PLOS ONE

Diversity in sea buckthorn (Hippophae rhamnoides L.) accessions with different origins based on morphological characteristics, oil traits, and microsatellite markers --Manuscript Draft--

American Journal Experts (AJE, ID: HS1GCXH7) for the improvement in English quality.

The Materials & Methods needs to be revised at places (please see suggestions). Most trait measures in various tables lack the unit of measurements. Please incorporate that. Response: Thank you for the valuable suggestion. The places mentioned above in the Materials & Methods have been revised according to the reviewers' suggestions. And the unit of measurements has been added in the tables of the revised manuscript.

Specific comments:

1.The text contradictorily mentions the deployment of 20 SSR primer pairs at certain places (line 357, 450, Header of Table 5) and at other places (Line 27, 41, 46, 197, 358, 373, 383, 451, 482) the use of 23 SSR primer pairs has been mentioned. The supplementary table (S4) gives sequence information for 23, while its header says 20 SSR primers. Table 5, gives information for 23 markers although the Header says 20. Please ensure that all these ambiguities are taken care of.

Response: Twenty-three SSR primer pairs were used in this study. The number '20' at certain places (line 357, 450, Headers of Table 5 and S4 Table) have been replaced by 23 in the revised manuscript.

2.Abstract says 69 polymorphic bands, while in results 59 polymorphic bands are mentioned. This ambiguity also needs to be addressed.

Response: The number of polymorphic bands is 59. It has been revised in the abstract of the revised manuscript.

Introduction:

1. Line 62: 'Two important parameters in……..oil quantity are oil content'. Oil content cannot be a parameter of oil quality. So, this statement needs modification.

Response: The authors agreed with this opinion. The oil content is a parameter of oil yield. The sentence has been revised as bellow.

'Two important parameters in analyzing oil yield and quality are oil content and fatty acid (FA) composition (referred to here as 'oil traits' for simplicity).'

2. Line 78: 'Due to small berries………………….artificial hybridization for elite accessions.' The statement needs to be reframed.

Response: Thank you for the valuable suggestion. The statement is reframed as bellow.

'Due to the small berries and thorns of native cultivars (ssp. sinensis), which result in little economic value, the breeding of sea buckthorn has undergone different stages of development in China, such as introduction, domestication, seedling selection and artificial hybridization for elite accessions.'

3.Line 98: 'The diversity analysis…………………………germplasm'. The authors appear to have fused to incomplete sentences. This needs to be re-written. All other such statements have been highlighted in the document attached. Response: Thank you for the valuable suggestion. All such statements are re-written in the revised manuscript.

Materials & Methods

1.Line 139: 'There were three biological replicates………measurement'. Do the authors mean that 300 berries were taken for the analysis? 100 berries from 2- 5 plants/ accession is a good enough number for the analysis. Response: Yes. 300 berries were taken for the analysis. We collected more than 300 berries per accession and the analyses of other nutrients were performed in our research work, e.g. vitamin C, vitamin E and carotenoids.

2.Line142: '…with over 20 measurements…for each' This is not clear. Do the authors mean 20 berries per accession?? And how many plants did these berries belong to? Response: The authors agreed with this view. It means averaged 20 determinations were done for each character. These berries were selected from the berry samples randomly collected from 2-5 ramet plants per accession. This sentence mentioned above has been re-framed for clarity in the revised manuscript as bellow. 'The transverse and longitudinal diameters of berries (BTD and BLD) and the length, width and thickness of seeds (SL, SW and ST) were measured over 20 times each (on average) by micrometer calipers.'

3.For the oil extraction, were the seeds and fruit pulp weighed prior to oil extraction to maintain some uniformity. This has not been mentioned in the M&M.

The oil contents in both seeds and fruit pulp as mentioned in Line 153 is expressed as percentage. Percentage of what? Seed/pulp weight? The authors need to clearly mention that in the M&M.

In the results (Line 278), the authors mention '.... highest oil content (24.68%) based on dry weight.' This means that the weight of the pulp/seed was considered. But, this has not been clearly mentioned either in the M&M or in the Table 3. The units for oil characteristic (min and max) have not been mentioned in the table.

Reponse: Thank you for the valuable suggestion. The method of lipid extraction was described by Yang and Kallio (2001). Samples (1 g) of seeds and fruit pulp were isolated from freeze-dried berries and lipids from the samples were extracted with chloroform/methanol (2:1, v/v) with mechanical homogenization of the tissues. The oil contents (percentages) in seeds and fruit pulp were calculated (oil % in seeds and lyophilized fruit pulp). The fatty acid composition was also expressed as a weight percentage of the total fatty acids. The units (weight percentages) for oil characteristics in Table 3 and Table 4 have been added in the revised manuscript.

4.Line 197: 'Twenty-three polymorphic microsatellite loci (SSR) developed using RNA-Seq was evaluated and loci SB1-SB17 were previously reported'.

Please mention here the names of the SSR markers (SB1-SB23). Nowhere in the text have they been mentioned except for tables. Then it can be mentioned that SB1-17 were previously deployed (Ref. 14).

The authors need to clearly mention in the introduction itself that in a previous study, RNA seq analysis was done to generate SSR markers and these were tested on 31 accessions. The 17 SSR markers developed in that study have been utilized in the present endeavor for genetic diversity assessment of larger set of accessions. This description in the 'introduction' will bring more clarity in the text. This previous study and its outcomes should be mentioned clearly in the 'Introduction' so that its extension in the present study can be deciphered.

Reponse: Thank you for the valuable suggestion. The sentences mentioned above have been re-framed for clarity in the revised manuscript as bellow.

'Twenty-three polymorphic microsatellite loci (SB1-SB23) developed using RNA-Seq were evaluated. Of these, 17 (SB1-SB17) had been deployed in a previous study by the group [14].'

And the authors added the statements of 17 RNA-Seq SSR markers developed in our previous study and mentioned these SSR markers have been utilized in the present endeavor for genetic diversity assessment of larger set of accessions in the revised manuscript.

'In our previous study, 17 RNA-Seq SSR markers (SB1-SB17) were developed and validated on 31 accessions, which were utilized in the present study for genetic diversity assessment of larger set of accessions [14].'

Results

1. Line 246: 'In previous mutilocation trials in Suiling (47°14′N, 127°06′E; 202 m) and Dengkou (40°43′N, 106°30′E; 1053m, Inner Mongolia), the fruit characteristics of 11 large……'.

How many berries per accession were taken for this analysis? The data should be represented as + SD in Table S7.

Reponse: 300 berries of each cultivar were randomly sampled and divided into 3 groups (100 berries were divided into 1 group) to determine the hundred berry weight (HBW). 20 berries of each cultivar were randomly sampled to determine the transverse, longitudinal diameters of berries and berry shape indices (BTD, BLD and BSI). The data has been represented as + SD in S7 Table in the revised manuscript.

2. Line 302: 'Small variations were found in the proportion of linoleic acid in seed oil (40.44 – 42.87%). Its proportion in hybrids were slightly higher than in ssp. mongolica (42.87% vs 42.10%.....'

Are these differences significant?

 Reponse: These differences are significant despite small variations. The content of seed oil in hybrids is lower than that in ssp. mongolica. However, the proportion of linoleic acid (an important polyunsaturated fatty acid) in seed oil is higher in hybrids

Unfunded studies

Enter: The author(s) received no specific funding for this work.

Funded studies

Enter a statement with the following details:

- Initials of the authors who received each award
- Grant numbers awarded to each author
- The full name of each funder
- URL of each funder website
- Did the sponsors or funders play any role in the study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript?
- NO Include this sentence at the end of your statement: The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.
- YES Specify the role(s) played.

* typeset

Competing Interests

Use the instructions below to enter a competing interest statement for this submission. On behalf of all authors, disclose any [competing interests](http://journals.plos.org/plosone/s/competing-interests) that could be perceived to bias this work—acknowledging all financial support and any other relevant financial or nonfinancial competing interests.

This statement will appear in the published article if the submission is accepted. Please make sure it is accurate. View published research articles from [PLOS ONE](http://journals.plos.org/plosone/) for specific examples.

The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

Format for specific study types

Human Subject Research (involving human participants and/or tissue)

- Give the name of the institutional review board or ethics committee that approved the study
- Include the approval number and/or a statement indicating approval of this research
- Indicate the form of consent obtained (written/oral) or the reason that consent was not obtained (e.g. the data were analyzed anonymously)

Animal Research (involving vertebrate

animals, embryos or tissues)

- Provide the name of the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC) or other relevant ethics board that reviewed the study protocol, and indicate whether they approved this research or granted a formal waiver of ethical approval
- Include an approval number if one was obtained
- If the study involved non-human primates, add additional details about animal welfare and steps taken to ameliorate suffering
- If anesthesia, euthanasia, or any kind of animal sacrifice is part of the study, include briefly which substances and/or methods were applied

Field Research

Include the following details if this study involves the collection of plant, animal, or other materials from a natural setting: • Field permit number

• Name of the institution or relevant body that granted permission

Data Availability

Authors are required to make all data underlying the findings described fully available, without restriction, and from the time of publication. PLOS allows rare exceptions to address legal and ethical concerns. See the [PLOS Data Policy](http://journals.plos.org/plosone/s/data-availability) and [FAQ](http://journals.plos.org/plosone/s/data-availability#loc-faqs-for-data-policy) for detailed information.

Yes - all data are fully available without restriction

Abstract

 Sea buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides*) is an ecologically and economically important species. Here, we assessed the diversity of 78 accessions cultivated in northern China using 8 agronomic characteristics, oil traits (including oil content and fatty acid composition) in seeds and fruit pulp, and SSR markers at 23 loci. The 78 accessions included 52 from ssp. *mongolica*, 6 from ssp. *sinensis*, and 20 hybrids. To assess the phenotypic diversity of these accessions, 8 agronomic fruit traits were recorded and analyzed using principal component analysis (PCA). The first two PCs accounted for approximately 78% of the variation among accessions. The oil contents were higher in pulp (3.46-38.56%) than in seeds (3.88-8.82%), especially in ssp. *mongolica* accessions. The polyunsaturated fatty acid (PUFA) ratio was slightly lower in the seed oil of hybrids (76.06%) than that of in ssp. *mongolica* (77.66%) and higher than that of in ssp. *sinensis* (72.22%). The monounsaturated fatty acid (MUFA) ratio in the pulp oil of ssp. *sinensis* (57.00%) was highest, and that in ssp. *mongolica* (51.00%) was approximately equal to the ratio in the hybrids (51.20%). Using canonical correspondence analysis (CCA), we examined the correlation between agronomic traits and oil characteristics in pulp and seeds. Oil traits in pulp from different origins were correlated with morphological 40 groupings ($r = 0.8725$, $p = 0.0000$). To assess the genotypic diversity, 23 SSR markers (including 17 loci previously reported) were used among the 78 accessions with 59 polymorphic amplified fragments obtained and an average PIC value of 0.2845. All accessions were classified into two groups based on the UPGMA method. The accessions of ssp. *sinensis* and ssp. *mongolica* were genetically distant. The hybrid

 accessions were close to ssp. *mongolica* accessions. The 8 agronomic traits, oil characteristics in seed and pulp oils, and 23 SSR markers successfully distinguished the 78 accessions. These results will be valuable for cultivar identification and genetic diversity analysis in cultivated sea buckthorn.

Introduction

 Sea buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) is a hardy winter shrub that is naturally distributed throughout Asia and Europe. It is an economically valuable species, divided into eight subspecies. Of these subspecies, ssp. *sinensis* and *mongolica* are mainly distributed in Asia, where they are abundant and commercially cultivated [1−2]. The fruits of sea buckthorn are rich in a variety of phytochemicals with physiological properties, such as lipids, carotenoids, ascorbic acid, tocopherols, and flavonoids [3−5]. The main applications for the fruits include food, cosmetics, and pharmaceutical products [6−7]. One of the most requested products for therapeutic practices is sea buckthorn oil, which is extracted from both seeds and fruit pulp. The applications of sea buckthorn oil include healing of the skin, mucosa, and immune systems, especially in cancer and cardiovascular disease therapy [8−9].

 Two important parameters in analyzing oil yield and quality are oil content and fatty acid (FA) composition (referred to here as 'oil traits' for simplicity). Sea buckthorn seed and pulp oils are considered the most valuable products of the berries with a unique FA composition [10]. The seed oil contains omega-3 (*α*-linolenic acid) and omega-6 (linoleic acid) FAs, and the pulp oil is characterized by a high concentration of FAs from the omega-7 group (e.g., palmitoleic acid). Seed oil is rich in unsaturated FAs (commonly 30-40% linoleic acid and 20-35% linolenic acid) [10]. The soft parts (pulp and peel) of the berries have an FA composition that differs from the seeds that is characterized by a high level of palmitoleic acid (16–54%), which is very uncommon in plants. The oil traits of sea buckthorn berries vary greatly according to their origin, based on the climatic and geological conditions of the growing areas [11].

 Sea buckthorn adapts well to extreme conditions, including drought, salinity, alkalinity, and extreme temperatures [12]. Its vigorous vegetative reproduction and strong, complex root system with nitrogen-fixing nodules make it an optimal pioneer plant for soil and water conservation. For these reasons, sea buckthorn is cultivated widely in arid and semiarid areas of China [13]. Due to the small berries and thorns of native cultivars (ssp. *sinensis*), which result in little economic value, the breeding of sea buckthorn has undergone different stages of development in China, such as introduction, domestication, seedling selection and artificial hybridization for elite accessions. The cultivars of ssp. *mongolica* (introduced from Russia and Mongolia), ssp. *sinensis* (China origin) and hybrids (ssp. *mongolica* × ssp. *sinensis*) are abundant in northern China [14]. However, as a perennial woody plant, traditional cross breeding that takes a long time and has low efficiency cannot meet the needs of modern production in sea buckthorn. It is essential for economic production to utilize molecular marker-assisted breeding (MAB) in sea buckthorn, especially to breed accessions associated with desirable oil traits. An essential step in this process is the genetic analysis of sea buckthorn germplasm. At present, molecular markers are mainly used

 for the analysis of genetic diversity, the taxonomic and geographic origin of cultivars, sex determination and population genetic structure in sea buckthorn [14−16]. SSR (simple sequence repeat, microsatellite) markers, with 1- to 6-bp DNA regions repeated in tandem, have been used in these analyses for their advantages of codominance, random distribution throughout the genome, easy detection, and high polymorphism and reproducibility [17]. Currently, an increasing number of microsatellite markers are being developed in sea buckthorn using high-throughput sequencing techniques for transcriptome datasets (RNA-Seq), which have become valuable resources for SSR discovery [14, 18]. In our previous study, 17 RNA-Seq SSR markers (SB1-SB17) were developed and validated on 31 accessions, which were utilized in the present study for genetic diversity assessment of larger set of accessions [14].

 Diversity analysis helps clarify the relationships between germplasm characteristics and genotype and will improve our understanding of sea buckthorn germplasm to achieve greater production with higher quality regarding the important traits correlated with germplasm [19].

 In the present study, 78 accessions of sea buckthorn with variation in fruit traits were selected as materials. The aim of this study is to report the phenotypic characteristics and oil traits in fruit pulp and seeds and the genetic diversity of the 78 sea buckthorn accessions in northern China, providing a foundation for MAB in sea buckthorn.

Materials and methods

Plant materials

 Berries and leaves of 78 sea buckthorn accessions belonging to ssp. *mongolica* (52 accessions), ssp. *sinensis* (6 accessions) and hybrids (ssp. *mongolica* × ssp. *sinensis*, 20 accessions) were collected from the end of July to mid-September in 2015. Table 1 summarizes information on the plant materials. Three research institutes located in northern China, the Institute of Selection and Breeding of *Hippophae* (42°26′N, 121°28′E; 380 m) in Fuxin, the Research Institute of Berry (47°14′N, 127°06′E; 202 m) in Suiling and the Jiuchenggong Breeding Base of Sea Buckthorn (39°40′N, 110°09′E; 1400 m) in Dongsheng, provided 76 accessions of sea buckthorn samples (Fig 1, S1 120 Table). The other two accessions, Ouvisike and Zhongguoshaji^{wild}, were harvested from cultivated fields in Qinghe (46°40′N, 90°22′E; 1218 m) and Datong (36°53′N, 101°35′E; 2800 m) (Fig 1, S1 Table, S2 Table). These areas have various geographical and climatic conditions (S3 Table).

 The young leaves of each plant were kept at −80 °C for use. The berries of each accession were pooled and frozen as quickly as possible at −20 °C. When all plant 126 materials were harvested, the berries were transferred to -50 °C for storage until analysis.

Fig 1. The 78 sea buckthorn accessions from five cultivated lands used in this study.

Table 1. Accessions of sea buckthorn used for the study.

	No.	Accession name	Abbrev. ^a	Collection	b SSD.	No.	Accession name	Abbrev. ^a	Collection	SSD.
				site					site	

133 a Abbrev., abbreviation.

^b ssp., subspecies; M, ssp. *mongolica*; S, ssp. *sinensis*; H, hybrid (ssp. *mongolica* ♀ × ssp. *sinensis* ♂).

Morphological characteristics of fruit

 Hundred berry weight (HBW) was the weight of 100 fresh berries after they were picked from bushes. Hundred seed weight (HSW) was the weight of 100 seeds after air 139 drying at room temperature (25 $^{\circ}$ C) for 2 weeks [20]. There were three biological replicates for each measurement. The transverse and longitudinal diameters of berries (BTD and BLD) and the length, width and thickness of seeds (SL, SW and ST) were measured over 20 times each (on average) by micrometer calipers. The berry shape indices (BSIs) were estimated by the ratio of BLD to BTD. The minimum (Min), 144 maximum (Max), mean \pm standard deviation (SD), and coefficient of variation (CV%) were reported.

Oil extraction and FA analysis in seeds and pulp

 The methods of lipid extraction, transesterification (methylation) and purification of methyl esters of the lipid extracts were described by Yang and Kallio [11]. Briefly, samples (1 g) of seeds and fruit pulp were isolated from freeze-dried berries and lipids 151 from the samples were extracted with chloroform/methanol $(2:1, v/v)$ with mechanical homogenization of the tissues. The purified oils were filtered before the solvent was removed on a rotary evaporator. The lipids were weighed, and the oil contents (percentages) in seeds and fruit pulp were calculated. Three biological replicates were taken for analysis. Lipids were stored in chloroform at −20 °C until analysis.

 The oil (10 mg) was transesterified by sodium methoxide catalysis [11, 21]. It was dissolved in sodium-dried diethyl ether (1 ml) and methyl acetate (20 μl). Then, 1 M sodium methoxide in dry methanol (20 μl) was added, and the solution was agitated briefly and incubated for 5 min at room temperature. The reaction was stopped by adding a saturated solution of oxalic acid in diethyl ether (30 μl) with brief agitation. The mixture was centrifuged at 1500 g for 2 min, and the supernatant was dried in a gentle stream of nitrogen. Fresh hexane (1 ml) was added and the solution was filtered with microporous filtering films (0.22 μm) for analysis.

 Fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) were analyzed with a gas chromatography-165 tandem mass spectrometry (GC/MS/MS) system (model $AxION^{\circledR}$ iOTTM, PerkinElmer, Shelton, CT, USA). Chromatographic separation was achieved using a DB-23 capillary 167 column (60 m \times 0.25 mm \times 0.25 µm; Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA, USA) 168 with the following temperature program: initial temperature 50 \degree C, hold for 1 min, heat 169 to 175 °C at 25 °C/min, then heat to 215 °C at 3 °C/min and hold for 10 min, heat to 170 230 °C at 3 °C/min and hold for 5 min. The inlet was operated in split mode (1:20) at a 171 temperature of 250 °C with helium as the carrier gas at constant flow of 1.0 mL/min. 172 The transfer line temperature was 215 \degree C, and the MS ion source was set to 230 \degree C. MS detection was carried out in electron impact (EI) ionization mode, scanning all masses from 45–400 amu. FAME components were identified based on mass spectral comparison with an external standard (Supelco 37 Component FAME Mix, Sigma- Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) and previous studies [10−11]. The main FA composition was expressed as a weight percentage of the total FAs from three replicates. The 178 minimum, maximum, mean \pm SD, and CV% were reported.

Statistical analysis

 The data analysis for morphological traits and oil characteristics was performed with 182 SPSS[®] 24.0 (IBM[®]). The following parameters were evaluated: mean, minimum value, maximum value, SD and CV%. One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was used in the comparison of all traits among subsp. of *sinensis*, subsp. of *mongolica* and hybrids. Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated to analyze the relationship between pairs of 8 agronomic traits. Principal component analysis (PCA) was used to determine relationships among the accessions. In addition, a canonical correspondence analysis (CCA) was applied to the data between morphological characteristics and oil traits in different tissues (seeds and pulp).

DNA extraction and SSR analysis

 The microsatellites were scored as codominant markers for genetic diversity analysis. The number of alleles (Na), effective number of alleles (Ne), observed and expected heterozygosity (Ho and He), Shannon's information index (Is) and polymorphic information content (PIC) for each of the genic SSR markers were calculated using GenAlEx 6.5 [22−23] and PowerMarker version 3.25 [24] software packages. A genetic similarity matrix based on the proportion of shared alleles was generated, and a UPGMA tree was constructed using PowerMarker. The dendrogram 215 was displayed using MEGA 6 software [25] to reveal genetic relationships between the 78 sea buckthorn accessions.

Results

Morphological characterization of berries and seeds

 Descriptive statistical analysis of 8 agronomic fruit traits for the 78 sea buckthorn accessions is shown in Tables 2, S5 and S6. Relatively high CV values were observed 222 for the HBW, BLD, and HSW ($>$ 20%). The highest CV% was observed for the HBW 223 (39.12%), which varied from 8.52 to 69.74 g. ANOVA ($p < 0.05$) showed that the HBW 224 of ssp. *mongolica* berries was 47.69 ± 11.03 g, which was much higher than those of 225 ssp. *sinensis* berries $(10.73 \pm 1.54 \text{ g})$ and hybrids $(31.44 \pm 13.84 \text{ g})$. In hybrids, the 226 HBW values were high in EZ4, Za56, Za1-2, Za05-6 and Za05-21(> 45 g), which were approximately the size of those in ssp. *mongolica* berries on average (S6 Table). The BTD varied from 5.54 to 10.80 mm, and the BLD varied from 4.83 to 14.25 mm. In addition, the BLD of berries from ssp. *mongolica* was higher than the BTD, and this relationship was the opposite in berries of ssp. *sinensis*. According to BSI values, the 231 berry shapes of the three groups were significantly different $(p = 0.000)$: oblong berries 232 for ssp. *mongolica* (1.35 ± 0.20) , oblate berries for ssp. *sinensis* (0.90 ± 0.05) and 233 circular berries for the hybrids (1.08 ± 0.11) . The HSW varied from 0.61 to 2.19 g with an average of 1.45 g. Similar to the HBW, there were significant differences in the HSW among seeds from ssp. *mongolica*, ssp. *sinensis*, and hybrids (*p* = 0.000). The SL

241

Table 2. Fruit traits of sea buckthorn berries of two different subspecies and hybrid accessions^a 242 *.*

243

244 a Values with different lowercase letters (a–c) are significantly different at $p < 0.05$.

245 b Abbrev., Abbreviation.

257 PCA was performed using fruit characteristics (Fig 2). The first two PCs explained 78.11% of the total morphological variance. The first PC accounted for 41.74% of the variance. It was associated with BTD, HBW, ST, HSW, and SW in descending order. Therefore, these traits were important attributes for the classification of sea buckthorn accessions. The second PC accounted for 36.37%, which were correlated with BSI, SL, and BLD in descending order. The plot shows the distribution of 78 sea buckthorn accessions on PC1 and PC2 (Fig 2). The ssp. *mongol*ica accessions with larger berries tended to cluster together, mainly positive on PC2. Six accessions of ssp. *sinensis* with the smallest berries were negative on both PC1 and PC2. The hybrids were largely distributed between the above two groups. Some hybrids (including ZCY1, ZCY10, ZCY12, XZC26, SCY2, and SCY5) were close to the accessions from ssp. *sinensis*.

 Fig 2. Two-dimensional scatter plot for the first two principal components (PC1 and PC2) based on the agronomic fruit characteristics of 78 sea buckthorn accessions. Numbers associated with 271 symbols are the variety codes listed in Table 1. \triangle = ssp. *mongolica*; \bullet = ssp. *sinensis*; \diamond = hybrid.

Oil characterization in seeds and seedless parts

 The oil characteristics of seeds and seedless parts (pulp and peel) among the 78 accessions are summarized in Tables 3 and Table 4. One special feature of sea buckthorn fruit was the high oil content in the pulp and peel (20.41%), in contrast to the oil content in the seeds (8.82%). A higher CV% was observed in pulp oil (42.72%) and varied over a wide range, from 3.46 to 38.56%. The pulp fraction of berries of ssp. *mongolica* had the highest oil content (24.68%) based on dry weight. The lowest pulp oil content (7.10%) on average was found in the berries of ssp. *sinensis*. In hybrids, the berries of ZJ2 contained 27.22% pulp oil, which slightly exceeded that of ssp. *mongolica* on average (S6 Table). The seed oil content varied from 3.88 to 12.75% with an average of 8.82%. The seeds of ssp. *mongolica* had the highest oil contents, with an average of 9.46%, and those of the other two groups did not differ significantly.

Table 3. Oil characteristics of pulp and seeds of 78 sea buckthorn accessions (weight

percentages).

288 ^a Minimum value.

- 289 b Maximum value.
- 290 \cdot Standard deviation.
- 291 ^dCoefficient of variation expressed as a percentage.
- 292 e tr, trace (< 0.5%).

Table 4. Oil content and fatty acid composition in the seeds and fruit pulp of sea buckthorn berries of different origins^a 293 **(weight percentages)***.*

294 a Values with different lowercase letters (a–c) are significantly different at $p < 0.05$.

295 b tr, trace $(< 0.5\%)$.

Correlations among the agronomic traits and oil characteristics

Canonical analyses allow direct comparisons of two data matrices. All sea buckthorn

 accessions were represented in a two-dimensional space using CCA between phenotypic traits and oil characteristics (Fig 3). For berries of the two different subspecies and hybrid accessions, phenotypic characters (BLD, HBW, BSI, and BTD) 341 of berries and oil traits in pulp showed a close correlation ($r = 0.8725$, $p = 0.0000$). Based on CCA, accessions of ssp. *mongolica* were clustered on the upper side (mainly positive on D1 and D2), those of ssp. *sinensis* on the other, and the hybrids in the middle in Fig 3A. The positioning of samples in the first dimension was mostly related to 345 differences in their berry characteristics that were primarily provided by a marker of BLD. The second dimension indicated differences in the oil contents and FA compositions of pulp oil among sea buckthorn accessions. Differences between pulp oil traits were primarily related to percentages of oil content, 16:0 and 16:1n7, which were highest in ssp. *mongolica*, followed by hybrids, and lowest in ssp. *sinensis*. For seeds of 78 accessions, phenotypic characteristics (SL, SW, ST, and HSW) and seed oil 351 traits were correlated $(r = 0.7482, p = 0.0000)$. The positioning of samples was staggered (Fig 3B), which reflected that all seed samples had relatively little variation among phenotypic traits and oil characteristics. These results verified the previous analysis (Table 2 and Table 3).

 Fig 3. Canonical correspondence analysis of phenotypic traits (A. berry; B. seed) and oil characteristics (A. pulp oil; B. seed oil) of sea buckthorn germplasms. D1, Dimension 1; D2, 358 Dimension 2. \triangle = ssp. *mongolica*; \bullet = ssp. *sinensis*; \diamond = hybrid.

SSR diversity

 Twenty-three pairs of RNA-Seq SSR primers with good amplification and band stability were used in 78 accessions of sea buckthorn. A total of 69 bands were amplified using the 23 primer pairs, of which 59 were polymorphic, accounting for 85.51% of all bands. The number of amplified bands per locus ranged from 2 to 5, averaging 3, and Ne ranged from 1.0392 to 3.1049, averaging 1.6602 (Table 6). SB2, SB3, SB5, SB6, SB8, SB13, SB16 and SB23 were informative SSR loci, each revealing more than four effective alleles distributed among all of the accessions. Compared with Na, Ne and their average values were lower, which was caused by the uneven distribution of gene frequencies in SSR loci. In the genetic diversity analysis, Ho ranged from 0.0385 to 0.7949, with an average of 0.2965; He ranged from 0.0377 to 0.6779, with an average of 0.3291; and Is ranged from 0.0950 to 1.2152, with an average of 0.5681. The PIC value, regarded as discriminating power, varied from 0.0370 to 0.6174, 373 with an average of 0.2845. Loci SB6 (PIC = 0.6174) and SB8 (PIC = 0.5820) showed higher effectiveness because of their high informativity and could be used to construct 375 the fingerprint map of sea buckthorn germplasm. The characteristics of these 23 loci in the genetic diversity analysis of sea buckthorn germplasm are shown in Table 5.

-
- **Table 5. Characterization of 23 polymorphic SSR markers in the 78 sea buckthorn accessions.**
-

SB ₂	$\overline{4}$	1.1382	0.1282	0.1214	0.1166	0.2791
SB ₃	$\overline{4}$	2.2372	0.4615	0.5530	0.4627	0.9090
SB ₄	$\overline{2}$	1.5006	0.2692	0.3336	0.2779	0.5160
SB ₅	$\overline{4}$	2.1129	0.3333	0.5267	0.4735	0.9288
SB ₆	$\overline{4}$	3.1049	0.7051	0.6779	0.6174	1.2152
SB7	$\overline{2}$	1.0799	0.0769	0.0740	0.0712	0.1630
SB ₈	5	2.8490	0.3846	0.6490	0.5820	1.1890
SB ₉	$\overline{2}$	1.1509	0.1410	0.1311	0.1225	0.2550
SB10	3	1.5350	0.2949	0.3485	0.3114	0.6253
SB11	$\overline{2}$	1.9287	0.1667	0.4815	0.3656	0.6745
SB12	3	1.2430	0.2179	0.1955	0.1753	0.3687
SB13	$\overline{4}$	2.1644	0.4231	0.5380	0.4392	0.8687
SB14	2	1.9987	0.3077	0.4997	0.3750	0.6928
SB15	$\boldsymbol{2}$	1.0662	0.0641	0.0620	0.0601	0.1418
SB16	$\overline{4}$	1.4567	0.1923	0.3135	0.2956	0.6427
SB17	$\sqrt{2}$	1.4175	0.3590	0.2945	0.2512	0.4706
SB18	\overline{c}	1.0392	0.0385	0.0377	0.0370	0.0950
SB19	3	1.0804	0.0641	0.0744	0.0724	0.1804
SB20	$\boldsymbol{2}$	1.1803	0.1667	0.1528	0.1411	0.2868
SB21	3	1.9123	0.7308	0.4771	0.3802	0.7318
SB22	3	1.2905	0.2564	0.2251	0.2025	0.4084
SB ₂₃	$\overline{4}$	2.4239	0.7949	0.5874	0.5102	1.0284

380 Na, observed number of alleles; Ne, effective number of alleles; Ho, observed heterozygosity; He,

381 expected heterozygosity; PIC, polymorphism information content; Is, Shannon's information index.

Genetic relationships among sea buckthorn germplasm

 Using 23 polymorphic SSR markers, the UPGMA dendrogram based on the proportion of shared alleles was constructed to assess the genetic relationships between the 78 accessions (Fig 4). The results showed that all the accessions could be divided into two groups (I and II). The accessions of ssp. *sinensis* (JD, ZGSJ, MHC, ZGSJ^{*wild*}, JPDH and ZXY) were clustered into group I. These accessions had closer relationships, despite great geographic differences. The second group was divided into 3 subgroups, namely, IIa, IIb, and IIc. The 20 hybrid accessions were all clustered into IIa. Subgroups IIb and IIc contained all the accessions of ssp. *mongolica* (introduced from Russia and Mongolia). Subgroup IIb included 6 accessions, namely WCF, LS1, QYSK, FX, SR, and MZ14. The remaining accessions of ssp. *mongolica* were clustered into IIc. Among them, KTN, WLGM, HS4, HS9, HS10, HS12, HS14, HS18, HS20, HS22, WCF, FX and MZ14 composed one sub-subgroup. SJ3, ZYH, SD, NR, FL, XE2, XE3, JYH and YLSD12 showed close relationships. The other 23 accessions clustered into the third sub-subgroup. Overall, the relationship between ssp. *mongolica* and ssp. *sinensis* was relatively distant. The hybrids are close to ssp. *mongolica*, to which their female parents belonged.

 Fig. 4. UPGMA dendrogram of sea buckthorn germplasm based on SSR data (sample 402 **abbreviations described in Table 1).** \triangle = ssp. *mongolica*; \bullet = ssp. *sinensis*; \diamond = hybrid.

Discussion

 Morphological characteristics, biochemical traits, and microsatellite markers have been used for germplasm identification and genetic diversity analysis in many horticultural plants [26−27]. The diversity at the morphological, biochemical, and molecular levels of 78 sea buckthorn accessions, composed of 52 from ssp. *mongolica*, 6 from ssp. *sinensis*, and 20 hybrids, was investigated.

 The morphological characterization of plant materials with desired traits is an essential step for the effective use of germplasm [28]. Here, 8 important agronomic traits were measured among 78 sea buckthorn accessions, and a considerable amount of variation in morphological traits was found. The sizes of berries from the two different subspecies and hybrid accessions were significantly different according to the HBW value (*p* = 0.000). Compared to ssp. *sinensis* berries, ssp. *mongolica* berries were much larger on average. The berry size of hybrid accessions was between the two subspecies. In the PCA, we plotted 2D plots with PC1 and PC2 scores of phenotypes (Fig 2). PC1 was mainly related to BTD and HBW, which explained the largest portion of the variance in 78 accessions. The distribution of 78 accessions on PC1 and PC2 was consistent with their agronomic characteristics (Fig 2). These results estimating morphological traits are valuable tools for identifying variation among plant germplasms [26].

 For biochemical traits, oil content and FA composition in the seeds and seedless parts were selected for their important roles in human health. The oil of sea buckthorn seems to be a good source of unsaturated FAs. Seed oil is rich in PUFAs, including 426 linoleic and α -linolenic acids. The proportion of PUFAs did not differ significantly among berries from three origins, despite the differences in some morphological characteristics and in growth conditions. These results were consistent with previous 429 studies [10]. The results of the present study and previous investigations also suggested that the berries of ssp. *mongolica* were a good source of palmitic and palmitoleic acids in pulp oil and that those of ssp. *sinensis* were a good source of oleic acid in both seeds and fruit pulp [29]. Although carefully selected for intersubspecies crosses, some hybrids displayed elite oil traits. For example, the proportion of MUFAs in the pulp of SCY2 and of PUFAsin the seeds of 6 accessions(including ZJ1, Za1-2, Za13-25, Za05- 6, LFZ, and ZCY12) exceeded the average level of ssp. *mongolica* accessions, the subspecies that one of their parents belonged to. These results demonstrate the effectiveness of traditional cross breeding in the improvement of native accessions (ssp. *sinensis*), even though it is time-consuming and has low efficiency.

 Previous studies found that berry size is a useful indicator of Vc, sugars and acids in population identification [19, 30]. The nutrients in the seedless fraction were more concentrated in the small berries of ssp. *sinensis* than in the large berries of ssp. *mongolica* [29]. In the present study, we analyzed the correlation between agronomic characteristics and oil traits at different levels (seed and pulp) by CCA. The results showed that the phenotypic characteristics (BLD, HBW, BSI, and BTD) of berries and 445 the oil traits in pulp were positively correlated $(r = 0.8725, p = 0.0000)$. The BLD, as a promising marker, provided the primary difference in CCA. Our results illustrated that berry size had different correlations with various biochemical characteristics in sea buckthorn.

 Variation in phenotypic traits among germplasms may be attributed to differences in genetic backgrounds, geographical location, climate, harvest period and berry maturity, while molecular markers are independent of environmental condition and 452 growth stage [31]. Twenty-three polymorphic SSR markers were used to identify 78 sea buckthorn accessions. The 23 selected SSR markers detected 2–5 alleles, and their PIC values ranged from 0.1166 to 0.6155 and had an average of 0.3249. The PIC mean value was significantly lower than that of RAPD, ISSR and SRAP markers previously reported [15−16, 32], suggesting that the gene sequences of these SSR markers were conserved in sea buckthorn germplasm.

 Based on UPGMA, the 78 accessions were classified into two groups. There is a large genetic distance between accessions of ssp. *sinensis* and ssp. *mongolica*. The hybrids were in between and rather close to ssp. *mongolica* accessions. Coincidentally, these hybrids were also between ssp. *sinensis* and ssp. *mongolica* accessions on the 462 PCA plot based on 8 agronomic characteristics. This result illustrated that the diversity of morphological characteristics could reflect genetic diversity and be used as markers in agronomy. Ruan et al. [15] assessed 14 Chinese, Russian and Mongolian sea 465 buckthorn accessions using RAPD markers and obtained similar results. In a previous publication, the genetic relationship of 31 sea buckthorn accessions (also contained in this study) was analyzed based on 17 RNA-Seq SSRs [14]. However, the accessions of ssp. *mongolica* clustered in one group and those of ssp. *sinensis* and hybrids were divided in the other. This revealed that genetic relationships mainly relied on the diversity of genotypes and genetic backgrounds.

 With the continuous development of high-throughput sequencing technology, transcriptome databases have become a powerful resource for SSR mining. An increasing number of RNA-Seq SSRs have been developed and applied to the study of species genetic diversity and population genetic structure [33−34]. The SSRs obtained by transcriptomes are associated with many important quantitative traits [35].

 The results in the present study yielded useful knowledge regarding the diversity and genetic relationships of sea buckthorn germplasm in northern China, and could therefore facilitate further studies, including the selection of mapping populations and promising candidates, marker-trait association analysis based on establishing the consistency of the traits , and characterization of parents used in future breeding programs.

Conclusion

 In the present study, 8 phenotypic characteristics, oil traits in seeds and seedless parts, and 23 SSR markers successfully distinguished all 78 sea buckthorn accessions. In PCA, BTD and HBW in the first PC were the most important characteristics for distinguishing the accessions. The agronomic traits of berries were closely correlated with the oil content and FA composition in the pulp by CCA. This information will be valuable for germplasm identification and genotypic diversity analysis in *Hippophae rhamnoides*.

Supporting information

 S1 Fig. 78 berry samples used in this study. Numbers are the variety codes listed in Table 1.

- (TIF)
- **S2 Fig. Total ion flow chromatography of 37 FAMEs Mix (A) and FAMEs in pulp**
- **oil in MHC (B).**
- (TIF)
- **S1 Table. Samples of sea buckthorn grouped according to different genetic**
- **backgrounds.**
- (DOCX)
- **S2 Table. Characterization of the hybrids of sea buckthorn accessions studied.**
- (DOCX)
- **S3 Table. Climatic conditions at different growth sites of sea buckthorn samples**
- **in China.**
- (DOCX)
- **S4 Table. Primer sequences, annealing temperature, and estimated allelic size of**
- **23 SSR markers.**
- (DOCX)
- **S5 Table. Descriptive statistics for morphological traits of berries and seeds among**
- **the sea buckthorn accessions studied.**
- (DOCX)
- **S6 Table. The morphological characteristics and oil traits of pulp and seeds of the**
- **78 sea buckthorn accessions studied.**

(XLSX)

S7 Table. Fruit traits and Vc contents of large berry accessions of sea buckthorn

in two experimental fields (located in Suiling and Dengkou).

(DOCX)

- **S8 Table. Allele combinations obtained at the 20 microsatellite loci in 78 sea**
- **buckthorn accessions.**

(TXT)

Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful to Hai Guo (Jiuchenggong Breeding Base of Sea Buckthorn)

and Jun Zhang (Institute of Selection and Breeding of *Hippophae*) for the collection of

plant materials.

References

- 1. Bartish IV, Jeppsson N, Nybom H, Swenson U. Phylogeny of *Hippophae* (Elaeagnaceae) inferred
- from parsimony analysis of chloroplast DNA and morphology. Syst Bot. 2002; 27:41–54.

2. Swenson U and Bartish IV. Taxonomic synopsis of *Hippophae* (Elaeagnaceae). Nord J Bot. 2002;

22:369–374.

3. Teleszko M, Wojdyło A, Rudzińska M, Oszmiański J, Golis T. Analysis of Lipophilic and

Hydrophilic Bioactive Compounds Content in Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides* L.) Berries.

J Agric Food Chem. 2015; 63:4120−4129.

4. Pop MR, Weesepoel Y, Socaciu C, Pintea A, Vincken JP, Gruppen H. Carotenoid composition of

berries and leaves from six Romanian sea buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) varieties. Food

- Chem. 2014; 147:1−9.
- 5. Raffo A, Paoletti F, Antonelli M. Changes in sugar, organic acid, flavonol and carotenoid
- composition during ripening of berries of three seabuckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) cultivars.
- Eur Food Res Technol. 2004; 219:360−368.
- 6. Bal ML, Meda V, Naik NS, Satya S. Sea buckthorn: A potential source of valuable nutrients for nutraceuticals and cosmoceuticals. Food Res Int. 2011; 44:1718−1727.
- 7. Suryakumar G, Gupta A. Medicinal and therapeutic potential of Sea buckthorn (*Hippophae*
- *rhamnoides* L.). J Ethnopharmacol. 2011; 138:268−278.
- 8. Grey C, Widén C, Adlercreutz P, Rumpunen K, Duan RD. Antiproliferative effects of sea buckthorn
- (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) extracts on human colon and liver cancer cell lines. Food Chem.2010; 120: 1004−1010.
- 9. Xu YJ, Kaur M, Dhillon SR, Tappia SP, Dhalla SN. Health benefits of sea buckthorn for the
- prevention of cardiovascular diseases. J Func Foods. 2011; 3:2−12.
- 10. Yang B and Kallio H. Composition and Physiological Effects of Sea Buckthorn Lipids, Trends Food
- Sci Technol. 2002; 13:160–167.
- 11. Yang B and Kallio H. Fatty acid composition of lipids in sea buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides* L.)
- berries of different origins. J. Agric. Food Chem. 2001; 49:1939−1947.
- 12. Ruan CJ, Li H, Mopper S. Characterization and identification of ISSR markers associated with resistance to dried-shrink disease in sea buckthorn. Mol. Breeding. 2009; 24:255−268.
- 13. Ruan CJ, Teixeira da Silva JA, Jin H, Li H, Li DQ. Research and biotechnology in sea buckthorn
- (*Hippophae* spp.). Medicinal and Aromatic Plant Science and Biotechnology. 2007; 1: 47−60.
- 14. Li H, Ruan CJ, Wang L, Ding J, Tian XJ. Development of RNA-Seq SSR markers and application to genetic relationship analysis among sea buckthorn germplasm. J Amer Soc Hort Sci. 2017; 142(3):200-208.
- 15. Ruan CJ. Genetic relationships among some sea buckthorn cultivars from China, Russia and Mongolia using RAPD markers. Sci Hort. 2004; 101:417–426.
-
- 16. Li H, Ruan CJ, Teixeira da Silva J, Liu BQ. Associations of SRAP markers with dried-shrink disease
- resistance in a germplasm collection of sea buckthorn (*Hippophae* L.). Genome. 2010; 53:447–457.
- 17. Kalia RK, Rai MK, Kalia S, Singh R, Dhawan AK. Microsatellite markers: An overview of the
- recent progress in plants. Euphytica. 2011; 177:309–334.
- 18. Jain A, Chaudhary S, Sharma PC. Mining of microsatellites using next generation sequencing of seabuckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) transcriptome. Physiol. Mol. Biol. Plants. 2014; 20:115–
- 123.
- 19. Patricia RR, Carmen GB, Beatriz CG, Jesús SG, Isabel T. Genotypic and phenotypic identification of olive cultivars from northwestern Spain and characterization of their extra virgin olive oils in terms of fatty acid composition and minor compounds. Sci Hort. 2018;
- 232:269-279.
- 20. Tang X and Tigerstedt PMA. Variation of physical and chemical characters within an elite sea buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) breeding population. Sci. Hort. 2001; 88(3):203–214.
- 21. Christie WW. A simple procedure for rapid transmethylation of glycerolipids and cholesteryl esters.
- J Lipid Res. 1982; 23:1072-1075.
- 22. Peakall R and Smouse PE. GENALEX 6: Genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software
- 579 for teaching and research. Mol Ecol Notes. 2006; 6:288–295.
	-
- 23. Peakall R and Smouse PE. GenAlEx 6.5: Genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software for
- teaching and research An update. Bioinformatics. 2012; 28:2537–2539.
- 24. Liu K and Muse SV. PowerMarker: An integrated analysis environment for genetic marker analysis.
- Bioinformatics. 2005; 21:2128–2129.
- 25. Tamura SK, Peterson GD, Filipski A, Kumar S. MEGA6: Molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 6.0. Mol Biol Evol. 2013; 30:2725–2729.
- 26. Lee ON and Park HY. Assessment of genetic diversity in cultivated radishes (*Raphanus sativus*) by agronomic traits and SSR markers. Sci Hort. 2017; 223:19-30.
- 27. Goodarzi S, Khadivi A, Abbasifar A, Akramian M. Phenotypic, pomological and chemical
- variations of the seedless barberry (*Berberis vulgaris* L. var. asperma). Sci Hort. 2018; 238:38–50.
- 28. Santos RC, Pires JL, Correa RX. Morphological characterization of leaf, flower, fruit and seed traits
- among Brazilian *Theobroma* L. species. Genet. Resour. Crop Evol. 2012; 59:327–345.
- 29. Kallio H, Yang B, Peippo P, Tahvonen R, Pan R. Triacylglycerols, glycerophospholipids,
- tocopherols and tocotrienols in sea buckthorn *Hippophae rhamnoides* L. ssp. *sinensis* and ssp.

mongolica berries and seeds. J. Agric. Food Chem. 2002; 50:3004–3009.

- 30. Kallio H, Yang B, Peippo P. Effects of Different Origins and Harvesting Time on Vitamin C,
- Tocopherols, and Tocotrienols in Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae1 rhamnoides*) Berries. J. Agric. Food
- Chem. 2002; 50:6136−6142.
- 31. Ali M, Rajewski J, Baenziger P, Gill K, Eskridge KM, Dweikat I. Assessment of genetic diversity
- and relationship among a collection of US sweet sorghum germplasm by SSR markers. Mol. Breed.
- 2008; 21:497–509.
- 32. Li, H., C.J. Ruan, and J.A. Teixeira da Silva. 2009. Identification and genetic relationship based on
- ISSR analysis in a germplasm collection of sea buckthorn (*Hippophae* L.) from China and other countries. Sci. Hort. 123:263–271.
- 33. Liu YL, Zhang PF, Song ML, Hou JL, Qing M, Wang WQ, Liu CS. Transcriptome analysis and
- development of SSR molecular markers in *Glycyrrhiza uralensis* Fisch. PLoS One. 2015;
- 10:e0143017. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0143017
- 34. Zhang LW, Li YR, Tao AF, Fang PP, Qi JM. Development and characterization of 1,906 EST-SSR
- markers from unigenes in jute (*Corchorus* spp.), PLoS One. 2015; 10(10):e0140861.
- doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140861
- 35. Ramchiary N, Nguyen VD, Li X, Hong CP, Dhandapani V, Choi SR, et al. Genic microsatellite
- markers in *Brassica rapa*: Development, characterization, mapping, and their utility in other
- cultivated and wild *Brassica* relatives. DNA Res. 2011; 18:305–320.

Supporting Information - Compressed/ZIP File Archive

Click here to access/download [Supporting Information - Compressed/ZIP File Archive](https://www.editorialmanager.com/pone/download.aspx?id=25924793&guid=6604269b-2311-4496-98bc-4acc241e3313&scheme=1) Supporting Information.zip