Supplementary Information

Proxy evidence for state-dependence of climate sensitivity in the Eocene greenhouse

by Anagnostou et al.



Supplementary Figure 1: Compilation of multi-site  $\delta^{11}$ B-derived CO<sub>2</sub> for the Eocene. The Middle Eocene Climatic Optimum (MECO)<sup>3</sup>, Eocene Thermal Maximum 2 (ETM2)<sup>4</sup> and Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM)<sup>4,5</sup> records were reprocessed, as described in the Methods, to be consistent with the rest of the data in the time series. The line and shaded region represent LOESS curve and its 95% confidence. All data and errors are summarized in Supplementary Data 1 and 3.



Supplementary Figure 2: Transfer functions between Global Mean Temperature (GMT) tie points and either the ODP 959 TEX<sub>86</sub> record (black), or the tropical Sea Surface Temperature (SST) compilation (red). All data are summarized in Ref. <sup>6</sup>, and also shown in Supplementary Fig. 5.



Supplementary Figure 3: Compilation of CO<sub>2</sub> records for the Eocene. Data are from the compilation in Ref. <sup>7</sup>, including the new  $\delta^{11}$ B-derived CO<sub>2</sub> in this study and in Refs. <sup>3-5</sup>, phytane-CO<sub>2</sub> <sup>8</sup>, and stomata-CO<sub>2</sub> <sup>9</sup>. Note that the Nahcolite estimates best represent a minimum in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Lines and shaded envelopes represent LOESS curves and their 95% confidence for the compilation in Ref. <sup>7</sup> (purple and blue) and the compilation from foraminiferal  $\delta^{11}$ B in this study (green and orange).



**Supplementary Figure 4: Age model used for ODP Site 865B in this study.** The model is based on a linear fit through planktonic foraminiferal datums of Ref. <sup>10</sup> as modified here (Supplementary Table 1).



**Supplementary Figure 5: Derived GMT time series for the Eocene.** Brown symbols are based on the ODP 959 TEX<sub>86</sub> record<sup>6</sup>. The green circles are based on the tropical compilation of Ref. <sup>6</sup>, which includes Ref. <sup>6,11-20</sup>. Brown symbols are on the Ref. <sup>21</sup> age model. Blue symbols are the same as the brown but on the GTS2012 <sup>22</sup> age model, demonstrating the magnitude of potential misalignment due to the age model chosen. Error bars represent 1 s.d. uncertainties.

Planktonic foraminifera datum	Mean datum depth (mbsf)	Age (Ma) GTS2012 (± 0.169)
Top <i>Globigerinatheka semiinvoluta</i> <sup>10</sup>	20.35	36.18
Base Turborotalia cunialensis	21.81	35.71
Base G. semiinvoluta	26.3	38.62
Top <i>Orbulinoides beckmann</i> i <sup>10</sup>	33.63	40.03
Base <i>O. beckmanni</i> <sup>10</sup>	37.91	40.49
Top Morozovella aragonensis	48.88	43.26
Base M. lehneri	59.25	43.15
Base G. kugleri	61.28	43.88
Base T. frontosa <sup>10</sup>	73.94	48.31
Base Astrorotalia palmerae <sup>10</sup>	78.15	50.2
Base Acarinina cuneicamerata	81.81	50.2
Top M. subbotinae	85.35	50.67
Base M. aragonensis	94.85	52.54

Supplementary Table 1: Age model for ODP Site 865B. Planktonic foraminiferal datums,

mean datum core depths, and GTS2012 datum ages.

## **Supplementary References**

- 1. Anagnostou, E. *et al.* Changing atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was the primary driver of early Cenozoic climate. *Nature* **533**, 380-384 (2016).
- 2. Pearson, P. N., Foster, G. L. & Wade, B. S. Atmospheric carbon dioxide through the Eocene-Oligocene climate transition. *Nature* **461**, 1110-1113 (2009).
- Henehan, M.J. *et al.* Revisiting the Middle Eocene Climatic Optimum 'Carbon Cycle Conundrum' with new estimates of atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> from boron isotopes. *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 35, e2019PA003713 (2020).
- Harper, D. T. *et al.* The magnitude of surface ocean acidification and carbon release during Eocene Thermal Maximum 2 (ETM-2) and the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM). *Paleoceanogr. Paleoclimatol.* 35, e2019PA003699 (2020).
- Gutjahr, M. *et al.* Very large release of mostly volcanic carbon during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum. *Nature* 548, 573-577 (2017).
- 6. Cramwinckel, M. J. *et al.* Synchronous tropical and polar temperature evolution in the Eocene. *Nature* **559**, 382-386 (2018).
- 7. Foster, G. L., Royer, D. L. & Lunt, D. J. Future climate forcing potentially without precedent in the last 420 million years. *Nat. Commun.* **8**, 14845 (2017).
- 8. Witkowski, C. R. *et al.* Molecular fossils from phytoplankton reveal secular Pco<sub>2</sub> trend over the Phanerozoic. *Sci. Adv.* **4**, eaat4556 (2018).
- 9. Wolfe, A. P. *et al.* Middle Eocene CO<sub>2</sub> and climate reconstructed from the sediment fill of a subarctic kimberlite maar. *Geology* **45**, 619-622 (2017).
- 10. Coxall, H. K. *Hantkeninid Planktonic Foraminifera And Eocene Palaeoceanographic Change*. PhD thesis (University of Bristol, Bristol, 2000).
- 11. Evans, D. *et al.* Eocene greenhouse climate revealed by coupled clumped isotope-Mg/Ca thermometry. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* **115**, 1174 (2018).
- Pearson, P. N. *et al.* Stable warm tropical climate through the Eocene Epoch. *Geology* 35, 211-214 (2007).
- Liu, Z. *et al.* Global cooling during the Eocene-Oligocene climate Transition. *Science* 323, 1187-1190 (2009).
- 14. Zhang, Y. G., Pagani, M., Liu, Z., Bohaty, S. M. & DeConto, R. A 40-million-year history of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Phil Trans Royal Soc A* **371**, 20130096 (2013).

- Pearson, P. N. & Burgess, C. E. Foraminifer test preservation and diagenesis: Comparison of high latitude Eocene sites. *Special Publications* 303, 59-72 (The Geological Society, London, 2008).
- Lear, C. H., Bailey, T. R., Pearson, P. N., Coxall, H. K. & Rosenthal, Y. Cooling and ice growth across the Eocene-Oligocene transition. *Geology* 36, 251-254 (2008).
- 17. Inglis, G. N. *et al.* Descent towards the Icehouse: Eocene sea surface cooling inferred from GDGT distributions. *Paleoceanography* **30**, 1000–1020 (2015).
- Tripati, A. K. *et al.* Tropical sea-surface temperature reconstruction for the early Paleogene using Mg/Ca ratios of planktonic foraminifera. *Paleoceanography* 18, 1101 (2003).
- 19. Frieling, J. *et al.* Extreme warmth and heat-stressed plankton in the tropics during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum. *Sci. Adv.* **3**, e1600891 (2017).
- 20. Frieling, J. *et al.* Tropical Atlantic climate and ecosystem regime shifts during the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum. *Clim. Past* **14**, 39-55 (2018).
- Westerhold, T. *et al.* Astronomical calibration of the Ypresian timescale: implications for seafloor spreading rates and the chaotic behavior of the solar system? *Clim. Past* 13, 1129-1152 (2017).
- 22. Gradstein, F. M. et al. The Geologic Time Scale, (Boston, USA, Elsevier, 2012).