

PEER REVIEW HISTORY

BMJ Open publishes all reviews undertaken for accepted manuscripts. Reviewers are asked to complete a checklist review form (<http://bmjopen.bmj.com/site/about/resources/checklist.pdf>) and are provided with free text boxes to elaborate on their assessment. These free text comments are reproduced below.

ARTICLE DETAILS

TITLE (PROVISIONAL)	Police officers' work-life balance, job satisfaction and quality of life – Longitudinal effects after changing the shift schedule
AUTHORS	Rohwer, Elisabeth; Velasco Garrido, Marcial; Herold, Robert; Preisser, A; Terschüren, Claudia; Harth, Volker; Mache, Stefanie

VERSION 1 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Daniela Acquadro Maran University of Turin, Department of Psychology
REVIEW RETURNED	02-May-2022

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>Dear Authors,</p> <p>Your paper lacks a literature analysis. It is biased and not done correctly. There are no theoretical and bibliographical references to the main studies conducted on these topics. Since it is not possible to evaluate the article if these references are missing. The work done is not complete, and if in the introduction the explanatory principles and the placement of the phenomenon in an international context are missing, then the scientific basis for what is proposed is also missing.</p> <p>I suggest revising the manuscript after reading and considering the following works (they are the basis for anyone who wants to study the phenomenon).</p> <p>See for example about sleep problems: Garbarino, S., De Carli, F., Nobili, L., Mascialino, B., Squarcia, S., Penco, M. A., ... & Ferrillo, F. (2002). Sleepiness and sleep disorders in shift workers: a study on a group of Italian police officers. <i>Sleep</i>, 25(6), 642-647.</p> <p>Garbarino, S., & Magnavita, N. (2019). Sleep problems are a strong predictor of stress-related metabolic changes in police officers. A prospective study. <i>PLoS One</i>, 14(10), e0224259.</p> <p>Garbarino, S., Guglielmi, O., Puntoni, M., Bragazzi, N. L., & Magnavita, N. (2019). Sleep quality among police officers: implications and insights from a systematic review and meta-analysis of the literature. <i>International journal of environmental research and public health</i>, 16(5), 885.</p> <p>about health problems: Garbarino, S., Cuomo, G., Chiorri, C., & Magnavita, N. (2013). Association of work-related stress with mental health problems in a special police force unit. <i>BMJ open</i>, 3(7), e002791.</p> <p>Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., McCanlies, E., Hartley, T. A., Baughman, P., Andrew, M. E., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2017). Police stressors and health: a state-of-the-art review. <i>Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management</i>.</p> <p>Paton, D., Violanti, J., & Schmuckler, E. (1999). Chronic exposure to risk and trauma: Addiction and separation issues in police officers.</p>
-------------------------	--

Police trauma: Psychological aftermath of civilian combat, 78-87. Violanti, J. M., Fekedulegn, D., Hartley, T. A., Charles, L. E., Andrew, M. E., Ma, C. C., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2016). Highly rated and most frequent stressors among police officers: Gender differences. *American journal of criminal justice*, 41(4), 645-662.

about suicidal ideation:

Violanti, J. M. (2007). *Police suicide: Epidemic in blue*. Charles C Thomas Publisher.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., Hartley, T. A., Mnatsakanova, A., Andrew, M. E., Fekedulegn, D., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2008). Shift-work and suicide ideation among police officers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 51(10), 758-768.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., Hartley, T. A., Mnatsakanova, A., Andrew, M. E., Fekedulegn, D., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2008). Shift-work and suicide ideation among police officers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 51(10), 758-768.

Violanti, J. M., Owens, S. L., McCanlies, E., Fekedulegn, D., & Andrew, M. E. (2018). Law enforcement suicide: a review. *Policing: An International Journal*.

Violanti, J. M., Vena, J. E., & Marshall, J. R. (1996). Suicides, homicides, and accidental death: a comparative risk assessment of police officers and municipal workers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 30(1), 99-104.

Violanti, J. M. (2004). Predictors of police suicide ideation. *Suicide and life-threatening behavior*, 34(3), 277-283.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., McCanlies, E., Hartley, T. A., Baughman, P., Andrew, M. E., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2017). Police stressors and health: a state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.

Violanti, J. M. (1997). Suicide and the police role: A psychosocial model. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.

Violanti, J. M., Castellano, C., O'Rourke, J., & Paton, D. (2006). Proximity to the 9/11 terrorist attack and suicide ideation in police officers. *Traumatology*, 12(3), 248-254.

Violanti, J. M. (1995). Trends in police suicide. *Psychological Reports*, 77(2), 688-690.

Violanti, J. M., Gu, J. K., Charles, L. E., Fekedulegn, D., Andrew, M. E., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2011). Is suicide higher among separated/retired police officers? An epidemiological investigation. *International journal of emergency mental health*, 13(4), 221.

Violanti, J. M., Andrew, M. E., Mnatsakanova, A., Hartley, T. A., Fekedulegn, D., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2016). Correlates of hopelessness in the high suicide risk police occupation. *Police practice and research*, 17(5), 408-419.

Violanti, J. M. (1995). The mystery within: Understanding police suicide. *FBI L. Enforcement Bull.*, 64, 19.

Hackett, D. P., & Violanti, J. M. (Eds.). (2003). *Police suicide: Tactics for prevention*. Charles C Thomas Publisher.

Violanti, J. M., Mnatsakanova, A., Hartley, T. A., Andrew, M. E., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2012). Police suicide in small departments: a comparative analysis. *International journal of emergency mental health*, 14(3), 157.

Garbarino, S., Fornaro, M., Messina, R., Pompili, M., & Ciprani, F. (2021). Suicide mortality data from the Italian police during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Annals of General Psychiatry*, 20(1), 1-3.

Garbarino, S. (2014). Police and Military. In *Sleepiness and Human Impact Assessment* (pp. 159-168). Springer, Milano.

Garbarino, S., Magnavita, N., Chiorri, C., Brisinda, D., Cuomo, G.,

	<p>Venuti, A., & Fenici, R. (2012). Evaluation of operational stress in riot and crowd control police units: a global challenge for prevention and management of police task-related stress. <i>Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology</i>, 27(2), 111-122.</p> <p>These are just few references from literature. You could search it in scientific database.</p>
--	--

REVIEWER	Sergio Garbarino University of Genoa, Department of Health Sciences
REVIEW RETURNED	02-May-2022

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>The Authors evaluated the mental health-related outcomes before and after implementing a five and half-year new shift schedule. They found a significant improvement in job satisfaction and work-life balance, with a trend also for quality of life. The methodology is rigorous and the results novel and well explained.</p> <p>The limited sample size is a major drawback of the study and may not be not representative of study population but the preliminary results are interesting.</p> <p>Some minor concerns are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - is there any effect of age groups on the outcomes evaluated? - some pertinent references might be added: line 49 Garbarino S, Cuomo G, Chiorri C, Magnavita N. Association of work-related stress with mental health problems in a special police force unit. <i>BMJ Open</i>. 2013 Jul 19;3(7):e002791. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2013-002791. - Line 47 Garbarino S, Guglielmi O, Puntoni M, Bragazzi NL, Magnavita N. Sleep Quality among Police Officers: Implications and Insights from a Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Literature. <i>Int J Environ Res Public Health</i>. 2019 Mar 11;16(5):885. doi: 10.3390/ijerph16050885.
-------------------------	--

VERSION 1 – AUTHOR RESPONSE

Reviewer: 1

Dr. Daniela Acquadro Maran, University of Turin

Dear Authors,

Your paper lacks a literature analysis. It is biased and not done correctly. There are no theoretical and bibliographical references to the main studies conducted on these topics. Since it is not possible to evaluate the article if these references are missing. The work done is not complete, and if in the introduction the explanatory principles and the placement of the phenomenon in an international context are missing, then the scientific basis for what is proposed is also missing.

I suggest revising the manuscript after reading and considering the following works (they are the basis for anyone who wants to study the phenomenon).

See for example about sleep problems:

Garbarino, S., De Carli, F., Nobili, L., Mascialino, B., Squarcia, S., Penco, M. A., ... & Ferrillo, F. (2002). Sleepiness and sleep disorders in shift workers: a study on a group of Italian police officers. *Sleep*, 25(6), 642-647.

Garbarino, S., & Magnavita, N. (2019). Sleep problems are a strong predictor of stress-related metabolic changes in police officers. A prospective study. *PLoS One*, 14(10), e0224259.

Garbarino, S., Guglielmi, O., Puntoni, M., Bragazzi, N. L., & Magnavita, N. (2019). Sleep quality among police officers: implications and insights from a systematic review and meta-analysis of the literature. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 16(5), 885.

about health problems:

Garbarino, S., Cuomo, G., Chiorri, C., & Magnavita, N. (2013). Association of work-related stress with mental health problems in a special police force unit. *BMJ open*, 3(7), e002791.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., McCanlies, E., Hartley, T. A., Baughman, P., Andrew, M. E., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2017). Police stressors and health: a state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.

Paton, D., Violanti, J., & Schmuckler, E. (1999). Chronic exposure to risk and trauma: Addiction and separation issues in police officers. *Police trauma: Psychological aftermath of civilian combat*, 78-87.

Violanti, J. M., Fekedulegn, D., Hartley, T. A., Charles, L. E., Andrew, M. E., Ma, C. C., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2016). Highly rated and most frequent stressors among police officers: Gender differences. *American journal of criminal justice*, 41(4), 645-662.

about suicidal ideation:

Violanti, J. M. (2007). *Police suicide: Epidemic in blue*. Charles C Thomas Publisher.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., Hartley, T. A., Mnatsakanova, A., Andrew, M. E., Fekedulegn, D., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2008). Shift-work and suicide ideation among police officers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 51(10), 758-768.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., Hartley, T. A., Mnatsakanova, A., Andrew, M. E., Fekedulegn, D., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2008). Shift-work and suicide ideation among police officers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 51(10), 758-768.

Violanti, J. M., Owens, S. L., McCanlies, E., Fekedulegn, D., & Andrew, M. E. (2018). Law enforcement suicide: a review. *Policing: An International Journal*.

Violanti, J. M., Vena, J. E., & Marshall, J. R. (1996). Suicides, homicides, and accidental death: a comparative risk assessment of police officers and municipal workers. *American journal of industrial medicine*, 30(1), 99-104.

Violanti, J. M. (2004). Predictors of police suicide ideation. *Suicide and life-threatening behavior*, 34(3), 277-283.

Violanti, J. M., Charles, L. E., McCanlies, E., Hartley, T. A., Baughman, P., Andrew, M. E., ... & Burchfiel, C. M. (2017). Police stressors and health: a state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.

Violanti, J. M. (1997). Suicide and the police role: A psychosocial model. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*.

Violanti, J. M., Castellano, C., O'Rourke, J., & Paton, D. (2006). Proximity to the 9/11 terrorist attack and suicide ideation in police officers. *Traumatology*, 12(3), 248-254.

Violanti, J. M. (1995). Trends in police suicide. *Psychological Reports*, 77(2), 688-690.

Violanti, J. M., Gu, J. K., Charles, L. E., Fekedulegn, D., Andrew, M. E., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2011). Is suicide higher among separated/retired police officers? An epidemiological investigation. *International journal of emergency mental health*, 13(4), 221.

Violanti, J. M., Andrew, M. E., Mnatsakanova, A., Hartley, T. A., Fekedulegn, D., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2016). Correlates of hopelessness in the high suicide risk police occupation. *Police practice and research*, 17(5), 408-419.

Violanti, J. M. (1995). The mystery within: Understanding police suicide. *FBI L. Enforcement Bull.*, 64, 19.

Hackett, D. P., & Violanti, J. M. (Eds.). (2003). *Police suicide: Tactics for prevention*. Charles C Thomas Publisher.

Violanti, J. M., Mnatsakanova, A., Hartley, T. A., Andrew, M. E., & Burchfiel, C. M. (2012). Police suicide in small departments: a comparative analysis. *International journal of emergency mental health*, 14(3), 157.

Garbarino, S., Fornaro, M., Messina, R., Pompili, M., & Ciprani, F. (2021). Suicide mortality data from the Italian police during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Annals of General Psychiatry*, 20(1), 1-3.

Garbarino, S. (2014). Police and Military. In *Sleepiness and Human Impact Assessment* (pp. 159-168). Springer, Milano.

Garbarino, S., Magnavita, N., Chiorri, C., Brisinda, D., Cuomo, G., Venuti, A., & Fenici, R. (2012). Evaluation of operational stress in riot and crowd control police units: a global challenge for prevention and management of police task-related stress. *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, 27(2), 111-122.

These are just few references from literature. You could search it in scientific database.

Authors' Response: Dear Dr. Acquadro Maran, thank you very much for your, we highly appreciate your many suggestions and carefully reviewed the literature. We included references we deemed relevant and enriching for the introductory section and scientific basis of our paper (lines 53-63 in the revised manuscript). Since further analyses focusing on health outcomes (including, e.g., sleep quality) will be presented in another paper (see references Velasco Garrido et al., under review), we will draw more extensively on the literature on sleep in that manuscript than in this present one. In addition, we searched for and added further references. We consider our thorough revision as a major improvement of our paper and thank you very much for bringing this to our attention.

Reviewer: 2

Dr. Sergio Garbarino, University of Genoa, Ministry of Interior

The Authors evaluated the mental health-related outcomes before and after implementing a five and half-year new shift schedule. They found a significant improvement in job satisfaction and work-life balance, with a trend also for quality of life. The methodology is rigorous and the results novel and well explained.

The limited sample size is a major drawback of the study and may not be not representative of study population but the preliminary results are interesting.

Some minor concerns are as follows:

- is there any effect of age groups on the outcomes evaluated?

- some pertinent references might be added: line 49 Garbarino S, Cuomo G, Chiorri C, Magnavita N. Association of work-related stress with mental health problems in a special police force unit. *BMJ Open*. 2013 Jul 19;3(7):e002791. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2013-002791.

- Line 47 Garbarino S, Guglielmi O, Puntoni M, Bragazzi NL, Magnavita N. Sleep Quality among Police Officers: Implications and Insights from a Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Literature. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2019 Mar 11;16(5):885. doi:10.3390/ijerph16050885.

Authors' Response: Dear Dr. Garbarino, thank you very much for your appreciative review of our paper and your suggestions for improvement. Regarding age groups, we found no significant effects (except for the age group of >35 years, which however did not occur in the larger sample of T2 (n = 756)), but not in relation to the other variables and age groups. We reviewed and included the references you suggested (line 55 in the revised manuscript), which enriched the scientific basis of our paper. Moreover, we added some further references. Therefore, we are convinced that we have substantially improved our paper thanks to your recommendations.