

BMJ Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (<u>http://bmjopen.bmj.com</u>).

If you have any questions on BMJ Open's open peer review process please email <u>info.bmjopen@bmj.com</u>

BMJ Open

# **BMJ Open**

### Estimated cost-based prices for injectable medicines in the WHO Essential Medicines List

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-027780
Article Type:	Research
Date Submitted by the Author:	07-Nov-2018
Complete List of Authors:	Gotham, Dzintars; Independent, Barber, Melissa; Harvard University, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health Hill, Andrew; University of Liverpool, UK
Keywords:	PUBLIC HEALTH, pharmaceuticals, access to medicines, access to healthcare, global health, generic medicines

SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
, 0	
0	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33	
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
20	
40	
40	
41	
42	
43	
44	
45	
46	
47	
48	
49	
50	
51	
52	
52	
55	
54	
22	
56	
57	
58	
59	
60	

# Estimated cost-based prices for injectable medicines in the WHO Essential Medicines List

Authors: Dzintars Gotham MBBS<sup>1</sup>, Melissa Barber MPhil<sup>2</sup>, Andrew M Hill PhD<sup>3</sup>

- 1. Independent, Boston, MA, USA
- 2. Department of Translational Medicine, University of Liverpool, UK
- 3. Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Harvard University, Boston, MA, USA

## Addresses of authors

Dr Dzintars Gotham MBBS BSc(Hons) Independent Boston, Massachusetts, USA Email: dzintarsgotham@gmail.com Telephone: +1-781-975-2727

Melissa J Barber MPhil Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health Boston, Massachusetts, USA

Dr Andrew M Hill PhD Department of Translational Medicine, University of Liverpool, 70 Pembroke Place, Liverpool L69 3GF, United Kingdom

## Corresponding author:

Dr Dzintars Gotham MBBS BSc(Hons) Independent Boston, Massachusetts, USA Email: dzintarsgotham@gmail.com Telephone: +1-781-975-2727

Word count: main text 2814, abstract 277

**Key words:** essential medicines; generics; cost of production; health economics; health systems

## ABSTRACT

#### objectives

Challenges remain in ensuring universal access to affordable essential medicines. We previously estimated the expected generic prices based on cost of production for medicines in solid oral formulations (i.e. capsules or tablets) on the World Health Organization Model List of Essential Medicines (EML). The objectives of this analysis were to estimate cost-based prices for injectable medicines on the EML and to compare these to lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India.

#### design

Data on the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) exported from India were extracted from an online database of customs declarations (<u>www.infodriveindia.com</u>). A formula was designed to use API price data to estimate a cost-based price, by adding the costs of converting API to a finished pharmaceutical product, including the cost of formulation in vials or ampoules, transportation, taxes, and an average profit margin.

#### results

For injectable formulations on the WHO EML, medicines had prices above the estimated cost-based price in 75% of comparisons in the UK (median ratio 2.45), and 65% in South Africa (median ratio 1.47), while 83% of medicines in India were below estimated cost-based price (median ratio 0.29). 19% of injectable medicines in the UK, 12% in South Africa, and 5% in India had prices more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price. Medicines that appeared in the top 20 by ratio of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price for more than one country included numerous oncology medicines – irinotecan, leuprorelin, ifosfamide, daunorubicin, filgrastim, and mesna – as well as linezolid and ciclosporin.

#### conclusions

Estimating manufacturing costs can identify cases in which profit margins for medicines may be set significantly higher than average.

## setting/participants/interventions/outcome measures/trial registration Not applicable.

## Strengths and limitations of this study

- The cost assumptions used to estimate cost-based prices were conservative
- The key input of API price was based on average prices of actual, completed sales of API
- Apart from the individual API price data, the costing formula was adjusted only for formulation as vial or ampoule, but not for other characteristics such as volume
- We did not estimate demand volumes and did not adjust price estimates based on demand volume

for open teries only

## INTRODUCTION

There are persistent challenges in ensuring access to affordable essential medicines in low-and middle-income countries (LMICs).[1] The World Health Organization's Model List of Essential Medicines (EML) comprises medicines that meet the priority health needs of global populations and should be available at all times, at affordable prices.[2] A previous analysis estimated the cost of production for solid oral formulations in the EML, finding sizeable differences between cost of manufacture and current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India.[3]

A number of differences between solid oral formulations and injectable formulations could be expected to affect manufacturing costs, such significantly higher requirements for manufacturing sites to maintain product sterility for intravenous and intramuscular formulations, cost of containers like ampoules or metered-dose inhaler canisters, and different costs of excipients. Other factors may influence market dynamics for individual products – for example, the majority of injectable products are likely, in general, to be used in healthcare institutions and for more severe illness than most other formulations.

While many cases of difficulties in accessing treatment are associated with patent-protected medicines, in some cases, generic medicines may also be priced at very high levels, such as in the recent cases involving manufacturers Pfizer, Flynn, and Aspen in the UK. In these cases, manufacturers dramatically increased prices of generic medicines, arguably taking advantage of a dominant position they held in the respective markets.[4,5]

We aimed to develop an algorithm for estimating the cost of manufacture for injectable medicines on the WHO EML, to use this algorithm to estimate prices that would be expected assuming an average profit margin, and to compare these estimated cost-based prices to current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India.

#### **METHODS**

In our earlier analysis of solid oral formulations (SOF), we developed a costing formula that accounted for capital expenses, the cost of excipients, and the cost of formulation into tablets.[3] We have also previously developed a costing formula for biosimilars of insulin formulated in vials.[6]

Here, we developed a similar formula for injectable medicines, and submitted data on the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) to the formula to generate cost-based estimated generic prices. We then compared these estimated prices to current market prices in three countries – the UK, South Africa, and India.

#### medicines included in the analysis

We analysed medicines listed in the 2015 WHO EML as injectable formulations.[7] We use the term 'item' to describe an individual medicine-formulation-dosage listing. Besides SOF, we further excluded certain categories of medicines, due both to limitations in reliably identifying API data and/or were we considered that the market would be a special case (e.g. blood products). These categories included blood products, diagnostic agents, antivenom, vaccines, simple water-based solutions (e.g. 0.9% sodium chloride), and vitamins and minerals. A full list of included and excluded medicines/formulations is available in the appendix.

#### cost of API

Data on API exported from India were retrieved from an online database of customs declarations (<u>www.infodriveindia.com</u>), a source that we have used in numerous previous analyses of manufacturing costs.[3,6,8–12] API shipments in the date range 1 July 2014 to 1 July 2016 where included, extending the range 2 years into the past if <100 records were returned, and repeating this until at least 100 records were available, or until the timeframe spanned 6 years.

API data were manually cleaned to remove entries that did not represent genuine API (e.g. shipments of FPP; see appendix for details), after which a linear regression model, weighted by size in kilograms of individual shipments, was applied to estimate an average API price per kilogram at the data cut-off date (November 2016)(see appendix for an example).

For some medicines, dosage is expressed as the dose of the active molecule, while the API is sold as a salt form (e.g. one vial of '80mg methylprednisolone' contains 106mg of methylprednisolone sodium succinate). We adjusted the cost of API needed per unit accordingly.

Statistical analyses of API export data were done in Stata/IC V.14.0 for Mac.

#### cost of manufacture of injectables

We have previously estimated cost-based prices that could be achieved in a competitive market for various SOF medicines, [3,8–12] as well as for insulins. [6] We divide the manufacturing cost estimation into four parts: the cost of API, the cost of converting the API into an finished pharmaceutical product (FPP), and operating expenditures including a profit margin. The cost estimation formula is given in Figure 1 and explained further below.

The cost of API per dose was calculated as described earlier.

The cost of converting API into an FPP includes the cost of constructing and operating manufacture sites, raw materials such as glass vials, and process wastage (i.e. the proportion of the API that is wasted in the process of formulating it into an FPP). In general, we aimed to use conservative (high) assumptions in estimating the cost of production.

Injectable items in the EML divide broadly into those for which the designated formulation is an ampoule, and those for which the designated formulation is a vial. In some cases, the EML does not indicate whether formulation is as a vial or ampoule – for these items we assumed one or the other based on the more prevalent form found across the UK, South Africa, and India.

To design conservative assumptions for ampoule/vial formulation costs, we reviewed the lowestpriced products formulated as vials or ampoules in the UK eMIT database (see next section). These lowest prices are around US\$0.20 for ampoules and US\$0.50 for vials (appendix). We used these values as assumed formulation costs. These are of course conservative assumptions, as for those products API costs and operating margins (and transportation costs, taxes, etc.) would have to be zero for the price to represent formulation alone. This is reflected in a recent analysis of the cost of manufacture of vaccines, which estimated the cost of sterile formulation as an ampoule to be around \$0.12/unit, and as a vial to be around US\$0.35/unit, with these values including raw

materials (i.e. the vial or ampoule itself), labour, facility and equipment costs, and overheads.[13] It is worth noting that Indian government standards on pharmaceutical manufacturing costs, previously used to inform price ceilings, set allowable costs at a substantially lower level: ampoule costs at \$0.03-0.13 and vial costs at \$0.05-0.21 (ranges depending on size and type)(appendix).

We assumed that 10% more API is needed than the stated dosage, to account for loss of API in the vial/ampoule filling process and vial/ampoule overfill.

We assumed a net profit margin of 10% (the average operating margin in the US was 12% in 2013).[14]

Though these cost components are highly variable between countries, an analysis by IMS Health found that costs associated with import (transport, tariffs, other charges) were around 5% in most of the countries surveyed (e.g. Brazil, India, Russia), and that taxes represented around 10% of the final price.[15] We therefore added a 10% margin for transportation costs, and 10% margin to account for taxation.

#### prices in the UK, South Africa, and India

Prices were collected in December 2016.

For the UK, prices were collected from the British National Formulary (BNF) and the electronic market information tool (eMit). The BNF lists 'indicative prices' and is a reference used by clinicians and pharmacists. eMit provides actual government-purchase prices. The lowest price available across the two sources was used. For South Africa, prices were collected from a database of prices in the public healthcare system as well as a database of prices in the private market, both published by the Department of Health. The lowest price available across the two sources was used. For India, prices reported in public tenders of the state of Tamil Nadu were used. Where prices were not available in this source, we used the price reported in an online database of Indian Maximum Retail Prices. Details on price sources are available in the appendix.

For many medicines in the EML, multiple dosages are listed, and may be interchangeable by using a larger number of smaller-dose items in the place of a larger item, or vice-versa. Individual countries may procure larger some volumes of one dosage, but not the other, potentially leading to one

#### **BMJ** Open

dosage having a far higher price than would be expected, due to lower demand volume. To avoid misleading findings as a result of this, for each formulation of each medicine, comparisons between countries and between market prices and cost-based price estimates (for injectables) or API cost (for other formulations) were made for the dosage that gave the lowest difference. As an example, for an injection that is listed in 500mg and 1000mg forms, the UK-South Africa price ratio was recorded as the lower between the two dosage forms. Within the context of our analysis this is a conservative approach (yielding smaller differences in comparisons).

id i .e. dosag. .g. and 1000mg .d. dosage forms. Witk. .differences in compariso

#### RESULTS

Of 414 unique medicines (including combinations) on the 2015 EML, 149 fit the inclusion criteria of this analysis. API data were available for 98 of these 149 medicines (66%).

#### estimated cost-based prices

Estimated cost-based prices ranged from \$0.26 (enoxaparin 20mg) to \$494 (rituximab 500mg).

The comparison of lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India to estimated cost-based prices for injectable items is shown in Table 1 and Figure 2. The majority of injectable items had prices significantly above the estimated cost-based prices in the UK and South Africa, however, in India, 83% of injectable items had prices below the estimated cost-based price.

The 20 items with the highest ratios of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price are shown for the UK in Table 2, for South Africa in Table 3, and for India in Table 4.

Therapeutic categories with notably higher ratios of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price included cardiovascular medicines, medicines for mental and behavioural disorders, and medicines affecting the blood (appendix).

#### International price comparisons

International comparisons of lowest current prices for injectable essential medicines are shown in Figure 3. Prices were higher in the UK than in South Africa in 57% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 1.26; higher in the UK than in India in 90% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 6.75; and higher in South Africa than in India in 86% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 4.13 (Figure 3).

## DISCUSSION

For injectable formulations on the WHO EML, 75% of medicines had prices above the estimated cost-based price in the UK, and 65% has prices above the estimated cost-based price in South Africa, while 83% of medicines in India were below estimated cost-based price. 19% of injectable medicines in the UK, 12% in South Africa, and 5% in India had prices more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price (Table 1, Figure 2).

A few medicines were notable for appearing in the top-20 lists by ratio of current price to estimated cost-based price in more than one country (Tables 2–4): numerous oncology medicines – irinotecan, leuprorelin, ifosfamide, daunorubicin, filgrastim, and mesna – as well as the linezolid, an antibiotic, and ciclosporin, an immunosuppressant.

A wide range of market factors may contribute to the greater than average difference in manufacture costs and price. The 'top 20' injectable medicines are all mostly used in the in-patient hospital setting, are used in specialist treatments, are second/third-line treatments, and/or are used for short durations. These characteristics would all tend to reduce demand volumes, reduce economies of scale (both in manufacture and distribution), and reduce the buyer's negotiating power, and may thus explain the high prices relative to manufacture costs. The great majority of medicines compared in this analysis are no longer under patent protection in the UK, South Africa, or India.[16]

Given the range of medicines included, it is difficult to make generalised comments. If cost of manufacture analysis were employed by governments to evaluate prices, large differences between current prices and estimated cost-based prices could trigger closer examination on a case-by-case basis. For example, linezolid is recently off-patent, and is used as a 'last-resort' antibiotic,[17] limiting demand volume. Enoxaparin and insulin, which appear in the 'top 20' list for India (Table 4), are biologics, meaning different regulations and higher regulatory expenses may apply. In such cases, large profit margins may be more acceptable. In other cases, such as ibuprofen (5mg in 1mL injection) and ampicillin (1000mg powder for injection) in the UK may reflect insufficient competition, inefficient procurement, or a less commonly used dosage form (Table 2). Some of these 'top 20' medicines may represent a substantial burden on healthcare expenditures – for example, irinotecan represented expenditures of £22 million (about US\$29 million) by the UK public healthcare system in 2016/2017.[18]

#### **BMJ** Open

Current lowest prices in India were on average lower than our estimated cost-based price; (lowest current prices in India were median 29% of the estimated cost-based price; Table 1 and Figure 2). This may reflect conservative assumptions made for the cost of ampoules and vials; a substantial number of items cost less than our assumed raw material cost for the ampoule/vial (primary packaging) alone, which we based on prices in high-income countries (see Figure A2 in the Appendix). It may also reflect the general conservative (overestimating) effect of using data on exported API; API that is manufactured in-house or procured domestically may have lower prices. The use of an average API price (rather than, for example, lowest observed or first-quartile) means, in most cases, that a number of API sales occurred at lower price points. Lastly, Indian prices were collected from two databases – one representing the private market and one representing Tamil Nadu state tenders (the lower price of the two was recorded). State tender prices are likely lower than private market prices, but the majority of health expenditures in India are out-of-pocket, and of these the majority are on medicines.[19]

In our earlier analysis of solid oral form medicines in the EML, we found that 214 of 277 comparable prices in the UK, 142 of 212 comparable prices in South Africa and 118 of 298 comparable prices in India were above the estimated cost-based price. Median ratios for lowest current price to estimated cost-base price were 2.7x in the UK, 1.4x in South Africa, and 0.6x in India.[3] These ratios are notably similar to the comparisons in this analysis between lowest current prices and estimated cost-based prices for injectables (2.5x in the UK, 1.5x in South Africa, 0.3x in India; Table 1).

Analysis of the cost of production of medicines can be used in government price negotiations, price control mechanisms, or in competition law contexts. In India, until 2013, a formula based on the cost of manufacture was used to set ceiling prices on key medicines.[20,21] A similar approach is or has been used in Bangladesh, Pakistan, and China.[21] In South African tenders, manufacturers are required to submit breakdowns of their price by various cost components including API cost and profit margin.[22] The WHO Guideline on Pharmaceutical Pricing Policies notes that the use of cost-plus formulae may be challenging to implement due to challenges on obtaining accurate data on material prices on manufacturing costs, and due to the potential for manipulation of data by manufacturers to exaggerate costs and justify higher prices.[21] Indeed, in this analysis, the Indian government requirement for the publication of customs data on the value of exported API has been revoked since we collected data, meaning that at present the authors are not aware of an

alternative, affordable source of data for API costs.[23] Nevertheless, cost of manufacture analysis should be explored further as a component of pricing policies.

Pricing policies linked to manufacturer costs would also need to be use alongside policies to prevent shortages and stock-outs.[24] Indeed, some of the therapeutic groups identified in this analysis as in many cases high differences between market prices and estimated cost-based prices, such as chemotherapy medicines and antibiotics, may also be groups that are vulnerable to shortages.[25,26]

#### limitations

The main limitation of our analysis is that our estimates do not account for differences of costs individual manufacturing plants, different distribution costs (including tariffs) depending on the country of manufacture and the importing country, and changes in conversion cost depending on the volume of the unit. As argued above, this limitation would not preclude the use of a methodology such as this one to identify medicines that may have high profit margins, for closer *ad hoc* analysis.

As data collection for this analysis finished shortly before the publication in April 2017 of the 2017 EML, we use the second most recent iteration, the 2015 EML.

#### conclusion

Most injectable medicines on the EML can be manufactured at very low cost. In the UK, about one in five injectable essential medicines is priced at more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price. In South Africa, this proportion is one in ten, and in India, one in twenty. Estimation of the cost of manufacture could be used in government pharmaceutical pricing mechanisms, for example, by identifying products for which profit margins may be notably above average.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

None.

## FUNDING

No specific funding was received for this analysis.

## **AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS**

All authors designed the study, interpreted the data, and critically reviewed the manuscript. MB and DG collected and analysed the data.

## **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Dzintars Gotham reports personal fees for unrelated work from the Medicines Patent Pool, the Wellcome Trust, Treatment Action Group, and the World Health Organization. Melissa J Barber and Andrew M Hill report no conflicts of interest.

#### DATA SHARING STATEMENT

An appendix with details on methodology is available as a supplementary file.

## REFERENCES

- 1 Wirtz VJ, Hogerzeil HV, Gray AL, *et al.* Essential medicines for universal health coverage. *The Lancet* 2017;**389**:403–76. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(16)31599-9
- 2 World Health Organization. *Revised procedure for updating WHO's Model List of Essential Drugs*. 2001. http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s22165en/s22165en.pdf (accessed 8 Mar 2018).
- 3 Hill A, Barber MJ, Gotham D. Estimated costs of production and potential prices for the WHO Essential Medicines List. *BMJ Glob Health* 2018;**0**:e000571. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2017-000571
- 4 Billy Kenber. Drug firm is facing fine of £220m for hiking prices. The Times. 2017.https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/drug-firm-faces-fine-of-220m-for-hiking-pricesgf0ssclqk (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 5 Competition and Markets Authority. CMA fines Pfizer and Flynn £90 million for drug price hike to NHS. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/cma-fines-pfizer-and-flynn-90-million-for-drug-price-hike-to-nhs (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 6 Gotham D, Barber MJ, Hill A. Production costs and potential prices for biosimilars of human insulin and insulin analogues. *BMJ Glob Health* 2018;**3**:e000850. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2018-
- 7 World Health Organization. 19th WHO Model List of Essential Medicines. 2015. http://www.who.int/medicines/publications/essentialmedicines/EML2015\_8-May-15.pdf?ua=1 (accessed 28 Jan 2016).
- 8 Hill A, Gotham D, Cooke et al. G. Analysis of minimum target prices for production of entecavir to treat hepatitis B in high- and low-income countries. *J Virus Erad* 2015;1:103–10.
- 9 Hill A, Gotham D, Fortunak J, *et al.* Target prices for mass production of tyrosine kinase inhibitors for global cancer treatment. *BMJ Open* 2016;**6**:e009586. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2015-009586
- 10 Hill A, Simmons B, Gotham D, *et al.* Rapid reductions in prices for generic sofosbuvir and daclatasvir to treat hepatitis C. *J Virus Erad* 2016;**2**:28–31.
- 11 Hill A, Redd C, Gotham D, *et al.* Estimated generic prices of cancer medicines deemed costineffective in England: a cost estimation analysis. *BMJ Open* 2017;**7**:e011965. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2016-011965
- 12 Gotham D, Fortunak J, Pozniak A, *et al.* Estimated generic prices for novel treatments for drugresistant tuberculosis. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2017;:dkw522. doi:10.1093/jac/dkw522
- 13 Sedita J, Perrella S, Morio M, et al. Cost of goods sold and total cost of delivery for oral and parenteral vaccine packaging formats. *Vaccine* 2018;**36**:1700–9. doi:10.1016/j.vaccine.2018.01.011
- 14 Karamehic J, Ridic O, Ridic G, *et al.* Financial aspects and the future of the pharmaceutical industry in the United States of america. *Mater Socio-Medica* 2013;**25**:286–90. doi:10.5455/msm.2013.25.286-290

4
5
6
7
, 0
0
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
10
20
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
20
29
50
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
10
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58

- 15 IMS Institute for Healthcare Informatics. Understanding the pharmaceutical value chain. 2014. https://www.ifpma.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/IIHI\_Report\_Pharma\_Value.pdf
  - 16 Medicines Patent Pool. MedsPaL. http://www.medspal.org/ (accessed 28 Feb 2018).
  - 17 MSF Access campaign. *DR-TB drugs under the microscope: Sources and prices for drug-resistant tuberculosis medicines*. 2016. http://www.msfaccess.org/sites/default/files/TB\_report\_DR-TB\_DRUGS\_UTM\_\_4th\_edition\_2016.pdf (accessed 22 Mar 2016).
  - 18 NHS Digital. Prescribing Costs in Hospitals and the Community, England 2016/17: NICE Data. https://files.digital.nhs.uk/publication/n/0/hosp-pres-eng-201617-nicedata.csv (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 19 Garg CC, Karan AK. Reducing out-of-pocket expenditures to reduce poverty: A disaggregated analysis at rural-urban and state level in India. *Health Policy Plan* 2009;**24**:116–128. doi:10.1093/heapol/czn046
- 20 Kotwani A, Levison L. Price components and access to medicines in Delhi, India. 2007.http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s19208en/s19208en.pdf
- 21 World Health Organization. WHO guidelines on country pharmaceutical pricing policies. 2015. http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s21016en/s21016en.pdf
- 22 Republic of South Africa National Department of Health. *Special Requirements and Conditions of Contract. HP09–2016SD/01. The supply and delivery of solid dosage forms to the Department of Health for the period up to 31 July 2018.* 2017. http://www.health.gov.za/tender/docs/contructs/HP092016SD01ContractCircular.pdf (accessed 11 Jul 2017).
- 23 Central Board of Excise and Customs. Notification No. 140/2016. https://www.seair.co.in/custom-notifications/notifications-issued-in-the-year-2016-notificationno-1402016-dated-25th-nov-2016-268128.aspx (accessed 4 Apr 2017).
- 24 World Health Organization. Medicines shortages: Global approaches to addressing shortages of essential medicines in health systems. *WHO Drug Inf* 2016;**30**.
- 25 Gray A, Manasse H. Shortages of medicines: a complex global challenge. *Bull World Health Organ* 2012;**90**:158–158. doi:10.2471/BLT.11.101303
- 26 Iyengar S, Hedman L, Forte G, *et al.* Medicine shortages: a commentary on causes and mitigation strategies. *BMC Med* 2016;**14**. doi:10.1186/s12916-016-0674-7

## **TABLES AND FIGURES**

to beet teries only

# Table 1. Comparison of estimated prices, API cost, and lowest current prices in UK, South Africa, and India.

	UK	South Africa	India
Injectables			
>10x estimated price	16 (19%)	7 (12%)	4 (5%)
0-10x estimated price	47 (56%)	32 (53%)	10 (12%)
Below estimated price	21 (25%)	21 (35%)	69 (83%)
Median ratio of current	2.45x	1.47x	0.29x
price to estimated price			

Note: multiple dosage levels of one formulation of one medicine (e.g. ifosfamide powder for injection in 1g and 2g forms) are counted as one instance in these overview statistics.

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

Medicine	Unit	Lowest current price (USD)	Estimated cost-based price (USD)	Ratio
linozolid	200mL infusion bag (600mg)	¢578 50	\$0.61	054.2
irinotocon	EmL vial (100mg)	\$378.30	\$0.01 ¢1.20	111 E
filgractim	1 mL vial (200mcg)	\$145.01 \$69 E2	\$1.29	102.4
		\$08.52	\$0.67	102.4
ibuproten	1mL injection (5mg)	\$46.80	\$0.67	70.3
daunorubicin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$211.25	\$3.16	66.8
azathioprine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$39.99	\$0.73	55.0
ifosfamide	powder for injection (2g)	\$233.84	\$4.51	51.9
ifosfamide	powder for injection (1g)	\$118.72	\$2.59	45.9
ifosfamide	powder for injection (500mg)	\$59.35	\$1.63	36.5
mesna	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$38.23	\$1.24	30.8
atropine	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$8.25	\$0.27	30.6
ampicillin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$20.36	\$0.71	28.7
mesna	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$17.43	\$0.66	26.6
phenobarbital	1mL injection (200mg)	\$7.32	\$0.29	25.2
leuprorelin	pre-filled syringe (7.5mg)	\$195.62	\$8.11	24.1
epinephrine	10mL ampoule (1mg)	\$6.97	\$0.29	23.7
valproic acid	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$5.09	\$0.28	18.1
sulfamethoxazole + trimethoprim	10mL ampoule (800mg+160mg)	\$4.62	\$0.29	16.2
zidovudine	20mL vial (200mg)	\$11.60	\$0.74	15.7
ampicillin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$10.18	\$0.69	14.8

## Table 2. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared to API cost or estimated cost-based price, in the UK.

Table 3. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared to estimated cost-based
price or API cost, in South Africa.

current price (USD)         cost-based price (USD)           filgrastim         1mL vial (300mcg)         \$32.38         \$0.67         48.4           linezolid         300mL infusion bag (600mg)         \$21.90         \$0.61         36.1           tranexamic acid         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         \$9.74         \$0.40         24.1           ifosfamide         powder for injection (1g)         \$33.02         \$2.59         12.8           ifosfamide         powder for injection (2g)         \$56.02         \$4.51         12.4           ifosfamide         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$19.81         \$1.63         12.2           streptokinase         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$257.52         \$21.56         11.9           amiodarone         ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL am
price (USD)         price (USD)           filgrastim         1mL vial (300mcg)         \$32.38         \$0.67         48.4           linezolid         300mL infusion bag (600mg)         \$21.90         \$0.61         36.1           tranexamic acid         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         \$9.74         \$0.40         24.1           ifosfamide         powder for injection (1g)         \$33.02         \$2.59         12.8           ifosfamide         powder for injection (500mg)         \$19.81         \$1.63         12.2           streptokinase         powder for injection (500mg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$34.36         \$5.34         6.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (50g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         <
filgrastim       1mL vial (300mcg)       \$32.38       \$0.67       48.4         linezolid       300mL infusion bag (600mg)       \$21.90       \$0.61       36.1         tranexamic acid       10mL ampoule (1000mg)       \$9.74       \$0.40       24.1         ifosfamide       powder for injection (1g)       \$33.02       \$2.59       12.8         ifosfamide       powder for injection (2g)       \$56.02       \$4.51       12.4         ifosfamide       powder for injection (20)       \$19.81       \$1.63       12.2         streptokinase       powder for injection (15.0mg)       \$257.52       \$21.56       11.9         amiodarone       ampoule (150mg/3mL)       \$3.30       \$0.30       11.2         digoxin       2mL ampoule (500mcg)       \$2.81       \$0.27       10.3         fluphenazine       1mL ampoule (25mg)       \$2.64       \$0.35       7.5         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (100mg)       \$68.72       \$10.01       6.9         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (50mg)       \$1.57       \$0.29       5.5         ciclosporin       1mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.98       \$0.37       5.4         docetaxel       injection (20mg)       \$24.95       \$4.63       5.4
linezolid         300mL infusion bag (600mg)         \$21.90         \$0.61         36.1           tranexamic acid         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         \$9.74         \$0.40         24.1           ifosfamide         powder for injection (1g)         \$33.02         \$2.59         12.8           ifosfamide         powder for injection (2g)         \$56.02         \$4.51         12.4           ifosfamide         powder for injection (500mg)         \$19.81         \$1.63         12.2           streptokinase         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$257.52         \$21.56         11.9           amiodarone         ampoule (150mg/3mL)         \$3.30         \$0.30         11.2           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         1mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           otigoxin         1mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           otigoxin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.57         \$0.29         \$.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$1.57         \$0.29         \$.5
tranexamic acid       10mL ampoule (1000mg)       \$9.74       \$0.40       24.1         ifosfamide       powder for injection (1g)       \$33.02       \$2.59       12.8         ifosfamide       powder for injection (2g)       \$56.02       \$4.51       12.4         ifosfamide       powder for injection (500mg)       \$19.81       \$1.63       12.2         streptokinase       powder for injection (15.6mg)       \$257.52       \$21.56       11.9         amiodarone       ampoule (150mg/3mL)       \$3.30       \$0.30       11.2         digoxin       2mL ampoule (500mcg)       \$2.81       \$0.27       10.3         digoxin       2mL ampoule (25mg)       \$2.64       \$0.35       7.5         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (100mg)       \$68.72       \$10.01       6.9         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (50mg)       \$34.36       \$5.34       6.4         magnesium sulfate       10mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.57       \$0.29       5.5         ciclosporin       1mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.98       \$0.37       5.4         docetaxel       injection (20mg)       \$22.77       \$0.66       4.2         daunorubicin       powder for injection (50mg)       \$11.53       \$3.16
ifosfamide       powder for injection (1g)       \$33.02       \$2.59       12.8         ifosfamide       powder for injection (2g)       \$56.02       \$4.51       12.4         ifosfamide       powder for injection (2g)       \$56.02       \$4.51       12.4         ifosfamide       powder for injection (500mg)       \$19.81       \$1.63       12.2         streptokinase       powder for injection (15.6mg)       \$257.52       \$21.56       11.9         amiodarone       ampoule (150mg/3mL)       \$3.30       \$0.30       11.2         digoxin       2mL ampoule (500mcg)       \$2.81       \$0.27       10.3         fluphenazine       1mL ampoule (25mg)       \$2.64       \$0.35       7.5         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (100mg)       \$68.72       \$10.01       6.9         oxaliplatin       powder for injection (50mg)       \$34.36       \$5.34       6.4         magnesium sulfate       10mL ampoule (5g)       \$1.57       \$0.29       5.5         ciclosporin       1mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.98       \$0.37       5.4         docetaxel       injection (20mg)       \$24.95       \$4.63       5.4         mesna       4mL ampoule (400mg)       \$2.77       \$0.66       4.2
ifosfamide         powder for injection (2g)         \$56.02         \$4.51         12.4           ifosfamide         powder for injection (500mg)         \$19.81         \$1.63         12.2           streptokinase         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$257.52         \$21.56         11.9           amiodarone         ampoule (150mg/3mL)         \$3.30         \$0.30         11.2           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin
ifosfamide         powder for injection (500mg)         \$19.81         \$1.63         12.2           streptokinase         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$257.52         \$21.56         11.9           amiodarone         ampoule (150mg/3mL)         \$3.30         \$0.30         11.2           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$34.36         \$5.34         6.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin
streptokinase         powder for injection (15.6mg)         \$257.52         \$21.56         11.9           amiodarone         ampoule (150mg/3mL)         \$3.30         \$0.30         11.2           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$34.36         \$5.34         6.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine
International         Interna <thinternational< th="">         International<!--</td--></thinternational<>
digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           digoxin         2mL ampoule (500mcg)         \$2.81         \$0.27         10.3           fluphenazine         1mL ampoule (25mg)         \$2.64         \$0.35         7.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$68.72         \$10.01         6.9           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$34.36         \$5.34         6.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine         powder for injection (5mg)         \$16.00         \$4.57         3.5
and any one (accuracy)         procession
Internet of the control         Procession
Introduction         Introduction         Other
Oxaliplatin         powder for injection (100mg)         \$1001         0.5           oxaliplatin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$34.36         \$5.34         6.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine         powder for injection (5mg)         \$16.00         \$4.57         3.5
Oxder for injection (50mg)         \$35,4         0.4           magnesium sulfate         10mL ampoule (5g)         \$1.57         \$0.29         5.5           ciclosporin         1mL ampoule (50mg)         \$1.98         \$0.37         5.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine         powder for injection (5mg)         \$16.00         \$4.57         3.5
Imagnesidin sulfate       10mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.57       \$0.25       \$3.5         ciclosporin       1mL ampoule (50mg)       \$1.98       \$0.37       \$5.4         docetaxel       injection (20mg)       \$24.95       \$4.63       \$5.4         docetaxel       injection (40mg)       \$39.44       \$8.60       4.6         mesna       4mL ampoule (400mg)       \$2.77       \$0.66       4.2         daunorubicin       powder for injection (50mg)       \$11.53       \$3.16       3.6         vincristine       powder for injection (5mg)       \$16.00       \$4.57       3.5
Citcosporm         Init ampoule (soling)         \$1.98         \$0.37         \$3.4           docetaxel         injection (20mg)         \$24.95         \$4.63         \$5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine         powder for injection (5mg)         \$16.00         \$4.57         3.5
docetaker         Injection (2011g)         \$24.93         \$4.03         5.4           docetaxel         injection (40mg)         \$39.44         \$8.60         4.6           mesna         4mL ampoule (400mg)         \$2.77         \$0.66         4.2           daunorubicin         powder for injection (50mg)         \$11.53         \$3.16         3.6           vincristine         powder for injection (50mg)         \$16.00         \$4.57         3.5
docetaxerInjection (40ng)\$33.44\$3.004.0mesna4mL ampoule (400mg)\$2.77\$0.664.2daunorubicinpowder for injection (50mg)\$11.53\$3.163.6vincristinepowder for injection (5mg)\$16.00\$4.573.5
Intestia4int ampoule (400ing)32.7730.004.2daunorubicinpowder for injection (50mg)\$11.53\$3.163.6vincristinepowder for injection (5mg)\$16.00\$4.573.5
dationation       powder for injection (somg)       \$11.53       \$3.16       3.6         vincristine       powder for injection (5mg)       \$16.00       \$4.57       3.5
vincristine powder for injection (Smg) \$16.00 \$4.57 3.5

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
17
15
16
10
17
10 10
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
50 27
27 20
20
39 40
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
50

Table 4. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared to estimated cost-based
price or API cost, in India.

Medicine	Unit	Lowest	Estimated	Ratio
		current	cost-based	
		price	price (USD)	
		(USD)		
irinotecan	25mL vial (500mg)	\$112.50	\$3.79	29.7
filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$16.50	\$0.67	24.7
irinotecan	5mL vial (100mg)	\$22.50	\$1.29	17.4
leuprorelin	pre-filled syringe (7.5mg)	\$111.30	\$8.11	13.7
irinotecan	2mL vial (40mg)	\$11.25	\$0.92	12.3
bendamustine	2mL injection (180mg)	\$194.40	\$16.55	11.7
bendamustine	0.5mL injection (45mg)	\$48.60	\$4.64	10.5
leuprorelin	pre-filled syringe (22.5mg)	\$252.00	\$24.34	10.4
valproic acid (sodium valproate)	10mL ampoule (1g)	\$3.00	\$0.30	9.8
enoxaparin	0.6mL injection (60mg)	\$4.55	\$0.77	5.9
enoxaparin	0.2mL injection (20mg)	\$1.52	\$0.26	5.9
enoxaparin	1mL injection (100mg)	\$7.58	\$1.28	5.9
linezolid	300mL infusion bag (600mg)	\$3.47	\$0.61	5.7
ciclosporin	1mL ampoule (50mg)	\$1.80	\$0.37	4.9
testosterone	1mL ampoule (200mg)	\$1.41	\$0.30	4.7
valproic acid (sodium valproate)	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$1.20	\$0.28	4.3
enoxaparin	0.4mL injection (40mg)	\$1.58	\$0.51	3.1
enoxaparin	0.8mL injection (80mg)	\$3.15	\$1.03	3.1
insulin injection (soluble)	10mL injection (34.7mg)	\$6.09	\$2.37	2.6
sodium nitroprusside	powder for injection (50mg)	\$0.68	\$0.28	2.4

Figure 1. Formula for estimating cost-based prices for injectable formulations.

Figure 2. Estimated generic prices and current prices for injectables in UK, South Africa, and India.

Figure 3. Comparison of lowest current prices of injectable essential medicines between the UK, South Africa, and India.

to occure work





Page 23 of 39 **UK** 



## UK versus South Africa



## Appendix

to beer terien on

## Criteria used for cleaning export data.

Reason for censoring	Example of product description that would trigger censoring
Incorrect substance identified	"DIAMORPHINE" (in a search for "morphine")
Item is part of a mix of products	"ABACAVIR, LOPINAVIR, LAMIVUDINE API"
Quantity of shipment < 1.0 kg, with exceptions made for very low-dose medicines	Value listed in "quantity" variable greater than 1.0kg
Finished Pharmaceutical Product (FPP), for example tablets	"ABACAVIR SULFATE TABLETS 600MG"
Impurity	"ABACAVIR SULPHATE IMPURITY"
Unclear quantity of API	"ABACAVIR GRANULES 10%" (In this example, the percentage descriptor could refer to a variety of parameters, for example, moisture content. As this is not specified, the true amount of API is unknown.)
Free sample or 'no commercial value'	"ABACAVIR SULPHATE FREE SAMPLE" "ABACAVIR SULPHATE N.C.V."
For veterinary use	"IVERMECTIN VETERINARY"
Reference/working standard	"ABACAVIR WORKING STANDARD"

This table is reproduced from an earlier publication as this element of the methodology was identical:

Hill A, Barber MJ, Gotham D. Estimated costs of production and potential prices for the WHO Essential Medicines List. *BMJ Global Health* 2018; e000571.

## Included and excluded formulation types, by terms used in WHO Model List of Essential Medicines.

#### Included:

Concentrate for injection, depot injection, infusion, injectable solution, injection, injection for intravenous administration, injection for spinal anaesthesia, injection in oil, injection: ampoule or pre-filled syringe, injections, oily injection, oily solution, oily suspension for injection, parenteral formulation, powder for injection, solution for injection, solution for intramuscular injection, solution for IV infusion, vial or prefilled syringe.

#### Excluded:

Ampoule (for buccal administration when solution for oromucosal administration is not available), aqueous solution\*, capsule, cream, cream (as mupirocin calcium), cream or lotion, cream or ointment, dental cartridge, detergent-based suspension, eye ointment, gel or rectal solution, granules, granules (slow-release; to mix with water), immediate release capsule, inhalation (aerosol), lotion, lozenge, metered dose inhaler (aerosol), nasal spray, ointment, oral liquid, oral powder, pessary, powder for oral administration, powder for oral liquid, rectal dosage form, rectal solution, respirator solution for use in nebulizers, retention enema, saturated solution, solid oral dosage form, solid oral dosage form (controlled-release tablets), solid oral form, solution, solution (eye drops), solution for oromucosal administration, suppository, tablet, tablet (chewable), tablet (crushable), tablet (dispersible, scored), tablet (dispersible), tablet (enteric-coated), tablet (heat stable), tablet (immediate release), tablet (scored), tablet (slow release), tablet (sublingual), topical, topical forms, transdermal patches, vaginal cream, vaginal tablet.

C. C. O.

\*this represents potassium permanganate for topical use in dermatology.

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml



## Figure A1. Example of API data: Price of linezolid API exported from India from July 1, 2014 to July 1, 2016.

 Bubble colours correspond to the region of the destination country for individual shipments. Bubble sizes correspond to the size of individual shipments (size key shown in lower-left, in kilograms). The linear regression model is shown as a dashed red line; though is appears horizontal is has a slight upwards slope. The values estimated by the linear regression model were \$683/kg on July 1, 2014, and \$690/kg on July 1, 2016.

## Costs prescribed in India's Drug Price Control Order (2012).

ltem	Cost per unit in 2011 Indian rupees	Converted to 2016 USD
Conversion cost		
Ampoules		
Up to 1mL	0.4253	\$0.008
100mL	1.4327	\$0.028
Sterile vials		
Up to 5mL	1.22	\$0.024
100mL	3.21	\$0.063
Packing materials cost		
USP type I glass vial including blister		
Up to 2mL	1.48	\$0.029
100mL	6.96	\$0.136
Plastic vial/bottle		
Up to 2mL	0.99	\$0.019
100mL	2.96	\$0.058
Ampoules		
White ampoule in tray		
Up to 1mL	0.53	\$0.010
25mL	2.86	\$0.056
Amber ampoules in blister	~	
Up to 1mL	0.63	\$0.012
25mL	4.68	\$0.091
Packing charges		
Ampoules		
Up to 5mL	0.33	\$0.006
Over 15mL	0.56	\$0.011
Liquid in vials		
Up to 5mL	0.6	\$0.012
Over 5mL	0.69	\$0.013
Sterile powder in vials		
Up to 1g	0.23	\$0.004
Over 1g	0.38	\$0.007
Ampoules range		\$0.03-\$0.13
Vials range		\$0.05-\$0.21

Pharmabiz.com. NPPA notification dated Dec 27, 2012 fixing/revising the norms for conversion cost (CC), packing charges (PC), process loss (PL) and packing material. Available from: <u>http://pharmabiz.com/PrintArticle.aspx?aid=72988</u> (accessed 6 November 2018).

Rupee values were inflation-adjusted by a factor of 1.30, based on inflation data provided by the World Bank, available from https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/FP.CPI.TOTL.ZG?locations=IN.



Solid red line: Points above this line represent an instance where the lowest current price is greater than the estimated generic price/API cost.

Dashed red line: Points above this line represent an instance where the lowest current price is more than 10 times the estimated generic price/API cost.

'Floors' can be seen for estimated generic price at \$0.27 and \$0.67 – the cost-based prices estimated by our algorithm for ampoules and vials, respectively, if API costs are zero, therefore, the estimated cost-based price cannot be below these 'floors'. In all countries, it can be observed that in some cases (in India more than in South Africa more than in UK) lowest current prices go below these 'floors'.

Ratio of estimated cost-based prices to lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India, by therapeutic category.

Medicine	UK	South Africa	India
Anaesthetics	0.2	0.2	0.1
Medicines for pain and palliative care	0.6	0.5	0.1
Antiallergics and medicines used in anaphylaxis	0.7	1.0	0.1
Antidotes and other substances used in poisonings	16.5	1.0	0.2
Anticonvulsants/antiepileptics	2.5	1.7	0.2
Anti-infectives	1.8	1.0	0.3
Antimigraine medicines	NA	NA	NA
Antineoplastics and immunosuppressives	2.8	2.4	0.6
Antiparkinsonism medicines	NA	NA	NA
Medicines affecting the blood	6.0	2.8	1.4
Cardiovascular medicines	4.7	10.3	0.2
Dermatological Medicines (topical)	NA	NA	NA
Diuretics	0.2	0.1	0.0
Gastrointestinal medicines	1.2	1.1	0.1
Hormones, other endocrine medicines and contraceptives	4.1	0.9	2.7
Muscle relaxants (peripherally-acting) and cholinesterase inhibitors	1.4	0.5	0.1
Ophthalmological Preparations	NA	NA	NA
Oxytocics and antioxytocics	3.4	1.4	0.4
Medicines for mental and behavioural disorders	5.2	7.5	0.1
Medicines acting on the respiratory tract	0.7	NA	0.1
Ear, nose and throat medicines (children)	NA	NA	NA
Specific medicines for neonatal care	39.4	0.9	0.1
Medicines for diseases of joints	NA	NA	NA

Full results table: Lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India, and estimated
cost-based generic prices.

				<b>c</b>				Estimated
				South		India price		cost-based product
		UK price	UK price	price	India price	sourc	Cost of API	price per
Medicine	Unit	(USD)	source	(USD)	(USD)	e	per unit	unit
acetylcysteine	2000mg ampoule	\$1.36	eMIT	\$1.81	\$2.10	TN		
aciclovir	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.24	eMIT	\$2.42	\$0.24	TN	\$0.02215	\$0.69793
amikacin	powder for injection (100mg)	\$2.38	eMIT	\$0.38	\$0.06	TN		
amikacin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$11.92	eMIT	\$0.32	\$0.14	TN		
amikacin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$23.83	eMIT	\$0.64	\$0.28	TN		
amiodarone	ampoule (150mg/3mL)	\$1.95	BNF	\$3.30	\$0.25	TN	\$0.02024	\$0.29583
amphotericin B	powder for injection (50mg)	\$5.04	BNF		\$1.07	TN	\$0.09296	\$0.80160
amphotericin B	powder for injection (50mg)	\$5.04	BNF		\$1.07	TN	\$0.09296	\$0.80160
ampicillin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$10.18	BNF	\$0.70	\$0.07	TN	\$0.01471	\$0.68703
ampicillin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$20.36	BNF	\$1.39	\$0.13	TN	\$0.02941	\$0.70856
artemether	ampoule (80mg/1mL)				\$0.42	Р	\$0.02194	\$0.29832
asparaginase	powder for injection (10,000iU)	\$796.90	BNF		\$12.15	TN		
atracurium	1mL injection (10mg)	\$0.86	BNF		\$0.00	TN	\$0.09646	\$0.80673
atropine	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$8.25	BNF	\$0.15	\$0.01	TN	\$0.00198	\$0.26910
atropine	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$8.25	BNF	\$0.15	\$0.01	TN	\$0.00198	\$0.26910
azathioprine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$39.99	BNF				\$0.04225	\$0.72736
bendamustine	0.5mL injection (45mg)				\$48.60	Р	\$2.71305	\$4.63768
bendamustine	2mL injection (180mg)				\$194.40	Р	\$10.85220	\$16.55421
benzathine benzylpenicillin	5mL vial (900mg)				\$0.17	Р		
benzathine benzylpenicillin	5mL vial (1.44g)		4		\$0.24	Р		
benzylpenicillin	powder for injection (600mg)	\$3.04	BNF		\$0.10	TN		
benzylpenicillin	powder for injection (3g)	\$15.18	BNF		\$0.51	TN		
bevacizumab	1mL injection (25mg)	\$78.86	BNF		\$66.75	TN		
bleomycin	powder for injection (15mg)	\$24.78	BNF		\$4.83	TN		
bupivacaine	1mL injection (5mg)	\$0.09	eMIT	\$0.03	\$0.01	TN	\$0.00103	\$0.66701
bupivacaine	1mL injection (2.5mg)	\$0.11	eMIT		\$0.02	Р	\$0.00051	\$0.66625
bupivacaine	4mL ampoule (20mg, with glucose)			\$0.24	\$0.24	Р	\$0.00411	\$0.27222
caffeine citrate	1mL injection (20mg)	\$5.70	eMIT				\$0.00030	\$0.66594
calcium folinate	10mL ampoule (30mg)	\$6.01	BNF		\$1.97	Р		
calcium gluconate	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$0.65	eMIT	\$0.41	\$0.12	Р	\$0.01106	\$0.28239
capreomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$37.19	BNF	\$8.23	\$4.13	Р		
carboplatin	5mL injection (50mg)	\$4.64	eMIT	\$4.39	\$1.85	TN	\$1.43635	\$2.76845
carboplatin	15mL injection (150mg)	\$9.91	eMIT	\$13.16	\$5.99	TN	\$4.30904	\$6.97436
carboplatin	60mL injection (600mg)	\$32.83	eMIT	\$52.63	\$23.94	TN	\$17.23615	\$25.90095
carboplatin	45mL injection (450mg)	\$24.78	eMIT	\$34.51	\$16.61	TN	\$12.92711	\$19.59208
cefazolin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.61	\$0.27	TN	\$0.15187	\$0.88785

Page 33 of 39

#### BMJ Open

cefotaxime	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.31 eMIT	\$0.17	\$0.07	ΤN	\$0.02734	\$0.70553
ceftazidime	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.77 eMIT	\$0.51	\$0.37	Р	\$0.10774	\$0.82325
ceftazidime	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$0.99 eMIT	\$2.04	\$0.38	Р	\$0.43097	\$1.29649
ceftriaxone	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.43 eMIT	\$0.31	\$0.08	TN	\$0.04759	\$0.73517
ceftriaxone	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$0.64 eMIT	\$0.51	\$0.15	TN	\$0.19035	\$0.94419
chloramphenicol	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$1.81 BNF		\$0.14	Р	\$0.15906	\$0.89837
chloramphenicol	2mL ampoule (1000mg)			\$0.14	Р	\$0.15906	\$0.49907
chlorpromazine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.92 eMIT		\$0.03	Р	\$0.00429	\$0.27249
chlorpromazine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.92 eMIT		\$0.03	Р	\$0.00429	\$0.27249
ciclosporin	1mL ampoule (50mg)	\$3.02 BNF	\$1.98	\$1.80	Р	\$0.06771	\$0.36533
ciprofloxacin	1mL solution for infusion (2mg)	\$0.01 eMIT		\$0.00	ΤN	\$0.00051	\$0.66624
cisplatin	50mL injection (50mg)	\$9.09 eMIT	\$5.09	\$2.70	Р	\$1.94314	\$3.51046
cisplatin	100mL injection (100mg)	\$13.73 eMIT	\$10.17	\$5.40	Р	\$3.88629	\$6.35542
clindamycin	1mL injection (150mg)	\$0.37 eMIT		\$1.28	Р		
cloxacillin	powder for injection (500mg)		\$1.02	\$0.13	TN	\$0.01268	\$0.68407
cyclizine	1mL injection (50mg)	\$2.11 eMIT				\$0.00419	\$0.67163
cyclophosphamid	nounder for injection (E00mg)	611 F2 AMIT	ćr 70	ćo ra	TN	ćo 79100	¢1 90040
e outorobino	powder for injection (500mg)	\$11.53 EIVIT	\$2.79	\$0.53		\$0.78130	\$1.80940
dagarbazina	powder for injection (100mg)	\$3.99 EMIT	\$2.07	\$0.05 ¢1.07		\$0.13341	\$0.80083
dacarbazine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$5.42 elvil 1		\$1.07		\$0.33923	\$1.10217
daunaruhisin	powder for injection (Sounde)	6211 25 DNF	<u>с</u> 11 го	\$0.17		¢1 70665	62 16421
	initiation (500mm)	\$211.25 BINF	\$11.55	\$2.91		\$1.70005	\$3.10421
deferoxamine	Injection (Soumg)	\$5.19 BNF	\$0.54	\$2.23			
dereroxamine	powder for injection (Soumg)	\$5.19 BINF	\$0.54	\$2.23	IN	ć0.00112	ć0 20704
desmopressin	1mL ampoule (4mcg)	\$1.46 eMIT	ć0.24	ć0.02		\$0.00112	\$0.26784
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)		\$0.24	\$0.03		\$0.00790	\$0.27777
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)		\$0.24	\$0.03		\$0.00790	\$0.27777
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)		\$0.24	\$0.03		\$0.00790	\$0.27777
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)		\$0.24	\$0.03		\$0.00790	\$0.27777
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)	ĆO 25 - NAIT	\$0.24	\$0.03		\$0.00790	\$0.27777
diazepam	ImL injection (Smg)	\$0.25 eMIT	\$0.07	\$0.02		\$0.00065	\$0.66646
digoxin	2mL ampoule (500mcg)	\$0.60 eMIT	\$2.81	\$0.07	Р 	\$0.00354	\$0.27138
digoxin	2mL ampoule (Soumcg)	Ş0.60 elvil i	\$2.81	\$0.07	Р 	\$0.00354	\$0.27138
dimercaprol	2mL ampoule (100mg)			\$1.58	Р		
	(AO = z)		¢20.44	62.04	-	CF 42200	
docetaxel	injection (40mg)	¢2.20 - MIT	\$39.44	\$3.04	TN	\$5.42209	\$8.60398
docetaxel docetaxel	injection (40mg) injection (20mg)	\$3.30 eMIT	\$39.44 \$24.95	\$3.04 \$1.52	TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104	\$8.60398 \$4.63474
docetaxel docetaxel dopamine	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09	TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644
docetaxel docetaxel dopamine doxorubicin	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52	TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800
docetaxel docetaxel dopamine doxorubicin doxorubicin	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg) powder for injection (50mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT \$5.25 eMIT	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95 \$5.82	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52 \$1.19	TN TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249 \$2.26247 \$2.26247	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800 \$3.97798
docetaxel docetaxel dopamine doxorubicin doxorubicin eflornithine	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg) powder for injection (50mg) 100mL injection (20g)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT \$5.25 eMIT	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95 \$5.82	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52 \$1.19	TN TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249 \$2.26247 \$27.83990 \$1.05251	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800 \$3.97798 \$41.42589
docetaxel dopamine doxorubicin doxorubicin eflornithine enoxaparin	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg) powder for injection (50mg) 100mL injection (20g) 0.8mL injection (120mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT \$5.25 eMIT \$11.43 BNF \$12.99 PME	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95 \$5.82	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52 \$1.19	TN TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249 \$2.26247 \$27.83990 \$1.05251 \$1.21564	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800 \$3.97798 \$41.42589 \$1.54098 \$1.92622
docetaxel dopamine dopamine doxorubicin doxorubicin eflornithine enoxaparin enoxaparin	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg) powder for injection (50mg) 100mL injection (20g) 0.8mL injection (120mg) 1mL injection (150mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT \$5.25 eMIT \$11.43 BNF \$12.99 BNF	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95 \$5.82	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52 \$1.19	TN TN TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249 \$2.26247 \$27.83990 \$1.05251 \$1.31564 \$0.17542	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800 \$3.97798 \$41.42589 \$1.54098 \$1.92622 \$0.25682
docetaxel docetaxel dopamine doxorubicin doxorubicin eflornithine enoxaparin enoxaparin enoxaparin	injection (40mg) injection (20mg) 5mL vial (200mg) powder for injection (10mg) powder for injection (50mg) 100mL injection (20g) 0.8mL injection (120mg) 1mL injection (150mg) 0.2mL injection (20mg)	\$3.30 eMIT \$0.68 eMIT \$1.99 eMIT \$5.25 eMIT \$11.43 BNF \$12.99 BNF \$2.71 BNF	\$39.44 \$24.95 \$0.30 \$1.95 \$5.82 \$0.85	\$3.04 \$1.52 \$0.09 \$0.52 \$1.19 \$1.52 \$1.52	TN TN TN TN TN TN	\$5.42209 \$2.71104 \$0.05528 \$0.45249 \$2.26247 \$27.83990 \$1.05251 \$1.31564 \$0.17542 \$0.87700	\$8.60398 \$4.63474 \$0.74644 \$1.32800 \$3.97798 \$41.42589 \$1.54098 \$1.92622 \$0.25683 \$1.28415

enoxaparin	0.4mL injection (40mg)	\$3.94	BNF	\$1.71	\$1.58	TN	\$0.35084	\$0.51366
enoxaparin	0.8mL injection (80mg)	\$7.17	BNF	\$3.41	\$3.15	ΤN	\$0.70167	\$1.02732
ephedrine	1mL ampoule (30mg)	\$0.52	eMIT		\$0.11	ΤN	\$0.00184	\$0.26889
epinephrine	10ml ampaula (1mg)	\$6.07	ONALT				¢0 01979	¢0 20260
epinephrine		\$0.97					\$0.01878	ŞU.29509
(adrenaline)	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$0.20	eMIT		\$0.04	ΤN	\$0.01878	\$0.29369
epinephrine (adrenaline)	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$0.20	AMIT		\$0.04	TN	\$0.01878	\$0.29369
ergometrine	1ml ampoule (0.2mg)				+0.0¢ \$0.03	D	90.01070	J0.25505
erythromycin	nowder for injection (500mg)	\$11.12	eMIT		<del>.</del>			
etonoside	5mL ampoule (100mg)	\$3.47	eMIT	\$4.21	\$1.02	тл	\$0.84629	\$1 50525
filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$68.52	BNE	\$37.38	\$16.50	D	\$0.04025	\$0 66900
filgrastim	1 6ml vial (480mcg)			<i>3</i> 32.30	Ş10.50		\$0.00243	\$0.6712/
fluconazole	1ml vial (2mg)	\$0.01	oMIT		\$0.00	ты	\$0.00032	\$0.66502
flucutosino	2E0mL infusion (2 Eq)	\$0.01			Ş0.00		\$0.00028	\$0.00392
fludarabino	vial (50mg)	\$35.43		¢10.22	¢21 52		Ş3.44202	ŞJ.70364
fluorouracil		\$30.40		\$40.55	\$21.55			
fluorouracii	SmL ampoule (250mg)	\$0.60		62.64	\$0.10	Р р	¢0.05000	¢0.25270
fupnenazine	1 First empoule (25mg)	\$2.78	eiviri	\$2.64	\$0.36	Р	\$0.05980	\$0.35376
	1.5mL ampoule (1500mg)	<u> </u>		<u> </u>	<u> </u>		\$26.92838	\$39.69204
furosemide	2mL ampoule (20mg)	\$0.12	eMII	\$0.08	\$0.02		\$0.00075	\$0.26730
furosemide	2mL ampoule (20mg)	\$0.12	eMIT	\$0.08	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00075	\$0.26730
gemcitabine	vial (200mg)	\$5.19	eMIT	\$5.77	\$0.99	TN	\$0.87393	\$1.94502
gemcitabine	vial (1000mg)	\$40.16	eMIT	\$23.23	\$4.95	TN	\$4.36964	\$7.06309
gentamicin	2mL vial (80mg)	\$0.78	eMIT	\$0.27	\$0.04	TN		
gentamicin	2mL vial (20mg)	\$1.43	eMIT		\$0.04	Р		
glucagon	1mL injection (1mg)	\$14.98	BNF	\$22.44	\$1.72	Р		
haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT		\$0.03	TN	\$0.00166	\$0.26862
haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT		\$0.03	TN	\$0.00166	\$0.26862
haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT		\$0.03	TN	\$0.00166	\$0.26862
heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (6.7mg)	\$0.99	eMIT	\$0.19	\$0.02	Р	\$0.08533	\$0.39113
heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (6.7mg)	\$0.99	eMIT	\$0.19	\$0.02	Р	\$0.08533	\$0.39113
heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (33.3mg)	\$2.09	eMIT	\$0.32	\$0.15	ΤN	\$0.42411	\$0.88714
heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (33.3mg)	\$2.09	eMIT	\$0.32	\$0.15	ΤN	\$0.42411	\$0.88714
heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (133.3mg)						\$1.69772	\$2.75183
hydralazine	powder for injection (20mg)	\$2.88	BNF				\$0.00777	\$0.27758
hydrocortisone	powder for injection (100mg)			\$0.90	\$0.50	Р	\$0.09166	\$0.79970
hydrocortisone	powder for injection (100mg)			\$0.90	\$0.50	Р	\$0.09166	\$0.79970
hydroxocobalami n	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$1.15	eMIT					
hyoscine hydrobromide	injection (400mcg)	\$1.10	eMIT				\$0.00159	\$0.26853
nyoscine hydrobromide	  injection (600mcg)	\$1.33	eMIT				\$0.00239	\$0.26969
ibuprofen	1mL injection (5mg)	\$46.80	BNF				\$0.00005	\$0.66557
ifosfamide	powder for injection (500mg)	\$59.35	BNF	\$19.81	\$1.22	TN	\$0.65602	\$1.62598
ifosfamide	powder for injection (1g)	\$118.72	BNF	\$33.02	\$2.44	TN	\$1,31204	\$2,58646
ifosfamide	nowder for injection (2g)	\$722.84	BNE	\$56.02	<del>۲۲</del> . <u>-</u> د۸ ۵۵	TN	\$2.62/08	\$4 50742
nosiannue		2253.04		J0.02 و	Ş4.69	111	JZ.02400	ə4.3074/
#### BMJ Open

imipenem + cilastatin	powder for injection (250mg + 250mg)			\$1.80	\$8.93	Р		
imipenem +	powder for injection (500mg +	¢2.20		\$2.50	¢1.2 /E	П		
insulin injection	Soung)	\$5.50		\$5.59	\$12.45	P		
(soluble)	10mL injection (13.9mg)				\$0.83	ΤN	\$0.46524	\$1.34665
insulin injection (soluble)	10mL injection (34.7mg)	\$9.72	BNF	\$2.10	\$6.09	Р	\$1.16309	\$2.36838
intermediate- acting insulin	10mL injection (13.9mg)				\$0.83	TN		
intermediate- acting insulin	10mL injection (34.7mg)	\$9.72	BNF	\$2.10	\$4.40	Р		
irinotecan	2mL vial (40mg)	\$5.58	eMIT		\$11.25	Р	\$0.17047	\$0.91509
irinotecan	5mL vial (100mg)	\$143.81	BNF		\$22.50	Р	\$0.42618	\$1.28947
irinotecan	25mL vial (500mg)	\$46.83	eMIT		\$112.50	Р	\$2.13090	\$3.78536
kanamvcin	powder for injection (1g)	,	-		\$0.45	Р		,
ketamine	10mL vial (500mg)	\$9.10	BNF	\$2.64	\$0.08	Р	\$0 14269	\$0 87441
leuprorelin	nre-filled syringe (7 5mg)	\$195.62	BNF	<i>\</i>	\$111 30	Р	\$5 54227	\$8 11444
leuprorelin	pre-filled syringe (22 5mg)	\$749.47	BNF		\$252.00	P	\$16 62682	\$74 34333
lidocaine	vial (20mg)	<u>4-7-7-7</u> ۲۵ ۵۶	BNF	\$0.16	\$0.00	Р	\$0.00032	\$0 66597
lidocaine	vial (10mg)	\$0.00 ¢∩ ∩⊑	BNE	\$0.10 \$0.46	\$0.00 \$0.00	P	\$0.00032 \$0.00016	\$0.00337 \$0.66574
lidocalite	2mL ampoule (100mg lidocaine +	Ş0.05			Ş0.00	F	Ş0.00010	J0.00374
lidocaine	glucose)	-			\$0.06	Р	\$0.00016	\$0.26644
lidocaine	5mL ampoule (100mg)	\$0.26	eMIT		\$0.02	Р	\$0.00162	\$0.26857
lidocaine + eninenhrine								
(adrenaline)	vial (10mg + 0.005mg)	\$0.13	BNF				\$0.00026	\$0.66587
lidocaine + epinephrine (adrenaline)	vial (20mg + 0.005mg)	\$0.12	BNF				\$0.00042	\$0.66611
linezolid	300mL infusion bag (600mg)	\$578.50	BNF	\$21.90	\$3.47	TN	\$0.41407	\$0.60624
lorazepam	1mL ampoule (2mg)				\$0.06	TN	\$0.00147	\$0.26835
lorazepam	1mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.46	BNF		\$0.23	Р	\$0.00294	\$0.27050
magnesium sulfate	2mL ampoule (1g)	\$0.42	eMIT	\$0.31	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00267	\$0.27011
magnesium sulfate	10mL ampoule (5g)	\$0.73	eMIT	\$1.57	\$0.09	TN	\$0.01335	\$0.28575
mannitol	1ml solution (100mg)	\$0.01	BNF		\$0.00	P	\$0,00069	\$0.66651
		7				-	7	+ • • • • • • • •
mannitol	1ml solution (100mg)	\$0.01	BNF		\$0.00	Р	\$0,00069	\$0.66651
mannitol mannitol	1mL solution (100mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02	BNF	\$0.01	\$0.00 \$0.01	Р Р	\$0.00069	\$0.66651 \$0.66751
mannitol mannitol mannitol	1mL solution (100mg) 1mL solution (200mg) 1mL solution (200mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02	BNF BNF BNF	\$0.01	\$0.00 \$0.01	P P P	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138	\$0.66651 \$0.66751
mannitol mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate	1mL solution (100mg) 1mL solution (200mg) 1mL solution (200mg) 1mL vial (150mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81	BNF BNF BNF BNF	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48	P P P	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751
mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna	1mL solution (100mg) 1mL solution (200mg) 1mL solution (200mg) 1mL vial (150mg) 4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43	BNF BNF BNF BNF	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37	P P P P TN	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.00138	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.66751
mannitol mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna mesna	1mL solution (100mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL vial (150mg)         4mL ampoule (400mg)         10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43 \$38 23	BNF BNF BNF BNF BNF	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37 \$0.92	P P P TN TN	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.26636 \$0.66591	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.65618 \$1.24116
mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna mesna methotrexate	1mL solution (100mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL vial (150mg)         4mL ampoule (400mg)         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         powder for injection (50mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43 \$38.23 \$1.83	BNF BNF BNF BNF BNF BNF eMIT	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37 \$0.92 \$0.28	P P P TN TN TN	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.26636 \$0.66591 \$4.04570	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.65618 \$1.24116 \$6.58881
mannitol mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna mesna mesna methotrexate methylprednisolo ne	1mL solution (100mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL vial (150mg)         4mL ampoule (400mg)         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         powder for injection (50mg)         1mL vial (40mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43 \$38.23 \$1.83 \$1.83	BNF BNF BNF BNF BNF eMIT	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77 \$2.22 \$1.38	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37 \$0.92 \$0.28 \$0.28	P P P TN TN TN P	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.26636 \$0.66591 \$4.04570 \$0.11323	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.65618 \$1.24116 \$6.58881 \$0.83128
mannitol mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna mesna methotrexate methylprednisolo ne methylprednisolo	1mL solution (100mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL vial (150mg)         4mL ampoule (400mg)         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         powder for injection (50mg)         1mL vial (40mg)         1mL vial (80mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43 \$38.23 \$1.83 \$1.83 \$1.79	BNF BNF BNF BNF BNF eMIT eMIT	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77 \$2.22 \$1.38	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37 \$0.92 \$0.28 \$0.23 \$0.23	P P TN TN TN P P	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.26636 \$0.66591 \$4.04570 \$0.11323 \$0.22647	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.65618 \$1.24116 \$6.58881 \$0.83128 \$0.99707
mannitol mannitol mannitol medroxyprogester one acetate mesna mesna methotrexate methylprednisolo ne methylprednisolo ne methylprednisolo ne	1mL solution (100mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL solution (200mg)         1mL vial (150mg)         4mL ampoule (400mg)         10mL ampoule (1000mg)         powder for injection (50mg)         1mL vial (40mg)         1mL vial (200mg)	\$0.01 \$0.02 \$0.02 \$7.81 \$17.43 \$38.23 \$1.83 \$1.79	BNF BNF BNF BNF eMIT eMIT	\$0.01 \$0.00 \$0.49 \$2.77 \$2.22 \$1.38	\$0.00 \$0.01 \$3.48 \$0.37 \$0.92 \$0.28 \$0.23 \$0.64	P P TN TN TN P P P	\$0.00069 \$0.00138 \$0.00138 \$0.26636 \$0.66591 \$4.04570 \$0.11323 \$0.22647 \$0.22647 \$0.56616	\$0.66651 \$0.66751 \$0.66751 \$0.65618 \$1.24116 \$6.58881 \$0.83128 \$0.99707 \$1.49442

metoclopramide	2mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.15	eMIT	\$0.13	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00086	\$0.26746
metronidazole	100mL vial (500mg)	\$0.47	eMIT		\$0.09	TN	\$0.00616	\$0.67452
metronidazole	100mL vial (500mg)	\$0.47	eMIT		\$0.09	TN	\$0.00616	\$0.67452
midazolam	1mL injection (1mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.07	\$0.03	TN	\$0.00526	\$0.67320
midazolam	1mL injection (1mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.07	\$0.03	TN	\$0.00526	\$0.67320
midazolam	1mL injection (5mg)	\$0.08	eMIT	\$0.20	\$0.10	Р	\$0.02628	\$0.70398
morphine	1mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.16	eMIT	\$0.14	\$0.11	TN		
morphine	1mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.16	eMIT	\$0.14	\$0.11	TN		
naloxone	1mL ampoule (400mcg)	\$0.43	eMIT	\$0.24	\$1.04	TN		
neostigmine	1mL ampoule (500mcg)			\$0.29	\$0.03	TN	\$0.01352	\$0.28599
neostigmine	1mL ampoule (2.5mg)	\$0.53	eMIT	\$0.17	\$0.34	Р	\$0.06758	\$0.36514
norethisterone enantate	1mL ampoule (200mg)	\$5.27	BNF	\$0.83	\$2.08	Р		
omeprazole	powder for injection (40mg)	\$1.23	eMIT		\$0.17	TN	\$0.00055	\$0.66630
ondansetron	2mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.34	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00445	\$0.27272
ondansetron	2mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.34	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00445	\$0.27272
oxaliplatin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$13.81	eMIT	\$34.36	\$3.26	TN	\$3.19285	\$5.34016
oxaliplatin	powder for injection (100mg)	\$20.15	eMIT	\$68.72	\$6.52	TN	\$6.38571	\$10.01481
oxaliplatin	10mL vial (50mg)	\$13.81	eMIT	\$34.36			\$3.19285	\$5.34016
oxaliplatin	20mL vial (100mg)	\$20.15	eMIT	\$68.72			\$6.38571	\$10.01481
oxaliplatin	40mL vial (200mg)	\$40.30	eMIT				\$12.77141	\$19.36413
oxytocin	1mL ampoule (25mcg)	\$0.91	eMIT	\$0.36	\$0.10	TN	\$0.00134	\$0.26816
paclitaxel	powder for injection (1mg)	\$0.09	eMIT	\$0.25	\$0.04	TN	\$0.04273	\$0.72807
pegylated interferon alfa (2a or 2b)	injection (180mcg)	\$161.72	BNF		\$48.75	TN		
pegylated interferon alfa (2a or 2b)	injection (20mcg)	¢129.24	DNE		¢41.00			
pegylated		\$156.24	DINF		\$41.09	IIN		
interferon alfa (2a								
or 2b)	injection (100mcg)	\$172.80	BNF		\$51.36	TN		
pentamidine	powder for injection (200mg)	\$27.54	BNF		<b>A</b> .			
phenobarbital	1mL injection (200mg)	\$7.32	eMIT		\$0.21	Р	\$0.01656	\$0.29045
phenytoin	5mL vial (250mg)	\$0.85	eMIT	\$1.54	\$0.10	TN	\$0.00475	\$0.67246
phytomenadione	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$2.46	BNF		\$0.38	Р		
benzylpenicillin	powder for injection (3g)				\$0.51	Р		
propofol	1mL injection (20mg)	\$0.05	eMIT		\$0.18	Р	\$0.00226	\$0.66880
propofol	1mL injection (10mg)	\$0.03	eMIT	\$0.02	\$0.04	TN	\$0.00113	\$0.66715
protamine sulfate	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$6.44	BNF	\$4.69	\$0.09	Р		
protamine sulfate	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$6.44	BNF	\$4.69	\$0.09	Р		
quinine	2mL ampoule (600mg)			\$1.27	\$0.12	Р	\$0.07719	\$0.37922
ranitidine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.48	eMIT	\$0.56	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00105	\$0.26774
ribavirin	10mL solution (800mg)						\$0.09776	\$0.80863
ribavirin	10mL solution (1g)						\$0.12220	\$0.84442
ribavirin	10mL solution (800mg)						\$0.09776	\$0.80863
ribavirin	10mL solution (1g)						\$0.12220	\$0.84442

#### BMJ Open

rituximab	50mL vial (500mg)	\$1,135.10	BNF	\$596.25			\$336.88802	\$493.90325
rituximab	10mL vial (100mg)	\$227.01	BNF	\$119.25			\$67.37760	\$99.31305
salbutamol	5mL ampoule (50mcg)						\$0.00001	\$0.26621
sodium calcium edetate	5mL ampoule (1000mg)						\$0.00334	\$0.27109
sodium nitrite	10mL ampoule (300mg)						\$0.00038	\$0.26675
sodium nitroprusside	powder for injection (50mg)				\$0.68	Р	\$0.00784	\$0.27768
sodium stibogluconate	30mL vial (3g)	\$25.91	BNF					
sodium thiosulfate	50mL ampoule (12500mg)						\$0.02574	\$0.30388
spectinomycin	powder for injection (2g)				\$3.00	Р		
streptokinase	powder for injection (15.6mg)	\$101.97	eMIT	\$257.52	\$3.83	Р	\$14.27110	\$21.55982
streptomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.34	\$0.06	Р		
streptomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.34	\$0.06	Р		
sulfamethoxazole + trimethoprim	5mL ampoule (400mg+80mg)	\$2.31	BNF				\$0.00659	\$0.27584
sulfamethoxazole + trimethoprim	10mL ampoule (800mg+160mg)	\$4.62	BNF				\$0.01317	\$0.28548
sulfamethoxazole + trimethoprim	5mL ampoule (400mg+80mg)	\$2.31	BNF				\$0.00659	\$0.27584
+ trimethoprim	10mL ampoule (800mg+160mg)	\$4.62	BNF				\$0.01317	\$0.28548
suramin sodium	powder for injection (1g)							
suxamethonium	2mL ampoule (100mg)	\$0.86	eMIT		\$0.13	Р	\$0.05053	\$0.34017
suxamethonium	0	R.			· · · ·		\$0.00000	\$0.66550
testosterone	1mL ampoule (200mg)				\$1.41	Р	\$0.02237	\$0.29896
tranexamic acid	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$3.90	BNF	\$9.74	\$0.57	Р	\$0.09442	\$0.40444
trastuzumab	powder for injection (150mg)	\$529.62	BNF		· · ·			
valproic acid (sodium valproate)	4ml ampoule (400mg)	\$5.09	eMIT		\$1.20	P	\$0.01051	\$0 28159
valproic acid		<i>Ş</i> 5.05					<i>90.01031</i>	<i>90.20133</i>
(sodium valproate)	10mL ampoule (1g)			0	\$3.00	Р	\$0.02628	\$0.30468
vancomycin	powder for injection (250mg)	\$0.72	eMIT	\$1.01	\$0.30	TN	\$0.22748	\$0.99855
vecuronium	powder for injection (10mg)	\$4.38	BNF		\$1.10	TN		
vecuronium	powder for injection (10mg)	\$4.38	BNF		\$1.10	TN		
verapamil	2mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.41	BNF				\$0.00039	\$0.26677
vinblastine	powder for injection (10mg)	\$19.27	eMIT	\$7.13	\$1.80	TN	\$2.57796	\$4.43989
vincristine	powder for injection (1mg)	\$4.08	eMIT	\$3.20	\$0.05	TN	\$0.53274	\$1.44549
vincristine	powder for injection (5mg)	\$23.43	eMIT	\$16.00	\$0.25	TN	\$2.66370	\$4.56543
vinorelbine	1mL vial (10mg)	\$6.23	eMIT	\$7.78	\$38.63	Р		
vinorelbine	5mL vial (50mg)	\$23.41	eMIT	\$38.65	\$160.26	Р		
zidovudine (ZDV or AZT)	20mL vial (200mg)	\$11.60	BNF		\$0.21	P	\$0.05046	\$0.73938

eMIT – price source was the electronic market information tool, available from <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/drugs-and-pharmaceutical-electronic-market-information-emit">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/drugs-and-pharmaceutical-electronic-market-information-emit</a>

BNF – price source was the British National Formulary, available from

https://bnf.nice.org.uk/

TN – price source was the database of the Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation, available from

http://www.tnmsc.com/tnmsc/new/user\_pages/drugtender.php?drugcat=drug2017 and http://www.tnmsc.com/tnmsc/new/user\_pages/drugtender.php?drugcat=sdg2017

P – price source was the MedGuide India database, available from http://www.medguideindia.com/

Prices in South Africa were collected from the South Africa Department of Health Master Procurement Catalogue. Available from

http://www.health.gov.za/index.php/component/phocadownload/category/196 (accessed May 12, 2017).

or opping the terms of terms of

### Exchange rates

Exchange rates used were 1 INR = 0.015 USD, 1 GBP = 1.3 USD, 1 ZAR = 0.075 USD.

for beer teries only

BMJ Open

# **BMJ Open**

## Estimation of cost-based prices for injectable medicines in the WHO Essential Medicines List

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2018-027780.R1
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	16-Jul-2019
Complete List of Authors:	Gotham, Dzintars; Independent Barber, Melissa; Harvard University, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health Hill, Andrew; University of Liverpool, UK
<b>Primary Subject Heading</b> :	Health economics
Secondary Subject Heading:	Public health, Pharmacology and therapeutics, Geriatric medicine, Health policy
Keywords:	PUBLIC HEALTH, pharmaceuticals, access to medicines, access to healthcare, global health, generic medicines



#### 

# Estimation of cost-based prices for injectable medicines in the WHO Essential Medicines List

Authors: Dzintars Gotham MBBS<sup>1</sup>, Melissa J Barber MPhil<sup>2</sup>, Andrew M Hill PhD<sup>3</sup>

- 1. Independent, London, UK
- 2. Department of Translational Medicine, University of Liverpool, UK
- 3. Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Harvard University, Boston, MA, USA

## Addresses of authors

Dr Dzintars Gotham MBBS BSc(Hons) Independent London, UK Email: dzintarsgotham@gmail.com Telephone: +44-7751-051-852

Melissa J Barber MPhil Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health Boston, Massachusetts, USA

Dr Andrew M Hill PhD Department of Translational Medicine, University of Liverpool, 70 Pembroke Place, Liverpool L69 3GF, United Kingdom

## Corresponding author:

Dr Dzintars Gotham MBBS BSc(Hons) Independent London, UK Email: dzintarsgotham@gmail.com Telephone: +44-7751-051-852

Word count: main text 3730, abstract 271

**Key words:** essential medicines; generics; cost of production; health economics; health systems

## ABSTRACT

#### objectives

Challenges remain in ensuring universal access to affordable essential medicines. We previously estimated the expected generic prices based on cost of production for medicines in solid oral formulations (i.e. capsules or tablets) on the World Health Organization Model List of Essential Medicines (EML). The objectives of this analysis were to estimate cost-based prices for injectable medicines on the EML and to compare these to lowest current prices in England, South Africa, and India.

#### design

Data on the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) exported from India were extracted from an online database of customs declarations (<u>www.infodriveindia.com</u>). A formula was designed to use API price data to estimate a cost-based price, by adding the costs of converting API to a finished pharmaceutical product, including the cost of formulation in vials or ampoules, transportation, and an average profit margin.

#### results

For injectable formulations on the WHO EML, medicines had prices above the estimated cost-based price in 77% of comparisons in England (median ratio 2.54), and 62% in South Africa (median ratio 1.48), while 85% of medicines in India were below estimated cost-based price (median ratio 0.30). 19% of injectable medicines in England, 9% in South Africa, and 5% in India had prices more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price. Medicines that appeared in the top 20 by ratio of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price for more than one country included numerous oncology medicines – irinotecan, leuprorelin, ifosfamide, daunorubicin, filgrastim, and mesna – as well as valproic acid and ciclosporin.

#### conclusions

Estimating manufacturing costs can identify cases in which profit margins for medicines may be set significantly higher than average.

## Strengths and limitations of this study

- The cost assumptions used to estimate cost-based prices were conservative (strength) •
- The key input of active pharmaceutical ingredient price was based on average prices of actual, • completed sales of active pharmaceutical ingredient (strength)
- <text><text> Apart from the individual active pharmaceutical ingredient price data, the costing formula was • adjusted only for formulation as vial or ampoule, but not for other characteristics such as volume (limitation)
- We did not estimate demand volumes and did not adjust price estimates based on demand volume (limitation)

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml

## INTRODUCTION

There are persistent challenges in ensuring access to affordable essential medicines in low-and middle-income countries (LMICs).[1] The World Health Organization's Model List of Essential Medicines (EML) comprises medicines that meet the priority health needs of global populations and should be available at all times, at affordable prices.[2] A previous analysis estimated the cost of production for solid oral formulations in the EML, finding sizeable differences between cost of manufacture and current prices in England, South Africa, and India.[3]

A number of differences between solid oral formulations and injectable formulations could be expected to affect manufacturing costs, such as significantly higher requirements for manufacturing sites to maintain product sterility for intravenous and intramuscular formulations. Other factors may influence market dynamics for individual products – for example, the majority of injectable products are likely, in general, to be used in healthcare institutions and for more severe illness than most other formulations.

While many cases of difficulties in accessing treatment are associated with patent-protected medicines, in some cases, generic medicines may also be priced at very high levels, such as in the recent cases involving manufacturers Pfizer, Flynn, and Aspen in England. In these cases, manufacturers dramatically increased prices of generic medicines, arguably taking advantage of a dominant position they held in the respective markets.[4,5]

We aimed to develop an algorithm for estimating the cost of manufacture for injectable medicines on the WHO EML, to use this algorithm to estimate prices that would be expected assuming an average profit margin, and to compare these estimated cost-based prices to current prices in England, South Africa, and India. Estimation of cost-based generic prices can contribute to procurement, among other things, by informing negotiations, tenders, price control mechanisms, and competition policy.

#### METHODS

In our earlier analysis of solid oral formulations (SOF), we developed a costing formula that accounted for capital expenses, the cost of excipients, and the cost of formulation into tablets.[3] We have also previously developed a costing formula for biosimilars of insulin formulated in vials.[6]

Here, we developed a similar formula for injectable medicines, and submitted data on the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) to the formula to generate cost-based estimated generic prices. We then compared these estimated prices to current market prices in three countries – England, South Africa, and India. We assume manufacturing in India both because of the fact that India is a major manufacturer of generics globally, and due to the greater availability of data on the bulk prices of active pharmaceutical ingredient (see below) in India compared to other countries.

#### medicines included in the analysis

We analysed medicines listed in the 2015 WHO EML as injectable formulations.[7] We use the term 'item' to describe an individual medicine-formulation-dosage listing. Besides SOF, we further excluded certain categories of medicines, due both to limitations in reliably identifying active pharmaceutical ingredient data and/or were we considered that the market would be a special case (e.g. blood products). These categories included blood products, diagnostic agents, antivenom, vaccines, simple water-based solutions (e.g. 0.9% sodium chloride), and vitamins and minerals, as well as infusion bag formulations and pre-filled syringe formulations. A full list of included and excluded medicines/formulations is available in the appendix.

#### cost of active pharmaceutical ingredient

Data on active pharmaceutical ingredient exported from India were retrieved from an online database of customs declarations (<u>www.infodriveindia.com</u>), a source that we have used in numerous previous analyses of manufacturing costs.[3,6,8–12] Active pharmaceutical ingredient shipments in the date range 1 July 2014 to 1 July 2016 where included, extending the range 2 years into the past if <100 records were returned, and repeating this until at least 100 records were available, or until the timeframe spanned 6 years.

#### **BMJ** Open

API data were manually cleaned to remove entries that did not represent genuine active pharmaceutical ingredient (e.g. shipments of finished pharmaceutical product; see appendix for details), after which a linear regression model, weighted by size in kilograms of individual shipments, was applied to estimate an average active pharmaceutical ingredient price per kilogram at the data cut-off date (November 2016)(see appendix for an example).

For some medicines, dosage is expressed as the dose of the active molecule, while the active pharmaceutical ingredient is sold as a salt form (e.g. one vial of '80mg methylprednisolone' contains 106mg of methylprednisolone sodium succinate). We adjusted the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredient needed per unit accordingly.

Statistical analyses of active pharmaceutical ingredient export data were done in Stata/IC V.14.0 for Mac.

#### cost of manufacture of injectables

We have previously estimated cost-based prices that could be achieved in a competitive market for various solid oral formulation medicines, [3,8–12] as well as for insulins. [6] We divide the manufacturing cost estimation into four parts: the cost of active pharmaceutical ingredient, the cost of converting the active pharmaceutical ingredient into a finished pharmaceutical product , and operating expenditures including a profit margin. The cost estimation formula is given in Figure 1 and explained further below.

The cost of active pharmaceutical ingredient per dose was calculated as described earlier.

The cost of converting active pharmaceutical ingredient into an finished pharmaceutical product includes the cost of constructing and operating manufacture sites, raw materials such as glass vials, and process wastage (i.e. the proportion of the active pharmaceutical ingredient that is wasted in the process of formulating it into an finished pharmaceutical product). In general, we aimed to use conservative (high) assumptions in estimating the cost of production. In other words, in designing our costing model, we erred on the side of overestimating the cost of production, in preference to underestimating it. This has the effect of minimising the observed difference in price between current prices and estimated cost-based generic prices, where the former is greater than the latter.

**BMJ** Open

Injectable items in the EML divide broadly into those for which the designated formulation is an ampoule, and those for which the designated formulation is a vial. In some cases, the EML does not indicate whether formulation is as a vial or ampoule – for these items we assumed one or the other based on the more prevalent form found across England, South Africa, and India. Ampoules are sealed glass containers, while vials generally have a removable cap. Assumptions on whether the medicine is formulated as a vial or ampoule were made for 23% of items.

To design conservative assumptions for ampoule/vial formulation costs, we reviewed the lowestpriced products formulated as vials or ampoules in the eMIT database (see next section). These lowest prices are around US\$0.20 for ampoules and US\$0.50 for vials (appendix). We used these values as assumed formulation costs. These are, of course, conservative assumptions, as for those products active pharmaceutical ingredient costs and operating margins (and transportation costs, taxes, etc.) would have to be zero for the price to represent formulation alone. This is reflected in a recent analysis of the cost of manufacture of vaccines, which estimated the cost of sterile formulation as an ampoule to be around \$0.12/unit, and as a vial to be around US\$0.35/unit, with these values including raw materials (i.e. the vial or ampoule itself), labour, facility and equipment costs, and overheads.[13] It is worth noting that Indian government standards on pharmaceutical manufacturing costs, previously used to inform price ceilings, set allowable costs at a substantially lower level: ampoule costs at \$0.03-0.13 and vial costs at \$0.05-0.21 (ranges depending on size and type)(appendix).

We assumed that 10% more active pharmaceutical ingredient is needed than the stated dosage, to account for loss of active pharmaceutical ingredient in the vial/ampoule filling process and vial/ampoule overfill.

We assumed a net profit margin of 10% (the average operating margin in the US was 12% in 2013).[14]

Though these cost components are highly variable between countries, an analysis by IMS Health found that costs associated with import (transport, tariffs, other charges) were around 5% in most of the countries surveyed (e.g. Brazil, India, Russia)..[15] Based on this, we added a 10% margin for transportation costs as a conservative assumption..

prices in England, South Africa, and India

Prices were collected in December 2016. Exchange rates used are given in the appendix.

For England, prices were collected from the British National Formulary (BNF) and the electronic market information tool (eMit). The BNF lists 'indicative prices' and is a reference used by clinicians and pharmacists. eMit provides actual government-purchase prices. The lowest price available across the two sources was used. For South Africa, prices were collected from a database of prices in the public healthcare system as well as a database of prices in the private market, both published by the Department of Health. The lowest price available across the two sources was used. For India, prices reported in public tenders of the state of Tamil Nadu were used. Where prices were not available in this source, we used the price reported in an online database of Indian Maximum Retail Prices. Details on price sources are available in the appendix. For South Africa and India, the medicine prices in the sources were assumed to include 15% and 5% value-added tax (VAT), respectively, and price data was adjusted accordingly to be net of VAT. For England, the medicine prices in the sources do not include VAT.

For many medicines in the EML, multiple dosages are listed, and may be interchangeable by using a larger number of smaller-dose items in the place of a larger item, or vice-versa. Individual countries may procure larger some volumes of one dosage, but not the other, potentially leading to one dosage having a far higher price than would be expected, due to lower demand volume. To avoid misleading findings as a result of this, for each formulation of each medicine, comparisons between countries and between market prices and cost-based price estimates (for injectables) or active pharmaceutical ingredient cost (for other formulations) were made for the dosage that gave the lowest difference. As an example, for an injection that is listed in 500mg and 1000mg forms, England-South Africa price ratio was recorded as the lower between the two dosage forms. Within the context of our analysis this is a conservative approach (yielding smaller differences in comparisons).

#### patient and public involvement

The conduct of this study did not involve patients or the public. This study is based on exclusively on publicly available export, price, and trade data. Ethical board review was therefore not needed.

#### RESULTS

Of 414 unique medicines (including combinations) on the 2015 EML, 145 fit the inclusion criteria of this analysis. Active pharmaceutical ingredient data were available for 96 of these 145 medicines (66%)(an example of these data for a single medicine is illustrated in Appendix Figure A1).

#### estimated cost-based prices

Estimated cost-based prices ranged from \$0.24 (salbutamol 50mcg) to \$449 (rituximab 500mg).

The comparison of lowest current prices in England, South Africa, and India to estimated cost-based prices for injectable items is shown in Table 1 and Figure 2. The majority of injectable items had prices significantly above the estimated cost-based prices in England and South Africa, however, in India, 88% of injectable items had prices below the estimated cost-based price.

The items with the highest ratios of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price are shown for England in Table 2, for South Africa in Table 3, and for India in Table 4.

Therapeutic categories with notably higher ratios of lowest current price to estimated cost-based price included cardiovascular medicines, medicines for mental and behavioural disorders, hormones, other endocrine medicines and contraceptives, anticonvulsants/antiepileptics, antineoplastics and immunosuppressives, and oxytocics (appendix).

#### International price comparisons

International comparisons of lowest current prices for injectable essential medicines are shown in Figure 3. Prices were higher in England than in South Africa in 60% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 1.44; higher in England than in India in 91% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 7.08; and higher in South Africa than in India in 84% of comparisons, with a median ratio of 3.69 (Figure 3).

## DISCUSSION

For injectable formulations on the WHO EML, 77% of medicines had prices above the estimated cost-based price in England, and 62% has prices above the estimated cost-based price in South Africa, while 85% of medicines in India were below estimated cost-based price. 19% of injectable medicines in England, 9% in South Africa, and 5% in India had prices more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price (Table 1, Figure 2).

A few medicines were notable for appearing in the top-20 lists by ratio of current price to estimated cost-based price in more than one country (Tables 2–4): numerous oncology medicines – irinotecan, ifosfamide, daunorubicin, filgrastim, and mesna – as well as the certain antimicrobials (ampicillin, acyclovir, quinine), valproic acid (an anti-epileptic) and ciclosporin (an immunosuppressant).

A wide range of market factors may contribute to the greater than average difference in manufacture costs and price. The 'top 20' injectable medicines are all mostly used in the in-patient hospital setting, are used in specialist treatments, are second/third-line treatments, and/or are used for short durations. These characteristics would all tend to reduce demand volumes, reduce economies of scale (both in manufacture and distribution), and reduce the buyer's negotiating power, and may thus explain the high prices relative to manufacture costs.

Differences between countries in the ratios of lowest current price to estimated cost-based generic price, similarly, may be explained by a wide range of factors. A detailed comparison of pharmaceutical market characteristics of the three countries is beyond the scope of the study. India is a substantially larger market than England and South Africa, and this difference in volume of demand may play a role. Differences in regulatory requirements are also likely to play a significant role. India has a large local generic manufacturing sector. Lastly, there may be a comparatively greater emphasis on these 'essential' products in South Africa and India compared to England, as there is in general a lesser range of products available for use, for most patients in these countries. Lastly, some of the higher-cost drugs for which prices were identified for England were not found in the Indian databases, which leads to a degree of 'selection bias', wherein for the India comparison, a higher proportion of available datapoints are for lower-cost drugs than for the UK.

Most of all of the medicines compared in this analysis are no longer under patent protection in England, South Africa, or India.[16] Varying levels of competition across products and countries may

#### **BMJ** Open

 also influence prices. This analysis does not account for differing volumes related to market size and related efficiencies. In many or most cases, we would not expect low competition to be a driving factor behind high prices, given the robust generics markets in England, South Africa, and India, as well as the 'essential' nature of included medicines. However, in some cases, high prices for generic medicines may be explained by anti-competitive practices, or price hikes where a single supplier controls the market. This analysis is unable to detect the presence of anticompetitive strategies which may raise prices such as price fixing or upstream consolidation or collusion. The extent of these practices is unknown, but, as this year's lawsuit brought by 44 state Attorney Generals in the US against 20 generics manufacturers demonstrates, anticompetitive practices may be prevalent in certain pharmaceutical markets.[17]

Given the range of medicines included, it is difficult to make generalised comments. If cost of manufacture analysis were employed by governments to evaluate prices, large differences between current prices and estimated cost-based prices could trigger closer examination on a case-by-case basis. For example, linezolid is recently off-patent, and is used as a 'last-resort' antibiotic,[18] limiting demand volume. Some EML medicines, such as filgrastim , which appears in the 'top 20' in all three countries , are biologics, meaning different regulations and higher regulatory expenses may apply. In such cases, large profit margins may be more acceptable. In other cases, such as ibuprofen (5mg in 1mL injection) and ampicillin (1000mg powder for injection) in England may reflect insufficient competition, inefficient procurement, or a less commonly used dosage form (Table 2). Some of these 'top 20' medicines may represent a substantial burden on healthcare expenditures – for example, irinotecan represented expenditures of £22 million (about US\$29 million) by the public healthcare system in England in 2016/2017.[19]

Current lowest prices in India were on average lower than our estimated cost-based prices (lowest current prices in India were median 27% of the estimated cost-based price; Table 1 and Figure 2). This may reflect conservative assumptions made for the cost of ampoules and vials; a substantial number of items cost less than our assumed raw material cost for the ampoule/vial (primary packaging) alone, which we based on prices in high-income countries (see Figure A2 in the Appendix). It may also reflect the general conservative (overestimating) effect of using data on exported active pharmaceutical ingredient; active pharmaceutical ingredient that is manufactured in-house or procured domestically may have lower prices. The use of an average active pharmaceutical ingredient price (rather than, for example, lowest observed or first-quartile) means, in most cases, that a number of active pharmaceutical ingredient sales occurred at lower price points. Lastly, Indian prices were collected from two databases – one representing the private

#### **BMJ** Open

> market and one representing Tamil Nadu state tenders (the lower price of the two was recorded). State tender prices are likely lower than private market prices, but the majority of health expenditures in India are out-of-pocket, and of these the majority are on medicines.[20] In addition, there are wide variations in wealth and access to health insurance between Indian states. The methodological approach of seeking the lowest available price in each country means that the price faced by patients when paying out-of-pocket in the private market may be considerably higher.

> In our earlier analysis of solid oral form medicines in the EML, we found that 77% comparable prices in England, 67% comparable prices in South Africa and 40% comparable prices in India were above the estimated cost-based price. Median ratios for lowest current price to estimated cost-base price were 2.7x in England, 1.4x in South Africa, and 0.6x in India.[3] These ratios are notably similar to the comparisons in this analysis between lowest current prices and estimated cost-based prices for injectables (2.5x in England, 1.5x in South Africa, 0.3x in India; Table 1).

Analysis of the cost of production of medicines can be used in government price negotiations, price control mechanisms, or in competition law contexts. In India, until 2013, a formula based on the cost of manufacture was used to set ceiling prices on key medicines.[21,22] A similar approach is or has been used in Bangladesh, Pakistan, and China.[22] In South African tenders, manufacturers are required to submit breakdowns of their price by various cost components including active pharmaceutical ingredient cost and profit margin.[23] The WHO Guideline on Pharmaceutical Pricing Policies notes that the use of cost-plus formulae may be challenging to implement due to challenges on obtaining accurate data on material prices on manufacturing costs, and due to the potential for manipulation of data by manufacturers to exaggerate costs and justify higher prices.[22] Indeed, in this analysis, the Indian government requirement for the publication of customs data on the value of exported active pharmaceutical ingredient has been revoked since we collected data, meaning that at present the authors are not aware of an alternative, affordable source of data for active pharmaceutical ingredient costs.[24] Nevertheless, cost of manufacture analysis should be explored further as a component of pricing policies.

Pricing policies linked to manufacturer costs would also need to be use alongside policies to prevent shortages and stock-outs.[25] Indeed, some of the therapeutic groups identified in this analysis as in many cases high differences between market prices and estimated cost-based prices, such as chemotherapy medicines and antibiotics, may also be groups that are vulnerable to shortages.[26,27]

#### **BMJ** Open

This study, which used broad and conservative assumptions, can be seen as an initial exploration of the feasibility of estimating cost-based generic prices for injectables. As there is considerable variation among items listed in the EML, a tailored approach could be to improve the precision and confidence of the estimate for specific products, for example, those identified here as having high price-to-cost ratios.

#### limitations

The main limitation of our analysis is that our estimates do not account for differences of costs across individual manufacturing plants due to heterogeneity in, for example, location, machinery used, and capacity, as well as different distribution costs (including tariffs) depending on the country of manufacture and the importing country, and changes in conversion cost depending on the volume of the unit. As argued above, this limitation would not preclude the use of a methodology such as this one to identify medicines that may have high profit margins, for closer *ad hoc* analysis. Although prices in India were adjusted to be net of VAT, other state-level taxes may apply and these were not adjusted for.

In the previous analysis concerning solid oral formulations on the WHO EML, in which many elements of the methodology were identical (e.g. cost analysis for active pharmaceutical ingredient, tax and profit assumptions), the estimated cost-based generic prices were compared to the lowest available prices for key HIV, TB, and malaria treatments. Prices in these disease areas were used, as there are well-developed international procurement mechanisms for quality-assured generic products, and procurement prices are transparently reported. In this validation exercise, predictive accuracy between estimated cost-based generic price and actual global market prices was high.[28] However, medicines for HIV, TB, and malaria are predominantly solid oral formulations. We have thus not attempted to conduct a similar validation exercise for the estimated cost-based prices presented in this study, for lack of a dataset to be used for comparison. As noted, however, we consider the individual assumptions made for cost components to be conservative (high).

As data collection for this analysis finished shortly before the publication in April 2017 of the 2017 EML. The EML is published biennially; we used the most recent iteration at the time of data analysis, the 2015 EML.

#### conclusion

Most injectable medicines on the EML can be manufactured at very low cost. In England, about one in five injectable essential medicines was priced at more than 10 times the estimated cost-based price. In South Africa, this proportion was about one in ten, and in India, about one in twenty. Estimation of the cost of manufacture could be used in government pharmaceutical pricing mechanisms, for example, by identifying products for which profit margins may be notably above average.

Li Lighting produc.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

None.

### FUNDING

No specific funding was received for this analysis.

## **AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS**

DG, MJB, and AMH designed the study, interpreted the data, and critically reviewed the manuscript. MJB and DG collected and analysed the data.

## **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Dzintars Gotham reports personal fees for unrelated work from the Medicines Patent Pool, the Wellcome Trust, Treatment Action Group, and the World Health Organization. Melissa J Barber and Andrew M Hill report no conflicts of interest.

#### DATA SHARING STATEMENT

Some unpublished data on active pharmaceutical ingredient costs could be shared upon request. An appendix with details on methodology is available as a supplementary file.

## REFERENCES

- 1 Wirtz VJ, Hogerzeil HV, Gray AL, *et al.* Essential medicines for universal health coverage. *The Lancet* 2017;**389**:403–76. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(16)31599-9
- 2 World Health Organization. *Revised procedure for updating WHO's Model List of Essential Drugs*. 2001. http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s22165en/s22165en.pdf (accessed 8 Mar 2018).
- 3 Hill A, Barber MJ, Gotham D. Estimated costs of production and potential prices for the WHO Essential Medicines List. *BMJ Glob Health* 2018;**0**:e000571. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2017-000571
- 4 Billy Kenber. Drug firm is facing fine of £220m for hiking prices. The Times. 2017.https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/drug-firm-faces-fine-of-220m-for-hiking-pricesgf0ssclqk (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 5 Competition and Markets Authority. CMA fines Pfizer and Flynn £90 million for drug price hike to NHS. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/cma-fines-pfizer-and-flynn-90-million-for-drug-price-hike-to-nhs (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 6 Gotham D, Barber MJ, Hill A. Production costs and potential prices for biosimilars of human insulin and insulin analogues. *BMJ Glob Health* 2018;**3**:e000850. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2018-
- 7 World Health Organization. 19th WHO Model List of Essential Medicines. 2015. http://www.who.int/medicines/publications/essentialmedicines/EML2015\_8-May-15.pdf?ua=1 (accessed 28 Jan 2016).
- 8 Hill A, Gotham D, Cooke et al. G. Analysis of minimum target prices for production of entecavir to treat hepatitis B in high- and low-income countries. *J Virus Erad* 2015;1:103–10.
- 9 Hill A, Gotham D, Fortunak J, *et al.* Target prices for mass production of tyrosine kinase inhibitors for global cancer treatment. *BMJ Open* 2016;**6**:e009586. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2015-009586
- 10 Hill A, Simmons B, Gotham D, *et al.* Rapid reductions in prices for generic sofosbuvir and daclatasvir to treat hepatitis C. *J Virus Erad* 2016;**2**:28–31.
- 11 Hill A, Redd C, Gotham D, *et al.* Estimated generic prices of cancer medicines deemed costineffective in England: a cost estimation analysis. *BMJ Open* 2017;**7**:e011965. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2016-011965
- 12 Gotham D, Fortunak J, Pozniak A, *et al.* Estimated generic prices for novel treatments for drugresistant tuberculosis. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2017;:dkw522. doi:10.1093/jac/dkw522
- 13 Sedita J, Perrella S, Morio M, et al. Cost of goods sold and total cost of delivery for oral and parenteral vaccine packaging formats. *Vaccine* 2018;**36**:1700–9. doi:10.1016/j.vaccine.2018.01.011
- 14 Karamehic J, Ridic O, Ridic G, *et al.* Financial aspects and the future of the pharmaceutical industry in the United States of america. *Mater Socio-Medica* 2013;**25**:286–90. doi:10.5455/msm.2013.25.286-290

4	
5	
6	
7	
, 8	
0	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
25	
20	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33	
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	
42	
43	
44	
77 15	
45	
40	
47	
48	
49	
50	
51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
56	
57	
58	
59	
60	

- 15 IMS Institute for Healthcare Informatics. Understanding the pharmaceutical value chain. 2014. https://www.ifpma.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/IIHI\_Report\_Pharma\_Value.pdf
- 16 Medicines Patent Pool. MedsPaL. http://www.medspal.org/ (accessed 28 Feb 2018).

17 Murphy, Heather. "Teva and other generic drugmakers inflated prices up to 1000%, State Prosecutors say." The New York Times. 11 May 2019. Available from: https://www.nytimes.com/2019/05/11/health/teva-price-fixing-lawsuit.html

- 18 MSF Access campaign. *DR-TB drugs under the microscope: Sources and prices for drug-resistant tuberculosis medicines*. 2016. http://www.msfaccess.org/sites/default/files/TB\_report\_DR-TB\_DRUGS\_UTM\_4th\_edition\_2016.pdf (accessed 22 Mar 2016).
- 19 NHS Digital. Prescribing Costs in Hospitals and the Community, England 2016/17: NICE Data. https://files.digital.nhs.uk/publication/n/0/hosp-pres-eng-201617-nicedata.csv (accessed 28 Oct 2018).
- 20 Garg CC, Karan AK. Reducing out-of-pocket expenditures to reduce poverty: A disaggregated analysis at rural-urban and state level in India. *Health Policy Plan* 2009;**24**:116–128. doi:10.1093/heapol/czn046
- 21 Kotwani A, Levison L. Price components and access to medicines in Delhi, India. 2007.http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s19208en/s19208en.pdf
- 22 World Health Organization. WHO guidelines on country pharmaceutical pricing policies. 2015. http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s21016en/s21016en.pdf
- 23 Republic of South Africa National Department of Health. Special Requirements and Conditions of Contract. HP09–2016SD/01. The supply and delivery of solid dosage forms to the Department of Health for the period up to 31 July 2018. 2017. http://www.health.gov.za/tender/docs/contructs/HP092016SD01ContractCircular.pdf (accessed 11 Jul 2017).
- 24 Central Board of Excise and Customs. Notification No. 140/2016. https://www.seair.co.in/custom-notifications/notifications-issued-in-the-year-2016-notificationno-1402016-dated-25th-nov-2016-268128.aspx (accessed 4 Apr 2017).
- 25 World Health Organization. Medicines shortages: Global approaches to addressing shortages of essential medicines in health systems. *WHO Drug Inf* 2016;**30**.
- 26 Gray A, Manasse H. Shortages of medicines: a complex global challenge. *Bull World Health Organ* 2012;**90**:158–158. doi:10.2471/BLT.11.101303
- 27 Iyengar S, Hedman L, Forte G, *et al.* Medicine shortages: a commentary on causes and mitigation strategies. *BMC Med* 2016;**14**. doi:10.1186/s12916-016-0674-7

Hill A, Barber M, Gotham D, Fortunak J, Pozniak A. Generic treatments for HIV, HBV, HCV, TB could be mass produced for <\$90 per patient. In: 9th IAS Conference on HIV Science. Paris, 2017. http://programme.ias2017.org/Abstract/Abstract/1978.

## **TABLES AND FIGURES**

to peet teries only

## Table 1. Comparison of estimated prices and lowest current prices in England, South

## Africa, and India.

	England	South Africa	India
Injectables			
>10x estimated price	15 (19%)	5 (9%)	4 (5%)
0-10x estimated price	47 (58%)	31 (53%)	8 (10%)
Below estimated price	19 (23%)	22 (38%)	68 (85%)
Median ratio of current	2.54x	1.48x	0.30x
price to estimated price			

Note: multiple dosage levels of one formulation of one medicine (e.g. ifosfamide powder for injection in 1g and 2g forms) are counted as one instance in these overview statistics.

3
Δ
-
5
6
/
8
9
10
11
12
13
17
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
20
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
20
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
Δ7
10
40
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
55
50
5/
58
59

1 2

Medicine	Unit	Lowest current price (USD)	Estimated cost-based price (USD)	Ratio
irinotecan	5mL vial (100mg)	\$143.81	\$1.17	122.7
filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$68.52	\$0.61	112.6
ibuprofen	1mL injection (5mg)	\$46.80	\$0.61	77.3
daunorubicin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$211.25	\$2.88	73.4
azathioprine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$39.99	\$0.66	60.5
ifosfamide	powder for injection (2g)	\$233.84	\$4.10	57.1
ifosfamide	powder for injection (1g)	\$118.72	\$2.35	50.5
ifosfamide	powder for injection (500mg)	\$59.35	\$1.48	40.2
mesna	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$38.23	\$1.13	33.9
atropine	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$8.25	\$0.24	33.7
ampicillin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$20.36	\$0.64	31.6
mesna	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$17.43	\$0.60	29.2
phenobarbital	1mL injection (200mg)	\$7.32	\$0.26	27.7
epinephrine	10mL ampoule (1mg)	\$6.97	\$0.27	26.1
valproic acid	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$5.09	\$0.26	19.9
zidovudine	20mL vial (200mg)	\$11.60	\$0.67	17.3
ampicillin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$10.18	\$0.62	16.3
irinotecan	25mL vial (500mg)	\$46.83	\$3.44	13.6
ketamine	10mL vial (500mg)	\$9.10	\$0.79	11.4
hydralazine	powder for injection (20mg)	\$2.88	\$0.25	11.4

## Table 2. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared toestimated cost-based price, in England.

## Table 3. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared to estimated cost-based price, in South Africa.

Medicine	Unit	Lowest current price (USD)	Estimated cost-based price (USD)	Ratio
filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$32.38	\$0.61	46.3
tranexamic acid	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$8.47	\$0.37	23.0
ifosfamide	powder for injection (1g)	\$28.71	\$2.35	12.2
ifosfamide	powder for injection (2g)	\$48.71	\$4.10	11.9
ifosfamide	powder for injection (500mg)	\$17.22	\$1.48	11.7
streptokinase	powder for injection (15.6mg)	\$223.93	\$19.60	11.4
amiodarone	ampoule (150mg/3mL)	\$2.87	\$0.27	10.7
digoxin	2mL ampoule (500mcg)	\$2.44	\$0.25	9.9
fluphenazine	1mL ampoule (25mg)	\$2.30	\$0.32	7.1
oxaliplatin	powder for injection (100mg)	\$59.76	\$9.10	6.6
oxaliplatin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$29.88	\$4.85	6.2
magnesium sulfate	10mL ampoule (5g)	\$1.36	\$0.26	5.2
ciclosporin	1mL ampoule (50mg)	\$1.72	\$0.33	5.2
docetaxel	injection (20mg)	\$21.70	\$4.21	5.1

docetaxel	injection (40mg)	\$34.29	\$7.82	4.4
mesna	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$2.40	\$0.60	4.0
daunorubicin	powder for injeciton (50mg)	\$10.03	\$2.88	3.5
vincristine	powder for injection (5mg)	\$13.92	\$4.15	3.4
aciclovir	powder for injection (250mg)	\$2.10	\$0.63	3.3
quinine	2mL ampoule (600mg)	\$1.10	\$0.34	3.2

to peer teriew only

2 1
4 5
5
7
/ Q
0
9 10
10
11
12
13
14
15
10
1/
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58

1 2

Table 4. Injectable essential medicines with the highest price compared to estimated cost-based
price , in India.

Medicine	Unit	Lowest current	Estimated	Ratio
		price (USD)	cost-based	
			price (USD)	
irinotecan	25mL vial (500mg)	\$107.14	\$3.44	31.1
filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$15.71	\$0.61	25.8
irinotecan	5mL vial (100mg)	\$21.43	\$1.17	18.3
irinotecan	2mL vial (40mg)	\$10.71	\$0.83	12.9
bendamustine	2mL injection (180mg)	\$185.14	\$15.05	12.3
bendamustine	0.5mL injection (45mg)	\$46.29	\$4.22	11.0
valproic acid (sodium valproate)	10mL ampoule (1g)	\$2.86	\$0.28	10.3
ciclosporin	1mL ampoule (50mg)	\$1.71	\$0.33	5.2
testosterone	1mL ampoule (200mg)	\$1.34	\$0.27	4.9
valproic acid (sodium valproate)	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$1.14	\$0.26	4.5
insulin injection (soluble) 🥂 🦯	10mL injection (34.7mg)	\$5.80	\$2.15	2.7
sodium nitroprusside	powder for injection (50mg)	\$0.64	\$0.25	2.5

All other items for which ratios could be calculated had ratios below 2.0.

Figure 1. Formula for estimating cost-based prices for injectable formulations. Figure 2. Estimated generic prices and current prices for injectables in England, South Africa, and India.

Figure 3. Comparison of lowest current prices of injectable essential medicines between England, South Africa, and India.





Estimated generic price

**South Africa** 



India



For peer review only - http://stimated.geniericoptiedelines.xhtml

**UK versus South Africa** 





## Appendix

totoeetterien ont

#### Criteria used for cleaning export data.

Reason for censoring	Example of product description that would trigger censoring	
Incorrect substance identified	"DIAMORPHINE" (in a search for "morphine")	
Item is part of a mix of products	"ABACAVIR, LOPINAVIR, LAMIVUDINE API"	
Quantity of shipment < 1.0 kg, with exceptions made for very low-dose medicines	Value listed in "quantity" variable greater than 1.0kg	
Finished Pharmaceutical Product (FPP), for example tablets	"ABACAVIR SULFATE TABLETS 600MG"	
Impurity	"ABACAVIR SULPHATE IMPURITY"	
Unclear quantity of API	"ABACAVIR GRANULES 10%" (In this example, the percentage descriptor could refer to a variety of parameters, for example, moisture content. As this is not specified, the true amount of API is unknown.)	
Free sample or 'no commercial value'	"ABACAVIR SULPHATE FREE SAMPLE" "ABACAVIR SULPHATE N.C.V."	
For veterinary use	"IVERMECTIN VETERINARY"	
Reference/working standard	"ABACAVIR WORKING STANDARD"	

This table is reproduced from an earlier publication as this element of the methodology was identical:

Hill A, Barber MJ, Gotham D. Estimated costs of production and potential prices for the WHO Essential Medicines List. *BMJ Global Health* 2018; e000571.

## Included and excluded formulation types, by terms used in WHO Model List of Essential Medicines.

#### Included:

Concentrate for injection, depot injection, infusion, injectable solution, injection, injection for intravenous administration, injection for spinal anaesthesia, injection in oil, injection: ampoule or pre-filled syringe, injections, oily injection, oily solution, oily suspension for injection, parenteral formulation, powder for injection, solution for injection, solution for intramuscular injection, solution for IV infusion, vial.

#### Excluded:

Ampoule (for buccal administration when solution for oromucosal administration is not available), aqueous solution\*, bag for infusion, capsule, cream, cream (as mupirocin calcium), cream or lotion, cream or ointment, dental cartridge, detergent-based suspension, eye ointment, gel or rectal solution, granules, granules (slow-release; to mix with water), immediate release capsule, inhalation (aerosol), lotion, lozenge, metered dose inhaler (aerosol), nasal spray, ointment, oral liquid, oral powder, pessary, powder for oral administration, powder for oral liquid, pre-filled syringe, rectal dosage form, rectal solution, respirator solution for use in nebulizers, retention enema, saturated solution, solid oral dosage form, solid oral dosage form (controlled-release tablets), solid oral form, solution, solution, solution (eye drops), solution for oromucosal administration, suppository, tablet, tablet (chewable), tablet (crushable), tablet (dispersible, scored), tablet (dispersible), tablet (scored), tablet (scored), tablet (slow release), tablet (sublingual), topical, topical forms, transdermal patches, vaginal cream, vaginal tablet.

\*this represents potassium permanganate for topical use in dermatology.

 BMJ Open



Figure A1. Example of API data: Price of linezolid API exported from India from July 1, 2014 to July 1, 2016.

Bubble colours correspond to the region of the destination country for individual shipments. Bubble sizes correspond to the size of individual shipments (size key shown in lower-left, in kilograms). The linear regression model is shown as a dashed red line; though is appears horizontal is has a slight upwards slope. The values estimated by the linear regression model were \$683/kg on July 1, 2014, and \$690/kg on July 1, 2016.

## Costs prescribed in India's Drug Price Control Order (2012).

Item	Cost per unit in 2011 Indian rupees	Converted to 2016 USD
Conversion cost		
Ampoules		
Up to 1mL	0.4253	\$0.008
100mL	1.4327	\$0.028
Sterile vials		
Up to 5mL	1.22	\$0.024
100mL	3.21	\$0.063
Packing materials cost		
USP type I glass vial including blister		
Up to 2mL	1.48	\$0.029
100mL	6.96	\$0.136
Plastic vial/bottle		
Up to 2mL	0.99	\$0.019
100mL	2.96	\$0.058
Ampoules		
White ampoule in tray		
Up to 1mL	0.53	\$0.010
25mL	2.86	\$0.056
Amber ampoules in blister		
Up to 1mL	0.63	\$0.012
25mL	4.68	\$0.091
Packing charges		
Ampoules		
Up to 5mL	0.33	\$0.006
Over 15mL	0.56	\$0.011
Liquid in vials		
Up to 5mL	0.6	\$0.012
Over 5mL	0.69	\$0.013
Sterile powder in vials		
Up to 1g	0.23	\$0.004
Over 1g	0.38	\$0.007
Ampoules range		\$0.03-\$0.13
Vials range		\$0.05-\$0.21

Pharmabiz.com. NPPA notification dated Dec 27, 2012 fixing/revising the norms for conversion cost (CC), packing charges (PC), process loss (PL) and packing material. Available from: <u>http://pharmabiz.com/PrintArticle.aspx?aid=72988</u> (accessed 6 November 2018).

Rupee values were inflation-adjusted by a factor of 1.30, based on inflation data provided by the World Bank, available from https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/FP.CPI.TOTL.ZG?locations=IN.


Solid red line: Points above this line represent an instance where the lowest current price is greater than the estimated generic price/API cost.

Dashed red line: Points above this line represent an instance where the lowest current price is more than 10 times the estimated generic price/API cost.

'Floors' can be seen for estimated generic price at \$0.24 and \$0.61 – the cost-based prices estimated by our algorithm for ampoules and vials, respectively, if API costs are zero, therefore, the estimated cost-based price cannot be below these 'floors'. In all countries, it can be observed that in some cases (in India more than in South Africa more than in UK) lowest current prices go below these 'floors'.

Ratio of estimated cost-based prices to lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India, by therapeutic category.

Medicine	UK	South Africa	India
Specific medicines for neonatal care	43.4	0.8	0.1
Cardiovascular medicines	5.2	9.9	0.2
Medicines for mental and behavioural disorder	5.7	7.1	0.1
Hormones, other endocrine medicines and			
contraceptives	4.5	0.8	2.8
Anticonvulsants/antiepileptics	2.8	3.7	0.3
Antineoplastics and immunosuppressives	3.0	2.7	0.7
Oxytocics and antioxytocics	3.7	1.3	0.4
Antidotes and other substances used in poisonings	2.5	1.4	0.4
Anti-infectives	2.0	1.4	0.3
Gastrointestinal medicines	1.3	1.0	0.1
Muscle relaxants (peripherally-acting) and			
cholinesterase inhibitors	1.6	0.5	0.1
Antiallergics and medicines used in anaphylaxis	0.7	0.9	0.1
Medicines acting on the respiratory tract	0.7	NA	0.1
Medicines affecting the blood	0.6	0.5	0.1
Medicines for pain and palliative care	0.6	0.5	0.1
Anaesthetics	0.2	0.2	0.1
Diuretics	0.3	0.1	0.0
Antimigraine medicines	NA	NA	NA
Antiparkinsonism Medicines	NA	NA	NA
Dermatological Medicines (topical)	NA	NA	NA
Ophthalmological Preparations	NA	NA	NA
Ear, nose and throat medicines (children)	NA	NA	NA
Medicines for diseases of joints	NA	NA	NA

Table is ranked by highest to lowest mean ratio across the three countries.

## Full results table: Lowest current prices in the UK, South Africa, and India, and estimated cost-based generic prices.

								Estimated
				South		India		cost-based
		LIK price	LIK price	Africa	India prico	price		product
Medicine	Unit	(USD)	source	(USD)	(USD)	sourc e	per unit	unit
acetylcysteine	2000mg ampoule	\$1.36	eMIT	\$1.57	\$2.00	TN		
aciclovir	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.24	eMIT	\$2.10	\$0.23	ΤN	\$0.02215	\$0.63448
amikacin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$23.83	eMIT	\$0.55	\$0.27	ΤN		
amikacin	powder for injection (100mg)	\$2.38	eMIT	\$0.33	\$0.05	TN		
amikacin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$11.92	eMIT	\$0.28	\$0.14	TN		
amiodarone	ampoule (150mg/3mL)	\$1.95	BNF	\$2.87	\$0.24	ΤN	\$0.02024	\$0.26893
amphotericin B	powder for injection (50mg)	\$5.04	BNF		\$1.02	ΤN	\$0.09296	\$0.72872
ampicillin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$20.36	BNF	\$1.21	\$0.13	TN	\$0.02941	\$0.64415
ampicillin	powder for injection (500mg)	\$10.18	BNF	\$0.61	\$0.06	ΤN	\$0.01471	\$0.62457
artemether	ampoule (80mg/1mL)				\$0.40	Р	\$0.02194	\$0.27120
	artesunate ampoule (60mg) &							
artesunate	ampoule							
	powder for injection							
asparaginase	(10,000iU)	\$796.90	BNF		\$11.57	ΤN		
atracurium	1mL injection (10mg)	\$0.86	BNF		\$0.00	ΤN	\$0.09646	\$0.73339
atropine	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$8.25	BNF	\$0.13	\$0.01	ΤN	\$0.00198	\$0.24464
azathioprine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$39.99	BNF				\$0.04225	\$0.66124
bendamustine	2mL injection (180mg)				\$185.14	Р	\$10.85220	\$15.04928
bendamustine	0.5mL injection (45mg)				\$46.29	Р	\$2.71305	\$4.21607
benzathine				7				
benzylpenicillin	5mL vial (1.44g)				\$0.23	Р		
benzatnine benzvlpenicillin	5mL vial (900mg)				\$0.17	Р		
benzylpenicillin	nowder for injection (3g)	\$15 18	BNF		\$0.49	TN		
benzylpenicillin	nowder for injection (600mg)	\$3.04	BNE		\$0.45	TN		
bevacizumah	1ml injection (25mg)	\$78.86	BNF		\$63.57	TN		
		<i>\$70.00</i>			<i><b>403.37</b></i>			
biperiden	1ml ampoule (5mg)							
bleomycin	powder for injection (15mg)	\$24.78	BNF		\$4.60	TN		
bupivacaine	1mL injection (2.5mg)	\$0.11	eMIT		\$0.02	Р	\$0.00051	\$0.60568
bupivacaine	4mL ampoule (20mg, with glucose)			\$0.21	\$0.23	Р	\$0.00411	\$0.24747
bupivacaine	1mL injection (5mg)	\$0.09	eMIT	\$0.02	\$0.01	ΤN	\$0.00103	\$0.60637
caffeine citrate	1mL injection (20mg)	\$5.70	eMIT				\$0.00030	\$0.60540
calcium folinate	10mL ampoule (30mg)	\$6.01	BNF		\$1.87	Р		
calcium								
gluconate	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$0.65	eMIT	\$0.36	\$0.11	Р	\$0.01106	\$0.25672
capreomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$37.19	BNF	\$7.16	\$3.93	Р		
carboplatin	60mL injection (600mg)	\$32.83	eMIT	\$45.76	\$22.80	ΤN	\$17.23615	\$23.54631
carboplatin	15mL injection (150mg)	\$9.91	eMIT	\$11.44	\$5.70	TN	\$4.30904	\$6.34033

			1	<u> </u>			
carboplatin	45mL injection (450mg)	\$24.78	eMIT	\$30.01	\$15.81 TN	\$12.92711	\$17.81099
carboplatin	5mL injection (50mg)	\$4.64	eMIT	\$3.81	\$1.76 TN	\$1.43635	\$2.51678
cefazolin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.53	\$0.26 TN	\$0.15187	\$0.80714
cefotaxime	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.31	eMIT	\$0.15	\$0.06 TN	\$0.02734	\$0.64139
ceftazidime	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$0.99	eMIT	\$1.77	\$0.36 P	\$0.43097	\$1.17863
ceftazidime	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.77	eMIT	\$0.44	\$0.36 P	\$0.10774	\$0.74841
ceftriaxone	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$0.64	eMIT	\$0.44	\$0.15 TN	\$0.19035	\$0.85836
ceftriaxone	powder for injection (250mg)	\$1.43	eMIT	\$0.27	\$0.08 TN	\$0.04759	\$0.66834
chloramphenico					40.445	40.45000	40 40000
 	2mL ampoule (1000mg)				\$0.14 P	\$0.15906	\$0.45370
	powder for injection (1000mg)	\$1.81	BNF		\$0.14 P	\$0.15906	\$0.81670
chlorpromazine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.92	eMIT		\$0.03 P	\$0.00429	\$0.24772
chlorpromazine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.92	eMIT		\$0.03 P	\$0.00429	\$0.24772
ciclosporin	1mL ampoule (50mg)	\$3.02	BNF	\$1.72	\$1.71 P	\$0.06771	\$0.33212
	1mL solution for infusion	,		,		,	,
ciprofloxacin	(2mg)	\$0.01	eMIT		\$0.00 TN	\$0.00051	\$0.60568
cisplatin	100mL injection (100mg)	\$13.73	eMIT	\$8.84	\$5.14 P	\$3.88629	\$5.77765
cisplatin	50mL injection (50mg)	\$9.09	eMIT	\$4.42	\$2.57 P	\$1.94314	\$3.19133
clindamycin	1mL injection (150mg)	\$0.37	eMIT		\$1.21 P		
cloxacillin	powder for injection (500mg)			\$0.89	\$0.12 TN	\$0.01268	\$0.62188
cyclizine	1mL injection (50mg)	\$2.11	eMIT			\$0.00419	\$0.61057
cyclophosphami de	powder for injection (500mg)	\$11.53	eMIT	\$5.04	\$0.50 TN	\$0.78130	\$1.64490
cytarabine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$3.99	eMIT	\$1.80	\$0.05 TN	\$0.13341	\$0.78257
dacarbazine	powder for injection (100mg)	\$5.42	eMIT		\$1.01 TN	\$0.33923	\$1.05652
dactinomycin	powder for injection (500mcg)	•			\$5.87 P		
daunorubicin	powder for injeciton (50mg)	\$211.25	BNF	\$10.03	\$2.78 TN	\$1.70665	\$2.87655
deferoxamine	injection (500mg)	\$5.19	BNF	\$0.47	\$2.12 TN		
deferoxamine	powder for injection (500mg)	\$5.19	BNF	\$0.47	\$2.12 TN		
desmopressin	1mL ampoule (4mcg)	\$1.46	eMIT			\$0.00112	\$0.24349
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)			\$0.21	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00790	\$0.25252
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)			\$0.21	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00790	\$0.25252
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)			\$0.21	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00790	\$0.25252
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)			\$0.21	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00790	\$0.25252
dexamethasone	1mL ampoule (4mg)			\$0.21	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00790	\$0.25252
diazepam	1mL injection (5mg)	\$0.25	eMIT	\$0.06	\$0.02 TN	\$0.00065	\$0.60587
digoxin	2mL ampoule (500mcg)	\$0.60	eMIT	\$2.44	\$0.06 P	\$0.00354	\$0.24671
dimercaprol	2mL ampoule (100mg)				\$1.50 P		
docetaxel	injection (20mg)	\$3.30	eMIT	\$21.70	\$1.45 TN	\$2.71104	\$4.21340
docetaxel	injection (40mg)			\$34.29	\$2.90 TN	\$5.42209	\$7.82180
dopamine	5mL vial (200mg)	\$0.68	eMIT	\$0.26	\$0.09 TN	\$0.05528	\$0.67858
doxorubicin	powder for injection (10mg)	\$1.99	eMIT	\$1.70	\$0.50 TN	\$0.45249	\$1.20727
doxorubicin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$5.25	eMIT	\$5.06	\$1.13 TN	\$2.26247	\$3.61635
eflornithine	100mL injection (20g)					\$27.83990	\$37.65990
onhodrino	1ml ampoule (30mg)	\$0 52	eMIT		\$0.10 TN	\$0.00184	\$0 2 <i>444</i> 5

2		F	r	r				-	
3	epinephrine								
4	(adrenaline)	10mL ampoule (1mg)	\$6.97	eMIT				Ş0.01878	Ş0.26699
5	epinephrine	1mL ampaula (1mg)	¢0.20			ć0 02	TNI	¢0 01070	¢0.26600
6	(aurenaine)		ŞU.2U	eivii i		ŞU.US	TIN	\$0.01076	ŞU.20099
/ Q	(adrenaline)	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$0.20	eMIT		\$0.03	ΤN	\$0.01878	\$0.26699
9	ergometrine	1 ml ampoule (0.2 mg)				\$0.03	P	70.020.0	
10	orythromycin	nowder for injection (E00mg)	ć11 12			Ş0.05			
11	estradiol	powder for injection (Soong)	Ş11.1Z	eivii i					
12	cypionate +								
13	medroxyprogest								
14	erone acetate	injection (5mg + 25mg)							
15	etoposide	5mL ampoule (100mg)	\$3.47	eMIT	\$3.66	\$0.97	ΤN	\$0.84629	\$1.36841
16	filgrastim	1.6mL vial (480mcg)						\$0.00392	\$0.61022
17	filgrastim	1mL vial (300mcg)	\$68 52	BNE	\$28.15	\$15 71	P	\$0,00245	\$0.60826
18	fluconazala	1mL vial (3mg)	\$00.52		Ş20.13	¢0.00	' TNI	\$0.002+3	\$0.00020
19	fluconazoie		\$0.01			ŞU.UU	TIN	\$0.00028	\$U.00556
20	flucytosine	250mL infusion (2.5g)	\$39.43	BNF				\$3.44262	\$5.18/12
27	fludarabine	vial (50mg)	\$30.46	eMIT	\$42.03	\$20.50	ΤN		
23	fluorouracil	5mL ampoule (250mg)	\$0.60	eMIT		\$0.10	Р		
24	fluphenazine	1mL ampoule (25mg)	\$2.78	eMIT	\$2.30	\$0.34	Р	\$0.05980	\$0.32160
25	fomepizole	1.5mL ampoule (1500mg)						\$26.92838	\$36.08368
26	furosemide	2mL ampoule (20mg)	\$0.12	eMIT	\$0.07	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00075	\$0.24300
27	furosemide	2mL ampoule (20mg)	\$0.12	eMIT	\$0.07	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00075	\$0.24300
28	gemcitabine	vial (1000mg)	\$40.16	eMIT	\$20.20	\$4 71	ΤN	\$4 36964	\$6 42099
29	gemcitabine	vial (200mg)	\$5.10		\$5.02	<u>- ۱۰۰ ټ</u> د ۵ ۵ ۵	ты	\$0.87303	\$1 76820
31	gentensioin		¢1.12			\$0.04		JU.07355	Ş1.70020
32	gentamicin		\$1.43	eivii i	40.00	\$0.04	P		
33	gentamicin	2mL vial (80mg)	\$0.78	eMII	\$0.23	\$0.04	IN		
34	glucagon	1mL injection (1mg)	\$14.98	BNF	\$19.51	\$1.64	Р		
35	haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT	7	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00166	\$0.24420
36	haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT 🧹		\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00166	\$0.24420
37	haloperidol	1mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.40	eMIT		\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00166	\$0.24420
38	heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (133.3mg)						\$1.69772	\$2.50167
39	heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (6.7mg)	\$0.99	eMIT	\$0.17	\$0.02	Р	\$0.08533	\$0.35558
40	heparin sodium	1ml ampoule (6 7mg)	\$0.99	eMIT	\$0.17	\$0.02	P	\$0.08533	\$0 35558
41 42	heparin sodium	1mL ampoule (33 3mg)	\$2.00	oMIT	\$0.28	\$0.14	тм	\$0,42411	\$0.806/9
43	heparin sodium		\$2.05		\$0.20	\$0.14		\$0.42411	\$0.8004J
44			\$2.09		ŞU.28	ŞU.14	TIN	50.42411	\$0.80649
45	hydralazine	powder for injection (20mg)	\$2.88	BNF				\$0.00777	\$0.25234
46	hydrocortisone	powder for injection (100mg)			Ş0.78	\$0.48	Р	Ş0.09166	Ş0.72700
47	hydrocortisone	powder for injection (100mg)			\$0.78	\$0.48	Р	\$0.09166	\$0.72700
48	hydroxocobala		64.45						
49	min	1mL ampoule (1mg)	\$1.15	eivii i					
50	hydrobromide	injection (600mcg)	\$1 33	eMIT				\$0,00239	\$0 24518
50	hyoscine		÷1.55					<i>\$0.00233</i>	Ş0.24310
53	hydrobromide	injection (400mcg)	\$1.10	eMIT				\$0.00159	\$0.24412
54	ibuprofen	1mL injection (5mg)	\$46.80	BNF				\$0.00005	\$0.60507
55	ifosfamide	powder for injection (1g)	\$118.72	BNF	\$28 71	\$2.33	ΤN	\$1,31204	\$2,35133
56	ifosfamido	nowder for injection (2g)	\$722.04	BNE	\$ <u>/</u> <u>9</u> 71	¢2.55 ¢1 65		\$2 62100	\$1 0076E
57	nosiannue		40.د2ب		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	<del>ب</del> ې	111	72.02400	J4.03/03
58									

ifosfamide	powder for injection (500mg)	\$59.35	BNF	\$17.22	\$1.16	TN	\$0.65602	\$1.47816
imipenem +	powder for injection (500mg	4			4	_		
cilastatin	+ 500mg)	\$3.30	eMIT	\$3.12	Ş11.86	Р		
imipenem +	powder for injection (250mg +			\$1 56	\$8.50	D		
insulin injection	2501187			Ş1.50	Ş0.50	1		
(soluble)	10mL injection (13.9mg)				\$0.79	TN	\$0.46524	\$1.22423
insulin injection								
(soluble)	10mL injection (34.7mg)	\$9.72	BNF	\$1.83	\$5.80	Р	\$1.16309	\$2.15308
intermediate-					40 TO			
acting insulin	10mL injection (13.9mg)				Ş0.79	IN		
acting insulin	10ml injection (34 7mg)	\$9.72	BNF	\$1.83	\$4 19	Р		
irinotecan	5ml vial (100mg)	\$1/13 81	BNE	Ŷ1.00	\$21 /13	D	\$0.42618	\$1 17225
irinotecan	25mL vial (200mg)	¢4C 92			¢107.14		\$0.42010	¢2 44122
irinotecan		\$46.83	eivii i		\$107.14	Р -	\$2.13090	\$3.44123
irinotecan	2mL vial (40mg)	\$5.58	eMIT		\$10.71	Ρ	\$0.17047	\$0.83190
kanamycin	powder for injection (1g)				Ş0.43	Р		
ketamine	10mL vial (500mg)	\$9.10	BNF	\$2.30	\$0.07	Р	\$0.14269	\$0.79492
lidocaina	2mL ampoule (100mg				¢0.06	п	¢0.00016	<u>ຕັດ ວ</u> າງວວງ
		<u> </u>			\$0.06	P	\$0.00016	\$0.24222
lidocaine	5mL ampoule (100mg)	\$0.26	eMIT		Ş0.02	Ρ	\$0.00162	\$0.24416
lidocaine	vial (10mg)	\$0.05	BNF	\$0.40	\$0.00	Р	\$0.00016	\$0.60522
lidocaine	vial (20mg)	\$0.06	BNF	\$0.14	\$0.00	Р	\$0.00032	\$0.60543
lidocaine +								
(adrenaline)	vial (10mg + 0.005mg)	\$0.13	BNF				\$0,00026	\$0 60534
lidocaine +		<i>\$</i> 0.13	Divi				<i>\$0.00020</i>	<b>90.0033</b> 4
epinephrine								
(adrenaline)	vial (20mg + 0.005mg)	\$0.12	BNF				\$0.00042	\$0.60556
lorazepam	1mL ampoule (2mg)				\$0.06	TN	\$0.00147	\$0.24395
lorazepam	1mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.46	BNF		\$0.21	Р	\$0.00294	\$0.24591
magnesium			6					
sulfate	10mL ampoule (5g)	\$0.73	eMIT	\$1.36	\$0.09	TN	\$0.01335	\$0.25978
magnesium	2ml ampaula (1a)	ćo 40		¢0.27	¢0.02		¢0,00007	60 24FFC
suitate	2mL ampoule (1g)	\$0.42	eivii i	ŞU.27	\$0.02		\$0.00267	\$0.24556
mannitol	1mL solution (100mg)	\$0.01	BNF		\$0.00	Ρ	\$0.00069	\$0.60592
mannitol	1mL solution (100mg)	\$0.01	BNF		\$0.00	Р	\$0.00069	\$0.60592
mannitol	1mL solution (200mg)	\$0.02	BNF	\$0.01	\$0.01	Р	\$0.00138	\$0.60683
mannitol	1mL solution (200mg)	\$0.02	BNF	\$0.00	\$0.01	Р	\$0.00138	\$0.60683
medroxyprogest		4		40.10	40.00	_		
erone acetate	1mL vial (150mg)	\$7.81	BNF	Ş0.42	\$3.32	Р		
antimoniate	0							
molarcoprol	Emi ampoulo (190mg)							
	Sinc ampoule (180mg)							
melarsoprol		620.25	DNE		<u>Å0 00</u>		60.0000	¢4 40000
mesna	IUML ampoule (1000mg)	\$38.23	RINF	4-	ŞU.88		\$0.66591	\$1.12833
mesna	4mL ampoule (400mg)	\$17.43	BNF	\$2.40	\$0.35	ſN	\$0.26636	\$0.59653
methotrexate	powder for injection (50mg)	\$1.83	eMIT	\$1.93	\$0.26	TN	\$4.04570	\$5.98983
methylprednisol one	5mL vial (200mg)						\$0.56616	\$1.35856



## **BMJ** Open

3	methylprednisol								
4	one	1mL vial (80mg)				\$0.61	Р	\$0.22647	\$0.90643
5	methylprednisol								
6	one	1mL vial (40mg)	\$1.79	eMIT	\$1.20	\$0.22	Р	\$0.11323	\$0.75571
7	methylthioniniu								
8	m chloride								
9	(methylene								
10			40.45		60.44	<u> </u>		40.00000	40.04045
11	metoclopramide	2mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.15	eMII	\$0.11	\$0.02	IN	\$0.00086	\$0.24315
12	metoclopramide	2mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.15	eMIT	\$0.11	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00086	\$0.24315
13	metronidazole	100mL vial (500mg)	\$0.47	eMIT		\$0.09	ΤN	\$0.00616	\$0.61320
14	metronidazole	100mL vial (500mg)	\$0.47	eMIT		\$0.09	ΤN	\$0.00616	\$0.61320
16	midazolam	1mL injection (5mg)	\$0.08	eMIT	\$0.17	\$0.09	Р	\$0.02628	\$0.63998
17	midazolam	1mL injection (1mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.06	\$0.03	ΤN	\$0.00526	\$0.61200
18	midazolam	1ml injection (1mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.06	\$0.03	TN	\$0,00526	\$0.61200
19	morphino		¢0.16		¢0.00	¢0.00		<i>\$0.00520</i>	<i><b>QUIDILOU</b></i>
20	morphine		\$0.10		\$0.15	\$0.10			
21	morphine	1mL ampoule (10mg)	\$0.16	eMII	\$0.13	\$0.10	IN		
22	naloxone	1mL ampoule (400mcg)	\$0.43	eMIT	\$0.21	\$0.99	ΤN		
23	neostigmine	1mL ampoule (500mcg)			\$0.26	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.01352	\$0.25999
24	neostigmine	1mL ampoule (2.5mg)	\$0.53	eMIT	\$0.15	\$0.32	Р	\$0.06758	\$0.33194
25	norethisterone								
20	enantate	1mL ampoule (200mg)	\$5.27	BNF	\$0.72	\$1.98	Р		
27	omeprazole	powder for injection (40mg)	\$1.23	eMIT		\$0.16	ΤN	\$0.00055	\$0.60573
20	ondansetron	2mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.30	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00445	\$0.24792
30	ondansetron	2mL ampoule (4mg)	\$0.11	eMIT	\$0.30	\$0.02	ΤN	\$0.00445	\$0.24792
31	oxaliplatin	40mL vial (200mg)	\$40.30	eMIT				\$12.77141	\$17.60375
32	oxalinlatin	20ml vial (100mg)	\$20.15	eMIT	\$59.76			\$6 38571	\$9 10438
33	oxaliplatin	nowder for injection (100mg)	\$20.15		\$55.70	¢6 21		¢6 20571	¢0 10430
34			\$20.15		\$59.70	\$0.21		\$0.36371	\$9.10456
35	oxaliplatin	powder for injection (50mg)	\$13.81	eMII	\$29.88	\$3.10	IN	\$3.19285	\$4.85469
36	oxytocin	1mL ampoule (25mcg)	\$0.91	eMIT 🤍	\$0.32	\$0.09	ΤN	\$0.00134	\$0.24378
37	paclitaxel	powder for injection (1mg)	\$0.09	eMIT	\$0.22	\$0.04	ΤN	\$0.04273	\$0.66188
38	paromomycin	injection (750mg)				4			
39 40	pegylated								
40	interferon alfa		+ · = 2 . 2 .						
42	(2a or 2b)	injection (100mcg)	\$1/2.80	BNF		\$48.91	IN		
43	pegylated								
44	(2a or 2h)	injection (180mcg)	\$161 72	BNF		\$46 43	TN		
45	pegvlated		<i><i><i><i></i></i></i></i>			<i>\</i>			
46	interferon alfa								
47	(2a or 2b)	injection (80mcg)	\$138.24	BNF		\$39.13	ΤN		
48	pentamidine	powder for injection (200mg)	\$27.54	BNF					
49	phenobarbital	1mL injection (200mg)	\$7.32	eMIT		\$0.20	Р	\$0.01656	\$0.26404
50	nhenvtoin	5ml vial (250mg)	¢0 85	eMIT	¢1 2/	\$0.02	TN	\$0.00475	\$0 61122
51 52	phytomenadion		J0.0J		Υ <b>1.</b> 34	J0.05	111	J0.00473	
52	e	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$2.46	BNF		\$0.36	Р		
54	phytomenadion								
55	e	5mL ampoule (5mg)							
56									

proceino								
benzylpenicillin	powder for injection (1g)							
procaine								
benzylpenicillin	powder for injection (3g)				\$0.49	Р		
propofol	1mL injection (20mg)	\$0.05	eMIT		\$0.17	Р	\$0.00226	\$0.60800
propofol	1mL injection (10mg)	\$0.03	eMIT	\$0.02	\$0.03	TN	\$0.00113	\$0.60650
prostaglandin E1	1mL solution for injection (0.5mg)							
prostaglandin E2	1mL solution for injection (1mg)							
protamine sulfate	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$6.44	BNF	\$4.08	\$0.08	Р		
protamine sulfate	5mL ampoule (50mg)	\$6.44	BNF	\$4.08	\$0.08	Р		
pyridostigmine	1mL ampoule (1mg)							
quinine	2mL ampoule (600mg)			\$1.10	\$0.11	Р	\$0.07719	\$0.34474
ranitidine	2mL ampoule (50mg)	\$0.48	eMIT	\$0.49	\$0.01	TN	\$0.00105	\$0.24340
ribavirin	10mL solution (800mg)						\$0.09776	\$0.73512
ribavirin	10mL solution (800mg)						\$0.09776	\$0.73512
ribavirin	10mL solution (1g)						\$0.12220	\$0.76765
ribavirin	10mL solution (1g)						\$0.12220	\$0.76765
		\$1,135.1		\$518.4			\$336.8880	\$449.0029
rituximab	50mL vial (500mg)	0	BNF	8			2	6
rituximab	10mL vial (100mg)	\$227.01	BNF	\$103.7 0			\$67.37760	\$90.28459
salbutamol	5mL ampoule (50mcg)						\$0.00001	\$0.24201
sodium calcium edetate	5mL ampoule (1000mg)	L					\$0.00334	\$0.24644
sodium nitrite	10mL ampoule (300mg)						\$0.00038	\$0.24250
sodium nitroprusside	powder for injection (50mg)		7		\$0.64	Р	\$0.00784	\$0.25244
sodium stibogluconate	30mL vial (3g)	\$25.91	BNF					
sodium stibogluconate or meglumine antimoniate	N/A			0	2			
sodium thiosulfate	50mL ampoule (12500mg)				5		\$0.02574	\$0.27625
spectinomycin	powder for injection (2g)				\$2.86	Р		
	, , , , , ,			\$223.9				
streptokinase	powder for injection (15.6mg)	\$101.97	eMIT	3	\$3.65	Р	\$14.27110	\$19.59983
streptomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.29	\$0.06	Р		
streptomycin	powder for injection (1000mg)			\$0.29	\$0.06	Р		
sulfamethoxazol e +								
trimethoprim	5mL ampoule (400mg+80mg)	\$2.31	BNF				\$0.00659	\$0.25077
sulfamethoxazol e +								
trimethoprim	5mL ampoule (400mg+80mg)	\$2.31	BNF				\$0.00659	\$0.25077

sulfamethoxazol								
e +	10mL ampoule							
trimethoprim	(800mg+160mg)	\$4.62	BNF				\$0.01317	\$0.25953
suramin sodium	powder for injection (1g)							
suxamethonium	0						\$0.00000	\$0.60500
suxamethonium	2mL ampoule (100mg)	\$0.86	eMIT		\$0.12	Р	\$0.05053	\$0.30925
testosterone	1mL ampoule (200mg)				\$1.34	Р	\$0.02237	\$0.27178
tranexamic acid	10mL ampoule (1000mg)	\$3.90	BNF	\$8.47	\$0.54	Р	\$0.09442	\$0.36767
trastuzumab	powder for injection (150mg)	\$529.62	BNF					
trastuzumab	powder for injection (440mg)							
trastuzumab	powder for injection (60mg)							
valproic acid								
(sodium								
valproate)	10mL ampoule (1g)				\$2.86	Р	\$0.02628	\$0.27698
valproic acid								
(sodium								
valproate)	4mL ampoule (400mg)	Ş5.09	eMIT		Ş1.14	Р	Ş0.01051	Ş0.25599
vancomycin	powder for injection (250mg)	\$0.72	eMIT	\$0.88	\$0.28	ΤN	\$0.22748	\$0.90777
vecuronium	powder for injection (10mg)	\$4.38	BNF		\$1.05	TN		
vecuronium	powder for injection (10mg)	\$4.38	BNF		\$1.05	TN		
verapamil	2mL ampoule (5mg)	\$1.41	BNF				\$0.00039	\$0.24252
vinblastine	powder for injection (10mg)	\$19.27	eMIT	\$6.20	\$1.72	TN	\$2.57796	\$4.03626
vincristine	powder for injection (5mg)	\$23.43	eMIT	\$13.92	\$0.24	TN	\$2.66370	\$4.15039
vincristine	powder for injection (1mg)	\$4.08	eMIT	\$2.78	\$0.05	TN	\$0.53274	\$1.31408
vinorelbine	1mL vial (10mg)	\$6.23	eMIT	\$6.76	\$36.79	Р		
vinorelbine	5mL vial (50mg)	\$23.41	eMIT	\$33.61	\$152.63	Р		
zidovudine (ZDV								
or AZT)	20mL vial (200mg)	\$11.60	BNF		\$0.20	Р	\$0.05046	\$0.67216

eMIT – price source was the electronic market information tool, available from <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/drugs-and-pharmaceutical-electronic-market-information-emit">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/drugs-and-pharmaceutical-electronic-market-information-emit</a>

BNF – price source was the British National Formulary, available from <a href="https://bnf.nice.org.uk/">https://bnf.nice.org.uk/</a>

TN – price source was the database of the Tamil Nadu Medical Services Corporation, available from

http://www.tnmsc.com/tnmsc/new/user\_pages/drugtender.php?drugcat=drug2017 and http://www.tnmsc.com/tnmsc/new/user\_pages/drugtender.php?drugcat=sdg2017

P – price source was the MedGuide India database, available from <a href="http://www.medguideindia.com/">http://www.medguideindia.com/</a>

Prices in South Africa were collected from the South Africa Department of Health Master Procurement Catalogue. Available from

http://www.health.gov.za/index.php/component/phocadownload/category/196 (accessed May 12, 2017).

## **Exchange rates**

Section/item	Item No	Recommendation	Reported on page No/ line No
Title and abstract			
Title	1	Identify the study as an economic evaluation or use more specific terms such as "cost-effectiveness analysis", and describe the interventions compared	Page 1 lines 1-2
Abstract	2	Provide a structured summary of objectives, perspective, setting, methods (including study design and inputs), results (including base case and uncertainty analyses), and conclusions.	Page 2, lines 1-27
Introduction		•	
Background and objectives	3	Provide an explicit statement of the broader context for the study.	Page 4, lines3-8
		Present the study question and its relevance for health policy or practice decisions.	Page 4, lines 24-29
Methods	1.		[
Target population and subgroups	4	Describe characteristics of the base case population and subgroups analysed, including why they were chosen.	Page 5, lines 3-38
Setting and location	5	State relevant aspects of the system(s) in which the decision(s) need(s) to be made.	Not applicable
Study perspective	6	Describe the perspective of the study and relate this to the costs being evaluated.	Not applicable
Comparators	7	Describe the interventions or strategies being compared and state why they were chosen.	Not applicable
Time horizon	8	State the time horizon(s) over which costs and consequences are being evaluated and say why appropriate.	Not applicable, as this is a 'snapshot' price estimate and comparison to current prices (one time point: the present moment)
Discount rate	9	Report the choice of discount rate(s) used for costs and outcomes and say why appropriate.	No discount rate used, as snapshot estimate
Choice of health outcomes	10	Describe what outcomes were used as the measure(s) of benefit in the evaluation and their relevance for the type of analysis performed.	Not applicable
Measurement of effectiveness	11a	<i>Single study-based estimates:</i> Describe fully the design features of the single effectiveness study and why the single study was a sufficient source of clinical effectiveness data.	Not applicable

Section/item	Item No	Recommendation	Reported on page No/ line No
	11b	<i>Synthesis-based estimates:</i> Describe fully the methods used for identification of included studies and synthesis of clinical effectiveness data.	Not applicable
Measurement and valuation of preference based	12	If applicable, describe the population and methods used to elicit preferences for outcomes.	Not applicable
Estimating resources and costs	13a	Single study-based economic evaluation: Describe approaches used to estimate resource use associated with the alternative interventions. Describe primary or secondary research methods for valuing each resource item in terms of its unit cost. Describe any adjustments made to	
	13b	<i>Model-based economic evaluation:</i> Describe approaches and data sources used to estimate resource use associated with model health states. Describe primary or secondary research methods for valuing each resource item in terms of its unit cost. Describe any adjustments made to approximate to opportunity costs	Pages 5-8
Currency, price date, and conversion	14	Report the dates of the estimated resource quantities and unit costs. Describe methods for adjusting estimated unit costs to the year of reported costs if necessary. Describe methods for converting costs into a common currency base and the exchange rate.	Page 8. line 6
Choice of model	15	Describe and give reasons for the specific type of decision-analytical model used. Providing a figure to show model structure is strongly recommended.	Not applicable
Assumptions	16	Describe all structural or other assumptions underpinning the decision-analytical model.	Not applicable
Analytical methods	17	Describe all analytical methods supporting the evaluation. This could include methods for dealing with skewed, missing, or censored data; extrapolation methods; methods for pooling data; approaches to validate or make adjustments (such as half cycle corrections) to a model; and methods for handling population heterogeneity and uncertainty.	Page 5, lines 27-32 and page 6, lines 1- 13.

Section/item	Item No	Recommendation	Reported on page No/ line No
Study parameters	18	Report the values, ranges, references, and, if used, probability distributions for all parameters. Report reasons or sources for distributions used to represent uncertainty where appropriate. Providing a table to show the input values is strongly recommended.	Not applicable.
Incremental costs and outcomes	19	For each intervention, report mean values for the main categories of estimated costs and outcomes of interest, as well as mean differences between the comparator groups. If applicable, report incremental cost- effectiveness ratios.	Not applicable
Characterising uncertainty	20a	<i>Single study-based economic evaluation:</i> Describe the effects of sampling uncertainty for the estimated incremental cost and incremental effectiveness parameters, together with the impact of methodological assumptions (such as discount rate, study perspective).	Not applicable
	20b	<i>Model-based economic evaluation:</i> Describe the effects on the results of uncertainty for all input parameters, and uncertainty related to the structure of the model and assumptions.	Not applicable
Characterising heterogeneity	21	If applicable, report differences in costs, outcomes, or cost-effectiveness that can be explained by variations between subgroups of patients with different baseline characteristics or other observed variability in effects that are not reducible by more information.	Not applicable
Discussion			
Study findings, limitations, generalisability, and current knowledge	22	Summarise key study findings and describe how they support the conclusions reached. Discuss limitations and the generalisability of the findings and how the findings fit with current knowledge	Pages 10-13
Other			1 4905 10 15
Source of funding	23	Describe how the study was funded and the role of the funder in the identification, design, conduct, and reporting of the analysis. Describe other non-monetary sources of support.	Page 14, lines 3-4
Conflicts of interest	24	Describe any potential for conflict of interest of study contributors in accordance	Page 14, lines 8-11

Section/item	Item No	Recommendation	Reported on page No/ line No
		with journal policy. In the absence of a journal policy, we recommend authors comply with International Committee of Medical Journal Editors recommendations.	

to peer teriew only

For peer review only - http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/guidelines.xhtml