

PEER REVIEW HISTORY

BMJ Open publishes all reviews undertaken for accepted manuscripts. Reviewers are asked to complete a checklist review form (<http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/resources/checklist.pdf>) and are provided with free text boxes to elaborate on their assessment. These free text comments are reproduced below.

ARTICLE DETAILS

TITLE (PROVISIONAL)	Contribution of supervision to the development of advanced practitioners: a qualitative study of pharmacy learners' and supervisors' views
AUTHORS	Hindi, Ali; Willis, Sarah; Astbury, Jayne; Fenton, Catherine; Stearns, Selma; Jacobs, Sally; McDermott, Imelda; Moss, Aidan; Seston, Elizabeth; Schafheutle, Ellen

VERSION 1 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Bingham, Jennifer Tabula Rasa HealthCare
REVIEW RETURNED	18-Nov-2021

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>Thank you for this intriguing submission on the perceived value of clinical and educational supervision to improve patient care delivery in primary care. It was well written and informative. Please find below some suggestions.</p> <p>Line 39: Advanced practitioners - There appears to be an extra space.</p> <p>Line 46: to work across different settings - It is unclear which settings the authors refer to. For example, is it accurate to infer that pharmacists should be competently trained to work as paramedics? Please clarify the settings and scenarios further. Perhaps it is better to phrase that advanced practitioners should promote interprofessional collaboration.</p> <p>Line 59: In medical education - This is a great section, yet it solely focuses on one advanced practitioner (medicine). It would be interesting to include information about other disciplines listed in the paragraph above to draw parallels/differences.</p> <p>Line 34: The following table provides a description of the key elements of the learning pathways - Missing a period at the end of the sentence.</p> <p>Line 41: Theory of workplace pedagogy - Excellent section in which certain elements would be better suited in the Introduction/Background section.</p> <p>Line 40: All interviews were audio-recorded - Before the interviews were conducted, did the research team develop it using relevant literature and/or review for discordance? Also, was it refined and pilot tested before interviews were conducted?</p> <p>Results: Whilst the quotes are informative, consider only including</p>
-------------------------	--

	<p>the high impact quote content and removing some of the conversational content (i.e., So, for me,...)</p> <p>Results: Recommend presenting the themed data in two subthemes, educational and clinical supervision.</p> <p>Conclusion: Nice conclusion. Recommend reporting on the primary outcomes in the Conclusion. Outcomes mentioned in the abstract included: (1) contribution of clinical (CS) and (2) educational supervision (ES) to the development of advanced practitioners in primary care.</p>
--	---

REVIEWER	Kavanagh, Sallianne Sheffield Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust, Pharmacy
REVIEW RETURNED	02-Jan-2022

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>This is a valuable paper and very current. The needs of addressing the pharmacy workforce are well presented and well considered. There are occasions in the paper where you attempt to draw the reference and conclusions of the paper to wider than pharmacists and pharmacy technicians, I do not believe your findings can support this wider inference.</p> <p>The results could be in greater depth as the discussion does appear to draw on information from the results that have not been fully presented (see specific comments on the paper)- this may be due to your inherent knowledge of the subject and the wider scope of the work being completed. The section that discusses the benefits and limitations of the different roles as supervisors needs review for clarity of the arguments that your findings support and that you are wishing to present</p> <p>What specific and achievable recommendations will you be making as a result of your findings?</p>
-------------------------	--

VERSION 1 – AUTHOR RESPONSE

Reviewer #1	
Comments:	Response
Thank you for this intriguing submission on the perceived value of clinical and educational supervision to improve patient care delivery in primary care. It was well written and informative. Please find below some suggestions.	Many thanks for the kind comments – much appreciated.
Line 39: Advanced practitioners - There appears to be an extra space.	Extra space on line 39 has now been removed.
Line 46: to work across different settings - It is unclear which settings the authors refer to. For example, is it accurate to infer that pharmacists should be competently trained to work as paramedics? Please clarify the settings and scenarios further. Perhaps it is better to phrase that advanced practitioners should promote interprofessional collaboration.	<p>Many thanks for this very insightful suggestion. We have now rephrased this sentence with emphasis on promoting interprofessional collaboration in primary and secondary care settings:</p> <p><i>“Of particular importance is preparing advanced practitioners to move between different primary and secondary care settings working as part of a multi-disciplinary team, and to gain the skills and confidence needed to do so”. (page 3)</i></p>
Line 59: In medical education - This is a great section, yet it	This is very good point. We have now included

<p>solely focuses on one advanced practitioner (medicine). It would be interesting to include information about others disciplines listed in the paragraph above to draw parallels/differences.</p>	<p>references to literature on other advanced practitioners (i.e. nurses, pharmacists, physiotherapists, occupational therapists, social workers, dietitians, psychologists, podiatrists and speech pathologists) :</p> <p><i>“Common features of effective supervision in medicine, pharmacy, and nursing literature include: availability of supervisor, informative feedback, effective communication and a supportive relationship between supervisor and supervisee.¹⁸⁻²² These features have also been found to facilitate effective clinical supervision of physiotherapists, occupational therapists, social workers, dietitians, psychologists, podiatrists and speech pathologists.²³” (Page 4)</i></p>
<p>Line 34: The following table provides a description of the key elements of the learning pathways - Missing a period at the end of the sentence.</p>	<p>Period now added at the end of the sentence.</p>
<p>Line 41: Theory of workplace pedagogy - Excellent section in which certain elements would be better suited in the Introduction/Background section.</p>	<p>Many thanks for the compliment. The theory of workplace pedagogy is already presented as a sub-section under the Introduction/Background. We strongly feel it's important to explain Billet's theory and its relevance our study all under one paragraph to clearly demonstrate to the reader how/why this theory was used to analyse our findings.</p>
<p>Line 40: All interviews were audio-recorded - Before the interviews were conducted, did the research team develop it using relevant literature and/or review for discordance? Also, was it refined and pilot tested before interviews were conducted?</p>	<p>The research team developed the topic guides using relevant literature. The topic guides were refined following discussions with relevant PHIF stakeholders. However, the topic guides were not piloted. These key bits of information have now been added:</p> <p><i>“Topic guides were informed by relevant literature and the Theoretical Domains Framework... Although not piloted tested, topic guides were refined following discussions between the research team and relevant PHIF stakeholders”. (page 6)</i></p>
<p>Results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Whilst the quotes are informative, consider only including the high impact quote content and removing some of the conversational content (i.e., So, for me,...) - Recommend presenting the themed data in two subthemes, educational and clinical supervision. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To the best of our knowledge, we have removed some of the conversational content in all of the quotes, where necessary. (pages 7-10) - We have now presented the relevant themes data under two overarching themes “educational” and “clinical supervision” (page 6): <p>“Using Billet's theory of workplace pedagogy, findings have been grouped into three themes under clinical supervision and educational supervision, to provide insight into supervision</p>

	<p>models in terms of developing advanced practitioners:</p> <p><u>Clinical supervision</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation in workplace activities and guided learning at work • Workplace affordances <p><u>Educational supervision</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ongoing support to help meet learning needs”
<p>Conclusion: Nice conclusion. Recommend reporting on the primary outcomes in the Conclusion. Outcomes mentioned in the abstract included: (1) contribution of clinical (CS) and (2) educational supervision (ES) to the development of advanced practitioners in primary care.</p>	<p>Many thanks for this very insightful suggestion. We have now added in a sentence in the conclusion reporting on primary outcomes mentioned in the abstract:</p> <p><i>“Using educational theory, this study highlights important considerations for effective supervision of pharmacy learners in advanced practitioner roles. <u>These include supporting learners to identify their learning needs (ES), guiding learners in everyday work activities (CS), combination of regular pre-arranged face-to-face meetings and ad hoc contact when needed (CS), along with ongoing support as learners progressed through a learning pathway (ES)</u>”. (page 12)</i></p>

Reviewer #2	
Comments:	Response
Overarching comments	
<p>This is a valuable paper and very current. The needs of addressing the pharmacy workforce are well presented and well considered. There are occasions in the paper where you attempt to draw the reference and conclusions of the paper to wider than pharmacists and pharmacy technicians, I do not believe your findings can support this wider inference.</p> <p>The results could be in greater depth as the discussion does appear to draw on information from the results that have not been fully presented (see specific comments on the paper) - this may be due to your inherent knowledge of the subject and the wider scope of the work being completed.</p>	<p>Many thanks for the kind comments – much appreciated. It is difficult to provide findings in greater depth as this evaluation was not solely focused on supervision and therefore we did our best to draw most relevant data from the interviews. Nevertheless, we have now removed sections in the discussion which findings may not have supported for wider inference. The following sections have been removed:</p> <p><i>“It is beneficial to have a supervisor from the same profession, particularly if there are issues around role clarity in newer settings”. (page 11)</i></p> <p><i>“Supervisory tasks do not necessarily have to be profession specific; what is more important is for supervisors to have the knowledge, skills and availability to help the learner to develop a specified capability and assess trainee</i></p>

	<p><i>competence”. (page 11)</i></p> <p><i>“An educational supervisor should be responsible for overseeing and coordinating multi-professional learning with clinical supervisors”. (page 11)</i></p> <p><i>“In addition to providing supervisors with guidance on best supervisory practices and organisational support, expectations for advanced practitioners need to be clearly defined otherwise supervisors and learners may hold conflicting views which will negatively impact learning and supervision experiences”. (page 12)</i></p>
<p>The section that discusses the benefits and limitations of the different roles as supervisors needs review for clarity of the arguments that your findings support and that you are wishing to present. What specific and achievable recommendations will you be making as a result of your findings?</p>	<p>The specific and achievable recommendations we made as a result of our findings have now been clearly summarised in the conclusion. We have made sure that these recommendations are fully supported by findings:</p> <p><i>“Using educational theory, this study highlights important considerations for effective supervision of pharmacy learners in advanced practitioner roles. <u>These include supporting learners to identify their learning needs (ES), guiding learners in everyday work activities (CS), combination of regular pre-arranged face-to-face meetings and ad hoc contact when needed (CS), along with ongoing support as learners progressed through a learning pathway (ES).</u> Insights from this study can inform the education and training of advanced practitioners from different professions to support healthcare workforce development and integrated multi-disciplinary working in different healthcare settings”. (page 12)</i></p>
<p>Specific comments on attachments</p>	
<p>Page 4, Line 46-47: which settings are considered in the context of this study?</p>	<p>We have now clarified which context is considered in the context of this study:</p> <p><i>“Of particular importance is preparing advanced practitioners <u>to move between different primary and secondary care settings working as part of a multi-disciplinary team,</u> and to gain the skills and confidence needed to do so”.</i></p>
<p>Page 5, line 35-38 : provide more simple and accurate statement:</p> <p><i>“In UK pharmacy, there is no real culture of, or formal support/ framework for, registered pharmacy professionals’ support or supervision. Some evidence has been emerging on the process (or lack) of supervision and support for pharmacists and pharmacy technicians in the workplace, mostly stemming from the period prior to registration”.</i></p>	<p>We have now presented a more simple and accurate statement of the sentence:</p> <p><i>“In UK pharmacy, there is no formal support/ framework for registered pharmacy professionals’ support or supervision. There is emerging research that considers the process (or lack) of supervision and support for pharmacists and pharmacy technicians in the workplace, mostly stemming from the period prior to registration”</i></p>

<p>Page 5, line 50-52: provide more accurate statement:</p> <p>“More recently, pharmacy professionals increasingly work in a range of primary care settings, which have a limited understanding of their skills or learning needs.”</p>	<p>We have now presented a more simple and accurate statement of the sentence:</p> <p><i>“More recently, pharmacy professionals increasingly work in a range of primary care settings, where other professionals and support staff in the different settings have a limited understanding of the role and potential learning needs of pharmacy professionals.” (page 5)</i></p>
<p>Page 12, line 10: clinical or educational supervisor?</p>	<p>We have now clarified that we are referring to the clinical supervisor:</p> <p><i>“It is beneficial for learners to have <u>clinical</u> supervision from different professions to support the breadth of development necessary across all areas of advanced practice”.</i></p>
<p>Page 12, Line 11 -12: asking where comments are coming from</p> <p>“Hence, it is beneficial to have a supervisor from the same profession, particularly if there are issues around role clarity in newer settings”.</p>	<p>We have removed the sentence mentioning the need for trainees to receive support by supervisors from the same profession as this was not grounded findings.</p>
<p>Page 13, lines 12-13:</p> <p>“Findings from this study suggest that having a more experienced healthcare professional in the workplace from the same discipline as the learner could help facilitate professional identity work”</p> <p>What is meant by work here? Do you mean development of professional identity or some active systems to support recognition of the individuals and or the groups identity?</p>	<p>We have now clarified that this sentence meant development of the professional identity:</p> <p><i>“Findings from this study suggest that having a more experienced healthcare professional in the workplace from the same discipline as the learner <u>could help facilitate development of the trainees’ professional identity”.</u></i></p>