Science Advances NAAAS

advances.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/7/2/eaba9958/DC1

Supplementary Materials for

Thermal stress reduces pocilloporid coral resilience to ocean acidification by impairing control over calcifying fluid chemistry

Maxence Guillermic*, Louise P. Cameron, Ilian De Corte, Sambuddha Misra, Jelle Bijma, Dirk de Beer, Claire E. Reymond, Hildegard Westphal, Justin B. Ries, Robert A. Eagle*

*Corresponding author. Email: maxence.guillermic@gmail.com (M.G.); robeagle@g.ucla.edu (R.A.E.)

Published 8 January 2021, *Sci. Adv.* **7**, eaba9958 (2021) DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.aba9958

This PDF file includes:

Supplementary Materials and Methods Tables S1 to S6 Figs. S1 to S3 References

Tables

Table S1: Calculations of $[CO_3^2]_{cf}$ and DIC_{cf} using the K_D definition from *(10)*, 'M17', from *(33)*, 'H16', and from *(8)*, 'newEq'. Calculations were done using Matlab code from *(8)*.

Table S2: Microelectrode derived measurements of pH_{cf} in the light and dark.

Table S3: Reproducibility of boron isotope analyses in standards.

Table S4: Reproducibility of X/Ca analyses in CamWuellestorfi standard.

Table S5: $\delta^{11}B$ composition of seawater from the experimental treatments. $\delta^{11}B_1$ and $\delta^{11}B_2$ were purified using column chemistry and $\delta^{11}B_3$ and $\delta^{11}B_4$ were purified through microdistillation.

Table S6: Test of significant differences between treatment conditions (unpaired t-test with Welch's correction).

Table S7: Elemental ratios Li/Ca, Mg/Ca and Sr/Ca measured in this study for *P. damicornis* and *S. pistillata*.

Figures

Figure S1: Comparison between boron derived carbonate parameters of the calcifying fluid based different K_D formulations and independent measurements. Comparison of carbonate parameters calculated from boron proxies with different K_D ((10) 'M17', (33) 'H16', *(8)* 'new eq') and independent measurements for *S. pistillata* (**A**, **B**, **C**) and *P. damicornis* (**D, E**). Carbonate ion concentration of the calcifying fluid ($[CO₃²]_{cf}$), dissolved inorganic carbon of the calcifying fluid (DIC_{cf}), saturation state of aragonite of the calcifying fluid (Q_{cf}) . **A** and **E**: $[CO_3^2]$ _{cf}; **B**: DIC_{cf}; **C** and **D**: Ω_{cf} . For *S. pistillata* (**A**, **B**, **C**). The data reported here are from the control treatment ($pCO_2 \sim 400$ ppm). The carbonate parameters are in the range of independent LIX microelectrode measurements from *(32)*. For *P. damicornis*, independent measurements based on Raman spectroscopy *(61)* are consistent with data from 'M17' using [Ca]_{cf}=[Ca]_{sw}. Recalculating [CO₃²]_{cf} with the K_D definition from (34) ('A17', **E**) and data from (61) yields values that are greater than in 'A17', but similar to estimates of $[CO₃²]_{cf}$ from (9). Independent measurements of $[CO₃²]_{cf}$ (e.g., via LIX microelectrode) do not presently exist for *P. damicornis* but would help refine the B/Ca proxy of $[CO₃²]_{cf}$ and identify optimal K_D formulation. Error bars represent 1 standard deviation from the mean.

Figure S2: Analytical δ ¹¹B comparison between the University of Cambridge and the Alfred Wagner Institute. Two-independent measurements of $\delta^{11}B$ for *S. pistillata* carried out at the University of Cambridge ('Uni. Cambridge') and at the Alfred Wagner Institute ('AWI'). Regression comparing results from the two labs are not significantly different from the 1:1 line (p>0.05; Welch-t test). These results cross-validate the $\delta^{11}B$ analytical procedures of both laboratories and show that the reported $\delta^{11}B$ values are reproducible by independent laboratories at the 95% confidence level. Error bars represent 2 standard deviation from the mean.

Figure S3: B/Ca and δ¹¹B measured in this study. Analytical results relative to treatment seawater pH (pH_{sw}) (blue squares: 28 $^{\circ}$ C, red triangles: 31 $^{\circ}$ C). A and B: show B/Ca for *P*. *damicornis* and *S. pistillata*, respectively. C and D show $\delta^{11}B$ for *P. damicornis* and *S. pistillata*, respectively. Error bars represent 1 standard error, envelops represent 95% confidence interval of the linear regressions.

Materials and methods

Measurement of calcifying fluid pH with proton-sensitive LIX microelectrodes

Microelectrode measurements of coral calcifying fluid pH were conducted by Louise Cameron, Claire Reymond, and Justin Ries at the MAREE marine experimental facility at the Leibniz Center for Tropical Marine Research (Bremen, Germany) *(7).*

Calcifying fluid pH was measured using pH-sensitive liquid ion-exchanger (LIX) microelectrodes produced at the Max Planck Institute for Marine Microbiology (MPIMM) using the technique described in *(76)*. Briefly, green soda lime glass microcapillary tubes (*Schott* model 8516) were held in a heated coil and pulled to a target tip diameter of ca. 10 μ m, yielding final diameters of $8 - 20 \mu m$. These were then silanized to obtain a hydrophobic surface that allowed the adhesion of the LIX membrane. The microcapillary tubes were filled with ca. 300 μ m of degassed, filtered electrolyte (300 mM KCl, 50 mM sodium phosphate adjusted to pH 7.0) using a plastic syringe with a 0.1-mm tip. The microcapillary tubes were then backfilled with LIX containing a polyvinyl chloride (PVC) epoxy to prevent leakage of electrolyte by submerging the tips of the microcapillary tubes in LIX and apply suction to the other end of the tube until the PVC-containing LIX was drawn into the tip of the microcapillary by 100 – 200 µm. Microcapillary tubes were encased in a Pasteur pipette for shielding, with the pulled tip of the microcapillary tube protruding ca. 2 cm beyond this casing. This casing was filled with a 0.3 M KCl solution and connected to the reference electrode with an Ag/AgCl wire to minimize electrical noise. Microelectrodes were left for 24 hours after construction to allow for stabilization of the LIX membranes.

All microelectrode equipment (millivolt meter, National Instruments DAQ Pad 6020E, laptop, cables, micromanipulator, VT80 Micos motor arm, lab stands, Zeiss Stemi SV6 binocular microscope) was set up adjacent to the experimental tanks to minimize transport stress for the corals. Two reservoirs of seawater, sourced from the corresponding experimental treatment tanks, were established next to the microelectrode system. These reservoirs were bubbled with the corresponding treatment gases and maintained at the corresponding treatment temperature using aquarium heaters or chillers. The seawater was circulated between the two reservoirs through two 5.4 L flow-through chambers (30 x 12 x 15 cm). All pH microelectrode measurements were performed within these smaller flow-through chambers. All corals were transferred to flow-through chambers filled with treatment seawater and light levels were maintained at 150 lux. All corals were acclimated to the microelectrode chamber until polyp extension was observed prior to measurements (minimum of 10 minutes). Measurements of calcifying fluid pH were perfomed on three replicate individuals per treatment. One measurement was obtained for each coral specimen.

The proton-sensitive LIX microelectrodes were used to measure both seawater and calcifying fluid pH. Before and after measurement of calcifying fluid pH, all microelectrodes were calibrated at the treatment temperature with pH 7 and 9 NBS buffers (for slope of the calibration) and a Dickson seawater CRM (for intercept of the calibration; with pH calculated from the certified values). The vertical position of the microelectrode was controlled to onemicron precision using a motorized micromanipulator. The microelectrodes were slowly inserted through the coral tissue into the upper portion of the coral calyx, between septal ridges and proximal to the thecal wall, until the skeleton was reached. A vertical pH profile was then obtained by moving the microelectrode out of the calyx into the adjacent seawater. This profile was obtained in 1 μ m steps for the first 20 μ m, followed by 5 μ m steps out into the surrounding seawater.

The calibration and microelectrode pH data were processed by parsing scatterplots of the data into three zones, which were annotated at the time of data collection. The calibration data were parsed as pH 7 buffer, pH 9 buffer, and Dickson CRM . The microelectrode pH data were parsed as calcifying fluid, tissue, and seawater. Notes recorded during the original measurements were used to assist in identifying boundaries of adjacent zones. Measured mV within each zone of the calcifying fluid measurements were converted to pH using the calibration regression produced for each microelectrode.

Calcification rate measurements

Calcification rates were obtained using the buoyant weight technique *(77)* by Louise Cameron, Claire Reymond, and Justin Ries at the MAREE marine experimental facility at the Leibniz Center for Tropical Marine Research (Bremen, Germany) *(7)*.

Coral fragments were hung by their stands from a hook suspended from a bottom loading scale (Mettler Toledo, precision $= 0.01$ g). All measurements took place within a seawater bath of constant temperature and salinity. Fragments were weighed three times to obtain a mean weight, and a standard of known weight was measured every 5 samples to ensure that the scale was functioning properly (i.e. no instrumental drift). Buoyant weights were obtained during the first three days of the experimental period, and the last three days. Immediately after the final weight was taken, corals were removed from their treatment tanks and their tissue was removed using a gas duster. Corals skeletons were soaked twice in 90% ethanol to remove any salts, and were then dried in ambient air (20 °C) for two days. Dry skeletons were then weighed using the same scale. The relationship between the dry and buoyant weight of coral skeletons was empirically defined by plotting the dry weight against their final buoyant weight (Figure S1). This relationship can be defined for the species in this experiment using the following algorithms:

1) *Stylophora pistillata:* Dry weight (g) = 1.919 x Buoyant Weight + 7.677

2) *Pocillopora damicornis:* Dry weight (g) = 1.662 x Buoyant Weight + 8.777

where the precision of the buoyant weight of coral specimens as an estimator of their dry weight is equivalent to the standard error of the regression (*Stylophora pistillata:* 0.060 g; *Pocillopora damicornis:* 0.053 g). These empirically derived relationships were then used to calculate dry weight at the start of the experimental period, and net calcification was calculated as: [dry weight (end) – dry weight (start)] / [dry weight (start)].

Geochemical analyses Sample preparation

Cleaning was performed following *(83)*. Insoluble particles were removed after separation of clay from the sample. Due to high organic matter content, a double oxidative step was performed using H_2O_2 . A weak acid leach was also performed using 0.001N HCl. Pristine carbonates were then dissolved in 1N double-distilled HCl.

Boron isotopes

B isotopes variations are expressed in conventional delta (δ) notation (eq. S1) and are reported versus the NIST SRM 951 (84).

$$
\delta^{11}B (^{\%}o) = 1000 \times \left(\frac{^{11}B^{/10}B_{Sample}}{^{11}B^{/10}B_{NIST 951 \text{--}a}} - 1 \right) \tag{S1}
$$

 $B(OH)_3$ is enriched in ¹¹B compared to $B(OH)_4$ ⁻ with a constant offset between the two chemical species given by the fraction factor (α). This fractionation factor (α) between B(OH)₃ and $B(OH)₄$ of 27.2 \pm 0.6 ‰ has been empirically determined by *(82)* in seawater and confirmed by an independent method by *(85).*

Boron purification was achieved via microdistillation *(78, 86, 87, 88, 89)*. The recovered distillate was diluted with 0.5% HF to a final B concentration matching the liquid standards to avoid matrix effects. Boron isotopic measurements were carried out on a Thermo Scientific ®Neptune Plus MC-ICP-MS at the University of Cambridge configured with $10^{13} \Omega$ resistance (91).

Seawater samples were prepared using column chemistry and analyzed at the Pôle Spectrométrie Océan (PSO), Plouzané. pH of the samples was elevated to 8-9. Five mL of Amberlite IRA-743 (Rohm and Hass[®], Philadelphia, PA, USA) was cleaned and conditioned using 2% HNO₃ followed by MQ water buffered at pH 9. 200 μ L of seawater was loaded onto the resin. The matrix was then eluted using 2ml of MO water pH 9, 1ml NaNO₃ (0.6N, pH9), and 5ml MQ water of pH 9. Boron was then recovered using 2.5 mL of 2% HNO₃. Na and S was removed to avoid matrix effects. A few seawater samples were also prepared using microdistillation to allow for comparison between methods.

Data quality was controlled by analyzing external standards, the NEP internal coral standard (Porites sp., $\delta^{11}B = 26.12 \pm 0.92$ ‰, 2SD, n=33; *(35, 80)*, Table S3) from University of Western Australia/Australian National University and the JCp-1 (Porites sp., $\delta^{11}B = 24.37$ ± 0.32 ‰, 2SD, n=57 *(80)*, Table S3) from the Geological Survey of Japan. The certified boron isotope liquid standard ERM[©] AE121 ($\delta^{11}B = 19.88 \pm 0.3\%$, certified) was used to monitor reproducibility and drift during each session.

Samples measured for boron isotopes typically ranged from 10 ppb B (\sim 5 ng B) to 20 ppb B samples (~10 ng B). Sensitivity was 8 mV/ppb B (e.g., 80 mV for 10ppb B) in wet plasma at 50µl/min sample aspiration rate. Procedural borotn blanks ranged from 15pg B to 65 pg B and the acid blank during analyses was measured at $1mV$ on the ^{11}B , indicating a blank contribution of <1% of the sample signal with no memory effect within and across sessions. External reproducibility was ensured by the measurements of carbonate standard sublimated at the same time as the samples. Results for the isotopic composition of the NEP is $\delta^{11}B_{\text{NEP}}$ =25.71 ± 0.79 ‰ (2 SD, n=22, over 8 analytical sessions with each number representing an *abinitio* processed sample). Our results are within error of published values of 25.80 ± 0.89 % (35). Results for JC_P-1 is $\delta^{11}B_{JCh-1} = 24.06 \pm 0.19$ % (2 SD, n=6, over 6 analytical sessions with each number representing an *ab initio* processed sample), within error of published values of 24.37 ± 0.32 ‰ *(80)* and 24.42 ± 0.28 ‰ *(35)*.

Boron isotope $(\delta^{11}B)$ analyses of *S. pistillata* specimens were also performed independently at AWI (Bremerhaven, Germany). Coral samples were washed at least six times in MilliQ water and two times in methanol, and subsequently oxidized in buffered 1% H₂O₂ to remove organic material. Samples were then leached in 0.001 N HNO₃ to remove any adsorbed contaminants, and finally dissolved 1 N HNO3. Boron in the dissolved samples was separated from the matrix using the microdistillation technique. Boron isotope analyses were performed at AWI with a Nu Plasma II MC-ICP-MS equipped with a customized detector array including six secondary electron multipliers (SEM), where high-mass IC5 was used for ^{11}B and IC0 for $10B$. The standard-sample-bracketing technique was used to correct for the instrumental mass bias and drift using the boron reference material NBS 951. Boron conentrations of samples and standards were matched to within \pm 5% to ensure that plasma conditions and the background contribution to the signal are similar between samples and standards. Each micro-distilled sample was analyzed in triplicate where at least two measurements were used for averaging the $δ¹¹B_{Cc}$. Error is specified as 2 $σ$ (2 standard errors) of the mean derived from the replicates, accounting for ∼95% of the data. The long-term instrumental uncertainty is monitored by frequent analysis of a control standard (AE121) that was run six times with each batch of samples. If the 2σ from sample replicates was smaller than the long-term instrumental uncertainty of \pm 0.30, the latter was reported as the measurement uncertainty. More detailed information on sample separation and analytical procedures is available in *(90).*

Unpaired t-tests with Welch's correction showed that values of seawater $\delta^{11}B$ measured by both were not significantly different amongst treatments (p>0.05; Table S6).

* NS: non systematic error (SE) calculated using a Monte Carlo simulation taking into account uncertainties associated with $\delta^{11}B$, B/Ca, temperature and salinity

**S: systematic error (SE) calculated using a Monte Carlo simulation taking into account uncertainties associated with $\delta^{11}B_{sw}$ fractionation α , total [B] and pKB (see (δ))

Table S5

δ 11B

 $*$ Purification using columns chemistry (see text), δ 112 B measured at the university of Brest.

** Purification using microsublimation (see text), δ11 B measured at the university of Cambridge.

Temperature 28°C vs 31°C experiments

CULTURE CONDITIONS

 * "Uncertainty is calculated as 2 SD of repeated measurements of the CamWuellestorfi standard.

S. pistillata

Figure S1: Comparison between boron derived carbonate parameters of the calcifying fluid based different K_D formulations and independent measurements. Comparison of carbonate parameters calculated from boron proxies with different K_D $((10)$ 'M17', (33) 'H16', (8) 'new eq') and independent measurements for *S. pistillata* (**A**, **B**, **C**) and *P. damicornis* (**D, E**). Carbonate ion concentration of the calcifying fluid ($[CO₃²$]_{cf}), dissolved inorganic carbon of the calcifying fluid (DIC_{cf}), saturation state of aragonite of the calcifying fluid (Ω_{cf}). **A** and **E**: [CO₃²⁻]_{cf}; **B**: DIC_{cf}; **C** and **D**: $\Omega_{\rm cf}$. For *S. pistillata* (**A**, **B**, **C**). The data reported here are from the control treatment (pCO₂ ~400) ppm). The carbonate parameters are in the range of independent LIX microelectrode measurements from *(32)*. For *P. damicornis*, independent measurements based on Raman spectroscopy *(61)* are consistent with data from 'M17' using $[Ca]_{\text{cr}}=[Ca]_{\text{sw}}$. Recalculating $[CO_3^2]_{\text{cf}}$ with the K_D definition from *(34)* ('A17', **E**) and data from (61) yields values that are greater than in 'A17', but similar to estimates of $[CO_3^2]$ _{cf} from (9). Independent measurements of $[CO_3^2]$ _{cf} (e.g., via LIX microelectrode) do not presently exist for *P. damicornis* but would help refine the B/Ca proxy of $[CO₃²]_{cf}$ and identify optimal K_D formulation. Error bars represent 1 standard deviation from the mean.

Figure S2: Analytical δ ¹¹B comparison between the University of Cambridge and the Alfred Wagner Institute. Two-independent measurements of $\delta^{11}B$ for *S*. *pistillata* carried out at the University of Cambridge ('Uni. Cambridge') and at the Alfred Wagner Institute ('AWI'). Regression comparing results from the two labs are not significantly different from the 1:1 line (p>0.05; Welch-t test). These results cross-validate the δ^{11} B analytical procedures of both laboratories and show that the reported δ^{11} B values are reproducible by independent laboratories at the 95% confidence level. Error bars represent 2 standard deviation from the mean.

Figure S3: B/Ca and δ¹¹B measured in this study. Analytical results relative to treatment seawater pH (pH_{sw}) (blue squares: 28° C, red triangles: 31° C). A and B: show B/Ca for *P. damicornis* and *S. pistillata*, respectively. C and D show $\delta^{11}B$ for *P. damicornis* and *S. pistillata*, respectively. Error bars represent 1 standard error, envelops represent 95% confidence interval of the linear regressions.

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- 1. T. P. Hughes, K. D. Anderson, S. R. Connolly, S. F. Heron, J. T. Kerry, J. M. Lough, A. H. Baird, J. K. Baum, M. L. Berumen, T. C. Bridge, D. C. Claar, C. M. Eakin, J. P. Gilmour, N. A. J. Graham, H. Harrison, J. P. A. Hobbs, A. S. Hoey, M. Hoogenboom, R. J. Lowe, M. T. McCulloch, J. M. Pandolfi, M. Pratchett, V. G. Schoepf, Torda, S. K Wilson, Spatial and temporal patterns of mass bleaching of corals in the Anthropocene. *Science* **359**, 80–83 (2018).
- 2. A. C. Baker, P. W. Glynn, B. Riegl, Climate change and coral reef bleaching: An ecological assessment of long-term impacts, recovery trends and future outlook. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci.***80**, 435–471 (2008).
- 3. S. Reynaud, N. Leclercq, S. Romaine-Lioud, C. Ferrier-Pagés, J. Jaubert, J. P. Gattuso, Interacting effects of CO₂ partial pressure and temperature on photosynthesis and calcification in a scleractinian coral. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **9**, 1660–1668 (2003).
- 4. K. R. N. Anthony, D. I. Kline, G. Diaz-Pulido, S. Dove, O. Hoegh-Guldberg, Ocean acidification causes bleaching and productivity loss in coral reef builders. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **105**, 17442–17446 (2008).
- 5. R. Rodolfo-Metalpa, F. Houlbrèque, É. Tambutté, F. Boisson, C. Baggini, F. P. Patti, R. Jeffree, M. Fine, A. Foggo, J.-P. Gattuso, J. M. Hall-Spencer, Coral and mollusc resistance to ocean acidification adversely affected by warming. *Nat. Clim. Change* **1**, 308–312 (2011).
- 6. A. L. Cohen, T. A. McConnaughey, Geochemical perspectives on coral mineralization. *Rev. Mineral. Geochem.* **54**, 151–187 (2003).
- 7. L. P. Cameron, C. Reymond, J. Bijma, J. Büscher, D. De Beer, R. T. Eagle, Symbiont-assisted calcifying fluid pH elevation aids coral resilience to ocean acidification. *In review* (2020).
- 8. T. M. DeCarlo, M. Holcomb, M. T. McCulloch, Reviews and syntheses: Revisiting the boron systematics of aragonite and their application to coral calcification. *Biogeosciences* **15**, 2819–2834 (2018b).
- 9. S. Comeau, C. E. Cornwall, M. T. McCulloch, Decoupling between the response of coral calcifying fluid pH and calcification to ocean acidification. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 7573 (2017a).
- 10. M. T. McCulloch, J. P. D'Olivo, J. Falter, M. Holcomb, J. A. Trotter, Coral calcification in a changing world and the interactive dynamics of pH and DIC upregulation. *Nat. Commun.* **8**, 15686 (2017).
- 11. *IPCC: Climate Change 2014—The Physical Science Basis*, Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, Ed., (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2014).
- 12. D. Allemand, C. Ferrier-Pagès, P. Furla, F. Houlbrèque, S. Puverel, S. Reynaud, É. Tambutté, S. Tambutté, D. Zoccola, Biomineralisation in reef-building corals: From molecular mechanisms to environmental control. *Comptes Rendus Palevol* **3**, 453–467 (2004).
- 13. J. Erez, The source of ions for biomineralization in foraminifera and their implications for paleoceanographic proxies. *Rev. Mineral. Geochemistry* **54**, 115–149 (2003).
- 14. J. B. Ries, A physicochemical framework for interpreting the biological calcification response to CO2-induced ocean acidification. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **75**, 4053–4064 (2011).
- 15. T. A. McConnaughey, R. H. Falk, Calcium-proton exchange during algal calcification. *Biol. Bull.* **180**, 185–195 (1991).
- 16. P. Furla, I. Galgani, I. Durand, D. Allemand, Sources and mechanisms of inorganic carbon transport for coral calcification and photosynthesis. *J. Exp. Biol.* **203**, 3445–3457 (2000).
- 17. D. Zoccola, P. Ganot, A. Bertucci, N. Caminiti-Segonds, N. Techer, C. R. Voolstra, M. Aranda, E. Tambutté, D. Allemand, J. R. Casey, S. Tambutté, Bicarbonate transporters in corals point towards a key step in the evolution of cnidarian calcification. *Sci. Rep.* **5**, 9983 (2015).
- 18. A. Moya, S. Tambutté, A. Bertucci, E. Tambutté, S. Lotto, D. Vullo, C. T. Supuran, D. Allemand, D. Zoccola, Carbonic anhydrase in the scleractinian coral *Stylophora pistillata*: Characterization, localization, and role in biomineralization. *J. Biol. Chem.* **283**, 25475– 25484 (2008).
- 19. N. Allison, I. Cohen, A. A. Finch, J. Erez, A. W. Tudhope, Corals concentrate dissolved inorganic carbon to facilitate calcification. *Nat. Commun.* **5**, 5741 (2014).
- 20. S. Von Euw, Q. Zhang, V. Manichev, N. Murali, J. Gross, L. C. Feldman, T. Gustafsson, C. Flach, R. Mendelsohn, P. G. Falkowski, Biological control of aragonite formation in stony corals. *Science* **356**, 933–938 (2017).
- 21. J. L. Drake, M. F. Schaller, T. Mass, L. Godfrey, A. Fu, R. M. Sherrell, Y. Rosenthal, P. G. Falkowski, Molecular and geochemical perspectives on the influence of $CO₂$ on calcification in coral cell cultures. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **63**, 107–121 (2018).
- 22. T. Mass, A. J. Giuffre, C.-Y. Sun, C. A. Stifler, M. J. Frazier, M. Neder, N. Tamura, C. V. Stad, M. A. Marcus, P. U. P. A. Gilbert, Amorphous calcium carbonate particles form coral skeletons. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **114**, E7670–E7678 (2017b).
- 23. A. Akiva, M. Neder, K. Kahil, R. Gavriel, I. Pinkas, G. Goobes, T. Mass, Minerals in the pre-settled coral *Stylophora pistillata* crystallize via protein and ion changes. *Nat. Commun.* **9**, 1880 (2018).
- 24. A. Venn, E. Tambutté, M. Holcomb, D. Allemand, S. Tambutté, Live tissue imaging shows reef corals elevate pH under their calcifying tissue relative to seawater. *PLOS ONE* **6**, e20013 (2011).
- 25. A. J. Giuffre, A. C. Gagnon, J. J. De Yoreo, P. M. Dove, Isotopic tracer evidence for the amorphous calcium carbonate to calcite transformation by dissolution–reprecipitation. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **165**, 407–417 (2015).
- 26. T. M. DeCarlo, Characterizing coral skeleton mineralogy with Raman spectroscopy. *Nat. Commun.* **9**, 5325 (2018).
- 27. A. Akiva, M. Neder, K. Kahil, R. Gavriel, I. Pinkas, G. Goobes, T. Mass, Reply to: Characterizing coral skeleton mineralogy with Raman spectroscopy. *Nat. Commun.* **9**, 5324 (2018).
- 28. D. Evans, P. B. Webb, K. Penkman, R. Kröger, N. Allison, The characteristics and biological relevance of inorganic amorphous calcium carbonate (ACC) precipitated from seawater. *Cryst. Growth Des.* **19**, 4300–4313 (2019).
- 29. N. G. Hemming, G. N. Hanson, Boron isotopic composition and concentration in modern marine carbonates*. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **56**, 537–543 (1992).
- 30. V. Mavromatis, V. Montouillout, J. Noireaux, J. Gaillardet, J. Schott, Characterization of boron incorporation and speciation in calcite and aragonite from co-precipitation experiments under controlled pH, temperature and precipitation rate. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **150**, 299–313 (2015).
- 31. J. Noireaux, V. Mavromatis, J. Gaillardet, J. Schott, V. Montouillout, P. Louvat, C. Rollion-Bard, D. R. Neuville, Crystallographic control on the boron isotope paleo-pH proxy. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **430**, 398–407 (2015).
- 32. D. S. Sevilgen, A. A. Venn, M. Y. Hu, E. Tambutté, D. de Beer, V. Planas-Bielsa, S. Tambutté, Full in vivo characterization of carbonate chemistry at the site of calcification in corals. *Sci. Adv.* **5**, eaau7447 (2019).
- 33. M. Holcomb, T. M. DeCarlo, G. A. Gaetani, M. McCulloch, Factors affecting B/Ca ratios in synthetic aragonite. *Chem. Geol.* **437**, 67–76 (2016).
- 34. N. Allison, Reconstructing coral calcification fluid dissolved inorganic carbon chemistry from skeletal boron: An exploration of potential controls on coral aragonite B/Ca. *Heliyon* **3**, e00387 (2017).
- 35. J. N. Sutton, Y.-W. Liu, J. B. Ries, M. Guillermic, E. Ponzevera, R. A. Eagle, $\delta^{11}B$ as monitor of calcification site pH in divergent marine calcifying organisms. *Biogeosciences* **15**, 1447–1467 (2018).
- 36. Y. W. Liu, J. N. Sutton, J. B. Ries, R. A. Eagle, Regulation of calcification site pH is a polyphyletic but not always governing response to ocean acidification. *Sci. Adv.* **6**, eaax1314 (2020).
- 37. A. A. Venn, E. Tambutté, N. Caminiti-Segonds, N. Techer, D. Allemand, S. Tambutté, Effects of light and darkness on pH regulation in three coral species exposed to seawater acidification. *Sci. Rep.*, **9**, 2201 (2019).
- 38. M. T. McCulloch, J. P. D'Olivo, J. Falter, L. Georgiou, M. Holcomb, P. Montagna, J. A. Trotter, Boron isotopic systematics in scleractinian corals and the role of pH up-regulation. *Boron Isotopes* 145–162 (2018).
- 39. A. A. Venn, E. Tambutte, M. Holcomb, J. Laurent, D. Allemand, S. Tambutte, Impact of seawater acidification on pH at the tissue–skeleton interface and calcification in reef corals. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **110**, 1634–1639 (2013).
- 40. F. A. Al-Horani, S. M. Al-Moghrabi, D. de Beer, The mechanism of calcification and its relation to photosynthesis and respiration in the scleractinian coral *Galaxea fascicularis. Mar. Biol.* **142**, 419–426 (2003).
- 41. W.-J. Cai, Y. Ma, B. M. Hopkinson, A. G. Grottoli, M. E. Warner, Q. Ding, X. Hu, X. Yuan, V. Schoepf, H. Xu, C. Han, T. F. Melman, K. D. Hoadley, D. T. Pettay, Y. Matsui, J. H. Baumann, S. Levas, Y. Ying, Y. Wang, Microelectrode characterization of coral daytime interior pH and carbonate chemistry. *Nat. Commun.* **7**, 11144 (2016).
- 42. S. Comeau, E. Tambutté, R. C. Carpenter, P. J. Edmunds, N. R. Evensen, D. Allemand, C. Ferrier-Pagès, S. Tambutté, A. A. Venn, Coral calcifying fluid pH is modulated by seawater carbonate chemistry not solely seawater pH. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **284**, 20161669 (2017b).
- 43. C. L. Ross, J. L. Falter, M. T. McCulloch, Active modulation of the calcifying fluid carbonate chemistry $(\delta^{11}B, B/Ca)$ and seasonally invariant coral calcification at sub-tropical limits. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 13830 (2017).
- 44. P. W. Glynn, Coral reef bleaching: Ecological perspectives. *Coral Reefs* **12**, 1–17 (1993).
- 45. R. Berkelmans, J. K. Oliver, Large-scale bleaching of corals on the Great Barrier Reef. *Coral reefs* **18**, 55–60 (1999).
- 46. J. P. D'Olivo, M. T. McCulloch, Response of coral calcification and calcifying fluid composition to thermally induced bleaching stress. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 2207 (2017).
- 47. J. P. D'Olivo, G. Ellwood, T. M. DeCarlo, M. T. McCulloch, Deconvolving the long-term impacts of ocean acidification and warming on coral biomineralisation. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **526**, 115785 (2019).
- 48. O. Hoegh-Guldberg, G. J. Smith, The effect of sudden changes in temperature, light and salinity on the population density and export of zooxanthellae from the reef corals *Stylophora pistillata* Esper and *Seriatopora hystrix* Dana. *J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.* **129**, 279–303 (1989).
- 49. C. B. Bove, J.B. Ries, S.W. Davies, I.T. Westfield, J. Umbanhowar, K.D. Castillo. Common Caribbean corals exhibit highly variable responses to future acidification and warming. *Proc. R. Soc. B.* **286**, 20182840 (2019).
- 50. Y. Loya, K. Sakai, K. Yamazato, Y. Nakano, H. Sambali, R. van Woesik, Coral bleaching: The winners and the losers. *Ecol. Lett.* **4**, 122–131 (2001).
- 51. J. P. Gattuso, D. Allemand, M. Frankignoulle, Photosynthesis and calcification at cellular, organismal and community levels in coral reefs: A review on interactions and control by carbonate chemistry*. Am. Zool.* **39**, 160–183 (1999).
- 52. N. J. Silbiger, G. Goodbody-Gringley, J. F. Bruno, H. M. Putnam, Comparative thermal performance of the reef-building coral *Orbicella franksi* at its latitudinal range limits. *Mar. Biol.* **166**, 126 (2019).
- 53. R. Rowan, Thermal adaptation in reef coral symbionts. *Nature* **430**, 742–742 (2004).
- 54. C. D. Clausen, A. A. Roth, Effect of temperature and temperature adaptation on calcification rate in the hermatypic coral *Pocillopora damicornis. Mar. Biol.* **33**, 93–100 (1975).
- 55. J. B. Ries, A. L. Cohen, D. C. McCorkle, Marine calcifiers exhibit mixed responses to CO2 induced ocean acidification. *Geology* **37**, 1131–1134 (2009).
- 56. K. D. Castillo, J. B. Ries, J. F. Bruno, I.T. Westfield, The reef-building coral *Siderastrea siderea* exhibits parabolic responses to ocean acidification and warming. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **281**, 20141856 (2014).
- 57. S. Krief, E. J. Hendy, M. Fine, R. Yam, A. Meibom, G. L. Foster, A. Shemesh, Physiological and isotopic responses of scleractinian corals to ocean acidification. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **74**, 4988–5001 (2010).
- 58. R. H. McLachlan, J. T. Price, S. L. Solomon, A. G. Grottoli, Thirty years of coral heat-stress experiments: A review of methods. *Coral Reefs* **39**, 885–902 (2020).
- 59. S. Tambutté, E. Tambutté, D. Zoccola, D. Allemand, Organic matrix and biomineralization of scleractinian corals, in *Handbook of Biomineralization: Biological Aspects and Structure Formation* (Wiley, 2007), pp. 243–259.
- 60. T. M. DeCarlo, S. Comeau, C. E. Cornwall, M. T. McCulloch, Coral resistance to ocean acidification linked to increased calcium at the site of calcification. *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* **285**, 20180564 (2018a).
- 61. W. Sun, S. Jayaraman, W. Chen, K. A. Persson, G. Ceder, Nucleation of metastable aragonite CaCO₃ in seawater. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **112**, 3199–3204 (2015).
- 62. M. Holcomb, A. A. Venn, E. Tambutté, S. Tambutté, D. Allemand, J. Trotter, M. McCulloch, Coral calcifying fluid pH dictates response to ocean acidification. *Sci. Rep.* **4**, 5207 (2014).
- 63. C. Langdon, M. J. Atkinson, Effect of elevated $pCO₂$ on photosynthesis and calcification of corals and interactions with seasonal change in temperature/ irradiance and nutrient enrichment. *J. Geophys. Res.* **110**, C09S07 (2005).
- 64. S. H. C. Noonan, K. E. Fabricius, Ocean acidification affects productivity but not the severity of thermal bleaching in some tropical corals. *ICES J. Mar. Sci.* **73**, 715–726 (2016).
- 65. C. B. Wall, T.-Y. Fan, P. J. Edmunds, Ocean acidification has no effect on thermal bleaching in the coral *Seriatopora caliendrum*. *Coral Reefs* **33**, 119–130 (2013).
- 66. A. A. Venn, C. Bernardet, A. Chabenat, E. Tambutté, S. Tambutté, Paracellular transport to the coral calcifying medium: Effects of environmental parameters. *J. Exp. Biol.* **223**, jeb227074 (2020).
- 67. S. Hohn, C. Reymond, Coral calcification, mucus, and the origin of skeletal organic molecules. *Coral Reefs* **38**, 973–984 (2019).
- 68. T. C. LaJeunesse, J. E. Parkinson, P. W. Gabrielson, H. J. Jeong, J. D. Reimer, C. R. Voolstra, S. R. Santos, Systematic revision of Symbiodiniaceae highlights the antiquity and diversity of coral endosymbionts. *Curr. Biol.* **28**, 2570–2580.e6 (2018).
- 69. R.M. Key, A. Kozyr, C. L. Sabine, K. Lee, R. Wanninkhof, J. L. Bullister, R. A. Feely, F. J. Millero, C. Mordy, T.-H. Peng, A global ocean carbon climatology: Results from Global Data Analysis Project (GLODAP). *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **18**, GB4031, (2004).
- 70. R. N. Roy, L. N. Roy, K. M. Vogel, C. Porter-Moore, T. Pearson, C. E. Good, F. J. Millero, D. M. Campbell, The dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at salinities 5 to 45 and temperatures 0 to 45°C. *Mar. Chem.* **44**, 249–267 (1993).
- 71. A. Mucci, The solubility of calcite and aragonite in seawater at various salinities, temperatures, and one atmosphere total pressure. *Am. J. Sci.* **283**, 780–799 (1983).
- 72. F. E. Grubbs, Procedures for detecting outlying observations in samples. *Dent. Tech.* **11**, 1– 21 (1969).
- 73. D. de Beer, A. Glud, E. Epping, M. Kühl, A fast-responding $CO₂$ microelectrode for profiling sediments, microbial mats, and biofilms. *Limnol. Ocean.* **42**, 1590–1600 (1997).
- 74. P. S. Davies, Short-term growth measurements of corals using an accurate buoyant weighing technique. *Mar. Biol.* **101**, 389–395 (1989).
- 75. M. Guillermic, S. Misra, R. Eagle, A. Villa, F. Chang, A. Tripati, Seawater pH reconstruction using boron isotopes in multiple planktonic foraminifera species with different depth habitats and their potential to constrain pH and $pCO₂$ gradients. *Biogeosciences* 17, 3487–3510 (2020).
- 76. M., Gutjahr, L., Bordier, E., Douville, J., Farmer, G. L., Foster, E., Hathorne, B. Hönisch, D. Lemarchand, P. Louvat, M. M. Culloch, J. Noireaux, N. Pallavicini, I. Rodushkin, P. Roux, J. Stewart, F. Thil, C.-F. You, Boron Isotope Intercomparison Project (BIIP): Development of a new carbonate standard for stable isotopic analyses, in *EGU General Assembly Conference Abstracts (Vol. 16)* (2014)
- 77. M. Holcomb, T. M. DeCarlo, V. Schoepf, D. Dissard, K. Tanaka, M. McCulloch, Cleaning and pre-treatment procedures for biogenic and synthetic calcium carbonate powders for determination of elemental and boron isotopic compositions. *Chem. Geol.* **398**, 11–21 (2015).
- 78. S. Misra, M. Greaves, R. Owen, J. Kerr, A. C. Elmore, H. Elderfield, Determination of B/Ca of natural carbonates by HR-ICP-MS*, Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* **15**, 1617–1628 (2014).
- 79. K. Klochko, A. J. Kaufman, W. Yao, R. H. Byrne, J. A. Tossell, Experimental measurement of boron isotope fractionation in seawater. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **248**, 261–270 (2006).
- 80. S. Barker, M. Greaves, H. Elderfield, A study of cleaning procedures used for foraminiferal Mg/Ca paleothermometry. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* **4**, 8407 (2003).
- 81. E. J. Catanzaro, C. E. Champion, A. L. Garner, G. Marinenko, K. M. Sappenfield, W. R. Shields, Boric Acid; Isotopic and Assay Standard Reference Materials (U.S. Natl. Bur. Stand. Spec., Publ., 1970), pp. 260–17, 70p.
- 82. O. Nir, A. Vengosh, J. S. Harkness, G. S. Dwyer, O. Lahav, Direct measurement of the boron isotope fractionation factor: Reducing the uncertainty in reconstructing ocean paleo-pH, Earth Planet. *Sci. Lett.* **414**, 1–5 (2015).
- 83. J. Gaillardet, D. Lemarchand, C. Göpel, G. Manhès, Evaporation and sublimation of boric acid: Application for boron purification from organic rich solutions. *Geostand. Newsl.* **25**, 67–75 (2001).
- 84. B.-S. Wang, C.-F. You, K.-F. Huang, S.-F. Wu, S. K. Aggarwal, C.-H. Chung, P.-Y. Lin, Direct separation of boron from Na- and Ca-rich matrices by sublimation for stable isotope measurement by MC-ICP-MS, *Talanta* **82**, 1378–1384 (2010).
- 85. S. Misra, R. Owen, J. Kerr, M. Greaves, H. Elderfield, Determination of $\delta^{11}B$ by HR-ICP-MS from mass limited samples: Application to natural carbonates and water samples. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **140**, 531–552 (2014b).
- 86. J. W. B. Rae, Boron isotopes in Foraminifera: Systematics, biomineralisation, and CO₂ reconstruction, in *Boron Isotopes. Advances in Isotope Geochemistry*, H. Marschall, G. Foster, Eds. (Springer, 2018).
- 87. M. Raitzsch, J. Bijma, A. Benthien, K.-U. Richter, G. Steinhoefel, M. Kučera, Boron isotopebased seasonal paleo-pH reconstruction for the Southeast Atlantic – A multispecies approach using habitat preference of planktonic foraminifera. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **487**, 138–150 (2018).
- 88. N. S. Lloyd, A. Y. Sadekov, S. Misra, Application of 10^{13} ohm Faraday cup current amplifiers for boron isotopic analyses by solution mode and laser ablation multicollector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* **32**, 9–18 (2018).