consumption both in the past 30 days (AOR 1.98, 95% CI 1.58, 2.49), and before the past 30 days (AOR 1.85, 95% CI 1.35, 2.53), and FSWs who chewed khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 1.58, 95% CI 1.13, 2.21) and 5-7 days per week (AOR 1.43, 95% CI 1.13, 1.80) had more likelihood of experiencing physical violence. Condom breakage experience

within the past 30 days prior to the study was also significantly associated with physical violence (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84).

Table 4. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten) in the past twelve months among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95%CI)
Age	
15-24*	
25-34	1.04 (0.82, 1.22)
35+	0.59 (0.38, 0.92)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	0.71 (0.52, 0.97)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	0.98 (0.77, 1.26)
Secondary & above	1.14 (0.85, 1.53)
Monthly income from selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *	
1001 – 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.13 (0.90, 1.41)
2001 – 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.14 (0.87, 1.48)
3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.12 (0.77, 1.61)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	1.44 (0.93, 2.24)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.12 (0.63, 1.99)
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.68 (0.24, 1.89)
Separated/Divorced	1.08 (0.88, 1.29)
Widowed 0.87 (0.48, 1.5	
Sex selling venues	
Bar/Hotel*	

Local drinking houses	1.35 (1.02, 1.78)
Spa/massage/beauty salon/own house	1.04 (0.58, 1.84)
Red-light houses	1.63 (1.12, 2.38)
Street	1.92 (1.53, 2.39)
Others	1.39 (0.98, 1.99)
Frequency alcohol consumption	
Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.25 (0.77, 2.04)
2 - 3 days a week	1.32 (0.84, 2.06)
4 or more days a week	1.92 (1.21, 3.04)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day	
1 or 2*	
3 or 4	1.08 (0.84, 1.39)
5 or 6	1.15 (0.85, 1.57)
7 to 9	1.09 (0.74, 1.64)
10 or more	1.14 (0.72, 1.81)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	
Never*	
Less than monthly	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Monthly	0.84 (0.59, 1.18)
Weekly	1.07 (0.82, 1.39)
Daily or almost daily	0.99 (0.71, 1.38)
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the ne	xt
day	
No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.98 (1.58, 2.49)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.85 (1.35, 2.53)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week	
Never*	
Less than once a week	1.04 (0.77, 1.42)

1-2 days per week	1.30 (0.96, 1.77)
3-4 days per week	1.58 (1.13, 2.21)
5-7 days per week	1.43 (1.13, 1.80)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.51 (1.25, 1.84)

Note: \* Reference category

#### Multivariate analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)

Table 5 shows the results of the multivariate logistic regression analyses to identify factors that were significantly associated with rape after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers with a monthly income of \$50 to \$200 were significantly less likely to experience rape compared to those with a monthly income of below \$50. Drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy drinking in the last 30 days and not remembering what happened the next day (AOR 1.34, 95% CI 1.05, 1.72), experience of heavy episodic drinking (HED) in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), experience of HED almost daily (AOR 1.49, 95% CI 1.06, 2.11) and chewing khat1-2 days (AOR 2.13, 95% CI 1.61, 2.83) and 3-4 days (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98) per week were positively associated with rape. Moreover, condom breakage (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55) was significantly more frequent among FSWs who reported rape.

Table 5. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)since sex selling start among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

OR (95%CI)	
0.62 (0.49, 0.77)	
0.42 (0.32, 0.57)	

3001 – 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	0.45 (0.29, 0.69)
4001 – 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	0.84 (0.53, 1.33)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	0.62 (0.34, 1.15)
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.57 (0.17, 1.97)
Separated/Divorced	1.01 (0.83, 1.22)
Widowed	1.61 (0.98, 2.63)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1-4)	1.06 (0.79, 1.43)
Primary 2nd cycle (5-8)	0.83 (0.65, 1.07)
Secondary & above	0.92 (0.68, 1.25)
Frequency of alcohol consumption	
Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.15 (0.69, 1.89)
2 - 3 days a week	1.24 (0.78, 1.96)
4 or more days a week	2.33 (1.47, 3.73)
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the	
next day	
No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.34 (1.05, 1.72)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	
Never*	
Less than monthly	1.61 (1.12, 2.32)
Monthly	1.71 (1.24, 2.38)
Weekly	1.04 (0.78, 1.38)
Daily or almost daily	1.49 (1.06, 2.11)

Frequency of khat chewing in a week

Never*	
less than once a week	0.83 (0.59, 1.16)
1-2 days per week	2.13 (1.61, 2.83)
3-4 days per week	2.15 (1.55, 2.98)
5-7 days per week	1.06 (0.83, 1.36)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.26 (1.03, 1.55)

Note: \* Reference category

#### **Discussion**

According to this study, 17.5% of FSWs in Ethiopia had been physically beaten within the past 12 months and 15.2% had been raped since they started selling sex. Age, sex selling venues, and high consumption of alcohol and khat were significant predictors of physical violence (beating). On the other hand, the significant predictors of sexual violence (rape) were low income and also high consumption of alcohol and khat.

The prevalence of both physical violence and sexual violence (rape) was lower than the prevalence found in studies conducted in Uganda, Ivory Coast, and Kenya(9, 12, 30, 32). However, when compared to the studies conducted in Adama (Ethiopia), China, India, and Mexico, the current study reported a higher prevalence of both physical and sexual violence (10, 11, 13, 14, 33). The difference in the definition of violence used might be one of the possible explanations for the difference between the current results and those found in other studies in Africa. Most of the studies assessed all forms of physical and sexual violence while the current study assessed solely physical beating and forced penetrative sex (rape). On the other hand, differences in results across settings might also be due to differences in background and contextual factors such as socioeconomic status and cultural aspects.

Several studies showed that younger FSWs are more exposed to physical and sexual violence (13, 34) in line with the current findings that younger FSWs (15-24years) were at higher risk for

physical violence when compared to their older counterparts (35+years). Perpetrators' find it easier to manipulate younger FSWs and this might play a role in their increased exposure to violence. That younger FSWs are especially vulnerable to violence has important implications due to the increasing number of younger FSWs who are entering the sex trade. Therefore, to minimize the vulnerability of younger FSWs, intervention programs need to create awareness about the factors that increase the likelihood of violence and to ensure that younger FSWs are particularly addressed in such programs.

Even though sex work is not a legally recognized profession in Ethiopia, most of the establishments where the sex workers are based (hotels, bars/restaurants, nightclubs, etc.) operate legally with working licenses. Nevertheless, some FSWs work on the street and in red-light houses where they manage their own working area. Consequently, the extent to which physical violence occurs may vary according to their working area. The present study revealed that FSWs who mainly work in bars and hotels face less physical beating when compared with FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses. This finding is in-line with studies conducted in New York City and England (20, 21). This might be due to the level of protection in their working areas and/or due to the type of clients who frequents those localities. This means that engaging bar/hotel managers in the prevention activities could be an additional strategy to increase the effectiveness of harm reduction programs.

On the other hand, FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses experience more violence. Most of these venues are located in the slum areas of the cities, and such areas are often the focus of police efforts to control various unwanted activities. In this regard, FSWs are one of the targets of the police and face harassment, beating, and arrest. Due to that, the reporting rate of violence is very poor, and the actions of the police also make the use of violence seem legitimate among FSWs. Therefore, to minimize the harm in these localities, involving the police force in violence prevention activities is crucial and should be one of the first steps. In addition, a peer education program led by the sex workers could be an additional strategy. It could help FSWs to create information sharing platform to discuss the incidences of violence, types of perpetrators, etc., which could raise awareness and help them to become more alert.

Furthermore, an association between alcohol use and higher frequency of physical violence and rape was reported. In particular, FSWs who consume alcohol more than four days a week and those with experience of HED were significantly more likely to experience violence. Several studies conducted in Ethiopia, Uganda, and Kenya also reported similar findings (9, 10, 12, 19). A large proportion of female sex workers (FSWs) use alcohol prior to or during sex to helps them to solicit clients and overcome their shyness (35, 36). In particular high level of alcohol consumption places FSWs in disadvantaged situations by intensifying their vulnerability (8). Research reviews also report that alcohol use impairs FSWs' ability to detect the risk of violence and increases their vulnerability to risk-prone situations (37, 38). The consequences of HED are not just limited to the physical effects of intoxication but further exposes them to violence and risky sexual behaviors.

Correspondingly, chewing khat more days in a week was significantly associated with experience of physical violence and rape. After chewing khat, some of the users consume alcohol-containing drinks to decrease the level of stimulation. Although there is no previous study on the relationship between khat chewing and experience of violence among FSWs, most FSWs chew khat before departing for work. In the bar, they drink alcohol to minimize the effect, which in turn exposes them to HED and violence. Further studies should assess the contribution of Khat chewing to increasing violence experience independently.

The extent to which alcohol use/Khat chewing are risk factors for the occurrence of experiences of violence must be interpreted with caution. Since physical beating was measured within the past 12 months and rape was measured since they started selling sex, the participants' current Khat chewing or alcohol consumption status might not be an accurate indicator of the consumption status at the time of the violence. In addition, the current use of substances might be a means to cope with the trauma related to the experience of violence.

In addition, the resistance to condom use from clients and the violence experience may create a difficult situation for FSWs with regard to proper use of condoms, which further exposes FSWs to HIV and other STIs. In this study there was a significant relationship between condom breakage and history of physical beating and rape. Even though there was no significant association between HIV and violence, the proportion of HIV positive FSWs in the sample was high (23%). A study

conducted in Benin reported a similar finding concerning the association between condom breakage and violence, but unlike our study there was a significant association between HIV and violence experience (23). This finding indicates that solely providing condoms will not be effective to prevent HIV and other STIs transmission. Rather working on factors which contribute to not utilizing condoms properly (such as violence) could be an additional strategy for HIV prevention programs.

In general, our study demonstrates that sex workers are particularly vulnerable to physical beating and rape. Nevertheless, the harm reduction program among FSWs in Ethiopia is poor. Given the associations between violence and unprotected sex, the HIV control program may not accomplish epidemic control without also addressing violence. Therefore, combining both programs could yield better results with regard to attaining epidemic control as well as reducing the harm associated with violence. In addition, this study shows that different factors (such as sex selling venues, the age of FSWs, and level of alcohol use etc.) were associated with violence among FSWs, signifying the need of different approaches to minimize the incidence of violence (39). At the individual level, efforts to reduce violence could focus on developing educational materials and creating awareness for sex workers about their legal rights and about how to prevent, reduce and respond to violence (40). In addition, involving the community in the prevention program could play a vital role especially towards reducing stigma and discrimination towards FSWs, which in turn would create a suitable environment for FSWs to stand up for their rights. Furthermore, involving police and law enforcement authorities to reduce harassment could play a greater role in violence reduction.

Finally, there were some similarities but also differences concerning the predictors of rape and physical violence. For example, being in the younger age group was a significant predictor of physical beating but not rape, and having lower income was associated with rape but not with physical beating. Nevertheless, based on the current data, it is difficult to draw any conclusions about why one variable would matter for physical beating but not for rape. The reasons underlying the differences are currently unknown, and further research might be required to gain an understanding of the patterns observed.

#### **Methodological considerations**

There are a limited number of studies on violence among FSWs in Ethiopia and the existing studies are restricted to one city (9, 10). One of the strengths of this study is that it involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country. The second strength is the sampling technique; the study used a respondent-driven sampling, which is a strategy recommended for hard-to-reach populations and which is believed to give a representative sample of the target population. The third strength is the assessment of their HIV status on site using the national testing algorithm. In addition, the pilot study conducted prior to the actual implementation added strength for the main study protocol.

This study also had limitations. First, sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias. Second, recall bias could have occurred because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they started selling sex. We tried to minimize underreporting through intense interviewer training. In addition, since it was a cross-sectional study, participants were assessed only once; thus, it would be difficult to infer the temporal association between a risk factor and the outcome measures, i.e. physical violence and rape.

Furthermore, the results regarding correlates of physical and sexual violence among FSWs in Ethiopia might have limited generalizability across settings. However, these results are likely to be relevant for other FSWs in other African countries that have a similar setting as Ethiopia, and may inform targeted prevention strategies for this key population.

#### **Conclusion**

In general, FSWs are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and are high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, to reduce physical and sexual violence, strategies to secure and improve their work environment should be a critical component of targeted interventions. Increasing awareness regarding the role of khat chewing and alcohol drinking towards vulnerability to violence should be an integral component of HIV

prevention and violence reduction programs. In addition, targeted efforts should be made for the younger FSWs to reduce their vulnerability.

#### Acknowledgments

We would like to express gratitude to the study participants and the data collectors.

Conflict of Interest: None to declare.

#### **Authors contributions**

MA and AA developed the study design. MA analyzed and interpreted the data and drafted the manuscript. AA was involved in the data analysis and interpretation, and in the writing of the manuscript. TT was involved in the interpretation of the data and contributed to the writing of the manuscript. All authors approved the final manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no specific grant from any funding agency.

**Data sharing statement:** No additional data available.

#### Reference

- 1. Jewkes R. Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention. The Lancet. 2002;359(9315):1423-9.
- 2. World Health Organization, Global and regional estimates of violence against women: prevale nce and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence: executive summary.

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/85239/9789241564625\_eng.pdf;jsessionid=6 E940F74EB1BC5204EEDE0FC6D26F358?sequence=1

- 3. Glasier A, Gulmezoglu AM, Schmid GP, Moreno CG, Van Look PF. Sexual and reproductive health: a matter of life and death. The lancet. 2006;368(9547):1595-607.
- 4. Perry A. Risk Factors of Gender-based Sexual Violence. RTM Insights.23.

  <a href="http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgenderbasedsexual\_violenc">http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgenderbasedsexual\_violenc</a>

  e rtminsights23.pdf
- 5. Godwin J. Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific. Bangkok: United Nations Develop ment Programme.

http://www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/hivaids/English/HIV2012SexWorkAndLaw.pdf

- 6. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Article 634:(Proclamation No. 414/2004) 2004.
- 7. World Health Organization, Addressing violence against women and achieving the Millennium Development Goals. 2005.
- 8. World Health Organization, Addressing Violence against Sex Workers 2013. https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex\_worker\_implementation/swit\_chpt2.pdf
- Alemayehu M, Yohannes G, Damte A, Fantahun A, Gebrekirstos K, Tsegay R, et al. Prevalence and predictors of sexual violence among commercial sex workers in Northern Ethiopia. Reproductive health. 2015;12(1):47.
- 10. Mooney A, Kidanu A, Bradley HM, Kumoji EK, Kennedy CE, Kerrigan D. Work-related violence and inconsistent condom use with non-paying partners among female sex workers in Adama City, Ethiopia. BMC public health. 2013;13(1):771.
- 11. Misganaw AC, Worku YA. Assessment of sexual violence among street females in Bahir-Dar town, North West Ethiopia: a mixed method study. BMC Public Health.13(1):825.
- 12. Schwitters A, Swaminathan M, Serwadda D, Muyonga M, Shiraishi RW, Benech I, et al. Prevalence of rape and client-initiated gender-based violence among female sex workers: Kampala, Uganda, 2012. AIDS and Behavior.19(1):68-76.
- 13. Beattie TS, Bhattacharjee P, Ramesh B, Gurnani V, Anthony J, Isac S, et al. Violence against female sex workers in Karnataka state, south India: impact on health, and reductions in violence following an intervention program. BMC Public Health. p. 476.
- 14. Kelvin EA, Sun X, Mantell JE, Zhou J, Mao J, Peng Y. Vulnerability to sexual violence and participation in sex work among high-end entertainment centre workers in Hunan Province, China. Sexual health.10(5):391-9.
- 15. Wolffers I. Violence repression and other health threats. Research for sex work. 2001;4:1-2. https://www.nswp.org/sites/nswp.org/files/research-for-sex-work-4-english.pdf
- 16. Hanck SE, Blankenship KM, Irwin KS, West BS, Kershaw T. Assessment of self-reported sexual behavior and condom use among female sex workers in India using a polling box approach: a preliminary report. Sexually transmitted diseases. 2008;35(5):489-94.

- 17. Parcesepe AM, Kelly L, Martin SL, Green S, Sinkele W, Suchindran C, et al. The impact of an alcohol harm reduction intervention on interpersonal violence and engagement in sex work among female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya: Results from a randomized controlled trial. Drug and alcohol dependence.161:21-8.
- 18. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam WK, Parry CD, Morojele NK. Substance use, sexual risk, and violence: HIV prevention intervention with sex workers in Pretoria. AIDS and Behavior. 2006;10(2):131.
- 19. Chersich M, Luchters S, Malonza I, Mwarogo P, King'Ola N, Temmerman M. Heavy episodic drinking among Kenyan female sex workers is associated with unsafe sex, sexual violence and sexually transmitted infections. International journal of STD & AIDS2007. p. 764-9.
- 20. Church S, Henderson M, Barnard M, Hart G. Violence by clients towards female prostitutes in different work settings: questionnaire survey. Bmj. 2001;322(7285):524-5.
- 21. El-Bassel N, Witte SS, Wada T, Gilbert L, Wallace J. Correlates of partner violence among female street-based sex workers: substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. AIDS patient care and STDs. 2001;15(1):41-51.
- 22. Masvawure TB, Mantell JE, Tocco JU, Gichangi P, Restar A, Chabeda SV, et al. Intentional and unintentional condom breakage and slippage in the sexual interactions of female and male sex workers and clients in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior.22(2):637-48.
- 23. Tounkara FK, Diabate S, Guedou FA, Ahoussinou Cm, Kintin Fdr, Zannou DM, et al. Violence, condom breakage and HIV infection among female sex workers in Benin, West Africa. Sexually transmitted diseases.41(5):312.
- 24. Choi SY, Chen KL, Jiang ZQ. Client-perpetuated violence and condom failure among female sex workers in southwestern China. Sex Transm Dis2008.
- 25. Wilson KS, Deya R, Yuhas K, Simoni J, Vander Stoep A, Shafi J, et al. A prospective cohort study of intimate partner violence and unprotected sex in HIV-positive female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior.20(9):2054-64.
- 26. Okal J, Chersich MF, Tsui S, Sutherland E, Temmerman M, Luchters S. Sexual and physical violence against female sex workers in Kenya: a qualitative enquiry. AIDS care.23(5):612-8.
- 27. Ethiopian National Key Population HIV Bio-behavioral Surveillance Round I Report. 2013
- 28. HIV Related Estimates and Projections for Ethiopia-2015

- 29. Decker MR, Lyons C, Billong SC, Njindam IM, Grosso A, Nunez GT, et al. Gender-based violence against female sex workers in Cameroon: prevalence and associations with sexual HIV risk and access to health services and justice. Sex Transm Infect.92(8):599-604.
- 30. Lyons CE, Grosso A, Drame FM, Ketende S, Diouf D, Ba I, et al. Physical and Sexual Violence Affecting Female Sex Workers in Abidjan, CÃ'te d'Ivoire: Prevalence, and the Relationship with the Work Environment, HIV, and Access to Health Services. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes.75(1):9-17.
- 31. World Health Organization, Assessment of khat (Catha edulis Forsk) 34th ECDD 2006/4.4. <a href="http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality\_safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf">http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality\_safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf</a>.
- 32. Wilson KS, Deya R, Masese L, Simoni JM, Stoep AV, Shafi J, et al. Prevalence and correlates of intimate partner violence in HIV-positive women engaged in transactional sex in Mombasa, Kenya. International journal of STD & AIDS.27(13):1194-203.
- 33. Semple SJ, Stockman JK, Pitpitan EV, Strathdee SA, Chavarin CV, Mendoza DV, et al. Prevalence and correlates of client-perpetrated violence against female sex workers in 13 Mexican cities. PloS one.10(11):e0143317.
- 34. Silverman JG. Adolescent female sex workers: invisibility, violence and HIV. Archives of disease in childhood.archdischild178715.
- 35. Sharma S, Singh S, Talukdar B. Understanding the Factors Associated with Alcohol Use among Female Sex Workers in a High HIV Prevalence Northeast State of India. J Infec Dis Treat. 2016;2:1.
- 36. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam W. Violence against substance-abusing South African sex workers: intersection with culture and HIV risk. AIDS care. 2005;17(sup1):55-64.
- 37. George WH, Stoner SA. Understanding acute alcohol effects on sexual behavior. Annual review of sex research. 2000;11(1):92-124.
- 38. Mbonye M, Rutakumwa R, Weiss H, Seeley J. Alcohol consumption and high risk sexual behaviour among female sex workers in Uganda. African Journal of AIDS Research.13(2):145-51.
- 39. Reed E, Gupta J, Biradavolu M, Devireddy V, Blankenship KM. The context of economic insecurity and its relation to violence and risk factors for HIV among female sex workers in Andhra Pradesh, India. Public Health Reports. 2010;125(4 suppl):81-9.

40. Hail-Jares K, Chang RC, Choi S, Zheng H, He N, Huang ZJ. Intimate-partner and client-initiated violence among female street-based sex workers in China: does a support network help? PloS one. 2015;10(9):e0139161.



### Reporting checklist for cross sectional study.

Based on the STROBE cross sectional guidelines.

#### Instructions to authors

Complete this checklist by entering the page numbers from your manuscript where readers will find each of the items listed below.

Your article may not currently address all the items on the checklist. Please modify your text to include the missing information. If you are certain that an item does not apply, please write "n/a" and provide a short explanation.

Upload your completed checklist as an extra file when you submit to a journal.

In your methods section, say that you used the STROBE cross sectional reporting guidelines, and cite them as:

von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies.

			Page
		Reporting Item	Number
Title	<u>#1a</u>	Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
Abstract	<u>#1b</u>	Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	1

Background /	<u>#2</u>	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the 2	
rationale		investigation being reported	
Objectives	<u>#3</u>	State specific objectives, including any prespecified	3
		hypotheses	
Study design	<u>#4</u>	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	4
Setting	<u>#5</u>	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including	4, 5, 6
		periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	
Eligibility criteria	<u>#6a</u>	Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of	5
		selection of participants.	
	<u>#7</u>	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential	6
		confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if	
		applicable	
Data sources /	<u>#8</u>	For each variable of interest give sources of data and details of	6
measurement		methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	
		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one	
		group. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
Bias	<u>#9</u>	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	2, 18
Study size	<u>#10</u>	Explain how the study size was arrived at	5
Quantitative	<u>#11</u>	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the	6
variables		analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen,	
		and why	

Statistical	<u>#12a</u>	Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control	7
methods		for confounding	
	#12b	Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and	NA
		interactions	
	#100	Evalois how missing data ware addressed	0
	<u>#12c</u>	Explain how missing data were addressed	8
	#12d	If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of	NA
		sampling strategy	
	<u>#12e</u>	Describe any sensitivity analyses	7
Participants	<u>#13a</u>	Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg	5
		numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility, confirmed	
		eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and	
		analysed. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	<u>#13b</u>	Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	5
	<u>#13c</u>	Consider use of a flow diagram	
Descriptive data	<u>#14a</u>	Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic,	
		clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential	
		confounders. Give information separately for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
	<u>#14b</u>	Indicate number of participants with missing data for each	8, 9 in
		variable of interest	tables
Outcome data	<u>#15</u>	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures.	na
For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml			

Give information separately for exposed and unexposed

	groups if applicable.	
<u>#16a</u>	Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-	7 - 10
	adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	
	interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and	
	why they were included	
<u>#16b</u>	Report category boundaries when continuous variables were	
	categorized	
<u>#16c</u>	If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into	
	absolute risk for a meaningful time period	
<u>#17</u>	Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and	10 -16
	interactions, and sensitivity analyses	
<u>#18</u>	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	
<u>#19</u>	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of	18
	potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and	
	magnitude of any potential bias.	
<u>#20</u>	Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives,	16 -18
	limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies,	
	and other relevant evidence.	
<u>#21</u>	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study	19
	results	
<u>#22</u>	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the	20
Forno	present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which	
	#16b #16c #17 #18 #19 #20 #21	#16a Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounderadjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included  #16b Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized  #16c If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period  #17 Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses  #18 Summarise key results with reference to study objectives  #19 Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias.  #20 Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence.  #21 Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results  #22 Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the

the present article is based

The STROBE checklist is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License CC-BY. This checklist can be completed online using https://www.goodreports.org/, a tool made by the EQUATOR Network in collaboration with Penelope.ai



## **BMJ Open**

# Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-028247.R3
Article Type:	Research
Date Submitted by the Author:	02-Jul-2019
Complete List of Authors:	Amogne, Minilik; Lunds Universitet, social medicin and global health; Ethiopian Public Health Institute, TB/HIV Department Balcha, Taye; Armauer Hansen Research Institute Agardh, Anette; Lunds University Faculty of Medicine
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Public health
Secondary Subject Heading:	Public health, Sexual health, HIV/AIDS, Epidemiology
Keywords:	female sex workers, physical violence, rape, Substance use, Ethiopia

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

Prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among female sex workers in Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study with respondent-driven sampling from 11 major towns Minilik Demissie<sup>1,2</sup>, Taye Tolera Balcha<sup>3</sup>, Anette Agardh<sup>1</sup>

#### Author affiliation

- 1. Social Medicine and Global Health, Department of Clinical Sciences, Malmo, Lund University, Malmo, Sweden
- 2. Ethiopian Public Health Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- 3. Armauer Hansen Research Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Corresponding author

Minilik Demissie Amogne, minilik.demissie@med.lu.se

#### **Abstract**

**Objective:** This study examined the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia.

**Design:** A cross-sectional study using respondent-driven sampling technique

**Setting:** Eleven major towns in Ethiopia

Participants: 4900 female sex workers (FSWs)

Main outcome measures: The prevalence of experiences of physical beating and rape

**Results:** Among FSWs, 17.5% reported physical beating within the past year and 15.2% reported rape since they started selling sex. FSWs aged 35+ years (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were less exposed to physical beating than those aged 15-24 years. FSWs working on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38), and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) experienced more physical beating than FSWs working in bars/hotels. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), and who chewed khat frequently experienced more physical violence. Rape was associated with having a low monthly income, drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy episodic drinking in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), and chewing khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98). Condom breakage was more

frequent among FSWs who reported both physical beating (AOR1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84) and rape (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55).

**Conclusion:** FSWs in Ethiopia are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, targeted efforts are needed for prevention and harm reduction.

Keywords: female sex workers, physical violence, rape, substance use, Ethiopia

#### Strengths and limitations of this study

- The study involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country with a large sample size.
- The study used a respondent-driven sampling, a technique that is recommended for hard to reach populations.
- Sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias.
- Recall bias could have occurred because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they started selling sex.
- Due to a cross-sectional study design, the influence of alcohol use/khat chewing must be interpreted with caution, since the participants' current consumption status might not be an accurate indicator of the consumption status at the time of the violence.

#### Introduction

As per WHO definition, violence is the intentional use of physical force or power against another person or group, which has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, or sexual or psychological harm (1). Violence against women is a global phenomenon, as more than one in three women worldwide is beaten, coerced into sex, or abused in her lifetime (2). Furthermore, violence is one of the main contributors to poor sexual and reproductive health among women, leading to unintended pregnancy, self-induced abortions, gynecologic problems, sexual dysfunction, and sexually transmitted infections (STIs), including HIV (3, 4).

In most countries, female sex work is either illegal or has an uncertain legal status. For example, prostitution is not illegal but approaching sex workers in public is illegal; this makes authorities reluctant to offer protection or support, which in turn legitimizes violence and discrimination against sex workers (5). In the case of Ethiopia, it is illegal to operate a brothel or procure sex workers as a commercial activity, but the sale of sex by women is neither prohibited nor legally recognized as a profession (6). Female sex workers (FSWs) frequently face harassment and violence, not only because of their illegitimate status, but also as a manifestation of gender inequality and discrimination directed towards women (7, 8).

Violence against FSWs can be perpetrated by anyone, including police officers, intimate partners, and clients. In Adama and Mekelle towns in Ethiopia, nearly 60% and 75% of female sex workers, respectively, reported lifetime violence (9, 10). In the same study in Adama, 8% of FSW reported forced sex since they started sex work (10). In another study conducted among homeless street females in Bahirdar town, 11.4% of them reported having been raped during the last one year period (11). In Uganda, 40% of FSWs reported physical abuse, and 49 % had been raped at least once in their lifetime (12). In another study conducted in Hunan, China and Karnataka, India,16% and 9% of female sex workers, respectively, reported work-related violence (13, 14).

Several risk factors have been found to have an association with physical and sexual violence against FSWs. Socio-economic characteristics, risky sexual behaviors and substance abuse are the most mentioned factors worldwide (9, 10, 15, 16). A randomized controlled trial study in Kenya and South Africa showed that alcohol consumption reduction by FSWs had a significant

contribution to violence reduction (17, 18). Moreover, establishments where alcohol and other drugs are consumed are associated with an increased likelihood of people becoming violent towards sex workers (8, 19). However, other studies suggest that FSWs who work outdoors face more violence than those who work indoors (20, 21).

Violence towards FSWs may also be associated with condom use and condom breakage. Studies conducted among FSWs have found several intentional and unintentional factors associated with condom breakage during sex work. These factors included being drunk or high on drugs, wearing unfitting condoms, incorrect condom use, and having violent or rough sex (22, 23). Moreover, violence towards FSWs may also be linked to disagreement over condom use, which increases the risk of acquiring HIV and other STIs (21, 24-26). In Ethiopia, the weighted HIV prevalence among FSWs is estimated to be 23% (27), while it is 1.2 % in the general population (28), which shows the magnitude of the potential risk exposure among FSWs. In addition, violence also prevents sex workers from seeking appropriate health services (26, 29, 30).

In general, 120,000 to 160,000 FSWs are estimated to live in Ethiopia, working in different venues, mainly in bars and hotels, Key-mebrat (red lighthouses), local drinking houses, and on the street (27). Currently, the number of female sex workers is growing, with increasing numbers of young girls entering the sex trade.

This study explores the prevalence and correlates of physical violence and rape among FSWs in Ethiopia. Successful strategies for handling the trauma may vary by the type of violence experienced. Therefore, identification of risk factors that are specific to various types of violence has the potential to inform the development of evidence-based prevention programs. In addition, generating such types of evidence based on national level data will help to promote effective prevention for female sex workers.

#### Methods

#### Study design

This study was part of a larger study concerning HIV prevalence and related risk factors among female sex workers and long-distance drivers that was carried out in Ethiopia in 2014. A cross-sectional study design using Respondent Driven Sampling technique (RDS) was used for data collection. RDS is a complex sampling method based on a chain-referral design and recommended for hard-to-reach populations. At all data collection sites, initial FSW "seeds" were selected to start the sampling process. Seeds were selected purposively to represent the type of sex worker, age category, and geographic location. They were identified through formative assessments with key stakeholders working with FSWs and representatives of FSWs. The selected seeds were those who were well-connected with their community and reported large social networks.

A maximum of three recruits per seed was allowed and only one-time participation was ensured by using a fingerprint-scanning device. Recruitment pattern (who recruited whom) was tracked and network size was determined.

#### Study area, period and population

The study locations were the seven major regional towns and the four main transport corridor towns. The seven major regional towns were: Addis Ababa, Bahirdar, Mekelle, Hawassa, Adama, Gambela, and Dire-dawa. The four transport corridor towns were Semera-Logia (Addis Ababa-Djibouti route), Kombolcha (Addis Ababa-Mekelle route), Metema (Addis Ababa-Metema route), and Shashemene (Addis Ababa - Moyale route).

The source populations were all female sex workers living in those selected eleven towns. For the purpose of the study, female sex workers were defined as follows: 'women who practice sexual activity with the pre-conditions of financial or in-kind benefits'. The inclusion criteria were: receiving money or other benefits for sex with four or more people within the last 30 days, being 15 and above years old, properly recruited by a peer (presenting with the coupon), and giving consent both for the interview and blood drawing.

#### Sample size

The source study protocol calculated that a sample size of 400 female sex workers was needed in each town using anticipated HIV prevalence of 25%, 6% precision, 95% CI, and design effect of two. However, the number of female sex workers who participated in each town was not exactly 400, and the total number of FSWs who participated in the study was 4900.

#### **Data collection procedure**

Six seed FSWs were selected to initiate coupon-based recruitment. Eligible FSWs who provided informed consent to participate were administered a face to face interview in a private room by a nurse with a structured questionnaire in Amharic language. They then provided blood specimens for HIV, CD4, and viral load testing in a private room. When the process was completed, participants were provided with up to three coupons and instructed to recruit their FSW peers into the study. To compensate the time and costs of transport, a primary incentive of 100 ETB (\$5.0) and additional 50 ETB (\$2.5) for each eligible peer she enrolled into the study was given. An electronic data base for tracking coupons and recruitment was established with participant ID, fingerprint code, and a pre-printed label that was scanned. The data collection tools and questionnaire were pretested in a pilot study; feedback from the pilot study was used to finalize the data collection tools and field logistic and operational procedures. The questionnaire included: socio-demographic characteristics, sexual risk exposure, sexual behaviors, condom use, history of STI symptoms, alcohol and drug use consumption, violence related issues, knowledge of HIV transmission, and HIV testing history.

#### **Variables**

Violence was assessed with two dependent variables, which were physical beating during the last one year and rape since sex selling started. The following questions were asked: "When exchanging sex for money during the last one year, have you ever been physically beaten by a sexual partner or client?" and "Have you ever been raped or forced to have sex against your will since you start selling sex?". Responses were dichotomized into a Yes and No variable for analysis. For both of the questions, all who had reported beating and rape at least once were considered as having experienced violence (Yes).

The different time periods used to assess experiences of physical beating and rape were based on the presumed frequency of the two different types of violence. Physical beating might occur more frequently, while rape presumably occurs less frequently. Therefore, to measure the general burden of the two experiences, we specifically selected the time period that might be appropriate for the recall of the particular experience.

The independent measures included current age, monthly income from selling sex, marital status, educational status, sex selling venue, khat chewing, alcohol drinking, HIV status, and condom breakage.

Current age was a continuous variable and for the purpose of analysis categorized as ten-year intervals: younger (15-24), middle age (25-34), and older one (35+), with the younger age group used as the reference category. Monthly income from selling sex was an open-ended question and for the analysis was categorized into 1000 birr (\$50) intervals considering the cost of living in the country. Educational status was categorized as no formal education, primary first cycle (grade 1-4), primary second cycle (grade 5-8), and secondary and above for analysis, in accordance with the country education system.

In addition, sex workers were categorized based on their sex-selling venue, where bar/hotel was used as the reference because it is the most common FSW working venue. In addition, this venue category has better security than the other venues, and there were greater numbers of FSWs in this category.

Alcohol consumption was measured by different indicators, including frequency of alcohol consumption, number of drinks per specific day and frequency of heavy episodic drinking (6 or more standard drinks per day).

Frequency of khat chewing was assessed according to the number of days that they chewed in a week. Khat (Catha edulis) is a stimulant leaf, and after chewing khat, an individual may become talkative, alert, feel excitement, increased self-esteem, and increased imagination (31). Khat chewing is also popular among FSWs, as it is a means to spend the daytime, to be active during the night for sex work, and to socialize with each other.

#### Data analysis

Statistical analysis was performed using SPSS Version 20. Descriptive statistics were used to provide summary measures (means, frequencies). Odds ratios (crude and adjusted) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) were obtained using bivariate and multivariate logistic regression analysis. Those independent variables significantly associated with the outcome variable in the bivariate analysis were included in the multivariate analysis. In addition, correlation analysis was performed to examine potential multicollinearity; no correlation was found between the variables. Cases with missing data were excluded from the analyses. Significance was accepted at p-value <0.05.

During data collection, we did not specifically assess where FSWs experienced the violence (in the current town or in another town). Because FSWs are highly mobile from one town to another, it would be inaccurate to assume that their experiences of violence occurred in the town from which they were sampled. Therefore, during analysis, we did not conduct any statistical analysis that assessed the contribution of the sampling site (participant's town) to the experience of violence.

#### **Ethical considerations**

Permission for data use was obtained from the Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI). The protocol was cleared at the Scientific and Ethical Research Office (SERO) of EPHI, the Ethiopian Science and Technology Ministry Ethical Committee, and CDC-Atlanta IRB. Individual written informed consent was obtained from each participant for the interview and blood sample collection while the study was conducted.

#### **Patient and Public Involvement**

During the design or implementation of the study, no patients were involved in the development of the research question and outcome measures. Nevertheless, due to the nature of the respondent driven sampling methodology, an assessment was conducted to identify seeds and hotspot areas for the actual data collection. This assessment was conducted in collaboration with organizations working with FSWs and an active member of FSWs in those organizations. The primary results will be disseminate by publication in peer-reviewed journals and presented at the national level for stakeholders working with FSWs.

#### Results

#### Socio-demographic and other background characteristics

A total of 4900 female sex workers participated in the study. Demographic, socioeconomic, and other background characteristics of the participants are shown in Table 1. The majority of the participants were between 15 to 24 years old with a mean age of 24 years (SD= 5.7); 44 % of them were divorced, separated or widowed. A quarter of them reported being uneducated and 40% of them earned on average less than \$50 per month. Regarding sex selling starting age, the majority started selling sex between the ages of 18-24 years, although nearly 25% started before the age of 18. FSWs work in different eating, drinking and recreation establishments, as well as other venues; 33% recruited their clients in bars/hotels, followed by 26.5% on the street, and 20% in local drinking houses (Table 1).

Table 1. Distribution of socio-demographic and other background characteristics among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Age	16.	
15 - 24	2831	57.8
25 - 34	1700	34.7
35+	369	7.5
Total	4900	100.0
Missing	0	
Mean age of respondents = 24.16		
SD= 5.7		
Educational status		
No Education	1224	25.0
Primary 1st cycle (1 - 4)	764	16.0
Primary 2nd cycle (5 - 8)	2062	42.0
Secondary & above	831	17.0
Total	4881	100.0

Missing	19	
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel	1613	33.0
Local drinking houses	983	20.1
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	261	5.3
Red-light houses	429	8.8
Street	1295	26.5
Other	304	6.2
Total	4885	100.0
Missing	15	
Current marital status		
Never Married	2698	55.2
Married/Cohabited	37	0.8
Separated/Divorced	1976	40.5
Widowed	173	3.5
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	
Sex selling starting age		
Less than 15	120	2.5
15 - 17	1088	22.3
18 - 24	2864	58.7
25 - 29	583	12.0
30 & above	220	4.5
Total	4875	100.0
Missing	25	
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 (<\$50)	1932	39.6
1001 - 2000 (\$50 - \$100)	1554	31.8
2001 - 3000 (\$100 - \$150)	812	16.6
3001 - 4000 (\$150 - \$200)	318	6.5

4001 - 5000 (\$200 - \$250)	150	3.1
Above 5000 (>\$250)	117	2.4
Total	4883	100.0
Missing	17	

#### Behavioral and other related factors

Table 2 shows the prevalence of behavioral and other factors. The majority (70%) of the respondents consumed alcohol, and of those, 15.8% had drunk so much on a typical day within the past 30 days that they did not remember what happened the next day. About half of the respondents chewed khat, and 23.8% of them chewed almost every day (5-7 days a week).

Regarding condom use, 25.5% of them reported condom breakage within the past 30 days prior to the study. HIV/AIDS status of the respondents was also assessed and a quarter of them (23%) were HIV positive. With regard to physical and sexual violence experience, 17.5% of them reported physical beating within the past 12 months and 15.2% reported having been raped since they started selling sex. (Table 2)

Table 2. Behavioral and other related factors among 4900 female sex workers across eleven towns, Ethiopia

Variable	Frequency	Percentage
Frequency alcohol consumption	on	70.
Never	1493	30.6
Once a month or less	222	4.5
2 - 4 days a month	492	10.1
2 - 3 days a week	1394	28.5
4 or more days a week	1283	26.3
Total	4884	100.0
Missing	16	

Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day

1 or 2	806	23.8
3 or 4	1383	40.8
5 or 6	742	21.9
7 to 9	296	8.7
10 or more	164	4.8
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	9	
Never	1863	54.9
Less than monthly	236	7.0
Monthly	299	8.8
Weekly	630	18.6
Daily or almost daily	363	10.7
Total	3391	100.0
Missing	0	
Drunk so much and can't remember		
what happened the next day		
Yes, in last 30 days	534	15.8
Yes, not in last 30 days	233	6.9
No	2609	77.2
Don't remember	4	0.1
Total	3380	100.0
Missing	11	
Frequency of khat chewing		
Never	2431	49.8
Less than once a week	577	11.8
1 - 2 days per week	429	8.8
3 - 4 days per week	284	5.8
5 - 7 days per week	1162	23.8
Total	4883	100.0

17	
1243	25.5
3635	74.5
4878	
22	
3708	76.0
1173	24.0
4881	100.0
19	
4142	84.8
742	15.2
4884	100.0
16	
4026	82.5
855	17.5
4881	100.0
19	
	1243 3635 4878 22 3708 1173 4881 19 4142 742 4884 16 4026 855 4881

# Bivariate regression analysis outcome

Table 3 shows the bivariate logistic regression results; each independent variable was analyzed separately against the two outcome variables. The variables that were significantly associated with physical violence were: age, educational level, average monthly income from selling sex, current marital status, sex selling venues, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week, and

condom breakage. Variables significantly associated with rape were educational level, average monthly income from selling sex, frequency of alcohol consumption, alcohol containing drinks on a typical day, frequency of heavy episodic drinking, frequency of khat chewing in a week, and condom breakage. HIV status was not significantly associated with either physical violence or rape.

Table 3. Bivariate logistic regression analyses of independent variables associated with physically beaten in the last 12 months and ever been raped since start selling sex, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI)

Variables	Physical beating	Rape
	OR (95% CI)	OR (95% CI)
Age		
15 - 24*		
25 - 34	1.02 (0.87, 1.19)	1.02 (0.86, 1.21)
35+	0.52 (0.37, 0.74)	0.88 (0.64, 1.20)
<b>Educational level</b>		
No Education*		
Primary 1st cycle (1 - 4)	1.01 (0.79, 1.31)	1.45 (1.14,1.85)
Primary 2nd cycle (5 - 8)	1.35 (1.11, 1.63)	1.08 (0.88,1.32)
Secondary & above	1.49 (1.18, 1.87)	1.09 (0.85,1.41)
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *		
1001 - 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	1.44 (1.20, 1.73)	0.69 (0.58, 0.85)
2001 - 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	1.67 (1.35, 2.07)	0.51 (0.39, 0.66)
3001 - 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	1.61 (1.19, 2.17)	0.65 (0.46, 0.92)
4001 - 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	2.12 (1.44, 3.14)	1.01 (0.66, 1.55)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.62 (1.01, 2.58)	0.75 (0.44, 1.27)
Current marital status		
Never Married*		
Married/Cohabited	1.05 (0.46, 2.41)	0.69 (0.24, 1.96)

Separated/Divorced	0.93 (0.80, 1.09)	1.03 (0.88, 1.21)
Widowed	0.59 (0.37, 0.95)	1.39 (0.95, 2.06)
Sex selling venues		
Bar/Hotel*		
Local drinking houses	0.87 (0.69, 1.09)	-
Spa/Massage/Beauty salon/Own house	0.45 (0.28, 0.71)	-
Red-light houses	0.95 (0.71, 1.27)	-
Street	1.51 (1.26, 1.82)	-
Other	1.37 (1.01, 1.86)	-
Frequency alcohol consumption		
Never*		
2 - 4 days a month	1.82 (1.35, 2.44)	1.74 (1.27, 2.38)
2 - 3 days a week	2.07 (1.66, 2.57)	1.87 (1.48, 2.36)
4 or more days a week	3.54 (2.87, 4.37)	3.43 (2.75, 4.28)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day		
1 or 2*		
3 or 4	1.39 (1.09, 1.76)	1.16 (0.92, 1.46)
5 or 6	2.03 (1.58, 2.62)	1.09 (0.84, 1.43)
7 to 9	2.19 (1.59, 3.03)	0.98 (0.68, 1.41)
10 or more	2.76 (1.88, 4.03)	1.78 (1.20, 2.65)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking		
Never*		
Less than monthly	1.43 (1.03, 1.98)	1.39 (0.99, 1.95)
Monthly	1.23 (0.90, 1.66)	1.59 (1.18, 2.13)
Weekly	1.73 (1.39, 2.14)	1.03 (0.80, 1.31)
Daily or almost daily	1.97 (1.53, 2.55)	1.69 (1.29, 2.21)
Drunk so much and can't remember what		
happened the next day		
No*		
Yes, in the last 30 days	2.90 (2.37, 3.56)	1.66 (1.33, 2.07)

Yes, before last 30 days	2.22 (1.65, 2.99)	1.27 (0.91, 1.78)				
Frequency of khat chewing in a week	Frequency of khat chewing in a week					
Never*						
Less than once a week	1.24 (0.96, 1.60)	0.89 (0.67, 1.19)				
1 - 2 days per week	1.67 (1.28, 2.18)	2.89 (2.26, 3.69)				
3 - 4 days per week	2.49 (1.87, 3.34)	2.92 (2.19, 3.89)				
5 - 7 days per week	2.48 (2.08, 2.96)	1.47 (1.21, 1.79)				
Condom breakage No* Yes	1.99 (1.69,2.33)	1.62 (1.37, 1.92)				
HIV test result Negative*	1.55 (1.05,2.55)	1.02 (1.37, 1.72)				
Positive	1.04 (0.88, 1.24)	0.88 (0.73, 1.07)				

Note: \* Reference category

# Multivariate analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten)

Table 4 shows the results of the multivariate analysis used to identify factors associated with physical violence after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers aged 35 years or above (AOR 0.59, 95% CI 0.38, 0.92) were significantly less likely to experience physical violence when compared with the younger age group (15-24years). FSWs who had attended primary first cycle education (AOR 0.71, 95% CI 0.52, 0.97) were also less likely to experience physical beating than those who reported no education. On the other hand, FSWs who worked on the street (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.53, 2.39), in red-light houses (AOR 1.63, 95% CI 1.12, 2.38) and in local drinking houses (AOR 1.35, 95% CI 1.02, 1.78) had an increased odds of experiencing physical violence compared with FSWs who worked in bars/hotels. Moreover, substance use was significantly related to physical violence. FSWs who consumed alcohol four or more days in a week (AOR 1.92, 95% CI 1.21, 3.04), those who did not remember what happened the next day due to heavy alcohol consumption both in the past 30 days (AOR 1.98, 95% CI 1.58, 2.49) and before the past 30 days (AOR 1.85, 95% CI 1.35, 2.53), and FSWs who chewed khat 3-4 days per week (AOR 1.58, 95% CI 1.13, 2.21) and 5-7 days per week (AOR

1.43, 95% CI 1.13, 1.80) had more likelihood of experiencing physical violence. Condom breakage experience within the past 30 days prior to the study was also significantly associated with physical violence (AOR 1.51, 95% CI 1.25, 1.84).

Table 4. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with physical violence (physically beaten) in the past twelve months among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95%CI)
Age	
15 - 24*	
25 - 34	1.04 (0.82, 1.22)
35+	0.59 (0.38, 0.92)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1 - 4)	0.71 (0.52, 0.97)
Primary 2nd cycle (5 - 8)	0.98 (0.77, 1.26)
Secondary & above	1.14 (0.85, 1.53)
Monthly income from selling sex	
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *	
1001 - 2000 birr (\$50 - \$100)	1.13 (0.90, 1.41)
2001 - 3000 birr (\$100 - \$150)	1.14 (0.87, 1.48)
3001 - 4000 birr (\$150 - \$200)	1.12 (0.77, 1.61)
4001 - 5000 birr (\$200 - \$250)	1.44 (0.93, 2.24)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	1.12 (0.63, 1.99)
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.68 (0.24, 1.89)
Separated/Divorced	1.08 (0.88, 1.29)
Widowed	0.87 (0.48, 1.59)
Sex selling venues	

Never\*

Bar/Hotel*	
Local drinking houses	1.35 (1.02, 1.78)
Spa/massage/beauty salon/own house	1.04 (0.58, 1.84)
Red-light houses	1.63 (1.12, 2.38)
Street	1.92 (1.53, 2.39)
Other	1.39 (0.98, 1.99)
Frequency alcohol consumption	
Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.25 (0.77, 2.04)
2 - 3 days a week	1.32 (0.84, 2.06)
4 or more days a week	1.92 (1.21, 3.04)
Alcohol containing drinks on a typical day	
1 or 2*	
3 or 4	1.08 (0.84, 1.39)
5 or 6	1.15 (0.85, 1.57)
7 to 9	1.09 (0.74, 1.64)
10 or more	1.14 (0.72, 1.81)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	
Never*	
Less than monthly	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Monthly	0.84 (0.59, 1.18)
Weekly	1.07 (0.82, 1.39)
Daily or almost daily	0.99 (0.71, 1.38)
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the next	
day	
No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.98 (1.58, 2.49)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.85 (1.35, 2.53)
Frequency of khat chewing in a week	

Less than once a week	1.04 (0.77, 1.42)
1 - 2 days per week	1.30 (0.96, 1.77)
3 - 4 days per week	1.58 (1.13, 2.21)
5 - 7 days per week	1.43 (1.13, 1.80)
Condom breakage	
No*	
Yes	1.51 (1.25, 1.84)

Note: \* Reference category

# Multivariate analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)

Table 5 shows the results of the multivariate logistic regression analyses used to identify factors that were significantly associated with rape after simultaneously adjusting for all measures included in the analyses. Female sex workers with a monthly income of \$50 to \$200 were significantly less likely to experience rape compared to those with a monthly income of below \$50. Drinking alcohol four or more days per week (AOR 2.33, 95% CI 1.47, 3.7), experience of heavy drinking in the last 30 days and not remembering what happened the next day (AOR 1.34, 95% CI 1.05, 1.72), experience of heavy episodic drinking (HED) in a month (AOR 1.71, 95% CI 1.24, 2.38), experience of HED almost daily (AOR 1.49, 95% CI 1.06, 2.11), and chewing khatl-2 days (AOR 2.13, 95% CI 1.61, 2.83) and 3-4 days (AOR 2.15, 95% CI 1.55, 2.98) per week were positively associated with rape. Moreover, condom breakage (AOR 1.26, 95% CI 1.03, 1.55) was significantly more frequent among FSWs who reported rape.

Table 5. Multivariate logistic regression analysis of factors associated with sexual violence (rape)since sex selling start among female sex workers across eleven towns in Ethiopia, odds ratios (OR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Variables	OR (95%CI)	
Monthly income from selling sex		
Less than 1000 birr (<\$50) *		
1001 - 2000 birr (\$50-\$100)	0.62 (0.49, 0.77)	

2001 - 3000 birr (\$100-\$150)	0.42 (0.32, 0.57)
3001 - 4000 birr (\$150-\$200)	0.45 (0.29, 0.69)
4001 - 5000 birr (\$200-\$250)	0.84 (0.53, 1.33)
Above 5000 birr (>\$250)	0.62 (0.34, 1.15)
Current marital status	
Never Married*	
Married/Cohabited	0.57 (0.17, 1.97)
Separated/Divorced	1.01 (0.83, 1.22)
Widowed	1.61 (0.98, 2.63)
Educational level	
No Education*	
Primary 1st cycle (1 - 4)	1.06 (0.79, 1.43)
Primary 2nd cycle (5 - 8)	0.83 (0.65, 1.07)
Secondary & above	0.92 (0.68, 1.25)
Frequency of alcohol consumption	
Never*	
2 - 4 days a month	1.15 (0.69, 1.89)
2 - 3 days a week	1.24 (0.78, 1.96)
4 or more days a week	2.33 (1.47, 3.73)
Drunk so much and can't remember what happened the	
next day	
No*	
Yes, in the last 30 days	1.34 (1.05, 1.72)
Yes, before last 30 days	1.07 (0.75, 1.52)
Frequency of heavy episodic drinking	
Never*	
Less than monthly	1.61 (1.12, 2.32)
Monthly	1.71 (1.24, 2.38)
Weekly	1.04 (0.78, 1.38)
Daily or almost daily	1.49 (1.06, 2.11)

#### Frequency of khat chewing in a week

less than once a week 0.83 (	0.59, 1.16)
1 - 2 days per week 2.13 (	1.61, 2.83)

5 - 7 days per week 1.06 (0.83, 1.36)

2.15 (1.55, 2.98)

## Condom breakage

No\*

Never\*

Yes 1.26 (1.03, 1.55)

Note: \* Reference category

3 - 4 days per week

#### **Discussion**

According to this study, 17.5% of FSWs in Ethiopia had been physically beaten within the past 12 months and 15.2% had been raped since they started selling sex. Age, sex selling venues, and high consumption of alcohol and khat were significant predictors of physical violence (beating). On the other hand, the significant predictors of sexual violence (rape) were low income and high consumption of alcohol and khat.

The prevalence of both physical violence and sexual violence (rape) was lower than the prevalence found in studies conducted in Uganda, Ivory Coast, and Kenya (9, 12, 30, 32). However, when compared to the studies conducted in Adama (Ethiopia), China, India, and Mexico, the current study reported a higher prevalence of both physical and sexual violence (10, 11, 13, 14, 33). The difference in the definition of violence used might be one of the possible explanations for the difference between the current result and those found in other studies in Africa. Most of the studies assessed all forms of physical and sexual violence while the current study assessed solely physical beating and forced penetrative sex (rape). On the other hand, differences in results across settings might also be due to differences in background and contextual factors such as socio-economic status and cultural aspects.

Several studies showed that younger FSWs are more exposed to physical and sexual violence (13, 34) in line with the current findings that younger FSWs (15-24 years) were at higher risk for physical violence when compared to their older counterparts (35+years). Perpetrators find it easier to manipulate younger FSWs and this might play a role in their increased exposure to violence. That younger FSWs are especially vulnerable to violence has important implications due to the increasing number of younger FSWs who are entering the sex trade. Therefore, to minimize the vulnerability of younger FSWs, intervention programs need to create awareness about the factors that increase the likelihood of violence and to ensure that younger FSWs are particularly addressed in such programs.

Even though sex work is not a legally recognized profession in Ethiopia, most of the establishments where the sex workers are based (hotels, bars/restaurants, nightclubs, etc.) operate legally with working licenses. Nevertheless, some FSWs work on the street and in red-light houses where they manage their own working area. Consequently, the extent to which physical violence occurs may vary according to their working area. The present study revealed that FSWs who mainly work in bars and hotels face less physical beating when compared with FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses. This finding is in line with studies conducted in New York City and England (20, 21). This might be due to the level of protection in their working areas and/or due to the type of clients who frequents those localities. This means that engaging bar/hotel managers in the prevention activities could be an additional strategy to decrease violence against FSWs.

On the other hand, FSWs who work on the street, in red-light houses and local drinking houses experienced more violence. Most of these venues are located in the slum areas of the cities, and such areas are often the focus of police efforts to control various unwanted activities. In this regard, FSWs are targets of harassment, physical violence and arrest by police. The actions of the police towards FSWs might also serve to legitimize violence against FSWs in the community (especially among FSWs residing in slum areas), thus increasing such acts of violence. Therefore, to minimize the harm in these localities, involving the police force in violence prevention activities is crucial and should be one of the first step. In addition, a peer education program led by the sex workers could be an additional strategy. Such a program could help FSWs to create an information sharing

platform to discuss the incidences of violence, types of perpetrators, etc., which could raise awareness and help them to become more alert.

Furthermore, an association between alcohol use and higher frequency of physical violence and rape was reported. In particular, FSWs who consume alcohol more than four days per week and those with experience of HED were significantly more likely to experience violence. Several studies conducted in Ethiopia, Uganda, and Kenya also reported similar findings (9, 10, 12, 19). A large proportion of female sex workers (FSWs) use alcohol prior to or during sex to help them to solicit clients and overcome their shyness (35, 36). In particular high level of alcohol consumption places FSWs at a disadvantage by intensifying their vulnerability (8). Research reviews also report that alcohol use impairs FSWs' ability to detect the risk of violence and increases their vulnerability to risk-prone situations (37, 38). The consequences of HED are not just limited to the physical effects of intoxication but further expose them to violence and risky sexual behaviors.

Correspondingly, chewing khat more days in a week was significantly associated with experience of physical violence and rape. After chewing khat, some of the users consume alcohol-containing beverages to decrease the level of stimulation. Although there is no previous study on the relationship between khat chewing and experience of violence among FSWs, most FSWs chew khat before departing for work. In the bar, they drink alcohol to minimize the effect, which in turn exposes them to HED and violence. Further studies should assess the independent contribution of khat chewing to increasing violence occurrence.

The extent to which alcohol use and khat chewing are risk factors for the occurrence of experiences of violence must be interpreted with caution. Since physical beating was measured within the past 12 months and rape was measured since they started selling sex, the participants' current khat chewing or alcohol consumption status might not be an accurate indicator of their consumption patterns at the time of the violence. In addition, the current use of substances might be a means to cope with the trauma related to the experience of violence.

In addition, the resistance to condom use from clients and the violence experience may create a difficult situation for FSWs with regard to the proper use of condoms, which further exposes FSWs to HIV and other STIs. In this study, there was a significant relationship between condom breakage and history of physical beating and rape. Even though there was no significant association between HIV and violence, the proportion of HIV positive FSWs in the sample was high (23%). A study conducted in Benin reported a similar finding concerning the association between condom breakage and violence, but unlike our study there was a significant association between HIV and violence experience (23). This finding indicates that solely providing condoms will not be effective to prevent HIV and other STIs transmission. Instead, working on factors that contribute to improper use of condoms (such as violence) could be an additional strategy for HIV prevention programs.

In general, our study demonstrates that sex workers are particularly vulnerable to physical beating and rape. Nevertheless, the harm reduction program among FSWs in Ethiopia is poor. Given the associations between violence and unprotected sex, the HIV control program may not accomplish its goal of reducing the number of new infections without also addressing violence. Therefore, combining both programs could yield better results with regard to attaining epidemic control as well as reducing the harm associated with violence. In addition, this study shows that different factors (such as sex selling venues, the age of FSWs, and level of alcohol use etc.) were associated with violence among FSWs, signifying the need for different approaches to minimize the incidence of violence (39). At the individual level, efforts to reduce violence could focus on developing educational materials and creating awareness for sex workers about their legal rights and about how to prevent, reduce and respond to violence (40). In addition, involving the community in the prevention program could play a vital role especially towards reducing stigma and discrimination towards FSWs, which in turn would create a suitable environment for FSWs to stand up for their rights. Furthermore, involving police and law enforcement authorities to reduce harassment could play a greater role in violence reduction.

Finally, there were some similarities but also differences concerning the predictors of rape and physical violence. For example, being in the younger age group was a significant predictor of physical beating but not rape, and having lower income was associated with rape but not with

physical beating. Nevertheless, based on the current data, it is difficult to draw any conclusions about why one variable would matter for physical beating but not for rape. The reasons underlying the differences are currently unknown, and further research might be required to gain an understanding of the patterns observed.

## **Methodological considerations**

There are a limited number of studies on violence among FSWs in Ethiopia and the existing studies are restricted to one city (9, 10). One of the strengths of this study is that it involves multiple sites (eleven large towns) across the country. The second strength is the sampling technique; the study used a respondent-driven sampling, which is a strategy recommended for hard-to-reach populations and which is believed to give a representative sample of the target population. The third strength is the assessment of FSWs' HIV status on site using the national testing algorithm. In addition, the pilot study conducted prior to the actual implementation added strength to the main study protocol.

This study also had limitations. First, sexual and physical violence are sensitive topics that are subject to underreporting because of social desirability bias. Second, recall bias could have occurred because participants were asked about physical violence in the past year and rape since they started selling sex. We tried to minimize underreporting through intense interviewer training. In addition, since it was a cross-sectional study, participants were assessed only once; thus, it would be difficult to infer the temporal association between a risk factor and the outcome measures, i.e. physical violence and rape.

Furthermore, the results regarding correlates of physical and sexual violence among FSWs in Ethiopia might have limited generalizability across settings. However, these results are likely to be relevant for other FSWs in other African countries that have a similar setting as Ethiopia, and may inform targeted prevention strategies for this key population.

#### Conclusion

In general, FSWs are vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, and the risk increases when they are younger, street-based, and are high consumers of alcohol or khat. Therefore, to reduce physical

and sexual violence, strategies to secure and improve their work environment should be a critical component of targeted interventions. Increasing awareness regarding the role of khat chewing and alcohol drinking towards vulnerability to violence should be an integral component of HIV prevention and violence reduction programs. In addition, targeted efforts should be made for the younger FSWs in order to reduce their vulnerability.

# Acknowledgments

We would like to express gratitude to the study participants and the data collectors.

**Conflict of Interest**: None to declare.

#### **Authors contributions**

MA and AA developed the study design. MA analyzed and interpreted the data and drafted the manuscript. AA was involved in the data analysis and interpretation, and in the writing of the manuscript. TT was involved in the interpretation of the data and contributed to the writing of the manuscript. All authors approved the final manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no specific grant from any funding agency.

**Data sharing statement:** No additional data available.

#### Reference

- 1. Jewkes R. Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention. The Lancet. 2002;359(9315):1423-9.
- World Health Organization, Global and regional estimates of violence against women: prevale
  nce and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence: executive
  summary.

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/85239/9789241564625\_eng.pdf;jsessionid=6 E940F74EB1BC5204EEDE0FC6D26F358?sequence=1

- 3. Glasier A, Gulmezoglu AM, Schmid GP, Moreno CG, Van Look PF. Sexual and reproductive health: a matter of life and death. The lancet. 2006;368(9547):1595-607.
- 4. Perry A. Risk Factors of Gender-based Sexual Violence. RTM Insights.23. <a href="http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgenderbasedsexual\_violenc">http://www.rutgerscps.org/uploads/2/7/3/7/27370595/riskfactorsofgenderbasedsexual\_violenc</a> e rtminsights23.pdf

- 5. Godwin J. Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific. Bangkok: United Nations Develop ment Programme.
  - $\underline{http://www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/hivaids/English/HIV2012SexWorkAndLaw.p} \\ df$
- 6. The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Article 634:(Proclamation No. 414/2004) 2004.
- 7. World Health Organization, Addressing violence against women and achieving the Millennium Development Goals. 2005.
- 8. World Health Organization, Addressing Violence against Sex Workers 2013. https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/sti/sex\_worker\_implementation/swit\_chpt2.pdf
- 9. Alemayehu M, Yohannes G, Damte A, Fantahun A, Gebrekirstos K, Tsegay R, et al. Prevalence and predictors of sexual violence among commercial sex workers in Northern Ethiopia. Reproductive health. 2015;12(1):47.
- 10. Mooney A, Kidanu A, Bradley HM, Kumoji EK, Kennedy CE, Kerrigan D. Work-related violence and inconsistent condom use with non-paying partners among female sex workers in Adama City, Ethiopia. BMC public health. 2013;13(1):771.
- 11. Misganaw AC, Worku YA. Assessment of sexual violence among street females in Bahir-Dar town, North West Ethiopia: a mixed method study. BMC Public Health.13(1):825.
- 12. Schwitters A, Swaminathan M, Serwadda D, Muyonga M, Shiraishi RW, Benech I, et al. Prevalence of rape and client-initiated gender-based violence among female sex workers: Kampala, Uganda, 2012. AIDS and Behavior.19(1):68-76.
- 13. Beattie TS, Bhattacharjee P, Ramesh B, Gurnani V, Anthony J, Isac S, et al. Violence against female sex workers in Karnataka state, south India: impact on health, and reductions in violence following an intervention program. BMC Public Health. p. 476.
- 14. Kelvin EA, Sun X, Mantell JE, Zhou J, Mao J, Peng Y. Vulnerability to sexual violence and participation in sex work among high-end entertainment centre workers in Hunan Province, China. Sexual health.10(5):391-9.
- 15. Wolffers I. Violence repression and other health threats. Research for sex work. 2001;4:1-2. <a href="https://www.nswp.org/sites/nswp.org/files/research-for-sex-work-4-english.pdf">https://www.nswp.org/sites/nswp.org/files/research-for-sex-work-4-english.pdf</a>

- 16. Hanck SE, Blankenship KM, Irwin KS, West BS, Kershaw T. Assessment of self-reported sexual behavior and condom use among female sex workers in India using a polling box approach: a preliminary report. Sexually transmitted diseases. 2008;35(5):489-94.
- 17. Parcesepe AM, Kelly L, Martin SL, Green S, Sinkele W, Suchindran C, et al. The impact of an alcohol harm reduction intervention on interpersonal violence and engagement in sex work among female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya: Results from a randomized controlled trial. Drug and alcohol dependence.161:21-8.
- 18. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam WK, Parry CD, Morojele NK. Substance use, sexual risk, and violence: HIV prevention intervention with sex workers in Pretoria. AIDS and Behavior. 2006;10(2):131.
- 19. Chersich M, Luchters S, Malonza I, Mwarogo P, King'Ola N, Temmerman M. Heavy episodic drinking among Kenyan female sex workers is associated with unsafe sex, sexual violence and sexually transmitted infections. International journal of STD & AIDS2007. p. 764-9.
- 20. Church S, Henderson M, Barnard M, Hart G. Violence by clients towards female prostitutes in different work settings: questionnaire survey. Bmj. 2001;322(7285):524-5.
- 21. El-Bassel N, Witte SS, Wada T, Gilbert L, Wallace J. Correlates of partner violence among female street-based sex workers: substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. AIDS patient care and STDs. 2001;15(1):41-51.
- 22. Masvawure TB, Mantell JE, Tocco JU, Gichangi P, Restar A, Chabeda SV, et al. Intentional and unintentional condom breakage and slippage in the sexual interactions of female and male sex workers and clients in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior.22(2):637-48.
- 23. Tounkara FK, Diabate S, Guedou FA, Ahoussinou Cm, Kintin Fdr, Zannou DM, et al. Violence, condom breakage and HIV infection among female sex workers in Benin, West Africa. Sexually transmitted diseases.41(5):312.
- 24. Choi SY, Chen KL, Jiang ZQ. Client-perpetuated violence and condom failure among female sex workers in southwestern China. Sex Transm Dis2008.
- 25. Wilson KS, Deya R, Yuhas K, Simoni J, Vander Stoep A, Shafi J, et al. A prospective cohort study of intimate partner violence and unprotected sex in HIV-positive female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya. AIDS and Behavior.20(9):2054-64.

- 26. Okal J, Chersich MF, Tsui S, Sutherland E, Temmerman M, Luchters S. Sexual and physical violence against female sex workers in Kenya: a qualitative enquiry. AIDS care.23(5):612-8.
- 27. Ethiopian National Key Population HIV Bio-behavioral Surveillance Round I Report. 2013
- 28. HIV Related Estimates and Projections for Ethiopia-2015
- 29. Decker MR, Lyons C, Billong SC, Njindam IM, Grosso A, Nunez GT, et al. Gender-based violence against female sex workers in Cameroon: prevalence and associations with sexual HIV risk and access to health services and justice. Sex Transm Infect.92(8):599-604.
- 30. Lyons CE, Grosso A, Drame FM, Ketende S, Diouf D, Ba I, et al. Physical and Sexual Violence Affecting Female Sex Workers in Abidjan, CÃ'te d'Ivoire: Prevalence, and the Relationship with the Work Environment, HIV, and Access to Health Services. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes.75(1):9-17.
- 31. World Health Organization, Assessment of khat (Catha edulis Forsk) 34th ECDD 2006/4.4. <a href="http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality-safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf">http://www.who.int/medicines/areas/quality-safety/4.4KhatCritReview.pdf</a>.
- 32. Wilson KS, Deya R, Masese L, Simoni JM, Stoep AV, Shafi J, et al. Prevalence and correlates of intimate partner violence in HIV-positive women engaged in transactional sex in Mombasa, Kenya. International journal of STD & AIDS.27(13):1194-203.
- 33. Semple SJ, Stockman JK, Pitpitan EV, Strathdee SA, Chavarin CV, Mendoza DV, et al. Prevalence and correlates of client-perpetrated violence against female sex workers in 13 Mexican cities. PloS one.10(11):e0143317.
- 34. Silverman JG. Adolescent female sex workers: invisibility, violence and HIV. Archives of disease in childhood.archdischild178715.
- 35. Sharma S, Singh S, Talukdar B. Understanding the Factors Associated with Alcohol Use among Female Sex Workers in a High HIV Prevalence Northeast State of India. J Infec Dis Treat. 2016;2:1.
- 36. Wechsberg WM, Luseno WK, Lam W. Violence against substance-abusing South African sex workers: intersection with culture and HIV risk. AIDS care. 2005;17(sup1):55-64.
- 37. George WH, Stoner SA. Understanding acute alcohol effects on sexual behavior. Annual review of sex research. 2000;11(1):92-124.

- 38. Mbonye M, Rutakumwa R, Weiss H, Seeley J. Alcohol consumption and high risk sexual behaviour among female sex workers in Uganda. African Journal of AIDS Research.13(2):145-51.
- 39. Reed E, Gupta J, Biradavolu M, Devireddy V, Blankenship KM. The context of economic insecurity and its relation to violence and risk factors for HIV among female sex workers in Andhra Pradesh, India. Public Health Reports. 2010;125(4\_suppl):81-9.
- 40. Hail-Jares K, Chang RC, Choi S, Zheng H, He N, Huang ZJ. Intimate-partner and client-initiated violence among female street-based sex workers in China: does a support network help? PloS one. 2015;10(9):e0139161.

# Reporting checklist for cross sectional study.

Based on the STROBE cross sectional guidelines.

# Instructions to authors

Complete this checklist by entering the page numbers from your manuscript where readers will find each of the items listed below.

Your article may not currently address all the items on the checklist. Please modify your text to include the missing information. If you are certain that an item does not apply, please write "n/a" and provide a short explanation.

Upload your completed checklist as an extra file when you submit to a journal.

In your methods section, say that you used the STROBE cross sectional reporting guidelines, and cite them as:

von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies.

			Page
		Reporting Item	Number
Title	<u>#1a</u>	Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the abstract	1
Abstract	<u>#1b</u>	Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found	1

Background /	<u>#2</u>	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the	2
rationale		investigation being reported	
Objectives	<u>#3</u>	State specific objectives, including any prespecified	3
		hypotheses	
Study design	<u>#4</u>	Present key elements of study design early in the paper	4
Setting	<u>#5</u>	Describe the setting, locations, and relevant dates, including	4, 5, 6
		periods of recruitment, exposure, follow-up, and data collection	
Eligibility criteria	<u>#6a</u>	Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of	5
		selection of participants.	
	<u>#7</u>	Clearly define all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential	6
		confounders, and effect modifiers. Give diagnostic criteria, if	
		applicable	
Data sources /	<u>#8</u>	For each variable of interest give sources of data and details of	6
measurement		methods of assessment (measurement). Describe	
		comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one	
		group. Give information separately for for exposed and	
		unexposed groups if applicable.	
Bias	<u>#9</u>	Describe any efforts to address potential sources of bias	2, 18
Study size	<u>#10</u>	Explain how the study size was arrived at	5
Quantitative	<u>#11</u>	Explain how quantitative variables were handled in the	6
variables		analyses. If applicable, describe which groupings were chosen,	
		and why	

Statistical	<u>#12a</u>	Describe all statistical methods, including those used to control	7		
methods		for confounding			
	#12b	Describe any methods used to examine subgroups and	NA		
		interactions			
	#100	Evalois how missing data ware addressed	0		
	<u>#12c</u>	Explain how missing data were addressed	8		
	#12d	If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of	NA		
		sampling strategy			
	<u>#12e</u>	Describe any sensitivity analyses	7		
Participants	<u>#13a</u>	Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg	5		
		numbers potentially eligible, examined for eligibility, confirmed			
		eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and			
		analysed. Give information separately for for exposed and			
		unexposed groups if applicable.			
	<u>#13b</u>	Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	5		
	<u>#13c</u>	Consider use of a flow diagram			
Descriptive data	<u>#14a</u>	Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic,			
		clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential			
		confounders. Give information separately for exposed and			
		unexposed groups if applicable.			
	<u>#14b</u>	Indicate number of participants with missing data for each	8, 9 in		
		variable of interest	tables		
Outcome data	<u>#15</u>	Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures.	na		
For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml					

Give information separately for exposed and unexposed

	groups if applicable.	
<u>#16a</u>	Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-	7 - 10
	adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence	
	interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and	
	why they were included	
<u>#16b</u>	Report category boundaries when continuous variables were	
	categorized	
<u>#16c</u>	If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into	
	absolute risk for a meaningful time period	
<u>#17</u>	Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and	10 -16
	interactions, and sensitivity analyses	
<u>#18</u>	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	
<u>#19</u>	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of	18
	potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and	
	magnitude of any potential bias.	
<u>#20</u>	Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives,	16 -18
	limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies,	
	and other relevant evidence.	
<u>#21</u>	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study	19
	results	
<u>#22</u>	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the	20
Forno	present study and, if applicable, for the original study on which	
	#16b #16c #17 #18 #19 #20 #21	#16a Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounderadjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included  #16b Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized  #16c If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period  #17 Report other analyses done—e.g., analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses  #18 Summarise key results with reference to study objectives  #19 Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision. Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias.  #20 Give a cautious overall interpretation considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence.  #21 Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results  #22 Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the

the present article is based

The STROBE checklist is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License CC-BY. This checklist can be completed online using https://www.goodreports.org/, a tool made by the EQUATOR Network in collaboration with Penelope.ai

